

# A Note on Lagrangians and Lovelock-Rund's Identities

Gyan Bahadur Thapa<sup>1</sup> and J. López Bonilla<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Central Campus, Institute of Engineering, T.U., Kathmandu, Nepal

<sup>2</sup>ESIME-Zacatenco, National Polytechnic Institute, Lindavista 07738, Mexico city

E-mail: jlopezb@ipn.mx

## ABSTRACT

Lagrangians and Lovelock-Rund's identities are important derivations in theory of gravity which is generalization of Einstein's theory of general relativity. In this paper, we construct continuity equations in arbitrary Riemannian 4-spaces, which could be interpreted as conservation laws for the energy and momentum of the gravitational field. We put special attention in general relativity.

**Keywords:** Lagrangians in curved spaces, Energy and momentum in Riemannian spaces, Rund-Lovelock's identities

## INTRODUCTION

For Lagrangians-based theories, we exploit from very beginning the transformation properties of fields. In this paper, we consider gravitational Lagrangians:

$$L = L(g_{ab}; g_{ab,c}; g_{ab,cd}), \quad (1)$$

where  $g_{ij}$  is the metric tensor and,  $a = \partial / \partial x^a$ ;  $L$  is a scalar density of weight one (Lovelock & Rund 1989) under an arbitrary coordinate transformation  $\bar{x}^i = \bar{x}^i(x^j)$ :

$$L = J \left( \frac{\bar{x}}{x} \right) \bar{L}. \quad (2)$$

Here we shall employ the property (2) to obtain (in general relativity) in natural manner the energy-momentum pseudo-tensors of Einstein (1916), (also see Trautman (1962), Adler *et al.* (1965), Davis (1974), Dirac (1975), Persides (1979), Palmer (1980), Landau and Lifshitz (1955), Anderson (1967), Misner *et al.* (1973), Sygne (1976), Caltenco *et al.* (2005), Möller (1958), Laurent (1959), Florides (1962), Shah (1967), Goldberg (1958) and Stachel (1977)); and also the continuity equations of Komar (1959), Trautman (1964), Du Plessis (1969), and Moss (1972).

Rest of the paper is planned as follows: in the second Section, we indicate the notation and quantities to employ through the paper. The third Section is dedicated to the analysis of conservation laws originated from the equations (1) and (2), and the Hilbert's variational principle (Lovelock & Rund 1989, Misner *et al.* 1973, Rund 1966, Rund & Lovelock 1972):

$$\delta \int_{V_4} L \sqrt{-g} d^4x = 0 \quad (3)$$

We also mention applications of  $L$  in the case of general relativity (Adler *et al.* 1965, Davis 1974, Dirac 1975, Anderson 1967, Schild 1967). The final Section concludes the paper.

## RUND-LOVELOCK'S RELATIONS

Lovelock and Rund (1989), Rund (1966), Rund and Lovelock (1972), in their study of variational principles with Lagrangians verifying (1) and (2), showed the importance of the derivatives of  $L$  with respect to its arguments:

$$\begin{aligned} A^{ij} &= A^{ji} \equiv \frac{\partial L}{\partial g_{ij}}, \quad A^{ij,h} = A^{ji,h} \equiv \frac{\partial L}{\partial g_{ij,h}}, \\ A^{ij,hk} &= A^{ji,hk} = A^{ij,kh} \equiv \frac{\partial L}{\partial g_{ij,hk}} \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

and, in general, only  $A^{ij,hk}$  has tensorial character. These quantities have the following properties:

$$\begin{aligned} A^{ij} &= \frac{L}{2} g^{ij} + \frac{4}{3} A^{hk,jr} R_{khr}^i - \Gamma^i_{rm} \Gamma^r_{km} A^{km,rh}, \\ A^{ij,h} &= \Gamma^i_{rk} A^{rk,jh} + \Gamma^j_{rk} A^{rk,ih} - \Gamma^h_{rk} A^{rk,ij}, \\ A^{ij,hk} &= A^{hk,ij}, \quad A^{ij,hk} + A^{ih,kj} + A^{ik,jh} = 0, \quad A_{r\ ,hji}^i = 0, \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

with the convention of Dedekind-Einstein of sum over repeated indices (Sinaceur 1990, Laugwitz 2008). On the other hand, the Euler-Lagrange expressions defined by:

$$L^{ij} = A^{ij} - A^{ij,h}{}_{,h} + A^{ij,hk}{}_{,hk}, \quad (6)$$

can be written using (5), in the form:

$$L^{ij} = \frac{L}{2} g^{ij} + \frac{2}{3} A^{hk,jr} R_{khr}^i + A^{ij,hk}{}_{,hk}, \quad (7)$$

where ;c represents the covariant derivative. Besides, we have the contracted Bianchi identities:

$$L^{ij}{}_{;j} = 0. \tag{8}$$

As an example, if  $L$  is the scalar density of weight one corresponding to general relativity (Adler *et al.* 1965, Davis 1974, Dirac 1975, Anderson 1967, Schild 1967):

$$L = \sqrt{-g}R, \quad g = \det(g_{ab}), \tag{9}$$

where  $R \equiv R^j{}_j$  is the scalar curvature, then:

$$A^{ij,km} = \frac{1}{2}\sqrt{-g}(2g^{ij}g^{km} - g^{im}g^{jk} - g^{ik}g^{jm}) \tag{10}$$

Thus, (7) and (10) imply that the Euler-Lagrange relations are proportional to the Einstein tensor:

$$L^{ij} = -\sqrt{-g}G^{ij}, \tag{11}$$

which satisfies (8) because  $G^{ab}{}_{;b} = 0$ .

### CONTINUITY EQUATIONS IN RIEMANNIAN SPACES

The variational principle (3) is invariant under general transformations  $\bar{x}^i = \bar{x}^i(x^j)$ , in particular, we can use infinitesimal coordinate changes:

$$\bar{x}^i = x^i + \varepsilon^i \xi^i(x^i), \tag{12}$$

without sum over  $i$ , and  $\varepsilon^i$  denoting small constant parameters. The Noether's theorem (Noether 1918) establishes that each continuous symmetry transformation which leaves the corresponding variational principle invariant, implies a conservation law, and hence a constant of motion. For further detail, we refer to Weyl (1935), Rund (1966), Trautman (1967), Kimberling and Byers (1996), Byers (1996), Lam *et al.* (2014), Kosman-Schwarzbach (2011) and Neuenschwander (2011). Here we employ the Noether's theorem via the approach of Lanczos (1969), Lanczos (1970), Lam *et al.* (2014) and Lanczo (1973); and we apply the equation (12) to equation (3) but now considering that  $\varepsilon^i$  are new variational variables, then the Lagrange equations for  $\varepsilon^i$  give the continuity equations of Noether. Thus, it is possible to deduce the following important relations not found explicitly in the literature on gravitational energy-momentum pseudo-tensors (Synge 1967, Bak *et al.* 1994, Chang *et al.* 1999, Babak & Grishchuk 2000):

$$\left( B_r^i \xi^r - U_r^{ij} \xi^r{}_{;j} - \frac{1}{2} A_r^{i,jh} \xi^r{}_{;jh} \right)_{;i} = 0, \tag{13}$$

where

$$U_r^{ij} = A_r^{i,jh}{}_{;h} + \Gamma_{krh} A^{kj,ih} - \frac{1}{2} \Gamma^i{}_{hk} A_r^{j,hk}, \tag{14}$$

$$B_r^i = U_r^{ij}{}_{;j} = -\frac{L}{2} \delta_r^i + L_r^i + \frac{1}{2} (A^{ihj} - A^{jhk}) g_{jhr} + \frac{1}{2} A^{hkij} g_{khjr} \tag{15}$$

Besides, with (8) and (15), it is easy to obtain the conservation law:

$$B_r^i{}_{;i} \equiv L_r^i{}_{;i} = 0. \tag{16}$$

In the case of general relativity theory,  $L$  given by (9), and a complete study of (13) when  $\xi^r$  is a vectorial field, leads to results of Komar (1959) and Du Plessis (1969), and if  $\xi^r$  is a Killing vector, then it is also possible to deduce the relations of Trautman (1964) and Moss (1972). On the other hand, (16) allows to construct the energy-momentum pseudo-tensors of Landau and Lifshitz (1955), Caltenco *et al.* (2005), Misner *et al.* (1973), Synge (1976), Anderson (1967), Möller (1958), Goldberg (1958) and Stachel (1977).

Sometimes in the Einstein theory, we use the Lagrangian (Adler *et al.* 1965, Misner *et al.* 1973, Anderson 1967, Dirac 1975):

$$\bar{L} = \sqrt{-g} g^{ab} (\Gamma^i{}_{ab} \Gamma^j{}_{ij} - \Gamma^i{}_{ja} \Gamma^j{}_{ib}), \tag{17}$$

such that  $\sqrt{-g}R = \bar{L} + (\text{ordinary divergence})$ , then the empty field equations are the same for (9) and (17), besides  $\partial \bar{L} / \partial g_{ij,hk} = 0$ . However,  $\bar{L}$  satisfies (2) when

$\xi^r$  are constants, therefore (13) is equivalent to

$$B_r^i{}_{;i} = 0 \text{ and from (15):}$$

$$B_r^i = 8\pi \sqrt{-g} t_r^i = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{\partial \bar{L}}{\partial g_{jh,i}} g_{jhr} - \bar{L} \delta_r^i \right), \tag{18}$$

where  $t_r^i$  is the canonical energy-momentum pseudo-tensor of Einstein (1916), (also see Trautman (1962), Adler *et al.* (1965), Davis (1974), Dirac (1975), Persides (1979), Palmer (1980), Caltenco *et al.* (2010)). Thus, the conservation law  $t_r^i{}_{;i} = 0$  is implied by the translational invariance of  $\bar{L}$ .

### CONCLUSION

It is thus, the Lanczos technique for the Noether theorem gives the continuity equations (13) and (16) which have total information on energy-momentum quantities for gravitational theories in Riemannian spaces. Thus, the energy-momentum can be regarded as the most fundamental conserved quantity being associated with a symmetry of the space time geometry.

## REFERENCES

- Adler, R., Bazin, M., Schiffer, M. 1965. *Introduction to general relativity*. McGraw-Hill, New York.
- Anderson, J.L. 1967. *Principles of relativity physics*. Academic Press, New York.
- Babak, S.V., Grishchuk, L. 2000. The energy-momentum tensor for the gravitational field. *Phys. Rev. D* **61**: 24-38.
- Bak, D., Cangemi, D., Jackiw, R. 1994. Energy-momentum conservation in gravity theories. *Phys. Rev. D* **49**: 5173-5181.
- Byers, N. 1996. Emmy Noether's discovery of the deep connection between symmetries and conservation laws. *Proc. Symp. Heritage E. Noether* Bar Ilan University, Tel Aviv, Israel, Dec. 2-3.
- Byers, N. 1996. *The life and times of Emmy Noether. Contributions of E. Noether to particle physics*, in 'History of original ideas and basic discoveries in particle physics', eds. Newman, H.B., Ypsilantis, T., Plenum Press, New York, 945-964.
- Caltenco, J.H., López-Bonilla, J., Ovando, G. 2010. On a gravitational energy-momentum pseudotensor. *J. Vect. Rel.* **5**(4): L8-L9.
- Caltenco, J.H., López-Bonilla, J., Peña, J.R., Rivera J.R. 2005. Landau-Lifshitz energy-momentum pseudotensor for metrics with spherical symmetry. *Proc. Pakistan Acad. Sci.* **42**(4): 261-264.
- Chang, C.C., Nester, J., Chen, C.M. 1999. Pseudotensors and quasilocal energy-momentum. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **83**(10): 1897-1900.
- Davis, W. 1974. *Conservation laws in Einstein's general theory of relativity*. In 'studies in numerical analysis', ed. Scaife B.K.P., Academic Press, London, 29-64p.
- Dirac, P. 1975. *General theory of relativity*, John Wiley, New York.
- Du Plessis, J.C. 1969. Tensorial concomitants and conservation laws. *Tensor* **20**: 347-360.
- Einstein, A. 1916. Die grundlage der allgemeinen relativitätstheorie. *Ann. der Physik.* **49**: 769-822.
- Flórides, P.S. 1962. Applications of Möller theory on energy and its localization in general relativity. *Proc. Camb. Phil. Soc.* **58**: 102-109.
- Goldberg, J.N. 1958. Conservation laws in general relativity. *Phys. Rev.* **111**(2): 315-320
- Kimberling, C.H. 1972. Emmy Noether. *Am. Math. Mon.* **79**(2): 136-149.
- Komar, A. 1959. Covariant conservation laws in general relativity. *Phys. Rev.* **113**(3): 934-936.
- Kosman-Schwarzbach, Y. 2011. *The Noether theorems*, Springer, New York.
- Lam E.P., López-Bonilla, J., López-Vázquez, R., Ovando, G. 2014. Lagrangians: symmetries, gauge identities and first integrals. *The Sci. Tech., J. Sci. & Tech.* **3**(1): 54-66.
- Lam E.P., López-Bonilla, J. and López-Vázquez, R. 2014. Lanczos approach to Noether's theorem. *Bull. of Soc. for Mathematical Services & Standards* **3**(3): 1-4.
- Lanczos, C. 1969. *Variational principles*, in 'mathematical methods in solid state physics and super fluid theory', eds. Clark, R.C., Derrick, G.H., Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh. 1-45p.
- Lanczos, C. 1970. *The variational principles of mechanics*. Univ. Toronto Press, Chap 11.
- Lanczos, C. 1973. Emmy Noether and calculus of variations. *Bull. Inst. Math. and Appl.* **9**(8): 253-258.
- Landau, L.D., Lifshitz, E.M. 1955. *The classical theory of fields*. Addison-Wesley, Cambridge.
- Laurent, B. 1959. Note on Möller's energy-momentum pseudotensor. *Nuovo Cim.* **11**(5): 740-743.
- Laugwitz, D. 2008. *Bernhard Riemann 1826-1866. Turning points in the conception of mathematics*. Birkhäuser, Boston, USA.
- Lovelock, D., Rund, H. 1989. *Tensors, differential forms and variational principles*. Dover, New York.
- Misner, C.W., Thorne, K.S., Wheeler, J.A. 1973. *Gravitation*. W.H. Freeman, San Francisco.
- Moss, M.K. 1972. A Komar superpotential expression for the Trautman conservation law generator of general relativity. *Lett. Nuovo Cim.* **5**: 543-550.
- Möller, C. 1958. On the localization of the energy of a physical system in the general theory of relativity. *Ann. Phys.* **4**: 347-371.
- Neuenschwander, D.E. 2011. *Emmy Noether's wonderful theorem*. The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore.
- Noether, E. 1918. *Invariante variationsprobleme*. *Nachr. Ges. Wiss. Göttingen* **2**: 235-257.

- Palmer, T. 1980. Gravitational energy-momentum: The Einstein pseudotensor reexamined. *Gen. Rel. Grav.* **12**(2): 149-154.
- Persides, S. 1979. Energy and momentum in general relativity. *Gen. Rel. Grav.* **10**(7): 609-622.
- Rund, H. 1966. Variational problems involving combined tensor fields. *Abhandl. Math. Sem. Univ. Hamburg* **29**: 243-262.
- Rund, H. 1966. *The Hamilton-Jacobi theory in the calculus of variations. Its role in mathematics and physics.* D. Van Nostrand, London.
- Rund, H. and Lovelock, D. 1972. Variational principles in the general theory of relativity. *Jber. Deutsch. Math. Verein* **74**: 1-65.
- Schild, A. 1967. *Lectures on general relativity*, in 'Relativity theory and astrophysics. I' - Lectures in Applied Maths. **8**, ed. J. Ehlers, *Am. Math. Soc.* USA, 1-104.
- Sinaceur, M.A. 1990. Dedekind et le programme de Riemann. *Rev. Hist. Sci.* **43**: 221-294.
- Shah, K.B. 1967. Energy of a charged particle in Möller's tetrad theory. *Proc. Camb. Phil. Soc.* **63**: 1157-1160.
- Stachel, J. 1977. A variational principle giving gravitational superpotentials, the affine connection, Riemann tensor, and Einstein field equations. *Gen. Rel. Grav.* **8**(8): 705-715.
- Synge, J.L. 1967. A new pseudotensor with vanishing divergence. *Nature* **215**: 102.
- Synge, J.L. 1976. *Relativity: the general theory*, North-Holland, Amsterdam, Chap. 6
- Trautman, A. 1962. *Conservation laws in general relativity*, in 'Gravitation: an introduction to current research', ed. L. Witten, Wiley, New York, Chap. 5.
- Trautman, A. 1964. *Lectures on general relativity – Brandeis Summer*. Prentice-Hall, New Jersey.
- Trautman, A. 1967. Noether equations and conservation laws, *Commun. Math. Phys.* **6**(4): 248-261.
- Weyl, H. 1935. Emmy Noether. *Scripta Math.* **3**: 201-220.