



A 341191

A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis: The Eightfold Path to More Effective Problem Solving

Eugene Bardach

Richard and Rhoda Goldman School of Public Policy
University of California at Berkeley

CHATHAM HOUSE PUBLISHERS

SEVEN BRIDGES PRESS, LLC

NEW YORK • LONDON

Contents

Preface	xi
Introduction	xiii
Policy Analysis: More Art than Science	xiv
The Eightfold Path	xiv
Iteration Is Continual	xiv
Some of the Guidelines Are Practical, but Most Are Conceptual	xv
The Concepts Come Embedded in Concrete Particulars	xv
Your Final Product	xv
The Spirit of the Eightfold Path	xvi
Part I. The Eightfold Path	1
1. Define the Problem	1
<i>Think of Deficits and Excesses</i>	2
<i>The Definition Should Be Evaluative</i>	2
<i>Quantify If Possible</i>	4
<i>Conditions That Cause Problems Are Also Problems</i>	4
<i>Missing an Opportunity Is a Problem</i>	5
<i>Common Pitfalls in Problem Definition</i>	5
<i>Defining the solution into the “problem”</i>	
<i>Be skeptical about the causal claims implicit in diagnostic problem definitions</i>	
<i>Iterate</i>	7
2. Assemble Some Evidence	7
<i>Think Before You Collect</i>	9
<i>The value of evidence</i>	
<i>Self-control</i>	
<i>Do a Literature Review</i>	10

<i>Survey “Best Practice”</i>	10
<i>Use Analogies</i>	11
<i>Start Early</i>	11
<i>Touching Base, Gaining Credibility, Brokering Consensus</i>	11
<i>Freeing the Captive Mind</i>	12
3. Construct the Alternatives	12
<i>Start Comprehensive, End Up Focused</i>	12
<i>Model the System in Which the Problem Is Located</i>	14
<i>Reduce and Simplify the List of Alternatives</i>	16
<i>Design Problems</i>	17
<i>A Linguistic Pitfall</i>	19
4. Select the Criteria	19
<i>Apply Evaluative Criteria to Judging Outcomes, Not Alternatives</i>	19
<i>Criteria Selection Builds on Problem Definitions—and Continues</i>	20
<i>Evaluative Criteria Commonly Used in Policy Analysis</i>	20
<i>Efficiency</i>	
<i>Equality, equity, fairness, “justice”</i>	
<i>Freedom, community, and other ideas</i>	
<i>Weighting Conflicting Evaluative Criteria</i>	23
<i>The political process takes care of it</i>	
<i>The analyst imposes a solution</i>	
<i>Practical Criteria</i>	24
<i>Legality</i>	
<i>Political Acceptability</i>	
<i>Robustness and improvability</i>	
<i>Criteria in Optimization Models</i>	26
<i>Linear programming</i>	
<i>Improving linguistic clarity</i>	
5. Project the Outcomes	27
<i>Projection = Model + Evidence</i>	28
<i>Attach Magnitude Estimates</i>	29
<i>Break-Even Estimates</i>	29
<i>The Optimism Problem</i>	32
<i>Scenario writing</i>	
<i>The other-guy's-shoes heuristic</i>	
<i>Undesirable side effects</i>	
<i>The ethical costs of optimism</i>	
<i>The Outcomes Matrix</i>	35
<i>Linguistic Pitfalls</i>	36
6. Confront the Trade-Offs	37
<i>Commensurability</i>	38

<i>Break-even analysis revisited</i>	
<i>Without Projecting Outcomes, There's Nothing to Trade Off</i>	39
<i>Simplify the Comparison Process</i>	39
7. Decide!	40
<i>The Twenty-Dollar-Bill Test</i>	41
8. Tell Your Story	41
<i>The New York Taxi Driver Test</i>	41
<i>You, Your Client, and Your Audiences</i>	42
<i>What Medium to Use?</i>	42
<i>Your Story Should Have a Logical Narrative Flow</i>	43
<i>Some Common Pitfalls</i>	44
<i>Following the Eightfold Path</i>	
<i>Compulsive qualifying</i>	
<i>Showing your work</i>	
<i>Listing without explaining</i>	
<i>Style</i>	
<i>Report Format</i>	45
<i>Table format</i>	
<i>References and sources</i>	
<i>Memo Format</i>	46
<i>The Sound Bite and the Press Release</i>	46
Part II. Gathering Data for Policy Research	47
In the Beginning	48
Locating Relevant Sources	50
<i>Documents and People</i>	50
<i>People lead to people</i>	
<i>People lead to documents</i>	
<i>Documents lead to documents</i>	
<i>Documents lead to people</i>	
<i>Secondhand Information</i>	53
<i>Multiple Sources of Firsthand Information</i>	54
<i>The Search for Sources and the Search for Knowledge</i>	55
Gaining Access and Engaging Assistance	55
<i>Getting an Appointment</i>	56
<i>Cultivating Access</i>	58
<i>Exhausting Access</i>	58
Acquiring and Using Leverage	59
<i>Energy Plus Direction Equals Information</i>	60
<i>The Defensive Informant</i>	63

Protecting Credibility	67
<i>Policy Research Aims at Approximate Truths</i>	67
<i>The Risks of Premature Exposure</i>	68
Strategic Dilemmas of Policy Research	69
Part III. “Smart (Best) Practices” Research: Understanding and Making Use of What Look like Good Ideas from Somewhere Else	71
Have Realistic Expectations	71
“Smart Practices”	72
<i>Free Lunches</i>	72
<i>Breaking Loose from Conventions and Assumptions</i>	76
Characterizing and Observing the “Practice”	77
<i>Characterizing the Elements of a Practice</i>	77
<i>Distinguish between elements that are “essential” and those that are “supportive”</i>	
<i>Distinguish between “essential” and “optional” elements</i>	
<i>Distinguish between the functions each of the elements performs and the methods used to perform them</i>	
<i>Allowing for Variation and Complexity</i>	79
<i>Characterization should be generic and flexible, not prescriptive and overly precise</i>	
<i>Characterization of the essential elements of a practice is not necessarily simple; it could be complex</i>	
<i>Specimens of a smart practice in the real world look rather different from one another and require careful interpretation</i>	
<i>Generic Vulnerabilities</i>	81
<i>But Will It Work Here?</i>	82
<i>The Target Context</i>	
<i>The Source Contexts</i>	
<i>Back to the Eightfold Path</i>	84
Appendix A. Things Governments Do	87
I. Taxes	87
A. <i>What You Might Do</i>	87
B. <i>Why You Might Do It</i>	87
II. Regulation	88
A. <i>What You Might Do</i>	88
B. <i>Why You Might Do It</i>	88
III. Subsidies and Grants	89
A. <i>What You Might Do</i>	89

B. Why You Might Do It	89
<i>Incentive effects</i>	
<i>Wealth effects</i>	
<i>Some design problems</i>	
IV. Provide a Service	90
A. What You Might Do	90
B. Why You Might Do It	90
V. Agency Budgets	90
A. What You Might Do	90
B. Why You Might Do It	91
VI. Information	91
A. What You Might Do	91
B. Why You Might Do It	91
VII. Modify Structure of Private Rights	91
A. What You Might Modify or Create	91
B. Why You Might Do It	92
VIII. Modify Framework of Economic Activity	92
A. What You Might Do	92
B. Why You Might Do It	93
<i>Supporting more government intervention</i>	
<i>Supporting less government intervention</i>	
IX. Education and Consultation	93
A. What You Might Do	93
B. Why You Might Do It	93
X. Financing and Contracting	94
A. What You Might Do	94
B. Why You Might Do It	94
XI. Bureaucratic and Political Reforms	94
A. What You Might Do	94
B. Why You Might Do It	94
Appendix B. Semantic Tips: A Summary	97
Defining the Problem	97
Assembling the Evidence	98
Constructing the Alternatives	98
Selecting Criteria	99
Projecting Outcomes	100
Confronting Trade-offs	101
Doing Smart Practices Research	101