

Open access • Journal Article • DOI:10.1038/S41560-017-0007-X

A research agenda for a people-centred approach to energy access in the urbanizing global south — Source link <a> □

Vanesa Castán Broto, Lucy Stevens, Emmanuel Ackom, Julia Tomei ...+5 more authors

Institutions: University of Sheffield, Practical Action, Technical University of Denmark, University College London ...+2 more institutions

Published on: 02 Oct 2017 - Nature Energy (Nature Publishing Group)

Related papers:

- · Energy sovereignty and development planning: the case of Maputo, Mozambique
- · Incremental infrastructures: material improvisation and social collaboration across post-colonial Accra
- 'We Live on Estimates': Everyday Practices of Prepaid Electricity and the Urban Condition in Maputo, Mozambique
- Powering sub-Saharan Africa's urban revolution: An energy transitions approach
- · Energy access for sustainable development









- A research agenda for a people-centred approach to energy access in the urbanizing global south
- 2 Vanesa Castán Broto, Development Planning Unit, University College London
- 3 Lucy Stevens, Practical Action
- 4 Emmanuel Ackom, Technical University of Denmark and UNEP DTU Partnership
- 5 Julia Tomei, Institute of Sustainable Resources, University College London
- 6 Priti Parikh, Iwona Bisaga, UCL Civil, Environmental & Geomatic Engineering
- 7 Long Seng To, Low Carbon Energy for Development Network, Loughborough University
- 8 Josh Kirshner, Department of Geography, University of York
- 9 Yacob Mulugetta, Department of Science, Technology, Engineering and Public Policy, University
- 10 College London

11

- 12 Corresponding author: Vanesa Castán Broto, Bartlett Development Planning Unit, University College
- 13 London, 34 Tavistock Square, London, WC1H9EZ, UK. Email: v.castanbroto@ucl.ac.uk

14

15

Abstract

- 16 Energy access is typically viewed as a problem for rural areas, but people living in urban settings also
- 17 face energy challenges that have not received sufficient attention. A revised agenda in research and
- 18 practice that puts the user and local planning complexities centre stage is needed to change the way we
- 19 look at energy access in urban areas, to understand the implications of the concentration of vulnerable
- 20 people in slums and to identify opportunities for planned management and innovation that can deliver
- 21 urban energy transitions while leaving no one behind. Here, we propose a research agenda focused on
- three key issues: understanding the needs of urban energy users; enabling the use of context-specific,
- disaggregated data; and engaging with effective modes of energy and urban governance. This agenda
- requires interdisciplinary scholarship across the social and physical sciences to support local action and
- deliver large-scale, inclusive transformations.

26

27

28

- 29 The majority of people without access to electricity and clean fuels live in rural areas. Nevertheless,
- energy access challenges in urban areas are also significant and attract policy attention. Over 880 million
- 31 people live in slums in developing regions, in households that suffer multiple deprivations in urban
- services, space and security of tenure.² Such households routinely lack access to a reliable and affordable
- supply of electricity and clean fuels. About 105 million people lack electricity in urban areas in sub-
- 34 Saharan Africa alone.³ In countries like Malawi, Mozambique, Rwanda or Tanzania less than half of the
- 35 urban households have access to an electricity connection.² People living in urban areas face specific
- energy challenges, including: unreliability of energy services, lack of affordability, lack of access to
- 37 microfinance and insecurities related to tenure issues and the erroneous perceptions of slums.⁴
- Progress towards global objectives for universal energy access has been disappointing since the UN
- 39 Secretary-General launched them in 2011. According to the Global Tracking Framework, ³ 1.05 billion
- 40 people worldwide did not have access to electricity in 2014, down from 1.06 billion in 2012. The access
- rate increased 0.27% per year, which is not sufficient to achieve the goal of universal electrification by
- 42 2030. The figures for access to clean cooking are even more discouraging: over 3 billion people still
- 43 lacked access to clean fuels and technologies in 2014. With a rate of improvement of 0.46% a year, the
- 44 goal of achieving universal access to clean fuels and technologies by 2030 seems unachievable.
- The challenge of achieving universal access to modern energy services in urban areas highlights the
- strong linkages between two Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), SDG7 (Affordable and Clean
- 47 Energy) and SDG11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities). Both SDGs can be advanced simultaneously
- 48 through forms of inclusive urban planning that promote energy sustainability and resilience. This requires
- 49 two changes in policy approaches.
- First, policies need to address the lack of installed capacity for energy access and limited availability of
- clean fuels, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa. Addressing this persistent challenge will require a
- substantial amount of public finance while recognising a diversity of feasible provision models.^{6,7}
- 53 Progress has concentrated in Asia, where multi-actor efforts in the context of industrialisation have
- 54 improved the rates of energy access in urban areas. For example, in Indonesia, a national-level
- 55 programme including governmental institutions, businesses and consumers facilitated a large shift from
- 56 kerosene to Liquefied Petroleum Gas (LPG) and contributed directly to the alleviation of extreme
- 57 poverty. ^{8,9} In Sub-Saharan Africa, in contrast, energy access rates remain stagnant. Energy access rates
- have even worsened in countries such as the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Angola.
- 59 Second, there is a need to challenge dominant paradigms of energy provision. Unfortunately, the
- assumption that urbanisation is akin to an extension of the electricity grid has long dominated debates of
- energy access in urban areas. This assumption puts a disproportionate emphasis on electrification at the
- expense of understanding the need for fuels and technologies for clean cooking. ^{10,11} Moreover, this
- assumption obscures the complex ways in which energy access barriers manifest in urban areas and, in
- particular, the specific limitations that emerge in sub-serviced, informal or peri-urban areas. 12-16
- 65 Delivering sustainable energy access in urban areas requires a multidimensional understanding of users'
- 66 needs within diverse urban contexts.
- These two policy changes call for a renewed research agenda on universal access to sustainable energy in
- 68 urban areas. In this Perspective, we outline such an agenda, and frame progress towards sustainable
- 69 energy as a complex, multi-dimensional challenge in the next section. Delving deeper into why the global
- 70 energy challenge continues to haunt contemporary societies in the age of urbanisation, we then analyse
- barriers to energy access in urban areas. Finally, alongside a discussion of policy implications, we outline
- 72 the contours of an interdisciplinary research agenda that considers users' needs, explores data gaps and

prioritises systems of governance that can deliver urban energy services in a sustainable and equitable

74 manner.

75

Universal energy access is a multidimensional challenge

One of the greatest obstacles in achieving progress towards energy access is the dominance of a

- technocentric approach in policy and decision making. Energy provision is routinely thought of as a
- technical challenge, exclusively dependent on achieving economies of scale sufficient to extend grids or
- market chains. Most often, energy access is erroneously represented as a binary phenomenon, in which
- we can identify the precise moment after which energy needs are fully met. 4,17,18 This leads to definitions
- of energy access that are 'too modest' and do not reflect the multiple dimensions of energy demand.¹⁹
- 82 The energy ladder model dominates debates on urbanisation and energy access. This model assumes that
- 83 urbanisation enables households to move up the energy ladder because households rationalize the use of
- energy, adopting cleaner and more expensive fuels as their income increases. ²⁰ As a result, energy access
- in urban areas is most often treated as a homogeneous process of fuel adoption and grid expansion.
- 86 Empirical evidence has long shown, however, that households use multiple fuels simultaneously. 21 More
- 87 recently, the model has been redefined to focus on energy services rather than just fuels.²² Nevertheless,
- 88 the energy ladder model lacks explanatory power to explain why low income urban populations cannot
- access the services they need.
- 90 Instead, energy access should be understood as part of a progressive process of wellbeing improvement.
- 91 Access is not only dependent on the supply of electricity and fuels. The Global Tracking Framework
- already recognises, for example, that clean cooking depends both on the fuels and the technologies
- employed in cooking. Additional evidence shows that energy services also depend on the built
- environment, such as the space available for cooking, ventilation and illumination within buildings and
- available appliances.²³ From street lighting to the maintenance of greenspaces, energy access is closely
- linked to the development of the built environment and public space. In slums access to energy is directly
- 97 linked to livelihood opportunities, so investment in energy services is a key driver of development.²⁴
- 98 Rather than prioritising the delivery of a predetermined model of energy supply, programmes for
- 99 sustainable energy access should focus on delivering the types of service provision that will meet people's
- aspirations. Recent calls to focus on the productive uses of energy and the linkages to income generation
- aspirations. Recent cans to focus on the productive uses of energy and the mixages to meonic generation
- activities²⁵ highlight that achieving the SDG7 requires examining the socio-economic conditions and
- perspectives of those who lack energy access. Addressing energy access from a people's perspective
- involves location-specific interventions engaging communities in energy planning activities. 4,18 Energy
- access also depends on community involvement to develop business models that integrate technical
- concerns with institutional frameworks and user preferences. 26-28
- For example, more than half of the urban population in Rwanda lacks access to the electricity grid. While
- over 65% of the households were connected to the grid in Kigali in 2011, only 17% of the households had
- a grid connection in other cities in the country.³ Renewable energy technologies may provide an
- alternative to facilitate energy access. Some users of solar home systems in rural and peri-urban Rwanda
- require energy for in-household use only (e.g. lighting, mobile phone charging), while others require
- higher levels of access to power small businesses and bigger appliances, such as welding machines.¹⁸
- 112 User needs are addressed in performance contracts, called *imihigo*, which provide an official framework
- for achieving development goals at all levels of the country's administration, including at the household
- level. Each year, households sign official commitments, including commitments to improve energy
- access. The source of energy is then chosen depending on the resources available, their safety and
- 116 affordability.

- Energy access is linked to other basic services such as water and sanitation, and depends on programmes
- to upgrade the built environment. ^{29,30} Significant gains can be made through interventions in urban areas,
- even in countries where there have been clear advances in energy access. In Ghana, about 1.7 million
- people gained access to electricity every year from 2012 to 2014. Huge rolling blackouts, however, have
- compromised these advances, particularly for poorer households lacking backup systems. This case calls
- for research looking beyond infrastructure coverage to examine, for example, how poverty and energy
- access are correlated in urban areas and how to ensure supply reliability in poorer households.³¹
- The planning challenge is to provide electricity, cleaner fuels and technologies in rapidly growing urban
- and peri-urban areas within complex and often undefined institutional frameworks and ever growing
- demands for infrastructure. ¹² Inclusive energy planning processes can support the recognition of the
- unmet needs of the urban poor whilst simultaneously acknowledging the urgency of shifting aspirations
- among those whose energy uses are already unsustainable.^{3,32}

Challenges in urban areas

129

- Energy access is embedded within multiple tiered deprivation processes faced by the urban poor.
- 131 Changes to underlying factors, such as upgrades in the built environment, tenure status, access to decision
- making processes, or market access to key appliances, may have as much impact on people's energy
- access as any improvement in generation capacity or fuel supply. Three key reasons support the case for
- looking at energy access in urban areas: the prevalence of misunderstandings about energy access in
- urban areas; the concentration of vulnerable people in urban areas, especially in slums; and potential
- opportunities for planned management and innovation in business models at the local level.
- On-the-ground evidence of the challenges of energy access in urban areas is scant, and there have been
- 138 few efforts to document these experiences and compare them systematically. The Global Network on
- Energy for Sustainable Development (GNESD) and the Poor People's Energy Outlook (PPEO) are two
- pioneering efforts to develop a people-centred perspective on energy access which engage with the
- specific challenges of urban areas. GNESD is a UNEP-funded network that has studied energy access in
- urban areas since the mid-2000s, with regional studies in Kenya, Thailand, Brazil, Senegal, South Africa,
- Argentina, and India. The Poor People's Energy Outlook (PPEO) is an annual report funded by the UK
- Department for International Development and Practical Action since 2010. Both programmes have
- influenced policy making at the international level, for example, in the development of the Multi-Tier
- 146 Framework to assess energy poverty.³³
- 147 GNESD found that informal settlements are often subserviced and residents may have precarious
- structures of home ownership and limited access to both livelihood opportunities and institutions that can
- address their needs and concerns. Data produced at the national level rarely include slum areas which are
- often seen by governments (national and municipal) as illegal settlements.^{3,23} When data can be accessed,
- the needs of the urban poor may be underestimated because of the exclusion of informal settlements in the
- processes of documentation and planning. Problems in slums are 'invisible' when government officials do
- processes of documentation and planning. Problems in siding are invisible when government officials do
- not acknowledge their needs or even their existence. On the one hand, local governments may lack
- capacity to respond to the needs of informal settlements. On the other hand, urban development practices
- regularly ignore or misrepresent their existence, which may lead to conflicts over land and violence.³⁴
- Access to electricity in such conditions, for example through off-grid systems, may have transformative
- impacts both in terms of directly improving the lives of people at the household level, and enabling them
- to be recognised as urban citizens through the provision of services. Here again, communities and
- 159 cooperative societies play a key role in providing business alternatives which can help implement and
- deliver direct improvements in energy access to the urban poor. ^{26,35}

- The GNESD team analysed the barriers to energy access in urban areas, from both the supply side and the
- demand side. 18 Some of the barriers identified in the study relate to lack of planning; in countries such as
- 163 Kenya and Senegal, electrification has rarely been part of development planning. Further, lack of capacity
- within local governments translates into an absence of planning at the institutional level. Often, citizens
- distrust government institutions and public utilities and associate their practices with corruption,
- carelessness, and lack of interest to implement sound solutions.
- Barriers also emerge from the intersection of energy issues and urban social processes. For example, high
- upfront costs and lack of proof of residence often lead to unauthorized means to access energy, whether
- this is renting backyards to poor families in South Africa, connecting through neighbours in Thailand,
- 170 renting out electricity as a means of income generation in Kenya, or with the proliferation of unsafe
- 171 connections in India and Senegal. In the context of a total lack of access, improvisation may be the only
- alternative open to the urban poor,³⁶ but has consequences in terms of the quality of service, its safety, and
- the distribution of responsibilities (e.g. the urban poor may end up paying more for the same service). Key
- urban issues, such as lack of tenure or proof of address, continue to determine energy access.
- 175 The last PPEO report, launched in October 2016, focused on national energy access planning.³⁷ PPEO's
- case studies in cities like Maputo, Mozambique, show the limitations of a grid-based understanding of
- energy access in urban areas. ³⁸ Services do not always reach all urban areas, particularly in sub-serviced
- areas and unplanned neighbourhoods. Even when households have access to an electricity grid this is not
- an automatic guarantee of energy access since the service may be of poor quality and intermittent. Urban
- citizens may not be able to use the service because they cannot afford it or because they are not aware of
- how to use it. New energy services may be inappropriate to support certain cultural practices, or may
- overlap with other fuels that already meet energy needs.
- The PPEO provides evidence for the need to disaggregate energy access data alongside social variables.
- For example, gender is a key variable to understand energy access. Energy services shape possibilities for
- women to access other urban services, such as sanitation services in ill-lit public spaces, and livelihood
- opportunities. Women may benefit from access to energy but there is little information about how access
- to energy (or lack of thereof) affects women's labour and time. Data collected at the household level
- rarely reflects women's needs and aspirations. As a result, energy policies targeting women are the
- exception, rather than the norm. Other factors like age, disability, ethnic group, or sexual orientation may
- also influence how energy access affects everyday life.
- Another misunderstanding is the idea that large energy utilities are better able to contribute to the
- economy because they support large industrial and business areas. This does not recognise that the
- economies that support the urban poor are often characterised by a diversity of small enterprises which
- provide diverse local social and economic benefits. Access to energy at a scale targeted to support small
- enterprises can create direct livelihood opportunities for people living in slums. Often, small businesses
- and NGOs may also be effective in advancing context-based innovations. Alongside local governments,
- the private sector and civil society may also support action to facilitate access to sustainable energy. 27,28
- Both PPEO and GNESD are examples of a growing body of people-centered research on energy access in
- in urban areas, attending both at the manifestation of energy challenges in urban contexts and the
- 200 opportunities to advance global goals through local governance processes.

Urgent research agendas

201

- Achieving universal access to sustainable energy is an urgent challenge but progress against timescales
- 203 has been slow at best. In urban areas there is space for cautious optimism, as rapid urbanisation opens up
- 204 opportunities for investment and improved service delivery.
- The integration of urban development and energy planning agendas is a policy priority. Such integration
- requires understanding the multi-scalar nature of energy challenges and how they manifest in urban areas.
- There needs to be far greater consideration of often-ignored issues in energy policy including the needs of
- the urban poor for clean cooking, and for better grid and off-grid electricity access, in terms of supplies
- and appliances that will meet household needs and support productive uses and community facilities. It
- also requires an inclusive policy agenda to diversify the voices that intervene in energy planning. Policy-
- 211 makers should find the means to include the views of non-experts and disadvantaged communities in
- decision-making process, to understand their actual energy needs and how to meet them within present
- 213 constraints.
- Additional research is needed both to improve data collection and challenge long-held assumptions about
- energy access. We propose three questions to guide an emerging agenda of research. First, achieving the
- SDGs requires a true understanding of people's needs, their perspectives and aspirations. The research
- 217 question is: 'what are the users' needs in specific contexts?' The question calls for a deep engagement
- with people's aspirations while understanding the structural constraints that shape such aspirations.
- Second, there is an urgent need to improve the types of energy knowledge and data available. The
- question is: 'Do we have the appropriate information to address energy access questions?' There is a
- 221 chronic lack of data about energy use and demand, particularly for the urban poor living in rapidly
- 222 urbanising areas. Ongoing challenges include improving survey designs to allow data disaggregation and
- combine quantitative data with in-depth analyses from qualitative studies. Third, in urban areas, different
- types of actions may be effective to address context-specific constraints. The question is: 'what is the
- match between government policies for energy access and the needs of the urban poor?' Specifically, to
- what extent do existing systems of delivery suit people's needs? Do planning systems address noticeable
- deficiencies in service delivery? These questions invite a reconsideration of resource distribution and
- 228 institutional participation in energy planning, as well as people's representation in decision making
- processes.

234

- The research questions and policy recommendations outlined here emphasise models of energy delivery
- that recognise users' needs in context. These questions highlight the importance of socially inclusive
- action and applied interdisciplinary research to achieve broader transformations towards universal energy
- access in urban areas.

References

- 235 1 Ahlborg, H. & Hammar, L. Drivers and barriers to rural electrification in Tanzania and
- Mozambique Grid-extension, off-grid, and renewable energy technologies. *Renewable Energy* **61**, 117-124, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2012.09.057 (2014).
- 238 2 UN-Habitat. World Cities Report. (UN-Habitat, Nairobi, 2016).
- World Bank and International Energy Agency. Sustainable Energy for All 2017 Progress toward Sustainable Energy. (World Bank/International Energy Agency, Washington DC, 2017).
- Singh, R., Wang, X., Mendoza, J. C. & Ackom, E. K. Electricity (in) accessibility to the urban poor in developing countries. *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Energy and Environment* **4**, 339-
- 243 353 (2015).
- Bazilian, M. *et al.* Energy access scenarios to 2030 for the power sector in sub-Saharan Africa. *Utilities Policy* **20**, 1-16, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jup.2011.11.002 (2012).

- Glemarec, Y. Financing off-grid sustainable energy access for the poor. *Energy Policy* **47**, **Supplement 1**, 87-93, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.032 (2012).
- Onyeji, I., Bazilian, M. & Nussbaumer, P. Contextualizing electricity access in sub-Saharan Africa. *Energy for Sustainable Development* **16**, 520-527, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2012.08.007 (2012).
- Andadari, R. K., Mulder, P. & Rietveld, P. Energy poverty reduction by fuel switching. Impact evaluation of the LPG conversion program in Indonesia. *Energy Policy* **66**, 436-449, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2013.11.021 (2014).
- Budya, H. & Yasir Arofat, M. Providing cleaner energy access in Indonesia through the megaproject of kerosene conversion to LPG. *Energy Policy* **39**, 7575-7586, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2011.02.061 (2011).
- 257 10 Bhattacharyya, S. C. Energy access programmes and sustainable development: A critical review 258 and analysis. *Energy for Sustainable Development* **16**, 260-271, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2012.05.002 (2012).
- Rehman, I. H. *et al.* Understanding the political economy and key drivers of energy access in addressing national energy access priorities and policies. *Energy Policy* **47, Supplement 1**, 27-37, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.043 (2012).
- Kemausuor, F., Obeng, G. Y., Brew-Hammond, A. & Duker, A. A review of trends, policies and plans for increasing energy access in Ghana. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* **15**, 5143-5154, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2011.07.041 (2011).
- Melo, V. D. The Production of Urban Peripheries For and By Low-Income Populations at the Turn of the Millennium: Maputo, Luanda and Johannesburg. *Journal of Southern African Studies* **42**, 619-641, doi:10.1080/03057070.2016.1196955 (2016).
- Jenkins, P., Robson, P. & Cain, A. Local responses to globalization and peripheralization in Luanda, Angola. *Environment and Urbanization* 14, 115-127, doi:10.1177/095624780201400110 (2002).
- Nielsen, M. Inverse governmentality: The paradoxical production of peri-urban planning in Maputo, Mozambique. *Critique of Anthropology* **31**, 329-358, doi:10.1177/0308275x11420118 (2011).
- Jimenez-Redal, R., Parker, A. & Jeffrey, P. Factors influencing the uptake of household water connections in peri-urban Maputo, Mozambique. *Utilities Policy* **28**, 22-27, doi:10.1016/j.jup.2013.11.003 (2014).
- World Bank and International Energy Agency. Sustainable Energy for All 2015 Progress towards sustainable energy. (World Bank/International Energy Agency, Washington DC, 2015).
- 280 18 GNESD. Energy access realities in urban poor communities of developing countries: assessments and recommendations. (DTU/UNEP, Copenhagen, 2015).
- Bazilian, M. & Pielke, R. Making Energy Access Meaningful. *Issues in Science and Technology* **29**, 74-78 (2013).
- van der Kroon, B., Brouwer, R. & van Beukering, P. J. H. The energy ladder: Theoretical myth or empirical truth? Results from a meta-analysis. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews* **20**, 504-513, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2012.11.045 (2013).
- 287 21 Masera, O. R., Saatkamp, B. D. & Kammen, D. M. From Linear Fuel Switching to Multiple
 288 Cooking Strategies: A Critique and Alternative to the Energy Ladder Model. *World Development*289 28, 2083-2103, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(00)00076-0 (2000).
- Sovacool, B. K. Conceptualizing urban household energy use: Climbing the "Energy Services Ladder". *Energy Policy* **39**, 1659-1668 (2011).
- 292 23 WHO. Report on Global Urban Health. (WHO, 2016).
- Parikh, P., Chaturvedi, S. & George, G. Empowering change: The effects of energy provision on individual aspirations in slum communities. *Energy Policy* **50**, 477-485,
- 295 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.07.046 (2012).

- 296 25 Brew-Hammond, A. Energy access in Africa: Challenges ahead. *Energy Policy* **38**, 2291-2301, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2009.12.016 (2010).
- 298 26 Schillebeeckx, S. J. D., Parikh, P., Bansal, R. & George, G. An integrated framework for rural electrification: Adopting a user-centric approach to business model development. *Energy Policy* 300 48, 687-697, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.05.078 (2012).
- Chaurey, A., Krithika, P. R., Palit, D., Rakesh, S. & Sovacool, B. K. New partnerships and business models for facilitating energy access. *Energy Policy* **47**, 48-55, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2012.03.031 (2012).
- Sovacool, B. K. Expanding renewable energy access with pro-poor public private partnerships in the developing world. *Energy Strategy Reviews* **1**, 181-192, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2012.11.003 (2013).
- Smajgl, A., Ward, J. & Pluschke, L. The water–food–energy Nexus Realising a new paradigm. Journal of Hydrology **533**, 533-540, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhydrol.2015.12.033 (2016).
- Vieira, A. S. & Ghisi, E. Water-energy nexus in low-income houses in Brazil: the influence of integrated on-site water and sewage management strategies on the energy consumption of water and sewerage services. *Journal of Cleaner Production* **133**, 145-162, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.05.104 (2016).
- 313 Aglina, M. K., Agbejule, A. & Nyamuame, G. Y. Policy framework on energy access and key 314 development indicators: ECOWAS interventions and the case of Ghana. *Energy Policy* **97**, 332-342, doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2016.07.012 (2016).
- 316 32 Satterthwaite, D. & Sverdlik, A. Energy access and housing for low-income groups in urban areas. in *Energizing sustainable cities* (eds A. Grubler & D. Fisk) 73-94 (Routledge, 2013).
- 318 33 Bhatia, M. & Angelou, N. Beyond connections: energy access redefined. Executive Summary. 319 *IBRD/WB, Washington, D. C* (2015).
- 320 34 Watson, V. African urban fantasies: dreams or nightmares? *Environment and Urbanization* **26**, 321 215-231, doi:10.1177/0956247813513705 (2013).
- 322 Amanor, K. S. & Chichava, S. South-South Cooperation, Agribusiness, and African Agricultural 323 Development: Brazil and China in Ghana and Mozambique. *World Development* **81**, 13-23, 324 doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2015.11.021 (2016).
- 325 36 Silver, J. Incremental infrastructures: material improvisation and social collaboration across post-326 colonial Accra. *Urban Geography* **35**, 788-804, doi:10.1080/02723638.2014.933605 (2014).
- 327 37 Practical Action. 2016 Poor People's Energy Outlook (Rugby, UK: Practical Action Publishing, http://dx.doi.org/10.3362/9781780449357, 2016).
- 329 38 Castán Broto, V., Stevens, L. & Salazar, D. Energy Access and Urban Poverty- Energy and
 330 Everyday Life in an Informal Settlement in Maputo, Mozambique: Poor People's Energy Briefing
 331 4. (Practical Action, Rugby, 2015).