

2019

# An Exploration of the Nongovernmental Organization-State Relationship Through a Postinternational Framework

Dana-Marie Ramjit  
*Walden University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations>

 Part of the [International Relations Commons](#), [Public Administration Commons](#), and the [Public Policy Commons](#)

---

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection at ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact [ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu](mailto:ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu).

# Walden University

College of Social and Behavioral Sciences

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Dana-Marie Ramjit

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,  
and that any and all revisions required by  
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee

Dr. Anne Hacker, Committee Chairperson,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Michael Knight, Committee Member,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Tanya Settles, University Reviewer,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Chief Academic Officer  
Eric Riedel, Ph.D.

Walden University  
2019

Abstract

An Exploration of the Nongovernmental Organization-State Relationship Through a  
Postinternational Framework

by

Dana-Marie Ramjit

MSc, University of the West Indies, 2009

BA, University of the West Indies, 2007

Proposal Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy & Administration

Walden University

August 2019

## Abstract

Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and the state contribute considerably to the unique state of Caribbean politics, yet their relationship is turbulent which prevents effective policymaking. Specifically, the problem this study addressed is the turbulent relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational framework. The purpose of this research was to provide an explanation of the NGO-state relationship through the postinternational concepts of turbulence and distant proximities. Data for this study were acquired through open-ended surveys from 22 leaders of NGOs and publicly available documentation pertaining to the relationship between government and NGOs. These data theoretically coded and subjected to a thematic analysis procedure. The results indicated that the NGO-state relationship can be best described as turbulent and characteristic of a distant proximity, thereby implying that the relationship between the participants is characterized by a dynamic tension and the efficacy of the relationship is further exacerbated by distance and proximity. Further, there was evidence of advocacy coalitions (or non-advocacy coalitions) in the relationships and the state can be resistant to engage in participation. The positive social change implications stemming from this study include opportunities for further academic investigation and presents new knowledge of the NGO-State relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. This understanding enhances social change by offering direction in the creation and modification of public policies in the Caribbean.

An Exploration of the Nongovernmental Organization-State Relationship Through a  
Postinternational Framework

by

Dana-Marie Ramjit

MSc, University of the West Indies, 2009

BA, University of the West Indies, 2007

Proposal Submitted in Partial Fulfillment  
of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy & Administration

Walden University

August 2019

## Dedication

To my late father and grandfather who always inspired me to work hard.

## Acknowledgments

This study would not have been possible without the support, encouragement and love of family, friends and colleagues. I am grateful to many people who have supported me in this journey. I would like to express my heartfelt thanks to several people.

To my Lord Jesus Christ for providing me with the blessings I needed to complete this work, I am ever thankful.

My second note of thanks is to my chair, Dr. Anne J. Hacker who spent much of her time supervising me and guiding my study. Your encouragement helped me to grow professionally. I extend thanks to Walden University staff. I am grateful for your support.

I am grateful to family who supported me in numerous ways during this journey. Their love is unquestionable and a great source of strength.

Finally, to my husband, who sacrificed and encouraged me to complete this work.

## Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study .....	1
Background .....	1
Problem Statement.....	5
Purpose of the Study .....	7
Research Question .....	10
Theoretical Framework.....	10
Nature of the Study .....	15
Operational Definitions.....	18
Assumptions .....	18
Scope and Delimitations .....	20
Limitations .....	22
Significance of the Study .....	23
Summary .....	26
Chapter 2: Literature Review .....	28
Literature Search Strategy.....	29
Theoretical Foundation .....	30
Postinternationalism: A Theory of Turbulence .....	30
Distant Proximities.....	34
A Changing World .....	38
Pinocchio's Problem .....	41
The Plus Non-State Framework.....	43



Cheesy Governance.....	44
Conceptual Jailbreaks.....	47
Nationalism.....	50
Internationalism .....	55
Postcolonialism.....	61
The State in Trinidad and Tobago: Its History and Role .....	68
NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago .....	74
Caribbean Sovereignty .....	80
Hurricanes in the Caribbean .....	83
Moving forward – the policy making process .....	88
Qualitative Method – General Qualitative Study .....	91
Summary .....	91
Chapter 3: Research Method.....	94
Research Design and Rationale .....	94
Role of the Researcher .....	97
Methodology .....	98
Participant Selection Logic .....	99
Instrumentation.....	101
Content Validity .....	103
Procedures for Recruitment, Participation, and Data Collection .....	104
Data Analysis Plan.....	107
Issues of Trustworthiness .....	111

Ethical Procedures .....	112
Summary .....	113
Chapter 4: Results.....	114
Setting 115	
Demographics.....	116
Data Collection Procedures .....	116
Data Analysis .....	117
Trustworthiness .....	119
Results 119	
Theme 1: The Statics of Continuity .....	120
Theme 2: Lack of financial support .....	122
Theme 3: Political affiliation .....	122
Theme 4: A weak relationship .....	123
Theme 1: Localization.....	124
Theme 2: NGO scope & popularity .....	125
Theme 3: International affiliations strength the NGO-state relationship.....	125
Theme 1: Closed decision-making.....	126
Theme 2: Closed political system .....	127
Summary .....	128
Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations .....	130
Introduction .....	130
Interpretation of Findings.....	131

Limitations of the study .....	142
Recommendations.....	143
Implications for social change.....	144
Recommendations for Practice .....	146
Conclusion.....	146
References .....	148
Appendix A: Letter of Invitation.....	177
Appendix B: Reminder e-mail invitation.....	178
Appendix C: Codebook .....	180
Appendix D: Survey Protocol .....	181
Appendix E: Document sources .....	183
Appendix F: Aggregate Frequency Table.....	184

## Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study

In this study, I explored the nongovernmental organization (NGO) and state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago by using a postinternational framework.

Understanding the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago is important as the country is one of the wealthiest and leading nations in the Caribbean, but still faces numerous economic, social, and political challenges. The greatest contribution of this research is that it provided the empirical data on NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago, their activities, and their perceptions of this relationship. This information will allow policy makers to design and redesign policies based on the dynamics of this relationship to promote greater collaboration to build a better nation. This research on the Trinidad and Tobago NGO-state relationship provided opportunities for further research to refine and elaborate on its findings. This chapter begins with a background to the problem, followed by the problem statement, purpose of study, and the study's primary research question. I introduce the theoretical framework for the study, along with the nature of the study and operational definitions for exploring the phenomenon under study. I conclude the chapter with a discussion of the assumptions, scope and delimitations, limitations, and the significance of the study.

### **Background**

Operating as a third sector in society, NGOs are important actors in development, human rights, the environment, culture, policy, research, democracy and in other areas. NGOs have been the subject of much discussion, study and analysis, and have been at the

center of international relations for some time (Aho, 2017; Dar, 2015). While NGOs have been around for centuries, they only acquired international recognition in the 1980s and 1990s (Karns, Mingst & Stiles, 2015). NGOs are becoming necessary due to an apparent decline of state prominence and are now legitimate entities, occupying a level position with the state on the international stage (Pineda, 2013). Today, NGO involvement in negotiations and policymaking speak to its capacity to become major political actors (Blasiak, et al., 2017). The study of NGOs in modern society is interesting and necessary.

The Caribbean has felt the effects of the presence of NGOs. In fact, the growth of NGOs has contributed meaningfully to democratization in the region (Brown, 2015; Pineda, 2013). In February 2017, the EU awarded 17 nongovernmental organizations \$5 million for projects in governance and human rights, acknowledging the critical role played by NGOs in shaping government policies and fostering peace (Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, 2017). In 2017, the Trinidad and Tobago Chamber of Commerce partnered with the NGO Habitat for Humanity for their Leaders Build 2017 initiative, to build homes for marginalized communities (Harrinanan, 2017). These examples demonstrate, among many others, the attempts made by NGOs to collaborate on critical issues in Trinidad and Tobago.

However, NGOs are not without their challenges. While NGOs are critical actors in society, they are also criticized as distrustful agents with alternative agendas (Afaq, 2013; Bourillon, Flores, & Fulton, Moreno, 2017; Hickey, Phillip, Saint Ville, & 2017). Caribbean NGOs have been affected by globalization, the rise of neoliberal politics, and

regional integration and state reforms, which have altered their political, economic, social and cultural conditions (Bowen, 2013; Brown, 2015). Moreover, NGOs are faced with structural problems such as financial interdependence and legal regulations (Bowen, 2013; Moreno, et al., 2017). Perrone (2009) recounted that NGO participation for developing regions like the Caribbean are the weakest, with funding being the most critical problem (Perrone, 2009). Pino (2010) found that NGOs are challenged by a lack of respect, recognition and resources from the state (Pino, 2010). Civil society in Trinidad and Tobago and the Caribbean remains disturbed, due to lack of recognition from and involvement by the state (Ali, Miller & Ponce de Leon, 2017; Pino, 2010). While they are nongovernmental, they are constantly monitored by the state; a reminder of their lack of power and authority (Alvare, 2010). Ultimately, it appears the state has ostracized civil society organizations and this climate has made it difficult for cooperation and integration (Grenade, 2013). NGOs are seriously weakened by these challenges.

Politics in the Caribbean is complex and interesting. Since independence in 1962, the Caribbean faced political adversity (Grenade, 2013). A former British colony, Trinidad and Tobago achieved independence in 1962 but maintained a Westminster model of governance. This model of government enables parliamentary democracy, fair elections, transparency, and the establishment of autonomous institutions (Kirton, 2010). Still, the region faced challenges to governance such as excessive state control, a distorted electoral system, political clientelism, corruption, and an unhappy, isolated population, and this is continuing (Kirton, 2010; Milhaput & Pargendler, 2017). The

political history of Trinidad and Tobago can be summed up as a winner-takes-all approach (Grenade, 2013). While citizens in Trinidad and Tobago enjoy freedom and liberties, excessive state power has marginalized NGOs and facilitates corruption and poor governance (Grenade, 2013). Ultimately, citizens in Trinidad and Tobago are disenchanted and dissatisfied with its political culture. A political transformation to include that includes greater power sharing and unity among sectors is necessary (Apostolos, Johnson, Kuhns, Maguire, &, 2017; Grenade, 2013). In this study, I began this process by providing an understanding of the NGO-state relationship.

In this study, I touched on an understudied region of the world. While many researchers have studied postinternationalism, no study has yet been done on the application of this theory to the NGO-state relationship in the Caribbean country of Trinidad and Tobago. Moreover, the concepts of Rosenau's (2003) turbulence and distant proximities have not been specifically highlighted to explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago (Rosenau, 2003). Through this research, I attempted to fill a major gap as it may also be applied to other Caribbean countries with similar histories and small state challenges.

Understanding the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago is important because each sector has its own respective role. Postinternationalism came out of the need to describe the interactions that take place in world politics without the involvement of states (Rosenau, 1990). Rosenau (2003) believed that these profound changes taking place in world affairs can be described as turbulence and distant

proximities (Rosenau, 2003). Turbulence reflects a disturbance in world affairs in which tension and changes arise due to the dynamism and complexity of diverse actors (Rosenau, 1990). Distant proximities reflect this tension between the national and the transnational characterized by contradictions, ambiguities, complexities and uncertainties (Rosenau, 2003). The relationship between NGOs and the state appears turbulent and can be likened to a distant proximity.

NGO-state relations in Trinidad and Tobago can be characterized by tensions. In November 2014 the Network of NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago, an umbrella organization representing over 100 NGOs, highlighted its unsuccessful attempts over the years to convince the state to approve a proposed gender policy which would guarantee civic rights and equality to women (Powers, 2014). The Network believed that the state had intentionally mischaracterized the details of their draft policy to prevent the document from passing, as they argued the policy legalized abortion and same-sex marriage (Powers, 2014). This antagonism is disastrous for the NGO-State relationship and must be addressed to promote positive social change in the Caribbean.

### **Problem Statement**

The rise of NGOs in the Caribbean has impacted politics. With its history of slavery and colonialism, the state in Trinidad and Tobago cherishes its power and authority. Prime ministers in the Caribbean are described as first among equals, authorized by constitution to select the Governor General, Speaker of the House, President of the Senate, heads of mission, diplomats and the civil service (Ministry of the



Attorney General and Legal Affairs, 1976; The Barbados Advocate, 2013). This immense power is now being threatened by NGOs who are making their mark in politics today (Alleyne, 2017). Studies of politics in a contemporary world cannot ignore the challenges, needs and value of civil society.

NGOs in the Caribbean have a unique story. Davies (2013) described NGO history as long and turbulent (Davies, 2013). Caribbean NGOs have their roots in antislavery groups like the British Abolitionist Society and the Quakers, which lobbied for the abolition of the slave trade in 18th century (Davies, 2013). Their work led to the abolition of the slave trade in Trinidad and Tobago in 1834, making it the first country in the world to declare a national holiday to honor the abolition of slavery (Trinidad and Tobago News, 2003). Regrettably, the Cabinet of Trinidad and Tobago only installed an NGO unit in 2011, which was only officially implemented in 2013, to manage the relationship between the government and NGOs (Ministry of Social Development and Family Services, 2017). In 2016, a former minister of parliament and administrator for the Living Water Community, appealed for greater state support, as NGOs are wasting time raising funds, instead of saving lives (Tack, 2016). NGOs feel neglected by the state due to a flawed consultative process that is time bound and offers little room for dialogue (Brothers, 2016). The relationship between these two entities is complex and must be assessed since it dictates the future of Trinidad and Tobago society and politics.

This study builds on several related studies of NGOs in the Caribbean. Bowen (2013) advanced the challenges facing civil society in the Caribbean and presented a

remedial approach to addressing these challenges through proper consultation and policy measures to strengthen participation. Pineda (2013) focused on the ability of NGOs in the Caribbean to support the state to deal with poverty and development (Pineda, 2013). Pino (2010) studied civil society groups in Trinidad and Tobago and concluded that a major challenge for these groups was legitimacy and lack of involvement (Pino, 2010). Alvare (2010) studied the contribution of grassroots NGOs to problems in Trinidad and Tobago (Alvare, 2010). However, studies on postinternationalism in the Caribbean are limited, and on its evaluation of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago, are nonexistent.

While these highlighted studies are important, they do not provide an explanation of the NGO-state relationship in contemporary Trinidad and Tobago. An exploration of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective accounts for the shifts in power taking place in Caribbean society and provides direction for the future of this relationship. This understanding is necessary in promoting positive social change and effective policymaking in the Caribbean.

### **Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this study was to explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework. Although it is easy to observe the interaction between NGOs and the state in the Caribbean, the dynamics surrounding this relationship is not very well understood. While much literature exists on the NGO-state relationship, there is no research on the dynamics of this relationship in Trinidad and

Tobago from a postinternational perspective. I explored the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago by two central concepts of Rosenau's (1990; 2003) postinternationalism: distant proximities and turbulence.

I conducted a general qualitative comparative study on the NGO-state relationship using a postinternational framework. A research paradigm is a set of beliefs and agreements among scientists about how problems should be understood and addressed (Kuhn, 1963). Creswell (2009) believed that the constructivist/interpretivist approach share the belief that reality is interpreted, and people embody multiple realities. In this study, I adopted a constructivist/interpretivist approach to explore the distinct realities of NGOs and the state primarily through survey research with open ended questions.

The NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago was worth studying because Trinidad and Tobago is one of the most prosperous countries in the Caribbean. Trinidad and Tobago maintains one of the highest GDP per capita incomes in Latin America and the Caribbean (Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade, 2014). Trinidad and Tobago is the largest CARICOM economy and plays a leading role in Caribbean regional integration. Trinidad and Tobago is home to one of the largest natural gas liquefaction facilities in the Western Hemisphere with the United States being the country's largest trading partner (Central Intelligence Agency, 2017). In 2013, Trinidad and Tobago was the world's sixth largest exporter of liquefied natural gas (LNG) and the largest LNG exporter to the United States, accounting for nearly 74% of US LNG imports (Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade, 2014). Trinidad and Tobago's future looks

promising due to its stable democratic government and educated workforce (Central Intelligence Agency, 2017). Trinidad and Tobago is clearly a leader in the Caribbean region.

Additionally, Trinidad is a haven for investment and business. Popular sectors for investment and growth in Trinidad and Tobago are tourism, agriculture, shipping and information and computer technologies “ICTs” (Central Intelligence Agency, 2017). Despite these possibilities, Trinidad and Tobago remains a third-world nation and like many others, is at the center of global inequality debates (Pineda, 2013). In addition, rising national debt, a dependence on food imports and food aid, the return of preventable diseases and poverty, weaken Trinidad and Tobago (Brown, 2015; Caribbean Center for Money and Finance, 2016). In this vulnerable region, development is critical, and this study is useful because it will provide strategic direction on the roles both the state and NGOs can play if the nation wants to achieve its goal of developed nation status.

Trinidad and Tobago has over 800 active NGOs in different sectors that have made significant progress within and outside of the Caribbean (Brown, 2015; Ministry of Social Development and Family Services, 2017). This is remarkable for a small nation. However, the biggest challenge facing NGOs today is funding (Raphael, 2017). In a time when state and donors are making significant budget cuts, NGOs must gain respect to attract funding (Raphael, 2017). Moreover, to survive NGOs must build relationships around transparency, accountability, compliance and global changes (Raphael, 2017). This study is important because both NGOs and the state depend on each other: the state

for delivery of crucial services and NGOs for funding and technical support (Brothers, 2016). An understanding of the NGO-state relationship can strengthen the collaboration between both sectors.

In studying the relationship between NGOs and the state, I was interested in Rosenau's (1990) postinternationalism, and specifically its concepts of turbulence and distant proximities (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Postinternationalism describes the contemporary political environment as turbulent: dynamic and complex (Rosenau, 2003). Due the variety and number of actors present today, state-centric systems are losing preeminence and are forced to exist in a multi-centric environment (Rosenau, 2003). Moreover, tensions exist between the state and nonstate actors since each sector is vying for power and influence; the forces of localization (state) and globalization (NGOs) fighting each other (Rogers, 2016; Rosenau, 2003). This theory adequately describes the contemporary political environment unfolding in Trinidad and Tobago.

### **Research Question**

This study provided one explanation of the NGO-State relationship through a postinternationalist framework. From this perspective, the following principal research question emerged: What are the perceptions of NGOs and the state of their relationship as characteristic of turbulence and distant proximities?

### **Theoretical Framework**

This study was grounded in Rosenau's (1990) theory of postinternationalism, specifically focusing on the major elements which characterize world politics: turbulence

and distant proximities (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Focusing on a historical era which began after World War II and continues today, postinternationalism was first introduced to the literature in 1990 by Rosenau (1990; 2003) and is still explaining trends in politics today (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Referring to an environment with changing orientations and shifting authority among diverse actors, postinternationalism reflects the dynamics of global turbulence (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Hobbs, 2000; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). This turbulence occurs when the structures that sustain world politics are unsettled and experience restructuring (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Postinternationalism provides an explanation of politics that cannot be overlooked.

I used postinternationalism for this study because it characterizes modern-day society in Trinidad and Tobago. Pawelz (2016) stated that people have lost confidence in the state's ability to guarantee safety, as gangs have become influential social and political actors on the island. McCoy & Knight (2017) highlighted Trinidad and Tobago as a center for terrorism due to its radical Islamic community which led to an Islamic insurrection in 1990, its high rate of extremist travelers and its sophisticated network of drug smuggling and human trafficking (McCoy & Knight, 2017). In June 2017, there were 255 murders on this tiny island of no more than 1.3 million people (Trinidad and Tobago Crime Statistics, 2017). This is compared to a total of 478 murders for the year 2016 (Trinidad and Tobago Crime Statistics, 2017). In an interview in April 2017, the prime minister of Trinidad and Tobago highlighted that the society has become violent

and lawless (Daily Express, 2017). These problems weaken the state and calls for greater collaboration with civil society.

Contemporary society cannot be defined without the role of civil society. NGOs contribute to society by providing key services, as capacity builders, innovators, advocates and watchdogs (Moreno, et. al., 2017; Saint Ville, et al., 2017). NGOs are continuing to expand and deepen their roles and today, hold the power and influence the state no longer dictates (Ali, et al., 2017; Brown; 2015). Despite their importance, their relationship with the state is far from perfect as they are faced with a lack of dialogue, funding, recognition, and respect, to name a few challenges (Ali et al., 2017; Bowen, 2013; Brothers, 2016; Perrone, 2009; Pino, 2010). There is tension between state and nonstate actors, both trying to assert their relevance. This complex and turbulent atmosphere is a main feature of politics in the postinternational world.

Postinternationalism describes contemporary politics as turbulence. Turbulence exists when state-centric systems are invaded by decentralized multi-centric systems (Rosenau, 2003). Since both systems are mutually exclusive, power becomes confused (Rosenau, 2003). Furthermore, the processes of globalization and localization create distant proximities as globalization (distant) forces press for greater globalization, while localization (proximate) forces press for greater localization (Rosenau, 2003). The tension between these two forces speak to the dynamism and complexity that is the essence of postinternationalism.

I used postinternationalism in this study to explain politics in the Caribbean. Rosenau (2003) believed that postinternationalism was the best approach to understand world politics (Rosenau, 2003). The study of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago is focused on how the state, representative of localization, interacts with NGOs, representatives of globalization. In this relationship, globalization and localization are contradictory forces. While globalization transcends national boundaries, is unlimited and unpreventable, localization features a narrowing of horizons; a retreat to less encompassing systems (Rosenau, 2003). Therefore, localization and globalization are representative of past epochs versus the current complex environment that emerged after World War II and continues (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). This distinction is important to understanding the postinternational world.

The processes of globalization and localization are dominant in postinternationalism. To further explore their impact, Rosenau (1990; 2003) used the metaphor of a violin. Like a poorly built violin that cuts the instrument's sound as fast as bow leaves the string, so past epochs attempted to maintain their system of politics (localization). On the contrary, a good violin vibrates the entire instrument, sustaining and amplifying its sound in the same way globalization has impacted and is continuing to impact the entire world (Rosenau, 2003). In this context, the state represents localization, while NGOs represent globalization. Events are no longer local, but countries are interdependent, and events are now global. Clearly, the nature and process of politics has been realigned.



Coupled with globalization and localization are the notions of state-centrism versus multi-centrism. These conflicting notions were used by Rosenau (1990; 2003) to explain the transition from previous epochs to the current era, localization to globalization and a bipolar to multipolar world (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). A multi-centric world is made up of complex actors who determine political outcomes (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). This creates tensions among political actors like the state and NGOs. The state in Trinidad and Tobago maintains a controlling interest in the management of the country's natural resources since most corporations in oil, gas, steel and telecommunications, are state-owned (U.S. Encyclopedia of the Nations, 2015). The World Bank characterized the state in Trinidad and Tobago as overstuffed, bureaucratic, and obstructive to competition in the energy industry (Encyclopedia of the Nations, 2017). This contrasts with the focus of NGOs on diversification of the economy. Furthermore, NGOs believed the economic model of Trinidad and Tobago is not sustainable as the country continues to face economic problems (Caribbean News Now, 2014; Worrel, 2016). Conflict is embedded in relations between NGOs and the state.

Politics in Trinidad and Tobago is best explained by postinternationalism. Postinternational politics is changing, inconsistent, and includes abundant diverse forces, which limit, weaken and rearrange systems (Rosenau, 2003). Trinidad and Tobago is witnessing a realignment of its political authority structures and the NGO-state relationship must be assessed in moving forward.

To this end, my aim for this study was to understand the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational framework. Postinternationalism is suitable to study for two central reasons. First, postinternationalism explains politics in the contemporary society. Second, postinternationalism is distinct in its discussions of turbulence and distant proximities to explain the relationship between state and nonstate actors. Hence, postinternationalism was the best way to answer this study's primary research question: What are the perceptions of the NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago of their relationship as characteristic of turbulence and distant proximities? Subsequent research and application of postinternationalism offers guidance on determining the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago and contributes to social change through effective policy-making.

### **Nature of the Study**

To explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago, I chose a qualitative approach. Unlike quantitative methods, qualitative methods do not test hypotheses, but explain the social world (Creswell, 2009; Merriam, 2009). The aim of this study was to understand the experiences of NGOs and the state. Qualitative research is fitting for studies that explore complex issues (Clisset, 2008; Creswell, 2009; Schwandt, 2007). The NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago is surrounded by several complexities: the country's colonial past, small state vulnerability, challenges to Caribbean sovereignty, inadequate resources and poor technical capacity, to name a few. Qualitative research is appropriate when there is limited research on a topic as it allows

the researcher to fill a gap through description, analysis and interpretation (Leedy and Omrod, 2005). Hence, qualitative research was the best fit for research on the NGO-state relationship in the understudied nation of Trinidad and Tobago.

A general qualitative study is not guided by specific philosophies like phenomenology, ethnography, case study or grounded theory, but combines existing methodologies to create something new, and stands as a suitable approach to qualitative research (Caelli, et al., 2003; Creswell, 2009; Merriam, 1998). This study used a general qualitative method of research to explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational framework for several reasons.

First, like all qualitative studies, the general qualitative study is aimed at understanding perceptions, motivations, experiences and behaviors (Clisset, 2008; Jeffries, 2005; Merriam, 2009; Schwandt, 2007). Specifically, the general qualitative method is focused on how people interpret their experiences, how they construct reality and the meaning they attribute to their experiences (Kennedy, 2016; Merriam, 2009; Percy et al., 2015). This study was aimed at understanding how NGOs and the state interpret their experiences and how they make meaning of their different but related worlds.

Prior research on the NGO-state relationship has shown turbulence between both entities. However, this research expands previous knowledge by asking *how* NGOs and the state think and feel about their relationship. A general qualitative study is suitable when the researcher has foreknowledge about a topic but would like to describe further

from the participants' perspectives (Percy, et al., 2015). Percy, Kostere & Kostere (2015) believed that researchers who wish to study people's subjective views on happenings and events should utilize the general qualitative method.

In this study I explored the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational framework. It was aimed at understanding the perceptions of both entities of their relationship for comparison. Participants provided a rich description of the NGO-state relationship. The methods used for a general qualitative study is usually highly inductive involving codes, categories and thematic analysis (Lim, 2011). For this study, I collected data through open-ended surveys and analyzed from different perspectives to allow for an interpretation that provides a meaningful contribution to the literature.

For this study I conducted open ended surveys with NGOs and the state. I examined and analyzed the data collected manually. I analyzed data for this study using open and process coding of themes and the creation of categories to establish links that can be verified against the data. I then integrated this information into the theory of postinternationalism to explain the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. I compared views of NGOs and the state on their relationship for greater explanation of postinternationalism. Finally, I presented my interpretations.

### **Operational Definitions**

*Postinternationalism* - a term developed by Rosenau (1990), used to refer to the historical period which began after World War II and continues today, characterized by flux and transition, chaos and coherence.

*Turbulence* - tensions and changes which arise due to a rearrangement of world politics (state-centric systems invaded by a decentralized multi-centric system causing a confused conception of authority structures) (Rosenau, 1990).

*Distant proximities* – reflects the idea that world affairs is both distant and proximate; what was once remote is close-at-hand due to globalization (Rosenau, 2003).

*Fragmegration* – a term developed by Rosenau (2003) to explain the interaction between fragmenting and integrating dynamics (how localization, decentralization and fragmentation are linked with globalization, centralization and integration).

### **Assumptions**

I identified several assumptions related to this research which must be outlined. An assumption in research can be defined as a belief that forms the basis for the research (Simon, 2011). While they cannot be controlled, assumptions cannot be overlooked since they contribute to the relevance of the study (Simon, 2011). The following assumptions were important for this study.

Fundamental to this study was the assumption that Rosenau's postinternationalism (1990; 2003) is the most effective approach to understanding the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago, and that most researchers have failed to identify this link. While

Rosenau's postinternationalism (1990; 2003) was specifically applied by Rosenau (1998) to the complex environment in the Caribbean, this study builds on Rosenau's (1990; 1998; 2003) analysis with current supporting literature.

Some of the more recent applications of Rosenau's postinternationalism is Gordon's (2017) reference to distant proximities as an explanation of porous borders and the establishment of collective action, Awad's (2017) discussion of multiple levels of governance and Dell'Aguzzo & Diodato's (2016) exploration of political turbulence. Rogers (2009) also applied postinternationalism to explore small arms controls. In addition, a handful of researchers have built on Rosenau's (1990; 2003) postinternationalism. These are Hobbs (2000), Astrov (2002), Chong (2002) and Ferguson and Mansbach (2007). Despite this, no study has examined postinternationalism in specific context of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago.

Additionally, it was assumed that the specific concepts of turbulence and distant proximities can explain and characterize the interaction between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago. Turbulence explores a dynamic environment marked by complexities (Rosenau, 1990). Distant proximities refer to tensions between states and nonstates, that are complex, complementary and competitive (the tension between globalization and localization) (Rosenau, 1990). Today, in Trinidad and Tobago there are over 800 active NGOs, some of whose work is done without the involvement of the state (Ministry of Social Development, 2017). Still, many NGOs work with governments on important initiatives, but with limited authority and room for dialogue. One of the

concerns of the NGO community in Trinidad and Tobago is the lack of recognition and funding from the state (Brothers, 2016; Pineda, 2013). It is obvious that both sectors depend on each other. Hence, this relationship is best characterized by turbulence and distant proximities.

Finally, I assumed that the research participants will be objective about the questions they will be asked. This assumption is justified since I ensured that anonymity and confidentiality were preserved, that participants were willing, and that participants were able to withdraw from the research at any time with no consequences.

### **Scope and Delimitations**

It is important to identify the scope and delimitations for every study. The scope of a study refers to the parameters under which the study will operate (Simon & Goes, 2013). Delimitations are controlled characteristics that limit the scope of the study and define the boundaries for the study (Simon, 2011). In this study, I explored the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework. Research has cited antagonism between these two entities for many reasons. In this study I explained their turbulent relationship through postinternationalism by understanding the views of both entities about their relationship, for comparison. NGOs and the state must work together to solve problems. Ideally, they should complement each other, instead of compete with each other. This study provided direction for building a successful the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago.

This research focused on the NGO-state relationship due to its importance for the future of Trinidad and Tobago.

The scope of this study was limited by several factors. I selected research participants from the NGO community and state officials. Additionally, the number of participants targeted is at least 12. This limited the scope of the study. The identities, expertise and experiences of these participants limited the scope of the study. In addition, the scope of the study was limited by the medium of interaction. All surveys were conducted via the internet and telephone. This means that only those participants who were skilled in the use of technology and who had access to this technology were able to properly participate in the research. Finally, the study was bound by its duration as online communication caused a delay in the responses by participants.

I imposed certain delimitations on the study. This study focused on an explanation of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework. In this study, I did not set out to explore any issues which relate to development in Trinidad and Tobago or in any way discuss elements of development theory as it relates to the Third World. Additionally, the study used the postinternational ideas advanced by James N. Rosenau (1990; 2003). While there are many other scholars who have contributed to this theory, this study focused particularly on Rosenau's (1990; 2003) analysis of turbulence and distant proximities. The results of this study are only be applicable to professors/scholars, law makers, students, state officials, NGOs and the



public in Trinidad and Tobago and the wider Caribbean who have interests in the fields of public policy, politics, government, and international relations.

### **Limitations**

Limitations are weaknesses in research. Simon (2011) believed that while limitations in research cannot be controlled, they must be addressed so they do not affect the outcomes of the study. This study explained the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective. The results of this study provided an explanation of this relationship with useful predictions for the future. In this study, I predicted the future of NGO-state relationships, the creation of policies and transnational politics in the Caribbean. The outcome of this study was the articulation of a new explanation of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Thus, this explanation will require further study to be proven, disproven and applied.

This study faced several limitations. This study was limited by its qualitative research method. While this method was appropriate to this study due to the depth of understanding it allows, this method is usually time-consuming and labor intensive (Maxwell, 2005). Additionally, as compared to quantitative research, qualitative research involves small numbers of participants and this challenges its dependability (Bowen, 2006). Since qualitative research is open-ended, participants have control over the information they share and there is no way for the researcher to verify information objectively (Datt & Datt, 2016). This limited the research.

While I placed careful thought and analysis into the selection of candidates for surveys, due to limited time, space and resources, it was likely that valuable contributions were omitted. Moreover, the quality of the work was affected due to my personal biases which have reduced the accuracy of the study's results. While the study's research participants were experts in the fields of politics and society and specifically on issues involving NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago, they were also subject to bias based on their experiences and education. Their views may not have reflected that of others in their field as well as the public in Trinidad and Tobago. Finally, the study focused on postinternationalism as an explanation of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago and the results may not be applicable to this relationship in other parts of the world.

Several strategies were used to address these limitations. I examined data for reliability and validity which assessed the objectivity and credibility of the research (Anderson, 2010). I did this through lengthy engagement and persistency so that conclusions did not stem from my personal experience with the topic. I used rich and thick descriptions to ensure a sufficient level of detail throughout its analysis. I used member checking and peer debriefing to present the study to original participants and an external auditor for review and feedback.

### **Significance of the Study**

The study of NGO-state relationships is limited. Yet, it is necessary to understand this relationship due to the vast changes taking place in our world - the progression of

neoliberalism, shifting power structures, the explosion of numerous and diverse actors and revolutions in communication and technology. This study was significant for three major reasons.

This study provided an explanation of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. This explanation is particularly useful since Trinidad and Tobago is a leader in the Caribbean and in recent times, is drawing attention from the rest of the world. Politics in Trinidad and Tobago has been significantly transformed with the election of its first woman Prime Minister in May 2010. This is noteworthy given the nation's history of colonialism and traditionally male-dominated politics. This research contributes an understanding of the diversity in contemporary politics and the relevance of theory in explaining relationships among actors.

This study was significant since it provides direction in the modification of policies in Trinidad and Tobago. In 2016, Trinidad and Tobago ranked 101 out of 176 countries in the World Transparency Corruptions Perceptions Index (Transparency International, 2016). The World Bank stated corruption as a major problem in Trinidad and Tobago, citing police corruption, drug smuggling in prisons by prison guards and failure by public officials to abide by rules (Gov.uk, 2017). In addition to this, the country is facing a surge in violent crime (Central Intelligence Agency, 2017). Trinidad and Tobago US Embassy (2017) alerted its travelers of fifty-two (52) murders reported in January 2017, a 20.0% increase from the previous month (U.S Embassy in Trinidad and Tobago, 2017). Other concerns in Trinidad and Tobago are terrorism, drug trafficking

and gangs which pushes a demand for illegal weapons (United States Department of State OSAC, 2017). These problems demand a transformation in politics.

Moreover, the persistence of these problems indicates the failure of the state and highlights the increasingly important role of NGOs and civil society in Trinidad and Tobago. Therefore, it is important to understand the NGO-state relationship since both entities play critical roles in the society. This study will provide avenues for effective policy-making between these two actors and help to create roadmaps for the future of Trinidad and Tobago politics and society.

Literature on NGOs in the Caribbean has looked at the problems, challenges and avenues through which NGOs should and could contribute to development. Alvare (2010) studied the demand for social justice by an informal grassroots NGO in Trinidad and Tobago. Pino (2010) studied projects and activities of civil society groups in Trinidad and Tobago. Finally, Pineda (2013) focused on the role of NGOs and development in the Caribbean. None of these studies look at the NGO-State relationship through a postinternational framework. This study closed this gap. The research was significant since it sheds light on the Caribbean region in general and highlights the importance of NGOs for Trinidad and Tobago. In addition, the study produced new knowledge about the complexities of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago and its long-run implications for the Caribbean. This study provided direction for sustainable politics and development of society in the Caribbean.

## **Summary**

In this chapter, I introduced the study of the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective, including important background information. I included the problem statement, purpose of study and research questions, along with the study's theoretical framework, the nature of the study, operational definitions, assumptions, scope and delimitations, limitations and significance.

Chapter 2 includes a detailed review of literature used to understand study this relationship between NGOs and the state. Postinternationalism is a model in which states have become less competent and their role, less preeminent (Rosenau, 1990). This notion of postinternationalism depicts an atmosphere in which the boundaries between domestic and foreign have become blurred and porous, an adequate description of the situation in Trinidad and Tobago. The next chapter begins with an overview of postinternationalism followed by a detailed discussion focused on of elements associated with NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago. The chapter is organized around critical themes identified in the literature.

Chapter 3 presents a detailed discussion of the research method used for this study. The chapter begins with an overview of the research design, the qualitative research paradigm and the role of the researcher. In addition, I described and justified the research and participant information is outlined, including ethical considerations and selection criteria. I then explained both the data collection and data analysis procedures,

followed by a discussion on measures taken to ensure credibility, validity and dependability of the study.

## Chapter 2: Literature Review

Given its history of slavery and colonialism, Trinidad and Tobago values its freedom and independence and the state seeks to protect its authority. However, this authority is shifting as the population becomes more educated, skillful, and active, building a vibrant civil society sector on the island. The NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago is turbulent. However, both sectors need each other to effectively lead Trinidad and Tobago. My goal for this study was to examine the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework.

In Trinidad and Tobago, civil society functions alongside the state, but not without challenges. Some of these are a lack of dialogue with the state, a lack of legitimacy from the state, exclusion from the policy-making process and overall neglect (Aho, 2017; Bowen, 2013; Pino, 2010; SOFRECO, 2009; Trinidad Guardian, 2015). Despite this, NGOs are supporters of the state, building empowerment and reducing exclusion (Minto-Coy, Cowell, & McLeod, 2016; Pineda, 2013). This lack of collaboration between these two critical sectors highlights the importance of this study, which will provide direction for the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago.

This literature review begins with an overview of postinternationalism; its concepts of turbulence and distant proximities and ideas developed by contributing theorists. This is followed by discussions on nationalism, internationalism and postcolonialism. I then provide information on the role and function of the state and NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago. A discussion on Caribbean sovereignty, theoretical

perspectives of the Caribbean, policy-making in the Caribbean, and the research method for this study conclude the chapter.

The sections found in this chapter reveal that much has been written separately about postinternationalism, NGOs, and the state in Trinidad and Tobago, but none of the literature has made this correlation between postinternationalism and the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Dell’Aguzzo and Diodato (2016) highlighted political turbulence in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) considering Arab uprisings in the region. Ansell, Trondal, and Morten (2017) explored the concept of turbulence to explain challenges to governance in contemporary politics. Awad (2017) discussed the multiple levels of governance of international migration, citing Rosenau’s (2003) processes of governance: international, regional, national and subnational. Gordon (2017) employs Rosenau’s (2003) distant proximities to explain the erosion of barriers which led to large-scale collective action in Egypt in 2011. This research built on these studies by contributing new knowledge of postinternationalism in the Caribbean.

### **Literature Search Strategy**

I used the following databases to research information on the NGO-state relationship and postinternationalism were SAGE Journals, Thoreau Multi-Database Search, Political Science Complete, Academic Search Complete, EBSCO ebooks and ProQuest Central. I used Google and Google Scholar search engines. The key search terms were *NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago, the state in Trinidad and Tobago, civil society in Trinidad and Tobago, politics in Trinidad and Tobago, history of Trinidad and*



*Tobago, NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago, global governance, nationalism, internationalism, postinternationalism, postinternationalism in the Caribbean, turbulence in politics, distant proximities, globalism, postcolonialism, Caribbean sovereignty, the policy process, and policy-making theories.* Data search limiters included scholarly, peer-reviewed articles from the years 2015 to 2017. I searched these terms in all the accessed databases. However, limited research of this topic was found, which further evidences the gap in the literature and the need for this study.

For this study, I derived data from three main sources and triangulated to arrive at solid evidence. First, I obtained primary data from surveys with open-ended responses from NGOs. Second, I used previous studies and data from NGOs and other news organizations. Third, I used data from the literature in general. I consulted theorists, theories, concepts and processes, which informed the study and allowed for the exploration of the views of the state and NGOs turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship.

## **Theoretical Foundation**

### **Postinternationalism: A Theory of Turbulence**

Postinternationalism or turbulence theory was developed by Rosenau (1990) in the 1970s to describe an active political environment with minimal or no involvement of the state. Postinternationalism grew out of a dissatisfaction with state-centric realism, which became irrelevant in explaining the complex, dynamic, interdependent, and essentially turbulent political environment emerging after World War II (Ferguson &

Mansbach, 2007; Rosenau, 1990). Postinternationalism's central concepts of turbulence and distant proximities were applied to an understanding of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago as it explains contemporary politics in an ever-changing world.

The aftermath of World War II prompted a rise in specialized labor, collective action, the changing identity and number of actors, shifting authority structures, diverse goals and new arrangements, brief partnerships, a reversal of policies, a faster and more demanding world (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; Weatherby, et al., 2017). McNair (2017) believed that the democratic process began with the extension of voting rights in the 19th century alongside the mass media. These new processes eliminated boundaries, causing *prolonged disequilibrium* or what Piaget classed called cognitive disequilibrium, which occurs when tensions are created between what people know (local) and what they encounter (global) (Kibler, 2011; Rosenau, 2003).

These changes constitute turbulence. Turbulence occurred at both micro (individuals and groups) and macro (new technologies) levels, and therefore it was also called a micro theory of macro change (Hobbs, 2000; Rosenau, 1990; Weatherby, et al., 2017). This change was attributed to opposing forces such as stagnation and transformation, past and future, interdependence and dependence, and centralization and decentralization (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Hobbs, 2000; Rogers, 2009; Rosenau, 1990;). Turbulence best characterized these complex and dynamic occurrences.

A central feature of turbulence was the change in the structure of politics. A turbulent or imbalanced environment saw an increase in the number of diverse actors or polities, their goals, activities and interaction (Hobbs, 2000; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Kibler, 2011; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). The proliferation of these nonstate actors undermined national sovereignty and created a *bifurcated* or *pluricentric* world in which states and multiple actors coexisted (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Bellamy, 2017; Moreno, 2000; Rogers, 2009; Rosenau, 1990; 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Multicentrism is an endearing feature of the postinternational world.

At the same time, the state became important, not for its relevance, but its slow evaporation. While some writers of postinternationalism saw the disappearance of the state (Rosenau, 1990; 2003; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007), others like Lipshutz (2000) believed that the state was the primary actor in a postinternational world, but its jurisdictional authority was spread throughout an emergent, multilevel system of globalizing governance (Hobbs, 2000; Trondal & Bauer, 2017). Here, authority is transferred down to the regional and local levels and up to the global level. Holsti (2000) believed that postinternationalism began with the transformation of passive individuals into central actors (Hobbs, 2000). A revolution in communication and technology facilitated this transformation as people acquired the information and skills needed to make politically relevant judgments (Hobbs, 2000; Rosenau, 1990; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Hence, the postinternational citizen became a self-governing utilitarian now posing a challenge to the state (Hobbs, 2000).

The concept of turbulence in world politics was supported by several other writers. Ansell and Trondal (2017) defined turbulence as events that are variable, inconsistent, unexpected, and unpredictable. This complex environment is a result of the demands made by relevant actors who must be accommodated and included in the decision-making process (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Bubolz & Sontag, 2009; Maull, 2011). Karns, Mingst and Stiles (2015) defined turbulence as climate change, global terrorism, financial meltdowns, pandemics, nuclear weapons, humanitarian crises and conflicts, poverty, migration and failed states. Today, turbulence is a normal occurrence due to the continuation of liberalism and the inability of leaders to maintain control (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Webster, 2017; Worth, 2017). As such, turbulence cannot be addressed by states alone, but requires cooperation between states and nonstate actors (Karns, et al., 2015). This unanimity renders turbulence germane to the understanding of contemporary politics.

The rise of postinternationalism as an explanation of current affairs cannot be disregarded. As a framework, postinternationalism considers how globalization contributes to turbulence; an environment of complexity and dynamism in world politics (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Postinternationalism abandons the preeminence of the state and upsurge of civil society, in its attempt to make sense of the contemporary world. To further extrapolate this theory, discussions of distant proximities, change, and global governance follow.

## **Distant Proximities**

The concept of distant proximities is central to postinternationalism and this study. Distant proximities refer to a process in which people feel both distant and proximate simultaneously; what was once local has now become global and tensions exist between localization and globalization (Andaya, 2017; Guy, 2009; Rosenau, 2003). These tensions occur between core and peripheral countries, national and transnational, community and cosmopolitan, cultures and subcultures, centralization and decentralization, space and place, universalism and particularism, global and local (Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Distant proximities provide a spot-on characterization of modern society.

Distant proximities can be further elucidated by the metaphor of a violin. Rosenau (2003) employs the analogy of a violin to compare previous epochs with the contemporary emergent epoch. A poorly structured violin cuts the sound of each note, confining the note, in the same way previous world epochs tried to keep events local (Rosenau, 2003). Distant proximities and the present global system are like a well-built violin whose notes vibrate the entire violin, strengthening its sound (Rosenau, 2003). Our contemporary political environment is one of global interdependence where the lines between global and local have been blurred (Andaya, 2017; Gordon, 2017; Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). An understanding of politics today must consider this transformation.

Coupled with distant proximities is Rosenau's (2003) concept of *framegration*. Framegration is the dynamic relationship between fragmentation and integration in society which creates contradictions, ambiguities, complexities and uncertainties (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). With the erosion of social and geographic distances, people, organizations and communities became both distant and proximate, causing framegration or the dialectic of globalization and fragmentation (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). There are several causes for framegration. A framegrative world saw a breakdown of ideological belief systems due to the growth in technology and science (Rosenau, 2003). People are now insecure about the meaning of life, and having abandoned old identities and adopted new ones, are torn between the familiar and the distant global world (Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Thus, the postinternational world is characteristic of tensions between individualism and collectivism.

Framegration is used to describe a new environment of global subdivisions. A decline in traditional systems, norms and rules allowed for the formation of ties, groups, and networks (Rosenau, 2003). People are more developed, flexible, and autonomous, with multiple and shifting identities; distant developments have now become proximate (Galaz & Pierre, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Those who focus on the proximate occupy local worlds such as landscapes, and those who focus on the distant, occupy global worlds such as ethnoscapes, technoscapes, financescapes, mediascapes, ideoscapes, and landscapes (Rosenau, 2003). Hence, the local became less important as the global surfaced.

Various revolutions led to frammegration. An organizational revolution shifted authority, influence and power from traditional structures (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). An economic revolution altered how goods, services, capital and ownership is transported worldwide (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Galaz and Pierre (2017) defined the current economic world as superconnected, complex and ultrafast. These shifts caused borders to be eroded and regions to become more integrated (Rosenau, 2003). Consequently, people were no longer attached to territories, but became independent and skilled, states were being weakened and authority, shared among polities (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). This newfound independence extended the parameters of society.

Frammegration has led to several consequences that can be felt worldwide. The weakening of states and territoriality is one of these consequences (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). While states are legitimate, viable and powerful, their inability to cope with the dynamics of change has allowed frammegration to become more prevalent (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). With this loss of power, deterritorialization outshined territoriality (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Increased travel resulted in a loss of cultural ties and transmission of values across cultures. However, reterritorialization also became noticeable due to the rise of migration and the creation of diasporic communities (Gordon, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Indeed, the movement of people across borders is becoming more and more apparent in our world.

Another consequence of frammegration is divided loyalties. The loss of state sovereignty is evident due to the disappearing loyalties of citizens and the rise of a vibrant group of nongovernmental actors (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Authority has shifted due to a decentralization of national governments, which left many open power spaces, waiting to be filled by criminal organizations vying for authority, what Rosenau (2003) referred to as *bureaucratic disarray* and *decisional paralysis*, as people use their skills to serve their own self-interests (Karns, et al., 2015; Rosenau, 2003). A do-it-yourself approach becomes viable as people are losing confidence in the state and are on the hunt for alternatives.

The globalization of national economies was another obvious consequence of frammegration. It is impossible for economies to be self-contained in a postinternational world that is interdependent (Andaya, 2017; Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 2003; Prichard & Cerny, 2017). A key feature of postinternationalism is a multi-centric world consisting of global and transnational networks, brought on by economic globalization (Rosenau, 2003; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Frammegration resulted in a conflict between the individual and the national, where the individual seemed to be prioritized.

Frammegration led to global challenges. The world faced global challenges such as environmental pollution, currency crises, the drug trade, terrorism, AIDS, and the movement of refugees (Rosenau, 2003). These challenges demand the cooperation and involvement of nonstate actors since states alone are incapable of providing effective solutions (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003).



Ultimately, postinternationalism highlights two central worlds of human existence: the global and the local. This distant proximity is interdependent and counteractive; the global world is boundary-blurring, while the local world is boundary-preserving (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). The tension created between these two processes of globalization and localization culminate in a crisis of the emergent epoch known as *glocalization* or according to the Japanese, *dochakaku* (global localization) (Andaya, 2017; Guy, 2009; Rosenau, 2003). As an explanation of the NGO-state relationship, distant proximities advanced a resounding perspective.

### **A Changing World**

An exploration of postinternationalism cannot be undertaken without considerable attention to the process of change. The changes in politics are continual, intense, transformative and dramatic (Pierre & Galaz, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; Weatherby, et al., 2017). A major change occurred with transition from the industrial to the post-industrial world. This prompted the shift from a tight bipolar to a loose bipolar to a multipolar political world (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Change in postinternationalism is endogenous and exogenous and can be categorized under three global parameters: orientational or skill (individuals' analytical skills, compliance habits, legitimacy sentiments, cathectic capacities) structural (rules of governance, informal regimes, formal alliances, legal conventions etc.) and relational (class structures, balance of power, dependency patterns) (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). By and large, postinternationalism can be seen as a theory of change.

Postinternationalism identifies five sources of change. Change was brought on by technology and the microelectronic revolution, which made distances shorter and communication faster (Gordon, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Change was evident in emerging issues such as terrorism, the drug trade, AIDS and other world crises, all consequences of technology, interdependence and transnational relations (Karns, Mingst & Stiles, 2016; Rosenau, 1990). Change was seen in the reduced capability of states to produce acceptable solutions to problems (Karns, et al., 2015; Rosenau, 1990). With this, a major challenge for states became a lack of control over their citizenry (Rosenau, 2003). Change occurred with the weakening of the state and the strengthening of subsystems as decentralization replaced centralization (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Gordon, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Change happened with increased analytical skills, involvement and authority of citizens (Gordon, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). These are the changes which account for turbulence in world politics.

This complex environment constituted a conflict between change and continuity. As the world changed, identities evolved and tensions were created with those who altered identities and those who attempted to maintain continuity; the conflict between localization and globalization (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Rosenau, 2003). Added to this confusion was a bifurcation of global structures (Rosenau, 2003; Rogers, 2009). Bifurcation refers to a division or split. In politics, bifurcation of power occurred due to an explosion of new actors, revolutions in technology, economic globalization, loss of state sovereignty, interdependence, sub-groupism, a more educated and skilled

population, a wide gap between countries benefitting from globalization and those who are not (Rosenau, 2003; Bellamy, 2017). Postinternationalism thus accounted for the confusion associated with modernism.

Some postinternational scholars saw history as a suitable explanation of the contemporary world. However, Rosenau (2003) believed that the postinternational world is so dramatic and unique, that history is useless in explaining phenomena. Ferguson and Mansbach (2007) saw the contemporary world as *history's revenge and future shock*. History is crucial to understanding events in the current environment; to understand the international and the postinternational, there must be an understanding of the pre-international (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Moreover, since the postinternational view aligns with liberal international relations, turbulence can be viewed as a cyclic pattern of political organization and reorganization (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). The postinternational world is one in which history is having its revenge on traditional forms of power and society can only anticipate shocks from the future.

Postinternationalism offers a holistic perceptive of politics. This framework accounted for an eclectic frontier in which states are present and remain powerful, but sovereignty questioned as boundaries became eroded (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). On this frontier, a fusion and fission of authority is quite probable (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Fusion is the growth of networks that connects and influences people from far ends of our globe, while fission is the fracturing of political parties, localization and specialization to address needs (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007).

This flexibility of power demands that policymakers develop the agility to improve their performance in turbulent politics (Ansell & Trondal, 2017). Above all, postinternationalism highlights the contradiction between the forces that integrate the world and those that fragment the world.

### **Pinocchio's Problem**

The concept of Pinocchio's problem is intriguing in its application to modern politics. The postinternational world is faced with a dilemma in which advancement breathes discontent (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). The more educated society becomes, the more competent and hence, the more dissatisfied with authority. Society is experiencing a dispersal of power. The story of Pinocchio is a tale of power, choice, freedom, competence and transformation. As Pinocchio became older and wiser, he no longer submitted to authority (Strange, 1996). Instead, he was forced to rely on his own consciousness. Similarly, state allegiances are disappearing as loyalties and identities are now determined by individual consciences, cultures and influential politics (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Rosenau, 1990). Pinocchio's growing nose has become our dilemma in the contemporary world.

Modern politics features conflicting power sources which resemble Pinocchio's problem. Once a puppet, guided by strings, Pinocchio's father knew he would have to grow up and make his own decisions. Soon his strings were detached and real-life kicked in. Pinocchio's problem was not his lies, since he knew the outcome of his lies, but that he became a real person, no strings attached (Strange, 1996). Pinocchio now had to

determine his own authority structures. How can we determine where our allegiances lie? Rosenau (2003) hails the power of the individual as critical in guiding our loyalties. In Trinidad and Tobago, some people are loyal to the state, others to NGOs, religious organizations, unions and community-based associations. This confusion creates turbulence among these sectors, hindering development and progress in this region.

Postinternationalism acknowledges that world relations are no longer interstate, but intrastate and/or trans-state (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Global politics features a complex range of actors or polities who determine the course of events (Ferguson and Mansbach, 2007). Rosenau (2003) referred to these actors as *spheres of authority*, Kenis & Schneider (1991) as *policy networks*, Sabatier and Weible (2017) as *advocacy coalitions* and, Prichard & Cerny (2017), as *scales of interaction*. These polities are united by their objectives and resources (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Furthermore, they coexist, cooperate, compete, clash, overlap, layer and nest, together, creating possibilities for stability and turbulence (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). This reflects a highly complicated situation.

Postinternationalism accounts for the invasion of sovereignty as borders become porous. As a consequence, dominant polities were modified as old identities and loyalties became latent (Bellamy, 2017; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Multiple identities and loyalties became popular and will continue to be obliterated, reconstructed or resurrected (Rosenau, 2003). In this dialectic, the state is but one focus of identity and loyalty, and as new polities emerge, is becoming illegitimate and alienated (Ferguson & Mansbach,

2007; Karns, et al., 2015; Rosenau, 2003). Postinternationalism has altered the definitions of governance and authority in modern society as perceptions of legitimacy and power are relative to influence.

### **The Plus Non-State Framework**

The intensification of diverse actors led to the need to define this new environment and address its challenges effectively. Chong (2002) advanced a plus nonstate framework to deal the turbulence of postinternationalism. This framework incorporates NGOs, domestic labor, conscientious individuals, corporations and multilateral institutions into the policy-making process (Chong, 2002; Karns et al., 2015). While nonstate actors may suffer from lack of legitimacy, they are skillful and influential, advancing the causes of the marginalized and acting as watchdogs in the political system (Aho, 2017; Chong, 2002). Hence, legitimacy as a criterion has lost its effectiveness in place of appeal.

To understand the multi-centric world, a classification of diverse actors is important. Rosenau (1990) identified eight types of actors; three at the micro level (citizens, officials, private) and five at the macro level (states, subgroups, transnational organizations, leaderless publics and movements). Chong (2002) defined these actors with an explanation of two central concepts: resistance and complex multilateralism. The primary task of nonstate actors is global campaigning: creating an alternate dominion through opposition (Chong, 2002). This resistance demonstrates how globalization affects the exercising of power, as states are forced to hide behind globalization since

they are being eclipsed by time (Chong, 2002; Teivainen & Trommer, 2016). Neoliberal globalization capitalizes on time and space to secure profit (Chong, 2002; Gordon, 2017). Second, Chong (2002) defined complex multilateralism as the global contribution to decision-making from civil society (Chong, 2002; Sap, 2017). This system of global rulemaking is popular and favored but leads to confused authority structures (Chong, 2002; Worth, 2017). Ultimately, a transformation of the policy process which considers the dimensions of globalization is necessary.

Postinternationalism has placed the roles of NGOs and the state at the forefront of its analysis. Postinternationalism suggests that state effectiveness and autonomy is being diminished by diverse actors (Chong, 2002; Milhaupt & Pargendler, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; 2003; Sap, 2017). Rosenau (1990) believed that while the microelectronic revolution strengthened the competence of states, it enlarged the competence of individuals. The mobilization of individual efforts, what Rosenau (2003) termed aggressive sub-groupism, has paralyzed states. The most profitable survival strategy is an inclusive approach to politics.

### **Cheesy Governance**

The postinternational world brought to light the issue of governance. If internationalism was the Westphalian system, *postinternationalism* became the passing of that system (Hobbs, 2000). The most important feature of postinternationalism was the disappearance of the sovereign state, only one of several types of macro actors, which has become ineffective and incoherent (Bellamy, 2017; Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007;

Rogers, 2009; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Ramadan and Fregonese (2017) refers to *hybrid sovereignty* as a multiplicity of actors negotiating sovereignty and territoriality alongside the state. Lovan, Murray and Shaffer (2017) advances the idea of participatory governance in this interactive environment. Topics like governance and authority has been and is still at the heart of discussions of global politics.

It is important to understand postinternational governance in the study of the NGO-state relationship. Governance in a postinternational world is concerned with security, wealth, markets and human dignity, and the collective effort of states and nonstate organizations to identify, understand and address these problems (Hobbs, 2000; Karns, Mingst & Stiles 2015). Ansell and Trondal (2017) referred to these problems as *superwicked*; complex and multidimensional. Tarrow's (2010) *scale shifting* explored this diffusion of power among different networks, but perhaps, the most popular description of postinternational governance was Hobbs' (2000) comparison to the irregularly shaped Swiss cheese. The many holes in Swiss cheese represent the gaps in governance, waiting to be filled by private, governmental, nongovernmental, transnational and, supranational actors (Hobbs, 2000). The world is a single entity but is not guided by a single system of governance (Rosenau, 2003). Therefore, a relevant definition of governance must integrate the multiple actors that make this world confusing, but interesting.

Governance in a multi-centric, bifurcated world is complex. Complex governance is global, regional, sub-regional, national, provincial, local and individual (Hobbs, 2000;



Rosenau, 2003; Rogers, 2009). This *multilevel* governance can be attributed to technological revolutions, environmental degradation, global socio-economic changes and paradigm shifts in the world (Hobbs, 2000; Trondal & Bauer, 2017). Ansell and Trondal (2017) advanced the idea of *turbulent governance* which considers interactions in a changing, erratic and startling political environment (Ansell & Trondal, 2017). This dynamism is a leading theme throughout postinternationalism.

Perhaps the best example of the zing in contemporary politics is the emergence of civil society. The spread of NGOs over the years is among the most striking phenomena in postinternationalism (Hobbs, 2000). Information and Communications Technology (ICT) has facilitated distant proximities which lead to the mobilization of collective action (Gordon, 2017). This opening of *civic spaces* for civil society to demonstrate their expertise and influence across boundaries, is facilitated by social media and has been a major avenue for the Caribbean civil society to create social change (Ansell & Trondal, 2017; Milano, 2017; Weatherby, et al., 2017). Technology has changed the face of the game and this will continue.

The challenge remains how to address local problems, most of which today have become global. Goals and interests in a postinternational are diverse and places pressure on governance (Rosenau, 2003). Thus, governance must address the postinternational world on the intersubjective level, the behavioral level and the political level (Rosenau, 2003). The role of the state can only be assessed alongside this powerful group of charismatic, visionary, skilled people called civil society (Hobbs, 2000; Rosenau, 2003).

The new sheriff in town has reduced the relevance of the old. Actors in politics must understand and adapt to this new environment or else, they become ineffective and subject to criticism.

### **Conceptual Jailbreaks**

Postinternationalism presents a salient picture of modern politics. The global transformations of the postinternational world are unstoppable (Gordon, 2017; Rosenau, 1990). To be effective, broad-mindedness among policymakers is incumbent. This requires a breaking free from *conceptual jailbreaks* by releasing traditional and comfortable views of the world, to make giant intellectual leaps that account for global transformations (Rosenau, 1990). This is the true goal of postinternationalism.

Some scholars criticized the idea of conceptual jailbreaks as a difficult process to engage for several reasons. First, it is difficult to analyze a world that is constantly changing: shifting, expanding and narrowing (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Moreover, a definition of the political space which incorporates territorial, religious, ethnic and professional identities is challenging (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). Finally, there must be an agreement on how regimes, organizations, nonstate actors and other types of actors are granted authority (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). For these reasons, it may be that a state-centric world never existed, is obsolete and can never materialize in the future (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007). All of this is due to a fast pace of change. Additionally, state-centrism as a product of realism is irrelevant due to its failure to acknowledge the abundance and significance of nonstate actors, as well as its inability to engage in

effective policymaking (Ferguson & Mansbach, 2007; Trommer & Teivainen, 2017). As the opposite of realism, postinternationalism has abandoned traditional international relations theory to focus on the dynamic nature of contemporary society, offering a more relevant perspective of politics.

This exhaustive discussion of the various elements of postinternationalism offersd this framework as an excellent choice for studying the NGO-state relationship.

Postinternationalism is a theory of fragmegrative dynamics that accounts for tensions, ambiguities, contradictions and complexities (Hobbs, 2000; Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rogers, 2009; Rosenau, 2003). Analyzing the results of the last general elections in Trinidad and Tobago, BMI Research (2017) reports that Trinidad and Tobago's politics remain divided and contentious and this is expected to continue in the future. Although postinternationalism is 27 years old, the framework was chosen for the study of the NGO-state relationship since it provides a precise description of the political environment in Trinidad and Tobago in 2017.

With its emphasis on the distant proximities of state-centrism (state, localization) versus multi-centrism (NGOs, globalization) and turbulence, postinternationalism was used to answer the study's principal research question of what are the perceptions of the NGOs and the state of turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship. The research question builds on this framework to explore turbulence in Caribbean politics.

There are a few qualitative studies that relate to this study's central research question of what are the perceptions of NGOs and the state of turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship. Through participant observation and interviews, Alvare (2010) discussed the growth of NGOs in the developing world, their challenges, such as inferiority due to their limited administrative skill and experience. Although NGOs are seen as enemies of the state, they work hard to achieve social justice in Trinidad and Tobago (Alvare, 2010). Pino (2010) examined the extent to which civil society groups in Trinidad and Tobago participate in crime reduction programmes by interviewing members of NGOs and the Trinidad and Tobago Police Service. This study found that civil society felt excluded from initiatives to improve safety in Trinidad and Tobago (Pino, 2010). Bowen (2013) conducted qualitative research to explore the potential of civil society to contribute to integration and development in the Caribbean. Through surveys, interviews and document reviews, Bowen (2013) found that NGOs contribute to the social services, community building, economic and sustainable development, but still face many challenges which affect their effectiveness.

Like these studies, this study of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework performed qualitative research through open-ended surveys and document reviews, since this method is most consistent with the scope of the study. In this study, I wanted to find out the opinions and experiences of NGOs and the state to understand the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago.

Qualitative research was appropriate because of its flexibility and adaptability, which accounts for changes in the research environment.

In the following sections of this review, I provided an analysis of key concepts found in the literature related to this study. These concepts are nationalism and internationalism, which provide a foundation for the introduction of Rosenau's postinternationalism (Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Then, I discuss postcolonialism, the state in Trinidad and Tobago, NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago, Caribbean sovereignty, and finally, policymaking in Trinidad and Tobago.

### **Nationalism**

A comprehensive exploration of postinternationalism requires an understanding of nationalism and internationalism. Breuilly (1994) summed up nationalism in three concepts: political identity, loyalty and self-determination. Nationalism can be viewed from two angles: cultural and political. From a cultural perspective, nationalism is concerned with nationality and citizenship and politically, it is concerned with sovereignty and authority. Nationalism stands as a theory which maintains that a nation is fundamental to all aspects of life and takes priority over all other issues. There are several pertinent principles that contribute to the understanding of nationalism.

First, nations are an inclusive categorization of human beings. This means that all human activity is national. Members of a nation share a national identity through which they express affiliation with language, culture and values - their national identity. Second, nationalism can be viewed in terms of territory. For every nation, there is an assigned

territory through which a nation secures its existence. This concept of territorial sovereignty focuses on state power and nationhood and is particularly important in a globalized world. Third, the nation-state is expected to preserve its distinct identity and culture and in fact, nationalism should be the philosophy of state where each nation promotes national policies of language, education and culture. Fourth, members of a nation have a moral obligation to each other - national loyalty takes precedence over all other loyalties.

Several scholars discussed the development of nationalism. Gellner (1983) saw nationalism as a product of industrialization and modernization, which drove people to defend their culture and lifestyle. Hobsbawm (1983) viewed nationalism as an ideology in which the political and national function together. Hatcher (1987) defined nationalism as group formation and solidarity to secure boundaries. Armstrong (1982) focused on nationalism in terms of psychology, as opposed to territory, with a view of nationalism as an identity which functions as a shelter from a breakdown of identity, what he referred to as death. Hence, nationalism was a form of patriotism and national pride.

Nationalism was also viewed along different lines. Kedourie (1960) believed that nationalism was an attempt by governments to justify their actions and claim a right to national self-determination. In his attempt to analyze nationalism, Anderson (1991) popularized the concept of an imagined community which portrays the nation as a community that is imagined by people who view themselves as part of that community. Since its members are not familiar with each other and will never be, this community is

imagined. Furthermore, this affinity to a nation exists only in the mind, like the way nations claim the tombs of Unknown Soldiers (usually unidentifiable), without considering their true origin (Anderson, 1991). Classical Marxists saw nationalism as a bourgeois phenomenon through which nations secured their national markets. National culture was believed to create harmful habits and institutions (Stalin, 2013). Marx and Engels (1977) traced nationalism from the end of feudalism, as a detriment to the evolution of internationalism. These views question reality and motive of nationalism and account for the emergence of postinternationalism.

The debate on nationalism called for an understanding of the role of the state. As a philosophy, anarchism advocated for state-less, self-governed societies and non-hierarchical associations, condemning nationalism's purpose as solely the justification of state power, control and wealth (Carter, 1971). While realists believed that the threat of conflict challenges anarchy, liberals highlighted the role of institutions in avoiding conflict. Constructivists believed that anarchy is what states make of it - the state is a person with identities, constructed through social interactions, ideas, institutions and learning (Wendt, 1991). As a person and a collective agent, the state can also be an international super organism with its own subjectivities (Prichard, 2010; Wendt, 1991). Wight (2006) saw states as structures which contain organizational entities and institutions, with view of state behavior as prompted by those who control these organizational entities. In this sense, anarchy is a part of what a state is and what a state does (Wight, 2007). These views of the state are relevant to the study of the NGO-state

relationship in a postinternational world since they allow room for comparison and redefinition.

The nationalist debate in the post-colonial Caribbean is interesting and unique. Eric Williams, first prime minister of Trinidad and Tobago and a proponent of Caribbean nationalism, was known for his phrase, “Massa day done everywhere” where “Massa” referred to a racial hierarchy that exploited and degraded Caribbean people (Daily Express, 2011). Caribbean nationalism was driven by a desire to establish an independent nation-state with its own distinct national identity (Lewis, 2004). Development in the Caribbean was significantly impacted by slavery and colonialism. Lewis (2004) believed the result was a divided loyalty to the metropolitan culture. The nationalist movement was most vibrant in the 19<sup>th</sup> century in the Caribbean, fueled by the urban intelligentsia (Lewis, 2004). However, even before the 19<sup>th</sup> century, cultural nationalism began with a culture created by the slaves, which was carried out after the abolition of slavery by the lower classes (Lewis, 2004). One example of this was the introduction of Carnival in Trinidad and Tobago by slaves, developed as celebration of freedom.

The history of the Caribbean is one of political division. This was evident from as early as the 19<sup>th</sup> century, with the clash of ideologies between the proponents of slavery, the slave owners, and the opponents, abolitionists who fought for political liberalism (Lewis, 2004). Slaves were free in 1834 and many nations gained independence, but before this, there were many attempts at administration. First, the old representative system of government which consisted of a governor, a council and an assembly,



followed by a system of crown colony government in 1875, which featured an official majority controlled by the governor and an unofficial element nominated by the governor (Lewis, 2004). The unification principle was adopted in 1930 to maintain the efficiency of colonial service but failed due to an outbreak of war in 1939 (Lewis, 2004). In 1921, a commission was set up to investigate preparedness for self-government (Lewis, 2004). In 1958, a federation was established but also failed, and this led to full independence in 1962 (Lewis, 2004). These failed attempts reflect the nation's lack of technical capacity and unity.

Over the years, the Caribbean fought a long battle to maintain a stable identity for itself and has been successful in securing its preeminence. Today, Trinidad and Tobago celebrates 55 years of independence, but its identity is threatened by the forces of globalization. Caribbean people have found alternative homes with corresponding adaptive identities (Premdas, 2011). Consequently, migration has caused people to detach themselves from their territorial cultural identities and affiliate with a multi-cultural (Premdas, 2011). Young (1994) believed this led to ethnic dispersal and an evolution of identity, which has prevented the state from exclusively claiming citizens. Thus, the Caribbean is faced with confused notion of what it is and must define itself as wherever Caribbean people settle (Premdas, 2011). Building a Caribbean identity is difficult, in a postinternational world.

Ultimately, Caribbean nationalism must be seen through the lens of slavery and indentureship. In the 20th century, Caribbean nations desired freedom from their colonial

masters and nationalism led to the creation of the independent postcolonial state (Lewis, 2004). For the postcolonial state, power was the key to economic and social progress. In modern society, while the state attempts to maintain its supremacy, it is interrupted by turbulence. This makes the study of the NGO-state relationship even more important.

### **Internationalism**

Any discussion of nationalism must be followed by a discussion of internationalism. The word internationalism means between or among nations – a process by which people interact with each other as citizens of a nation through representatives (Glossop, 2017). Wilson's democratic peace theory is particularly important in explaining internationalism. Wilson's peace proposals held that the absence of freedom and justice breeds unrest and alienation (Rogers, 2016). Democratic peace theory sees the state as the primary actor in world affairs, but cooperation as the best way to achieve goals (Rogers, 2016). Arora (1991) defined internationalism as a theory which supersedes nationalism and advances the idea of cooperation among nations, emerging out of the international relations theoretical traditions of realism and classical realism. Considering major global changes, these ideas strengthened internationalism.

Internationalism abandoned the idea of the state as the sole political authority. However, realism saw the state as the primary actor, seeking its own national interests and maintaining power at all costs (Grieco, 1997). The state is sovereign and autonomous and can only survive through power. Classical realism believed that peace was essential to escape conflict (Carr, 2001). Since the state was by nature war-like, a fitting solution to

inter-state conflict was the creation of international law and international organizations, which led to the creation of the League of Nations in 1920. This principle highlights unity, mutual understanding and peace, above all else. Concepts like rationality and morality became important and this led to the creation of the United Nations in 1945 (Carr, 2001). The popularity of internationalism led to the creation of many global mechanisms that today function alongside the state. Several additional theories supported the development of internationalism and is discussed in the following paragraphs.

Institutionalism contributes to the development of internationalism.

Institutionalists like realists, believed that while states are self-serving rational actors seeking survival, co-operation among nations can be achieved (Barkanov, 2016; Immergut, 2010). Realists on the other hand, believe that this co-operation cannot be attained without the use of coercive power since the international system is by nature anarchic. The institutional view believed that institutions (rules, norms, practices, decision-making) can lead to co-operation for several reasons. Institutions extend the time horizon of interactions (Innergut, 2010). Negotiations among countries is a repeated long-term process and institutions allow countries to establish good reputations. Second, institutions increase information about the state and can monitor state behavior (Immergut, 2010). Third, institutions increase efficiency since they can reduce transaction costs by offering a central forum through which states can meet during negotiations (Immergut, 2010). This allows states to focus on key issues and make decisions readily.

Liberalism promotes the idea of democratic peace – the absence of war. Unlike realists, liberalists do not believe that all states are selfish actors pursuing survival. Instead, each liberal state is unique. Liberal thought follows three central assumptions: individuals and nonstate actors are the fundamental actors in world politics, not states; states are a dominant subset of society, who they serve; state behavior is determined by preferences (Moravcsik, 2001). Essentially, while survival may be a goal of states, commercial and ideological concerns are also important.

Liberalism replaced realism and gained prominence as an influential ideology. Dunne & McDonald (2013) traced the replacement of realism with liberalist ideals of international cooperation and collective security during the 1990s, a period marked by the popularity of liberal democratic governance. In 1946 there were 20 liberal states as compared to 95 in 2011 (Dunne & McDonald, 2013). Democracy outshined authoritarianism. The 2017 Freedom in the World report stated that of the 196 countries in the world, 87 (45%) were rated free, 59 (30%) partly free, 49 (25%) not free (Freedom House, 2017). Furthermore, the report noted that the year 2016 saw significant improvements toward democracy for populist and nationalist political nations (Freedom House, 2017). This establishes the value of liberalism for modern society.

The emergence of internationalism can be attributed to a number of additional factors. Dunne & McDonald (2013) discussed these as the normative theory and the rise of cosmopolitanism, the popularity of critical social theory and the revival of the English School which emphasized the significance of international society. Halliday (1988)

believed that internationalism linked the analytical with the normative. Holbraad (2003) saw the ascendance of internationalism with an inter-state order complete with institutions and conventions. The non-aligned movement of the 1960s and 1970s created a form of cohesion which echoed internationalism because of its reformist agenda (Holbraad, 2003). Ishay (1995) believed that internationalism arose because of the collapse of Christendom and the opportunity for merchants and the upper classes to seek their interests. The rise and popularity of internationalism was associated with major global shifts.

Internationalism has roots in both communitarianism and cosmopolitanism. Like the communitarians, internationalists believe shared interests and purpose is possible (Dunne & McDonald, 2013). Cosmopolitans believe that sovereign states occupy a crucial position in the international order, but this will dissipate unless the state adopts cosmopolitan values such as impartiality and justice, which can evade war (Dunne & McDonald, 2013). Internationalism is viewed in the context of interventions and the common good (Dunne & McDonald, 2013). Recounting the views of Richard Hass, Ikenberry (2011) claimed that the title of sovereign can only be awarded to those states who uphold their obligations to citizens and the international community. Hence, internationalism brought issues like the role of the state and sovereignty to the front of political debates.

Again, the popularity of internationalism was a direct result of the uncontrollable changes taking place in the world. Boulding (1964) believed that the industrial revolution

brought on significant changes in the lifestyles of people such as type of goods being produced and new means of transportation and communication, which make the world small. These changes produced corresponding changes in culture, identity, interaction, and politics (Glossop, 2017). For Glossop (2017), the transition from nationalism to internationalism in the 20<sup>th</sup> century can be a result of nations competing economically and socially, seeking to maintain their status in entertainment, literature, science, sports art and other areas. In an attempt to gain world prominence, nations banded together to create linkages and established ties in their own best interests.

In the international world, certain sentiments are distinct. People see themselves as members of a country first and second, as countries existing in a bigger world in which cooperation was important (Glossop, 2017). Internationalists see the world as a combination of differences and rely on technology for effective communication across these differences (Glossop, 2017). Internationalists hold that learning multiple languages is critical for survival. Moreover, international organizations function to provide cooperation among governments as opposed to individuals, and political loyalty rests with national governments (Glossop, 2017). This view is useful as it contrasts with the postinternational position that disregards the state but sees individuals and groups as the major players in world politics.

The concept of globalism becomes important to this discussion. Glossop (2017) noted a transition from internationalism to globalism, evident from as early as the photographing of earth from space in the 60s and 70s. Globalism arose with

globalization, an erosion of national borders in health, science, education and other areas, the emergence of transnational corporations and a focus on environmental concerns (Glossop, 2017). In the globalism era, people see themselves first as members of humanity and second, as citizens and believe that language should be universal in hopes of achieving global solidarity (Glosspp, 2017). Political loyalty is to a global government and *humatriotism* (loyalty to humanity) takes precedence over patriotism (Glossop, 2017). Globalism seeks a universal government as the global era sees people aligning more with the global community as opposed to national communities.

The ideologies of realism, nationalism, liberalism, internationalism and globalism, differ from postinternationalism. While these theories hold that states are the primary actors, postinternationalism suggests that states are important, but are simply among the broad list of actors that characterize world politics today (Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 2003). Postinternationalism differs from nationalism since it focuses its analysis on the strategic and economic as opposed to identity and society. Postinternationalists do not support the nationalist view that the world is adversarial and that survival is key. While globalists advance a global government, postinternationalists believe that there is no single system of global governance but sets of governance at different levels; multilayered governance (Karns, 2000; Prichard & Cerny, 2017; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). While internationalists and postinternationalists agree that cooperation among states is essential, postinternationalists, believe that sovereignty has eroded, due to a multi-centric world.

The Caribbean is a region of great transformation. In the year 2010 there were thirteen independent nations in the Caribbean (Higman, 2011). This was a major transformation from colonialism. Trinidad and Tobago was discovered in 1498. From slavery and colonialism in the 18<sup>th</sup> century to postcolonialism and independence in 20<sup>th</sup> century, the nation has been experiencing shocks and waves throughout its history. Internationalism in the Caribbean came about with the decline of imperialism and the rise of globalization, transnationalism and Americanization (Higman, 2011). As the world became interconnected, nationalism appeared less appealing and the freedom of movement, more attractive. Today, Trinidad and Tobago has entered the postinternational arena and its politics and society is must adapt to be relevant.

### **Postcolonialism**

Postcolonialism is important to consider for any study of Trinidad and Tobago and the Caribbean. Postcolonialism began when colonialism died and was a period of political, physical and economic domination of one people over another (Crawford, 2002). Gottsche (2017) saw postcolonialism as a historical, political and cultural set of ideas that aim to move beyond colonialism and its legacies. Strongman (2014) defined postcolonialism as the study of colonialism and the diaspora, centered on identity, inclusion, exclusion, change and culture. Clegg and Seremani (2016) explored postcolonial theory as the study of the dominance of the West and an exclusion of the marginal populations. These ideas unite under the position that postcolonialism was a rough period of transition and adaptability for postcolonial nations.



Many Caribbean writers have contributed to the postcolonial discourse with their focus on identity and displacement. Rhys's *Wide Sargasso Sea* (1966) provides a voice for a repressed and silenced Antoinette Cosway, a Creole "mad woman" married to an Englishman. Rhys's love story prompted a rejection for imperialism, promoting the postcolonial agenda of the destruction of Western thought and ideology (Senel, 2014). Like many writers in this categories, Rhys's personal life was the best inspiration for these writings.

The work of postcolonial writer, Walcott, has contributed significantly to an understanding of postcolonialism in the Caribbean. In *A Far Cry from Africa*, Walcott (2007) expresses ambivalence, cultural and racial hybridity, a central theme in postcolonial writing, which led to feelings of psychological conflict and divided loyalties. Similarly, in *Gardening in the Tropics*, Senior (1994) uses gardening as a metaphor with which Caribbean people can identify, but also as reflective of imperialism (Stouck, 2005). The garden metaphor depicted a space used for interaction among the colonial, postcolonial and global as well as an opportunity to examine the conflict between historical and regional identities and new identities shaped by globalization (Stouck, 2005). Like most of the Caribbean, these writers live with the challenges of postcolonialism and in a postinternational world, tensions mount between what their history and future.

The Caribbean discourse on postcolonialism identifies with many of the postcolonial theorists. Said's *Orientalism* (1978) discussed the misrepresented "other."

Fanon's *Black Skin, White Masks* (1952) highlighted dependency, inferiority and shame as effects of colonialism. Fanon's (1952) psychoanalytic explanation saw the colonized living in a world where conception of self is only through the eyes of the colonizer, which leads to a distorted view of reality. Spivak's (1988) version of postcolonialism focuses on the subaltern, those existing outside of the hegemonic structure (Williams & Crisman, 1988). Originally developed by Gramsci (1971), the term subaltern represented the voiceless and marginalized people. These ideas mirror Caribbean sentiments of postcolonialism and given the current state of global inequalities, the discussion of postcolonialism must look at the extent to which colonial attitudes prevail in contemporary society (Baylis and Smith, 2008; Duffield & Hewitt, 2001). An understanding of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago in a postinternational world must assess the extent to which each sector is impacted by postcolonialism and the consequences for their relationship.

Postcolonialism is important in understanding the NGO-state relationship in the Caribbean since it provides insight into the history and culture of the Caribbean. The Caribbean lives with a history of displacement and identity adaptation. Old identities clash with a cosmopolitan nature and hybrid culture (Guruprasad, 2014). Bhabha (1994) believed that cultural identity must consider the exchange between the colonizer and the colonized as both entities cannot define themselves independently. These two axes are the past and the present, the old world and the new world, in which identity is not

constant, but fluid (Rosenau, 2003; Williams & Chrisman, 1988). In the postcolonial Caribbean, people are caught between their historical and present states.

In the contemporary Caribbean, there is a mix of cultural and religious backgrounds that is continuing at a fast pace due to migration and globalization. In Trinidad and Tobago, there are large predominantly East Indian and African populations, existing alongside the indigenous peoples. Chinese, Syrians, Europeans, Americans, Spanish and migrants from many other nations around the world contribute to the cultural homogenization in the Caribbean. Trinidad and Tobago's religious experience is quite diverse with dominant groups of Roman Catholics, Hindus, Protestant Christians, Anglicans, and Muslims (Ledgister, 2006). With this diversity, loyalties are divided and the Caribbean is forced to confront its identity crisis in a postinternational world.

*Cultural fragmentation* is evident in the Caribbean. This climate is best described by Hall's (1994) two types of identities: being and becoming. Guruprasad (2014) describes it as multi-dimensional or pluralistic. In the colonial period, African slaves and Indian laborers adopted the culture of their masters, explained by Fanon (1952) as the dominant culture exposing itself on the inferior indigenous society. However, the creolization process abandons distinct identities such as Indian and African in light of a national identity, oneness or *Caribbeanness* (Guruprasad, 2014). The question remains, how long will this cohesion last in a dynamic postinternational society that is experiencing huge waves of migration.

Located on the northeastern coast of Venezuela, Trinidad and Tobago is one of the wealthiest and most developed nations in the Caribbean. In 2011 The Development Assistance Committee reported Trinidad and Tobago's developed country status, which reflects its sustained growth and high per capita income (Agostini, 2012). A major oil and gas economy, Trinidad and Tobago has one of the highest GNI per capita in Latin America and the Caribbean (US\$17, 640 in 2015) (World Bank, 2017). Trinidad and Tobago's success can be seen in the petrochemical, liquefied natural gas (LNG) and steel industries. Tourism and manufacturing are also major industries for Trinidad and Tobago. The island is continuing to boom and transform. The nation has a low level of public indebtedness, political stability and sufficient financial buffers, which can facilitate an economic rebound (World Bank, 2017). Despite this, the nation is facing significant challenges due to the collapse of energy prices and a rising crime rate. The nation must arrive at effective policies to improve business and public service (World Bank, 2017). This study is important in providing the information needed for political and economic success for the island.

The history of Trinidad and Tobago is one of invasion, conquest, and colonization. In 1498 Trinidad and Tobago was discovered by Columbus, inhabited by Amerindians. The Amerindians began disappearing, primarily due to European diseases and ill treatment. The island was tossed around by Great Britain, France, Holland, and other invading European countries, before it was finally ceded to Britain in 1814 (Ledgister, 2006). Under British rule Africans were brought to Trinidad and Tobago as

slaves to work on sugar plantations. When the British government abolished slavery in 1834, East Indian and Chinese laborers were brought in as indentured servants. This brief history of the Trinidad and Tobago provides a context for understanding its position in the contemporary world.

Following its relatively large size and wealth, Trinidad and Tobago occupies a leading role in the region's major political alliance, the Caribbean Community (CARICOM). The first Commonwealth nation to become a member of the Organization of American States, since its independence, Trinidad and Tobago has emerged as a political and economic leader in the Caribbean, but its status is slowly fading as problems surmount and tensions ensue.

Trinidad and Tobago became independent in 1962 but maintained the Westminster model of government. Consequently, British political culture was embedded in the Caribbean (Ledgister, 2006). Caribbean people defined colonialism as an exploitative experience in which a European minority dominated a population of enslaved Africans (Ledgister, 2006). Trevor Munroe (2006) characterized politics after independence as *home grown* and *foreign derived* (Ledgister, 2006). Homegrown referred to the political awakening of colonized Caribbean peoples (during the Great Depression, in the form of labor movements and during the aftermath of the World War II) (Ledgister, 2006). During this time, citizens established ties with middle-class activists to create political parties to fight for self-government and the redistribution of resources (Ledgister,

2006). Foreign-derived meant that the state was created by the British (Ledgister, 2006). Trinidad and Tobago struggled to find its place.

Independence demanded a definition of the role of the state. Ledgister (2006) recalled the revised state as embodying a structure with three central features. First, respect for civil liberties such as the right to own property, freedom of religion and expression. It was the responsibility of the state to secure and maintain the rule of law as compliant with the liberal constitutional norms Britain in the nineteenth century. Second, local involvement in government was important for middle and upper-class involvement in state affairs (Ledgister, 2006). Third, an authoritarian government by bureaucrats also in keeping with nineteenth century liberal norms which focused on discipline and development (Ledgister, 2006). This liberal-authoritarian state became the practice in the Caribbean from the late nineteenth century until the introduction of tutelary democracy in the 1940s and 1950s (Ledgister, 2006). Prior to this, the state in Trinidad and Tobago was known for its autonomy over the local ruling class. The state functioned as an organ for the colonial upper class, reinforcing its commitment to the metropolitan government (Ledgister, 2006).

Along with the evolution of the liberal-authoritarian state, came the introduction of a lower middle class, which reinforced the propensity and potential to govern and serve the state. This also stirred up protests as people felt that the state did not facilitate the lower and middle classes. As a result, the middle class aspired to politicize the masses and gain support for their interests (Ledgister, 2006). The colonial state offered an

opportunity for the middle-class to rise to prominence as representatives of the masses (Ledgister, 2006). This form of leadership and representation was present in most of the Caribbean colonies after World War II as an expression of democracy and the enhancement of a liberal authoritarian state (Ledgister, 2006). The role of the state in Trinidad and Tobago has clearly evolved. The following discussion provides more detail.

### **The State in Trinidad and Tobago: Its History and Role**

The role of the state must be evaluated in order to understand the dynamics of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. The state in Trinidad and Tobago and the Caribbean witnessed a revolution in politics fueled by tutelary democracy and universal suffrage, as well as the inclusion of elected representatives in decision-making (Ledgister, 2006). Elections under universal suffrage were first held in Jamaica in 1944 and then in Trinidad and Tobago in 1946. This was the trend in late 1950s throughout Caribbean (Ledgister, 2006). This system of government involved elected officials and appointed colonial administrators serving on executive bodies, who made policy decisions and supervised their implantation (Ledgister, 2006). This concept of tutelage was accompanied by the philosophy of developmentalism, an era in which colonial rule was no longer relevant. A vision of a state soon emerged and colonial powers began to prepare their colonies for independence by providing the physical as well as socio-economic infrastructure (Ledgister, 2006). This study of the NGO-state relationship took into account the extent to which this vision of what the state was, prevails today.

Characterized by a long history of colonialism, slavery and indentureship, the Caribbean has struggled with democracy and governance. Payne and Bishop (2010) characterized the region as a fragmented mixture of authorities, actors and cultures, all evidence of a complex colonial history. The Caribbean first attempted regional integration with the West Indies Federation in 1947, aiming to present the region as a viable force of self-government and sovereignty. After four years, the attempt failed for two reasons: constitutional powers were devolved locally and the economic growth of larger countries such as Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica, due to its bauxite and oil production, separated the states (Payne & Bishop, 2010). These larger states acceded to independence before the smaller ones, and this created division and confusion. Hence, the West Indies Federation failed.

In 1967, Britain released ties to the Caribbean and introduced the concept of associated statehood, where local states had internal self-government but Britain maintained external and defense control. In the 1970s, this arrangement failed and the states became independent. Payne & Bishop (2010) believed this explains the small-minded and competitive nature of the Caribbean, the fragmentation which characterized the Caribbean in modern society. Global changes challenged the Caribbean and prompted functional cooperation. In an attempt at regional integration, the Caribbean Free Trade Association “CARIFTA” was established in 1968 with three objectives: to allow free trade in the region, to facilitate economic integration in the region and finally, to provide a forum for negotiations to create a regional development fund (Payne & Bishop, 2010).



The Caribbean analyzed the different levels of development among its states, but failed. The relationship among states weakened, making it difficult for consensus and collaboration (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Clearly, integration was challenge for this newly independent region.

Nonetheless, transformations taking place in Jamaica at that time renewed the efforts of CARIFTA. Elected from the People's National Party "PNP" in 1972, Michael Manley was committed to integration in hopes of advancing internal markets, increasing bargaining power and international recognition and finally, promoted a reinvigoration of integration (Payne & Bishop, 2010). This led to a common external tariff, synchronization of fiscal inducements, policies and, investment (Payne & Bishop, 2010). These adjustments prompted a transition from CARIFTA to a Caribbean Common Market "CARICOM," with national sovereignty as the center of negotiations. This was regarded as the most notable and productive period of Caribbean regional integration history (Payne & Bishop, 2010). CARICOM was established in 1973 with the goals widening economic integration, giving priority to less developed countries, envisioning new forms of integration, and, coordinating foreign policy objectives (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Next to the European Union, CARICOM is the second oldest regional integration organization in the world (Girvan, 2005). This initiative has been successful and still exists today.

Nevertheless, CARICOM faced and continues to face many challenges. For instance, Trinidad and Tobago's wealth due to the oil industry, created tensions and

imbalance with other countries in the region. Added to this, politics in the Caribbean became quite radical (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Regional objectives clashed with foreign policy initiatives and the Caribbean became branded as vulnerable and dependent (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Suffering from declines in trade, the region was thrust into the hands of the IMF, structural adjustments and market liberalization (Payne & Bishop, 2010). This paints a gloomy picture of the capacity of the state.

Change was necessary for the Caribbean to survive. In the 1980s and 1990s, these struggles drove the region to assess its role in an advancing and globalizing world (Payne & Bishop, 2010). This led to the creation of the West Indies Commission in 1989. The aim of this initiative was to strengthen regional integration by establishing a permanent CARICOM Commission modeled by the European Union, with an acceptance of the neo-liberal agenda. However, the member states of CARICOM rejected this idea and as an alternative, established the Caribbean Single Market Economy “CSME.”

CARICOM became functional in 2006. The Caribbean felt that its presence was overlooked, there was a lack of interest in the region, and with the changes taking place in the world, sovereignty became a concern for these small nations (Payne & Bishop, 2010). This prompted the Rose Hall Declaration on Regional Governance and Integrated Development in 2003 to declare CARICOM as a collection of sovereign states (Payne & Bishop, 2010). 13 independent states were established between 1962 and 1983, but their experience has been traumatic. A case in point is Trinidad and Tobago. Although Trinidad and Tobago held the longest history of democratic government in the Caribbean

(over 50 years), the nation experienced two major attempts to overthrow the government. Today, criminals and gangs seem to be occupying a prominent position alongside the state, as they are making their presence felt, daily.

In an increasingly dynamic and diverse world, the Caribbean continues to face challenges due to its failure to harmonize efforts, poor leadership, indecision and resistance within the region. Politics in Trinidad and Tobago is conducted by a sole state and controlled by a parliamentary democracy, still maintaining its connection to the Westminster model. The arms of government are executive, legislative and judicial. The following paragraphs describe each arm and their powers.

*Executive.* The Constitution of 1976 replaced the British monarch as head of state with a President, chosen by an electoral college composed of the members of the bicameral Parliament (two legislative or parliamentary chambers; the Senate and the House of Representatives) (Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago, 2017). The Prime Minister is appointed by the President, based on popular support in the House of Representatives. The Cabinet is appointed from among Members of Parliament.

*Legislative.* The Parliament consists of two chambers; the House of Representatives has 41 members, elected for a period of five years; the Senate has 31 members, 16 government senators (appointed on the advice of the Prime Minister), six opposition senators (appointed on the advice of the Leader of the Opposition), and nine independent senators (appointed by the President to represent civil society) (Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago, 2017).

*Judicial.* The Court of Appeal is the highest court in Trinidad and Tobago, with a Chief Justice appointed by the President. The Privy Council in London, remains the final appeal on certain issues (Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago, 2017).

Ultimately, the general direction and control of the government rests with the Cabinet, led by a Prime Minister. The Prime Minister and Cabinet are accountable to the House of Representatives. Local government is carried out through nine regional corporations and five municipalities. Tobago was given a measure of self-government in 1980 and is governed by the Tobago House of Assembly (Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago, 2017). In 1996, Parliament passed legislation which gave Tobago greater self-government (Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago, 2017). This system persists in modern day Trinidad and Tobago.

Politics in Trinidad and Tobago is generally performed along ethnic lines centered around two dominant political parties. Most Afro-Trinidadians support the People's National Movement "PNM" and most Indo-Trinidadians support the United National Congress "UNC", now called the People's Partnership "PP" (a coalition government). In 2010, the nation experienced a major transformation with the election of Trinidad and Tobago's first female Prime Minister from the PP. This transformation was noteworthy and placed Trinidad and Tobago on the map, alongside other great nations that were/are led by women. Moreover, it speaks of the nation's potential for change, growth and adaptability in this postinternational era. This is promising for the study of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework.

## **NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago**

The contribution of NGOs to Trinidad and Tobago is undeniable. Hopper, Lassou & Soobaroyen (2016) traced the work of NGOs in developing countries since the 1980s, working on the ground to mobilize public opinion. Notwithstanding NGO popularity, NGOs have been and continue to be affected by political, economic, social and cultural changes (Bowen, 2013; Pino, 2010). The old conservative Caribbean has transformed into the new neo-liberal, globalized, fragmentative and turbulent Caribbean. With a breakdown of traditions, new forms of representation, melting loyalties, shifting demands and priorities, and policy changes, structures in the Caribbean are undergoing realignment (Pineda, 2013; Rosenau, 1990; 2003). Within this environment, NGOs are attempting to revitalize their efforts to boost development and democratization in the Caribbean.

NGOs are a major arm which represents the public and addresses the needs of underrepresented groups in the society. In their 2017 anti-crime initiative, civil society in Trinidad and Tobago adopted a united stance in providing effective solutions to crime (Boodram, 2017). In 2016, civil society collaborated on enhancing their capacity for effective communication about climate change (Caribbean Disaster Emergency Management Agency 2016). In 2016, 18 civil society organizations collaborated on the eradication of child marriage (Wired868, 2016). In 2016, NGOs collaborated with the state on attempts to fight against chronic diseases in Trinidad and Tobago (One Caribbean Health, 2016). These efforts to fix society are remarkable.

Despite this, civil society and NGOs experience significant challenges in working with the state. In addressing the problem of domestic violence and the rise in violence against women in Trinidad and Tobago, the prime minister responded by urging women to choose their men wisely (Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, 2017). This failure by the state to deal with and give priority to serious problems, make it increasingly difficult for collaboration. NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago are registered under two mechanisms:

1. Registration as under Companies Act 1995 (Ministry of Legal Affairs).

Administered by the Ministry of Legal Affairs, this Act allows NGOs to be registered as not-for-profit companies. They are expected to complete an annual return and notify the Registrar of significant changes such as directors, addresses or remortgages (ttconnect, 2014). Problems arise with this arrangement since it is generally not properly supervised and creates confusion surrounding the definition of a not-for-profit company and a nongovernmental organization. Also, there is the risk that companies can be registered under family names as not-or-profit, but can in fact be business organizations.

2. Registration for Charitable Status under Act of Parliament – Inland Revenue Department (Ministry of Finance).

Under this law, NGOs are required to register with the Ministry of Legal Affairs and then with Inland Revenue to acquire charitable status. No organization can be incorporated under both the Companies Act and an Act of Parliament. This Charities Act is more restrictive, longer and more prestigious. Its advantage is that purchases can be made tax-free and the organization can benefit from Deed of Covenant (TTconnect, 2017).

However, this registration arrangement creates confusion surrounding the number of NGOs existing in Trinidad and Tobago and bears further implications for policy development, outcome monitoring, funding, dialogue, consultation and the overall development of the NGO sector (SOFRECO, 2009). Furthermore, there has been no single mechanism to address this issue of registration.

In Trinidad and Tobago, nongovernmental organizations operate alongside other nonstate actors like community-based organizations, faith-based organizations, coalitions, associations, networks, umbrella organizations and international organizations (Middelbeek, Kolle & Verrest, 2016). They follow a variety of objectives such as welfare, economic advancement, political, recreational, spiritual, sporting, environmental, human rights and cultural promotion (Alvare, 2010; Bowen, 2013; Pino, 2010). While the work of NGOs is extensive for a small nation, their voice is still faint and the number of NGOs addressing specific issues is limited.

From the onset, the registration process for NGOs is complex. There are many diverse and demanding requirements for registration and an absence of one specific body or delegate to address civil society organizations and their concerns (Alvare, 2010; SOFRECO, 2009;). This is a constraint to consultation and policy dialogue. In fact, many NGOs remain unofficial which leads further challenges of legitimacy, funding and recognition. In 2011, a Civil Society Board was implemented with the aims of allowing civil society greater participation in the decision-making process as well as greater collaboration among partners in addressing issues (SOFRECO, 2009). However, there is

no solid structure which guarantees transparency and accountability within the mechanism and a current NGO database is lacking (SOFRECO, 2009). Clearly, civil society is not a priority.

Another restraint for NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago is funding. Obtaining funding is time-consuming and affects the delivery of services (Pineda, 2013; Tack, 2016). Popular NGOs receive funding from a wide range of national and international sources, but these are in the minority (SOFRECO, 2009). The European Commission provides bilateral assistance to Trinidad and Tobago, most of which is allocated to sector budget support, an area in which NGO involvement is limited (SOFRECO, 2009). While the state recognizes NGOs as important actors in development, NGOs are not viewed as democratic bodies and their role has not been accurately assessed by the state in Trinidad and Tobago (Middelbeek et al., 2016; SOFRECO, 2009).

The main thrust of most NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago is development. Unfortunately, most NGOs lack the institutional capacity, research and skill to perform successfully (Alvare, 2010; Pineda, 2013; Pino, 2010; SOFRECO, 2009). NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago work on environment issues, crime and security, trade and business, human rights and governance (Hopper et al., 2016; SOFRECO, 2009). Environmental NGOs have a strong volunteer-base, most of which are international and obtain funds primarily from the energy sector (SOFRECO, 2009). Nonetheless, they still face the challenge of funding as competition increases (Middelbeek et al., 2016; SOFRECO, 2009). There are several strong NGOs working in crime and security, but their main



challenge is integration with the Ministry of National Security and long-term funding (SOFRECO, 2009). In trade and business, NGOs receive government funding and work alongside the Ministry of Trade and Industry (Granderson, 2011; SOFRECO, 2009). These NGOs have been successful, demonstrating their professionalism and strong networking and dialoguing skills (SOFRECO, 2009). Like most other NGOs, their challenges remain funding, technical assistance and diversification.

Several NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago work on human rights issues. However, funding from the state is limited, leaving them to survive on the passion of their members (SOFRECO, 2009). Consequently, these NGOs have a weak capacity for advocacy since pertinent issues are ignored (SOFRECO, 2009). Across Trinidad and Tobago are several governance NGOs. Their biggest challenge is the failure to define their role due to a lack of collaboration with the state. Governance NGOs face additional challenges of lobbying and effective communication in monitoring the state and encouraging accountability (SOFRECO, 2009). Ultimately, the most effective NGOs function in sectors of trade and business and the environment.

It is clear that NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago are a weak third sector. Communication is poor across organizations, which results in an overlap of objectives and missions (SOFRECO, 2009). There is a lack of partnership with the government to encourage constructive dialogue and engagement, insufficient funding, poor alignment of initiatives, and a lack of efficiency and professionalism (Alvare, 2010; Bowen, 2013; Granderson, 2011; Pineda, 2013; Pino, 2010; SOFRECO, 2009). Added to these

challenges, NGOs suffer from political interference and corruption (Bowen, 2013; SOFRECO, 2009). This cannot continue. If governance has to be relevant in postinternational Trinidad and Tobago, the challenges facing NGOs must be addressed by first assessing the NGO-state relationship.

Trinidad and Tobago has made previous attempts to improve the experiences of civil society. Oil and gas companies, civil society organizations, and the state signed a Memorandum of Understanding in June 2013, committing to ensure revenues from oil and gas are available to the public through a transparency process (Trinidad and Tobago Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative, 2017). The state acceded to the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) in 2010, which allows collaboration with a multi-stakeholder committee to strengthen stakeholder engagement (Trinidad and Tobago Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative, 2017). The state also participated in the Open-Partnership Initiative in 2014 to ensure an open government, accountability, transparency and citizen participation for effective democratic governance (Open Government Partnership, 2014). Unfortunately, this saw little progress and the state was called to strengthen engagement with civil society (Trinidad and Tobago Newsday, 2016). Nonetheless, these attempts by the state are commendable and demonstrate the possibilities for inclusive politics.

The state remains a powerful force in Trinidad and Tobago's society, but it does not solely dictate the country's politics. While they face numerous challenges, NGOs have significant capacity to solve problems and have risen to the front of Caribbean

political discourse. Their advantage remains their influence, which allows them to make and implement rules and exercise power (Keohane & 1998). This system of governance contrasts with the traditional view of government - a strict and inflexible system among a narrow circle of participants, that has long lost its appeal in the Caribbean.

Postinternational politics in Trinidad and Tobago must understand that NGOs are here to stay and build an effective system of governance around this conviction.

### **Caribbean Sovereignty**

Undoubtedly, the Caribbean faces many challenges, but the question remains, how can we explain these challenges in order to accurately address them. Payne and Bishop (2010) believed these challenges lie in the notions of sovereignty and West Indian statehood. Belonging to Britain for a substantial period time, the newly independent Caribbean was forced to re-create itself as the reins of colonialism tore loose. In the post-colonialism period, the islands of the Caribbean were in a state of division and devastation. Each island had its own culture, linguistics, politics and society, which established unique national identities. The decolonization era in the Caribbean can be summed up in two main goals: national liberation and political power (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Therefore, sovereignty and political independence stood side by side, forming the basis of West Indian statehood. Lewis (2004) described a transition from cultural nationalism to political nationalism and then to an independent sovereign nation-state that exerts its control and expects compliance without opposition. This is a turbulent environment.

As the Caribbean struggled to identify itself, its connection to Europe could not be forgotten. A search for West Indian character echoed a European style of politics (Payne & Bishop, 2010). In the post-colonial Caribbean, independence and sovereignty was guarded and exercised. Independence led to seats for Caribbean nations in the United Nations General Assembly and interstate relations, with freedom to dictate their agendas (Payne & Bishop, 2010). However, this right to sovereignty was difficult to execute because of their small size, lack of development and discord within the region (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Sovereignty for the Caribbean was limited and narrow, but still reflected their West Indian equality and dignity (Payne & Bishop, 2010). The Caribbean states were weak and unable to meet the challenges posed by transnational forces.

An understanding of Caribbean politics must consider sovereignty. Clapham (1999) maintained that post-colonial sovereignty was special in a history of exploitation, displacement and powerlessness. Payne and Bishop (2010) described politics in the post-colonial Caribbean as personalistic, with priority on internal rule and domestic legitimacy. Compromise and cooperation were difficult to come by. Most likely, the Caribbean struggled with concepts of sovereignty and autonomy due to their inadequate understanding of what these concepts mean (Payne & Bishop, 2010). Through an exploration of the NGO-state relationship, this study will determine the extent to which these attitudes prevail in modern Trinidad and Tobago.

Sovereignty may carry different meanings across ideologies. One thing is certain, it must be defined and understood for effective policymaking in a postinternational

world. Krasner (2001) defines sovereignty in four strands: interdependence sovereignty, domestic sovereignty, international legal sovereignty and Westphalian sovereignty; different components exercised at different points. Interdependence sovereignty is the state's ability to regulate its borders and maintain control (over goods, capital, people, beliefs). Domestic sovereignty speaks to internal control, where the state secures acceptance by and eliminates challenges from its citizens. International legal sovereignty refers to recognition by other nations; interstate relations, relationship with international organizations. Westphalian sovereignty refers to states setting their own agendas, both domestic and international (Krasner, 2001). An understanding of Krasner's (2001) analysis is significant since sovereignty in a democratic era can be detrimental consequences.

Consequently, any understanding of state sovereignty must consider the turbulence between state and nonstate actors. Different forms of sovereignty are exercised in different nations, but there is no one size fits all approach. States must analyze their practice of sovereignty to be effective leaders. For these reasons, Krasner (2001) viewed sovereignty as problematic. Problematic, since traditional views of sovereignty are irrelevant in a contemporary society, bombarded with liberalism, mobility and technology.

What does this mean for the post-colonial states of the Caribbean? Held (2003) viewed sovereignty as a notion in which states have control legally, but effective power is occupied by an array of nonstate actors and other processes; a new approach to

sovereignty injected by globalization. After independence, the Caribbean adhered to the Westphalian view of sovereignty, but did not have the institutional capacity or material capabilities to cope with independence. Ultimately, their view of sovereignty allowed them to gain international recognition, and as independent states, which secured their international legal sovereignty (Payne & Bishop, 2010). However, throughout Caribbean history, most states were unable to hone control and recognition. Dr. Alexandrov, Trinidad and Tobago's sole forensic pathologist described affairs in the country as incompetent, messy, catastrophic, outdated, disastrous, and ridiculous (Gonzales, 2017; Superville, 2017). The Caribbean must revise its concept of sovereignty.

### **Hurricanes in the Caribbean**

This study applied postinternationalism to understand affairs in Trinidad and Tobago and to explain the NGO-state relationship. Rosenau (1998) considered the Caribbean as a region to which postinternationalism is glaringly relevant. Like many other regions, the Caribbean has its fair share of geographic challenges like earthquakes and hurricanes, economic challenges (market conditions), social challenges like cultural erosion and now more than ever, political challenges such as crime and terrorism. In June 2017, Trinidad and Tobago experienced severe flooding on the island due to the passing of Tropical storm Brett. As a result, much of the nation's homes require rebuilding and infrastructural change is needed to deal with the problem of flooding. A report by the Trinidad and Tobago Guardian (2016) highlighted economic challenges facing the nation in 2017 such as an increase in debt levels, red fiscal accounts, weakening labor markets, a

decline in foreign exchange and a dying credit rating (Worrel, 2016). Trinidad and Tobago is in a state of prolonged disequilibrium.

Moreover, society is crippled by social problems like an already high but climbing crime rate, bullying and violence in schools, a breakdown of family life, road fatalities, drugs, human trafficking, and pollution, to name a few. The population is not convinced of the state's ability to solve its problems. In June 2017, the Law Association of Trinidad and Tobago (LATT) called on its Chief Justice to step down (Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, 2017). In addition, the opposition considers filing a no confidence motion against the House Speaker of parliament and the Prime Minister (Rampersad & Julien, 2017). Corruption in political office is a significant problem, made more evident by the recent appointment of Marlene McDonald in 2017 as minister of public utilities, only to be fired two days after the appointment, for inviting a popular gang leader to the President's house for a swearing in ceremony (Alexander, 2017). Additionally, Trinidad and Tobago has recently been dubbed with the distressing reputation of the highest recruitment rates of ISIL fighters in the Western hemisphere (Aljazeera, 2017). Clearly the state alone is incapable of handling the country's many challenges and must work alongside nonstate actors.

The Caribbean is region of transformation. Rosenau (1998) noted one major transformation in politics after the cold war period. The post-cold war period featured a freedom of ideas and ambitions, all of which were suppressed by previous superpowers (Rosenau, 1998). In explaining politics in the Caribbean, Rosenau (1998) offers five

perspectives: unilateralism, multilateralism, subgroupism, transnationalism and finally, uneven fragmentation. The unilateralist or realist world sees the state as dominant, and all other actors, secondary, where power is essential to maintain state independence (Rosenau, 1998). This has been the traditional view of politics in the Caribbean. For unilateralists, the Caribbean is a conflictual region and collective action is insufficient to deal with challenges. Instead, each state must preserve its interests above the interests of the region (Rosenau, 1998).

Multilateralism sees cooperation as essential and states share their authority with global institutions to achieve their goals. While the state may be the dominant actor, it is not by nature, conflictual, but cooperative (Rosenau, 1998). This view accounts for the existence and continued growth of NGOs in the Caribbean working alongside the state. Rosenau (1998) referred to these NGOs as a *hurricane*, intruding on the region from diverse directions. The state is dependent on these NGOs for their skill in critical areas and this has created a transformation in the policy process toward greater partnership; a globalization of cooperation (Rosenau, 1998). For multilateralists, cooperation is both negative and positive. While it presents an opportunity for the region to solve their own problems, cooperation in a global economy is challenging. Despite this, multilateral initiatives are promising as it offers the hopes of collaboration and cooperation among states (Rosenau, 1998).

The number and diversity of actors existing today has left them with no choice but to seek their own interests. Roseanu (1998) advanced the idea of subgroupism, a process



of bifurcation in which the state (state-centric world) interacts with a broad group of actors (multi-centric world). These actors align with like-minded groups for support and comfort (Rosenau 1998). For subgroupists, the world is conflictual, decentralized and confused (Rosenau, 1998). In the history of the Caribbean, some of these groups were U.S. companies, European parties and the Catholic Church, but more recently, these groups are terrorist organizations, drug lords, money launderers, gangs and other groups involved in illegal activity (Rosenau, 1998). Criminal groups are competing for influence and power more than ever in Trinidad and Tobago. There has been a recent surge in human trafficking and sexual exploitation on the island. The U.S Department of State (2017) in its 2016 Trafficking in Persons Report Trinidad and Tobago, reported that the nation is a destination, transit and source country for sex trafficking and forced labor. The state failed to address this problem and in 2016, the country was on Tier Two Watch list for the second consecutive year (U.S Department of State, 2017). State attempts to address this problem, through funding for its anti-trafficking unit, training for law enforcement and public awareness activities, failed to incorporate NGOs (U.S Department of State, 2017). Among the recommendations made by the U.S Department of State (2017), was collaboration with NGOs (U.S Department of State, 2017). When the state fails to perform, these criminal groups can easily undermine their sovereignty (Rosenau, 1998).

Transnationalism is a global system characteristic of multiple actors, shared responsibility and accommodation. This perspective looks at how NGOs have been

cooperating both in the region and around the world, despite major social problems. Global interdependence propelled by global norms like human rights and democracy, has encouraged an explosion of transnational networks (Rosenau, 1998; Weatherby, et al., 2017). The number of NGOs operating in Trinidad and Tobago is approximately over 800, and for this small island, is evident of exponential continued growth (Ministry of Social Development, 2017). Many of these NGOs are international and transnational, dealing with issues like crime, corruption, gender, human rights, poverty, the environment and development. This independence of actors has diminished the authority of states and strengthened their relevance (Rosenau, 1998). People of the Caribbean are mobilizing their own efforts in diverse ways instead of simply relying on the state.

These perspectives offer some relevance in explaining conditions in the Caribbean. While the unilateral approach may be used as a historical explanation, the multilateral approach can be viewed as the response of the state to challenges brought on by globalization through cooperation and its inability to go it alone (Rosenau, 1998). The subgroupist perspective presents a possible explanation of how and why groups in society deal with problems by taking matters into their own hands, rejecting state authority and performance (Rosenau, 1998). Finally, transnationalism explains the existence of NGOs in the multi-centric Caribbean. Nonetheless, Rosenau (1998) believed that these perspectives failed at explaining the critical problem of security in the Caribbean and how it can be addressed. This is pertinent today since security remains one of the top priorities for the postinternational Caribbean.

The fragmentative approach becomes relevant to explaining Caribbean politics and society. Fragmentation accounts for the ways globalization has changed the Caribbean, making the region more susceptible to shifts and fluctuations (drug trade, economic challenges, disease, unemployment). Fighting with globalization is localization, where the loyalties to specific Caribbean countries hinder collective action (Rosenau, 1998). Globalization and localization are hurricanes – clashing winds from within and outside the region (Rosenau, 1998). However, the analytic ability of citizens to support to the state in building effective policies, must be considered. This perspective is interesting since it explains the ways NGOs can contribute independently to society, through cooperation and collective action with the state. Ultimately, the interests of individuals and NGOs must be secondary to national interests.

### **Moving forward – the policy making process**

The policy process is crucial to the discussion of the NGO-state relationship. In this section of the literature, two policy models will be highlighted which reflect the transformations taking place in Trinidad and Tobago and provide direction for the future of policy making. Sabatier (1986) believed that an understanding of the policy process includes the perceptions of the multiple actors involved. Developed by Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993), the advocacy coalition framework (ACF) provides an interesting approach to policy making with its focus on the interaction of advocacy coalitions (various types of actors), dependent on each other's capacities to achieve their goals. The ACF believed that the only way to deal with the myriad of actors today is through

advocacy coalitions (Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith, 1993). Coalitions are formed when those of similar interests naturally align themselves. Policymaking is structured around the networks its participants create. Since the belief and value systems of policy participants differ, success is only possible through cooperation.

Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993) saw policy change as achievable in two ways: a belief change or a replacement of a dominant coalition with a minority one. Dominant beliefs are resistant to change while secondary beliefs tend to be more open. Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993) believed that change can occur when a society experiences external shocks such as disasters, social-economic change, changes in administrations (Weible & Sabatier, 2017).

Trinidad and Tobago faces two central challenges to its policy-making process. Trinidad and Tobago operates the Westminster model of government in which decision-making is highly centralized. Sabatier and Jenkins-Smith (1993) highlighted that with this model of government, the majority party in parliament hardly gets more than 45% of the popular vote (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). The higher degree of consensus required, the greater possibility for inclusion and compromise (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). If the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago must be improved, change is eminent. Second, the closed nature of the political system means that participation is restricted to a small number of authorities. In this context, Trinidad and Tobago has weak norms of compromise (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). Applying the ACF to Trinidad and Tobago will require an increase in openness through greater inclusion of actors.

The network approach to policy making is equally important in exploring the NGO-state relationship. The network approach suggests that policy making takes place in subsystems, which contain many private and public actors and frequent and effective communication to maintain healthy relationships (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). The network approach grew out of a transformation of the policy process due to the fading boundaries between the private and public and the failure of state (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). Becoming more and more popular, especially in vulnerable and weak states who lack resources for effective decision-making, the network approach is relevant to Trinidad and Tobago.

Non-state actors in Trinidad and Tobago are diverse. The network approach believes that these diverse actors are mutually interdependent and governments must manage their relationship with these actors through joint problem solving (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). Social networks explore actors and their relationships and advances the capabilities, perceptions and preferences of actors as important in the policy process (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). The distribution of actors' capabilities determines the power structure of the network and the policy monopoly (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). The interaction among these actors is important and can be classified as either conflictual, bargaining or cooperative (Weible & Sabatier, 2017). This approach provides suitable direction for cooperation between the state and civil society.

Before effective policies could be advanced, there must be a transformation of the policy-process in Trinidad and Tobago. This requires a solid understanding of the

dynamics of the NGO-state relationship. Independently, these sectors are useless. The state is no longer the primary actor in politics and NGOs face significant challenges that stifle their efforts. Both sectors have no other alternative but joint decision making and teamwork.

### **Qualitative Method – General Qualitative Study**

In exploring the NGO-State relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework, I employed a general qualitative research method for several reasons. I collected data in the field where participants have first-hand accounts of the NGO-state relationship. Also, I was the key instrument, I collected data by examining documents and distributing open-ended surveys. In this way I was able to utilize multiple sources of data instead of relying on a single data source (Creswell, 2009). Additionally, I used the theoretical lens of postinternationalism to interpret data. Alongside the background, history and context, this allowed for multiple views of the problem (Creswell, 2009). Ultimately, this research provided a holistic account of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago by looking at the different perspectives of NGOs and state, to present a crystalline view of the elements that constitute this relationship (Creswell, 2009).

### **Summary**

This chapter included a detailed review of literature related to understanding the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternationalism perspective. This began with an introduction which restated the

research problem and its purpose with supporting literature to highlight its relevance and an overview of the chapter. Then, I discussed the literature search strategy, followed by the theoretical foundation for the study. I explained postinternationalism comprehensively, followed by a detailed discussion on elements surrounding this NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago: nationalism, internationalism, postcolonialism, the state in Trinidad and Tobago: its history and role, Caribbean sovereignty, hurricanes in the Caribbean and moving forward – the policy making process. The chapter finally discusses the qualitative method undertaken for this study.

From this literature review, much is known about NGOs and the state separately in Trinidad and Tobago. However, this relationship in light of postinternationalism, was never explored. The literature reveals a turbulent relationship between both sectors. While the state agrees to work with NGOs, this must be done to a limited extent. The state in Trinidad and Tobago is still more powerful and can dictate the extent to which cooperation and collaboration with NGOs take place. However, NGOs are becoming more persuasive due to the state's inability to tackle regular issues like crime and poverty. Put together, both entities are important but represent conflicting agendas. Despite this, no research has been conducted on this relationship. This study filled the missing gap in the literature as it undertakes an exploration of the NGO-state relationship through the most appropriate theory, postinternationalism. The results of this study contribute to public policy and international relations, not only an explanation of our present multi-centric political world, but also, with an accurate understanding of the

NGO-state relationship, opportunities for policymaking that is more inclusive and collective.

I conducted this research using a qualitative method of inquiry since the I wanted to understand the meaning of the behavior of NGOs and the state and their interaction. This produced descriptive data, which was rigorously interpreted and allowed for replicability. Chapter 3 presents a detailed discussion of the study's research method.



### Chapter 3: Research Method

The NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago is antagonistic as objectives and interests between these two sectors clash. The purpose of this study was to explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational framework. This chapter includes a detailed discussion of the research method for this study. It begins with an overview of the research design and rationale, followed by the role of the researcher. Additionally, I describe and justify the methodology. Details pertaining to the participant selection, instrumentation, procedures for recruitment, participation and data collection are outlined. I then explain the data analysis plan followed by issues of trustworthiness. The chapter ends with a discussion of ethical procedures for the study.

#### **Research Design and Rationale**

In exploring the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective, the following principal research question emerged: What are the perceptions of the state and NGOs as it relates to turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of the NGO-State relationship in Trinidad and Tobago?

This study was rooted in an interpretivist/constructivist paradigm. Creswell (2009) believed that qualitative research is a process of understanding a problem by painting a holistic picture of participants' experiences in their natural setting. Hence, qualitative research was most suited to this study. Arising out of the philosophy of Dilthey (1992), and Husserl and Weber (1860), this paradigm is focused on understanding the world of human experience; reality is socially constructed (Dilthey,

1922; Welton, 1999; Weber, 1860; Mertens, 2005). This rationale relies on the participants' view of the situation being examined because meaning-making is a process of social negotiation through dialogue and conversations (Dilthey, 1922; Husserl, 1989; Mertens, 2005; Weber, 1860).

This study was based on the perspectives of NGOs and state in their very different but related worlds, with interest in the way both entities make meaning of their interactions and relationship. Interpretivist/constructivist researchers address the process of interaction among individuals and focus on the specific context in which people live and work, to understand the historical and cultural settings of the participants (Creswell, 2009). The interpretivist/constructivist approach provides a framework for understanding how NGOs and the state construct and interpret reality. For this study, I was not interested in *why*, but *how* and *what*, to find new knowledge about the NGO-state relationship. With this approach, I was able to generate new hypotheses about the NGO-state relationship, which allowed for deeper understanding of the topic and a basis for further exploration.

For this study, I employed a basic or generic qualitative method of inquiry with the goal of understanding the NGO-state relationship from the perspectives of NGOs and the state. Edson (1986) believed that there is no qualitative method, but there are methods to gather information to create our meanings. Merriam (1998) stated that there are several forms of inquiry that allow us to understand and interpret the meanings of the phenomena we are studying. Among these are the basic or generic qualitative study, a process of

inquiry used when a researcher aims to discover and understand a problem and the experiences of those involved. I chose basic qualitative research for this study for several other reasons.

While the outcome of the NGO-state relationship is important, I was more interested in the process by which the NGO-state relationship came about and functions. Qualitative research is used when the researcher wants to examine a process as opposed to an outcome (Creswell, 2009). In addition, qualitative research is centered around meanings. In this research, I aimed to discover the meanings NGOs and the state attach to their experiences, which further indicated the nature of their relationship. Qualitative researchers utilize multiple sources of data to analyze and organize across data sources (Eisner, 1991; Hatch, 2002). For this research, I used open-ended surveys and document analysis to collect data.

Qualitative researchers use a theoretical lens through which the study is analyzed for greater understanding of the problem (Bodgan & Biklen, 1992; Creswell, 2009). In this study, I applied postinternationalism to analyze the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Notably, qualitative research is an inductive process of examining data to understand what is being studied, through which hypotheses and concepts can emerge (Creswell, 2009). While I sought to account for turbulence in the NGO-state relationship in this study, I was open to new ideas/concepts that emerged from the data during data analysis.

Finally, qualitative research is focused on the reality constructed by those involved (Creswell, 2009). The opportunity to gain first-hand accounts from NGOs and the state allowed for an understanding of best practices which can enhance the NGO-state relationship and advance the Caribbean through effective policymaking.

### **Role of the Researcher**

Defining the role of the researcher is important in qualitative research. The qualitative researcher must intensively engage with the research participants to fulfill a central characteristic of qualitative research: its interpretivism (Creswell, 2009). Merriam (1998) believed that the researcher must be highly intuitive, tolerant of ambiguity, and an excellent communicator, able to empathize with respondents, establish proper rapport, asked good questions and listened attentively. In this research, I was the key instrument, collecting data by examining documents and disseminating open-ended surveys.

For this study, the above qualities were essential. I carefully observed participants' responses. I implemented the interpretivist/constructivist paradigm throughout the work. I recruited all participants and created all open-ended surveys appropriately. I analyzed data and interpreted the findings.

To allow the audience to assess the validity of this study, I stated personal biases explicitly. Furthermore, I identified values and personal background (gender, history, culture, and socioeconomic status), which can shape interpretations. Einser and Peshkin (1990) maintained that researchers can make a unique contribution through bias, including their personal views combined with data collected.

As a citizen of Trinidad and Tobago and a student of International Relations and Public Policy, I have spent the last ten years studying politics in Trinidad and Tobago, which allowed for keen insight into the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago. I understand the challenges faced by both sectors and was aware that academic experience, personal background, and upbringing, may bias the approach to this study. Being immersed in a third-world culture, with a history of colonialism and slavery, vulnerability and subjugation, also constituted this bias. Additionally, because I am involved in the education sector as opposed to the political/public sector, limited experience also constituted a bias.

In controlling these biases, my data were reviewed by friends and colleagues to explore my preferences for particular kinds of interpretations and explanations, which allowed me to consider alternatives. I provided a confidentiality agreement to friends and colleagues prior to this.

### **Methodology**

In this study, I employed a basic qualitative methodology. I chose this since it allowed for use of established methodologies while maintaining flexibility. Merriam (2009) believed that a basic qualitative methodology is suitable for researchers who wish to examine how people describe their relationships and construct meaning. Hence, a basic qualitative methodology was best suited for this study since it allowed me to focus on how NGOs and the state interpret their relationship, how they both construct their worlds

and the meaning they attribute to their relationship. I collected data from existing documents as well as surveys using open-ended questions.

### **Participant Selection Logic**

The goal of qualitative research is in-depth understanding. Purposeful sampling allows for collection of rich information in an efficient manner (Creswell, 2007; Patton, 2002; Wilmont, 2005). Patton (1990) believed that purposeful sampling illustrated characteristics of particular groups of interest (like NGOs and the state), and allowed for comparison, generalization, and application of information to other cases. For this study, participants were identified and selected based on how knowledgeable and experienced they were on the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Bernard (2002) also believed that availability and willingness to participate should be considered.

The study required data that would lead to an understanding of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Creswell (2007) believed that purposive sampling was useful to include participants who met narrow or specific criteria. While I used purposive sampling because it allowed for a broad range of perspectives, I was also able to include participants who meet narrow or specific criteria like the NGO-state relationship. Participation in this study was limited to NGOs that deal directly with the state. Participants from the state were selected from the NGO Unit of the Ministry of Social Development, a department that manages relationships between the state and NGOs. Additionally, I selected only the longest standing (over 20 years) and fairly new NGOs (at least 5 years) for participation in this study. NGOs that are less than 5 years old

were exempt from this study. This allowed for an understanding of the history of the NGO-state relationship in order to identify changes and assess the current status of this relationship.

For this study, I used a small sample population to provide meaningful data on the NGO-state relationship. Wilmont (2005) believed in purposeful sampling; the number of participants is less important than the criteria used to select them. Furthermore, a small nonrepresentative but highly informed sample can provide rich information in qualitative research (Percy et al., 2015). Guest, Bunce, and Johnson (2006) suggested that qualitative researchers should aim to have a sample population of 12 people. Hence, my goal was to receive at least 12 surveys from NGO representatives and one from a state representative.

I chose this specified population from each sector because they have existing relationships, working together on policies and projects. I identified this population with information about NGOs and the NGO Unit of the Ministry of Social Development from Trinidad and Tobago government websites. Through these websites, I obtained contact information for various offices. I got in touch with executive directors and some assistants. I sent letters of invitation along with the link to the survey to the executive directors and their assistants, informing them of the research and seeking permission to speak with their representatives. I followed up with reminder emails.

The number of participants I used in this research was based on the number that was required to enlighten all elements of this study. Usually, in qualitative research, the sample size is not predetermined (Sargeant, 2012). The sample size will be sufficient

only when additional data do not result in the identification of new concepts or data saturation (Sargeant, 2012). Sargent (2012) believed that data saturation is achieved through an iterative process of data collection and analysis, which allows the researcher to pinpoint new themes and perspectives that may have previously been ignored. I followed this process to determine data saturation. My aim was to receive responses from six representatives of the state and six representatives from the NGO sector. This allowed for balanced data and ensured that biased views were not reported.

I maintained constant communication with research participants, which helped to counter challenges associated with recruitment. When saturation of themes is achieved, recruitment ceases, and this allows for transparency (Mason, 2010). I collected data over the period of five weeks which allowed for ample participation and because of the busy schedules of NGOs and state officials.

### **Instrumentation**

Data collection is a critical part of the research process. Chong and Yeo (2015) maintained that data collection is an on-going process that involves exchanging collected data between developed codes and categories. My data collection process was guided by this. I sought to answer the following research question: What are the perceptions of NGOs and the state of turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship? To answer the question and ensure rich data, I used two instruments: open-ended surveys and document analysis. Miles and Huberman (1994) believed that this



combination of methods allow the researcher to assemble massive data which can later be broken down into themes.

The survey questions used for this study were driven by the literature presented in Chapter 2. According to Percy et al. (2015), survey questions are constructed on the basis of foreknowledge about a topic. The questions align with the theory of postinternationalism and its concepts of turbulence and distant proximities. Open-ended surveys provide a first-hand account of participants' thoughts and allows the participants freedom to express opinions without being prompted by the researcher (Foddy, 1993). For this reason, I selected open-ended surveys. These surveys consisted of five key questions that helped to define the areas being explored, but also allowed room for the participants to diverge to express additional ideas or provide greater detail. This flexibility was important for this study.

I used the following survey questions for this study:

1. How do you believe the state describes their relationship with NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago?
2. How do you believe NGOs describe their relationship with the state in Trinidad and Tobago?
3. How does globalization verses local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago?
4. What factors do you believe contribute to NGO-state cooperation or lack of cooperation?

##### 5. How has the NGO-state relationship changed over time?

Document analysis allows a researcher to access a variety of reliable non-reactive data sources (Bowen, 2009). This method added depth to the data for analysis and for triangulation. The documents used in this study were public records such as policy manuals, strategic plans, and records of organizations' activities and newspapers.

The data collection method was appropriate to this study for a few reasons. I studied the participants in their natural setting. I emailed invitation letters to participants. I used SurveyMonkey to conduct the survey. In this way, participants were not inconvenienced or made uncomfortable outside of their natural environment. I was the key instrument and collected all data. The information retrieved provided a holistic account of the NGO-state relationship. Finally, since this research was interpretive, researcher involvement with participants was best achieved through open-ended surveys and document analysis.

#### **Content Validity**

This study used two methods to collect data: open ended-surveys and document analysis. Brod, Tesler & Christensen (2009) believed that to ensure data is comprehensive and accurately reflects the perspectives of those studied, the researcher must maintain direct communication with research participants. For this research I communicated directly with the research participants. Content validity refers to the relevance and generalizability of content (Leedy & Omrod, 2005). I assessed the study's

theoretical foundation, research rationale and approach to ensure they were consistent with experiences of NGOs and the state (Brod, Tesler & Christensen, 2009).

To answer the study's central research question of what are the perceptions of NGOs and the state of turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship, collecting large amounts of data was not as important as analysis of the data. Nonetheless, this combination of methods produced adequate data for complete understanding of the problem.

### **Procedures for Recruitment, Participation, and Data Collection**

To answer this study's research question: what are the perceptions and NGOs and the state of turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship? open-ended surveys and document analysis were used. Open-ended surveys were distributed to NGO representatives and the state. Then, I examined documents and other information that related to the NGO-state relationship. This information was retrieved from local news websites and NGO news websites and government ministry websites.

Due to the nature of the portfolios of selected research participants (usually very busy and difficult to get into contact with), open-ended surveys were emailed to research participants. The study was not be conducted in a single specific physical space. Rather, data collection was carried out online via email. In this way, I was able to access a geographically dispersed panel of experts, which allowed them to communicate in a convenient and flexible manner, while ensuring their time and schedules are respected.

I was the key instrument in this research and collected all the data for analysis. The data was collected over a period of five weeks based on the availability of state and nonstate officials. One week before starting data collection, initial contact was made with the Ministry of Social Development via telephone and/or emails. In this initial telephone conversation, I spoke with representatives at the NGO Unit at the Ministry of Social Development who provided me with contact information for the director of the NGO Unit. I maintained contact with this department by follow-up phone calls and emails. I sent an invitation letter via email with the link to the SurveyMonkey survey to this department. Unfortunately, I did not receive any response from the NGO Unit, which represents the state.

Information concerning research participants from NGOs was publicly available on the Trinidad and Tobago Directory of NGOs website. I sent emails to all 99 listed NGOs. The email addresses of the representatives of these NGOs were listed on the website. Out of these 99 representatives, 22 participated in this research. I emailed an invitation letter along with the link to the survey to participants during week one. The open-ended survey was created using SurveyMonkey.

This invitation letter (Appendix A) included instructions for locating and taking the survey, an explanation of the goals of the study, and informed consent. Emphasis was placed on the aim of the study to improve the understanding of the NGO-state relationship and how this understanding will impact not only these two entities, but all of society. Informed consent was introduced at the beginning of the survey. Participants

could only have taken the survey after agreeing to the informed consent. If participants did not agree to the informed consent, the survey would have automatically closed. This occurred at the beginning of week one of data collection.

Informed consent for this study aimed to ensure that participants were aware of their respective roles and expectations. The informed consent page communicated information about participation, specifying that participation is voluntary, personal information kept confidential and participants have the ability to withdraw from the research at any time without consequences.

One week later, a first reminder notice (Appendix B) was emailed to NGO the targeted participants to remind them to complete the survey. One week after the first reminder, I emailed a second reminder notice (Appendix B) to the targeted participants to remind them to complete the survey. At the end of week four, I calculated the preliminary response rate. The rate was not high enough, so I extend data collection to an additional week. The survey protocol for this research can be found in Appendix D. Upon receipt, the data was downloaded from emails and stored. I made notes for analysis and comparison.

After data collection, participants were provided with my student email address in case they wished to add to the survey after it has been completed, or if they wished to talk. Upon provision of their email addresses, participants will also be provided with an executive summary of my completed study.

### **Data Analysis Plan**

Data analysis for the study of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago through a postinternational framework, employed the transcendental realism approach to data analysis (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014). Transcendental realism allows the researcher to trace the relationship between the entities studied based on regularities and sequences that link these two entities (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014). For this reason, I employed this method of analysis. Data analysis included data reduction, data display and drawing and verifying conclusions (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014).

Coding is important in qualitative research since it allows for simplification of data to make connections between ideas and concepts and allow the data to speak to the researcher (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014). Coding is a process in which the researcher assigns codes to raw data (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014). For this research, codes were developed from the theory of postinternationalism and its central concepts, turbulence and distant proximities. Since these codes are theory-driven, it required constant reference to theory and key concepts. This process was iterative and required a revision of definitions as I gained new insights about the data. A preliminary codebook was established to assist me in analyzing the data. This codebook can be found in Table 1.

Table 1.

*Preliminary Codebook*

Parent Code	Child Code	Survey Questions
Turbulence	Complexity	1, 2, 3, 5
	Dynamism	1, 2, 3, 5
Distant proximities	Localization (state-centric)	4
	Globalization (nonstate-centric)	4
Advocacy Coalition Framework	Degree of consensus needed for policy change	3, 4, 5
	Openness of political system	2, 3, 4, 5

The initial stage of data analysis involved open coding. I scrutinized the information retrieved from open-ended surveys to arrive at categories/themes. I looked for key words and phrases that related to the concepts of turbulence and distant proximities. Saldana (2009) believed that initial coding is beneficial since it allows the researcher to remain open to the different theoretical directions the data led to.

I then coded the data process coding. Process means movement and change over time (Saldana, 2009). This type of coding allowed for an understanding of how the NGO-

state relationship originated and evolved and the significance of this relationship for both parties. Process coding is suited to studies focused on interactions for the purpose of solving with problems, like the NGO-state relationship (Saldana, 2009).

I manually coded the data for this study. It was important for me to step back from the software to conceptualize my codes. I downloaded the data from Survey Monkey and stored in one Microsoft Word document. I used track changes to mark terms in the data that reflected the theoretical codes. I also used track changes to mark emerging codes.

The central research question addressed by this study was: what are the perceptions of NGOs and the state about turbulence and distant proximities as characteristic of their relationship? Theories emerging from the data were:

- Postinternationalism (Rosenau, 2003)
- Advocacy Coalition Framework (Sabatier & Jenkins-Smith, 1993)

The following survey questions were used to answer the central research question of this study:

- 1) How do you believe the state describes their relationship with NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago?
- 2) How do you believe NGOs describe their relationship with the state in Trinidad and Tobago?
- 3) How does globalization verses local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago?



- 4) What factors do you believe contribute to NGO-state cooperation or lack of cooperation?
- 5) How has the NGO-state relationship changed over time?

Data reduction occurred throughout the analysis of data. I edited, organized and summarized the data, then I coded and explained. Data were displayed using an aggregate frequency table (Appendix F). This helped to organize and summarize the data. After this I drew conclusions through coding and memoing.

I analyzed the data through analytic memo writing. Memo writing is useful since it leads to elaboration of a concept and relationships between them (Glaser, 1978; Miles & Huberman, 1994; Saldana, 2009). Memos allowed me to record the coding process and choices and to reflect on emerging codes and themes in the data which further explored postinternationalism.

The final stage in data analysis was the interpretation of the data. Lincoln & Guba (1985) sums up this stage in the simple question “what were the lessons learned.?” This included my personal interpretation. According to Creswell (2009), the researcher brings to the study his/her own culture, history and experiences. The interpretation also included a comparison of the findings with relevant literature and theories, which helped me to explain whether the findings confirm past information or diverge from it. I developed new questions that warrant attention but was not anticipated earlier in the study.

### **Issues of Trustworthiness**

To improve the quality of this research, I ensured accuracy and credibility of findings. There are four ways I did this: credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability (Trochim, 2001). Credibility refers to accuracy in data collection (Sikolia , Biros, Mason, & Weiser, 2013). I had lengthy engagement with participants, triangulated data and shared information with participants. Through negative analysis I examined cases which may have contradicted the main findings.

I provided clear explanations of the research and its results, the perspectives and experiences of research participants, the methodology, and debriefing strategies. Transferability speaks to generalizability; how results can be transferred to different contexts and settings (Trochim, 2001; Biros, Mason, Sikolia & Weiser, 2013). Information about the researcher as the key instrument and researcher-participant relationship was also shared.

Dependability means making allowances for changes that can take place in a study (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). This includes changes in the design of the study, important for providing context. To ensure dependability, I used peer examination. I discussed my research with impartial colleagues to guarantee consistency throughout the research. Confirmability refers to disclosure of data for others confirm results/interpretations (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Confirmability in this study was achieved through triangulation and member checking.

### **Ethical Procedures**

There are certain ethical issues which arose due to the nature of this research. To address these, I was guided by the principle of autonomy and respect for participants' rights. The participants of this study were informed about the study, with the right to decide if to participate and the right to withdraw at any time without consequences. I ensured that participants selected were true volunteers and secured their privacy.

Additionally, I was committed to the purpose of qualitative research; to describe a phenomenon from participants' perspective. To this end, a balanced relationship with participants was maintained, with a clear understanding of my role to presenting research in a reliable manner (Ramos, 1989).

I submitted an application to the Walden University's Institutional Review Board to conduct an analysis of the benefits and risks of this study and ensure that the benefits of the research outweigh the risks. In disseminating the research, I was careful to refrain from language that may bias any group in society.

Furthermore, once published, if errors are highlighted that may change the interpretation of the study's findings, I will correct such errors (Smith, 2003). Finally, the primary data collected for this study will be archived for at least five years so that others can replicate the study and to maintain the study's authenticity (Smith, 2003). I am not collecting sensitive data and will specify in the consent process how the data will be shared.

Evidently, I was aware that all risks cannot be removed completely and there may be ethical dilemmas not related to study that may arise. In addressing these unforeseen issues, I was mindful of my moral responsibility (Ramos, 1989).

### **Summary**

This chapter presented a thorough explanation of the research design for this study of the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective. First, I provided an overview of the research design and rationale, followed by the role of the researcher. Next, I presented the methodology and details related to participant selection, instrumentation, procedures for recruitment, participation and data collection. After this, I presented the study's data analysis plan, followed by issues of trustworthiness and finally, ethical procedures. Chapter 4 contains a comprehensive presentation of the study's results.

## Chapter 4: Results

This chapter includes a discussion of the results of the study of the NGO-State relationship in Trinidad and Tobago using a postinternational framework. The principal research question that emerged was: What are the perceptions of NGOs and the state of their relationship as characteristic of turbulence and distant proximities? This research focused on five survey questions that answer this question:

1. How do you believe the state describes their relationship with NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago?
2. How do you believe NGOs describe their relationship with the state in Trinidad and Tobago?
3. How does globalization verses local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago?
4. What factors do you believe contribute to NGO-state cooperation or lack of cooperation?
5. How has the NGO-state relationship changed over time?

This chapter includes a detailed discussion of the results of this study. The chapter begins with an overview of the setting of the research, followed by the demographics of the study population. Additionally, I discuss the data collection and data analysis for the study. I then explain the data analysis plan is then explained followed by issues of trustworthiness. The chapter ends with a discussion of ethical procedures for the study.

### Setting

I designed the survey method approach to include participants from NGOs and the state across Trinidad and Tobago. I emailed surveys to 99 participants from NGOs and to the NGO Unit at the Ministry of Social Development in Trinidad and Tobago. I received 24 responses from representatives of NGOs, but no responses from state representatives. Of the 24 responses, two surveys were incomplete, therefore, only 22 surveys were coded and analyzed.

The organizations who responded to the survey were all in existence for at least five years and have existing relationships with the state for a period of over 10 years. Many of these NGOs have been in existence for over 20 years. This data can be seen in Table 2. This data allow for an understanding of the history of the NGO-state relationship as well as the current status of this relationship.

Table 2.

#### *Research Participants*

Years in Organization	Number	Percentage
0-5	9	41%
6-10	1	5%
11-15	2	9%
16-19	1	5%
20+	9	41%

### **Demographics**

Twenty-two respondents participated in this study. The participants were all representatives of various nongovernmental organizations. During the implementation of this study, there were no personal or organizational conditions that affected participants or that could affect the interpretation of the results of the study. All organizations that participated in this research met the inclusion criteria which included being in existence for at least 5 years and having an existing relationship with the state. In this research I did not collect data related to gender or racial identity as it was not within the parameters of the study.

### **Data Collection Procedures**

Data collection for this research began after IRB approval. The IRB approval number for this study is 1217-18-0238264. Ninety-nine surveys were distributed to research participants via email using SurveyMonkey. I emailed one survey to the NGO Unit at the Ministry of Social Development for state participation. I sent this email to the Director of the NGO Unit, who did not respond after two reminder emails were sent and ten phone calls. Consequently, this research reflects the perspectives of solely NGOs. Twenty-four research participants from NGOs responded, but only 22 surveys were thoroughly answered. Hence, I only coded and analyzed 22 surveys from NGO participants.

There were a proposed 4 to 6 weeks for recruitment and data collection, but the data was collected by the end of five weeks. Therefore, no additional time was required

to collect data from participants. I downloaded the data from SurveyMonkey and saved to one Microsoft Word document. During the data collection process, there were no other unusual situations that hampered data collection.

### **Data Analysis**

Miles, Huberman & Saldana (2014) highlighted the transcendental realism approach to data analysis which allows the researcher to trace relationships based on regularities and sequences that link two entities. I used this data analysis approach since it allowed me to trace the relationship between NGOs and the state based on regularities and sequences that link these two entities. I reduced the data by using only those surveys that were thoroughly completed. This amounted to 22 surveys.

I then coded the data manually. Originally, I decided to code the data for this research using NVivo software. However, after reviewing the responses of the surveys, it became more feasible to code this data manually. Elliot (2018) maintained that it is possible to proliferate codes beyond the level at which you are able to remember them all or deal with them usefully. Furthermore, when using software, it is very easy to be drawn into the data in a manner that makes it difficult for the researcher to have an overview of what is going on (Elliot, 2018). For this research, I wanted to take a step back from the software to conceptualize my codes.

I developed codes for this study from the theory of postinternationalism and its central concepts, turbulence and distant proximities. I created a preliminary codebook (Table 1) to assist me in analyzing the data. The initial stage of data analysis involved



open coding. The information retrieved from open-ended surveys was scrutinized to arrive at categories/themes. I identified key words and phrases that related to the concepts of turbulence and distant proximities.

I then coded the data using process coding. Process means movement and change over time (Saldana, 2009). This type of coding allowed me to understand how the NGO-state relationship originated and evolved, and the significance of this relationship for both parties. I analyzed the data through analytic memo writing. Saldana (2009) believed that analytic memo writing allows the researcher to record the coding process and choices and to reflect on emerging codes and themes in the data.

The final stage in data analysis was interpretation of the data. Creswell (2009) highlighted that interpretation of qualitative data includes the researcher's personal interpretation and a comparison of the findings with relevant literature and theories. This type of interpretation helped me to explain whether the findings confirm past information or diverge from it. I developed new questions that warrant attention, that were not anticipated earlier in the study.

I addressed the issue of missing data and nonresponse errors by omitting those surveys that were incomplete. In this research, only two surveys were incomplete and had to be omitted from the analysis. Hence, nonresponse bias in this research is nonnegligible. Although the selected participants had the right to withdraw from the study at any time, none of them requested to withdraw.

### **Trustworthiness**

Trustworthiness for this study was achieved in the following ways:

**Credibility:** I triangulated the data and shared information with participants. I examined cases which could have contradicted the main findings and provided clear explanations of the research and its results, the perspectives and experiences of research participants, the methodology, and debriefing strategies.

**Transferability:** I shared information about myself as the researcher and the researcher-participant relationship with research participants. I also thoroughly described the study's framework and assumptions, which allowed me to evaluate the extent to which my conclusions were transferable to other situations, settings and times.

**Dependability:** This study gained reliability and accuracy by only engaging with participants who met the inclusion criteria. I used peer examination and discussed my research with impartial colleagues to guarantee consistency. Finally, confirmability was achieved through triangulation and member checking to eliminate biases and negative instances.

### **Results**

In this section, I present the results of this research study, organized by the theoretical codes derived from the literature review. From the analysis of the data, 20 codes emerged that I correlated with three theoretical codes, to develop themes related to the survey questions. These emergent themes represented the perceptions of NGOs.

I grouped the survey questions according to their relationship to each code. As themes emerged from coding the survey questions, those recurring codes became themes aligned to the theory. Excerpts of the survey transcripts provided documentation support for the themes. I chose not to use a specific order in presenting support, but rather to first quote what appeared to be the most impactful statement related to the theoretical codes.

#### Code 1: Turbulence ( $f=36$ ) – Complexity & Dynamism

Turbulence was mentioned 36 times in the survey data. Survey questions 1, 2, 3 and 5 elicited comments related to turbulence. These questions directly reflected turbulence (instances of complexity and dynamism) in the state's relationship with NGOs. Complexity is a feature of interactions among diverse actors. Dynamism refers to a changing political environment. Complexity and dynamism were mentioned 17 times in the survey data. Out of 22 participants, 10 highlighted a complex and dynamic political environment. The coding indicted four themes:

#### **Theme 1: The Statics of Continuity**

The survey data references the statics of continuity 12 times throughout the data. Participants highlight the state's "lethargy" and resistance to change. Participants noted that one of the biggest challenges of working with the state is their lack of understanding of the NGO role and significance as actors in politics. When asked the question (SQ1) "How do you believe the state describes their relationship with NGOs?" some participants answered:

- "They know we exist"

- “The state needs NGOs but does not value them”
- “The state does not support NGOs”
- “Necessary but not expedient”
- “Challenging”

When asked the question SQ2, “How has the NGO-state relationship changed over time,” five participants mentioned that it has not changed, one participant remarked, “no change, just got relaxed.” Nine participants mentioned that changes in this relationship depends on the political party of the day. Five participants mentioned that the NGO-state relationship has improved. One participant believed that the relationship has evolved since NGOs have become more structured. Another participant believed that the relationship has become stronger and more inclusive.

Other responses from participants were:

- “The state operates on a selfish basis when they need NGO support they will ask but will not give that support in return.”
- “Less funding and support being offered by the State to NGOs that basically do a lot of the work that the State should be doing.”
- “The State is only just beginning to realize that it needs the full participation and collaboration NGOs to fulfill its international human rights and trade commitments, but it has not yet taken concrete steps to create an enabling environment to facilitate that level of engagement.”

- “Very little. Some priority is given to those NGOs where greater light or public interest are factors.”

### **Theme 2: Lack of financial support**

Lack of financial support was mentioned 13 times in the survey data. Out of 22 participants, nine highlighted that lack of financial support creates a complex environment for NGOs to exist alongside the state. Participants believe that the level of financing does not match the demands placed on NGOs. In many cases NGOs are frustrated and seek external funding to meet their needs due to a lack of cooperation from the state. In addition, the process of distribution of financing among NGOs by the state is unfair and only seeks to support those NGOs who share the state’s political interests. Participants noted that there has been a decline in state financing to NGOs and consequently, as one participant remarked their relationship has shift from a “donor-recipient to consultant-client.”

When asked the question SQ3 “What factors do you believe contribute to NGO-state cooperation or lack of cooperation,” participants mentioned the lack of resources to do their work, budget cuts, financial resources only provided based on the need of the state, a lack of fairness in distribution of funding to NGOs, the state is very selective and biased and priority is given to state agencies.

### **Theme 3: Political affiliation**

Political affiliation was mentioned nine times in the survey data. Out of 22 participants, five mentioned the importance of political affiliation when it comes to

NGO-state cooperation. When asked the question SQ5 “How do you believe NGOs describe their relationship with the State in Trinidad and Tobago,” participants agreed that support for NGOs is dependent on the political party in power at the given time. One participant compared the support with the last administration, noting that it has been “drastically reduced” with the current administration. The data highlighted that popular NGOs and NGOs that “play it well with politics” stand a greater chance of receiving funding. Furthermore, one participant mentioned that “personalities and personal connections dictate the tenor of the relationship far more than any policy.”

#### **Theme 4: A weak relationship**

A weak relationship was alluded to 26 times in the survey data. When asked the question SQ5, “How do you believe NGOs describe their relationship with the State in Trinidad and Tobago,” out of 22 participants, four mentioned that the relationship is “passive,” three mentioned that the relationship with the state can be described as “average,” two participants mentioned that the relationship is “frustrating,” three mentioned that they coexist, three mentioned that the relationship is “horrible,” two mentioned that the relationship is challenging, one mentioned that the relationship is strained and two mentioned that no relationship exists.

On the other hand, when asked the question SQ1, “How do you believe the state describes their relationship with NGOs,” 18 participants remarked that the state would describe their relationship with NGOs as positive.

Code 2: Distant Proximities ( $f=33$ ) – localization (state-centric) & globalization (multi-centric)

Distant proximities was alluded to 33 times in the survey data. SQ4 supported distant proximities. Distant proximities are the tensions that exist between the local and the global worlds. These questions directly reflected these tensions (distant proximities) in the state's relationship with NGOs. The coding indicated three themes:

### **Theme 1: Localization**

Localization or state centrism can be seen as a retreat by the state to less encompassing systems, a narrowing of horizons where the state is the center of attention. Localization was mentioned 13 times in the survey data. Globalization or multicentrism reflects an opposite world made up of a multiple complex actors involved in decision-making. Globalization was mentioned 17 times in the survey data. When asked the question SQ4, "How does globalization versus local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago," 16 participants believed that the state is not open to participation and refuses to take NGO recommendations on board. One participant highlighted that the power and privilege of the state perpetuates an imbalance between the two sectors and since the state is reluctant to make shifts in mentality and methodology, they render themselves irrelevant or obsolete.

Participants also noted that NGOs are criticized as pushing global agendas and not operating on a "grassroots level" which demonstrates their lack of understanding about

the potential of civil society. One participant believed that the state currently functions without critical support from the state. Another participant noted that the state abuses its power to achieve their own gains and, in most cases, NGOs are marginalized and underrepresented.

### **Theme 2: NGO scope & popularity**

In terms of the impact of globalization on the NGO-state relationship, participants believed that NGOs now have greater education and awareness due to technology. 16 participants believed that due to shifts in thinking by NGOs and their collaboration as a sector, NGOs now seen as a threat by the state. Also, as a result of a rise in diverse issues, NGO work is now in greater demand. Furthermore, foreign companies are now providing aid for NGOs, which allow them to function without the financial support of the state.

However, the state is being pressured by global trade agreements and the global position of national entities, to recognize the role of NGOs and give them a voice in national affairs. The popularity of NGOs is growing worldwide but NGOs are also pressured to fulfill the requirements of global organizations and incorporate global perspectives that do not clash with the local perspectives of the state.

### **Theme 3: International affiliations strength the NGO-state relationship**

When asked the question (SQ4) “How does globalization versus local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago?” 13 participants mentioned that globalization has positively impacted the NGO-state relationship since the work of NGOs influence diplomatic relations. This pleases the state



since it puts the country of the map and at the same time, encourages state respect for NGOs. These participants believe that NGOs allow for a global audience that cannot be achieved by the state.

Code 3: Advocacy Coalition Framework ( $f=11$ ) – degree of consensus needed for policy change & openness of political system

The advocacy coalition framework theory was mentioned 11 times throughout the data. SQ4 and SQ5 supported advocacy coalition framework. These questions directly reflected the advocacy coalition framework, but specifically the degree of consensus needed for policy change and the openness of the political system and how they impact the NGO-state relationship. The coding indicted three themes:

### **Theme 1: Closed decision-making**

When asked the question (SQ3): “What factors do you believe contribute to NGO-state cooperation or lack of cooperation?” one participant remarked that the state does not make the NGO “an integral part of decision making, another mentioned that the state does not value NGOs.

Nine participants believe that one of their biggest challenges for cooperation with the state is in the area of financial support. One participant noted that there is also a lack of fairness when it comes to financial distribution among NGOs and this leads to a lack of cooperation. Furthermore, decision-making is centralized and the state functions without critical contribution from NGOs. One participant mentioned that “the state abuses its power and uses NGOs at their leisure to serve their own gains.” Additionally,

participants mentioned that NGO interests are marginalized and hardly represented. Out of 22 participants, 17 participants believed that the state refuses to consider their recommendations.

Participants noted that NGOs are left out of decision-making because they are viewed as competitors. Some NGOs are fed up of government bureaucracy and politics and so prefer to work on their own, even though state partnership can expand their reach.

## **Theme 2: Closed political system**

When asked the question (SQ4) “How does globalization versus local efforts seem to impact the relationship between NGOs and the state in Trinidad and Tobago,” participants highlighted that the political system is resistant to change, one participant used the term “archaic.”

Two participants mentioned that there is a lack of trust between both sectors and this leads to lack of involvement by NGOs. In some cases, some NGOs are disorganized, and this also makes their involvement challenging. Furthermore, one participant noted that NGOs have political affiliations and their involvement is dependent on these affiliations. Cooperation is based on whether NGO mandates are aligned with those of the state or not.

One participant noted that the state is “selective” when it comes to NGO involvement and cooperation is only achieved if state believes their cause is important. One participant noted that state priorities are ultimately “self-serving.” One participant

believed that there is a lack of understanding and vision about social justice issues and along with inefficient systems and processes, these contribute to a closed political system.

Finally, one participant noted that both sectors display good governance and adhere to good practice, but a lack of cooperation results in the degree of fit between the vision and mission of NGOs and that of the state. Overall, 18 participants noted that the greatest contributor to this closed political system is a lack of appreciation by the state of the significant role of NGOs in society.

### **Summary**

This chapter presented the study's results and conducted an analysis of the data. From the analysis of the data, I derived three theoretical and 20 emergent codes, which I correlated to develop themes related to the survey questions.

The first category of themes fell under the code: turbulence – complexity and dynamism. 95% of the respondents felt that the state is resistant to change, NGO work is affected because of a lack of financial support from the state, the state “plays politics” with NGOs and only support NGOs in return for political support and finally, that the NGO-state relationship can best be described as passive.

The second category of themes fall under the code: distant proximities – localization and globalization. 60% of the respondents felt that the power and privilege of the state creates an imbalance between the two sectors and that NGOs are a threat to the state since there is a greater demand for NGO work as the plethora of challenges become increasingly diverse. In addition, globalization has positive effects for NGOs since

international affiliations allow for the country's diplomatic relations to be improved, which prompts state participation with NGOs.

The third category of themes fall under the code: advocacy coalition framework – degree of consensus needed for policy change & openness of political system. 85% of the participants felt that decision-making is centralized and the state functions without the contribution of NGOs. Consequently, NGOs are marginalized and underrepresented.

Chapter five will contain a summary discussion and conclusion of the study.

## Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

### **Introduction**

The purpose of this qualitative research was to explore the NGO-state relationship from a postinternational perspective. Caribbean politics is modeled by the Westminster system of governance because most islands were originally ruled by the English. Decision-making is centralized and political parties have immense power. This has caused a strain on the state relationship with NGOs. With NGOs becoming increasingly more popular, the region is challenged with issues of inclusion, decentralization, and managing their now complex environment.

In this basic qualitative study, I used the survey method to collect qualitative data that facilitated an exploration of the NGO-state relationship from a postinternational perspective. The perspectives of 22 participants were captured by a survey distributed online via email. The objective of this survey was to provoke responses from NGOs explaining their experiences resulting from interactions with the state. The responses were categorized into three codes that were further distilled into eight themes. This qualitative analysis revealed the view of NGOs that work directly with the state in Trinidad and Tobago.

This chapter includes the literature and findings, implications and recommendations for further research. I discuss answers to the central research question and five survey questions along with an overview of the perspectives of NGOs on their

relationship with the state. This chapter concludes with remarks on the limitations of the study, implications and recommendations for future research.

### **Interpretation of Findings**

In this study, this exploration of the NGO-state relationship from a postinternational perspective was driven by a central research question and five survey questions. The five survey questions formed the basis of the research aimed to answer the central research question. From the data obtained and the findings from the research, I was able to provide comprehensive and detailed answers to these questions.

As indicated by Rosenau (2003) turbulence and distant proximities are features of a modern political environment. From the research findings, 95% of the research population expressed turbulence in their relationship with the state. Turbulence exists when states are invaded by multiple diverse actors like NGOs (Rosenau, 2003). This causes the environment to become complex and dynamic, what Rosenau (2003) referred to as distant proximities. NGOs function in a tense environment alongside the state. In this environment, the forces of transformation, decentralization, and interdependence, represented by NGOs, clash with stagnation, dependence, and centralization, represented by the state. However, as globalization makes an impact on this environment, state prominence is being sidelined. In the Caribbean, this process takes place at a much slower rate. Research participants in this study reflect the view that the state is resistant to change, “lethargic,” “anarchic,” and unconvinced about the importance of NGOs, although NGO prominence is growing internationally.

NGOs are now in greater demand, especially since their social, economic and technical challenges are becoming more diverse. The state is not equipped to deal with many of these challenges and need to employ the services of NGOs. Karns, Mingst, and Stiles (2015) outlined some of these challenges as climate change, humanitarian crises, migration and wars, to name a few. Ansell and Trondall (2017) maintained that this complex environment is a result of the demands made by these actors, who must be included in decision-making. The problem of turbulence cannot be addressed by the state alone since it does not involve the state alone.

Distant proximities reflect a tension between globalization (NGOs) and localization (state) or *glocalization* (Rosenau, 2003). From the research findings, 60% of the participants characterized the NGO-state relationship as a distant proximity. Distant proximities was mentioned 33 times in the survey data. This tension can be further explained as frammegration, a merging of the processes of fragmentation and integration, caused by globalization (Rosenau, 2003). The growth of technology and communication has broken down many barriers, not only physical, but ideological. People are divided between what they know and what they are now encountering. In this postinternational world, NGOs are now filling this gap and becoming more popular. They are tasked to keep a check on the state, and because of pressure being placed on them by international standards, are forced to increase their transparency. In addition, much of NGO work is international, which contributes to positive diplomatic relations for the country. The state cannot achieve this alone. For these reasons, the state is forced to respect the NGO sector.

Traditional rules and norms are now slowly declining as allegiances shift. One of the biggest problems in Trinidad and Tobago today is illegal migration and movement of refugees, particularly from Venezuela, given its recent crisis. Fragmegration leads to global challenges like illegal migration (Rosenau, 2003). To address these and other challenges, cooperation between NGOs and the state proves to be an effective solution.

When asked the question about changes in the NGO-state relationship overtime, 75% of the research population alluded to changes in the political environment. In a postinterntional world, change is constant. Some of the changes that were noted from this research are a growth in more diverse issues, an increase in education and consequently NGO awareness among the population, a reduced capability of states to solve problems on their own and an increase in individual skills which made it possible for NGO work to continue without the involvement of states. In addition, global partnerships make it possible for global funding and as a result some NGOs become less reliant on the state for financial support. This “confusion,” results in a bifurcation of power between both sectors (Rogers, 2009; Roseanu, 2003).

This research highlighted the power and preeminence of the state in Trinidad and Tobago. Ferguson and Mansbach (2007) agree that the postinterantional climate is one in which the state remains powerful, but its sovereignty is being questioned, a fusion and fission of authority. The state abuses its power, and this frustrates NGOs. People are now more mobilized, educated, and aware and this increases their capacity. State loyalties are slowly being abandoned. NGOs are frustrated with the bureaucracy of the state and prefer



to work alone. Strange (1996) defines this dilemma as Pinnochio's problem. As society becomes advanced, they feel dissatisfied with authority. They are now forced to determine where their priorities lie as they are pulled and tossed by their feelings, culture, and influential forces in society. NGOs are challenged by a lack of legitimacy, but Chong (2002) believed that due to the increasing influence of NGOs, legitimacy is no longer a criterion to validate NGOs.

The findings of this research highlight the importance of governance in contemporary politics. The rise of NGOs has prompted a shift in traditional notions of governance as dictated by the state. The research has revealed frustration by NGOs in working with the state. This frustration prompts the NGO sector to be more united and to seek global partnerships. Governance in the contemporary era can be described as hybrid, participatory, multilevel, and turbulent (Hobbs, 2000; Lovan, Murray & Shaffer, 2017; Ramadan & Fregonese, 2017; Rosenau, 2003; Rogers, 2009). Governance involves numerous actors on different levels, the result of a dynamic political environment. This is the turbulence that makes up the postinternational world.

Lack of understanding of the potential role of an active and engaged civil society was mentioned by 95% of the research participants. One participant noted "our systems are outdated, mind set lethargic to change." For the state to recognize the potential of the NGO sector, it must make conceptual jailbreaks (Rosenau, 2003). The state must abandon its traditional views of rulership and incorporate transformations taking place in the world, such as the prominent role of NGOs. In Trinidad and Tobago, many policy-

makers still adopt a realist approach to politics, which sees the power of the state as untouchable. This view has become outdated and irrelevant because of its failure to acknowledge the role of nonstate actors. In the contemporary era, policy making is impossible without involvement of NGOs and this cannot be ignored.

Postinternationalism is relevant to this discussion since it presents a more practical approach to politics. The opposite of realism, it acknowledges the importance of the NGO sector in this dynamic environment.

Trinidad and Tobago, a previously British colony, achieved independence in 1962. The country, like many other Caribbean nations, struggled to maintain its independence in the following years, challenged by administrative and technical knowledge to govern its own affairs. 57 years later, Trinidad and Tobago still suffers from “small state” vulnerabilities which is largely a result of their conceptions of power and authority. The state in Trinidad and Tobago seeks to maintain its authority after a long battle following slavery and colonialism. One hundred and eighty-one years later, the state still believes that power is the way to economic and social progress and still attempts to go it alone. However, this stance is being challenged by NGOs, who believe that the state is unable to address the diverse needs of the contemporary Caribbean. Participants in this research believe that the NGO sector does most of the work that the state should be doing and in fact, NGOs are an “unpaid service provided by the state.”

The history of colonialism in Trinidad and Tobago cannot be left out of the explanation of state vulnerabilities. Colonization began with the Spanish at the end of the

18th century and was carried out by the British in 1797 until 1962. The French came in 1783, the Indians came in 1845 and the Chinese in 1848. Trinidadians felt powerless under the colonial system since they had no say in the politics of their land. Since independence and today, the state seeks to maintain its control, boost its confidence and maintain its identity. In the *Spoiler's Return*, Walcott describes the state as “sharks with shirt-jacs, sharks with well-pressed fins, ripping we small-fry off with razor grins, nothing ain't change but colour and attire” (Walcott, 1981). The state must be open to change and attempt to redefine itself to be relevant in a turbulent atmosphere.

Lack of cooperation between NGOs and the state was mentioned by 95% of the research participants in this research. Participants believed that NGO-state participation takes place on the terms of the state and NGOs are compelled to comply because of their lack of legitimacy. Cooperation has always been a challenge for the state. After slavery, the Caribbean experienced many failed attempts at integration. The nationalist debate in the Caribbean began with Trinidad and Tobago, one of the largest and wealthiest Caribbean nations, seeking to assert its power and secure its national identity. This triggered a lack of unity among the Caribbean islands, which still stands today.

This lack of cooperation is featured among critical sectors in the society. However, the state is now forced to alter their perspectives as globalization is making its mark. Trinidad and Tobago has seen a significant movement of people to and from its shores within the last couple of years and this has resulted in what Rosenau (2003) calls cultural fragmentation. People's attachments are shifting, and they are now adopting

different modes of thinking and many of them are more open and responsive to changes taking place around the world. This includes loyalties to NGOs who help the sidelined groups in society who in many cases are too insignificant for the reach of the state. Concepts like internationalism and globalism are critical to this debate in their recognition of these changes and how they impact culture, identity, interactions and politics (Glossop, 2017). Unlike postinternationalism, they believe that the state is still a primary actor.

Postinternationalism was the most appropriate lens for this study because it places the state alongside a list of other actors who dictate politics in the contemporary era. Research participants highlight that many NGOs are bypassing the state to seek global funding and to align themselves with global organizations for greater recognition and status. Some of them have been successful with this approach. Participants have also mentioned that the challenges facing NGOs in a contemporary environment are now quite diverse and the state does not have the skill to address them. Due to bureaucratic challenges of dealing with the state, many NGOs mobilize their own efforts to achieve their goals. Therefore, the value of NGOs is unquestionable. On the other hand, NGOs face the challenge of poor organization and weak administration (a result of lack of finances), which makes it difficult for them to attract global funding. Ultimately, cordial relations with the state can boost their performance and allow them to make a more valuable contribution to society.

Research participants highlighted that the state is slowly beginning to see the value of NGOs because of pressure being placed on them by global standards. This has created the tension between global and local, turbulence in the political environment (Rosenau, 2003). Many international NGOs operate in the Caribbean and in Trinidad and Tobago in particular. The rise of social media, increased travel and communications have popularized these organizations and allowed them to amass support from the business community and the general public. This has also created inspiration for many of the local institutions to be established. The presence, influence and growth of NGOs is undeniable. NGOs and the state must seek cooperation in order to be effective in their respective roles. This involves a greater understanding of the policy-making process and so, the advocacy coalition framework is appropriate to provide direction on inclusion of NGOs.

The advocacy coalition framework discussed the importance of coalitions to deal with the contemporary turbulent environment (Sabatier, 1986). The framework is useful in its approach since the state and NGOs have different perspectives and must cooperate to achieve national goals. Trinidad and Tobago was already introduced to coalitions with the first coalition government made up of four organizations, the People's Partnership, established in 2010. This coalition led the country until 2015, after which the country elected a single party, the PNM, to lead them. The People's Partnership coalition faced challenges of cooperation, which frustrated the population. It is clear that Trinidad and Tobago is in need of policy change. For this to happen, there must be changes in our dominant beliefs (Sabatier & Jenkins-Smith, 1993).

These changes are inevitable. The advocacy coalition framework approach believes that a turbulent environment creates opportunities for change (Sabatier, 1986). Trinidad and Tobago's approach to politics is derived from the British political system, in which decision-making is centralized and participation is limited. The Westminster approach, first used in 1848, is still practiced in Trinidad and Tobago in 2019. Pressure is being placed on the state because this style of governance is becoming outdated and impractical in a modern dynamic environment with multiple actors. Politics in contemporary Trinidad and Tobago must be viewed from a network perspective. The society is made up of a network of private and public actors who must maintain healthy relationships in order to create effective policies. Although a Caribbean leader, Trinidad and Tobago still faces challenges of administration and technical skills. The country is still vulnerable and weak. One of the biggest problems facing the country is crime. In 2014, there were 403 murders, 558 wounded and shoot at and 829 sexual offences in Trinidad and Tobago (TT Crime, 2019). In 2015 when the ruling party came into office, crime increased to 410 and in 2018 there were 516 murders (TT Crime, 2019).

In December 2018, there were 40 000 illegal immigrants in Trinidad and Tobago (Ramdass, 2019). These immigrants are bringing illegal guns and drugs into the country, as well as illnesses and infections. On April 11, 2019, four Venezuelan nationals were killed by the police for committing crimes for illegal firearms (Daily Express, 2019). In addition, many of Venezuelan immigrant women are building an illegal sex trade, working as prostitutes in bars and clubs. On April 12, 2019, police rescued four

Venezuelan nationals who were reportedly kidnapped, robbed and sexually assaulted (Daily Express, 2019). The nation is burdened by this crisis since these immigrants are also cornering the job market, making it difficult for nationals to gain and maintain jobs. The government is making attempts at a policy position to address this situation without the involvement of other actors in the society (Ramdass, 2019). Furthermore, the minister of national security mentioned that international bodies, the church and the UN Refugee Agency offered assistance, but this was declined by the state since they did not want to “confuse the process” (Ramdass, 2019).

In April 2019, this policy still has not been finalized and the Venezuelan immigrant population is growing. The government noted that the first step in this process is registration of these immigrants, which has not yet started (Ramdass, 2019). The government also noted that although amnesty will be granted to productive immigrants, who will be allowed to work in the country for one year, the logistics of this process has still not yet been worked out (Ramdass, 2019). Clearly, the state needs the collaboration of the NGO sector in order to draft an effective policy in a timely manner that can address this issue of illegal migration in Trinidad and Tobago. While illegal migration is not new to Trinidad and Tobago, the country has never experienced the problem in such a great magnitude. In order to address these complex problems, the state must adopt the ACF’s joint decision making and problem-solving approach (Weible & Sabatier, 2017).

The state in Trinidad and Tobago first experienced threats to its sovereignty in 1970 when labour unions and the Black Power Movement protested for social change and

again in 1990 when a religious group held members of the government hostage for five days. These incidents weakened the state and the society and 30 years later, many people still experience aftershocks. Social movements are purposeful and organized, committed to a common social goal. Social movements will always be present in society where aggrieved populations whose needs and interests are not being met, exist. With the advent of technology and communication, these populations are able to create viable organizations, mobilize resources and attract followers. These organizations demand our attention. The largest international organizations which function in Trinidad and Tobago are Habitat for Humanity, the Red Cross and the Pan American Health Organization (The Commonwealth Network, 2019). In addition, national NGOs, faith-based organizations and community-based organizations involved in sustainable development are growing (The Commonwealth Network, 2019). The Federation of Independent Trade Unions and NGOs (FITUN) is one of the primary bodies actively monitoring trade negotiations in Trinidad and Tobago (The Commonwealth Network, 2019). Other unions operating are the Oilfield Workers' Trade Union (OWTU), and the Trinidad Sugar and General Workers Trade Union (The Commonwealth Network, 2019). The state must allow these organizations their time, resources and attention.

Research participants in this research mention that the state is resistant to change, which was echoed throughout all surveys. Modernization describes a process in which specialization and differentiation of structures in society result in the move from an undeveloped to a developed, technologically driven society (Irwin, 1975). Using this



definition, the level of modernity in a society can be judged by the sophistication of its technology in different sectors. In 2016, Trinidad and Tobago moved from 67 to 70 in the World Economic Forum's Global Information and Technology Report (Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, 2016). This suggests that the country is providing the infrastructure and has the skill necessary to improve its technology readiness (Trinidad and Tobago Guardian, 2016). These changes drive social change across the society and demand a change in how the state functions.

NGOs in Trinidad and Tobago intersect with changes taking place in the environment, technology and population to create social change. Modernization is a result of social change. Population composition is constantly changing. Technology and particularly the internet, is the driving force behind globalization (Friedman, 2005). The industrialization of the society has led to shifting perspectives on the role of the state, created a global economy and provided new political platforms (Rosenau, 2003). Trinidad and Tobago is constantly changing. Given this, the state approach to politics should move beyond traditional unilateralism to embrace contemporary multilateralism (Rosenau, 1998). The state should not present itself as an agent of conflict, but rather, one of cooperation. NGOs should be agents of positive social change, not *hurricanes* as traditionally conceived by state (Rosenau, 1998).

### **Limitations of the study**

This basic qualitative study was conducted on NGOs in existence for at least 5 years, who work directly with the state, and their explicit experiences were presented.

This qualitative study offered an introductory view of the importance of understanding and improving the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. Previous research has not directly explored ways of improving the NGO-state relationship.

Limitations involved in this research include restraining factors explicit to basic qualitative research. While this type of research emphasizes the perceptions of NGOs, other aspects of the interactivity are not explored. For example, the relationships between NGOs and other sectors of the society are not explored. These relationships can be used to gauge the level of cooperation by NGOs and the state. Not having these perspectives is a limitation. Second, the survey method was the primary method of data collection. This relied on the ability of the research participants to accurately recall and articulate information, objectively. The incorporation of triangulation controlled this limitation. Finally, researcher bias is always a limitation of any research. Through lengthy engagement and persistency, I was able to maintain objectivity and credibility in this research.

### **Recommendations**

The objective of this study was to explore the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago from a postinternational perspective. In this study, only the perspectives of NGOs were studied. While this study sought to explore the perspectives of the state, the state was non-responsive. Future research should examine the perspectives of the state in contributing to this discussion of the NGO-state relationship.

Second, this study focused solely on the NGO-state relationship.

Interactions/communications between NGOs and other sectors of the society was not explored. Additional research should focus on the interaction between NGOs and other sectors of the society, for instance, the business sector. Most of the research found during the literature review focused on NGO-state interactions in a postinternational world. Future research should examine this relationship from a Caribbean development perspective. This was absent in the literature.

Additionally, research should expand the participant pool to include a greater number of participants using face-to-face interviews. This was a limitation of the current study. This study centered on Rosenau's (1990; 2003) postinternationalism, with a focus on the distinct elements of distant proximities and turbulence. Therefore, it is recommended that future research be targeted towards other perspectives of postinternationalism as an explanation of the NGO-state relationship.

### **Implications for social change**

The research findings contribute to social change by adding knowledge on the ways in which the NGO-state relationship could be improved for effective policy-making. The state, NGOs, public administrators, the business sector and educators may use the strategies identified in this research to improve their relationship with NGOs and to draft inclusive and effective policies that can solve the major social problems facing the country.

Improvements to the NGO-state relationship can be seen through the adoption of a perspective which incorporates the contribution of diverse political actors to the policy-making process. Rosenau (1998) talked about subgroupism, Chong (2002) advanced the plus nonstate framework, Ramadan & Fregonese (2017) suggested hybrid sovereignty, Lovan, Murray & Shaffer (2017) advanced the idea of participatory governance and Sabatier & Jenkins-Smith (1993) put forward the advocacy coalition framework. These ideas pay close attention to the multiple actors that make up our contemporary and dynamic society and accounts for their participation in contemporary politics.

The implications of this study suggest that positive social change is not dependent on one sector of the society, but on the ability of major political actors to successfully cooperate in the policy-making process. Currently, the conception of the state as the all-powerful and preeminent political force has been existing for decades. When educators accept the premise that the state no longer holds the influence they had in the days of old, but now exist alongside NGOs and numerous other actors, society can benefit from a social change brought about by a more informed population. Education is the key to relieving some of the traditional perspectives of politics that are no longer relevant in the contemporary Caribbean.

A successful NGO-state relationship is vital for effective policy-making. NGOs and the state are major political actors responsible for providing citizens with the best possible quality of life. Successful cooperation between NGOs and the state minimizes costs across the country and help both sectors to perform with excellence. Understanding

the factors which lead to the lack of cooperation between NGOs and the state and those hidden issues which impact the relationship is necessary to improve the relationship. The findings of this research indicate that the relationship between NGOs and the state can be described as turbulent and likened to a distant proximity (Rosenau, 2003).

### **Recommendations for Practice**

The responses of the participants developed a foundation of knowledge surrounding reasons for turbulence in the relationship between NGOs and the state. These rich analogies allowed me to build recommendations for practice. In the literature review for this research, I propose that the NGO-state relationship can best be explored by Rosneau's (1990; 2003) postinternationalism. Therefore, I recommend that the state, NGOs, public administrators, the business sector and educators enact this research to understand and improve the NGO-state relationship in our contemporary world. The state should revise its policies to integrate NGOs into the policy-making process and to avoid feelings of insignificance and distrust in the NGO sector. I will disseminate the study findings through various methods. I will publish the study through ProQuest for researchers and other professionals. I will also present the study to research participants, the state and other civil society organizations.

### **Conclusion**

This basic qualitative study assisted in understanding the NGO-state relationship in Trinidad and Tobago. 22 participants voluntarily participated in this research, all representatives from NGOs. The source of data was drawn from surveys administered via

email. NGO experiences and perspectives provided rich data in understanding the NGO-state relationship and the challenges surrounding this relationship. Although the study faced some challenges, the method used to collect and analyze the data increased the confidence and rigor of this research. The findings reveal a lack of cooperation and support for NGOs by the state, which results in a turbulent relationship and one characterized as a distant proximity. NGOs and the state must realize that this lack of cooperation is a hidden cost to the country and their successful cooperation is a future sustainable strategy.

As mentioned in Chapter 1, society is made up of a multiplicity of diverse actors, each of whom must cooperate with each other for effective policy-making and implementation. Chapter 2 presented a review of pertinent literature which addressed the factors relating to the NGO-state relationship in a postinternational world. Chapter 3 explained the methodology used to answer the research questions, Chapter 4 presented the findings and analysis of the evidence gathered. Finally, chapter 5 provided recommendations for further research which is necessary to improve cooperation between both sectors in order to successfully solve the major problems affecting Trinidad and Tobago.

## References

- Afaq, A. (2013). *Capacity development and leadership: challenges in the NGO sector in Pakistan*. Retrieved from <http://diginole.lib.fsu.edu/islandora/object/fsu%3A254411>
- Agostini, L. (2012, August 28). *Trinidad and Tobago Guardian*. Retrieved from Independent, but are we truly developed?: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/columnist/2012-08-28/independent-are-we-truly-developed>
- Aho, E. (2017). *Shrinking space for civil society: challenges for implementing the 2030 agenda*. Retrieved from <http://www.forumsyd.org>: [http://www.forumsyd.org/PageFiles/8150/PO150943\\_Rapport\\_5maj\\_web.pdf](http://www.forumsyd.org/PageFiles/8150/PO150943_Rapport_5maj_web.pdf)
- Alexander, G. (2017, July 2). *Marlene fired again*. Retrieved from [guardian.co.tt](http://www.guardian.co.tt): <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-07-02/marlene-fired-again>
- Ali, M., Miller, K., & Ponce de Leon, R. (2017). Family planning and Zika virus: need for renewed and cohesive efforts to ensure availability of intrauterine contraception in Latin America and the Caribbean. *The European Journal of Contraception & Reproductive Healthcare*, 102-106. doi:10.1080/13625187.2017.1288902
- Aljazeera. (2017, May 17). *Caribbean to Caliphate: why are young Muslims from the Caribbean island of Trinidad and Tobago being drawn to the conflicts in Syria and Iraq?* Retrieved from [aljazeera.com](http://aljazeera.com):

<http://www.aljazeera.com/programmes/peopleandpower/2017/05/caribbean-caliphate-170517073332147.html>

Alleyne, G. (2017, February 17). *The role of civil society as advocates and watchdogs in NCD prevention and control in the Caribbean*. Retrieved from

healthycaribbean.org: <https://www.healthycaribbean.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/2017-03-The-role-of-civil-society-as-advocates-and-watchdogs.pdf>

Alvare, B. (2010). Babylon makes the rules: compliance, fear, and self-discipline in the quest for official NGO status. *Political and Legal Anthropology*, 178-200.

doi:10.1111/j.1555-2934.2010.01110.x

Anderson, B. (1991). *Imagined communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. New York: Verso.

Anderson, C. (2010). Presenting and evaluating qualitative research. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 74-141. Retrieved from

<http://www.ajpe.org/doi/pdf/10.5688/aj7408141>

Ansell, C., & Trondal, J. (2017). Governing turbulence. *EUSA fifteenth biennial conference*. Miami.

Ansell, C., Trondal, J., & Morten, O. (2017). *Governance in Turbulent Times*. Oxford: Oxford University.

Armstrong, J. (1982). *Nations before nationalism*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina.



Arora, S. (1991). *Current issues and trends in center-state relations: a global view*. New Delhi: Mittal Publications.

Astrov, A. (2002). Pondering dramatic endings, probing possible beginnings; or doing politics as usual? *Journal of International Relations and Development*, 63-76.

Retrieved from

<http://eds.a.ebscohost.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=1&sid=61db2c8a-030d-4c5c-abb1-c51dd43fe9f7%40sessionmgr4006>

Awad, I. (2017). *The multiple levels of governance of international migration: understanding disparities and disorder*. Retrieved from Cambridge.org:

[https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/E714B022BC70D8B07E2320351B31F9AA/S2398772317000368a.pdf/multiple\\_levels\\_of\\_governance\\_of\\_international\\_migration\\_understanding\\_disparities\\_and\\_disorder.pdf](https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/E714B022BC70D8B07E2320351B31F9AA/S2398772317000368a.pdf/multiple_levels_of_governance_of_international_migration_understanding_disparities_and_disorder.pdf)

Balbis, J. (2003). *NGOs, governance and development in Latin America and the Caribbean*. UNESCO. Retrieved from [http://digital-](http://digital-library.unesco.org/shs/most/gsd/cgi-bin/library?e=d-000-00---0most--00-0-0--0prompt-10---4-----0-1l--1-en-50---20-about---00031-001-1-0utfZz-8-00&a=d&c=most&cl=CL5.9&d=HASH01000b50ae2385471f29df53)

[library.unesco.org/shs/most/gsd/cgi-bin/library?e=d-000-00---0most--00-0-0--0prompt-10---4-----0-1l--1-en-50---20-about---00031-001-1-0utfZz-8-00&a=d&c=most&cl=CL5.9&d=HASH01000b50ae2385471f29df53](http://digital-library.unesco.org/shs/most/gsd/cgi-bin/library?e=d-000-00---0most--00-0-0--0prompt-10---4-----0-1l--1-en-50---20-about---00031-001-1-0utfZz-8-00&a=d&c=most&cl=CL5.9&d=HASH01000b50ae2385471f29df53)

Barkanov, B. (2016, June 14). *Institutionalism*. Retrieved from Encyclopaedia Britannica:

<https://www.britannica.com/topic/institutionalism>

- Baylis, J., Smith, S., & Owens, P. (2008). *The globalization of world politics: An introduction to international relations*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bellamy, R. (2017). A European republic of sovereign states: sovereignty, republicanism and the European Union. *European Journal of Political Theory*, 188-209. doi: 10.1177/1474885116654389
- Bernard, H. (2002). *Research methods in anthropology: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Walnut Creek: Alta Mira.
- Bhabha, H. (1994). *The location of culture*. London: Routledge.
- Blasiak, R., Durussel, C., Pittman, J., Senit, C., Petersson, M., & Yagi, N. (2017). The role of NGOs in negotiating the use of biodiversity in marine areas beyond national jurisdiction. *Marine Policy*. doi:10.1016/j.marpol.2017.03.004
- BMI Research. (2017). *Local elections deliver little change in political climate*. Latin American Monitor.
- Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. (1992). *Qualitative research for education: an introduction to theory and methods*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Boodram, K. (2015, July 11). *NGOs: health card a danger to treating HIV/AIDS in T&T*. Retrieved from Trinidad and Tobago Guardian:  
<http://www.trinidadexpress.com/20150711/news/ngos-health-card-a-danger-to-treating-hiv-aids-in-tt>
- Boodram, K. (2017, Januray 6). *Civil society presents unified voice, offers suggestions*. Retrieved from trinidadexpress.com:

<http://www.trinidadexpress.com/20170106/news/civil-society-presents-unified-voice-offers-suggestions>

Boulding, K. (1964). *Meaning of the 20th century: the great transition*. New York: Harper & Row.

Bowen, G. (2006). Grounded theory and sensitizing concepts. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 12-23. Retrieved from [https://sites.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/5\\_3/HTML/bowen.html](https://sites.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/5_3/HTML/bowen.html)

Bowen, G. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 27-40. doi:10.3316/QRJ0902027

Bowen, G. (2013). Caribbean civil society: development role and policy implications. *Nonprofit Policy Forum*, 81-97. doi:10.1515/npf-2012-0013

Braveboy, M. (2017, January 18). *Crippling murder rate continues in Trinidad in 2017*. Retrieved from Caribbean News Now: <http://www.caribbeannewsnow.com/headline-Crippling-murder-rate-continues-in-Trinidad-in-2017-33219.html>

Breuilly, J. (1994). *Nationalisma and the state*. Manchester: Manchester University.

Brod, M., Tesler, L., & Christensen, T. (2009). Qualitative research and content validity: developing best practices based on science and experience. *Quality of Life Research*, 1263-1278. doi:10.1007/s11136-009-9540-9

Brown, H. (2015). *Implementing Agenda 21: the Caribbean NGO experience by Hazel Brown*. Retrieved from un-ngls.org: <https://www.un-ngls.org/index.php/23->

publications/policy-booklets/234-implementing-agenda-21-the-caribbean-ngo-experience-by-hazel-brown

Caelli, K., Ray, L., & Mill, J. (2003). Clear as mud: Toward greater clarity in generic qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 1-13.  
doi:10.1177/160940690300200201

Caribbean Center for Money and Finance. (2016). *Trinidad and Tobago's fiscal adjustment path 2016/2017 and beyond*. University of the West Indies.

Caribbean Disaster Emergency Management Agency. (2016, April 5). *10th Caribbean conference on comprehensive disaster management (CDM)*. Retrieved from cdema.org:

[http://www.cdema.org/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=1570:trinidad-and-tobago-civil-society-organisations-build-their-capacity-to-communicate-about-climate-change&catid=57:trinidad-and-tobago&Itemid=283](http://www.cdema.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1570:trinidad-and-tobago-civil-society-organisations-build-their-capacity-to-communicate-about-climate-change&catid=57:trinidad-and-tobago&Itemid=283)

Caribbean News Now. (2014, July 26). *Civil society identifies sustainable development priorities for Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <http://www.caribbeannewsnow.com/headline-Civil-society-identifies-sustainable-development-priorities-for-Trinidad-and-Tobago-22169.html>

Carr, E. (2001). *Twenty Years' Crisis*. New York: HarperCollins.

Carter, A. (1971). *The political theory of anarchism*. New York: Routledge.

Central Intelligence Agency. (2017). *Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/td.html>

- Chong, A. (2002). The post-international challenge to foreign policy: signposting 'plus non state' politics. *Review of International Studies*, 783-795.  
doi:10.1017/S0260210502007830
- Chong, C., & Yeo, K. (2015). An overview of grounded theory design in educational research. *Asian Social Science*, 258-268. doi:10.5539/ass.v11n12p258
- Civil society identifies sustainable development priorities for Trinidad and Tobago.* (2014, July 26). Retrieved from Caribbean News Now:  
<http://www.caribbeannewsnow.com/headline-Civil-society-identifiessustainable-development-priorities-for-Trinidad-and-Tobago-22169.html>
- Clapham, C. (1999). Sovereignty and the third world state. *Political Studies*, 522-537.  
doi:10.1111/1467-9248.00215
- Clapham, C. (1999). Sovereignty and the Third World State. *Political Studies*, 522-537.  
doi:10.1111/1467-9248.00215
- Clisset, P. (2008). Evaluating qualitative research. *Journal of Orthopaedic Nursing*, 99-105. doi:10.1016/j.joon.2008.07.009
- Commonwealth Network. (2019). *Find Civil Society expertise in Trinidad and Tobago.* Retrieved from Commonwealth Network:  
[http://www.commonwealthofnations.org/sectors-trinidad\\_and\\_tobago/civil\\_society/](http://www.commonwealthofnations.org/sectors-trinidad_and_tobago/civil_society/)
- Crawford, N. (2002). *Argument and change in world politics: ethics, decolonization and intervention.* New York: Cambridge University.

- Creswell, J. (2009). *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (3rd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- CrimeWriter. (2019). *Crime Statistics*. Retrieved from TT Crime:  
<https://ttcrime.com/crime-statistics/>
- Daily Express. (2011, March 22). *Massa day done?* Retrieved from  
<http://www.trinidadexpress.com/commentaries/Massa-Day-done-118412154.html>
- Daily Express. (2017, April 12). *Crime fighting is police work, not Gov't" says Rowley*.  
 Retrieved from <http://www.trinidadexpress.com/20170412/news/crime-fighting-is-police-work-not-govt-says-rowley>
- Daily Express. (2019, April 11). *These Venezuelans among four killed by cops*. Retrieved  
 from Daily Express: [https://www.trinidadexpress.com/news/local/these-venezuelans-among-four-killed-by-cops/article\\_3cd97b00-5d4e-11e9-8a8b-8f583f247372.html](https://www.trinidadexpress.com/news/local/these-venezuelans-among-four-killed-by-cops/article_3cd97b00-5d4e-11e9-8a8b-8f583f247372.html)
- Dar, F. (2015). Emerging role of NGOs in the world's socio-political affairs.  
*International Journal of Peace and Development Studies*.  
 doi:10.5897/IJPDS2014.0202
- Datt, S., & Datt, S. (2016, September 7). *Limitations and weaknesses of quantitative research methods*. Retrieved from  
<https://www.projectguru.in/publications/limitations-quantitative-research/>
- Davies, C. (2013). *Caribbean Spaces: escapes from twilight zones*. Champaign: University of Illinois.

- Davies, T. (2013, January 24). *NGOs: A long and turbulent history*. Retrieved from The Global Journal: <http://www.theglobaljournal.net/article/view/981/>
- Dell'Aguzzo, L., & Diodato, E. (2016). *The 'state' of pivot states in south-eastern Mediterranean Turkey, Egypt, Israel, and Tunisia after the Arab Spring*. Perugia: Perugia Stranieri University Press.
- Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade, A. (2014). *Trinidad and Tobago Country Brief*. Retrieved from Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade: <http://dfat.gov.au/geo/trinidad-tobago/pages/trinidad-and-tobago-country-brief.aspx>
- Desch, M. C., Dominguez, J. I., & Serbin, A. (1998). *From pirates to drug lords: the post-cold war Caribbean security environment*. New York: State University of New York Press.
- Duffield, M., & Hewitt, V. (2001). *Empire, development and colonialism: the past in the present*. Suffolk: James Currey.
- Dunne, T., & McDonald, M. (2013). *The politics of liberal internationalism*. Retrieved from School of Political Science and International Studies, University of Queensland: <https://timjdunne.files.wordpress.com/2013/08/the-politics-of-liberal-internationalism.pdf>
- Edson, C. (1986). Our past and present: historical inquiry in education. *Journal of thought*, 13-27.

- Einsler, E., & Peshkin, A. (1990). *Qualitative inquiry in education: the continuing debate*. New York: Teachers College.
- Eisner, E. (1991). *The enlightened eye: qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. New York: Macmillan.
- Encyclopedia of Nations. (2017). *Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <http://www.nationsencyclopedia.com/economies/Americas/Trinidad-and-Tobago.html>
- Fanon, F. (1952). *Black skin white masks*. New York: Grove Press.
- Ferguson, Y., & Mansbach, R. (2007). Post internationalism and IR theory. *Journal of International Studies*, 529-550. doi:10.1177/03058298070350031001
- Foddy, W. (1993). *Constructing questions for interviews and questionnaires: theory and practice in social research*. Cambridge: Cambridge University.
- Freedom House. (2017). *Populists and autocrats: the threat to global democracy*. Retrieved from <https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world/freedom-world-2017>
- Gellner, E. (1983). *Ernest Gellner and contemporary social thought*. New York: Cambridge University.
- Girvan, N. (2005). Whither CMSE? *Journal of Caribbean International Relations*, 13-34. Retrieved from <https://www.scribd.com/document/13902381/Norman-Girvan-Whither-CSME>



- Glaser, B. (1978). *Theoretical sensitivity: advances in the methodology of grounded theory*. Mill Valley: Sociology.
- Glesne, C. (1999). *Becoming qualitative researchers: an introduction (2nd ed.)*. Ontario, CA: Longman.
- Glossop, R. (2017). Meaning of the 21st century: from internationalism to globalism. *Comparative Civilizations Review*, No. 76 Article 15. Retrieved from <http://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2011&context=ccr>
- Gonzales, E. (2017, June 2). *Alexandrov complains of unfair treatment for Tobago autopsies*. Retrieved from [newsday.co.tt:](http://www.newsday.co.tt/news/0,244503.html)  
<http://www.newsday.co.tt/news/0,244503.html>
- Gordon, S. (2017). *Online communities as agents of change and social movements*. PA: IGI Global.
- Gottsche, D. (2017). Postimperialism, postcolonialism and beyond: toward a periodization of cultural discourse about colonial legacies. *Journal of European Studies*, 111-128. doi:10.1177/0047244117700070
- Gov.tt. (2014, September). *UWI and Canadian NGO to research private security in the Caribbean and Latin America*. Retrieved from Gov.tt:  
<http://www.news.gov.tt/content/uwi-and-canadian-ngo-research-private-security-caribbean-and-latin-america-0#.WWOw2Ijyvic>

- Gov.uk. (2017). *Oversees business risk - Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/overseas-business-risk-trinidad-tobago/overseas-business-risk-trinidad-tobago>
- Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks*. International Publishers.
- Granderson, A. (2011). Enabling multi-faceted measures of success for protected area management in Trinidad and Tobago. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 185-195. doi:10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2011.02.010
- Grenade, W. (2013). *Governance in the Caribbean: challenges and prospects*. Retrieved from <http://www.commonwealthgovernance.org/assets/uploads/2012/10/Governance-in-the-Caribbean.pdf>
- Grieco, J. (1997). Realist international theory and the study of world politics . In J. Ikenberry, & M. Doyle, *New thinking in international relations theory* (pp. 163-201). Boulder: Westview .
- Guest, G., Bunce, A., & Johnson, L. (2006). How many interviews are enough? An experiment with data saturation and variability. *Field Methods*, 59-82. doi:10.1177/1525822X05279903
- Guruprasad, S. (2014). *The creole identity in the Caribbean postcolonial society: a study of Selvon's A Brighter Sun*. Retrieved from <http://www.ijims.com>
- Guy, S. (2009). What is global and what is local? A theoretical discussion around globalization. *Parsons Journal for Information Mapping*. Retrieved from

[http://piim.newschool.edu/journal/issues/2009/02/pdfs/ParsonsJournalForInformationMapping\\_Guy-JeanSebastian.pdf](http://piim.newschool.edu/journal/issues/2009/02/pdfs/ParsonsJournalForInformationMapping_Guy-JeanSebastian.pdf)

Habermas, J. (2006). Religion in the public sphere. *European Journal of Philosophy*, 1-25. doi:10.1111/j.1468-0378.2006.00241.x

Habermas, J. (2006). *The divided west*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Halliday, F. (1988). Three concepts of internationalism. *International Affairs*, 187-198. doi:10.2307/2621845

Harrinanan, S. (2017, January 13). *NGO, Chamber in launch*. Retrieved from Trinidad and Tobago Newsday: <http://www.newsday.co.tt/news/0,238385.html>

Harris, B. (1998). A history of debriefing in social psychology. In J. Morawski, *The rise of experimentation in American psychology* (pp. 188-212). New York: Oxford University.

Hatch, A. (2002). *Doing qualitative research in education settings*. Albany: State University of New York.

Heins, V. (2005). Democratic States, Aid Agencies and World Society: What's the name of the game? *Global Society*, 361-384.

Heins, V. (2005). Democratic states, aids agencies and world society: what's the name of the game? *Global Society*, 361-384. doi:10.1080/13600820500242449

Held, D. (2003). *The global transformaitons reader: an introduction to the globalization debate*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hetcher, M. (1987). *Principles of group solidarity*. University of California.

- Higman, B. (2001). *A concise history of the Caribbean*. New York: Cambridge University.
- Hirst, P., & Thompson, G. (2002). The future of globalization: cooperation and conflict. *Nordic International Studies Association*, 247-265.  
doi:10.1177/0010836702037003671
- Hobbs, H. H. (2000). *Pondering postinternationalism*. New York: State University of New York.
- Hobsbawm, E. (1990). *Nations and nationalism since 1780*. Cambridge University.
- Holbraad, C. (2003). *Internationalism and nationalism in European political thought*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hopper, T., Lassou, P., & Soobaroyen, T. (2016). Globalisation, accounting and developing countries. *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, 125-148.  
doi:10.1016/j.cpa.2016.06.003
- Ikenberry, J. (2011, May/June ). *The future of the liberal world order*. Retrieved from Foreign affairs: <https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2011-05-01/future-liberal-world-order>
- Immergut, E. (2010, January 26). *Institution/Institutionalism*. Retrieved from <https://www.sowi.hu-berlin.de/de/lehrbereiche/comppol/pubbb/pdfs/Immergut2011.pdf>
- Ishay , M. (1995). *Internationalism and its betrayal*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.

- Jeffries, P. (2005). A framework for designing, implementing, and evaluating simulations used as teaching strategies in nursing. *Nurse Education Perspectives*, 96-103.
- Karns, M., Mingst, K., & Stiles, K. (2015). In *International Organizations*. CO: Lynne Rienner.
- Kedourie, E. (1960). *Nationalism*. New York: Praeger.
- Kennedy, D. (2016). Is it any clearer? Generic qualitative inquiry and the VSAIEED model of data analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, 1367-1379.
- Keohane, R. (2002). *Power and governance in a partially globalized world*. London: Routledge.
- Keohane, R., & Nye, J. (1998, September/October). *Power and interdependence in the information age*. Retrieved from Foreign Affairs:  
<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/1998-09-01/power-and-interdependence-information-age>
- Kibbler, J. (2011). Cognitive disequilibrium. *Encyclopedia of Child Behaviour and Development*, 380-380. doi:10.1007/springerreference\_179877
- Kirton, M. (2010). *Political culture of democracy in Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from Vanderbilt University: <http://www.vanderbilt.edu/lapop/trinidad-tobago/2010-political-culture.pdf>
- Krasner, S. (2001, July). *Abiding sovereignty*. Retrieved from  
<http://maihold.org/mediapool/113/1132142/data/Krasner.pdf>

Krasner, S. (2001, November). *Think again: sovereignty*. Retrieved from Foreign Policy:

<http://foreignpolicy.com/2009/11/20/think-again-sovereignty/>

Kuhn, T. (1963). *The function of dogma in scientific research*. New York: Basic Books.

Ledgister, F. (2006). *Democracy in the Caribbean: postcolonial experience*. Retrieved from Academia.edu:

[https://www.academia.edu/428522/Democracy\\_in\\_the\\_Caribbean\\_Post-Colonial\\_Experience](https://www.academia.edu/428522/Democracy_in_the_Caribbean_Post-Colonial_Experience)

Leedy, P., & Omrod, J. (2005). *Practical Research: planning and design (8th ed.)*. NJ: Prentice Hall.

Leverly, S. (2014). *NGOs, the UN and APA*. Retrieved from American Psychological

Association: <http://www.apa.org/international/united-nations/publications.aspx>

Lewis, D. (1994). Nongovernmental organizations and Caribbean development. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 125-138.

doi:10.1177/0002716294533001009

Lewis, G. (2004). *Main currents in Caribbean thought (2nd ed.)*. London: University of Nebraska Press.

Lim, J. (2011). Qualitative methods in adult development and learning: Theoretical

traditions, current practices and emerging horizons. In C. Hoare, *The Oxford*

*handbook of reciprocal adult development and learning* (pp. 39-60). New York:

Oxford University Press.

Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. New York: Sage.

- Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. CA: Sage.
- Maguire, E., Johnson, D., Kuhns, J., & Apostolos, R. (2017). The effects of community policing on fear of crime and perceived safety: findings from a pilot project in Trinidad and Tobago. *Policing and Society*, 1-20.  
doi:10.1080/10439463.2017.1294177
- Marx, K., & Engels, F. (1977). *Collected Works Vol. 9*. London: Lawrence and Wishart.
- Mason, M. (2010, September). *Sample size and saturation in PhD studies using qualitative interviews*. Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/1428/3027>
- Maull, H. (2011). *World politics in turbulence*. Retrieved from library.fes.de:  
[http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/ipg/ipg-2011-1/2011-1\\_\\_03\\_a\\_maull.pdf](http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/ipg/ipg-2011-1/2011-1__03_a_maull.pdf)
- Maxwell, J. (2005). *Qualitative research design: an interactive approach*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- McCoy, J., & Knight, A. (2017). Homegrown violent extremism in Trinidad and Tobago. *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*. doi:10.1080/1057610X.2016.1206734
- McNair, B. (2017). *An introduction to political communication 6th ed*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Merriam, S. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education (2nd ed.)*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Merriam, S. (2009). *Qualitative research: a guide to design and implementation*. CA: Jossey-Bass.

- Middelbeek, L., Kolle, K., & Verrest, H. (2016). Built to last? Local climate change adaptation and governance in the Caribbean – The case of an informal urban settlement in Trinidad and Tobago. *Urban Climate*, 138-154.  
doi:10.1016/j.uclim.2013.12.003
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Milhaupt, C., & Pargendler, M. (2017). Governance challenges of listed state owned enterprises around the world: national experiences and a framework for reform. *Law Working Paper N° 352/2017*. Curtis J. Milhaupt & Mariana Pargendler 2017.
- Ministry of Attorney General and Legal Affairs. (1976). *The Constitution of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from Ministry of attorney general and legal affairs: <http://rgd.legalaffairs.gov.tt/laws2/Constitution.pdf>
- Ministry of Finance. (2011, October). *Medium term policy framework 2011-2014 - Ministry of finance*. Retrieved from finance.gov.tt: <http://www.finance.gov.tt/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/Medium-Term-Policy-Framework-2011-14.pdf>
- Ministry of Social Development and Family Services. (2017). *Nongovernmental organization unit*. Retrieved from <http://www.social.gov.tt/divisions/nongovernmental-organization-n-g-o-unit/>
- Minto-Coy, I., Cowell, N., & McLeod, M. (2016). Breaking the barriers: entrepreneurship, enterprise, competitiveness and growth in the Caribbean. *Social and Economic Studies*, 1-13. doi:10.1080/08985626.2015.1088727



- Moravcsik, A. (2001, April). *Liberal international relations theory: a social scientific assessment*. Retrieved from Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, Harvard University: [https://wcfia.harvard.edu/files/wcfia/files/607\\_moravscik.pdf](https://wcfia.harvard.edu/files/wcfia/files/607_moravscik.pdf)
- Moreno, A., Bourillon, L., Flores, E., & Fulton, S. (2017). Fostering fisheries management efficiency through collaboration networks: the case of the Kanan Kay Alliance in the Mexican Caribbean. *Bulletin of Marine Science*, 233-247. doi:10.5343/bms.2015.1085
- One Caribbean Health. (2016, July 28). *Trinidad and Tobago: civil society rises to the NCD challenge*. Retrieved from [onecaribbeanhealth.org](http://onecaribbeanhealth.org): <http://onecaribbeanhealth.org/trinidad-and-tobago-civil-society-rises-to-the-ncd-challenge/>
- Open Government Partnership. (2014). *OGP annual report 2014*. Retrieved from <https://www.opengovpartnership.org/stories/ogp-annual-report-2014>
- Parliament, Trinidad and Tobago. (2017, July 12). *Evolution of a nation: Trinidad and Tobago at fifty*. Retrieved from [ttparliament.org](http://www.ttparliament.org): <http://www.ttparliament.org/documents/2183.pdf>
- Patton, M. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Pawelz, J. (2016). *Violent gangs as social actors in a world of socio-economic inequality. The case of Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from German Institute of Global and Area Studies: <https://www.giga-hamburg.de/en/event/violent-gangs-as-social-actors-in-a-world-of-socio-economic-inequality>

- Payne, A., & Bishop, M. (2010, January 29). *Caribbean regional governance and the sovereignty/statehood problem*. Retrieved from Center for International Governance Innovation: <https://www.cigionline.org/publications/caribbean-regional-governance-and-sovereignty-statehood-problem>
- Percy, W., Kostere, K., & Kostere, S. (2015). Generic qualitative research in psychology. *The Qualitative Report*, 76-85.
- Perrone, D. (2009, July). *Latin American & Caribbean NGOs: facing challenges for greater participation at the United Nations Economic and Social Council*. Retrieved from <http://csonet.org/content/documents/LAC.pdf>
- Pierre, J., & Galaz, V. (2017). Superconnected, complex and ultrafast: governance of hyperfunctionality in financial markets. *Complexity, Governance & Networks*, 12-28. doi:10.20377/cgn-55
- Pineda, A. (2013, May 1). *NGOs and development in Latin American and the Caribbean: A case study of Haiti*. Retrieved from University of New Orleans: [http://scholarworks.uno.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1047&context=honors\\_theses](http://scholarworks.uno.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1047&context=honors_theses)
- Powers, M. (2014, November 23). *Hazel Brown to step down as NGO head*. Retrieved from Trinidad and Tobago Guardian: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2014-11-23/hazel-brown-step-down-ngo%E2%80%88head>
- Premdas, R. (2011). Identity, ethnicity and the Caribbean homeland in an era of globalization. *Social Identities*, 811-832. doi:10.1080/13504630.2011.606676

- Prichard , A. (2010). *Rethinking anarchy and the state in IR theory: the contributions of classical anarchism*. Retrieved from University of Bristol:  
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/media-library/sites/spais/migrated/documents/prichard0310.pdf>
- Ramadan, A., & Fregonese, S. (2017). Hybrid sovereignty and the state of exception in the Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon. *Annals of the American Association of Geographers*, 2469-4460. doi:10.1080/24694452.2016.1270189
- Ramdass, A. (2019, March 1). *Amnesty for Venezuelans in Trinidad*. Retrieved from Daily Express: [https://www.trinidadexpress.com/news/local/amnesty-for-venezuelans-in-t-t/article\\_8127756c-3bc7-11e9-b487-e3592eda812c.html](https://www.trinidadexpress.com/news/local/amnesty-for-venezuelans-in-t-t/article_8127756c-3bc7-11e9-b487-e3592eda812c.html)
- Ramos, M. (1989). Some ethical implications of qualitative research. *Research in nursing and health*, 57-63. doi:10.1002/nur.4770120109
- Rampersad, S., & Julien, J. (2017, June 25). *Speaker under fire from UNC*. Retrieved from guardian.co.tt: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-06-24/speaker-under-fire-unc>
- Raphael, C. (2015, January 18). *Accept the disabled*. Retrieved from Trinidad and Tobago Guardian: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2015-01-18/accept-disabled>
- Raphael, J. (2017, August 1). *NGOs must focus on relationships, accountability to survive*. Retrieved from guardian.co.tt: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-08-01/ngos-must-focus-relationships-accountability-survive>

- Rawlins, G. (2017, June 15). *Civil society's overlooked role in natural resource governance*. Retrieved from tteiti.org/tt: <http://www.tteiti.org.tt/civil-societys-overlooked-role-in-natural-resource-governance/>
- Rhys, J. (1966). *Wide Sargasso Sea*. New York: Norton.
- Rogers, D. (2009). *Postinternationalism and small arms control: theory, politics, security*. Burlington: Ashgate .
- Rosenau, J. N. (1990). *Turbulence in world politics: a theory of change and continuity*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Rosenau, J. N. (2003). *Dynamics beyond globalization*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism*. New York: Random House.
- Saint Ville, A., Hickey, G., & Phillip, L. (2017). How do stakeholder interactions influence national food security policy in the Caribbean? The case of Saint Lucia. *Food Policy*, 53-64. doi:doi.org/10.1016/j.foodpol.2017.01.002
- Saldana, J. (2009). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. California: Sage.
- Sargeant, J. (2012). Qualitative research part II: participnats, analysis and quality assurance. *Journal of Graduate Medical Education*, 1-3. doi: 10.4300/JGME-D-11-00307.1
- Senel, N. (2014). A postcolonial reading of Wide Sargasso Sea by Jean Rhys. *Journal of Language and Literature Education*, 38-45. doi:10.12973/jlle.11.246
- Senior, O. (1994). *Gardening in the tropics*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart.

- Seremani, T., & Clegg, S. (2016). Postcolonialism, organization and management theory: the rold of epistemological third spaces. *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 171-183. doi:10.1177/1056492615589973
- Sikolia , D., Biros, D., Mason, M., & Weiser, M. (2013, May 24). *Trustworthiness of grounded theory methodology research in information systems*. Retrieved from aisel.aisnet.org:  
<http://aisel.aisnet.org/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1006&context=mwais2013>
- Simon, M. (2011). *Dissertation and scholarly research: recipes for success*. Seattle: Dissertation Success, LLC.
- Simon, M., & Goes, J. (2013). *Dissertation and scholarly research: recipes for success*. Dissertation Success LLC.
- Smith, D. (2003, January). *Five principles for research ethics: cover your bases with these ethical strategies*. Retrieved from apa.org:  
<http://www.apa.org/monitor/jan03/principles.aspx>
- SOFRECO. (2009). *Mapping of non state actors in Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from Mapping of non state actors in Trinidad and Tobago:  
[http://www.eeas.europa.eu/archives/delegations/trinidad/documents/1\\_\\_final\\_report20131007\\_01\\_en.pdf](http://www.eeas.europa.eu/archives/delegations/trinidad/documents/1__final_report20131007_01_en.pdf)
- Sontag, M., & Bubolz, M. (2009). *Human Ecology Theory*. In: Boss P., Doherty W.J., LaRossa R., Schumm W.R., Steinmetz S.K. (eds) *Sourcebook of Family Theories and Methods*. Boston: Springer.

- Stalin, J. (2013). *Marxism and the national question*. New York: Prism Key.
- Stouck, J. (2005, December). *Gardening in the diaspora: place and identity in Olive Senior's poetry*. Retrieved from <https://malcolmliteratureresource.wordpress.com/2012/10/22/gardening-in-the-tropics-journal-essay/>
- Strange, S. (1996). *The retreat of the state: the diffusion of power in the world economy*. Cambridge.
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research*. New York: Sage.
- Strongman, L. (2014, October 3). *Postcolonialism and international development studies: a dialectic exchange*. doi:10.1080/01436597.2014.946248
- Superville, J. (2017, August 12). *Alexandrov: Our forensic pathology systems outdated*. Retrieved from newsday.co.tt: <http://www.newsday.co.tt/news/0,247612.html>
- Tack, C. (2016, June 16). *Hulsie calls for more state support for NGOs*. Retrieved from newsday.co.tt: <http://www.newsday.co.tt/news/0,229278.html>
- Tarrow, S. (2010). Dynamics of diffusion: mechanisms, institutions, and scale shift. In R. Givan, K. Roberts, & S. Soule, *The diffusion of social movements: actors, mechanisms, and political effects* (pp. 204-220). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- The Silver Lining Foundation. (2013). *US Embassy awards \$9400USD to The Silver Lining Foundation*. Retrieved from <http://www.silverliningtt.com/us-embassy-grant/>

Transparency International. (2016). *Corruption perceptions index 2016*. Retrieved from

[https://www.transparency.org/news/feature/corruption\\_perceptions\\_index\\_2016](https://www.transparency.org/news/feature/corruption_perceptions_index_2016)

Trinidad and Tobago Crime Statistics. (2017, July 24). *ttcrime.com*. Retrieved from 2017

Crime Stats: <http://www.ttcime.com/stats.php>

Trinidad and Tobago Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative. (2017). *International*

*EITI*. Retrieved from <http://www.tteiti.org.tt/about/international-eiti/>

Trinidad and Tobago Guardian. (2011, November). *T&T now considered a developed*

*country*. Retrieved from <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2011/11/03/tt-now-considered-developed-country>

Trinidad and Tobago Guardian. (2016, July 9). *T&T improves in technology readiness*.

Retrieved from Trinidad and Tobago Guardian:

<http://www.guardian.co.tt/business/tt-improves-technology-readiness-6.2.355859.a54c37fafd>

Trinidad and Tobago Guardian. (2017, February 11). *\$5 million in EU funds for 17*

*groups*. Retrieved from guardian.co.tt: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-02-10/5m-eu-funds-17-groups>

Trinidad and Tobago Guardian. (2017, Thursday 1). *Law body calls on CJ to step down*.

Retrieved from guardian.co.tt: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-06-01/law-body-calls-cj-step-down>

Trinidad and Tobago Guardian. (2017, February 14). *Women's NGOs to PM: Make*

*domestic violence part of conversation*. Retrieved from Guardian.co.tt:

<http://www.guardian.co.tt/news/2017-02-14/women%E2%80%99s-ngos-pm-make-domestic-violence-part-conversation>

Trinidad and Tobago News. (2003, January 8). *Trinidad and Tobago emancipation day*.

Retrieved from trinidadanadtobagonews.com:

[http://www.trinidadandtobagonews.com/forum/webbbs\\_config.pl?md=read;id=11](http://www.trinidadandtobagonews.com/forum/webbbs_config.pl?md=read;id=1171)

71

Trinidad and Tobago Newsday. (2016, September 30). *Civil society wants transparent governance*. Retrieved from newsday.co.tt:

<http://www.newspday.co.tt/news/0,233921.html>

*Trinidad and Tobago: Politics, government and taxation* . (2015). Retrieved from

Encyclopedia of the Nations:

<http://www.nationsencyclopedia.com/economies/Americas/Trinidad-and-Tobago-POLITICS-GOVERNMENT-AND-TAXATION.html>

Trochim, W. (2001). *Research methods knowledge base*. Cincinnati: Atomic Dog.

Trommer, S., & Teivainen, T. (2017). Representation beyond the state: towards transnational democratic nonstate politics. *Globalizations*, 17-31.

doi:10.1080/14747731.2016.1160599

Trondal, J., & Bauer, M. (2017). Conceptualizing the European multilevel administrative order. Capturing variation in the European administrative system. *European Political Science Review (forthcoming)*.



TTconnect. (2017). *Regsitering for charitable organization status*. Retrieved from

TTconect:

[http://www.ttconnect.gov.tt/gortt/portal/ttconnect!/ut/p/a1/04\\_Sj9CPykssy0xPLMnMz0vMAfGjzOK9A40MTD0tjQ3cLUMNDYyCAh39zL08jQ28zYAKIpEV-Ae5uwEVuJoaeniHGRsYGBcN3wAHcCSopZglTz9cPwqvMpArUBVgcSZYAR53FOSGRIR4ZjoCAJzgJJA!/dl5/d5/L2dBISEvZ0FBIS9nQSEh/?WCM\\_GLOBA  
L\\_CO](http://www.ttconnect.gov.tt/gortt/portal/ttconnect!/ut/p/a1/04_Sj9CPykssy0xPLMnMz0vMAfGjzOK9A40MTD0tjQ3cLUMNDYyCAh39zL08jQ28zYAKIpEV-Ae5uwEVuJoaeniHGRsYGBcN3wAHcCSopZglTz9cPwqvMpArUBVgcSZYAR53FOSGRIR4ZjoCAJzgJJA!/dl5/d5/L2dBISEvZ0FBIS9nQSEh/?WCM_GLOBA<br/>L_CO)

Tuckman, B. (1999). *Conducting educational resesrch*. MO: Harcourt Brace College.

U.S Embassy in Trinidad and Tobago. (2017). *January 2017 crime statistics for Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <https://tt.usembassy.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/114/2017/03/January-2017-Crime-Statistics.pdf>

United States Department of State OSAC. (2017, March 10). *Trinidad and Tobago 2017 crime and safety report*. Retrieved from

<https://www.osac.gov/pages/ContentReportDetails.aspx?cid=21426>

*US Embassy awards \$9400USD to The Silver Lining Foundation*. (2013). Retrieved from

The Silver Lining Foundation: <http://www.silverliningtt.com/us-embassy-grant/>

Walcott, D. (1981). *The Fortunate Traveller*. New York: Farrar, Strauss & Giroux.

Walcott, D. (2007). *Selected Poems*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Weatherby, J., Arceneaux, C., Leithner, A., Reed, I., Timms, B., & Zhang, S. (2017). *The other world: issues and politics in the developing world 10th ed*. New York:

Routledge.

- Webster, C. (2017). Political turbulence and business as usual: tourism's future. *Journal of Tourism Futures*, 4-7. doi:10.1108/JTF-11-2016-0045
- Weible, M., & Sabatier, P. (2017). *Theories of the policy process (4th ed.)*. New York: Westview.
- Wendt, A. (1991). *Anarchy is what states make of it: the social construction of power politics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University.
- Wight, C. (2006). *Agents, structures and international relations: politics as ontology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University.
- Williams, P., & Chrisman, L. (1988). Can the subaltern speak? In G. Spivak, *Colonial discourse and postcolonial theory* (pp. 66-111). New York: Columbia University.
- Wilmot, A. (2005). Designing sampling strategies for qualitative social research: with particular reference to the Office for National Statistics' qualitative respondent register. *Quest*. Retrieved from <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20160113083155/http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/guide-method/method-quality/general-methodology/data-collection-methodology/reports-and-publications/index.html>
- Wired868. (2016, June 9). *18 T&T civil society groups unite on eradication of child marriage*. Retrieved from wired868.com: <https://wired868.com/2016/06/09/18-tt-civil-society-groups-unite-on-eradication-of-child-marriage/>
- World Bank. (2017). *The World Bank in Trinidad and Tobago*. Retrieved from <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/trinidadandtobago/overview>

- Worrel, A. (2016, December 31). *Economic challenges in 2017*. Retrieved from guardian.co.tt: <http://www.guardian.co.tt/business/2016-12-30/economic-challenges-2017>
- Worth, O. (2017). *Hegemony, international political economy and post-communist Russia*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Young, A. (1994). Belize: challenges to democracy. In C. Edie, *Democracy in the Caribbean* (pp. 113-129).

## Appendix A: Letter of Invitation

Dear Sir/Madam,

My name is Dana-Marie Ramjit and I am a doctoral student at Walden University's Public Policy and Administration program. I am kindly requesting your participation in a doctoral research study that I am conducting titled: An exploration of the NGO-state relationship through a postinternational framework.

The aim of this research is to assess the NGO-state relationship from the perspectives of NGOs and the state. The study involves completing a basic open-ended survey online using SurveyMonkey. The link to this survey can be found below.

Additional details about the study can be found in the informed consent, which is the first page of the survey.

Thank you for your time and participation.

Sincerely,

Dana-Marie Ramjit

Doctoral Student, Walden University

## Appendix B: Reminder e-mail invitation

*Reminder e-mail invitation to participate in a survey of the nongovernmental organization-state relationship through a postinternational framework.*

From:

To:

Subject: Reminder e-mail invitation to participate in a survey of the nongovernmental organization-state relationship through a postinternational framework.

Dear participant,

You may have already received an e-mail inviting you to participate in this survey. If you have already completed this survey, please accept my thanks and ignore this e-mail. If you have not completed the survey please take the time to consider helping me with this important research.

I am kindly requesting your participation in a doctoral research study that I am conducting titled: An exploration of the NGO-state relationship through a postinternational framework.

The aim of this research is to assess the NGO-state relationship from the perspectives of NGOs and the state. The study involves completing a basic open-ended survey online using SurveyMonkey. The link to this survey can be found below. Additional details about the study can be found in the informed consent, which is the first page of the survey.

Sincerely,

Dana-Marie Ramjit

Doctorol student, Walden University

## Appendix C: Codebook

*Preliminary Codebook*

Parent Code	Child Code	Interview Questions
Turbulence	Complexity	1, 2, 3, 5
	Dynamism	1, 2, 3, 5
Distant proximities	Localization (state-centric)	1, 2, 4
	Globalization (nonstate-centric)	1, 2, 4, 5
Advocacy Coalition Framework	Degree of consensus needed for policy change	4, 5
	Openness of political system	2, 3, 4, 5

## Appendix D: Survey Protocol

*Survey Protocol*

<b>Target Date</b>	<b>Activity</b>
<p>One week before starting data collection</p> <p>Date:</p>	<p>One week before starting data collection, initial contact will be made with the Ministry of Social Development via telephone and/or emails. In this initial telephone conversation, I will speak with representatives at the NGO Unit at the Ministry of Social Development who will provide me with information concerning research participants, in addition to what is publicly available on their website.</p>
<p>Beginning of week 1</p> <p>Date:</p>	<p>Email invitation letter with link to survey, instructions for locating and taking the survey, an explanation of the goals of the study, and informed consent. Informed consent will be introduced at the beginning of the</p>



	SurveyMonkey survey. Participants can only take survey after agreeing to the informed consent.
One week later Date:	Email first reminder notice only to participants to remind them to complete the survey.
One week after first reminder Date:	Email second reminder notice only to participants to remind them to complete the survey.
End of week 4 Date:	Calculate preliminary response rate. If the rate is high enough, data collection will be closed at the end of Week 4.
New closeout date – end of week 6 Date:	Extended data collection by 2 weeks.

## Appendix E: Document sources

Documents for analysis were also retrieved from the following websites:

- Trinidad & Tobago Guardian
- Trinidad & Tobago Express
- Trinidad & Tobago Newsday
- Trinidad & Tobago News
- Trinidad & Tobago Crime Statistics
- Caribbean News Now
- Commonwealth Network
- Ministry of Social Development & Family Services
- Ministry of Attorney General & Legal Affairs
- Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

## Appendix F: Aggregate Frequency Table

Code Word/Term	Code	Frequency (f)
Turbulence	TUR=	38
Distant Proximities – Globalization	DPRG=	17
Turbulence – Complexity	TURC=	16
Distant Proximities – Localization	DPRL=	13
Advocacy Coalition Framework - degree of consensus needed for policy change	ACFCPC=	13
Advocacy Coalition Framework	ACF=	11
Advocacy Coalition Framework - openness of political system	ACFOPS=	5
Distant proximities	DPR=	4
Turbulence – Dynamism	TURD=	1
<b>Emerging Codes</b>		
Positive relationship	POS+	19
Limited finances	LIMFIN	13
Political affiliation	POLAF	9
Evolving	EVOL	8
Lack of understanding	LUND	6
Passive relationship	PAS	5
Cooperation	cooeP	4
Image in public eye	imageG	4
Archaic	ARC+	3
Average relationship	AVG	3
Inefficient	ineF	3
No relationship	NOR	3
Coexistence	coeX	3
Horrible relationship	HOR	3
Self-serving	SELS	3
Frustrating	FRUST	2
Unfairness	UNF	2
Challenging relationship	CHAL	2
Strained relationship	STRR	1
State demands/state power	stateD	1