Bacterial anoxygenic photosynthesis on plant leaf surfaces

Nof Atamna-Ismaeel,^{1,2} Omri Finkel,² Fabian Glaser,³ Christian von Mering,⁴ Julia A. Vorholt,⁵

Michal Koblížek,⁶ Shimshon Belkin² and Oded Béjà^{1*} ¹Faculty of Biology, Technion – Israel Institute of

Technology, Haifa 32000, Israel.

²Department of Plant and Environmental Sciences, Alexander Silberman Institute of Life Sciences, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem 91904, Israel. ³Bioinformatics Knowledge Unit, Lorry I. Lokey Interdisciplinary Center for Life Sciences and Engineering, Technion – Israel Institute of Technology, Haifa 32000, Israel.

⁴Faculty of Science, Institute of Molecular Life Sciences and Swiss Institute of Bioinformatics, University of Zurich, 8057 Zurich, Switzerland.

⁵Institute of Microbiology, Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule Zurich, Wolfgang-Pauli-Strasse 10, 8093 Zurich, Switzerland.

⁶Institute of Microbiology, Department of Phototrophic Microorganisms – ALGATECH, 379 81 Třeboň, Czech Republic.

Summary

The aerial surface of plants, the phyllosphere, is colonized by numerous bacteria displaying diverse metabolic properties that enable their survival in this specific habitat. Recently, we reported on the presence of microbial rhodopsin harbouring bacteria on the top of leaf surfaces. Here, we report on the presence of additional bacterial populations capable of harvesting light as a means of supplementing their metabolic requirements. An analysis of six phyllosphere metagenomes revealed the presence of a diverse community of anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria, including the previously reported methylobacteria, as well as other known and unknown phototrophs. The presence of anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria was also confirmed in situ by infrared epifluorescence microscopy. The microscopic enumeration correlated with estimates based on metagenomic analyses, confirming

© 2012 Society for Applied Microbiology and Blackwell Publishing Ltd

both the presence and high abundance of these microorganisms in the phyllosphere. Our data suggest that the phyllosphere contains a phylogenetically diverse assemblage of phototrophic species, including some yet undescribed bacterial clades that appear to be phyllosphere-unique.

Introduction

All photosynthetic prokaryotes that utilize light through anoxygenic photosynthesis employ bacteriochlorophyll (BChl)-based reaction centres. To date, anoxygenic photosynthesis has been found in five bacterial phyla: Proteobacteria (purple bacteria), Chlorobi (green sulfur bacteria), Chloroflexi (green non-sulfur bacteria), Firmicutes (Heliobacteria) and Acidobacteria (Xiong and Bauer, 2002; Bryant et al., 2007). Anoxygenic phototrophs are divided into two large subgroups based on the type of reaction centres they harbour. The first, which encompasses Heliobacteria (Firmicutes), Chlorobi (green sulfur bacteria) and photosynthetic Acidobacteria, employs Fe-S type reaction centres (RC1). The second group includes photosynthetic members of Proteobacteria and Chloroflexi, and possesses pheophytin - quinone type reaction centres (RC2) (Xiong and Bauer, 2002; Hohmann-Marriott and Blankenship, 2011). In contrast to members of these two groups, which can photosynthesize only anaerobically, another group of anoxygenic phototrophs can function only in the presence of oxygen. These aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs (AAnPs), mostly depending on organic carbon, were found to account for a significant fraction of the microbial community in marine environments (Imhoff, 2001; Kolber et al., 2001; Cottrell et al., 2006; Yutin et al., 2007), displaying a critical role in the cycling of organic and inorganic carbon in the ocean (Kolber et al., 2001; Koblížek et al., 2007; 2011). Marine AAnPs are composed of various proteobacterial taxa (Béjà et al., 2002), particularly the Roseobacter clade and gammaproteobacteria (Oz et al., 2005; Yutin et al., 2007). AAnPs were also found in river estuaries (Waidner and Kirchman, 2007; Cottrell et al., 2010), freshwater lakes (Mašín et al., 2008; Eiler et al., 2009), brackish and saline lakes (Shiba et al., 1991; Yurkova et al., 2002; Jiang et al., 2009; Medová et al., 2011), and soil crusts (Csotonyi et al., 2010).

Received 18 August, 2011; revised 4 December, 2011; accepted 15 December, 2011. *For correspondence. E-mail beja@tx.technion.ac.il; Tel. (+972) 4 829 3961; Fax (+972) 4 822 5153.

2 N. Atamna-Ismaeel et al.

Another important terrestrial habitat is the outer plant surfaces (phyllosphere) (Bailey et al., 2006; Danhorn and Fugua, 2007). The planetary leaf surface area colonized by microbes is estimated to be 6.4×10^8 km² and is able to host up to 10²⁶ cells (Lindow and Brandl, 2003; Bailev et al., 2006). Most research conducted on the microbiota of plant leaf surfaces was driven by the agricultural importance of plant pathogens (Lindow and Brandl. 2003). The phyllosphere was reported earlier to host BChI a-containing Methylobacteria (Corpe and Rheem, 1989). Methylobacteria are organotrophic facultative methylotrophs with an ability to grow on formaldehyde, formate and methanol. In addition to their well-documented presence in the phyllosphere (Knief et al., 2008; 2010a,b), they are abundant in habitats such as soil in association with plant roots (Andreote et al., 2009), mud and air (Weon et al., 2008). The interest in Methylobacteria stemmed from their positive effects on plant health and development, yet their light utilization properties as commensals were hardly addressed (Abanda-Nkpwatt et al., 2006).

In this study, we mined six phyllosphere metagenomes for anoxygenic phototrophy-related genes (*bchY*, *pufM* and *pufL*) and carried out epifluorescence microscopy to track the presence, possible affiliation and relative abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs in various phyllosphere environments. Our results provide insight into their diversity on terrestrial plant leaves. The plant system thus appears to enable the coexistence of three modes of phototrophy: plant chlorophyll-based oxygenic photosynthesis, bacterial Bchl-based anoxygenic photosynthesis and the recently reported rhodopsin-based phototrophy (Atamna-Ismaeel *et al.*, 2011), each utilizing a different region of the light spectrum.

Results and discussion

Composition of anoxygenic phototrophic community

Two genes were used as markers for the presence of anoxygenic phototrophs: *bchY* and *pufM*. The *bchY* gene, encoding the Y subunit of chlorophyllide reductase, was shown to be a universal marker for all BChl-containing anoxygenic phototrophs (Yutin et al., 2009), while the pufM gene, encoding the M subunit of the reaction centre (Alberti et al., 1995), is a widely used marker for phototrophs harbouring type-2 reaction centres (Achenbach et al., 2001; Yutin et al., 2005). The mining for bchY genes did not indicate any presence of bacteria containing RC1s, thus our community composition analysis is based on pufM sequences recruited from five metagenomes of phyllosphere bacteria. The analysis revealed high diversity of phototrophic species highly affiliated with Proteobacteria. Phototrophic members of other bacterial phyla were detected yet their affiliation could not be determined with high confidence.

Figure 1 displays a phylogenetic tree using PufM protein sequences from both cultured and uncultured bacteria as reference. The tree encompassed several phylogenetic clades, with almost one third (28%) of the total number of recruited sequences clustering with Methylobacteria, a group long recognized as major phyllosphere inhabitants (Corpe and Rheem, 1989; Knief et al., 2008). Some of the PufM sequences formed phyllosphere-unique clades, while others clustered with representatives from various alphaproteobacterial groups reported previously from aquatic environments. A small fraction of the PufM sequences shared deep branching with representatives of Beta- and Gammaproteobacteria, and their affiliation could not be determined with high confidence. The dominance of the alphaproteobacterial *pufM* genes is consistent with the fact that this group was previously shown to be dominant in the phyllosphere habitat (Delmotte et al., 2009). It was also shown that plant-associated Methylobacterium radiotolerance (Alphaproteobacteria) expresses Bchl-protein complexes with an absorption spectrum similar to purple photosynthetic bacteria (Sato, 1978; 1985; Nishimura et al., 1989). In addition to Methylobacteria, anoxygenic photosynthesis has been found also in other proteobacterial species associated with plants. Intensively studied are phototrophic Bradyrhizobia (Fleischman and Kramer, 1998). These species are usually associated with plant stem and root system, having a positive effect on both plant growth and stem nodulation (Giraud et al., 2000).

The proposed possible affiliations of *pufM* genes should be treated with caution due to possible horizontal gene transfer of the photosynthetic gene cluster in purple bacteria (Igarashi *et al.*, 2001), which may complicate the definitive identification of the organismal origins based only on *pufM* gene analysis. Yet, it is possible that the apparently cosmopolitan phylogenetic distribution of the *pufM* genes may nevertheless indicate a potential significant role in energy acquisition in the phyllosphere.

Relative abundance of photosynthesis-related genes according to metagenomic data

To determine the relative abundance of phototrophs in the phyllosphere compared with other metagenomes from aquatic and soil environments, we calculated the ratio of *pufM*, *pufL* and *bchY* genes for anoxygenic phototrophs, and of the rhodopsin gene for rhodopsin-containing bacteria, to a panel of conserved single-copy genes (*rplA*, *rplC*, *rplD*, *rpoA*, *rpoB* and *rspQ*). On average, the numbers detected for anoxygenic phototrophs in aquatic Global Ocean Sampling expedition environments (Fig. 2) are similar to those previously reported by Yutin and colleagues (2007; estimates obtained using the *recA* gene for normalization) and ranges between 1.5% (Sargasso





0.1

Fig. 1. Phylogenetic analysis of PufM sequences from various phyllosphere metagenomes. Evolutionary relationships were determined by maximum likelihood analysis (see *Experimental procedures*). The green non-sulfur bacterium *Chloroflexus aurantiacus* was used as an outgroup. PufM proteins recruited from the phyllosphere matagenomes are indicated by coloured boxes: the rice phyllosphere in orange, the rice rhizosphere in grey, the clover in purple, soy in green and *Arabidopsis* in cyan. Cultivated anoxygenic phototrophs are marked in bold black; some cultured representatives were omitted for clarity. Known photosynthetic plant-associated groups are indicated by the arches around the tree. Bootstrap values greater than 60% are indicated by black dots above the branches. The scale bar represents number of substitutions per site.



Fig. 2. Abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs and rhodopsin-based phototrophs in different metagenomes. Abundances were normalized relative to the numbers of *rpIA*, *rpIC*, *rpID*, *rpoA*, *rpoB* and *rspJ* genes (Frank and Sorensen, 2011) in each environment. Standard deviations were calculated based on the different normalizations to each single copy gene.

Sea station 13) and 5% (Lake Gaton station). Figure 2 illustrates strikingly different proportions between anoxygenic phototrophs and rhodopsin-containing bacteria in aguatic and phyllosphere habitats. The aguatic environmental metagenomes that have been examined in this study displayed a ratio of anoxygenic phototrophs to rhodopsin-containing bacteria ranging from 1:3 to 1:15, implying the importance and dominance in these environments of rhodopsin-based phototrophy compared with anoxygenic phototrophy. In contrast, in the phyllosphere (excluding tamarisk), the ratio of anoxygenic phototrophs to rhodopsin-containing bacteria ranged from 2:1 to 1:1, signifying the importance of this type of phototrophy in the phyllosphere. While both types of environment are exposed to light, there appears to be a selective pressure favouring anoxygenic phototrophs in phyllosphere environments. Of the phyllospheres examined in this study, that of tamarisk stood out in that no pufM, pufL or bchY reads were found in its metagenome, indicating an absence or at least scarcity of anoxygenic phototrophs. This salt-excreting tree more closely resembles marine environments; this is in agreement with the saline characteristics of the leaf surfaces of this tree, as well as with the marine-like nature of its microbial populations (Qvit-Raz et al., 2008; Atamna-Ismaeel et al., 2011).

Of the other phyllospheres examined, that of clover displayed the highest abundance (~ 50%) of anoxygenic phototrophs, almost threefold higher than its average abundance in oceanic regions. A similar high abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs was detected previously in freshwater (Mašín *et al.*, 2008), saline lakes (Medová *et al.*, 2011) and Lake Sparkling (Martinez-Garcia *et al.*, 2011).

To better understand the phylogeny behind the relative abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs in the phyllosphere, we divided the recruited *pufM* gene sequences into two groups, methylobacteria and 'others', the latter comprising sequences with both known and unknown affiliations. Our results (Fig. S1) show that in the clover's phyllosphere metagenome, which contained the highest relative abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs, the majority of sequences (~ 75%) represent organisms the existence of which has not been previously implied in the phyllosphere environment. A similar situation was found also in Arabidopsis. In the rice and soybean phyllospheres ~50% of retrieved sequences originated from other species than methylobacteria. Thus, our results clearly showed that the majority of *pufM* sequences do not belong to the previously reported Methylobacteria.

Epifluorescence microscopy for the detection of active anoxygenic phototrophs

The presence of photosynthetic potential in some of the phyllosphere samples was examined also by infrared microscopy, which revealed a widespread presence of BChI *a*-containing bacteria with various morphologies (Fig. 3). The most common morphotypes were short rods $1-2 \mu m$ long and ovoid cells of ~1 μm diameter.

The abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs varied considerably between the different phyllospheres tested (clover, *Arabidopsis* and tamarisk), ranging from below 1% to about 7% of the total microbes in the sample (Fig. 3). The highest numbers were found on both *Arabidopsis* and clover. The differences between these numbers and the relative abundances calculated from the



Fig. 3. Abundance of anoxygenic phototrophs in various plant phyllospheres. Bchl *a*-harbouring cell counts are presented as percentages of total DAPI counts of each sample. Upper panel: images of anoxygenic phototrophs obtained using infrared epifluorescence microscopy. The displayed morphotypes were found in the phyllospheres examined.

metagenomic data may stem from possible differences between the stable genetic load and transient gene expression. Nevertheless, both estimates (microscopy and metagenomic) show a similar trend (i.e. high abundance in clover and *Arabidopsis*). The differences may also be attributed to natural variability between samples, heightened by local variations in parameters such as climate and even leaf age (Kinkel, 1997; Lindow and Brandl, 2003).

Another difference between the metagenomic analysis and the direct microscopic counts is that the tamarisk sample, which yielded no anoxygenic phototrophy-related genes, nevertheless showed the presence of these bacteria (0.4% of total bacteria) by microscopy. These low values resemble those detected in some freshwater lakes (Martinez-Garcia *et al.*, 2011). It is possible that at this low frequency, and considering the high error rate observed with the tamarisk rhodopsins (Fig. 2), a relatively small sampling variation may have been sufficient to reduce it to below detection levels. Alternatively, it would be difficult for a metagenomic analysis to pick up bacteria making up only 0.4% of the total, without a large amount of sequencing effort.

The importance of AAnPs is well characterized in oceanic habitats, and their total contribution to the energetic input in oceans is now recognized. Although the first report employing infrared epifluorescence microscopy indicated that of AAnPs represent approximately 10% of total bacteria in the Pacific Ocean (Kolber *et al.*, 2001), another study performed off the coast of Southern California yielded a significantly lower proportion, approximately 1% (Schwalbach and Fuhrman, 2005; Cottrell *et al.*, 2006). These findings indicate major differences in the proportion of AAnPs in oceans, similar to the differences observed through direct counts of different plant phyllospheres, some reaching high counts similar to those from the Pacific Ocean, others reaching lower proportions similar to coastal samples from Southern California.

Concluding remarks

The identification of novel and diverse phyllosphere anoxygenic phototrophs through both metagenomic and epifluorescent analyses provides a new perspective on the distribution, phylogeny and activity of these phototrophic bacteria. This discovery provides a platform for a broad range of studies in relation to the contribution and the effect of these bacteria on the plant itself and on the global energy flux in terrestrial habitats. One intriguing aspect could be the interactions between photosynthetic bacteria and the plant with respect to the reductants used. The anoxygenic phototrophs inhabiting the phyllosphere may use sulfide, which potentially may be supplied by the leaves of some plant species (Wilson et al., 1978; Rennenberg and Filner, 1982; Sekiya et al., 1982). Such a scenario, if confirmed, may supply these groups with a potential plant probiotic power. The presence of several pufM clades displaying no clear affiliation to cultured bacterial genera might indicate the presence of photosynthetic bacteria uniquely found in phyllospheres that may bear functional adaptations to such habitats.

Experimental procedures

Sampling

Plant leaf samples for the IR microscopy were collected from a Tamarix nilotica tree in an oasis located next to the Dead Sea, Israel, while rosettes of thale cress (Arabidopsis thaliana), fully developed trifoliates of clover (Trifolium repens), fully developed pine needles (Pinus silvestris) and upper parts of grass leaves (Poa pratensis) were collected from a field near Trebon, Czech Republic, in April 2011. Leaf materials for the different metagenomes were collected independently from the samples collected for the microscopy (Delmotte et al., 2009; Atamna-Ismaeel et al., 2011; Knief et al., 2011). Bacterial cells were washed from the leaf samples by placing 5 g of leaves inside a 50 ml sterile plastic test tube (Falcon) and immediately filling with sterile TE-buffer (10 mM Tris, 1 mM EDTA, pH 7.5). The tubes were shaken for 10 s; the leaf wash was separated from the plant material by decanting and kept for analysis.

Calculating anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria abundances

Frequency of *pufM*, *pufL* and *bchY* blast hits with an e-value $\leq 10^{-5}$ was determined for 14 metagenomes from phyllosphere (5), marine (5), freshwater (1), hypersaline (1)

© 2012 Society for Applied Microbiology and Blackwell Publishing Ltd, Environmental Microbiology Reports

and soil (2) environments. The abundance of each gene was normalized with a weighted average abundance of the bacterial single copy genes *rplA*, *rplC*, *rplD*, *rpoA*, *rpoB* and *rspQ* (blast hits with an *e*-value $\leq 1e^{-5}$; Frank and Sorensen, 2011).

Phylogenetic tree construction and analysis

Several methods for multiple sequence alignment calculation (MUSCLE, ProbCons and MAFFT) (Kemena and Notredame, 2009) were tested in this study, along with one refinement program (RASCAL) and one assessment program (NORMD). The ProbCons alignment refined by RASCAL produced the most reliable alignment and was used to generate the phylogenetic tree. Following the alignment computation, we used FastTree version 2.1.1 SSE3 (Price *et al.*, 2009) for the calculation of the phylogenetic tree using high accuracy settings: -spr 4 (to increase the number of rounds of minimum-evolution SPR moves), -pseudo (for many fragmentary sequences) and -mlacc 2 -slownni (to make the maximum-likelihood NNIs search more exhaustive). Phyllogenetic protein trees were visualized and edited using iTOL v2.1 (Letunic and Bork, 2007; 2011).

Metagenomic datasets used

Freshwater: GS020, Lake Gatun, Panama (MG_RAST accession: 4441590.3) (Rusch *et al.*, 2007)

Hypersaline: GS033, Punta Cormorant hypersaline lagoon, Galapagos (MG-RAST accession: 4441599.3) (Rusch *et al.*, 2007)

Open Sea: GS000a, Sargasso Station 11 (MG-RAST accession: 4441570.3) and GS000b, Sargasso Station 13 (MG-RAST accession: 4441573.3) (Rusch *et al.*, 2007) **Estuary**: Monterey Bay (MG-RAST accession: 4443712.3) **Whale Fall**: Whale Fall Bone (MG-RAST accession: 4441619.3)

Forest Soil: Luquillo experimental forest soil, Puerto Rico (MG-RAST accession: 4446153.3) and Waseca farm soil (MG-RAST accession: 4441091.3)

Tamarix phyllosphere: Atamna-Ismaeel and colleagues (2011)

Soybean: SRA accession: SRX008324 (Delmotte *et al.*, 2009)

Rice phyllosphere: Knief and colleagues (2011) Clover phyllosphere: Delmotte and colleagues (2009) Arabidopsis phyllosphere: Delmotte and colleagues (2009)

The PufM, PufL and BchY protein sequences from the different phyllosphere metagenomes are provided in the online supporting material Files S1–3.

Epifluorescence microscopy

Epifluorescence microscopy was carried out with a Zeiss Axio Imager.D2 microscope equipped with Plan-Apochromat 63x/1.46 Oil Corr objective and Hamamatsu EM CCD camera C9100-02. The leaf wash was fixed with 2% formaldehyde and collected onto 0.2 μ m polycarbonate filters, dried and

stained with 4',6-diamidino-2-phenylindole (DAPI). The DAPI was dissolved in a 3:1 mixture of Citifluor AF1 and Vectashield at a final concentration of 1 μ g ml⁻¹. The total DAPIstained bacteria were recorded and enumerated in the blue part of the spectrum (5–10 ms exposure). Briefly, Red chlorophyll a (Chl a) autofluorescence was then recorded to identify Chl *a*-containing organisms (5–10 ms exposure), followed by the capture of an infrared emission (> 850 nm) image, showing both anoxygenic phototrophs and Chl *a*-containing objects (100–200 ms exposure). The acquired images were saved and analysed semi-manually with the aid of AxioVison software to distinguish the number of heterotrophic bacteria, cyanobacteria and anoxygenic phototrophs for each sample. For each individual sample, 10–12 frames were recorded and analysed (~ 1000–1200 DAPI-stained cells).

Acknowledgements

This research was supported in part by Israel Science Foundation grant 1203/06 (O.B.), the US-Israel Binational Science Foundation grants number 2006324 and 2010262 (S.B.) and by Czech projects GAČR P501/10/0221 and Algatech (CZ.1.05/2.1.00/03.0110) (M.K.).

References

- Abanda-Nkpwatt, D., Musch, M., Tschiersch, J., Boettner, M., and Schwab, W. (2006) Molecular interaction between *Methylobacterium* extorquens and seedlings: growth promotion, methanol consumption, and localization of the methanol emission site. *J Exp Bot* **57**: 4025–4032.
- Achenbach, L.A., Carey, J., and Madigan, M.T. (2001) Photosynthetic and phylogenetic primers for detection of anoxygenic phototrophs in natural environments. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **67:** 2922–2926.
- Alberti, M., Burke, D., and Hearst, J. (1995) Structure and sequence of the photosynthesis gene cluster. In *Anoxygenic Photosynthetic Bacteria*. Blankenship, R.E., Madigan, M.T., and Bauer, C. (eds). Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers, pp. 1083– 1106.
- Andreote, F.D., Carneiro, R.T., Salles, J.F., Marcon, J., Labate, C.A., Azevedo, J.L., and Araújo, W.L. (2009) Culture-independent assessment of *Rhizobiales*-related alphaproteobacteria and the diversity of *Methylobacterium* in the rhizosphere and rhizoplane of transgenic eucalyptus. *Microb Ecol* **57**: 82–93.
- Atamna-Ismaeel, N., Finkel, E.M., Glaser, F., Sharon, I., Schneider, R., Post, A.F., *et al.* (2011) Microbial rhodopsins on leaf surfaces of terrestrial plants. *Environ Microbiol* 14: 140–146. doi: 10.1111/j.1462-2920.2011.02554.x.
- Bailey, M.J., Lilley, A.K., Timms-Wilson, T.M., and Spencer-Phillips, P.T.N. (2006) *Microbial Ecology of Aerial Plant Surfaces*. Wallingford, UK: CAB International.
- Béjà, O., Suzuki, M.T., Heidelberg, J.F., Nelson, W.C., Preston, C.M., Hamada, T., *et al.* (2002) Unsuspected diversity among marine aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs. *Nature* **415**: 630–633.
- Bryant, D.A., Costas, A.M., Maresca, J.A., Chew, A.G., Klatt, C.G., Bateson, M.M., *et al.* (2007) Candidatus *Chloracido*-

© 2012 Society for Applied Microbiology and Blackwell Publishing Ltd, Environmental Microbiology Reports

bacterium thermophilum: an aerobic phototrophic *Acidobacterium*. *Science* **317**: 523–526.

- Corpe, W.A., and Rheem, S. (1989) Ecology of the methylotrophic bacteria on living leaf surfaces. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **62**: 243–249.
- Cottrell, M.T., Mannino, A., and Kirchman, D.L. (2006) Aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria in the Mid-Atlantic Bight and the North Pacific Gyre. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **72:** 557–564.
- Cottrell, M.T., Ras, J., and Kirchman, D.L. (2010) Bacteriochlorophyll and community structure of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria in a particle-rich estuary. *ISME J* **4**: 945–954.
- Csotonyi, J.T., Swiderski, J., Stackebrandt, E., and Yurkov, V. (2010) A new extreme environment for aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs: biological soil crusts. *Adv Exp Med Biol* **675**: 3–14.
- Danhorn, T., and Fuqua, C. (2007) Biofilm Formation by Plant-Associated Bacteria. *Ann Rev Microbiol* **61**: 401–422.
- Delmotte, N., Knief, C., Chaffron, S., Innerebner, G., Roschitzki, B., Schlapbach, R., *et al.* (2009) Community proteogenomics reveals insights into the physiology of phyllosphere bacteria. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* **106**: 16428–16433.
- Eiler, A., Beier, S., Sawstrom, C., Karlsson, J., and Bertilsson, S. (2009) High ratio of bacteriochlorophyll biosynthesis genes to chlorophyll biosynthesis genes in bacteria of humic lakes. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **75:** 7221– 7228.
- Fleischman, D., and Kramer, D. (1998) Photosynthetic rhizobia. *Biochim Biophys Acta* **1364:** 17–36.
- Frank, J.A., and Sorensen, S.J. (2011) Quantitative metagenomic analyses based on average genome size normalization. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 77: 2513–2521.
- Giraud, E., Hannibal, L., Fardoux, J., Vermeglio, A., and Dreyfus, B. (2000) Effect of *Bradyrhizobium* photosynthesis on stem nodulation of *Aeschynomene sensitiva*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 97: 14795–14800.
- Hohmann-Marriott, M.F., and Blankenship, R.E. (2011) Evolution of photosynthesis. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **62:** 515–548.
- Igarashi, N., Harada, J., Nagashima, S., Matsuura, K., Shimada, K., and Nagashima, K.V.P. (2001) Horizontal transfer of the photosynthetic gene cluster and operon re-arrangement in purple bacteria. *J Mol Evol* **52:** 333– 341.
- Imhoff, J.F. (2001) True marine and halophilic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria. *Arch Microbiol* **176**: 243–254.
- Jiang, H., Dong, H., Yu, B., Lv, G., Deng, S., Wu, Y., et al. (2009) Abundance and diversity of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria in saline lakes on the Tibetan plateau. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 67: 268–278.
- Kemena, C., and Notredame, C. (2009) Upcoming challenges for multiple sequence alignment methods in the high-throughput era. *Bioinformatics* 25: 2455–2465.
- Kinkel, L.L. (1997) Microbial population dynamics on leaves. Annu Rev Phytopathol **35:** 327–347.
- Knief, C., Frances, L., Cantet, F., and Vorholt, J.A. (2008) Cultivation-independent characterization of methylobacterium populations in the plant phyllosphere by automated

ribosomal intergenic spacer analysis. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **74**: 2218–2228.

- Knief, C., Frances, L., and Vorholt, J.A. (2010a) Competitiveness of diverse *Methylobacterium* strains in the phyllosphere of *Arabidopsis thaliana* and identification of representative models, including *M. extorquens* PA1. *Microb Ecol* **60**: 440–452.
- Knief, C., Ramette, A., Frances, L., Alonso-Blanco, C., and Vorholt, J.A. (2010b) Site and plant species are important determinants of the Methylobacterium community composition in the plant phyllosphere. *ISME J* **4**: 719–728.
- Knief, C., Delmotte, N., Chaffron, S., Stark, M., Innerebener, G., Wassmann, R., *et al.* (2011) Metaproteogenomic analysis of microbial communities in the phyllosphere and rhizosphere of rice. *ISME J* doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.192.
- Koblížek, M. (2011) Role of photoheterotrophic bacteria in the marine carbon cycle. In *Microbial Carbon Pump in the Ocean.* Jiao, N., Azam, F., and Sanders, S. (eds). Washington, DC, USA: Science/AAAS, pp. 49–51.
- Koblížek, M., Mašín, M., Ras, J., Poulton, A.J., and Prášil, O. (2007) Rapid growth rates of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs in the ocean. *Environ Microbiol* **9**: 2401–2406.
- Kolber, Z.S., Plumley, F.G., Lang, A.S., Beatty, J.T., Blankenship, R.E., VanDover, C.L., *et al.* (2001) Contribution of aerobic photoheterotrophic bacteria to the carbon cycle in the ocean. *Science* **292**: 2492–2495.
- Letunic, I., and Bork, P. (2007) Interactive Tree Of Life (iTOL): an online tool for phylogenetic tree display and annotation. *Bioinformatics* **23:** 127–128.
- Letunic, I., and Bork, P. (2011) Interactive Tree of Life v2: online annotation and display of phylogenetic trees made easy. *Nucleic Acids Res* **39** (Suppl. 2): W475–W478.
- Lindow, S.E., and Brandl, M.T. (2003) Microbiology of the phyllosphere. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **69:** 1875–1883.
- Martinez-Garcia, M., Swan, B.K., Poulton, N.J., Gomez, M.L., Masland, D., Sieracki, M.E., and Stepanauskas, R. (2011) High throughput single cell sequencing identifies photoheterotrophs and chemoautotrophs in freshwater bacterioplankton. *ISME J* 6: 113–123. doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.84.
- Mašín, M., Nedoma, J., Pechar, L., and Koblížek, M. (2008) Distribution of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs in temperate freshwater systems. *Environ Microbiol* **10**: 1988– 1996.
- Medová, H., Boldareva, E.N., Hrouzek, P., Borzenko, S.V., Namsaraev, Z.B., Gorlenko, V.M., *et al.* (2011) High abundances of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophs in saline steppe lakes. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* **76**: 393–400.
- Nishimura, Y., Mukasa, S., Iizuka, H., and Shimada, K. (1989) Isolation and characterization of bacteriochlorophyllprotein complexes from an aerobic bacterium, *Pseudomonas radiora. Arch Microbiol* **152**: 1–5.
- Oz, A., Sabehi, G., Koblízek, M., Massana, R., and Béjà, O. (2005) Roseobacter-like bacteria in Red and Mediterranean Sea aerobic anoxygenic photosynthetic populations. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **71:** 344–353.
- Price, M.N., Dehal, P.S., and Arkin, A.P. (2009) FastTree: computing large minimum evolution trees with profiles instead of a distance matrix. *Mol Biol Evol* 26: 1641–1650.
- Qvit-Raz, N., Jurkevitch, E., and Belkin, S. (2008) Drop-size soda lakes: transient microbial habitats on a salt-secreting desert tree. *Genetics* **178**: 1615–1622.
- © 2012 Society for Applied Microbiology and Blackwell Publishing Ltd, Environmental Microbiology Reports

8 N. Atamna-Ismaeel et al.

- Rennenberg, H., and Filner, P. (1982) Stimulation of H₂S emission from pumpkin leaves by inhibition of glutathione synthesis. *Plant Physiol* **69:** 766–770.
- Rusch, D.B., Halpern, A.L., Heidelberg, K.B., Sutton, G., Williamson, S.J., Yooseph, S., *et al.* (2007) The Sorcerer II Global Ocean Sampling expedition: I, The northwest Atlantic through the eastern tropical Pacific. *PLoS Biol* **5**: e77.
- Sato, K. (1978) Bacteriochlorophyll formation by facultative methylotrophs, *Protaminobacter ruber* and *Pseudomonas* AM 1. *FEBS Lett* 85: 207–210.
- Sato, K., Hagiwara, K., and Shimizu, S. (1985) Effect aof cultural conditions on tetrapyrrole formation especially bacteriochlorophyll formation in a facultative methyltroph, *Protaminobacter ruber. Agric Biol Chem* **49:** 1–5.
- Schwalbach, M.S., and Fuhrman, J.A. (2005) Wide-ranging abundances of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria in the world ocean revealed by epifluorescence microscopy and quantitative PCR. *Limnol Oceanogr* **50**: 620–628.
- Sekiya, J., Schmidt, A., Wilson, L.G., and Filner, P. (1982) Emission of hydrogen sulfide by leaf tissue in response to L-cysteine. *Plant Physiol* **70**: 430–436.
- Shiba, T., Shioi, Y., Takamiya, K., Sutton, D.C., and Wilkinson, C.R. (1991) Distribution and physiology of aerobic bacteria containing bacteriochlorophyll a on the east and west coast of Australia. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 57: 295– 300.
- Waidner, L.A., and Kirchman, D.L. (2007) Aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria attached to particles in turbid waters of the Delaware and Chesapeake estuaries. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **73:** 3936–3944.
- Weon, H.Y., Kim, B.-Y., Joa, J.-H., Son, J.-A., Song, M.-H., Kwon, S.-W., et al. (2008) Methylobacterium iners sp. nov. and Methylobacterium aerolatum sp. nov., isolated from air samples in Korea. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 58: 93–96.
- Wilson, L.G., Bressan, R.A., and Filner, P. (1978) Lightdependent emission of hydrogen sulfide from plants. *Plant Physiol* 61: 184–189.
- Xiong, J., and Bauer, C.E. (2002) Complex evolution of photosynthesis. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **53**: 503–521.
- Yurkova, N., Rathgeber, C., Swiderski, J., Stackebrandt, E., Beatty, J.T., Hall, K.J., and Yurkov, V. (2002) Diversity, distribution and physiology of the aerobic phototrophic

bacteria in the mixolimnion of a meromictic lake. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* **40:** 191–204.

- Yutin, N., Suzuki, M.T., and Béjà, O. (2005) Novel primers reveal a wider diversity among marine aerobic anoxygenic phototrohs. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **71**: 8958–8962.
- Yutin, N., Suzuki, M.T., Teeling, H., Weber, M., Venter, J.C., Rusch, D., and Béjà, O. (2007) Assessing diversity and biogeography of aerobic anoxygenic phototrophic bacteria in surface waters of the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans using the Global Ocean Sampling expedition metagenomes. *Environ Microbiol* **9**: 1464–1475.
- Yutin, N., Suzuki, M.T., Rosenberg, M., Rotem, D., Madigan, M.T., Suling, J., *et al.* (2009) BchY-based degenerate primers target all types of anoxygenic photosynthetic bacteria in a single PCR. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **75**: 7556– 7559.

Supporting information

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

Fig. S1. Abundance of *methylobacterium*-like *pufM* genes. Recruited *pufM* sequences from the different phyllospheres were divided according to their phylogenetic affiliation to *methylobacterium*-like and others. The *methylobacterium*-like group represents the fraction (in per cent) of sequences known to be potentially associated with plants, and the 'others' include sequences of both known and unknown affiliations not previously reported in association with plants.

File S1. PufM protein sequences from the different phyllosphere metagenomes.

File S2. PufL protein sequences from the different phyllosphere metagenomes.

File S3. BchY protein sequences from the different phyllosphere metagenomes.

Please note: Wiley-Blackwell are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supporting materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.