Barriers and facilitators to asthma self-management in adolescents: a systematic review of qualitative and quantitative studies

Simone Holley¹, PhD, Ruth Morris², BSc, Rebecca Knibb³, PhD, Sue Latter⁴, PhD, Christina Liossi⁵, DPsych, Frances Mitchell⁶, BSc Graham Roberts^{1,6,7}, DM

1. Clinical and Experimental Sciences and Human Development in Health Academic Units, University of Southampton Faculty of Medicine, Southampton, UK.

2. NIHR/Wellcome Trust Clinical Research Facility, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK.

3. Aston University, Birmingham, UK.

4. Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Southampton, UK.

5. School of Psychology, University of Southampton, UK and Department of Paediatric

Psychology, Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Trust, London, UK

6. The David Hide Asthma and Allergy Research Centre, St Mary's Hospital, Isle of Wight, UK.

7. NIHR Southampton Respiratory Biomedical Research Unit, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK.

Corresponding Author: Professor Graham Roberts, Paediatric Allergy and Respiratory Medicine (Mailpoint 805), Southampton University Hospital NHS Foundation Trust, Tremona Road, Southampton SO166YD, UK. Telephone: 02381206160. Fax: 02380878847

Email: g.c.roberts@soton.ac.uk

Key words: pediatrics, patient compliance, self care,

This study was supported by a research grant from Asthma UK (AUK-PG-2013-213).

Short title: Asthma self-management in adolescents: a systematic review

ABSTRACT

Background: Many adolescents have poor asthma control and impaired quality of life despite the availability of modern pharmacotherapy. Research suggests that poor adherence to treatment and limited engagement in self-management could be contributing factors.

Objective: To conduct a systematic review of the barriers and facilitators to self-management of asthma reported by adolescents using a narrative synthesis approach to integrate the findings.

Design: MEDLINE, EMBASE, CINAHL, and PsycINFO were searched for all types of study design. Full papers were retrieved for study abstracts that included data from participants aged 12 - 18 years referring to barriers or facilitators of asthma self-management behaviours.

Results: Sixteen studies (5 quantitative and 11 qualitative) underwent data extraction, quality appraisal, and thematic analysis. Six key themes were generated that encompassed barriers and/or facilitators to self-management of asthma in adolescents: *Knowledge*, *Lifestyle*, *Beliefs and Attitudes*, *Relationships*, *Intrapersonal Characteristics*, *and Communication*.

Conclusions: There is a pressing need to prepare adolescents for self-management, using age-appropriate strategies that draw on the evidence we have synthesised. Current clinical practice should focus on ensuring adolescents have the correct knowledge, beliefs, and positive attitude to self-manage their illness. This needs to be delivered in a supportive environment that facilitates two-way communication, fosters adolescents' self-efficacy to manage their disease, and considers the wider social influences that impinge on self-management.

INTRODUCTION

Asthma is one of the commonest long-term conditions affecting adolescents.¹ Many have poor control and impaired quality of life despite the availability of modern pharmacotherapy.^{2,3} Adolescence is a difficult developmental period during which hormonal, physical, and emotional changes create turmoil for the young person.⁴ The process of developing independence and transitioning into adulthood may conflict with the actions and beliefs required for good self-management of asthma.⁵

Self-management of asthma in adolescents has been conceptualised as the behaviours to prevent, monitor, manage, and communicate asthma symptoms in order to control outcomes.⁶ Research indicates that adolescents have limited engagement in self-managing their asthma and there is inefficient communication between adolescents and healthcare professionals (HCP) about their illness.^{7,8} These are likely to be important factors in explaining poor adherence to treatment and poor asthma control in this age group.

Existing systematic reviews focus on educational interventions ⁹⁻¹¹ or specifically medication adherence^{12,13} as opposed to self-management. To the best of our knowledge none have focused on barriers and facilitators to self-management from the adolescents' perspective. However, a recent systematic review has summarised the barriers and facilitators to effective self-management of asthma across all ages.¹⁴ This identified ten overarching themes such as partnership between patient and HCP, issues around medication, and education. Given that adolescence is already associated with challenges, such as gaining autonomy, the self-management of asthma in this period of life might be expected to have its own particular influences. Furthermore, clinical services in the UK focus on either adults or a child / adolescent population, and hence our review focuses specifically on this latter age group. We

conducted a systematic review of adolescent-reported barriers and facilitators to the behaviours conceptualised as necessary for adolescent' asthma self-management.⁶

METHODS

In collaboration with an experienced medical librarian, a search strategy was developed based on keywords and MeSH terms and adapted to suit each database (MEDLINE, EMBASE, CINAHL, and PsycINFO. The original search was conducted for the period January 1996 – May 2014 (see Appendix 2) and updated in May 2016. The date range was restricted to ensure that data were relevant to current management of adolescents with asthma. The search was limited to articles published in English and excluded conference abstracts, PhD or Masters theses and non-systematic reviews. At this literature search stage, we chose a strategy that was wider than just the influences on self-management to minimise the risk of omitting important studies.

Full papers were retrieved for study abstracts that included data (quantitative or qualitative), reported by participants aged 12 - 18 years, identifying factors that had a direct impact on self-management of asthma,

Two authors (GR and SH) reviewed the full text for relevance and agreed the final papers for inclusion in the review. Data from each paper were extracted by two of three coders (SH, RM or GR). References to communication were not explicitly linked as a barrier or facilitator of asthma self-management in the selected papers, but given the importance of communication in the conceptual model of adolescent asthma self-management, ⁶ we chose to include these data. Information was extracted pertaining to: study aims, participants, sampling, recruitment, design, intervention, setting, data collection and analysis methods, and study findings. We excluded studies that just described an educational or technological intervention. We also

excluded financial barriers as healthcare in the UK is free up to the age of 19 when in fulltime education.

A quality appraisal of included studies was conducted independently by three researchers (SH, GR, and RM). Qualitative studies were quality appraised using the method described by Harden et al, ¹⁵ one mixed methods study was appraised as qualitative as only the qualitative data was utilised in the results for this review. Quantitative studies were quality appraised using the Cochrane Risk of Bias Tool.¹⁶ To be included in this review, subject matter was considered more important than quality of the study methodology, although we highlight methodological issues where they were found, therefore no studies were excluded on the basis of poor quality.

Data analysis

A meta-analysis of the quantitative studies was not appropriate due to the heterogeneity in outcomes. As our aim was to combine the evidence from quantitative and qualitative studies, we used a narrative synthesis approach¹⁷, which was informed by the guidance produced by Popay *et al.*¹⁷ Thematic analysis was used to identify common themes and concepts within and across qualitative and quantitative studies.

The text was coded according to its meaning and content to identify emerging themes. Written interpretations of quantitative data was coded in the same way as qualitative data. Three authors (SH, GR, RM) then met to review and discuss the emerging themes and to identify commonalities. This was an iterative process with subsequent discussions to enable themes to be further refined. Once agreement had been reached, the papers were read again by one author (SH) to ensure no relevant data had been missed.

RESULTS

Study selection

The search process is outlined in the flow diagram (Figure 1). The titles and abstracts of 3,886 records were reviewed by two authors (SH, GR) resulting in 101 records being retained for full-text retrieval and review. A further three records were excluded as the full text was not available and 46 were excluded as both reviewers agreed the article was not relevant to the review. A further 36 records were excluded for methodological reasons such as inappropriate age range of participants, i.e. too young (<11 years) and / or too old (>18 years). We included three papers where the youngest participants were 11 years, and 3 papers where the oldest participants were 20 given that most of their participants were in our adolescent age range. The final review consisted of eleven qualitative and five quantitative studies, including 1,011 participants that were subjected to data extraction and quality appraisal. The aims, sample characteristics, methodology and findings of these studies are described in table 1. The quality appraisals of the qualitative studies were rated as 'medium' or 'high' quality. The majority of the quantitative studies were assessed as 'unclear risk', due either to the lack of details and/or the use of unvalidated measures.

Thematic analysis

Our thematic analysis generated six key themes that encompass barriers and/or facilitators to self-management behaviours – preventing, managing, monitoring, and communicating with others - of asthma in adolescents. A summary is presented in table 4.

Knowledge of asthma and treatments

Adolescents who reported a greater knowledge of asthma reported far fewer barriers to selfmanagement.¹⁸ Compliance was reported to improve following a severe exacerbation.⁸ Lack of knowledge about medication regimes^{8,19} and inhaler techniques can lead to nonadherence.²⁰

Some adolescents lacked knowledge about triggers such as how pets in the home can affect asthma.⁸ Others were knowledgeable about triggers but did not feel able to control or avoid them as we discuss in the next section.²¹

Lifestyle influences

Difficulty in remembering to take care of their asthma was a barrier to self-management.¹⁸ Not taking medication as prescribed occurred due to forgetting;^{7,8,20,22-24} difficulty organising time (e.g. being in a rush for school in the morning or disruption to usual routines);^{8,22,23} not wanting to interrupt leisure activities;^{7,23} or when the medication regime conflicted with other priorities.⁸ Other barriers to self-management were: losing inhalers;²² the inconvenience of carrying²⁰ and the time needed to use spacer devices;⁸ smoking;⁸ and difficulty avoiding triggers such as cigarette smoke,²¹ or the weather.²⁵

Facilitators to self-management included a daily routine for the medical regime^{7,19,20} and cues for remembering to take medication,^{7,19} such as leaving inhalers in readily seen places.^{22-24,26} Adherence may be a habit as indicated by past self-reported adherence to medication predicted self-reported adherence one year later.²⁷

Beliefs and attitudes to asthma and medication

Not taking medication, or not using treatments as prescribed, occurred due to beliefs that medication is ineffective; ^{7,8,20,22,24} asthma is not a serious disease;^{19,21} they would outgrow asthma (and were non-adherent to test this); ¹⁹ and, taking medication is a sign of weakness (in adolescent boys a belief portrayed to them by their fathers).¹⁹ Attitudes that led to non-adherence included: they 'knew their bodies better' than their doctors and therefore felt 'safe' to deviate from medical guidance;²⁰ denial of having the disease;²⁰ adverse medication side effects such as the taste;^{7,22} and fear of potential side effects such as weight gain⁸ or addiction to medication.²²

Positive attitudes towards asthma resulted in fewer barriers to self-management¹⁸ and better adherence was associated with positive attitudes towards medication.²⁷

Relationships with others

Parents facilitated self-management by providing reminders or encouragement to take medication,^{8,20,23,24,26,28} as did peers²⁰ who also advised them to break from activities, warned of triggers, and shared medication (among friends with asthma).²⁶ Coping with asthma was better if social support encouraged a calm approach and they accepted help from others.²⁵

Some adults were barriers to asthma self-management, for example, teachers could be either insensitive or unsupportive²¹ and school policies could prevent adolescents from carrying inhalers.²⁶ Peers could be a barrier to self-management as some adolescents were unwilling to give up time with their friends to take care of their illness.¹⁸

Negative attitudes towards HCPs were frequently reported barriers to self-management¹⁸ and being seen in a paediatric clinic was "alienating".⁸ In contrast, better self-management was reported when a positive relationship with the HCP was promoted and when the HCP was competent, understanding, and helpful and reminded them about key things.^{26,19} Adolescents were more likely to comply with their treatment when they had support from nurses.^{23,29}

Intrapersonal characteristics

Apathy towards asthma and medication was shown by some adolescents who reported not being "bothered" to take medication.^{8,20}. Motivation, energy and willpower have been shown to significantly predict adherence to medication.²⁹

Adolescents reported situations where others did not take their illness seriously and they identified that it was difficult for them to act assertively in such situations.⁷ This included adults who smoked around them⁷ and expectations from teachers that could exacerbate symptoms during physical activities. ²¹

Fewer barriers to self-management were reported by adolescents who scored higher on a questionnaire designed to measure self-efficacy (perceived ability to perform a desired behaviour) in children with asthma.¹⁸ Another intervention study reported an increase in adherence after 24 months, but no change in self-efficacy.³⁰ Adolescents who reported feeling in "control" of their asthma symptoms were more likely to carry their inhalers outside the home.³¹

Taking medication or experiencing asthma symptoms in front of others was reported as embarrassing in several studies ^{8,19,20,31} and was associated with not carrying medication.³¹ Although in one study using inhalers in front of peers was not considered embarrassing³². Poor adherence was also associated with feeling ashamed about having asthma.²⁷ However, others reported "accepting" they had asthma and were more likely to tell others about their asthma.⁷ In contrast, some adolescents tried to forget they had asthma,¹⁸ or did not discuss their asthma with others because they had a desire to appear "normal" ²⁶ and this also lead them to "push" themselves (for example in sports) so as to appear no different to peers.²¹ Embarrassment also acted as a facilitator to self-management within the context of a medical consultation. Where medication use was electronically monitored, some adolescents wanted to demonstrate adherence and did not want to experience the embarrassment of HCP knowing they had not taken them.²²

Communicating with others

Communication factors were not directly implicated in self-management behaviours such as taking medication but they impact on how patients gain support especially when asthma is out of control. In keeping with this, descriptive experiences of ineffective communication about asthma were identified in four studies, all of which were designed to elicit adolescent views and experiences of asthma self-management. As adolescents begin to assume greater responsibility for asthma self-management, effective communication with others during this period is critically important.⁶

Deliberately not reporting medication deviations to healthcare professionals⁸ occurred sometimes to avoid confrontation¹⁹ or because of difficulty in being honest when parents were present if they do not want to disclose information such as smoking.⁸ Adolescents reported apprehension about attending outpatient clinics alone,⁸ feeling afraid to ask questions, or paying no attention to the information given by the HCP as they did not understand.⁷ A reluctance to discuss asthma with others was also reported.²¹

DISCUSSION

This systematic review and narrative synthesis has uniquely identified and integrated adolescent-reported barriers and facilitators to self-management of asthma, and summarised these into six key themes. Many of these related to adherence to asthma medications. The key take home messages from this review for healthcare professionals are given in table 5.

Adherence to medication is a key component of asthma self-management. When adolescents lack *knowledge* of asthma, their medications, and how to use them properly, they are less likely to be adherent to their treatment. *Lifestyle* factors such as time constraints were often linked to forgetting to take medication. Adolescents are not unique in this as adherence to prescribed treatment, including unintentional non-adherence,³³ in developed countries is estimated to be as low as 50%.³⁴ *Beliefs and attitudes* summarises how negative or erroneous beliefs and attitudes towards their illness, medication, and HCP can lead to non-adherence with treatment, whereas positive attitudes towards asthma and medications can have a facilitative influence on self-management. This is not surprising given that low rates of adherence in many other long term conditions (LTCs) (including asthma) have been associated with patients' beliefs about their personal need for medication and concerns about adverse side effects.³³ Our finding reinforces the UK's National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence report that adherence is best understood in terms of the beliefs and preferences that influence the person's perceptions of the treatment and their motivation to start and continue with it.

The theme *Relationships* highlights the importance of parents who can facilitate selfmanagement through support, reminders, and education. Teachers, HCPs and friends can also influence self-management and are potential facilitators that can be used as support structures, particularly the latter given recent research indicating that decision-making in adolescence may be particularly modulated by peers.³⁵ *Intrapersonal Characteristics* emphasises the embarrassment reported by adolescents from having asthma or using treatments in front of others. Adolescents are particularly sensitive to social environmental cues and process social emotions differently to adults,³⁶ which may explain their desire to appear 'normal'. A lack of assertiveness can prevent adolescents from advocating their needs, indicating that increased confidence and self-advocacy skills to act in such situations would empower them to better self-manage.

The final theme, although not explicitly linked to self-management behaviours, *was communication*. Effective communication with others has been identified as a necessary component of adolescent asthma self-management,⁶ and recognised more generally as an important element of self-management across a range of long term conditions.³⁷ HCPs' communication skills have been associated with patient adherence and HCPs' communication training can improve patient adherence.³⁸

Our study has a number of limitations. Studies were not excluded on the basis of quality; due to the paucity of studies in this area it was felt important to retain all the data. Although all the qualitative studies met the criteria to be considered of 'medium' or 'high' quality there were some concerns regarding the small number of participants in some focus groups. As already noted, we were unable to accurately rate the quality of the quantitative studies due to the lack of details and concerns due to the use of unvalidated questionnaires. Most studies were not designed to explicitly identify factors that influenced self-management behaviours (such as taking medication). Future research could attempt to address this by better linking identified barriers and facilitators of asthma self-management to actual behaviour.

For many patients with asthma, self-management is often further complicated by comorbid allergic disease. Likewise, the difficulties of self-managing a long term condition during adolescence is not limited to asthma. Adolescents with other LTCs, such as diabetes and juvenile idiopathic arthritis, also encounter similar barriers and facilitators to illness selfmanagement such as knowledge, parental involvement and intrapersonal issues.³⁹ The knowledge, attitudes and life skills that underpin engagement with self-management of LTCs are acquired at different rates in different children as they mature⁵ and this does not necessarily materialise at age 18, the age at which health services in the UK expect young adults to take responsibility for their disease management. Given that adults with LTCs, including asthma,¹⁴ also encounter barriers to self-management, there is a pressing need to prepare adolescents for self-management, through age-appropriate strategies.

Our findings support existing literature that identifies across a range of long term conditions in all ages, the more successful interventions to improve self-management have been multicomponent, and demonstrate the need to include knowledge, psychological strategies, practical and social support in future interventions³⁷ if we want to ensure effective on-going engagement of adolescents with self-management. Critical components of such an approach will need to enhance knowledge of asthma and treatments which should also positively influence some of the negative or erroneous beliefs and attitudes that conflict with effective on-going self-management skills. Psychological strategies will also be essential to: modify beliefs that cannot be addressed through knowledge alone; address interpersonal issues such as increasing motivation to self-manage and embarrassment around peers; and to increase self-confidence to advocate for oneself. The issues arising from the tripartite relationship between the adolescent patient, parent, and HCP also need consideration and will require actions to influence the behaviour of HCPs and parents to facilitate better communication between all parties.

There is evidence to suggest that consultations between adolescents and HCPs' are not currently patient-focused⁸ therefore clinical practice needs to be transformed to deliver care in

a supportive environment that facilitates two-way communication, fosters adolescents' selfefficacy to manage their disease, and considers their wider social influences.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to acknowledge the help of Paula Sands (Librarian, University of Southampton) in developing the search strategy for this systematic review. The study team would like to thank the trial steering group for their advice, in particular, Mike Thomas, Gary Connett, Hans Michael Haitchi, Woolf Walker, Arvind Nagra, Julian Legg and Tricia McGinnity. Lastly, we would like to thank the Asthma UK – Joanna Martin Project, for funding this study.

COMPETING INTERESTS

The authors have no conflicts of interest or financial relationships relevant to this article to disclose.

References

- 1. Kurukulaaratchy RJ, Matthews SM, Arshad SH. The natural history of fatal childhood asthma A case from the Isle of Wight birth cohort. Journal of Asthma 2008;**45**(10):944-47.
- 2. Fleming L, Wilson N, Bush A. Difficult to control asthma in children. Curr Opin Allergy Clin Immunol 2007;**7**(2):190-5.
- 3. Rabe KF, Adachi M, Lai CK, et al. Worldwide severity and control of asthma in children and adults: the global asthma insights and reality surveys. The Journal of allergy and clinical immunology 2004;**114**(1):40-7.
- 4. Steinberg L. Cognitive and affective development in adolescence. Trends in Cognitive Sciences 2005; **9**(2):69-74.
- 5. Sawyer SM, Aroni RA. Self-management in adolescents with chronic illness. What does it mean and how can it be achieved. Medical Journal of Australia 2005; **183**(8):405.
- 6. Mammen J, Rhee H. Adolescent Asthma Self-Management: A Concept Analysis and Operational Definition. Pediatric Allergy, Immunology, and Pulmonology 2012; **25**(4):180-89.

- 7. van Es SM, le Coq EM, Brouwer AI, et al. Adherence-related behavior in adolescents with asthma: results from focus group interviews. Journal of Asthma 1998; **35**(8):637-46.
- 8. Edgecombe K, Latter S, Peters S, et al. Health experiences of adolescents with uncontrolled severe asthma. Archives of Disease in Childhood 2010;**95**(12):985-91.
- 9. Bravata DM, Gienger AL, Holty JE, et al. Quality improvement strategies for children with asthma: a systematic review. Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med 2009;**163**(6):572-81.
- 10. Wolf FM, Guevara JP, Grum CM, et al. Educational interventions for asthma in children. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews 2003(1):CD000326.
- 11. Haby M, Waters E, Robertson C, et al. Interventions for educating children who have attended the emergency room for asthma. The Cochrane Library 2001.
- 12. Kahana S, Drotar D, Frazier T. Meta-analysis of psychological interventions to promote adherence to treatment in pediatric chronic health conditions. Journal of Pediatric Psychology 2008;**33**(6):590-611.
- 13. Ahmad A, Sorensen K. Enabling and hindering factors influencing adherence to asthma treatment among adolescents: a systematic literature review. J Asthma 2016(just-accepted):00-00.
- 14. Kirby S, Miles C, Arden-Close E, et al. P51 Barriers And Facilitators To Effective Self-management Of Asthma – A Systematic Review And Thematic Synthesis. Thorax 2014; **69**(Suppl 2):A96.
- 15. Harden A, Brunton G, Fletcher A, et al. Young people, pregnancy and social exclusion: A systematic synthesis of research evidence to identify effective, appropriate and promising approaches for prevention and support: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London, 2006.
- 16. Higgins JPT, Altman DG, Gøtzsche PC, et al. *The Cochrane Collaboration's tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised trials*, 2011.
- 17. Popay J, Roberts H, Sowden A, et al. Guidance on the conduct of narrative synthesis in systematic reviews. A product from the ESRC methods programme Lancaster: In stitute of Health Research 2006.
- 18. Rhee H, Belyea MJ, Ciurzynski S, et al. Barriers to asthma self-management in adolescents: Relationships to psychosocial factors. Pediatric Pulmonology 2009; **44**(2):183-91.
- 19. Wamboldt FS, Bender BG, Rankin AE. Adolescent decision-making about use of inhaled asthma controller medication: results from focus groups with participants from a prior longitudinal study. Journal of Asthma 2011;**48**(7):741-50.
- 20. Buston KM, Wood SF. Non-compliance amongst adolescents with asthma: listening to what they tell us about self-management. Family Practice 2000; **17**(2):134-8.
- 21. Velsor-Friedrich B, Vlasses F, Moberley J, et al. Talking with teens about asthma management. J Sch Nurs 2004;**20**(3):140-8.
- 22. Naimi DR, Freedman TG, Ginsburg KR, et al. Adolescents and asthma: why bother with our meds? Journal of Allergy & Clinical Immunology 2009; **123**(6):1335-41.
- 23. Blaakman SW, Cohen A, Fagnano M, et al. Asthma medication adherence among urban teens: a qualitative analysis of barriers, facilitators and experiences with school-based care. J Asthma 2014;**51**(5):522-9.
- 24. Koster ES, Philbert D, de Vries TW, et al. "I just forget to take it": asthma self-management needs and preferences in adolescents. J Asthma 2015; **52**(8):831-7.
- 25. Knight D. Beliefs and self-care practices of adolescents with asthma. Issues Compr Pediatr Nurs 2005; **28**(2):71-81.
- 26. Jonsson M, Egmar AC, Hallner E, et al. Experiences of living with asthma a focus group study with adolescents and parents of children with asthma. Journal of Asthma 2014;**51**(2):185-92.
- 27. van Es SM, Kaptein AA, Bezemer PD, et al. Predicting adherence to prophylactic medication in adolescents with asthma: an application of the ASE-model. Patient Educ Couns 2002;**47**(2):165-71.
- 28. Araujo A, Rocha RL, Alvim CG. Adolescence and asthma management: The perspective of adolescents receiving primary health care. Revista Paulista de Pediatria 2014; **32**(3):171-76.

- 29. Kyngäs HA. Nurses' support: essential factor for the good compliance of adolescents with asthma. Nursing & Health Sciences 2000;**2**(4):211-16.
- 30. van Es SM, Nagelkerke AF, Colland VT, et al. An intervention programme using the ASE-model aimed at enhancing adherence in adolescents with asthma. Patient Educ Couns 2001;**44**(3):193-203.
- 31. Cohen R, Franco K, Motlow F, et al. Perceptions and attitudes of adolescents with asthma. Journal of Asthma 2003;**40**(2):207-11.
- 32. Quaranta J, Wool M, Logvis K, et al. Interpersonal Influences on the Self-management Skills of the Rural Asthmatic Adolescent. Online Journal of Rural Nursing and Health Care 2014;**14**(2):97-122.
- 33. Horne R. Compliance, adherence, and concordance: implications for asthma treatment. Chest 2006;**130**(1 Suppl):65S-72S.
- 34. Sabaté E. Adherence to long-term therapies: evidence for action: World Health Organization, 2003.
- 35. Blakemore S-J, Robbins TW. Decision-making in the adolescent brain. Nature neuroscience 2012;**15**(9):1184-91.
- 36. Blakemore S-J. Development of the social brain in adolescence. Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine 2012;**105**(3):111-16.
- 37. Taylor S, Pinnock H, Epiphaniou E, et al. A rapid synthesis of the evidence on interventions supporting self-management for people with long-term conditions.(PRISMS Practical Systematic Review of Self-Management Support for long-term conditions). Health Serv Deliv Res 2014;2:53.
- 38. Zolnierek KBH, DiMatteo MR. Physician communication and patient adherence to treatment: a meta-analysis. Medical care 2009;**47**(8):826.
- 39. Lindsay S, Kingsnorth S, Hamdani Y. Barriers and facilitators of chronic illness self-management among adolescents: a review and future directions. Journal of Nursing and Healthcare of Chronic Illness 2011;**3**(3):186-208.

Table 1. Study Chai	racteristics
---------------------	--------------

Study ID (ref)	Aims	Participants	Data collection	Data analysis	Summary of findings
Blaakman	To understand the	Aged 12-16 years	Qualitative study with	Qualitative content	Themes categories, (1) "general asthma
2014	adolescent	(n=28) with persistent	data collected	analysis.	management" - positives: routines,
	perspective	asthma and prescribed	through semi-		independence, connecting daily medication use
	around asthma	preventer medication.	structured interviews		with fewer symptoms; negatives: hurrying,
	management	Participating in a pilot	at final review.		forgetfulness, competing demands; or (2)
	including	study examining daily			"program-specific" half reported positive rapport
	prevention and	observed medication			with their school nurse but a few felt nurse was
	adherence.	therapy at school and			dismissive, leaving the classroom, distance to the
		motivational			nurse's office, necessity of hall passes and
		interviews. Rochester,			morning school routines, many connected using
		US			medications to fewer symptoms.
Buston	To understand	Aged 14- 20 years	In-depth interview	Interviews were	Majority admitted to non-compliance with self-
et al.	better the reasons	(n=49) diagnosed with	conducted in the	transcribed in full and	care regimes. Reasons given were: forgetfulness;
2000	for non-	asthma >1 year ago.	home.	analysed using a	belief that medication is ineffective; denial of
	compliance in	Did not approach		grounded theory	having asthma or belief that asthma not serious;

	adolescents with	those deemed		approach. Transcripts	difficulty using inhaler; inconvenience; fear of side
	asthma.	inarticulate or with		were indexed and a	effects; embarrassment and laziness. Relative
		behavioural problems.		coding frame developed.	and friends were noted as important for
		Sampled from hospital			medication reminders, despite annoyance with
		asthma clinics in			parents for 'nagging'.
		Glasgow, UK.			
Cohen	To examine the	US high school	32 item self-report	Descriptive statistics only.	41% did not know the name of their asthma
et al.	perceptions of	students (n = 200).	questionnaire.		medication, 38% reported taking asthma pump
2003	inner-city	Multi-staged stratified			when going out. 29% reported feeling
	adolescent	sampling. Pilot			embarrassed having an asthma attack with
	asthmatics and	questionnaire			friends, 32% embarrassed to take medication in
	their attitudes	administered to 2800			front of friends. Embarrassment related to not
	towards self-	students, subset of			carrying pump and not taking medication with
	treatment.	200 were identified			friends.
		with asthma, 80%			
		completion rate.			
Edgecombe	To understand the	Aged 11-18 years (n =	Semi-structured	Transcripts were	Two overarching themes: 1) medication and
et al.	experiences of	22). Uncontrolled,	interviews for	systematically analysed	adherence, and 2) interaction with healthcare
2010	adolescents living	severe asthma, no	qualitative data.	using thematic approach	professionals and adherence with their advice.

	with difficult	other chronic medical		in an iterative process.	Adolescents had a poor understanding of their
	asthma,	condition. Purposively		Emergent themes were	medication and using it often conflicted with other
	particularly their	sampled from		identified and coded.	activities. Adolescents are very reliant on their
	interaction with	outpatient clinic in		Some transcripts were	parents and lack confidence in attending
	healthcare	Southampton, UK.		second coded. Deviant	appointments alone. Healthcare professionals
	professionals and			cases were addressed.	need to work to empower them to gradually take
	use of				on the responsibility for their asthma.
	medications.				
Jonsson	To describe the	Aged 13 – 18 years	Interview schedule	Transcribed data were	Three themes were identified: strategies,
et al.	experiences of	(n=9) with asthma.	with four focus	analysed using systematic	frustrations and expectations. Adolescents
2013	living with asthma	Doctor diagnosis of at	groups. Two with	text condensation.	wanted to be like their peers and developed their
	among	least 2 years, on daily	parents and two with		own strategies for self-management of
	adolescents with	treatment with ICS,	adolescents.		asthma, which included not always taking
	asthma and	and outpatients visit at			medication as prescribed. Participants wanted
	parents of young	least once a year.			competence and understanding in asthma care
	children with	Purposively sampled			from healthcare professionals.
	asthma.	from outpatient clinics			
		in Stockholm, Sweden.			

Koster et al	To assess	Aged 12-16 (n= 21)	Qualitative with 2	Qualitative thematic	Forgetting was major reason for poor adherence
2015	adolescent	years with asthma	online focus group	analysis	Others: lack of perceived need or benefit.
	asthmatics needs	from both primary and	and one face to face		Strategies to improve: reminders from parents,
	and preferences	secondary care. On	one. Questions		reminder on smartphone applications.
	regarding	ICS. Either from	focused on		
	medication	pharmacy or clinic.	adherence behaviour		
	counselling and	Netherlands	and		
			needs and		
			preferences in		
			adherence support.		
Knight 2005	To identify the	Aged 13-18 years (n =	Semi-structured	Transcriptions were	Knowledge acquisition, self-efficacy, and social
	beliefs and self-	10). Moderate-severe	interviews.	analysed to identify	support were associated with behaviours that
	care practices of	asthma. Convenience		themes, using a modified	control asthma with better outcomes. Greater
	adolescents with	sample from school in		grounded-theory	knowledge acquisition and symptom recognition
	asthma in a	Hawaii, US.		approach of constant	were associated with exposure to multiple
	private high			comparative methods.	educators, especially school-based programs.
	school.				High self-efficacy was facilitated through positive
					experiences - teenagers recognized that they have
					fewer asthma events and severity once they we

					in better physical condition, on preventive
					medicines, and/or used trigger avoidance
					success. Social support for teens was very
					helpful and included parents, family, friends,
					coaches and teachers, and healthcare providers.
Kyngas	To identify the	Aged 13-17 years (n =	58-item structured	Logistic regression to	The greatest predictor for compliance with health
2000	factors that	266). Diagnosed more	self-report	determine the factors that	regimens was support from nurses, followed by
	predict	than 1 year. Random	questionnaire posted	predict compliance with	motivation. Energy and willpower were also
	compliance with	whole population	to participants. 88%	health regimens.	significant predictors.
	health regimens	sample in Finland.	response rate.		
	by adolescents				
	with asthma				
Naimi et al.	To assess beliefs	Aged 15-18 years	Mixed methods. Two	A data reduction process	HBM themes from the interviews were: self-
2009	about adherence	(n=39). Moderate -	open-ended 1:1	with content analysis.	reported adherence, perceived severity of
	and asthma	severe asthma.	interviews a month	Researchers	asthma, effects on daily activities, benefits / risks
	management.	Convenience sample	apart, electronic	independently looked for	of ICS. Teens took medication inconsistently, had
		from outpatient clinic	monitoring of	common themes by using	erroneous beliefs about them, dislike taste, "too
		lists or during an	adherence (EMA).	grounded theory	busy" to take and "forget". Teenagers
		inpatient stay in		structure. Themes were	recommend "reminder" solutions to poor

		Philadelphia, US.		summarized and interpreted within the framework of the Health Belief Model. Themes were compared with the	adherence. Twenty percent believed that taking controller medication was unnecessary, and another 18% expressed ambivalence about its benefits
				EMA data.	
Quaranta et	To understand	Rural adolescents	Focus groups were	Thematic analysis	The majority of participants perceived provider
al 2014	how self-	aged 13-17 years	conducted with with		and parental expectations for asthma
	management	(n=7) with asthma.	focus on which		management as only consisting of medication
	behaviours of the	USA	influenced		compliance. The students did not report any
	adolescent with		management		perceived expectations from the school nurse
	asthma are		behaviours.		except independent inhaler use. There was no
	influenced by the				expectation to report use to the school nurse. The
	perceived				participants felt that their teachers were not
	expectations for				aware of their asthma diagnosis; therefore, no
	self-management				expectations were noted. Expectations from
	behaviours from				peers had no influence on self-management
	healthcare				behaviours.
	providers, school				

nurses, teachers,

family and friends.

Rhee et al.	To asses	Aged 13-20 years (n =	Illness Management	Descriptive statistics to	Common barriers were: unwillingness to give up
2009	common types of	126). Persistent	Survey (barriers);	analyse common barriers.	things (63%); difficulty remembering (53%); trying
	barriers to self-	asthma for more than	Asthma Knowledge	Factor analysis was	to 'forget' they have asthma (50%). 46% reported
	management.	1 year. No other	Questionnaire; and	performed on the Illness	five or more barriers. Factor analysis revealed
	Examine	chronic health	Attitude towards	management survey.	barriers in four domains: negativity toward
	associations	condition. Recruited	Illness	Hierarchical regression	providers and the medication regimen, cognitive
	between barrier	via community flyers,	Questionnaire. Non	used to examine the	difficulty, peer/family influence and denial. Self-
	perception and	schools, and	validated measures:	extent to which barrier	efficacy was the most influential factor that
	psychosocial	healthcare providers in	Asthma Self-Efficacy	perception was predicted	showed a strong negative association with all four
	factors including	New York, US.	and Asthma Control	by asthma control,	barrier subscales independent of asthma control
	knowledge,		questions.	knowledge, attitude and	and sociodemographic characteristics. Poor
	attitudes, and			self-efficacy.	attitudes to asthma were also associated with
	self-efficacy.				barriers of cognitive difficulty and social influence.
					Males consistently reported higher barriers such
					as negativity, social influence and denial. Self-

van Es et al.	To investigate	Aged 11-18 years (n =	Questionnaires	Linear regression used to	The most important determinant of self-reported
2002 (22)	whether attitudes,	86). Physician	measuring attitudes,	examine the relationship	adherence at 12 months was previous self-
	social influence,	diagnosed asthma	self-efficacy, social	between baseline	reported adherence (i.e. adherence at baseline)
	self-efficacy, and	prescribed daily	influences, and	determinants and	followed by 'feeling ashamed about asthma',
	intention can	inhaled prophylactics	adherence (self-	adherence after 12	positive attitude to medication, and intention.
	predict self-	for minimum 2 months.	reported). Data	months.	
	reported	Recruited from	collected as part of		
	adherence after 1	pediatric outpatient	RCT intervention at		
	year.	clinics in Netherlands.	baseline and after 12		
			months.		
van Es et al.	To explore the	Aged 12-16 years (n =	Three focus groups	Transcripts were coded	All participants said they forgot to take daily
1998 (7)	self-management	14), physician	(of 2, 5, and 7	by an observer and	medication, often because they were in a hurry.
	behaviour of	diagnosed asthma and	teenagers) discussed	independent physician.	Reminders or cues were needed to take
	adolescents,	on daily treatment of	self-management	Information was analysed	medication. Some were late starting medication
	particularly	prophylactic	behaviours; feelings	by coding statements into	when symptoms appeared and did not use
	adherence	medication. Recruited	about having	five topics. Once	medication in advance of expected symptoms.
	behaviour.	from outpatient clinics	asthma; opinions of	complete the analysts	Reasons for not taking medication included: not
		in Netherlands.	the health care	compared their coding	wanting to stop activities; dislike of taste or side-

			provided by the	and discussed any	effects; belief that medication is ineffective, or
			paediatrician;	disagreements to form a	because they did not have symptoms. A minority
			recommendations for	consensus. Data were	reported smoking, embarrassment, or lack of
			healthcare providers;	analyzed within groups,	confidence in speaking out. All were "fed up" with
			and patient	then responses of the	having asthma. Lack of honesty with doctor and
			education materials.	different groups were	lack of understanding about medications.
				combined.	Teenagers wanted more information in person
					and in a visual format.
van Es et al.	To assess an	Aged 11-18 years (n =	Questionnaires. RCT	T-tests were used for	No statistically significant differences were seen
2001 (24)	intervention	112). Doctor	of intervention	between group	between groups except at 24 months follow up
	programme aimed	diagnosed asthma on	program versus	comparisons of	when self reported adherence was higher.
	at enhancing	daily preventer	usual care. Self-	adherence, and possible	
	adherence to	medication. Recruited	reported adherence	determinants of	
	asthma	from outpatients in	at baseline, after 1	adherence.	
	medication	Netherlands.	year, and 2 years.		
Velsor-	To explore	Aged 14-18 years (n =	Four questions used	Discussion tapes	Four themes emerged: 1) wanting to be normal -
Freidreich	experiences and	24). Recruited from	to stimulate	transcribed verbatim and	not wanting to discuss asthma with peers. 2)
et al.	behaviours	four schools in city,	discussion in four	colour-coded to identify	unpredictability of the disease - difficulties in
2004	related to the self-	urban and rural areas,	focus groups.	each school. Transcripts	maintaining normal life. 3) credibility of the teen

(18)	management of	identified by school		were then disseminated to	with asthma - teenagers understand the
	teens with	nurse in US (exact		the research team and	seriousness of their asthma but not always the
	asthma.	location not provided).		themes identified.	adults around them. 4) Self-management issues -
					reliance on parents, difficulties avoiding triggers,
					inconsistencies between beliefs/knowledge and
					actual behaviour. Communicating needs to adults
					was seen as a benefit but asthma was not
					discussed with peers.
Wamboldt	To examine	Aged 12 – 20 years (n	Six focus groups	Verbatim transcripts of	A variety of beliefs, feelings, and behaviours
et al.	beliefs, feelings,	= 26) recruited from	comprised of 3-5	these groups were	influence decisions about how to use asthma
2011 (16)	and behaviours	previous study in	participants.	analyzed using the long-	medication. Some understood the importance of
	about ICS to	Denver, US. Physician		table method of content	daily medication and were committed to the
	develop more	diagnosed asthma on		analysis to identify key	treatment plan prescribed by their provider.
	effective	ICS.		themes raised by	Poorer adherence resulted from misinformation,
	management			participants.	incorrect assumptions about their asthma, and
	strategies.				current life situations.

ED emergency department; GP general practice, ICS inhaled corticosteroids,

First Author	Aims and objectives clearly reported	Adequate description of the context in which the research was carried out	Adequate description of the sample used and methods to identify and recruit sample	Adequate description of the methods used to collect the data	Adequate description of the methods used to analyse data	Attempts to establish the reliability of data collection tools	Attempts to establish the validity of data collection tools	Attempts to establish the reliability of the data analysis methods	Attempts to establish the validity of data analysis methods	Appropriate data collection methods for helping young people to express their views	Appropriate methods for ensuring data analysis grounded in the views of young	The study actively involved young people in its design and conduct	Overall quality criteria
Blaakman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Unclear	Yes	No	Medium
Buston	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR	NR	NR	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium
Edgecombe	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR	High
Jonsson	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	NR	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium
Knight	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium
Koster	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Unclear	Yes	No	Medium
Naimi	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NR	Yes	Yes	NR	High
Van Es	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	NR	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium
Velsor-	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium
Friedrich													

Table 2. Quality appraisal checklist of qualitative studies (CASP)

7)
Z	c	3
	2	_

Quaranta	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Unclear	Yes	NR	Medium
Wamboldt	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	NR	Medium

NR = not reported. <7 = low; 7-9 = medium; 10-12 = high

	Adequate	Allocation	Blinding / patient	Incomplete	Free of selected	Free of	Other method	Overall quality
	sequence	concealment	related outcomes	outcome data	reporting	other bias	notes	assessment
	generation			addressed				
Cohen	NA	NA	NA	Unclear	Unclear	Low	Unvalidated	Unclear
							questionnaire	
Kyngas	NA	NA	NA	Unclear	Unclear	Low		Unclear
Rhee	NA	NA	NA	Unclear	Unclear	Low		Unclear
Van Es 2001	Unclear	Unclear	No	Unclear	Unclear	Low		Unclear
Van Es 2002	Unclear	Unclear	No	Unclear	Unclear	Low		Unclear
NIA 1 1								

Table 3 Quality appraisal of quantitative studies using the Cochrane risk of bias tool

NA = not applicable

Table 4. Summary of themes with illustrative quotations (where provided)

	Barriers	Facilitators
Knowledge	Poor knowledge of asthma, treatment regimes, and devices	Severe exacerbation
	"I usually take my blue inhaler but then if it's really bad I the preventer because	"I just make sure I do it otherwise I'm gonna be ill,
	it's quick acting" [8]	that's one of the reasons I came into hospital was
		because I carried on forgetting to take my inhalers"
		[8]
Lifestyle	Forgetting to take medication	Routines
	"At the weekend I'm fairly poor [at remembering] because I go out quite a lot at	'first I clean my teeth then I take my medicine' [7]
	nights and come in late. I generally forget then, or if I'm up really late in the	Cues and reminders for remembering medication
	morning I quite often forget" [20]	"I take them by myself but my mum has to remind
	Time constraints	me otherwise I don't do it" [8]
	Not wanting to interrupt other activities	
	"don't really forget to take it but if I'm like doing something and I feel tight and it's	
	something that I don't want to be pulled away from then I won't take it" [8]	
	Inconvenience of spacers	
	"need to look for the spacer most of the time and I'm like, oh I can't be bothered to	

	look for this, let's just take it without the spacer" [8]	
	Unable or unwilling to avoid triggers	
Beliefs and	Side effects	Positive attitudes towards asthma and
attitudes	"I don't like the taste or the way it feels in your mouth or anything" [22]	medication
	Beliefs that medication is ineffective	
	"I don't [need to take F/S] Because when I don't take it, I feel the same as when I	
	do take it. To me, it doesn't make a difference" [22]	
	Beliefs that asthma is not serious	
	"I've never really thought of asthma as being serious"[19]	
	Denial of asthma	
	"when I first got diagnosed, I went through the stage of 'I haven't got asthma,	
	that's it', and I ended up having a massive attack from not taking the medication"	
	[20]	
Relationships	Unsupportive teachers and school policies	Accepting help from others
	"and the teachers there's a whole lot of shame and there's a lot of frowning that	Reminders and support from peers
	goes on" [21]	"they always like give me my inhalers and stuff" [
	Negativity towards HCP	Competent and supportive HCP

"It's better to meet someone who knows what I need

		than to be forced to meet ten people and tell them
		the whole story over and over again" [26]
Intrapersonal	Apathy towards asthma and medication	High motivation
	"I just can't be bothered really" [8]	High self-efficacy
	Experiencing symptoms or taking medication is embarrassing	Feeling in control of asthma
	"I'd rather just do it when I'm alone so no one's like staring at me with amazement	Taking responsibility
	that I'm taking an inhaler" [19]	Acceptance of asthma
	Lack of assertiveness	"Well, I suppose I've just grown up with it, the fact
	Feeling ashamed of having asthma	that I've got it. It's just a part of me" [7]
	"I am the only one in the class who has got asthma, and then I'm a bit ashamed of	
	<i>it."</i> [7]	
	Wanting to be 'normal'	
Communication	Withholding information from HCP	
	"well sometimes I said everything was ok but then I had been feeling quite poorly a	
	few days earlier'[7]	
	Difficulty being honest with HCP when parents present	
	"there's some stuff you don't feel comfortable talking about around your mum" [8]	
	Afraid to ask HCP questions	
	Not paying attention to HCP	

"If I like talk to the Dr or something I sometimes get really bored—he's just going

on about the same thing for about an hour-that's really annoying" [8]

Not discussing asthma with others

Table 5. Key messages for healthcare professionals

- Many adolescents have poor knowledge about asthma and treatments
- Non-adherence is frequently caused by forgetting to take medication
- Adolescents with established routines are better able to self-manage
- Some adolescents do not use treatments or use them incorrectly due to erroneous beliefs about their asthma and medication
- Asthma self-management is difficult for those with a lack of support at school
- Parents play a key role in reminding adolescents to take medication
- Many adolescents feel embarrassment about their asthma and using medication, particularly around their friends and peers
- Many adolescents report difficulties in communicating with their healthcare professional

Figure 1 Flow Diagram of Search Process

