

# Bayesian Approach to Interpreting Archaeological Data

**Caitlin E. Buck**

*School of History and Archaeology, University of Wales, Cardiff, U.K.*

**William G. Cavanagh**

*Department of Archaeology, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, U.K.*

**Clifford D. Litton**

*Department of Mathematics, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, U.K.*

JOHN WILEY & SONS

Chichester · New York · Brisbane · Toronto · Singapore

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Bayesian approach to statistical archaeology . . . . .</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Why use the Bayesian approach? . . . . .	1
1.1.1	An illustrative example . . . . .	2
1.2	Statistics and archaeology . . . . .	5
1.2.1	Descriptive statistics in archaeology . . . . .	5
1.2.2	Beyond descriptive statistics . . . . .	7
1.2.3	Interdisciplinary collaboration . . . . .	8
1.3	Aims of the book . . . . .	9
1.3.1	Further reading . . . . .	10
1.4	Plan of the book . . . . .	11
<b>2</b>	<b>Outline of the approach . . . . .</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1	Structure of the chapter . . . . .	13
2.2	Mathematical modelling . . . . .	13
2.2.1	Models and archaeology . . . . .	13
2.2.2	A mathematical model for St Veit-Klingberg . . . . .	14
2.2.3	The modelling of corbelled structures . . . . .	14
2.3	Updating information . . . . .	16
2.3.1	Prior information . . . . .	17
2.3.2	Comment . . . . .	17
2.3.3	Data . . . . .	18
2.3.4	Posterior information . . . . .	18
2.4	Bayesian inference . . . . .	19
2.4.1	Bayes' theorem . . . . .	19
2.4.2	Prior information about St Veit-Klingberg . . . . .	21
2.4.3	Prior information about the corbelled structures . . . . .	22
2.5	Questions and answers . . . . .	22
2.5.1	Questions about St Veit-Klingberg . . . . .	22
2.5.2	Questions about corbelled structures . . . . .	23
2.6	The history of the Bayesian approach . . . . .	25
2.7	Tailpiece . . . . .	26

<b>3</b>	<b>Modelling in archaeology</b>	27
3.1	Introduction	27
3.2	Archaeological ideas	28
3.3	Mathematical models	29
3.3.1	A simple example	29
3.4	The modelling cycle	31
3.5	An illustrative example	33
3.6	Examples of mathematical models in archaeology	35
3.6.1	Analysis of field survey data	36
3.6.2	Sourcing	37
3.6.3	Seriation	40
3.6.4	Tree-ring dating	42
3.6.5	Radiocarbon dating	44
3.7	Summing-up	46
<b>4</b>	<b>Quantifying uncertainty: the probability concept</b>	47
4.1	Introduction	47
4.2	Quantifying uncertainty	48
4.2.1	Knowledge and ignorance	48
4.2.2	How to assess uncertainty	49
4.3	Mathematical notation	52
4.3.1	The rule of coherence	54
4.4	Some rules of probability	56
4.4.1	Rule 1	56
4.4.2	Rule 2, the Addition Rule	57
4.4.3	Rule 3, the Multiplication Rule	59
4.4.4	The theorem of total probability	62
4.4.5	Getting to a dig on time	64
4.5	Bayes' theorem	65
4.5.1	The basic theorem	65
4.5.2	A simple example of using Bayes' theorem — selecting the right candidate	66
4.5.3	A more general form of Bayes' theorem	67
4.5.4	The director makes inferences	68
4.5.5	Burial rites and Bayes' theorem	68
4.6	Exchangeability	72
4.6.1	A fishy example	72
4.6.2	Implications of exchangeability	73
4.6.3	Consumerland	74
4.7	Discussion	77
<b>5</b>	<b>Statistical modelling</b>	79
5.1	Introduction	79
5.2	Populations and samples	80

5.2.1	Sample mean and population mean . . . . .	80
5.3	Random variables . . . . .	82
5.4	Modelling discrete random variables . . . . .	83
5.4.1	Probability distributions: introduction . . . . .	83
5.4.2	Probability mass function . . . . .	84
5.4.3	Cumulative distribution function . . . . .	85
5.5	Summarizing discrete random variables . . . . .	85
5.5.1	Probability histograms . . . . .	86
5.5.2	Expected value of a discrete random variable . . . . .	87
5.6	Examples of discrete distributions . . . . .	90
5.6.1	Uniform distribution . . . . .	90
5.6.2	Bernoulli distribution . . . . .	91
5.6.3	Binomial distribution . . . . .	91
5.6.4	Poisson distribution . . . . .	92
5.7	Consumerland revisited . . . . .	96
5.8	Modelling continuous random variables . . . . .	97
5.8.1	Probability density function . . . . .	97
5.9	Summarizing continuous random variables . . . . .	99
5.9.1	Expected value of a continuous random variable . . . . .	99
5.10	Examples of continuous distributions . . . . .	100
5.10.1	Uniform distribution . . . . .	100
5.10.2	Beta distribution . . . . .	101
5.10.3	Normal or Gaussian distribution . . . . .	103
5.10.4	Exponential distribution . . . . .	104
5.10.5	Gamma distribution . . . . .	107
5.10.6	Log-normal distribution . . . . .	110
5.10.7	Log-skew Laplace distribution . . . . .	110
5.11	Summary . . . . .	112
<b>6</b>	<b>Bivariate and multivariate distributions . . . . .</b>	<b>115</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	115
6.2	Discrete bivariate random variables . . . . .	116
6.2.1	Joint probability mass function . . . . .	116
6.2.2	Marginal probability mass function . . . . .	117
6.2.3	Conditional distributions . . . . .	119
6.2.4	Interpretation of the marginal mass function . . . . .	120
6.2.5	Independence . . . . .	121
6.2.6	Bayes' theorem using bivariate discrete distributions . . . . .	122
6.2.7	Expectation of discrete bivariate random variables . . . . .	122
6.2.8	Covariance and correlation . . . . .	124
6.3	Continuous bivariate random variables . . . . .	125
6.3.1	Joint probability density function . . . . .	126
6.3.2	Marginal probability density function . . . . .	126

6.3.3	Conditional densities and independence . . . . .	127
6.3.4	Bayes' theorem for bivariate continuous distributions . .	128
6.3.5	Expectation of continuous bivariate random variables .	128
6.3.6	Bivariate Normal distribution . . . . .	128
6.4	Multivariate distributions . . . . .	129
6.4.1	Conditional distributions . . . . .	130
6.4.2	Bayes' theorem for multivariate distributions . . . . .	130
6.4.3	Expectation . . . . .	131
6.5	Examples of multivariate distributions . . . . .	131
6.5.1	Multinomial distribution . . . . .	131
6.5.2	Multivariate Normal distribution . . . . .	132
6.5.3	Dirichlet distribution . . . . .	133
6.5.4	Inverse-Wishart distribution . . . . .	134
6.6	Concluding remarks . . . . .	134
<b>7</b>	<b>Bayesian inference . . . . .</b>	<b>137</b>
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	137
7.1.1	Outline of the Bayesian approach . . . . .	137
7.1.2	Dating the Turin Shroud . . . . .	140
7.1.3	The Bayesian framework . . . . .	141
7.2	Mechanics of the Bayesian approach . . . . .	142
7.2.1	Use of Bayes' theorem for events . . . . .	142
7.2.2	Making inferences about parameters using Bayes' theorem . . . . .	143
7.2.3	Interpretation of Bayes' theorem . . . . .	145
7.3	From prior to posterior . . . . .	146
7.3.1	Example 1 — Case I . . . . .	146
7.3.2	Example 1 — Case II . . . . .	149
7.3.3	Example 1 — Case III . . . . .	149
7.4	Summarizing the posterior . . . . .	150
7.4.1	Measures of posterior information . . . . .	150
7.4.2	Credible intervals and highest posterior density regions	152
7.4.3	Example 2 . . . . .	154
7.5	Bayes' theorem applied to multi-parameter problems . . . . .	159
7.5.1	Formulating the likelihood and prior . . . . .	160
7.5.2	The posterior and its interpretation . . . . .	160
7.5.3	Analysis of a simplified version of St Veit-Klinglberg . .	161
7.6	Sequential updating of beliefs . . . . .	167
7.6.1	The Turin Shroud continued . . . . .	167
7.6.2	Today's posterior is tomorrow's prior . . . . .	168
7.6.3	Example 1 — Case IV . . . . .	169
7.7	How to represent prior ignorance . . . . .	170
7.7.1	Improper priors . . . . .	170

7.7.2	Vague and reference priors . . . . .	171
7.8	The Bayesian versus classical debate . . . . .	171
7.8.1	Prior probability and subjectivity . . . . .	171
7.8.2	The classical or frequentist approach . . . . .	172
7.8.3	Hypothesis testing . . . . .	173
7.8.4	Comment . . . . .	174
7.9	Discussion . . . . .	174
<b>8</b>	<b>Implementation issues . . . . .</b>	<b>177</b>
8.1	Introduction . . . . .	177
8.2	Evaluation of the posterior . . . . .	178
8.3	Conjugate prior distributions . . . . .	179
8.3.1	Estimating sherd intensity . . . . .	180
8.3.2	Comments . . . . .	181
8.4	Approximations . . . . .	181
8.5	Numerical integration . . . . .	182
8.5.1	A simple example . . . . .	182
8.5.2	The general methodology . . . . .	185
8.5.3	St Veit-Klinglberg by numerical integration . . . . .	186
8.5.4	Comments . . . . .	188
8.6	Markov chain Monte Carlo methods . . . . .	188
8.6.1	The Gibbs sampler . . . . .	189
8.6.2	St Veit-Klinglberg using the Gibbs sampler . . . . .	190
8.6.3	One run or several? . . . . .	191
8.6.4	How many iterations? . . . . .	193
8.7	Simulation techniques . . . . .	194
8.7.1	Table look-up methods for discrete random variables . . . . .	194
8.7.2	Inversion method for continuous random variables . . . . .	195
8.7.3	Rejection methods . . . . .	197
8.7.4	Comments . . . . .	199
8.8	Discussion . . . . .	199
<b>9</b>	<b>Interpretation of radiocarbon results . . . . .</b>	<b>201</b>
9.1	Dating in archaeology . . . . .	201
9.1.1	Structure of the chapter . . . . .	203
9.2	Introduction to radiocarbon dating . . . . .	203
9.2.1	The carbon cycle . . . . .	203
9.2.2	The law of radioactive decay . . . . .	204
9.2.3	Modelling the relationship between radiocarbon and calendar years . . . . .	206
9.2.4	Statistical model of radiocarbon dating . . . . .	209
9.2.5	A simple example . . . . .	212
9.3	Archaeological problems and questions . . . . .	215
9.4	Case Study I — St Veit-Klinglberg, Austria — stratification . . . . .	218

9.4.1	The archaeological problem . . . . .	218
9.4.2	The model . . . . .	219
9.4.3	The data . . . . .	219
9.4.4	The prior information . . . . .	219
9.4.5	The likelihood . . . . .	221
9.4.6	The posterior . . . . .	221
9.4.7	Computational details . . . . .	221
9.4.8	Results and interpretation . . . . .	223
9.5	Case Study II — Jama River Valley, Ecuador — multiphase . . . . .	226
9.5.1	Background . . . . .	226
9.5.2	The model . . . . .	226
9.5.3	The data . . . . .	227
9.5.4	The prior . . . . .	227
9.5.5	The likelihood . . . . .	230
9.5.6	The posterior . . . . .	231
9.5.7	The calculations . . . . .	231
9.5.8	Results and interpretation . . . . .	232
9.6	Case Study III — Stolford, England — wigggle-matching . . . . .	232
9.6.1	Background . . . . .	232
9.6.2	The model . . . . .	234
9.6.3	The data . . . . .	235
9.6.4	Remodelling the calibration curve . . . . .	235
9.6.5	The prior . . . . .	237
9.6.6	The likelihood . . . . .	237
9.6.7	The posterior . . . . .	238
9.6.8	Results . . . . .	238
9.7	Case Study IV — Kastanas, Greece — wigggle-matching . . . . .	238
9.7.1	Background . . . . .	238
9.7.2	The model . . . . .	240
9.7.3	The data . . . . .	240
9.7.4	The prior . . . . .	240
9.7.5	The likelihood . . . . .	241
9.7.6	The posterior . . . . .	241
9.7.7	Results and interpretation . . . . .	242
9.7.8	Remodelling . . . . .	242
9.7.9	Sensitivity analysis . . . . .	243
9.8	Case Study V — the Chancay culture of Peru — outlier detection . . . . .	245
9.8.1	Background . . . . .	245
9.8.2	Archaeological background . . . . .	246
9.8.3	The model . . . . .	247
9.8.4	The data . . . . .	249
9.8.5	The prior . . . . .	249

9.8.6	The likelihood . . . . .	249
9.8.7	The posterior . . . . .	250
9.8.8	Implementation . . . . .	250
9.8.9	Results and interpretation . . . . .	251
9.9	Discussion of radiocarbon dating . . . . .	252
<b>10</b>	<b>Spatial analysis . . . . .</b>	<b>253</b>
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	253
10.1.1	Spatial analysis in archaeology . . . . .	253
10.1.2	Archaeological survey . . . . .	255
10.1.3	Traditional methods of presenting survey data . . . . .	256
10.1.4	Overview of the chapter . . . . .	258
10.2	Case Study I — analysis of phosphate data along a transect — change-point analysis . . . . .	258
10.2.1	Archaeological background . . . . .	258
10.2.2	Sampling and chemical analysis . . . . .	259
10.2.3	The model . . . . .	260
10.2.4	The data . . . . .	264
10.2.5	The prior . . . . .	264
10.2.6	The likelihood . . . . .	268
10.2.7	The posterior . . . . .	270
10.2.8	Example of the change-point methodology . . . . .	272
10.3	Case Study II — analysis of phosphate data in a grid, with two levels — image segmentation . . . . .	276
10.3.1	Background to the model . . . . .	277
10.3.2	The model . . . . .	278
10.3.3	The prior . . . . .	279
10.3.4	The likelihood . . . . .	281
10.3.5	The posterior . . . . .	281
10.3.6	Implementation . . . . .	282
10.3.7	Detailed methodology for LS N418 . . . . .	283
10.3.8	Interpretation of the results . . . . .	285
10.4	Case Study III — Manor Farm, Lancashire, U.K. — image segmentation with three levels . . . . .	286
10.4.1	The model . . . . .	286
10.4.2	Detailed methodology . . . . .	287
10.4.3	Interpretation . . . . .	289
10.5	Conclusion . . . . .	291
<b>11</b>	<b>Sourcing and provenancing . . . . .</b>	<b>293</b>
11.1	Introduction . . . . .	293
11.2	Plan of the chapter . . . . .	294
11.3	A basic model for sourcing and provenancing studies . . . . .	295
11.3.1	Notation . . . . .	295



11.3.2	The basic model . . . . .	298
11.3.3	Discriminant analysis and cluster analysis . . . . .	298
11.4	Some important issues . . . . .	299
11.4.1	Provenancing pottery . . . . .	299
11.4.2	Provenancing metals . . . . .	300
11.4.3	Provenancing obsidian . . . . .	301
11.4.4	Comment . . . . .	301
11.5	Case Study I — sourcing — Bayesian discriminant analysis . . . . .	301
11.5.1	The model . . . . .	302
11.5.2	The data . . . . .	304
11.5.3	The prior . . . . .	304
11.5.4	Analysis of the training data . . . . .	306
11.5.5	Analysis of the unsourced data . . . . .	308
11.5.6	Implementation . . . . .	310
11.5.7	Displaying and interpreting the results . . . . .	310
11.6	Case Study II — provenancing obsidian — Bayesian cluster analysis . . . . .	312
11.6.1	The model . . . . .	313
11.6.2	The data . . . . .	314
11.6.3	The prior . . . . .	314
11.6.4	The posterior . . . . .	316
11.6.5	Implementation . . . . .	316
11.6.6	Displaying and interpreting the results . . . . .	316
11.7	Case Study III — provenancing ceramics — Bayesian cluster analysis . . . . .	318
11.7.1	The model . . . . .	318
11.7.2	The data . . . . .	318
11.7.3	The prior . . . . .	320
11.7.4	The posterior . . . . .	321
11.7.5	Displaying and interpreting the results . . . . .	321
11.8	A useful practical extension to the methodology . . . . .	322
11.9	Conclusion . . . . .	325
<b>12</b>	<b>Application to other dating methods . . . . .</b>	<b>327</b>
12.1	Introduction . . . . .	327
12.1.1	Plan of the chapter . . . . .	328
12.2	Seriation . . . . .	328
12.2.1	Background . . . . .	328
12.2.2	Stochastic model . . . . .	329
12.2.3	The data . . . . .	330
12.2.4	The likelihood . . . . .	330
12.2.5	The prior . . . . .	330
12.2.6	The posterior . . . . .	331

12.2.7	Implementation . . . . .	331
12.2.8	Case Study I . . . . .	331
12.2.9	Discussion . . . . .	333
12.3	Tree-ring dating . . . . .	334
12.3.1	Background . . . . .	334
12.3.2	The traditional approach to tree-ring dating . . . . .	340
12.3.3	A statistical model of tree-ring dating . . . . .	342
12.3.4	Consequences of the model . . . . .	342
12.3.5	The data . . . . .	345
12.3.6	The prior . . . . .	345
12.3.7	The likelihood . . . . .	346
12.3.8	The posterior . . . . .	347
12.3.9	Case Study II . . . . .	347
12.3.10	Discussion . . . . .	348
12.4	Combining dendrochronological and radiocarbon information . . . . .	348
12.4.1	Background . . . . .	348
12.4.2	Statistical model of wiggle-matching . . . . .	349
12.4.3	The data . . . . .	349
12.4.4	The prior . . . . .	349
12.4.5	The likelihood . . . . .	349
12.4.6	The posterior . . . . .	350
12.4.7	Case Study III . . . . .	350
12.4.8	Sensitivity analysis . . . . .	351
12.5	Summary . . . . .	352
<b>13</b>	<b>The way forward . . . . .</b>	<b>353</b>
13.1	Introduction . . . . .	353
13.2	Some general principles . . . . .	355
13.2.1	The basic steps . . . . .	355
13.2.2	Problem definition . . . . .	358
13.2.3	Prior elicitation . . . . .	359
13.2.4	Evaluation of posterior distributions . . . . .	360
13.2.5	Joint posteriors and marginal posteriors . . . . .	361
13.2.6	Interpretable summaries . . . . .	361
13.3	Realizing the potential . . . . .	362
13.4	How to realize the potential . . . . .	363
13.4.1	Challenges for the archaeological community . . . . .	363
13.4.2	Challenges for the Bayesian statistical community . . . . .	363
13.4.3	Challenges at the interface . . . . .	364
13.5	Epilogue . . . . .	365
<b>References</b>	. . . . .	<b>367</b>
<b>Index</b>	. . . . .	<b>377</b>