



King's Research Portal

DOI:

[10.1177/0163443709344251](https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443709344251)

[Link to publication record in King's Research Portal](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Lee, H-K. (2009). Between fan culture and copyright infringement: manga scanlation. *Media Culture & Society*, 31(6), 1011 - 1022. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443709344251>

Citing this paper

Please note that where the full-text provided on King's Research Portal is the Author Accepted Manuscript or Post-Print version this may differ from the final Published version. If citing, it is advised that you check and use the publisher's definitive version for pagination, volume/issue, and date of publication details. And where the final published version is provided on the Research Portal, if citing you are again advised to check the publisher's website for any subsequent corrections.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Research Portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognize and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the Research Portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the Research Portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact librarypure@kcl.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Between fan culture and copyright infringement: manga scanlation

Dr Hye-Kyung Lee

Lecturer in Cultural and Creative Industries

Email hk.lee@kcl.ac.uk

Tel +44 (0)20 7848 1574

Culture, Media and Creative Industries

King's College London

4C Chesham Building

Strand Campus

London

WC2R 2LS

This pre-print paper is copyright of the author, but it is free to be used for research purposes as long as it is properly attributed. Permissions for multiple reproductions should be addressed to the author. This paper is intended to circulate work that readers might not otherwise be able to access. If your institution does subscribe to the journal, please access it via that link.

Please cite as Lee, H.-K. (2009) Between fan culture and copyright infringement: manga scanlation. *Media, Culture & Society*, 36(6): 1011-1022.
<http://mcs.sagepub.com/content/31/6.toc>

IMPORTANT: When referring to this paper, please check the page numbers in the journal published version and cite these.

Lee, H.-K. (2009) Between fan culture and copyright infringement: manga scanlation.
Media, Culture & Society, 36(6): 1011 - 1022.
<http://mcs.sagepub.com/content/31/6.toc>

Between fan culture and copyright infringement: manga scanlation

1. Introduction

In recent years, the Japanese comic book or 'manga' has gained remarkable popularity outside Japan, particularly in the US and Europe (Fishbein, 2007; Hickley, 2005; JETRO 2005a, 2005b, 2006). There might be a variety of driving forces for this phenomenon: Western society's increasing fascination with contemporary, popular culture in Japan; the critical and commercial success of Japanese animation, which is often based on manga; Japanese governmental agencies' support for manga-related studies and events overseas; and a variety of manga for girls, which immediately created a new, rapidly growing, market (Deutsche Welle, 2002, 2006; JETRO, 2005b; Kelts, 2007; Kinsella, 2000: 12-13). Behind the successful globalization of manga there exists manga scanlation (Deppey, 2005; Macias, 2006; Yang, 2004). 'Scan(s)lation' refers to the phenomenon where ardent fans scan in manga titles, translate them from Japanese to another language and release the translated version free of charge via the internet. It can be argued that scanlation has been driven by two main factors: first, demand exceeding the supply of manga outside Japan; and second, the availability of digital technologies and the internet, which allow the digitalization of manga and its international distribution through internet chat channels, peer-to-peer file sharing, scanlation distribution websites and simply websites run by scanlators.

Prima facie scanlation is unlawful because it is an unauthorized translation and reproduction. According to Japanese copyright law, artists (and publishers) are entitled to the right to translate, reproduce and exploit derivative works (CRIC, 2008). Their copyright is protected in foreign countries such as the US by virtue of the Berne

Convention for the Protection of Literary and Artistic Works 1886.¹ Whether scanlation is fair use, one should consider various factors: limitations on copyright protection such as ‘private use’ – personal use, family use or other similar uses within a limited circle – and ‘not for profit-making’ exceptions (Japanese copyright law); and its purpose and character, the nature of the copyrighted work, the amount and substantiality of the portion used and its impacts on the market (US copyright law) (CRIC, 2008; US Copyright Office, 2007). As there have been no debates in the media on the (il)legality of scanlation or lawsuits filed against scanlators, it is difficult to know how the industry and legal authorities in Japan and overseas approach the issue of scanlation. As a creation of participatory consumers, scanlation could be seen as being a private and not for profit use of copyrighted manga. Similarly, it also fits into the existing description of fan culture: it is conducted by fans for pleasure on the not-for-profit basis and it is closely associated with other participatory activities such as forums or discussion groups (Fiske, 1992; Grossberg, 1992; Jenkins, 1992). At the same time, however, scanlation is proximate to music file sharing in the sense that scanlated manga could be shared by endless readers and could potentially function as a substitute for the officially translated version.

As a fan culture which aims to ‘promote’ manga in non-Japanese speaking territories through potentially infringing copyright, scanlation seems to have an intriguing relationship with the industry, which could become antagonistic but, so far, has generally been nonchalant. The existence of scanlation and its peaceable relationship to the industry triggers the raising of some fundamental questions on the dynamics in the relations between cultural products, fans and the industry in the age of globalization and digitalization: for example, how the development of digital technologies, the internet and globalization are changing the ways cultural products are distributed and consumed, whether cultural industries can ever stop unauthorized file sharing between consumers,

¹ This is due to the principle of national treatment in Article 5(1) of the Berne Convention. Both Japan and the US are signatories to the Convention. The provisions of the Convention (except for that dealing with moral rights in Article 6bis) have been incorporated into the WTO Agreement on TRIPS.

and whether globalization and digitalization are bringing forward a need for a new set of business models and ethics to govern the cultural industries and their consumers. In order to provide a stepping stone to such enquiries, this paper aims at exploring the culture of English scanlation and the nature of its relationship with the industry through investigating the following three factors: first, the nature of the manga industry in Japan and beyond; second, the motives and ethics of scanlators; and finally, the industry's reaction to scanlation. This will be followed by a brief discussion of an agenda for future research.

2. Methodology

For this research, both literature review and empirical study were conducted. As there has been little writing on scanlation except for a few news reports, the author adopted some elements of the 'netnography' methodology devised by researchers who work on the online consumer community (Giesler and Pohlmann, 2003; Kozinets, 1997, 1998): this involved the examination of manga news websites and related forums, the analysis of scanlation groups' website texts and email interviews with selected scanlators. A sample of 120 English scanlation groups was randomly selected based on the index of 'active' scanlation groups at Baka-Update (<http://www.baka-updates.com/>), one of the most comprehensive websites indexing scanlation groups. By analysing the groups' websites, the author obtained basic information on scanlation. Then she selected a total of twenty-one scanlation groups seen as the most active and experienced for in-depth interview. Leaders of those groups were contacted, and nine scanlators were willing to be interviewed by email (see Table 1 below). They were asked to comment freely on questions about the following themes: a brief history of their involvement in scanlation, motives and rules, and scanlation's influence on the manga industry. Finally, the author interviewed six individuals working in the manga publishing industry in the UK, the US or Japan, and two comics journalists based in the US.

Table 1. Nine scanlators interviewed

Name (pseudonym)	Location	First scanlation	Genres	Other information
Adam	US	around	Various, mainly shonen	Stopped scanlating and currently working in the publishing

		2001	(manga for boys)	industry
Amy	US	around 2004	Dojinshi (fan books)	Age 28
Charlie	US	2003	Shojo	University student, Japanese major
Cindy	US	2001/2	Shojo (dedicated to a particular manga artist)	Age 22, Interested in working in a manga publishing company
Duke	US	2002	Various, mainly shonen, shojo & sports	Once offered a job by a manga publisher
Iris	US	2003	Shojo (manga for girls)	High school student
John	Austria	Around 2003	Shonen (dedicated to a popular, ongoing series)	Age 37
Peter	US	2001	Shonen, shojo, etc. (less popular series)	Age 25, webmaster
Tom	US		Action, shonen	College student, Japanese major

3. Manga Industry: An Overview

Manga is one of the most popular media in Japan. According to Kinsella (2000: 4), the best metaphor for manga is ‘air’: manga is almost everywhere and penetrates the everyday life of many ordinary Japanese. Although a decline in the market has been reported since the mid 1990s, manga still is a big business. As of 2005, the value of manga (books and magazines) sales was around 512 billion yen, which was almost 23% of total sales for published books of 2,195 billion yen (JETRO, 2006). Currently the industry is dominated by the three big publishers, Shueisha, Shogakukan and Kodansha (JMPA, 2007). Manga’s domestic market is large and mature. Readers are diverse in terms of age and interests, and their sophisticated and specified demands are satisfied by various niche manga in the form of weekly, biweekly, monthly, bimonthly or quarterly magazines as well as books.

One distinctive element of the industry is fans who are themselves amateur manga artists. These fans produce ‘dojinshi’, fan books often based on parodies of plots and characters in existing, popular manga titles. Their activities resemble those of *Star Trek* or *Dr Who* fans in the West. Since the 1980s dojinshi culture has found a great affinity with ‘slash literature’, part of *Star Trek* fandom (Penley, 1992). What distinguishes dojinshi from slash literature or science fiction fandom in the English-speaking world is the sheer number of the participants and the volume of the dojinshi trade. There are tens

of thousands of amateur manga circles in Japan and their biannual convention, Comic Market, attracts approximately 35,000 circles and more than 500,000 visitors (Birmingham, 2008). Nowadays dojinshi is also sold in mainstream bookshop chains. Another distinct feature of dojinshi culture is the 'ethics' that govern amateur artists, manga artists and publishers. In spite of its unauthorized borrowing from copyrighted materials, both manga artists and publishers tend to be tolerant toward these amateur artists. In return dojinshi artists work within boundaries which include an understanding that their work should be some sort of parody not a mere copycat (Kinsella, 2000: chapter 4; Lessig, 2004: 25-28; Mehra, 2002; Pink, 2007). Such an unspoken agreement between both sides seems grounded on the understanding that dojinshi functions as a bridge between producers and consumers and that without copying dojinshi cannot exist.

Recent years have seen a rapid growth in the popularity of Japan's manga particularly in Europe and the US. According to news reports, manga and their Korean cousins, manhwa, accounted for about half of European comic sales in 2005 (Hickley, 2005) and manga alone accounted for 70% of all comic sales in Germany in 2007 (Fishbein, 2007). The US has seen a noticeable growth of manga during the last ten years. The manga market in the US has virtually doubled every year and the UK is now mirroring this pattern (interview with two UK publishers, 2008). In 2006, seventeen out of twenty bestselling graphic novel titles in the US were manga (Book Publishing Report, 2007). In English-speaking territories, there are three key players: Viz Media, Tokyopop and Del Rey Manga. Viz Media, the publisher of the popular series *Naruto* and *Shonen Jump* magazine, is owned by three of Japan's largest publishers of manga and animation, Shueisha Inc., Shogakukan Inc. and Shogakukan Production Co., Ltd. Tokyopop is another English manga publisher operating in the US, the UK, Germany and Australia. Meanwhile, Del Rey Manga was launched in the US in 2004 when Random House, the publishing distribution arm of Bertelsman, entered into a publishing deal with Kodansha of Japan. Reflecting manga's huge potential, big global publishing houses have entered the manga business. Simon & Schuster, part of Viacom, entered a distribution deal with Viz. HarperCollins, a subsidiary of News Corporation, is collaborating with Tokyopop in publishing manga titles based on US novels and in distributing some of Tokyopop's

titles (Reid, 2006). In the UK, Gollancz, part of Orion Publishing Group, started publishing manga in 2005 and Random House created Tanoshimi, its own manga imprint, in 2006 (Horn, 2007). Meanwhile, Pan Macmillan became Tokyopop's sales and distribution partner in 2006.

In spite of globalization, the manga business is still based on language territories, and different manga publishers (licensees) are working in different territories. This means that there exists an inevitable time gap, from a few months to a few years, between the publication of manga in Japan and overseas and between different language territories. Even between the US and the UK there currently exists a few months' time difference. Another aspect of the global manga industry is the geographical gaps resulting from territories that lack publishers or distributors, which leads to 'grey importing', that is, booksellers importing manga directly from other countries, by-passing local publishers or distributors. One can also point out repertory gaps. If one looks at the huge volume and variety of manga published in Japan every week and every month, it is obvious that overseas publication of manga reflects only tiny section of the manga catalogues available in Japan.

4. Manga Scanlation as a Global Phenomenon

The geographical, repertory and time gaps found in the global manga industry disappoint enthusiastic manga fans outside Japan who have developed highly articulated tastes and, thanks to the Internet, are well informed of the latest news on manga in Japan, and often want to read the same manga available in Japan. The fans perceive those gaps as a problem which is intolerable but could be solved by their *own* efforts – scanlation. The development and wide diffusion of scanlation should be seen within the bigger context of a new and increasingly popular way of global consumption of Japanese cultural products. That is, overseas fans are willing to digitally copy, translate and distribute these products for other fans, particularly those who cannot access them due to geographical and linguistic barriers. For example, many Japanese animations or 'animes' are now digitally 'fansubbed' and popular light novels (an entertainment novel targeted at young adults, where the story is led by comic or animation characters) are

‘fan-translated’ (Hatcher, 2005; Leonard, 2005).

It is difficult to know when manga scanlation began although anecdotes suggest it might have been the turn of the century or slightly earlier. The number of scanlation groups has increased rapidly during the past few years. As of April 2008, the manga section of Baka-Update website lists approximately 1,300 manga scanlation groups. Among them, 648 groups are active: they have ‘released’ their work in the past six months. However, it should be noted that these sites list groups that primarily use English. If other language groups were included, the number would increase. According to the author’s survey of 120 active groups, they vary in size: from independent, individual scanlators to big groups which have fifty staff or members. Many groups focus on particular genres while also working on others. The manga ranges from currently ongoing, popular, series to lesser-known, non-mainstream titles. There are many groups and individuals who scanlate *dojinshi*. It appears that the scanlation community treats *dojinshi* as a legitimate part of manga and contributes to the promotion of *dojinshi* culture beyond Japan.

Although the majority of English scanlators are based in the US and thus are keen on manga licenses and releases in the US, scanlation projects themselves are an *international* collaboration. Not all sample groups reveal the nationality or geographical location of their members but, according to those who do, English scanlation groups involve members from European, Asian, South American and African countries. The following example shows the variety of nationalities among scanlation group members.

Group 1.15. US and France

Group 2.15. Britain and Russia

Group 3.20. Italy, Malaysia and Finland

Group 7.20. US, Canada, Philippines, Belgium, Britain and India

Group 17.10. US, Germany, France, Canada and Philippines

Group 19.15. US, Canada, Australia and France

Group 26.10. US, Singapore, Canada, Italy, Germany, UK, Netherlands, Brazil, South Africa, Vietnam and Malaysia

The scanlation process consists of various stages: getting ‘raws’; scanning; translating; proof reading; cleaning (taking out the Japanese text and removing grey areas); editing (inserting English text); quality checking; and releasing the scanlated version on the Internet. Independent scanlators do all these jobs themselves while one can see a clear division of labour in larger groups. One interesting finding is that most translators are native English speakers who learnt Japanese as their second or third language. This implies that scanlation is an activity driven by global manga fans rather than something initiated and led by domestic readers who want to communicate with fans outside Japan and improve their English skills.

5. Motives and Ethics of Scanlation

5.1. Motives of scanlators

Motives for scanlation range widely, but one thing scanlators tend to have in common is a strong, *missionary* zeal for *promoting* manga. The first and foremost motive is their love of, and passion for, manga. IRIS says that her group scanlates ‘just because [they] love manga’ and, once she started, she became ‘addicted’. As a hobby, scanlating gives PETER ‘a chance to relax...Zen moments...a wonderful feeling’. For AMY, who taught herself Japanese for the sole purpose of being able to read her existing collection of dojinshi, scanlation of often unknown dojinshi is her main, expensive hobby. Scanlators place great emphasis on the desire to ‘share’ their favourite manga and want to see the manga ‘reach a wider audience’ (ADAM, IRIS, PETER, TOM). Such enthusiasm for sharing looks anew when one considers the existing description of comic fan culture, which is based on differentiation from and alienation to newcomers or non-fans (Fiske, 1992; Pustz, 1999: xiii).

Some scanlators are devoted to particular artists and want to read and fully understand all of the manga their favourite artists have published in Japan. As the artists’ old and unknown works are not likely to be licensed in the English-language market, they see scanlation as the only way to make these manga widely accessible. In the case of popular, ongoing manga series which have already been licensed, barriers are more

about time lag rather than a lack of English translation. In this case, scanlation means ‘the fans can read its weekly chapters every Saturday or early Sunday just after its release in Japan’ (JOHN). However, such an approach is sometimes criticized by other scanlators, who see their job as being limited to scanlating *unlicensed* manga.

Sharing manga means creating and participating in a community of manga fans. ADAM, one of scanlation’s pioneers, found ‘a lot of enjoyment in posting a new chapter on [his] website and seeing the discussion it would generate on the forums’. For DUKE, being part of the community was a fundamental motive of scanlating. Scanlating is also seen as being good for learning skills such as Japanese, translation or editing skills (CHARLIE, IRIS, TOM). For many scanlators, achieving a high quality (‘to get the chapters and volumes done at the best quality possible in terms of graphics and translations’, JOHN) is a strong motive behind their hard work.

5.2. Ethics

Scanlators adopt distinct ethics, which are fundamentally different from those held by music file sharers. Peer-to-peer music file sharers tend to see music file sharing as gift-exchange on a reciprocal basis (Giesler and Pohlmann, 2003) and relate their activity to resistance against the commercialism of music business. Meanwhile, scanlators see using copyrighted manga as inevitable in their effort provide ‘provisional’ complements to those currently on offer by the industry. They say that their primary aim is to make a buzz about their favourite mangas and get them licensed, not to just get free manga. Evidently, scanlators are governed by their *own* code of ethics which consists of various elements, for example, their rationale or justification for their activities, widely shared rules and norms, and their views of the issue of copyright and licensed manga. Meanwhile, one should note that there exist various tensions between attitudes held by different groups, for example those working on unknown, unlicensed titles *vs.* those committed to popular, licensed series.

Not-for-profit principle

Scanlators firmly believe in the non-profit and voluntary principle. This is generally

translated into not making money out of scanlation, for example by charging fees to their readers. However it is common to see many groups welcoming donations (e.g., through Paypal) while others emphasize the full principle of being non-profit (e.g., group 24.15 says that it does not allow any sites that are supported by donations to host their projects).

Getting raws: ‘at least buying the original’

‘Raws’ refers to an original Japanese version of manga which is used for scanlation. There are a few ways to obtain raws: buying Japanese manga; or downloading scanned Japanese raws from English ‘raws websites’ or peer-to-peer file sharing websites in Japan. Many of the interviewees argue that buying Japanese manga and magazines and scanning them in is the best way because at least this would support manga artists in Japan and achieve high quality scans (AMY, IRIS and PETER). However, JOHN’s group, which is dedicated to an ongoing series, uses raws sites in order to get raws once a week. Nevertheless, JOHN owns the volumes of XXX in Japanese and some English prints.

‘We drop the project once it is licensed’ rule

Another influential norm is that when a manga is licensed its scanlation and distribution is stopped. Although there are groups who are not tightly bound by this norm, many participants tend to regard it as an important criterion that distinguishes scanlation from illegal file sharing. Scanlators are alerted about, and generally have a good knowledge of, license deals in the industry. In this context, they have a clear ‘sense of place and time’ in spite of their entire reliance on the Internet and digital technology for their work and communication. For example, one can easily come across various announcements of licence deals on scanlation websites: ‘[Four titles of manga series] have been licensed and translated by X, all rights are reserved to them. If they ask for those pages to be taken off they will be (Group 2.25). Once a manga has been licensed in the US, scanlators think their job is over and strongly suggest that their readers should buy licensed manga in order to support the artist and the industry:

‘If you liked these scanlations, please support the mangaka [manga artists] by buying their works!’ (group 7.20); ‘We are not trying to rip off the authors; in fact we have always encouraged readers to buy their own copy’ (group 2.20).

For them, scanlation is not an excuse for not buying the book but ‘*an incentive*’ to buying it (group 11.5, original emphasis). Those who scanlate old or less popular manga think their activity fits nicely into this rule as the manga they use is unlikely to be licensed in the US. However, the rule is sometimes criticized as being US-centric by fans outside the US, who rely on English scanlations to access manga.

The importance of ‘being credited’

While freely borrowing copyrighted manga, scanlators stress that ‘All rights of the manga belong to the authors and their respective copyright holders’ (group 7.70) for example through a disclaimer section at their website. As for scanlation *per se*, however, they tend to claim strong ownership and control. A scanlated manga normally has a ‘credits page’ at the beginning or end. This should remain intact when the scanlated manga is distributed through various ways including scanlation distribution and hosting sites. Similar rules apply to the ‘re-translation’ of English scanlators’ work into another language such as Spanish, Polish or Russian. For example, group 5.20 says,

ALSO it is **MANDATORY** that you [re-scanlators] credit us for the original work and link every translated scans back to us, please use the Credit logos that we've attached per chapter for this purpose and link your website back to us.

In some cases, English scanlation groups want their scanners, editors or translators to be independently consulted as they believe that those participants have the right to give permission, for example for scans of Japanese manga or the English translation itself. Meanwhile, there are groups who do not allow re-translation of their work for various reasons, ranging from the problems of ‘improper credits’, ‘multiple re-scanlation of a manga’ and ‘damaged integrity’ to the promotion of a self-help attitude. Scanlators’ strong sense of ownership over their work looks paradoxical considering their free use of copyrighted materials. Their identity seems to move between that of fans who borrow

copyrighted manga for personal use and that of cultural producers who are emotionally and artistically attached to their products and conscious of their audiences.

6. Scanlation and the Manga Industry

It is difficult to know how the Japanese manga industry perceives scanlation as there is little discussion on it apart from a few news reports. For some manga artists, the scanlation of their work into various languages could be a surprising experience. For example, when CINDY met her favourite manga artist to whose work her group is committed, the artist said that while she could not talk about scanlation's legalities and how the Japanese publishers might feel, she 'appreciated the exposure and was overwhelmed that there were so many fans...'. However, contrary anecdotes also exist: the scanlators interviewed have not been contacted by Japanese manga artists or publishers but some have heard about such a case, although they perceive it as exceptional. The interviewees in the US and UK manga industry have rarely discussed the issue of scanlation with Japanese artists or publishers. Some of them suggest that the Japanese manga industry is not too bothered with scanlation taking place in 'foreign countries' because it is facing bigger issues such as declining domestic sales. Recently, the issue of scanlation has gradually drawn attention as Japanese publishers are becoming keener on exploiting overseas markets. However the industry's attitude seems watchful. Rather than taking scanlation as a legal issue, it appears to see the scanlation boom as an indicator of an unfulfilled demand for licensed manga in foreign countries (IT Media News, 2007; interview with a Japanese manga seller). There also emerged an attempt to induce scanlation to legitimate manga business: the year 2007 saw Manganovel and Toshiba launching a website which allows readers not only to download Japanese mangas but also to scanlate them and offer the scanlations for sale (Business Wire, 2007).

The US and the UK manga industries are clearly aware of the existence of scanlation ('I know it's there') and regards it as illegal. However, interviewees from the industry tend to 'personally' acknowledge the fan culture aspects of scanlation, for example its individual and emotional nature. As an individual's hobby, scanlation is seen as

something the industry cannot simply manage to stop. Industry observers say that the US manga publishers are reluctant to take legal action as this might harm their fan base (Deppey, 2006; interview with two US comic journalists). Nonetheless, the industry wants the ‘stop the project once it is licensed’ rule to function effectively. When publishers license a particular title, they ask scanlation groups or distribution websites to drop the title. In general, such a request receives a positive response from the scanlation community though there are groups who are not willing to comply with the rule.

While acknowledging the ‘double edged’ nature of scanlation, both scanlators and the publishers do not see it as having any detrimental effect on the sales of manga. On the contrary, most interviewees believe that the success of scanlation as ‘a word of mouth’ and ‘community way of reading manga’ has helped certain manga series become licensed and released in the US. Similarly Dallas Middaugh, an associate publisher for Del Rey Manga once acknowledged that, when he was at Viz Media in 2001 and 2002, he was ‘following scanlations as a way of discovering new titles’ (Deppey, 2006). Steve Klechner, the then Tokyopop’s vice president of sales and distribution, supported this by saying that he found scanlation ‘flattering, not threatening’ and useful for sensing what the market wanted (Yang, 2004). Even for popular ongoing and licensed series such as *Naruto*, it is difficult to know if scanlation has had a harmful effect on their sales because ‘the series that are most scanlated have sold the best’ and ‘they are so popular that even people who are reading on scanlation would buy physical copies as well’ (interview with a UK manga distributor and a US manga editor).

Interestingly, the scanlation community and the manga industry share the opinion that the scanlation’s substitutability for licensed manga is low. They assume that fans who have already seen scanlated version of manga will still buy the books if available. It is in this context that both the scanlation community and the industry often compare scanlation to anime fansubbing saying that scanlating does not cause the same harm as fansubbing because fans still want to own the actual book. However, the recent development of the e-book industry, and particularly the growth of the e-comic book

business, as exemplified by the mobile comics boom in Japan² and the launch of Marvel Digital Comics Unlimited, implies that the landscape might change in the future (Glaister, 2007).

7. Agenda for Further Research

Manga scanlation succinctly demonstrates how fans outside Japan engage with Japanese popular culture in the age of globalization and digitalization and how considerable gaps exist between what the industry currently offers and what the fans demand. In many aspects it presents a unique dynamic in the industry-consumer relationship which needs to be further investigated. Despite their association with the elements of copyright infringement, scanlators' distinct motives, ethics and beliefs which, to some degree, are also recognized by the industry, have allowed their activity to position itself somewhere closer to fan culture than illegal file sharing. One hypothesis that could be deduced from the findings of this paper is that the global manga industry which relies primarily on Japanese artists and publishers is by nature different from other cultural industries. It might be heavily influenced by the 'culture' of the Japanese manga industry, where a strong fan culture flourishes and participatory fans' borrowing of copyrighted manga tends to be tolerated as can be seen in the case of dojinshi. Similarly, one could identify a proximity between the culture of scanlation and that of dojinshi.

Another hypothesis might be that scanlation is a temporary phenomenon occurring while the global manga industry is still in its infancy. By functioning as a market tester and a demand former, scanlation fills gaps which unavoidably exist in the process of the industry's early development but it might become less attractive as the industry matures and global manga publishing becomes concentrated and synchronized. In order to examine these hypotheses and their potential links, more empirical research needs to be conducted. In the meantime, the balancing act of scanlation between the interests of

² The Japanese e-comic market is fast growing. As of 2006 its value is 10.6 billion yen (including 8.4 billion yen for mobile comics) which accounts for 58% of the e-book market. <http://r.impressrd.jp/ecomic> (accessed on 10 August 2008).

publishers and consumers is likely to lead one to leave behind for a while those familiar debates around illegal file sharing and to deliberate on the possibility of a cultural industry developing its own ethics that are agreeable to and can practically be respected by both producers and consumers, however temporarily.

Acknowledgement

The author thanks the interviewees for their help and Professor Nobuko Kawashima and Dr Tanya Aplin for their constructive comments.

References

- Birmingham, L. (2008) 'Manga's Doe-Eyed Girls, Ninja Boys Woo U.S. Comic-Book Readers', Bloomberg News (22 January).
http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=20601080&sid=apcSQGNG_Ti8&refer=asia (accessed on 11 April 2008).
- Book Publishing Report (May 2007).
- Business Wire (2007) 'World's First Interactive Japanese Manga Web Service Creates Community of 'Reader-Translator' (1 October).
<http://www.panapress.com/newswire.asp?code=5542> (accessed on 10 August 2008).
- Copyright Research and Information Centre [CRIC] (2008) Copyright Law of Japan.
http://www.cric.or.jp/cric_e/clj/clj.html (accessed on 27 June 2008).
- Deppy, D. (2005) 'Scanlation Nation: Amateur Manga Translators Tell Their Stories', The Comics Journal, Number 269 (13 July).
- Deppy, D. (2006) 'Dallas Middaugh', The Comics Journal, Number 277 (11 July).
- Deutsche Welle (2002) 'Manga Girls versus Spiderman' (26 June). <http://www.dw-world.de/dw/article/0,2144,583423,00.html> (accessed on 16 June 2008).
- Deutsche Welle (2006) 'Japanese Manga Made in Germany' (8 November).
<http://www.dw-world.de/dw/article/0,2144,2230500,00.html> (accessed on 16 June 2008).
- Fishbein, J. (2007) 'Europe's Manga Mania', Business Week (26 December).
- Fiske, J. (1992) 'The Cultural Economy of Fandom', pp. 30-49 in L. A. Lewis (ed) *The Adoring Audience: Fan Culture and Popular Media*. London: Routledge.
- Giesler, M. and Pohlmann, M. (2003) 'The Anthropology of File Sharing: Consuming Napster as a Gift', *Advances in Consumer Research*, 30: 273-279.
- Glaister, D. (2007) 'Marvel Comics Puts Its Superheroes Online', The Guardian (14 November).
- Grossberg, L. (1992) 'Is There a Fan in the House? The Affective Sensibility of

- Fandom', pp. 50-65 in L. A. Lewis (ed) *The Adoring Audience: Fan Culture and Popular Media*. London: Routledge.
- Hatcher, J. S. (2005) 'Of Otakus and Fansubs: A Critical Look at Anime Online Light of Current Issues in Copyright Law', *Script-ed*, 2(4): 514-542.
- Hickley, C. (2005) 'Asterix Retaliates as Asian Comics Invade the European Market', *Bloomberg Report* (26 October).
<http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=10000085&sid=a6BN0d.7Ttr0&refer=europa> (accessed on 11 April 2008).
- Horn, C. (2007) 'Retailers "Miss out on Manga"', *The Bookseller* (7 September)
<http://www.thebookseller.com/news/44768-retailers-miss-out-on-manga.html> (accessed on 25 March 2008).
- IT Media News (2007) 'How is the World Enjoying Japanese Contents?' (世界は日本発コンテンツをどう楽しんでいるのか) (23 November).
<http://www.itmedia.co.jp/news/articles/0711/23/news006.html> (accessed on 10 August 2008).
- Japan External Trade Organization [JETRO] (2005a) *Cool Japan's Economy Warms Up*. http://www.jetro.go.jp/en/market/report/pdf/2005_27_r.pdf (accessed on 15 April 2008).
- JETRO (2005b) *Japanese Publishing Industry* (JETRO Economic Monthly, July).
http://www.jetro.go.jp/en/market/report/pdf/2005_42_r.pdf (accessed on 15 April 2008).
- JETRO (2006) *Japanese Publishing Industry* (JETRO Economic Report, October-November). http://www.jetro.go.jp/en/market/report/pdf/2006_25_r.pdf (accessed on 15 April 2008).
- Japan Magazine Publishers Association [JMPA] (2007) *Magazine Data 2007*.
http://www.j-magazine.or.jp/data_001/index.html (accessed on 10 August 2008).
- Jenkins, H. (1992) *Textual Poachers: Television Fans & Participatory Culture*. London: Routledge.
- Kelts, R. (2007) *Japanamerica: How Japanese Pop Culture Has Invaded the US*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kinsella, S. (2000) *Adult Manga: Culture and Power in Contemporary Japanese Society*. London: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Kozinets, R. V. (1997) "'I want to Believe": A Netnography of the X-Philes' Subculture of Consumption', *Advances in Consumer Research*, 24: 470-475.
- Kozinets, R. V. (1998) 'On Netnography: Initial Reflections on Consumer Research Investigations of Cyberculture', *Advances in Consumer Research*, 25: 366-371.
- Leonard, S. (2005) 'Progress against the Law: Anime and Fandom, with the Key to the Globalization of Culture', *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 8(3): 281-305.
- Lessig, L. (2004) *Free Culture: The Nature and Future of Creativity*. London: Penguin

Books.

- Macias, P. (2006) 'Fan Lift J-Culture over Language Barrier', *The Japan Times* (7 September).
- Mehra, Salil (2002) 'Copyright and Comics in Japan: Does Law Explain Why All the Comics My Kid Watches Are Japanese Imports?', *Rutgers Law Review*, 55: 155-204.
- Penley, C. (1992) 'Feminism, Psychoanalysis, and the Study of Popular Culture', pp. 479-500 in L. Grossberg, et al. (eds) *Cultural Studies*. London: Routledge.
- Pink, D. (2007) 'Japan, Ink: Inside the Manga Industrial Complex', *Wired*.
http://www.wired.com/techbiz/media/magazine/15-11/ff_manga (accessed on 23 March 2008).
- Pustz, M. (1999) *Comic Book Culture: Fanboys and True Believers*. Jackson, Mississippi: University Press of Mississippi.
- Reid, C. (2006) 'HarperCollins, Tokyopop Ink Manga Deal', *Publishers Weekly* (28 March).
- US Copyright Office (2007) 'Copyright Law of the United States'.
<http://www.copyright.gov/title17/> (accessed on 19 August 2008).
- Yang, J. (2004) 'Asian Pop Manga Nation: No Longer an Obscure Cult Art Form, Japanese Comics Are Becoming as American as Apuru Pai', *San Francisco Chronicle* (June 14).