# BIBLIOGRAPHIC COUPLING : AN EMPIRICAL STUDY OF ECONOMICS 

(Mrs) M.A. MUBEEN<br>Senior Assistant Librarian<br>Mangalore University<br>Mangalagangotri - 574199

The concept of bibliographic coupling developed by Fano and Kessler is empirically tested in two important sub-disciplines of Economics namely, Monetary Economics and Welfare Economics. All the pertinent research papers in these two subdisciplines from two journals viz; 'American Economic Review and 'The Economic Journal over a period of ten years have been culled and 45 pairs have been established to ascertain the coupling strength. The study shows that though there are slightly fewer number of citations in the journal 'American Economic Review', the coupling strength is higher and consistent than 'The Economic Journal. The tendency of researchers to refer or cite the relevant literature of the immediate past was also observed. This may be due to the fact that either the literature become out of date very quickly or the researchers may not be able to keep track of the entire literature that are being published in a particular discipline, though there are a few exceptions in the case of certain classic and outstanding research papers which are cited frequently. The coupling rate of the citations in American Economic Review has been found to be greater than The Economic Journal.

## INTRODUCTION

Citation indexing has become a popular device for retrieval and searching of scientific literature in a field of research. Citation indices are providing information scientists with useful materials for studying literature patterns, information generation, propagation, etc. All such activities are based on the hypothesis that between a citing item and cited set of items, there is a cognitive relationship linkage of some form. The underflying philosophy is that the citing item makes use of some piece of information contained in the cited items for some purpose relevant to the context and content of it.

One of the techniques frequently used in bibliometrics is citation analysis and during the last three decades there has been a burgeoning work in this area. A systematic citation study helps in measuring the degree of interaction among the researchers.

One of the major concepts of bibliometrics is bibliographic coupling which occurs when two research papers cite one or more common papers in their works. Fano [1] and Kessler [2] independently suggested that if two different documents referred to a common document, then they should have some sort of proximity or similarity in their approach or study. If the number of common citations for two different papers be multiple rather than single, their strength of coupling is said to be more, implying that their cognitive contents are much closer to each other. Kessler $[3,4]$ in a series of papers had further tried to establish the usefulness of this idea.

The notion of bibliographic coupling and its subsequent works have attracted attention of experts in bibliometrics and information analysis as an interesting area but have hardly taken off the ground. Martyn [5] states that "the main criticism is against the hypothesis that a common parental citation may be considered enough to ensure cognitive relationship". Sen and Gan [6] felt that the idea of bibliographic coupling should be theoretically elaborated and a general mathematical framework be evolved. Sharada and Sharma [7] recently carried out a study of bibliographic coupling in linguistic research by comparing the research papers published in an Indian journal vis-a-vis an American journal. In the present paper, an attempt is made to study the bibliographic coupling strength in the field of Economics.

## METHODOLOGY

The idea of bibliographic coupling was developed by M.M. Kessler in 1955 at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He proposed the idea of obtaining a matrix of conditional relevance measure for any two articles in the following ways:
(a) Establishing the coupling strength by identifying the common citations given in two papers, $x_{1}$ and $x_{1}$ in any field $m$ and denoting this coupling strength by $m\left[x_{i} \cap x_{j}\right)$
(b) Denoting the number of citations given in each of the articles $x_{1}$ and $x_{1}$ by $m\left(x_{i}\right)$ and $m\left(x_{i}\right)$ respectively;
(c) The bibliographic coupling strength between two papers, i.e.
$P_{i}$ is defined as $m\left(x_{i} \cap x_{j}\right) / m\left(x_{i}\right)$
and $m\left(x_{i} \cap x_{j}\right) / m\left(x_{j}\right)$

A modified version of Kessler's formula is proposed here for measuring the strength of bibliographic coupling between two papers which is as follows:

Let i and j be two papers from any field. Let $\mathrm{n}_{\mathrm{i}}, \mathrm{n}_{\mathrm{j}}$ and $r_{i \|}$ refer to the number of citations in the papers $\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}$ and the number of citations that are common to both i and j respectively. The bibliographic coupling strength or the coupling index $T_{i j}$ is given by the formula

$$
\begin{equation*}
T_{i j}=\frac{r_{i j}}{\left[n_{i} \times n_{j}\right]^{1 / 2}} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

For the comparison of two or more sets of documents on different topics on the basis of their citations and also the bibliographic coupling, the following procedure is suggested.

Let there be $N$ articles in a set and let $n$ be the number of citations in ith articles, where $i=1,2$, 3....N. The minimum and maximum number of citations per articles are found, in addition to the average and standard deviations.

The mean or average of citations is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{x}=\sum_{i=1}^{N} n_{i} / N \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

The standard deviation, which is a measure of variability in the data is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\alpha=\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{\left(n_{i}-\bar{x}\right)^{2}}{(N-1)}} \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Different sets of documents can be compared by evaluating and comparing these statistics.

The bibliographic coupling strength $T_{i j}$ can be computed for every pair in the set with the help of (1) for each of the $n_{c_{2}}$ where $n_{c_{2}}$ is the number of combinations of any two documents in a set of N documents.

## SAMPLE

For this study, two journals, namely, American Economic Review and The Economic Journal published by the American Economic Association (U.S.A.) and the Royal Economic Society (U.K.) respectively have been chosen. Research papers belonging to two sub-disciplines of Economics'Welfare Economics' and 'Monetary Economics' have been culled out from these two journals.

In each of these two areas ten research papers have been selected from each journal, thus, leading to a total of 40 research papers (Tables 1 and 2).

Table 1
List of articles selected for bibliographic coupling

## Subject : Monetary Economics

(a) Name of the Journal : The Economic Journal

| SI.no. | Author | Title | Vol. \& Issue no. | Year | No. of citations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Anderson, R.W. \& Danthine, J.P. | Higher diversity in future markets | 93 (370) | 1983 | 32 |
| 2. | Djajic, S. | Currency management \& economic stability | 94 (374) | 1984 | 29 |
| 3. | Marini, G. | Intertemporal substitution and the role of monetory policy | 95 (377) | 1985 | 20 |
| 4. | Cuddington, J.T. \& Vinals, J.M. | Budget deficits and the current account in the presence of classical unemployment | 96 (381) | 1986 | 30 |
| 5. | Dornbush, R. | Exchange rate economics: $1986$ | 97 (385) | 1987 | 43 |
| 6. | Fisher, S. | Recent developments in economics | 98 (391) | 1988 | 259 |
| 7. | Svensson, L.E. \& Wijabergen, S.V. | Excess capacity, monopolistic competition, and international transmission of monetary disturbances. | 99 (397) | 1989 | 22 |
| 8. | Jansen, D.W. | International substitution and the role of monetary policy: policy irrelevance once again | 100 (401) | 1990 | 18 |
| 9. | Miller, M, \& Weller, P. | Exchange rate bands with price inertia | 101 (409) | 1991 | 38 |
| 10. | Lee, K.C., Pesaran, M.H. \& Pierse, R.G. | Persistence of shocks and their sources in a multi-sectoral model of UK output growth | 102 | 1992 | 28 |

(Contd.)

Table 1 (..Contd.)
(b) Name of the Journal : American Economic Review

| SI. no. | Author | Title | Vol. \& Issue no. | Year | No. of Citations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Bradford, C. | The money supply announcement puzzle: review \& interpretation | 73 (4) | 1983 | 30 |
| 2. |  <br> Plosser, C.I. | Money, credit and prices in a real business cycle | 74 (3) | 1984 | 38 |
| 3. | Aizemman, J. \& Frankel, J.A. | Optimal wage indexation: foreign exchange intervention and monetary policy | 75 (3) | 1985 | 27 |
| 4. | Evans, G | A test for speculative bubbles in the Sterling-Dollar exchange rate-1981-84. | 76 (4) | 1986 | 48 |
| 5. | Frankel, J.A.\& Froot, K.A. | Using survey data to test standard proposition regarding exchange rate expectation | 77 (1) | 1987 | 33 |
| 6. | Boyle, W.G. \& Young, K.A. | Asset prices, commodity prices and money : a general equilibrium rational expectation model | 78 (1) | 1988 | 28 |
| 7. | Froot, K.A. \& Klemperer, P.D. | Exchange rate pass-through when market share matters | 79 (4) | 1989 | 38 |
| 8. |  <br> Hamilton, J.D. | Long swings in the Dollar: are they in the data and do the markets know It? | 80 (4) | 1990 | 48 |
| 9. | Alogoskoufis, G.S. \& Smith, R. | The Phillips Curve, the persistence of inflation and the lucas critique: evidence from exchange rate regimes | 81 (5) | 1991 | 49 |
| 10. | McLeod, D.W.B \& Malcomson, J.M. | Investments, holdup and the form of market | 83 (4) | 1993 | 42 |

Table 2
List of articles selected for bibliographic coupling

## Subject : Welfare Economics

(a) Name of the journal : The Economic Journal

| SI. no. | Author | Title | Vol. \& Issue no. | Year | No. of citations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Gordon, R.J. | Why U.S. wage and employment behaviour differs from that in Britain \& Japan | 92 (365) | 1982 | 60 |
| 2. | Kennally, G.F. | Some consequences of opening a Neo-Keynesian model | 93 (370) | 1983 | 23 |
| 3. | Kooiman, P. | Smoothing the aggregate fixprice model and the use of business survey data | 94 (376) | 1984 | 26 |
| 4. | Evans, G. | Bottlenecks and the Phillips Curve: a disaggregate Keynesian model of inflation, output \& unemployment | 95 (378) | 1985 | 25 |
| 5. | Matusz, S.J. | Implicit contracts, unemployment and international trade | 96 (382) | 1986 | 21 |
| 6. | Newbery, M.D. \& Stiglitz, J.E | Wage rigidity, implicit contracts, unemployment and economic efficiency | 97 (386) | 1987 | 14 |
| 7. | Burgers, S.M. | Employment adjustment in U.K. manufacturing | 98 (389) | 1988 | 29 |
| 8. | Dowrick-Steve | Union-oligopoly bargaining | 99 (398) | 1989 | 37 |
| 9. | Nickell, S. | Unemployment: a survey | 100 (401) | 1990 | 262 |
| 10. | Hendricks, W.E. \& Kahn, L.M. | Efficiency wages, monopoly unions and efficient bargaining | 101 (408) | 1991 | 25 |

Table 2 (..Contd.)
(b) Name of the journal : American Economic Review

| SI. no. | Author | Title | Vol. \& Issue No. | Year | No. of citations |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. | Bull, C. | Implicit contracts in the absence of enforcement and risk aversion | 73 (4) | 1983 | 25 |
| 2. | Miyazaki, H. | Internal bargaining, labour contracts and a Marshallian Theory of the firm | 74 (3) | 1984 | 25 |
| 3. | Shultz, C.L. | Micro economics efficiency and nominal wage stickiness | 75 (1) | 1985 | 39 |
| 4. | Kahneman, D., Kuetsch, J.M. \& Thaler, R. | Fairness as a constraint on profit seeking; entitlements in the market | 76 (4) | 1986 | 31 |
| 5. | Abowd, J.M. \& Card, D. | Intertemporal labour supply long-term employment contracts | 77 (1) | 1987 | 32 |
| 6. | Arnott, R., Hosios, A.J. \& \& Stiglitz, J. | Implicit contracts, labour mobility and unemployment | 78 (5) | 1988 | 32 |
| 7. | Brown, J.N. | Why do wages increase with tenure? On the job training and life-cycle wage growth observed within firms | 79 (5) | 1989 | 31 |
| 8. | Card, D. | Unexpected inflation, real wages and employment determinations in union contracts | 80 (4) | 1990 | 37 |
| 9. | Currie, J \& McConnell S. | Collective bargaining in public sector: the effect of legal structure on disputed costs \& wages | 81 (4) | 1991 | 38 |
| 10. | Cramption, P.C. \& Tracy, J.S. | Strikes and hold-outs in wage bargaining: theory | 82 (1) | 1992 | 25 |

From each set all the ten articles are considered in pairs and, thus, leading to 45 pairs. For every pair, $x_{1}, x_{j}$ and $T_{i j}$ were noted and calculated. The
details of these citations and couplings are given in Tables 3, 4, 5 and 6. Thereafter, the coupling index has been calculated using the formula (1).

Table 3

## Bibliographic coupling in Monetary Economics

(a) Name of the journal :The Economic Journal

| SI. no. | Couple | Ni | Nj | Rij | $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{ij}}=\left[\mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{ij}} / \sqrt{\left.N_{\mathrm{i}} \mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{j}}\right]}\right.$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1,2 | 32 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 2 | 1, 3 | 32 | 20 | 0 | 0 |
| 3 | 1,4 | 32 | 30 | 0 | 0 |
| 4 | 1,5 | 32 | 43 | 0 | 0 |
| 5 | 1,6 | 32 | 259 | 0 | 0 |
| 6 | 1, 7 | 32 | 22 | 0 | 0 |
| 7 | 1,8 | 32 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 8 | 1, 9 | 32 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 9 | 1,10 | 32 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 10 | 2, 3 | 29 | 20 | 0 | 0 |
| 11 | 2, 4 | 29 | 30 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 12 | 2, 5 | 29 | 43 | 1 | 0.028 |
| 13 | 2, 6 | 29 | 259 | 0 | 0 |
| 14 | 2, 7 | 29 | 22 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | 2, 8 | 29 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 16 | 2, 9 | 29 | 38 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 17 | 2, 10 | 29 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 18 | 3,4 | 20 | 30 | 0 | 0 |
| 19 | 3,5 | 20 | 43 | 0 | 0 |
| 20 | 3, 6 | 20 | 259 | 4 | 0.056 |
| 21 | 3,7 | 20 | 22 | 0 | 0 |
| 22 | 3, 8 | 20 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 23 | 3, 9 | 20 | 38 | 7 | 0.25 |
| 24 | 3, 10 | 20 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 25 | 4,5 | 30 | 43 | 0 | 0 |
| 26 | 4, 6 | 30 | 259 | 2 | 0.022 |
| 27 | 4,7 | 30 | 22 | 3 | 0.12 |
| 28 | 4, 8 | 30 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 29 | 4,9 | 30 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 30 | 4, 10 | 30 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 31 | 5,6 | 43 | 259 | 1 | 0.009 |
| 32 | 5,7 | 43 | 22 | 2 | 0.065 |
| 33 | 5,8 | 43 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 34 | 5,9 | 43 | 38 | 2 | 0.049 |
| 35 | 5,10 | 43 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | 6, 7 | 259 | 22 | 4 | 0.052 |
| 37 | 6, 8 | 259 | 18 | 5 | 0.052 |
| 38 | 6,9 | 259 | 38 | 0 | 0.07 |
| 39 | 6, 10 | 259 | 28 | 3 | 0.035 |
| 40 | 7, 8 | 22 | 18 | 0 | 0 |
| 41 | 7,9 | 22 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 42 | 7, 10 | 22 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 43 | 8, 9 | 18 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 44 | 8, 10 | 18 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 45 | 9, 10 | 38 | 28 | 0 | 0 |

Table 4
Bibliographic coupling in Monetary Economics
(b) Name of the journal : American Economic Review

| SI. no. | Couple | Ni | Nj | Rij | $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{ij}}=\left[\mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{ij}} / \sqrt{\left.N_{\mathrm{i}} \mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{j}}\right]}\right.$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1,2 | 30 | 38 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 2 | 1, 3 | 30 | 27 | 0 | 0 |
| 3 | 1,4 | 30 | 48 | 1 | 0.026 |
| 4 | 1,5 | 30 | 33 | 1 | 0.031 |
| 5 | 1,6 | 30 | 28 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 6 | 1,7 | 30 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 7 | 1,8 | 30 | 48 | 1 | 0.026 |
| 8 | 1,9 | 30 | 49 | 0 | 0 |
| 9 | 1,10 | 30 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 10 | 2, 3 | 38 | 27 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 11 | 2, 4 | 38 | 48 | 0 | 0 |
| 12 | 2,5 | 38 | 33 | 0 | 0 |
| 13 | 2, 6 | 38 | 28 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 14 | 2, 7 | 38 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | 2, 8 | 38 | 48 | 0 | 0 |
| 16 | 2,9 | 38 | 49 | 1 | 0.023 |
| 17 | 2, 10 | 38 | 42 | 1 | 0.025 |
| 18 | 3, 4 | 27 | 48 | 1 | 0.027 |
| 19 | 3, 5 | 27 | 33 | 0 | 0 |
| 20 | 3, 6 | 27 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 21 | 3, 7 | 27 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 22 | 3, 8 | 27 | 48 | 0 | 0 |
| 23 | 3, 9 | 27 | 49 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | 3, 10 | 27 | 42 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 25 | 4,5 | 48 | 33 | 5 | 0.125 |
| 26 | 4, 6 | 48 | 28 | 1 | 0.027 |
| 27 | 4, 7 | 48 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | 4,8 | 48 | 48 | 4 | 0.083 |
| 29 | 4,9 | 48 | 49 | 2 | 0.041 |
| 30 | 4, 10 | 48 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 31 | 5,6 | 33 | 28 | 0 | 0 |
| 32 | 5,7 | 33 | 38 | 1 | 0.028 |
| 33 | 5, 8 | 33 | 48 | 5 | 0.125 |
| 34 | 5,9 | 33 | 49 | 0 | 0 |
| 35 | 5, 10 | 33 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | 6, 7 | 28 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 37 | 6, 8 | 28 | 48 | 0 | 0 |
| 38 | 6, 9 | 28 | 49 | 3 | 0.08 |
| 39 | 6, 10 | 28 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 40 | 7, 8 | 38 | 48 | 1 | 0.023 |
| 41 | 7,9 | 38 | 49 | 0 | 0 |
| 42 | 7, 10 | 38 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 43 | 8, 9 | 48 | 49 | 0 | 0 |
| 44 | 8, 10 | 48 | 42 | 0 | 0 |
| 45 | 9, 10 | 49 | 42 | 1 | 0.022 |

Table 5
Bibliographic coupling in Welfare Economics
(a) Name of the Journal: The Economic Journal

| SI. no. | Couple | Ni | Nj | Rij | $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{ij}}=\left[\mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{ij}} / \sqrt{N_{\mathrm{i}} N_{j}}\right]$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1, 2 | 60 | 23 | 2 | 0.054 |
| 2 | 1, 3 | 60 | 26 | 2 | 0.051 |
| 3 | 1, 4 | 60 | 25 | 5 | 0.13 |
| 4 | 1,5 | 60 | 21 | 5 | 0.14 |
| 5 | 1,6 | 60 | 14 | 3 | 0.10 |
| 6 | 1,7 | 60 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 7 | 1,8 | 60 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 8 | 1, 9 | 60 | 262 | 7 | 0.056 |
| 9 | 1,10 | 60 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| 10 | 2, 3 | 23 | 26 | 3 | 0.122 |
| 11 | 2, 4 | 23 | 25 | 4 | 0.167 |
| 12 | 2, 5 | 23 | 21 | 0 | 0 |
| 13 | 2, 6 | 23 | 14 | 0 | 0 |
| 14 | 2, 7 | 23 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | 2, 8 | 23 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 16 | 2, 9 | 23 | 262 | 0 | 0 |
| 17 | 2, 10 | 23 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| . 18 | 3, 4 | 26 | 25 | 3 | 0.12 |
| 19 | 3, 5 | 26 | 21 | 0 | 0 |
| 20 | 3, 6 | 26 | 14 | 0 | 0 |
| 21 | 3, 7 | 26 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 22 | 3, 8 | 26 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 23 | 3, 9 | 26 | 262 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | 3, 10 | 26 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| 25 | 4,5 | 25 | 21 | 0 | 0 |
| 26 | 4, 6 | 25 | 14 | 0 | 0 |
| 27 | 4, 7 | 25 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | 4, 8 | 25 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 29 | 4,9 | 25 | 262 | 5 | 0.06 |
| 30 | 4, 10 | 25 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| 31 | 5,6 | 21 | 14 | 4 | 0.23 |
| 32 | 5, 7 | 21 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 33 | 5, 8 | 21 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 34 | 5,9 | 21 | 262 | 5 | 0.067 |
| 35 | 5,10 | 21 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | 6, 7 | 14 | 29 | 0 | 0 |
| 37 | 6, 8 | 14 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 38 | 6, 9 | 14 | 262 | 7 | 0.12 |
| 39 | 6, 10 | 14 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| 40 | 7, 8 | 29 | 37 | 3 | 0.09 |
| 41 | 7, 9 | 29 | 262 | 7 | 0.08 |
| 42 | 7, 10 | 29 | 25 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 43 | 8, 9 | 37 | 262 | 4 | 0.04 |
| 44 | 8,10 | 37 | 25 | 6 | 0.197 |
| 45 | 9, 10 | 262 | 25 | 7 | 0.086 |

Table 6
Bibliographic coupling in Welfare Economics
(b) Name of the Journal: American Economic Review

| SI. no. | Couple | Ni | Nj | Rij | $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{ij}}=\left[\mathrm{R}_{\mathrm{ij}} / \sqrt{N_{i} \times N_{j}}\right]$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1,2 | 25 | 25 | 4 | 0.16 |
| 2 | 1,3 | 25 | 39 | 5 | 0.16 |
| 3 | 1,4 | 25 | 31 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 4 | 1,5 | 25 | 32 | 3 | 0.11 |
| 5 | 1,6 | 25 | 32 | 6 | 0.21 |
| 6 | 1,7 | 25 | 31 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 7 | 1,8 | 25 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 8 | 1,9 | 25 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 9 | 1, 10 | 25 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 10 | 2, 3 | 25 | 39 | 5 | 0.16 |
| 11 | 2, 4 | 25 | 31 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 12 | 2,5 | 25 | 32 | 2 | 0.07 |
| 13 | 2, 6 | 25 | 32 | 3 | 0.11 |
| 14 | 2, 7 | 25 | 31 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | 2, 8 | 25 | 37 | 3 | 0.099 |
| 16 | 2, 9 | 25 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 17 | 2, 10 | 25 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 18 | 3, 4 | 39 | 31 | 3 | 0.086 |
| 19 | 3,5 | 39 | 32 | 5 | 0.14 |
| 20 | 3, 6 | 39 | 32 | 4 | 0.11 |
| 21 | 3,7 | 39 | 31 | 1 | 0.028 |
| 22 | 3, 8 | 39 | 37 | 3 | 0.08 |
| 23 | 3,9 | 39 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | 3, 10 | 39 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 25 | 4,5 | 31 | 32 | 3 | 0.09 |
| 26 | 4,6 | 31 | 32 | 2 | 0.06 |
| 27 | 4,7 | 31 | 31 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | 4,8 | 31 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 29 | 4,9 | 31 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 30 | 4, 10 | 31 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 31 | 5,6 | 32 | 32 | . 4 | 0.125 |
| 32 | 5,7 | 32 | 31 | 1 | 0.03 |
| 33 | 5,8 | 32 | 37 | 3 | 0.087 |
| 34 | 5,9 | 32 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 35 | 5, 10 | 32 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | 6,7 | 32 | 31 | 0 | 0 |
| 37 | 6, 8 | 32 | 37 | 1 | 0.029 |
| 38 | 6,9 | 32 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 39 | 6, 10 | 32 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 40 | 7, 8 | 31 | 37 | 0 | 0 |
| 41 | 7,9 | 31 | 38 | 0 | 0 |
| 42 | 7, 10 | 31 | 45 | 0 | 0 |
| 43 | 8,9 | 37 | 38 | 2 | 0.053 |
| 44 | 8, 10 | 37 | 45 | 1 | 0.024 |
| 45 | 9, 10 | 38 | 45 | 2 | 0.048 |

The statistical details pertaining to 'Monetary Economics' and 'Welfare Economics' have been ascertained individually for two journals. Table 7 gives a compendious picture of the statistical parameters which inter alia, give details for each subject the
minimum, maximum and average number of citations. The range of citations among the ten research papers and the dispersion of citations are measured with the help of standard deviation and mean deviation.

Table 7
Parameter patterns of citations per article

| Journal | Statistical parameters | Subjects |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Monetary Economics | Welfare Economics |
| The Economic Journal | Minimum citations | 18.00 | 14.00 |
|  | Maximum citations | 259.00 | 262.00 |
|  | Average citations | 51.90 | 52.20 |
|  | Standard deviation | 73.17 | 74.75 |
|  | Range | 241.00 | 248.00 |
|  | Mean deviation | 41.42 | 43.52 |
| American Economic Review | Minimum citations | 28.00 | 25.00 |
|  | Maximum citations | 49.00 | 45.00 |
|  | Average citations | 38.10 | 33.50 |
|  | Standard deviation | 8.48 | 5.74 |
|  | Range | 21.00 | 20.00 |
|  | Mean deviation | 6.93 | 4.70 |

Since some of the papers do not have common citations, a coupling rate is arrived at for each subdiscipline, separately,for both the journals by using the formula

Coupling Rate $(\mathrm{Cr})=.\frac{\begin{array}{l}\text { No. of pairs having } \\ \text { common citations }\end{array}}{\text { Total No. of pairs }} \times 100$
After calculating the coupling index for each pair, minimum, maximum and average indices were calculated for each sub-discipline in both the journals. These details are exhibited in Table 8.

## ANALYSIS

It would be obvious from Table 7 that research papers from 'The Economic Journal' tend to give more
number of average citations per paper than 'American Economic Review'. This has been due to the fact that in both the sub-disciplines of 'The Economic Journal' there has been a survey article which has reviewed the literature pertaining to both the sub-disciplines quite extensively, resulting in the high rate of average citations. The table also shows that the minimum number of citations appear in 'The Economic Journal' itself.

Further, the range of citations in all the four sets of research papers shows that there has been quite a huge range among the articles of 'The Economic Journal'. The range of papers appearing in 'American Economic review' is quite negligible.

When the subjects are compared, the trends are more or less same for both the journals. This is
due to the fact that both the sub-disciplines play an equally important role in the field of Economics (Table 8).

From Table 8, it is quite clear that the coupling rate is slightly higher for the journal 'American Economic Review' than 'The Economic Journal'. In both the sub-disciplines the rate of coupling has been higher for 'American Economic Review' than
'The Economic Journal'. There has been a high rate of $55.55 \%$ coupling in welfare economics and a low rate of $28.88 \%$ in monetary economics. A sharp contrast was noticed here, that though there are more number of citations in 'The Economic Journal' there has been a low rate of coupling exhibited among the citations of various pairs of research papers.

Table 8
Bibliographic coupling

| Journal | Subjects |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Monetary Economics |  |  | Welfare Economics |  |
|  | Bibliographic coupling index |  | Coupling rate | Bibliographic coupling index | Coupling rate |
| The Economic | Maximum | 0.25 | 28.88\% | Maximum 0.23 | 42.22\% |
| Journal | Minimum | 0.009 |  | Minimum 0.04 |  |
|  | Average | 0.068 |  | Average 0.103 |  |
| American | Maximum | 0.125 | 44.44\% | Maximum 0.21 | 55.55\% |
| Economic | Minimum | 0.022 |  | Minimum 0.024 |  |
| Review | Average | 0.051 |  | Average 0.091 |  |

Another interesting finding of the study is that throughout the citations, bibliographic coupling is observed among the papers of immediate past (Tables 3, 4, 5 and 6 ) which shows that majority of the researchers tend to refer the most recent literature for their study. It was observed in the study that most of the authors invariably referred to at least a few outstanding and classic research papers pertaining to each sub-discipline. There have been a few notable contributors like Azardio Costas, Barro Robert, Baily Martin in the field of welfare economics and Rudiger Dornbush, Robert Lucas, Stanley Fisher, Jeffery Frankel, Kenneth Froot and James Tobin in the field of monetary economics whose research papers have been frequently cited.

## CONCLUSIONS

The following observations can be drawn from this study :
(1) There has been very little to choose between the two journals from the point of view of number of citations, though the average citations are greater in 'The Economic Journal' due to the presence of survey articles. In fact, both the journals cite more or less in a similar fashion. The variability is less for 'American Economic Review' than 'The Economic Journal'. This is amply evidenced by the presence of high coupling rate in the journal ('American Economic Review').
(2) There have been a marginally higher number of citations in the discipline of monetary economics than welfare economics.
(3) A higher rate of coupling has been observed in the discipline of welfare economics than monetary economics in both the journals.
(4) Comparatively, a higher rate of variation can be observed in the discipline of welfare economics of 'The Economic Journal' and that of monetary economics in 'American Economic Review'.
(5) The range of citations is larger in the case of 'The Economic Journal' than 'American Economic Review' .

Bibliographic coupling provides to a great extent the relationship between a set of research papers pertaining to a field. This will certainly help the information seekers in searching the document and to a certain extent help in classifying the information.

It would be possible for a researcher to cover the area of his interest more comprehensively and systematically by refering to research papers having high coupling strength. Coupling index may also come in handy to compile special bibliographic materials.

## REFERENCES

1. FANO (R N). Documentation in Action. 1956. Reinholt; New York. pp. 238-44.
2. KESSLER (M M). Concerning some problems of inter science communication. 1958. Lincoln Lab. Group Report. pp. 35-45.
3. KESSLER (M M). An experimental study of bibliographic coupling between technical papers. IEEE Trans. PTGITIT-9; 1963; 43.
4. KESSLER (M M). Comparison of the result of bibliographic coupling and analytic subject indexing. Amer. Doc. 16; 1965; 223-33.
5. MARTYN (J). Bibliographic coupling. Jour. Doc. 20; 1964; 236.
6. SEN (S K) and GAN (S K). A mathematical extension of the idea of bibliographic coupling and its applications. Ann. Lib. Sci. Doc. 30; 1983; 78-82.
7. SHARDA (B A) and SHARMA (J S). A study of bibliographic coupling in linguistic research. Ann. Lib. Sci. Doc. 40; 1993; 125-137.
