1 **Bread Staling: Updating the View**

2

3 **C. Fadda[a], A. M. Sanguinetti[a], A. Del Caro[a], C. Collar[b], A. Piga[a]***

4

5 [a]Dipartimento di Agraria, Università degli Studi di Sassari, Viale Italia 39/A, 07100 Sassari,

6 Italy

7 [b]Cereal Group, Food Science Department, Instituto de Agroquímica y Tecnología de

8 Alimentos (CSIC), Avenida Catedrático Agustín Escardino 7, Paterna 46980, Valencia, Spain

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 The authors contributed equally to this work. All the authors do not have conflict of interests.

17

18 *Corresponding author: Prof. Antonio Piga, Dipartimento di Agraria, Università degli Studi

19 di Sassari, Viale Italia 39/A, 07100 Sassari – Tel and fax n. 0039 079 229272. *E-mail*

20 *address: pigaa@uniss.it*

21

22 Word count: 21517

23 **Running title: Bread staling review**

24

25

ABSTRACT: Staling of bread is cause of significant product waste in the world. We reviewed the literature of last 10 years with the aim to give an up-to-date overview on processing/storage parameters, antistaling ingredients, sourdough technology, and measurement methods of the staling phenomenon. Many researchers have been focusing their interest on the selection of ingredients able to retard staling, mainly hydrocolloids, waxy wheat flours (WWF), and enzymes, but different efforts have been made to understand the molecular basis of bread-staling with the help of various measurement methods. Results obtained confirm the central role of amylopectin retrogradation and water redistribution within the different polymers in determining bread-staling, but highlighted also the importance of other flour constituents, such as proteins and non-starch polysaccharides. Data obtained with thermal, spectroscopy, nuclear magnetic resonance, X-ray crystallography, and colorimetry analysis have pointed out the need to encourage the use of one or more of these techniques in order to better understand the mechanisms of staling. Results so far obtained have provided new insight on bread staling, but the phenomenon has not been fully elucidated so far.

List of chapters

67

68 **List of abbreviations**

69 ALG, sodium alginate; β-CD, β-cyclodextrin; BGF, β-glucan-rich fraction; BM, barley

70 flours; BR, ungerminated brown rice; CMC, carboxymethylcellulose; DATEM, mono or

71 diacylglycerols alone or esterified; DB, dough bread; D_{eff}, effective moisture diffusivity; DE,

72 dextrose equivalent; DF, dietary fiber; ΔH, enthalpy of melting; DMA, dynamic mechanical

73 analysis; DSC, differential scanning calorimetry; DTMA, dynamic thermomechanical

74 analysis; EPS, exopolysaccharides; FB, fully baked bread; FD, frozen dough; FFC, fast field

75 cycling; FPBFB, frozen part-baked French bread; FRF, fiber-rich fractions; FTIR, Fourier

76 transform infrared spectroscopy; FW, freezable water; GG, guar gum; GHP, gluten

77 hydrolysate; GO, glucose oxidase; ^{1}H NMR, hydrogen-1 nuclear magnetic resonance;

78 HPMC, hydroxypropyl methylcellulose; HPP, high-hydrostatic-pressure processing; K, k-

79 carragenan; KGM, konjac glucomannan; LAB, lactic acid bacteria; λC, λ-carrageenan;

80 MGL, fat-monoglycerides; MIR, middle-infrared spectroscopy; MRI, magnetic resonance

81 imaging; MTS, chemically modified tapioca starches; NIRS, near-infrared reflectance

82 spectroscopy; PB, par-baked bread; PBGR, pre-germinated brown rice; PCA, principal

83 component analysis; PGA, γ-polyglutamic acid; RVA, rapid visco-analysis; SAD, sponge-

84 and-dough baking method; SAXS, small-angle X-ray scattering; SEM, scanning electron

85 microscopy; SOM, self-organized map; SSL, sodium stearoyl lactylate; TA, texture analysis;

86 T_g, glass-transition temperature; T_g', T_g of the maximally freeze-concentrated state; Tgm,

1. Introduction

Bread stales and unfortunately it is a certainty and causes significant product waste all over the world (Collar and Rosell 2013). Staling results in loss of important sensory parameters of bread, like flavor and texture, and it is a consequence of a group of several physical-chemical changes occurring during bread storage that lead mainly to an increase of crumb firmness and loss of freshness (Kulp and Ponte 1981; Gray and Bemiller 2003). Although the staling mechanism has not been well established, the most important causes responsible for this alteration are starch transformation, starch–gluten interactions, and moisture redistribution (Schiraldi and Fessas 2001).

Bread staling is being continuously studied and researchers have been focusing their interest on mechanisms, factors and measurement, thus a huge body of literature is available, including a number of reviews and book chapters dealing with the different causes of bread staling and/or specific topics (Table 1). Most of the reviews and book chapters do not cover all aspects dealing with bread staling. A rather complete state of the art of molecular basis and most of the factors influencing the quality of bread, as well as of the main antistaling agents, has been, however, covered by Gray and Bemiller (2003), while reviews published later focused again only on specific aspects of bread staling, such as the influence of water, enzymes, frozen dough, and partially baked bread, waxy and high-amylose wheat starches and flours, sourdough, and analytical methodology (Table 1). More than 300 papers have been published in international peer-reviewed journals since 2003 on this topic, thus we

attempted to collect the most important literature to give a new and up-to-date picture on bread staling. In particular, this review will focus on new information regarding the following aspects of bread staling: processing/storage parameters, surface-active lipids, enzymes, carbohydrate ingredients, flours and other major ingredients, as well as new measurement methods and sourdough technology. The review will take into consideration only papers dealing with wheat bread and not with models such as diluted and concentrated starch pastes as well as gluten-free bread. In the case of papers dealing with the effect of different factors (such as storage temperature, ingredients, or ingredients of different origin), we use hierarchic considerations to select the proper section of discussion. Moreover, the reader has to refer to the literature previously reported and in particular to the paper of Gray and Bemiller (2003) and others that will be cited for more general information, molecular basis, and mechanisms of bread staling. As a general rule, only papers not cited by specific or general reviews, which will be reported in the proper sections, are discussed in this review. However, papers already cited in reviews, but not properly discussed with regard to bread staling will be reviewed again.

2. Main ingredients affecting bread staling

2.1. Flours

Flours other than wheat or deriving from amylose-free wheat flours (waxy) have been extensively studied during this last decade. The particular composition of some flours or the absence of amylose (with its role on staling) have been proposed in the production of mixed flour breads in order both to improve nutritional aspects and bread aging.

Non-wheat flours

It raises a great deal of recent interest that minor cereals, ancient crops and pseudocereals, besides wheat, constitute highly nutrient-dense grains with feasible breadmaking applications despite the poor viscoelasticity they exhibit when mixed with water.

Salehifar and Shahedi (2007) have confirmed earlier the beneficial effects found by Zhang and others (1998) using oat flour in reducing firmness of breads stored at room and chill temperature for up to 3 days, provided a maximum 20% oat flour substitution is accomplished, in order not to impart a strong bitter taste.

The ability of high β-glucan barley (HBGB) flour versus regular commercial barley (CB) to make highly nutritious wheat (WT) blended breads has been recently discussed (Collar and Angioloni, 2014a). Mixed breads obtained by 40 % replacement of WT flour by HBGB flours are more nutritious than those replaced by CB flours and much more than regular WT flour breads preserving the sensory acceptance and improving bread keepability during storage. The high content of β-glucan of barley flour has been described help in reducing the starch crystallization thus delaying significantly the staling rate of bread when used at the 20% level, even if it increased the firmness of fresh product (Gujral and others 2003). Moreover, when barley flour was used together with wet gluten and ascorbic acid they reduced both initial firmness and staling rate, especially when the higher level of the 3 additives was used. Purhagen and others (2008) proposed that water had a greater effect on bread staling as assessed by TA, with respect to amylopectin retrogradation measured with DSC, when normal or heat-treated barley flours (BM) were supplemented at 2 or 4% levels. In fact, although the retrogradation enthalpy of supplemented breads was higher than control breads, the firmness values of barley loaves were significantly lower during 7 days of storage at room temperature. However, the authors suggested that this effect could not be simply explained by the higher amounts of water in barley formulations, but by differences in the water-binding ability of flour formulations with BM or soluble fibers. Staling rate was retarded in

161 laboratory-produced breads by using pressure-treated barley flour, as well as waxy and pre-

162 gelatinized waxy barley starch at the 3% level (Purhagen and others 2011b). The best results

163 in retarding crumb firmness were found for pre-treated and pre-gelatinized additives, with

164 respect to the other formulations, including control bread, regardless of the storage time, even

165 if a higher amylopectin retrogradation was revealed. The authors explained this result with

166 the increased water retention during storage of substituted formulations. Unfortunately, they

167 did not manage to retard staling when the pre-gelatinized additives were used in an industrial

168 baking trial.

169 Vittadini and Vodovotz (2003) used thermal analysis to assess that soy flour may have a

170 role in modulating bread staling. Results indicated that replacing up to 40% of soy flour in the

171 bread formulation caused a significant decrease in amylopectin recrystallization as well as

172 promoted moisture retention during storage, with respect to control bread, thus leading to

173 decreased staling. Lodi and Vodovotz (2008) studied the effect of the partial substitution of

174 wheat flour with soy flour and the addition of raw ground almonds (5%). The incorporation

175 of almond increased the loaf specific volume of bread and reduced the crumb firmness

176 changes over a 10-day storage period, if compared to bread obtained with only soy, even if no

177 differences in amylopectin recrystallization rate or formation of amylose-lipid complexes

178 were detected between the 2 formulations. The authors postulated that the addition of almond

179 to soy flour probably resulted in a stronger interaction between proteins of wheat and soy,

180 favored by the high lipid content of almonds. On the other hand, the bread produced with

181 only soy staled at a lower rate than control bread, due to a better homogeneous water

182 distribution, as revealed by different thermal determinations and by MRI (Lodi and others

183 2007a,b).

184 Watanabe and others (2004) reported that substitution of wheat flour with powdered pre-

185 germinated brown rice (PBGR) was able to reduce the staling rate of bread stored for 3 days

at room temperature, with respect to both control formula and bread supplemented with ungerminated brown rice (BR). The replacement of 10% to 20% PBGR resulted in delayed staling with respect to BR sample, while 10% PGBR slowed starch retrogradation, compared to control loaves, but supplementation of 30% PGBR accelerated bread hardening. According to the authors, 10% PGBR addition enhanced softness of bread due to a certain amount of starch granules being gelatinized during PGBR production, while 30% supplementation led to accelerated staling owing to the high water content needed to obtain dough.

Mentes and others (2008) reported that substitution of wheat flour with ground flaxseed flour resulted in delayed staling of bread after 24 hours in storage, with respect to control all-wheat bread, as assessed by a mechanical penetration test, but the authors did not give any explanation of the probable causes. The best result was obtained by using 15% flaxseed flour.

Wu and others (2009) studied the effect of potato paste substitution at 5 to 30% on hardness evolution of bread during a 3-day storage period and found that staling decreased in 1-day stored samples obtained with 5% to 20% potato paste, with respect to control breads, and they associated this with the differences in water-binding capacities of potato paste and with interaction with starch, thus affecting starch retrogradation.

Begum and others (2010) evidenced that bread obtained with the use of 10% fermented cassava flour or 10% soy-fortified cassava flour was softer after 3 days at room temperature, with respect to wheat bread [Note: the authors did not make an explanation for this result and did not report the amount of soy used to fortify cassava flour].

In a recent paper (Angioloni and Collar 2011), the suitability of associated mixtures of minor/ancient cereals (rye, oat, Kamut® wheat, spelt wheat) and pseudocereals (buckwheat) was assessed in multigrain wheat flour highly replaced matrices. A quaternary blend of oat, rye, buckwheat and common wheat flours (20:20:20:40 w/w/w/w) without any additive

and/or technological aid in the formulation was proposed to make highly nutritious baked goods meeting sensory standards and exhibiting a low staling rate during ageing.

The quality profile of binary mixtures of oat–wheat (60:40 w/w), millet–wheat (40:60 w/w) and sorghum–wheat (40:60 w/w) was significantly improved in presence of some additives in terms of keepability during storage, mainly for oat–wheat blends which stale at a similar rate or even at lower rate than 100% wheat breads (Angioloni and Collar, 2013). Dilution up to 20% of the basic rye/wheat flour blend by accumulative addition of amaranth, buckwheat, quinoa and teff flours (5% single flour) did positively impact both bread keeping behavior during aging, and nutritional characteristics of mixed bread matrices (Collar and Angioloni, 2014b).

.

Waxy wheat flours

Most of the research work on flour has been focused, however, on the use of waxy wheat flours (WWF), because, due to its lack of amylose, WWF can reduce the initial phase of retrogradation (Graybosch 1998). A comprehensive review on the production and characteristics of WWF and waxy wheat starch (WWS) and their application for food processing is that of Hung and others (2006).

Baik and others (2003) suggested that the increased starch retrogradation of bread crumb, as assessed by DSC, may not be the cause of retarded staling during a period of 7 days in storage at 4 °C in bread obtained with double-null partial WWF, with respect to bread produced with hard red spring wheat flours. They proposed that the low amylose and high protein contents of the waxy lines were beneficial in retarding the increase in hardness. Peng and others (2009) reported that the use of 15% WWF combined with 2 other wheat flours was the optimal solution for retarding staling up to 6 days without impairing bread quality, as revealed by sensory analysis, if compared with the control. Data from Hung and others

(2007a) gave evidence of the relationship between the use of whole WWF and delayed staling. Breads made with 30 and 50% whole WWF substitution were softer up to 1 day in storage due to the higher amount of water absorbed by the dough as well as the high moisture content in breadcrumbs. In a further paper, the same authors (Hung and others 2007b) by using 100% whole WWF managed to delay staling of whole waxy bread up to 3 days by adding 40,000 U g^{-1} of cellulase, due to the particular pentosans present in the enzyme hydrolysate. Moreover, they obtained white WWF by removing the bran and germ, and the resulting breadcrumbs kept softer for 5 days, with respect to breadcrumbs from both the whole regular and whole waxy wheat, probably as a result of the enrichment of the amylopectin fraction of the white WWF. Park and Baik (2007) made a comparative test with wheat genotypes of wild type, partial waxy, and waxy starch, in order to study the influence of starch amylose content on French bread performance of wheat flour. Their study evidenced that wheat flours with reduced starch amylose content allowed the production of breads with better retained crumb moisture and delayed staling up to 48 hours of storage, probably because the greater crumb moisture resulted in a delay in amylopectin retrogradation, even if DSC analysis did not evidence significant differences in enthalpy values of the various wheat genotypes with different amylose content. Slowing the migration of water from the gluten phase to the starch phase by WWF (5-30%) has been hypothesized as the cause of diminution of firmness evolution, as determined with compression analysis (Mouliney and others 2011).

The low amylose content of flours obtained from 2 new Japanese wheat varieties was related to reduced staling of bread, especially in the first 48 h of storage at 20 °C, with respect to samples obtained with 2 representative bread wheat classes that are N. 1 Canada western red spring and hard red winter (Ito and others 2007). DSC data of enthalpy and X-ray patterns evidenced a slow retrogradation of starch gel in the bread obtained with the new varieties, thus accounting for their softer texture that resulted in softness and high cohesiveness of the

loaves. Apparently different results were found when replacing hard wheat flours with 15 to 45% with two hard WWF (Garimella Purna and others 2011). In fact, substitution led to softer bread, but only at day 1 after baking, while staling was not retarded during storage. The combination of less amylose and more soluble starch from amylopectin characterizing WWF could have resulted in a soft crumb structure on day 1 after baking, while after 7 days the bread was as firm as the control, due to a similar content of soluble starch, thus confirming a previous study (Ghiasi and others 1984).

Yi and others (2009) studied the effect of partial WWF substitution on staling of bread made from FD. They found that when modulating WWF and water amounts it was possible to reduce the staling rate, with respect to control formulations. The best combination was 45% WWF replacement and 65% water. By using pulsed hydrogen-1 nuclear magnetic resonance (^{1}H NMR) they concluded that bread with higher WWF content held more water and limited the movement of water from one domain to another.

Very recently, Lafaye and others (2013) obtained bread using waxy durum flour and concluded that this flour acted as a unique bread softener. The authors did not make any additional analysis in order to suggest a satisfactory explanation of the antistaling effect of this flour, however provided a well-described picture of the possible causes leading to the beneficial effect of waxy flour supplementation by summarizing literature results.

2.2.   Carbohydrates

A consistent research activity has been carried out during the last decade on the role of carbohydrate ingredients in reducing bread staling. Hydrocolloids, modified starches, dextrins, and maltooligosaccharides and other fibers will be covered in this section.

Hydrocolloids. The antistaling effect of hydrocolloids (Table 2) has been extensively

285   studied and attributed to controlling and maintaining the moisture content, stabilizing the

286   dough, and influencing the crust structure (Davidou and others 1996; Collar and others 1999;

287   Rojas and others 1999; Mandala and Sotirakoglou 2005; Mandala and others 2007; Rosell

288   and Gomez, 2007). Some interesting reviews focused on molecular structure,

289   physicochemical properties, and uses in food products of the whole class of hydrocolloids as

290   bread improvers (Kohajdová and Karovičová 2009) and more specifically of barley β-glucans

291   and arabinoxylans (Izydorczyk and Dexter 2008). A book chapter by Milani and Maleki

292   (2012) gives a classification of hydrocolloids and of their functions, according to

293   Hollingworth (2010).

294   The use of DSC allowed to establish that hydroxypropyl methylcellulose (HPMC) and k-

295   carragenan (K) decreased the retrogradation enthalpy of amylopectin, thus retarding staling of

296   part-baked breads produced with an interrupted baking process and frozen storage (Barcenas

297   and others 2003). The latter results were in part in contrast to what was reported previously

298   by Sharadanant and Khan (2003) who found a detrimental effect on bread firmness evolution

299   during storage of K-supplemented breads. In a later paper, Barcenas and Rosell (2005) gave a

300   more detailed explanation of the possible cause of the antistaling effect of HPMC. The

301   authors, in fact, determined the microstructure of bread crumb by cryo-SEM and found that

302   HPMC use resulted in gas cells with a more continuous surface and a thicker appearance,

303   with respect to the control. Thus, the presence of HPMC enfolded the other bread

304   constituents, with a consequent hindering of their interactions and avoided some of the

305   processes involved in bread staling. The HPMC was suggested as the best antistaling

306   ingredient also for Lavash flat bread made with 2 different wheat flours and stored for 48

307   hours (Tavakolipour and Kalbasi-Ashtari, 2007). Similar results on another flat bread, the

308   Barbari, have recently been reported by Maleki and others (2012) who found that

309   hydrocolloids other than HPMC, namely GG, XG, and CMC, reduced staling of bread up to 5

310 days, due to the limitation of water mobility that influenced the gelatinization process by

311 decreasing the ΔH, that was also reported by Ghanbari and Farmani (2013) who revealed a

312 significant antistaling effect of K, especially when supplemented at 0.5%. Mandala and

313 Sotirakoglou (2005) suggested that the use of XG and GG in fresh or microwave-heated

314 bread after frozen storage was able to retain water in the crumb and, consequently, moisture

315 migration to the crust, thus resulting in the crust to fail at greater deformation, that is, the

316 samples were less stiff. XG used at low concentrations, on the other hand, improved the

317 crumb viscoelastic properties on defrosted and microwave-heated samples, probably by

318 hindering the deteriorating effects and avoiding the development of a spongy structure during

319 frozen storage, as suggested by Ferrero and others (1993). Moreover, XG has been addressed

320 to retard amylose retrogradation, due to reduced amylose–amylose interactions. In 2 separate

321 papers the effect of 4 different hydrocolloids was studied, namely XG, GG, locust bean gum

322 (LBG), and HPMC on staling retardation of dough bread (DB), PB and full-baked (FB)

323 breads stored at chilling (Mandala and others 2007) or frozen temperature (Mandala and

324 others 2008) and finally re-baked (DB and PB). The crust puncture test and relaxation test of

325 the crumb revealed that XG addition resulted in a significantly less firm crust on PB and FB

326 breads after chilling storage, with respect to the other samples. X had also the more evident

327 effects on crumb viscoelastic properties, as revealed by relaxation tests, as it gave PB breads

328 with an elastic crumb, DB with a more viscous crumb, and FB breads with an even more

329 viscous crumb (Mandala and others 2007). In the case of frozen samples (Mandala and others

330 2008), XG supplementation was able to give a softer plastic crust, but only in PB breads, with

331 respect to control and other supplemented samples, probably due to the thickening effect on

332 the crumb walls associated with the air spaces that resulted in a less rigid structure. Finally,

333 the addition of XG to formulations allowed PB and FB breads to have a more elastic crumb

334 when compared to the other samples, thus revealing that this hydrocolloid is more efficient

against crumb deterioration in a FB product than in the DB, and highlighting a very different behavior from that found during chilling storage (Mandala and others 2007), in which FB breads presented a complete viscous and deteriorated crumb when hydrocolloids were used. Shittu and others (2009) reported that increasing the dosage of XG up to 2% resulted in a major hindrance of gluten-starch interaction in the presence of hydrocolloid molecules, thus conferring a significantly higher softness to fresh composite cassava-wheat bread. They also reported that crumb hardening and moisture loss followed a linear sequence up to the 1% XG level, which, thus, was proposed as the optimum concentration to reduce both phenomena, even if the 2% XG level best estimated the crumb firming rate. Shalini and Laxmi (2007) investigated the effect of 4 different hydrocolloids, HPMC, GG, K, and CMC on textural characteristics of Indian chapatti bread stored at ambient or chilling temperature and evidenced that 0.75% w/w supplementation of GG gave the softest bread and decreased the loss of extensibility up to 2 days in storage at both temperatures, with respect to the control. The authors suggested that GG has a softening effect, probably by an inhibition of the amylopectin retrogradation, prevention of water release, and polymer aggregation during refrigeration, as well as interference during interchain-amylose association. In a further paper, Shalini (2009) gave more explanations on the effects of GG on staling parameters and found that moisture, water-soluble starch and in vitro digestibility enzyme contents in GG incorporated chapatti were higher than in the control chapatti at both storage temperatures. Smitha and others (2008), on the other hand, working with another flat bread, the unleavened Indian parotta, found that supplementation of hydrocolloids (gum arabic, GG, XG, CMC, and HPMC) resulted in delayed staling 8 hours after baking, with respect to non supplemented breads. HPMC gave the best results in terms of reduction of hardness, while XG was judged by panelists as the best for preserving sensory attributes like softness and chewiness. Angioloni and Collar (2009a) proposed the viability of LBG and CMC blended with

360 oligosaccharides, at a medium-high substitution level, as very valuable sources of dietary

361 fiber (DF) for the baked goods with both "healthy" characteristics and extended shelf-life,

362 due to reduced staling. These conclusions were drawn after modeling the crumb firming

363 kinetics parameters obtained during storage with the Avrami equation. Moreover, good

364 relationships between the main parameters obtained with the different physical analyses

365 (small dynamic and large static deformation methods, viscometric pattern, and image

366 analyses) performed on raw materials and intermediate and final products were found. The

367 effect of ALG and konjac glucomannan (KGM) supplementation at 0.2 and 0.8% w/w flour

368 basis was studied in terms of staling behavior of Chinese steamed bread by Sim and others

369 (2011) who reported that the higher supplementation dose of both hydrocolloids resulted in a

370 significantly lower staling rate up to 4 days, with respect to the control bread, probably

371 because of the hindering effect of gums on macromolecular entanglements thus causing

372 starch recrystallization delay. Wang and others (2006) studied the effect of gluten hydrolysate

373 (GHP)/λ-carrageenan (λC) ratio on the increase in the bread crumb firmness during storage

374 and proposed that the changes occurring in the amorphous part of the starch, when a

375 concentration of 0.5% GHP/γC was used in the product formulation, thus significantly

376 delaying bread staling.

377   The use of hemicelluloses has been the topic of different studies during the last 10 years.

378 A penetrometric test revealed that supplementation of 0.3, 0.5, or 0.7% hemicelluloses

379 (extracted from buckwheat) increased the penetration depth of the crumb after 72 h of storage

380 at 30 °C, thus delaying crumb hardening, and resulted in bread with an higher specific

381 volume than the control during a 3-days storage period. The best results were in the order

382 0.5>0.3>0.7% both for hardness and volume (P=0.01) (Hromádková and others 2007).

383 Symons and Brennan (2004) reported that a β-glucan-rich fraction (BGF) extracted from

384 barley and incorporated at 2.5% into a bread formulation reduced crumb staling after one day

385 in storage, as detected by TA, but they did not formulate any explanation of the causes [Note:

386 the discussion of data on firming is not exhaustive, as the authors did not explain neither the

387 rate of staling, nor highlighted that there were no significant differences in firmness between

388 control and BGF-supplemented bread]. The BGF gave, moreover, breads with lower volume,

389 confirming previous results (Gill and others 2002). Jacobs and others (2008) gave interesting

390 new knowledge about the influence of bread production on bread quality when fiber-rich

391 fractions (FRF), enriched β-glucans, and arabinoxylans from hull-less barley were used.

392 They, while confirming the results of Symons and Brenan (2004), found that supplementation

393 of FRF (12% on flour basis, corresponding to 2.5 g of arabinoxylans and β-glucans per 100 g

394 of flour) and Xyn within the sponge-and-dough (SAD) baking method, improved the loaf

395 volume, appearance, and crumb structure and resulted in crumb hardness and staling rate

396 similar to that of the control bread, while other baking methods (Canadian short process,

397 remix-to-peak) gave negative results [Note: the main part of the paper deals with a

398 comparison of the 3 baking methods by using a 20% on flour basis supplementation and the

399 authors concluded that the quality of the 20% FRF-enriched SAD bread was equal to or better

400 than the remix-to-peak bread, but they neither presented a statistical comparison between data

401 of the 2 baking methods, nor did they explain why they evaluated the impact of lower FRF

402 addition only with the SAD method]. Skendi and others (2010) studied the supplementation

403 of 2 wheat flours differing in bread making quality (poor and good) with two different-

404 molecular-weight barley β-glucan isolates (at 0%, 0.2%, 0.6%, 1.0%, and 1.4% w/w on a

405 flour dry weight basis) and found that the crumb hardness of β-glucan supplemented breads,

406 measured after 24 h of storage, decreased with its increasing level up to reaching a minimum,

407 and then with a reverse trend, however the values were always lower than the control bread, if

408 we ignore one sample. Moreover, the antistaling effect was more pronounced up to 8 days in

409 storage when the higher-molecular-weight β-glucan isolate was used in both flour types. The

410   authors proposed that the beneficial effects found could be ascribed either to the higher water

411   retention capacity and a possible inhibition of the amylopectin retrogradation of β-glucan, as

412   already suggested (Biliaderis and others 1995), or to the increase of the total area of gas cells.

413   An increase in bread firmness with respect to control wheat formulation was, on the other

414   hand, found by Hager and others (2011) after addition of oat β-glucan, suggesting that this

415   increase in hardness might be ascribed to the increased water-binding capacity of the

416   polysaccharide, thus hindering the development of the gluten network. They also evidenced a

417   consistent increase in staling after the addition of the fat replacer inulin, thus confirming

418   previous results (Wang and others 2002; O'Brien and others 2003; Poinot and others 2010)

419   and in part in agreement with the study of Peressini and Sensidoni (2009) who used 2

420   commercial inulin products, with lower (ST) and higher (HP) degrees of polymerization, to

421   supplement 3 different wheat flours, moderately strong (MS) and weak (W), and found that

422   the ST inulin addition to MS flour significantly increased the volume and lowered bread

423   firmness, with respect to the control. The authors hypothesized that a delayed starch

424   gelatinization during baking, due to the presence of 12% solutes, and the significant reduction

425   of dough water absorption of ST inulin, may explain this result. The beneficial effect of inulin

426   gel at 2.5% flour basis on increasing the loaf volume and maintaining the hardness value,

427   with respect to a control bread, was also reported by O'Brien and others (2003). In a very

428   recent paper the antistaling effect of substitution of wheat flour with barley flour (28%, 56%,

429   and 84%) or β-glucan (1.5%, 3.0%, and 4.5%) on chapatti bread was assessed by DSC

430   (Sharma and Gujral 2014). Storage at 4 °C for 24 h induced retrogradation in baked

431   chapatties, as revealed by the increase in ΔH, but it was concomitantly reduced up to 44 or

432   64% when β-glucan or barley flour was used, respectively. The authors proposed that barley

433   flour supplementation increased the levels of soluble as well as insoluble DF, with an

434   increased water absorption and change of the nature of the starch and protein, thus preventing

435 better the staling of chapatties, with respect to loaves obtained with only β-glucan alone, as

436 suggested by Purhagen and others (2012).

437 The use of pectin slowed crumb hardening in bread that was part-baked and stored at

438 chilling (PB) or sub-zero (PBF) temperatures for variable times (Rosell and Santos 2010).

439 The authors also revealed that PBF pectin-supplemented breads showed a similar hardening

440 trend, with respect to their conventionally baked counterparts, as also demonstrated by using

441 the Avrami equation. Correa and others (2012) reported that the incorporation of high-

442 methoxyl pectin at 1 or 2% resulted in protection with respect to staling, especially when salt

443 was used in the formulation, as it reduced the hardness values with respect to the control

444 sample, as well as maintaining the chewiness. They proposed that the improved specific

445 volume of high-methoxyl pectin-supplemented bread, which gave both a more cohesive and

446 more resilient crumb with a different alveolus structure, which was the main reason for

447 retarded staling.

448 A certain interest during the last years has been focused also on an animal hydrocolloid,

449 chitosan, a nonbranched linear homopolymer obtained from shrimp and other crustacean

450 shells. Chitosan is a water-soluble cationic polyelectrolyte, while most of the other

451 polysaccharides are neutral or negatively charged at acid pH. In a first paper of Kerch and

452 others (2008), addition of 2% chitosan resulted in increased staling rate of bread, and the

453 author, through DSC analysis and SEM, suggested an increase in water migration rate from

454 crumb to crust and in dehydration rate both for starch and gluten and a prevention of

455 amylose-lipid complexation in breads supplemented with chitosan.

456 In a following paper, Kerch and others (2010) proposed and analyzed, with the aid of

457 mechanical and DSC measurements, the main possible mechanisms leading to staling in

458 breads obtained with supplementation of different chitosan and chitosan oligosaccharides.

459 They confirmed that staling was the result of 2 independent processes, the first during the first

460   two days of storage depended on changes in the organization of starch polymer chains, later

461   on it was caused by loss of water by gluten. They suggested also that chitosan increased the

462   firming rate during the first stage due to its ability to bind lipids and prevent amylose-lipid

463   complexation, while in the second stage it was enhanced dehydration of gluten due to its

464   water-binding ability. In their work, however, they found that both chitosan oligosaccharides

465   and low-molecular-weight chitosan decreased significantly the staling rate, if compared to

466   middle-molecular-weight chitosan, and they hypothesized that low-molecular-weight

467   substances inhibited crosslink formations between starch granules and protein fibrils which,

468   in turn, are responsible for staling. Later on, Kerch and others (2012a) demonstrated with

469   DSC that when chitosan was used in bread production by the straight-dough or the sponge-

470   and-dough method it accelerated or slowed down the decrease of bound water content during

471   the first stage of staling, respectively, thus delaying or accelerating staling during the first 2–3

472   days of storage (first stage of staling). In a further paper they showed that supplementation of

473   ascorbic acid to chitosan-enriched bread resulted in a more pronounced decrease of water

474   content during baking in fresh bread compared to the control bread (Kerch and others 2012b).

475

476   **Modified and damaged starches**. The use of modified starches for retarding staling has

477   been suggested since the 1990's, for their ability to influence amylopectin crystallization

478   (Inagaki and Seib 1992; Yook and others 1993; Toufeili and others 1999). Due to the fact,

479   however, that other linear fractions of starch may affect retrogradation, an increased interest

480   has been registered on cross-linked starches, due to their ability to increase the gelatinization

481   temperature, setback viscosity, and decrease the transition enthalpy of gelatinization (Zheng

482   and others 1999; Woo and Seib 2002). A well-focused review on this topic has been

483   published by Myiazaki and others (2006).

484   According to Leon and others (2006), the content of damaged starch directly influences

485 bread staling through the increase of amylopectin recrystallization, as detected by DSC

486 analysis. The authors concluded that the limited use of damaged starch is a key factor to

487 control the quality of fresh bread and of its shelf-life, in contrast to what was reported earlier

488 by Tipples (1969). In a paper of Miyazaki and others (2008) chemically modified tapioca

489 starches (MTS), but with different degrees of modification, have been used to retard staling in

490 breads obtained from FD, which was subjected to one freeze-thaw cycle and one-week frozen

491 storage. Highly MTS retarded significantly the increase in firmness during 3 days of storage,

492 thus confirming the results of previous papers, due to the slow retrograding rate of

493 amylopectin.

494

495 **Dextrins and maltooligosaccharides**. Dextrins are the product of starch hydrolysis and,

496 since bread staling has been attributed partly to its retrogradation, shortening the starch chain

497 length, as obtained with particular α-amylases, results in reducing the rate of staling.

498 Miyazaki and others (2004), using DSC, found that among 6 different dextrins (dextrose

499 equivalent 3-40) used at 20%, those with low molecular weight (DE 19, 25, and 40) at 2.5%

500 of substitution retarded retrogradation, as revealed by the ΔH of retrograded amylopectin, but

501 did not delay staling during 3 days of storage. They postulated that the antistaling mechanism

502 following addition of dextrin differed from the retarding effect of dextrin produced by Am, as

503 already reported (Akers and Hoseney 1994; Morgan and others 1997). They also highlighted

504 that retrogradation is not related to water mobility in crumbs, as assessed by the

505 determination of water activity. An interesting study involving the use of TPA, XRD, and

506 DSC reported that the use of β-cyclodextrin (β-CD) resulted in retardation of bread staling

507 during 35 days of storage at 4°C, as changes of some TPA indexes (hardness, cohesiveness,

508 and springiness) were reduced (Tian and others 2009). Data on hardness were fitted with the

509 Avrami equation that evidenced a significant reduction of the rate constant (k), while

510   increasing the Avrami exponent, thus suggesting a retarded crumb-firming kinetic for β-CD-

511   supplemented bread. Moreover, data of XRD showed a delay in changes of crystalline

512   patterns occurring in crust and crumb and this retardation was attributed to a complex

513   amylose–lipid β-CD, as observed by DSC, that resulted in transformation of nucleation type

514   and lowered rate of bread staling.

515   Jakob and others (2012), studied for the first time, the beneficial effects of different

516   fructans produced by acetic acid bacteria on the texture of bread. Out of 21 strains tested, 4 of

517   them were able to produce high amounts of exopolysaccharides (EPS), as detected by HPLC

518   analysis, which elicited, when supplemented at 1-2% of flour basis, significantly the increase

519   in bread volume and retarded the hardness increase of crumb up to 1 week of storage, the

520   highest differences being observed after addition of 2% sugar polymer from *Neoasaia*

521   *chiangmaiensis*. The authors proposed that the functional properties of the tested EPS were

522   due to their hydrocolloid character, allowing a high water retention, and due to interactions

523   between polysaccharides and other dough components like gluten and starch, thus influencing

524   the final structure of the baked product. They, moreover, compared effects of EPS to HPMC.

525

526   **Other fibers**. In this section the effect of dietary fiber (DF) other than previously defined

527   hydrocolloids and dextrins on bread staling will be reviewed. According to the Codex

528   Alimentarius Commission, DF are "Carbohydrate polymers with more than 10 monomeric

529   units, which are not hydrolyzed by the endogenous enzymes in the small intestine of humans"

530   (ALINORM 09/32/26 2009). Recently dough properties of bread enriched with DF have

531   been reviewed and the reader is redirected to this paper for the aspects dealing with the

532   interaction of this component in dough development and bread baking (Sivam and others

533   2010). Fibers investigated during this last decade are of cereal or noncereal origin.

534   Maeda and Morita (2003) proposed the polishing of soft wheat grain from the outer layer

535   in increments of 10% of total weight to obtain flours with a high content of pentosans and

536   damaged starch. In particular, both water-soluble (WSP) and water-insoluble pentosans

537   (WISP) from the inner part of the wheat grain were added to the conventional flour and their

538   effects on loaf volume and bread staling were assessed. The results indicate that both

539   pentosans gave an increase in loaf volume and a significant decrease in staling up to 3 days in

540   storage, with respect to the control bread. The authors presumed that the high viscous and

541   gelling properties of WSP may improve the strength of gluten and the retention of gas

542   generated in the dough.

543   Mandala and others (2009) studied the effect of different ingredients (hydrocolloids,

544   polydextrose, oat flour, inulin, and commercial shortening) on crust firmness and crumb

545   elasticity of breads obtained after thawing and baking of FD (at sub-zero temperatures for 1

546   week) and PB breads, and found that inulin was the best of them in reducing bread crust

547   firmness, probably due to a better moisture redistribution, even if fresh sample had the firmer

548   crust.

549   Gomez and others (2003) found that the use of fibers of different origin (cellulose, cocoa,

550   coffee, pea, orange, and wheat), while increasing the crumb firmness of fresh bread with

551   respect to the control, reduced its evolution during 3 days of storage, and they postulated that

552   this effect may be attributed to the already demonstrated water-binding capacity of fiber,

553   which in turn reduced water loss during storage, as well as the probable interaction between

554   fiber and starch, resulting in the delay of starch retrogradation. The best effect in delaying the

555   bread staling was noticed after 2 days by using a short-length wheat fiber.

556   Collar and others (2009) found a positive effect on reducing staling rate during 16 days of

557   storage of breads enriched with 2 kinds of cocoa fiber, as assessed by hardness and chewiness

558   fitted with the Avrami equation, when increasing the dose of addition up to 6%, especially

when the formulation was supplemented with alkalinized cocoa-soluble fiber, while over-dosage resulted in a staling rate similar to that of the control breads.

Zhou and others (2009) correlated the reduction of starch retrogradation after X-ray measurements and application of the Avrami model with increasing levels, from 1 to 5%, of tea polysaccharide, which was able to reduce the slope of the staling rate up to 9 times, with respect to the control. The authors also found that the magnitude of bread staling retardation strongly depended on the type of wheat flour used.

Addition of butternut fiber at 10g/kg of flour decreased the staling rate of bread after 7 days of storage, as measured by compressibility, DSC, and digital image analysis (Pla and others 2013). The authors clearly showed that fiber extracted from the peel resulted in a drastic reduction of the firmness value, suggesting a retardation of amylopectin retrogradation, more air occluded (cell area 100/total area), same number of particles (alveolus or gas cells) per square centimeter, and higher mean size of particles, with respect to the control bread. The authors concluded that the particular composition of fiber extracted from peel, that is presence of lignin, less-branched pectin chains, and significant higher protein content than the other butternut fiber used, may have accounted for the results obtained.

2.3. Lipids and shortenings

The role of surface-active lipids and shortenings has been well described by Gray and Bemiller (2003), and later on by Kohajdova and others (2009), thus we will report briefly the new knowledge not or only partially covered by these 2 reviews focused mainly on the use of mono or diacylglycerols alone or esterified (DATEM).

Collar (2003) suggested that individual and/or binary supplementation of fat-monoglycerides (MGL) and sodium stearoyl lactylate (SSL) to bread dough positively

584   influenced the level of the pasting parameters assessed by RVA (peak viscosity, pasting

585   temperature, and setback during cooling) that are associated with a significant delay in bread

586   firming. Moreover, she does not recommend binary use of MGL/carboxymethylcellulose

587   (CMC) and SSL/CMC, as the antagonistic effects of the pair gum/surfactant resulted in a

588   nullification of the benefits exerted by the individual emulsifiers.

589   Ribotta and others (2004a) evidenced the beneficial effect of DATEM on retarding crumb

590   firming at 4 and 20 °C aging temperature of bread from both non frozen and FD, and they

591   supposed that the formation of complexes with amylose and amylopectin inhibited the staling

592   phenomenon. Sawa and others (2009) studied the effects of a wide range of purified saturated

593   and unsaturated MGL at different concentrations on the crumb firmness evolution during

594   bread storage and reported that the use of C16:0 and C18:0 and cis- and trans- C18:1 resulted

595   both in a lower crumb firmness, even if depending on the baking process used, and in delayed

596   bread staling, when compared to control bread. They suggested the interaction of MGL with

597   amylose and amylopectin as the main cause of the obtained results. Manzocco and others

598   (2012) proposed that a particular system morphology, as assessed by proton density/mobility

599   using magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), was generated in bread in which palm oil was

600   replaced with a MGL-sunflower oil-water gel. The morphology change resulted in a 81%

601   reduction in bread fat content as well as in a delay in bread staling during storage. The

602   incorporation of the gel resulted, in fact, in a reduced proton density/mobility in comparison

603   with standard formulation, thus it was concluded that the physical architecture of the lipids

604   used in the formulation could contribute to modulate the retrogradation rate. Smith and

605   Johansson (2004) reported that the increase of solid fat of a shortening containing fully

606   hydrogenated soybean oil was able to delay bread staling and they suggested that saturated

607   triacylglycerols acted in a similar way as saturated monoacylglycerols, that was an interaction

608   with amylopectin. Mnif and others (2012) proposed a new biosurfactant obtained by *Bacillus*

609 *subtilis* as antistaling agent and compared it to soy lecithin. The bioemulsifier

610 supplementation significantly reduced the bread staling over an 8-day period, depending on

611 its amount, and the maximum decrease of staling rate was obtained with a 0.05%

612 biosurfactant addition, which was also the dose that resulted in the highest bread specific

613 volume. The authors suggested that the slower firming may be ascribed to the capacity of the

614 emulsifiers to form a complex starch-emulsifier, which in turn delayed wheat starch

615 crystallization. Additionally, the biosurfactant reduced the susceptibility to microbial growth

616 during bread storage.

617

618 **2.4.   Minor ingredients affecting bread staling**

619   The functional effects on fermentation and bread baking of whey protein and casein have

620 been reported by Erdoghu-Arnozcki and others (1996). Casein and whey, together with

621 sodium alginate (ALG) and k-carragenan (K) were used in an attempt to improve the quality

622 of FD, specifically to retard its quality loss during freezing time and after 3 freeze-thaw

623 cycles (Yun and Eun 2006). Bread made with milk proteins and hydrocolloids were softer

624 after 4 days in storage, with respect to control bread, probably because of better moisture

625 retention and improved emulsification of these ingredients. Similar results were obtained in a

626 later paper of Shon and others (2009).

627   Addition of juices to wheat bread formulations have been proposed to ameliorate its

628 nutritional profile (Batu 2005), as sweeteners and color enhancers, and to increase volume

629 and extend shelf-life (Matz 1989). Lasekan and others (2011) postulated that the high

630 concentration of monosaccharide of the pineapple juice concentrate used at a 1.5% level in

631 the formulation of white bread interfered with protein-starch interaction and delayed staling,

632 but only after one day of storage. Sabanis and others (2009) studied the effect of

633 supplementation (at 50% level sucrose substitution) of 2 types of raisin juices, concentrated

634 and dried on evolution of crumb firmness of bread obtained with both bread wheat and durum

635 wheat. The dried juice decreased the wheat starch gel rigidity and retrogradation for the

636 presence of glucose and fructose, thus resulting in reduced staling after 2 days of storage,

637 with respect to control loaves, especially when durum wheat flour was used.

638 Tomato pomace has been suggested as a good source of hydrocolloids and was thus

639 proposed (0, 1, 3, 5, and 7%) for flat bread production by Majzoobi and others (2011b), who

640 detected delayed bread staling up to 4 days of storage at 25 °C in tomato-pomace

641 supplemented bread, with respect to control sample, due to the concomitant increase in

642 volume and moisture content and decreased starch retrogradation.

643 Surface coating treatments have been patented for improving the quality of bakery

644 products (Lang and others 1987; Lonergan 1999; Hahn and others 2001; Jacobson 2003;

645 Casper and others 2006, 2007). The main advantages proposed for glazing were the

646 improvement of flavor and appearance. The moisture barrier exerted at the surface of baked

647 products allows retaining and aiding dough expansion during baking, thus resulting in a

648 reduction of surface defects, improvement of color, and higher baked volume. Recently,

649 however, other beneficial effects of glazing have been described. Jahromi and others (2012)

650 studied the effect of different glazing treatments, including natural substances, polyol, sugar,

651 and hydrocolloids on the staling rate of breads stored up to 12 days. Increased moisture and

652 reduction of water movement have been addressed as the main causes of delayed staling by

653 different glazing ingredients, mainly, water, egg yolk, propylene glycol and starch, while at

654 intermediate storage periods (2, 5, and 8 days) also other glazing substances significantly

655 retarded the increase in crumb firmness, with respect to control bread.

656 Chin and others (2012) focused their work also on crust behavior following different

657 glazing applications. Glazing with cornstarch, skim milk, and egg white were able to reduce

658 the rate of moisture loss in bread crumb during 6 days of storage, thus reducing the staling

659 rate of glazed bread, with respect to the control. Moreover, glazing resulted in an increase in

660 crust firmness, although the moisture content of the crust increased, probably because the rate

661 of moisture migration from crust to the surrounding atmosphere could be lower with respect

662 to that from the crumb to the crust region.

663 Sodium chloride impact on bread staling has recently been well reviewed and ascribed

664 mainly to the increased gas retention effect of dough with NaCl that allows an increase in

665 crumb porosity and a consequent decrease in crumb firmness (Beck and others 2012a). The

666 retrogradation effect ascribed to Na+ inclusion in starch molecules during storage of bread

667 has been suggested as delaying staling (Beck and others 2012b). In particular, a decrease in

668 bread staling following the decrease in NaCl levels was shown. Furthermore, a linear

669 relationship between rheofermentometer data, bread volume, and crumb firmness was

670 demonstrated, thus suggesting that the quality of bread could be predicted by gas release

671 measurement.

672

673 **3. Enzymes**

674 The role of enzymes on bread staling has been one of the preferred topics during this last

675 decade and along with quite recent reviews (Haros and others 2002; Butt and others 2008;

676 Goesaert and others 2009), an important number of papers have appeared, which will be

677 discussed. Apart from the effects of amylases, an increasing interest in transglutaminase, a

678 protein modifier enzyme and other non-starch polysaccharide-modifying enzymes has been

679 recorded.

680

681 **α-amylases and transferases**. The action of α-amylases in reducing bread staling has

682 been the topic of numerous studies (Gray and Bemiller 2003), and different ways of action

683 have been proposed. The paper of Goesaert and others (2009) provided new knowledge on

684 the α-amylase mode of action and its antistaling activity. In particular, they found that the

685 maltogenic α-amylase from *B. stearothermophilus* degraded significantly the outer

686 amylopectin branches, thus producing amylopectin chains that are too short to crystallize. The

687 result was the prevention of a "permanent" (based on amylopectin crystallites junction zones)

688 amylopectin network, thus staling was delayed. Maeda and others (2003) proposed that a

689 particular thermostable mutant, α-amylase (M77), purified from *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* F

690 increased the specific volume of the bread and improved the softness of bread crumb, when

691 compared to the commercial exo-type α-amylase Novamyl (NM). They also showed that

692 softness evolution of breadcrumb during storage was not correlated with thermostability. Rao

693 and Satyanarayana (2007) found that the addition of α-amylases produced by *Geobacillus*

694 *thermoleovorans* to wheat flour improved the fermentation rate and decreased the viscosity of

695 dough, while increasing the volume and texture of bread, moreover, it also increased its shelf-

696 life by retarding staling, with respect to control sample, but they did not give any explanation

697 of this beneficial effect. Jones and others (2008) managed to develop a new maltogenic α-

698 amylase from *Bacillus sp.* TS-25, formerly *B. stearothermophilus*, which increased thermal

699 stability and the possibility to work at acidic pH values that are typical of sourdough and rye

700 breads. Kim and others (2006) reported that the addition of a fungal α-amylase to polished

701 flour resulted in an improvement of gas cell distribution and softness of breadcrumbs and

702 delayed staling, without lowering the loaf volume with regard to control bread made with

703 hard wheat flour.

704 Blaszczack and others (2004) studied the effect of 2 α-amylases, one of fungal and the other

705 of bacterial origin, on the texture and microstructure of bread. The two α-amylases resulted in

706 different microstructure of bread, with respect to control bread, as revealed by light SEM,

707 thus staling was delayed. The authors proposed distinct antistaling mechanisms for the two α-

708 amylases.

709   **Xylanases**. Xylanases (Xyns) are enzymes able to retard bread staling, as reviewed by

710   Butt and others (2008), to which the reader is redirected.

711   A recombinantly produced Xyn B (XynB) from *Thermotoga maritima* MSB8 retarded the

712   staling of frozen PB bread (Jiang and others 2008). When added to the formulation the

713   resulting bread had a 40% reduction in crumb firmness and retarded staling, as bread

714   supplemented with XynB after 4 days of storage at 4 °C had the same firmness as control

715   bread after 1 day of storage. Data obtained with DSC analysis showed that XynB was able to

716   retard amylopectin crystallization. Recently, Zheng and others (2011) found the right dosage

717   to be used for two GH 10 Xyns, a psychrophilic (XynA from *Glaciecola mesophila*) and

718   mesophilic one (EX1 from *Trichoderma pseudokoningii*), with the aim to retard bread staling.

719   Both Xyns exhibited similar anti-staling effects on the bread, but while XynA proved to be

720   more effective in reducing the firming rate, the EX1 performed better in reduction of the

721   initial bread firmness. The optimal dosage of the psychrophilic Xyn was much lower than that

722   of the mesophilic counterpart, probably because the temperatures used for dough preparation

723   and proofing were in the range of optimum activity of psychrophilic XynA, as otherwise

724   reported (Collins and others 2006).

725   Recent results of the application of a thermostable enzyme cocktail from *Thermoascus*

726   *aurantiacus* showed an antistaling effect (Oliveira and others 2014). The main enzyme found

727   on the cocktail was Xyn, xylose being the main product released through enzyme activity

728   after prolonged incubation, and its application at 35 Units of Xyn/100 g significantly delayed

729   staling of bread up to 10 days at 4 °C if compared to control loaves. On the basis of DSC

730   results (lower enthalpy) it was suggested that products deriving from Xyn activity interfered

731   with the reorganization of the amylopectin and/or with the redistribution of water in the

732   system, with a consequent retrogradation reduction. Recently Ghoshal and others (2013)

733   suggested that the reduction of crystallization and reduction of crystal growth in bread, as

734 assessed by using n and k parameters of the Avrami equation, was caused by Xyn addition in

735 whole-wheat bread stored at 4 and 25 °C for 10 days, thus resulting in delayed staling.

736 Measurement of thermal properties confirmed the beneficial effects of Xyn, as it lowered the

737 endothermic peak for staling and the change of enthalpy during storage, with respect to

738 control bread.

739

740 **Enzyme mix**. The difference in mode of action of the various enzymes has been used

741 recently by several authors, which depended on additive or synergistic effects in order to

742 retard staling.

743 Leon and others (2002) studied the effects of 2 commercial enzyme mixtures containing

744 α−amylase and lipase activity on staling rate. Both mixtures helped in slowing down the

745 staling rate, especially the blend with the higher α−amylase activity. The beneficial effect

746 was attributed to a delay in amylopectin retrogradation and to the formation of amylose-lipid

747 complexes, both revealed by DSC analysis.

748 The use of a microbial transglutaminase (protein-glutamine γ-glutamyl transferase, Tgm),

749 which catalyzes the formation of ε-(γ glutamyl-)-lysine crosslinks in proteins via an acyl

750 transfer reaction (Motoki and Seguro 1998; Larre and others 2000), has received a great deal

751 of interest. Tgm with or without added amylolytic (maltogenic bacterial α−amylase in

752 granulate form (NMYL)) or non amylolytic (PTP) had beneficial effects on hardness

753 evolution of bread obtained with white (Collar and Bollain 2005) and whole-meal flour

754 (Collar and others 2005). Bread softness was reduced up to 16%, with respect to control

755 bread, when interactive effects were tried, and the best combination was the addition of

756 NMYL to Tgm breads, ascribing this effect to the relevant softening effect of NYML.

757 Gambaro and others (2006) proposed that the addition of a mixture of α−amylase and

758 Xyn was able to extend the shelf-life of brown pan bread by retarding staling, as assessed by

759 sensory and instrumental analyses. They suggested that the mixture produces low-molecular-

760 weight dextrins with high water retention capacity, and that could be partly responsible for

761 the lower staling rate. Moreover, they found a high correlation between both sensory and

762 instrumental parameters and staling rate.

763 Caballero and others (2007) studied the single and synergistic effects of some gluten-

764 crosslinking enzymes (Tgm, glucose oxidase, and laccase), and gluten-degrading enzymes

765 (α−amylase, Xyn, and protease) on bread staling. They found that α−amylase, Xyn, and

766 protease were able to lower significantly the staling effect promoted by Tgm and proposed

767 different mechanisms of action for each enzyme. In particular, they suggested that α−amylase

768 and Xyn could have an effect on the dough polysaccharide fraction, while the protease may

769 counteract Tgm-action, by a simultaneous action on the dough protein fraction.

770 Waters and others (2010) proposed that the highest Xyn and α−amylase activities of 5

771 thermozyme cocktails with different hydrolytic enzyme profiles produced by *Talaromyces*

772 *emersonii* resulted in delayed staling. The enzyme cocktail B was the best in reducing crumb

773 hardness evolution after 5 days of storage, with respect to control bread.

774

775 **Others**. The oxidizing effect of glucose oxidase (GO) was exploited for retarding staling

776 of bread (Bonet and others 2006). When used at a concentration of 0.001%, GO delayed

777 significantly the bread staling up to 12 days at 25 °C. The antistaling effect suggested was

778 due to the large amount of total pentosans produced by GO that can associate with the

779 glutenin macropolymer, thus leading to retain of high amounts of water.

780

781 **4.Associated mixtures of ingredients and/or enzymes**

782 In this section we will summarize the results of the main studies dealing with ingredients

783 and/or technological aids not included in the previous classes or combinations of different

784   ingredients. An interesting review on shelf-life improvement of polyols, to which the reader

785   is redirected, has recently been published (Bhise and Kaur 2013).

786   Wang and others (2007) reported that, when 1% of wheat gluten hydrolysate was used,

787   the hardness value of 3-days-old bread was equivalent to that of 1-day-old control bread,

788   probably for the higher, even if not significantly, specific volume and moisture content of

789   wheat gluten hydrolysate -supplemented sample.

790   Abu-Goush and others (2008) found a beneficial effect of sodium-propionate in delaying

791   staling of Arabic flat bread and correlated this result to moisture loss, starch retrogradation,

792   and protein interaction effects, as revealed by near-infrared spectroscopy data.

793   Shaikh and others (2008) tested 8 different antistaling agents on unleavened chapatti

794   bread and measured various staling parameters such as moisture content, texture, water-

795   soluble starch, in vitro enzyme digestibility, enthalpy change and sensory quality during 10

796   days of storage, at 4 and 29 °C. When comparing the effect of the added ingredients the

797   authors found that maltodextrin had the highest rank at both temperatures, while the worst

798   result was exerted by glycerol monostearate, following the order maltodextrin> GG>

799   α−amylase>sorbitol> XG> SSL> propylene glycol> glycerol monostearate. Moreover, when

800   trying 6 combinations, SSL + Am gave the best texture values, suggesting that α-amylase

801   first breaks starch molecules, and then SSL forms the complex with fragments derived from

802   starch rupture.

803   The lowest amylopectin retrogradation of soy milk powder was addressed as the cause of

804   delayed staling rate in wheat-soy bread (Nilufer-Erdil and others 2012). This result was

805   attributed to the synergistic effect of soluble fiber and partly denatured soy proteins and

806   higher lipid content of the soy milk powder. The delay of staling was confirmed by Instron

807   firmness measurements, although loss moduli revealed by dynamic mechanical analysis

808   (DMA) did not give significant differences of stiffness among formulations, contrary to what

809   had been reported previously by Vittadini and Volovodtz (2003).

810   Jekle and Becker (2012) studied the effects of pH adjustment, water, and sodium chloride

811   addition in order to model bread texture and staling kinetics of bread crumb. By using the

812   Avrami equation and the firming rate, which gave a better square correlation coefficient, the

813   authors managed to predict the staling rate as a function of pH, NaCl, and water addition. In

814   particular, they found an increase in the firming rate with increased NaCl concentration and

815   pH reduction and a decrease when water was added to the dough, probably as the change in

816   the volume of bread had a better influence on the staling rate, with respect to the effect of the

817   chemicals, since the literature well correlated the specific volume of breads with the firming

818   rate (Axford and others 1968; Russel 1983).

819   The addition of γ-polyglutamic acid (PGA) at 3 concentrations (0.5, 1.0, and 5.0 g kg^{-1},

820   w/w) was suggested by Shyu and others (2008) to evaluate its effect on staling of wheat

821   bread. The hardness value of the 6-day 1.0 kg^{-1} PGA stored bread was less than the value of

822   control bread after 1 day, thus PGA significantly reduced staling rate, as also demonstrated by

823   the decrease in cohesiveness, which was significantly delayed by the PGA addition.

824   Response surfaces and mathematical models were used by Gomes-Ruffi and others

825   (2012) to show the beneficial effect of the contemporary addition of SSL and of the enzyme

826   maltogenic α-amylase (MALTO) on both the increase of bread volume and the reduction of

827   firmness, especially after 10 days of storage, when the combination of 0.50 g SSL/100 g flour

828   and 0.02 g MALTO/100 g flour resulted in the same firmness value as the control at day 1 of

829   aging. The authors suggested that SSL formed complexes with starch molecules, while

830   MALTO reduced the molecular weight of the starch molecules, thus reducing retrogradation.

831   Pourfarzad and Habibi-Naiaf (2012) used the positive results in changing the hardening

832   rate of Barbari bread obtained with an antistaling liquid improver, made up of glycerol, SSL,

833   and enzyme-active soy flour, at different amounts, to test the consistency of 11 new

834 mathematical staling models. They found that all models presented high values, the best

835 being the rational and the quadratic, thus concluding that these models are suitable to

836 simulate staling kinetics. The best improver formulation contained 1.27% glycerol, 0.41%

837 SSL, and 1.59% enzyme-active soy flour.

838 The plasticizing effect of the sorbitol on starch/gluten biopolymers has been described by

839 Pourfarzad and others (2011) as the main reason of anti-staling effect of soy-fortified bread

840 for storage times longer than 2 days and up to 5 days. The same effect was found also for

841 propylene glycol when used at 5 g/100 g flour.

842

843 **5. Processing factors affecting staling rate**

844 Researchers have focused their attention during the last 10 years mainly on baking

845 technology, process parameters, and storage temperature, but other factors will also be

846 reported.

847

848 **5.1. Storage temperature**

849 The effect of storage temperature on staling has been reported by different authors, and

850 the main characteristic is a negative dependence between staling rate and temperature

851 (Colwell and others 1969).

852 The consumer request to have ''fresh'' bread available at any time of the day (Matuda

853 and others 2005) has stimulated the bakery industry to exploit freezing technology and this

854 has driven researchers to focus their attention mainly on effects of freezing and frozen storage

855 on bread staling, especially on dough and par-baked (PB) samples.

856 A comprehensive picture up to 2008 on the effect of raw material requirements,

857 processing conditions, and baked bread quality from frozen dough (FD) and PB bread are

858 reviewed by Rosell and Gomez (2007), Selomulyo and Zhou (2007), and Yi (2008), to which

859 the reader is redirected.

860 Carr and others (2006) carried out a sensory comparison between frozen part-baked

861 French bread (FPBFB) and fresh bread during a week of frozen storage with daily

862 inspections. The FPBFB had a lower weight and specific volume, with respect to fresh bread,

863 but was rated better after 4 days of frozen storage by a consumer acceptance test (difference

864 from control test) with respect to commercial brand bread. Moreover, data on texture and

865 sensory analysis of FPBFB stored for a week were similar to that of fresh bread. Frozen

866 storage of PB chappati, a Indian unleavened flat bread, was beneficial for maintaining its

867 quality (Gujral and others 2008). In particular, the extensibility of par-baked chapatti after

868 rebaking was very similar to that of the fresh conventionally baked sample. The main feature

869 was that sample of PB bread stored at ambient temperature or frozen (after thawing and

870 rebaking), showed a significant higher extensibility when compared to the same sample of

871 conventionally baked chapatti breads, thus giving loaves with better sensory quality than

872 frozen conventionally baked chapatties. Yi and Kerr (2009) highlighted the influence of

873 freezing rate (rate 1:15 °C/h, rate 2:33°C/h, rate 3:44 °C/h and rate 4:59 °C/h), dough storage

874 temperature (-10, -20, -30, and -35 °C) and storage duration on bread quality. They found that

875 sample frozen at the lower freezing rates and stored at the higher temperatures had higher

876 specific volume, were softer, and were lighter in color, but staled more easily, due probably

877 to the higher damage to the starch-gluten network at slower freezing rates (Yi 2008). They

878 noted that response of gluten structure and yeast activity to freezing rate and temperature

879 should be balanced in order to find the optimal freezing conditions. Aguirre and others (2011)

880 confirmed the existence of moisture equilibration between crumb and crust during bread

881 storage, and demonstrated that storage at -18 °C resulted in very limited water movement

882 when compared to bread stored at 4 and 25 °C. As a consequence, water activity values were

883 almost constant in bread stored for 23 days at -18 °C. They showed that the starch molecules

884 re-associate during storage to give a new crystalline structure with a typical X-ray diffraction

885 (XRD) B-type structure and that storage at -18 °C, that is a temperature below the glass-

886 transition temperature (T_g), slowed down but did not stop the recrystallization speed, and only

887 crystal growth occurred. The effect of vacuum-cooling on the staling rate of sourdough whole

888 meal flour bread was assessed by Le-Bail and others (2011). Vacuum-chilled bread showed

889 higher moisture loss, crumb hardness, and enthalpy of melting (ΔH) of amylopectin crystals

890 than conventionally cooled bread. The authors concluded that the negative effects of the

891 quick vacuum-cooling is the result of the increased number formation of amylopectin

892 crystallites and, thus, of recrystallized amylopectin. Ronda and others (2011) studied the

893 effect of prolonged storage time on staling of PB and fully baked (FB) breads. Three

894 parameters, namely moisture content, firmness, and starch retrogradation as well as the T_g of

895 the maximally freeze-concentrated state (T_g'), were considered to evaluate bread aging. The

896 thawed and rebaked PB bread showed significantly lower amylopectin ΔH values than that of

897 FB bread, and this may partially explain the similarity of PB bread with fresh bread. The

898 authors evidenced the need to select a proper frozen storage temperature, sufficiently lower

899 than T_g'. Frozen storage time, moreover, resulted in a significant decrease in firmness of PB

900 bread crumb. Based on the obtained results, the authors proposed that hardening of bread

901 during storage may not be related only to starch crystallization or water loss and developed a

902 regression study describing how the combined effect of both variables could better explain

903 the firming evolution. Majzoobi and others (2011a) hypothesized that the higher moisture

904 content of Barbari PB flat breads after full baking was the cause of delayed staling up to 72

905 hours, with respect to control sample, and proposed that bread crumb structure is formed

906 completely during the part-baking stage, while staling occurs in PB bread during storage at

907 ambient temperature, even if full-baking leads to the disappearance of many signs of staling,

908 thus the resulting bread has softer texture. Finally, they suggest storing the part-baked bread

909 at frozen temperature for no more than 2 months to reduce deterioration of bread caused by

910 the growth of ice crystals. In a subsequent paper Majzoobi and others (2012) recommend the

911 addition of 15% wheat germ for the general sensory improvement of Barbari bread, although

912 that did not manage to retard staling.

913 In 2 separate papers Karaoglu (2006) and Karaoglu and Kotancilar (2006) evidenced the

914 influence of par-baking on quality of wheat bran and white breads, respectively,

915 supplemented or not with calcium propionate, during chilling storage (4 °C) up to 21 days.

916 Both papers gave similar results, which were a softer bread crumb, with respect to a control

917 group, in breads PB for 10 min, rebaked, and stored for 7 and 14 days.

918

919 **5.2. Sourdough fermentation**

920 Sourdough fermentation has been known since ancient times and, among the beneficial

921 effects, reduction in staling has been reported and recently discussed in 2 reviews (Arendt and

922 others 2007; Chavan and Chavan, 2011), to which the reader is redirected. The different

923 metabolites produced by lactic acid bacteria (LAB) have proved to have a beneficial effect on

924 texture and staling. EPS, for example, are a valid and economic alternative to hydrocolloids,

925 while organic acids affect the protein and starch fractions and reduce the pH that results in an

926 increase in protease and amylase activities of the flour, thus reducing staling.

927 Katina and others (2006a) managed to delay bread staling at 3 and 6 days of storage, with

928 respect to white wheat bread, by combining wheat bran sourdough and an enzyme mix (α-

929 amylase, Xyn, and lipase). The crumb hardness of the supplemented bread after 6 days of

930 storage was the same as that of white bread at day 1. The authors used NMR, DSC, and

931 microscopy to explain this result and found fewer changes in amylopectin crystallinity and

932 rigidity of polymers in bran sourdough bread with enzymes, which also showed starch

933 granules much more swollen, with respect to white bread, as a result of the higher water

934 content and degradation of cell wall components. In another paper, Katina and others (2006b)

935 proposed the use of surface-response methodology to optimize sourdough process conditions

936 aimed at improving flavor and texture of wheat bread. They found that combining flour with

937 low ash content, and optimizing sourdough fermentation time, staling was reduced up to 4

938 days. The best result was, in particular, obtained using *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* sourdough

939 fermented bread for 12 h at 32 °C and with flour ash content of 0.6 g/100 g. It was also found

940 that the fermentation time had an important linear effect on softness of bread crumb. Finally,

941 it was confirmed that higher ash content of flour increased firmness in sourdough breads

942 fermented with *Lactobacillus brevis, S. cerevisiae* or a combination starter (Collar and others

943 1994). Plessas and others (2007) proposed the use of sourdough with immobilized cells, as it

944 resulted in a threefold delay in staling, compared to the traditional compressed baker's yeast

945 bread. The authors hypothesized that the retention of higher moisture levels after baking and

946 reduced moisture loss rates are due to the more compact texture in breads obtained with the

947 suggested technique. In particular, they showed that sourdough breads presented lower loaf

948 volumes for the same loaf weights, and fewer holes of higher size, with respect to

949 conventional baker's yeast bread. Dal Bello and others (2007) confirmed that the higher

950 volume of bread produced by the sourdough fermentation activity of the antifungal strain

951 *Lactobacillus plantarum* FST 1.7 and of *Lactobacillus sanfranciscensis* LTH 2581, with

952 respect to chemically or nonchemically acidified bread, delayed crumb staling up to 3 days.

953 Additionally, the *L. plantarum* FST 1.7 revealed inhibitory activity against *Fusaria*.

954 Fadda and others (2010) found that durum wheat bread produced with sourdough at a

955 dose higher than 10% significantly lowered and slowed crumb-firming kinetics, as assessed

956 by TA and DSC results, the latter used with the Avrami equation, provided gluten and yeast

957 were added.

958   Recently, Tamani and others (2013) associated the increased EPS production during

959   dough formation following the inoculation of ropy LAB starter cultures (*Lactobacillus*

960   *delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB18; *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus CNRZ* 737,

961   and *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* 2483) with increased bread volume and

962   reduced staling over 5 days of storage, with respect to the control bread, while one nonropy

963   LAB (*Lactobacillus helveticus* LH30) did not result in beneficial effects. The authors

964   suggested that the higher levels of EPS obtained with LAB may have resulted in greater water

965   retention, leading to the softer crumb structure of these breads, even if they evidenced that the

966   EPS production did not correlate with the extension of shelf-life, thus their effect was more

967   qualitative than quantitative.

968

969   **5.3. Baking and fermentation**

970   It has been reported that both baking time and temperature affect the quality and staling

971   rate of bread (Seetharaman and others 2002). Patel and others (2005) studied the effects of the

972   use of different ovens and dough size, when baking at constant temperature for varying times,

973   on texture, thermal properties, and pasting characteristics of products. Breads baked at the

974   lower heating rates had lower amylopectin recrystallization, rate of bread firmness, and

975   amount of soluble amylose. Similar results were obtained by Mouneim and others (2012).

976   Baking temperature and time affected some physical properties of bread from composite flour

977   made by mixing cassava and wheat flour at a ratio of 10:90 (w/w) as revealed by central

978   composite rotatable experimental design (Shittu and others 2007). Both the baking

979   temperature-and-time, among others, influenced the dried crumb hardness, due to the

980   complex effect of temperature and time combination, but the developed second-order

981   response surface regression equations could not predict satisfactorily most of the measured

982   properties, thus the authors proposed further studies to optimize the cassava and wheat flour

983 bread baking process. Three different heating temperatures corresponding to 3 heating rates

984 were also tested by Le-Bail and others (2009) with an innovative protocol in which a

985 degassed piece of dough was baked in a miniaturized oven, in order to compare it with

986 traditional dough. Hardening of the crumb occurred after retrogradation of amylopectin, as

987 revealed by calorimetric tests, and higher baking kinetics resulted in faster staling rates.

988 Additionally, the relative Young modulus, expressed as the ratio of the modulus of the

989 cellular crumb vs. the modulus of the degassed crumb, was proportional to the square of the

990 relative density of the crumb. In a further paper Le-Bail and others (2012), working with a

991 degassed sourdough, confirmed the previously obtained results and gave more explanation on

992 the effect of prolonged baking on staling rate, that was an increase of the amount of amylose

993 leaching from the starch granule, leading to a higher Young's modulus of the crumb at the

994 end of staling.

995 Different heating rates were recently associated with water vapor permeability (WVP),

996 effective moisture diffusivity (D_{eff}), and sorption of bread crust and crumb (Besbes and others

997 2013). The authors showed that baking at 240 °C gave both crust and crumb with higher

998 moisture diffusivity coefficient and that the crust had a higher WVP than that of sample

999 baked at 220 °C. They proposed a more pronounced porosity of crumb and crusts of breads

1000 baked at the higher temperature, as revealed by porosity values and scanning electron

1001 microscopy (SEM) determinations, as the cause of the obtained result. Purhagen and others

1002 (2012) concluded that breads obtained with different fibers (fine durum, oat bran, rye bran,

1003 and wheat bran) baked in pan remained softer after 7 days of storage, with respect to free-

1004 standing baked sample, and attributed this to the lower specific volume of pan-baked breads

1005 due to their high water content. Moreover, pan-baked loaves lost less water during storage,

1006 with respect to free-standing sample, probably because of the smaller crust area of these

1007 loaves. The difference in staling behavior between the 2 baking methods was not attributed,

1008 however, to starch retrogradation, while the influence of fibers was small, if compared to the

1009 baking method, thus confirming data obtained in another paper in which other antistaling

1010 agents, namely α-amilase, distilled monoglyceride, and lipase, were compared to the baking

1011 method (Purhagen and others 2011a).

1012 The effect of fermentation on the firming kinetics could not be explained only by its effect on

1013 volume, but also with the presence of different enzymes, such as amylases, proteases, or

1014 lipases that, alone or in combination with other enzymes, may help in reducing the firming

1015 rate in white or wholemeal bread, thus longer fermentation times enhanced the action of the

1016 enzymes, with a resulting reduction of the staling rate (Gomez and others 2008). The higher

1017 the yeast dose, the higher the quantity of dough enzymes previously cited. Temperature of

1018 fermentation, on the other hand, had a minor impact on bread staling. Moreover, the authors

1019 managed to adjust the firmness parameters to simple curvilinear equations and obtained high

1020 correlation coefficients (>90%). Ozkoc and others (2009) compared different baking

1021 methods, namely conventional, microwave, and infrared-microwave combination, in order to

1022 assess staling kinetics of hydrocolloid-supplemented breads during 120 h of storage, by using

1023 several methods, namely texture analysis (TA), differential scanning calorimetry (DSC) rapid

1024 visco-analysis (RVA), and X-ray and Fourier transform infrared spectroscopy (FTIR). The

1025 starch retrogradation of breads obtained with a combination oven was similar to that of

1026 conventionally baked ones, as revealed by ΔH values and FTIR outputs, thus leading the

1027 authors to postulate that it was possible to produce breads by combination heating with a

1028 staling rate similar to that of conventionally baked ones. Moreover, data from RVA and X-ray

1029 showed that the rapid staling rate typical of microwave baking can be mitigated by infrared-

1030 microwave combination heating. As expected, the addition of a xanthan gum (XG)-guar gum

1031 (GG) blend to the formulation retarded staling.

1032

5.4. High-hydrostatic-pressure processing (HPP)

This unit operation may change structural and functional properties of proteins and cereal starches and is being investigated to improve quality of breads made with flours alternative to wheat.

In a fundamental study on the use of HPP to improve the bread making performance of oat flour Huttner and others (2010) subjected oat batters to 3 levels of HPP (220, 350, and 500 MPa) and the treated samples replaced untreated oat flour in an oat bread recipe, by 10, 20, or 40%. Staling rate, as assessed by a Texture Profile Analysis (TPA) crumb hardness test, was reduced when 10 to 40% oat batter treated at 200 MPa was used, if compared to the control. The HPP-treatment at 200 MPa weakened the proteins, affected the moisture distribution, and also influenced the interactions between proteins and starch, which caused a decrease in the staling rate of the oat-bread. Opposite results were presented in another paper published some months later (Vallons and others 2010). The authors replaced 2 or 10% of a sorghum bread recipe with sorghum batters HPP-treated at 200 and 600 MP and found that breads containing 2% sorghum treated at 600 MPa had slower staling rates than control.

More recently Angioloni and Collar (2012) worked with fixed amounts of oat, millet, and sorghum HPP-treated flours (350 MPa), which replaced (60% for oat, 40% for the other 2) wheat flour. Half of the control bread was prepared by applying HPP to 50% of wheat flour. Results indicated that HPP-treated wheat and oat breads lowered final values of crumb hardness and Avrami exponent, thus giving softer breads with slower staling kinetics, with respect to control bread.

6. Measurement methods

The results reviewed above refer to one or more measurement methods to assess bread staling, but there has not been up to now a methodology that allows a complete measurement

of the staling phenomenon to the same extent as that described by a consumer (Sidhu and others 1996). Different specific reviews before that of Gray and Bemiller (2003) have dealt with the methods used to assess the rate and/or degree of staling such as those mentioned by Maga (1975), Kulp and Ponte (1981), and Ponte and Ovadia (1996). In most cases bread staling, apart from the more simple and direct texture analysis (TA), is indirectly measured as the extent of starch retrogradation, as also reviewed by Karim and others (2000). An interesting review, moreover, revisited crumb texture evaluation methods (Liu and Scanlon 2004), while another one summarized the more frequently used analytical methodologies for assessing bread staling (Choi and others 2010). In the following pages the major reports dealing with new methodologies and/or new applications used to measure bread staling during the last ten years will be reviewed.

6.1. Thermal analysis

Bollain and others (2005) proposed small dynamic deformation and large static deformation methods to evaluate the thermodynamic and physical-mechanical changes of enzyme-supplemented white or whole bread during staling. They successfully detected rheological changes of bread, as influenced by recipe and storage time, with dynamic thermomechanical analysis (DTMA) in the compression mode. They detected that the onset frequency (f_0) and the rubbery or plateau moduli (E') rose as the bread aged in a similar way to the hardening and firming curves. Moreover, relationships between the dynamic (DTMA) and static (TA) methods were found.

Ribotta and Le Bail (2007) used DSC and DMA to study bread staling. DSC evidenced water migration from the crumb to the crust and changes of water properties as initial and onset temperature of ice melting decreased significantly after 1 day and freezable water (FW) and unfreezable water (UFW) decreased and increased, respectively, as a consequence of

1083   aging. DSC results suggested the existence of a possible second transition, due to ice-melting

1084   transition being diverted to lower temperatures. The authors proposed that a concomitant

1085   water migration from the crumb to the crust and an incorporation of water molecules into the

1086   starch crystalline structure, developing after bread staling, may account for the decrease in

1087   FW after 4 days of storage at 4 °C. Moreover, they suggested that some water molecules were

1088   incorporated in the crystalline lattice when starch crystallized. DMA analysis showed

1089   significant changes in the thermo-mechanical profile of the crumb during staling, as aged

1090   breads contracted at a lower rate during cooling, but they evidenced a greater deformation

1091   during freezing and higher retraction within the complete cooling–freezing cycle, thus

1092   suggesting that the higher matrix rigidity, a consequence of the higher amount of

1093   retrograded starch, affected contraction capacity. The authors postulated that interactions

1094   during the hydration of the gluten network might explain the latter phenomenon.

1095

6.2. Infrared spectroscopy

1097   Near-infrared reflectance spectroscopy (NIRS) was used to obtain spectra during staling

1098   of bread and the results were compared with those obtained by TA (Xie and others 2003).

1099   Results showed that NIRS spectra were highly correlated with firmness values assessed with

1100   the more common TA. Moreover, the authors evidenced that NIRS measurements had a

1101   better correlation with storage time and also lower batch variability, with respect to TA-

1102   derived data, thus NIRS was suggested as a better tool than TA to study bread aging,

1103   probably because NIRS may follow both physical and chemical changes occurring during the

1104   staling process, while TA was limited to the only aspect of firmness evolution. In a further

1105   paper, Xie and others (2004) proposed the use of NIRS as a fundamental tool to study bread

1106   staling with the help of DSC, as well as the effects of starch, protein, and temperature

1107   (storage at 12.5 or 31.5 °C) on bread staling. DSC data showed that temperature strongly

1108 affected the staling rate, while the protein contribution was limited, if compared to

1109 temperature during 4 days of storage. Using the enthalpy ratio between bread supplemented

1110 with starch and sample produced with starch-protein it was possible to conclude that protein

1111 might retard bread staling not only by diluting starch (Kim and D'Appolonia 1977; Every and

1112 others 1998), but also by interfering with amylopectin retrogradation. NIRS was found to be

1113 very useful in studying bread staling, as it was able to study accurately amylopectin

1114 retrogradation and to obtain a very good correlation with DSC data when looking for protein

1115 and temperature effects on amylopectin retrogradation development, even if it showed

1116 difficulty in measuring the changes of the amylose-lipid complex during storage. The authors

1117 proposed 550, 970, 1155, 1395, and 1465 nm as important wavelengths of NIRS and

1118 concluded that amylopectin retrogradation was probably the main factor in bread staling and

1119 that the amylose-lipid complex contributed little to bread staling after one day of storage.

1120 Cocchi and others (2005) coupled middle-infrared spectroscopy (MIR) with principal

1121 component analysis (PCA) to follow bread shelf-life in a rapid and affordable way. Spectra of

1122 breads stored up to 7 days at ambient temperature were acquired in attenuated total reflection

1123 mode with a FT-IR spectrometer, normalized and then subjected to PCA. The authors

1124 revealed that the first PC increased with aging of samples and that the more influential

1125 variables on PC1 corresponded to spectral regions attributed to typical starch bond vibrations.

1126 Pikus and others (2006) proposed for the first time the small-angle X-ray scattering (SAXS)

1127 method to study bread staling. The authors, by using fresh dry and fresh water suspension

1128 samples, found that bread staling is accompanied by significant electron density changes,

1129 indicating that there were significant changes at the nanoscale level during the staling

1130 process. They suggested, by analyzing results obtained with the dynamics of the scattering

1131 intensity changes in the bread samples, along with those of SAXS investigations on native

1132 starch, that SAXS scattering changes for the dry samples originated mainly from the gluten

phase, while for water suspension samples they were mainly from the starch matrix. The authors concluded that a comparison of results of SAXS with data obtained with other methods, on the same bread sample, would be interesting.

Piccinini and others (2012) proposed, for the first time the use of NIR Fourier-transform-Raman spectroscopy to monitor starch retrogradation in stored hard-wheat bread and, with the help of TA data, to follow bread staling for 20 days. The authors found, by applying the 2D correlation analysis applied to the Raman spectra of bread crumb during storage, that both the peak shift and narrowing of the band at 480 cm^{-1} during retrogradation correlated well with the crumb-firming data obtained using the stress relaxation tests and that during starch retrogradation a new band peaking at 765 cm^{-1} appeared.

6.3. Nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy

Curti and others (2011) used ^{1}H NMR relaxometry and, for the first time in bread, the ^{1}H NMR fast field cycling (FFC) technique to follow the changes in ^{1}H T_1 relaxation in the 0.01-20 MHz frequency range, in order to check for the interactions of water molecules with paramagnetic and large-sized macromolecular system during bread staling. ^{1}H T_1 relaxation data at 20 MHz confirmed previous results, while studies conducted at a lower frequency (0.52 MHz) evidenced, for the first time, the presence of two T_1 proton populations, which were tentatively attributed to protons of the gluten domain at early storage times. The authors suggested that the use of the ^{1}H NMR FFC technique at different frequencies may be an additional way for monitoring molecular dynamics in bread and therefore a new valuable instrument to help understand the bread staling phenomenon.

Bosmans and others (2013) used H NMR relaxometry, along with DSC and wide-angle X-ray diffraction, to better elucidate the relationship between biopolymer interactions, water dynamics, and crumb texture evolution during 168 h of storage of bread. The NMR analysis

1158 allowed finding 6 proton populations in bread crumb and from the NMR profiles of bread

1159 crumb they were able to deduce the extent of formation of both amylopectin crystals and of

1160 crumb firmness. On the basis of data obtained they concluded that the increase in crumb

1161 firmness of stored bread was caused by a combination of different events that were

1162 amylopectin retrogradation and the formation of a continuous, rigid, crystalline starch

1163 network that included water in its structure. They also noticed moisture migration from gluten

1164 to starch and from crumb to crust, resulting in additional reduction of moisture in the gluten

1165 network, with the consequence that the subsequent increase in stiffness contributed to the

1166 increase in crumb firmness.

1167

1168 **6.4. X-ray crystallography**

1169 Del Nobile and others (2003) developed a mathematical model able to predict the starch

1170 retrogradation kinetics of durum wheat bread in order to link it to the crumb staling. Two

1171 equations were proposed dealing with data obtained with wide-angle X-ray diffraction (starch

1172 retrogradation) and compression tests (crumb firming process), and related to samples held at

1173 5 °C and 2 water activity values, in order to accelerate the test. The proposed model fitted

1174 well the obtained results; moreover, the authors evidenced that lowering the water activity

1175 value resulted in a higher overall starch crystal growth rate, due to the increase of the starch

1176 nucleation rate.

1177 X-ray patterns were studied with different methods, namely relative crystallinity, total

1178 mass crystallinity grade (TC), B-type mass crystallinity grade, and V-type mass crystallinity

1179 grade, in order to increase knowledge of the relationship between starch crystallinity and

1180 bread staling during 7 days of storage at 4 °C (Ribotta and others 2004). The authors pointed

1181 out that: a) fresh baked bread contained only a V-type structure, while the B-type structure

1182 appeared after 24 h and increased during bread staling; b) TC and relative crystallinity

1183 significantly increased during the first 24 h, then slightly decreased, thus indicating the

1184 appearance of the B-type structure; c) TC and relative crystallinity decreased at the end of

1185 aging, which is associated with an increased degree of ordering of the amorphous phase

1186 caused by staling. They suggested that staled bread showed reformation of the double helical

1187 structures of amylopectin and a reorganization, during aging, into crystalline regions that

1188 imparted rigidity. With this in mind, they concluded that amylopectin retrogradation is an

1189 essential step to consider to better understand bread staling.

1190

1191 **6.5. Colorimetry**

1192 Popov-Raljić and others (2009) used, for the first time, a MOM-color 100 tristimulus

1193 photo colorimeter, in CIE, CIELab, ANLAB, and Hunter systems to correlate crust color

1194 changes and staling of bread of different compositions packed in polyethylene film during 3

1195 days at 20 °C. The color of 3-day-stored bread samples was always lighter, as the stored

1196 breads showed higher average reflectance, with respect to just baked loaves. The authors

1197 hypothesized the moisture loss as the cause of this color change and, by fitting the values of

1198 average reflectance with a curve describing the dependence of average reflectance with

1199 storage time, they found a correlation coefficient of 0.99, thus they concluded that the change

1200 in color is the direct consequence of staling [Note: it would be more useful to correlate crust

1201 color changes with objective bread staling measurements, such as hardness, more than with

1202 time].

1203

1204 **6.6. Rheological methods**

1205 Textural assessment of staling has been reviewed by Chung and others (2003). Fiszman

1206 and others (2005) investigated the relationships between mechanical behavior of pan bread,

1207 supplemented or not with an amylolytic enzyme, a nonamylolytic enzyme and a combination

of the 2, and loss of sensory quality during 20 days in storage. TPA at 40% and 80% was proposed for the first time as well as a new penetration test. The authors positively correlated hardness with sensory "difficulty in swallowing", "crumbliness", "hardness", and "oral dryness", and negatively correlated it with sensory "cohesiveness", "softness", and "size of soft zone", while these parameters correlated well also for springiness and cohesiveness detected at 80% TPA, thus evidencing that TPA values obtained at the compressions resulted in greater sample distortion and gave information that was better correlated to sensory perception. Finally, the analysis of the penetration profiles gave data that were very useful to complement the TPA results, in order to assess bread staling.

Angioloni and Collar (2009b) suggested the complementarities of instrumental static (TPA, firmness, and relaxation test) and dynamic (innovative oscillatory test) analyses with empirical sensory characteristics in assessing commercial whole and white bread quality during a 10-day storage period, although the 2 different approaches investigated the bread characteristics at molecular or macroscopic level. In particular, the authors found that static relaxation parameters initial force (F_0), momentary force at time (t) F(t), constants related to stress decay k1(s) rate and residual stress at the end of the experiment (k2t) and dynamic (stress) bread crumb rheological attributes were correlated well, thus both techniques were useful in evaluating crumb textural characteristics of fresh and staled breads. Moreover, the sensory attributes (softness) and the overall acceptability were negatively correlated with either dynamic stress or static F_0. The authors concluded that the obtained results were quite promising for a proper bread crumb quality assessment, as the novel proposed approaches gave data with better accordance with consumer awareness.

6.7. Electrical impedance

1232   Bhatt and Nagaraju (2009) developed an instrument working with electrical impedance to

1233 assess the electrical properties of wheat bread crumb and crust, and they investigated changes

1234 in electrical impedance behavior during 120 h of storage with the use of multichannel ring

1235 electrodes. Variations in crust capacitance showed that there was a sharp increase in value

1236 after 96 h of storage at 17.6% moisture content, so after that period a glass transition occurred

1237 with a content of more than 17.6% of moisture at room temperature. On the other hand, the

1238 resistance measurements of crumb showed a decrease during staling, thus revealing that the

1239 starch crumb recovered its crystallinity during the storage time of 120 h. Data on crust

1240 capacitance and crumb resistance were validated by results obtained with DSC analysis

1241 (variation in glass transition temperature and enthalpy). The authors concluded that the

1242 proposed instrument was suitable for rapid and nondestructive measurement of electrical

1243 properties of bread at different zones with minimum error, thus enabling to study staling at

1244 crust and crumb simultaneously.

1245

1246 **6.8. Mixed instrumentation**

1247   Primo-Martín and others (2007) gave new insight on staling of bread crust by using a wide

1248 range of measurement techniques, namely, confocal scanning laser microscopy, wide-angle

1249 X-ray powder diffraction, polarized light microscopy, solid-state 13C cross-polarization-

1250 magic-angle spinning nuclear magnetic resonance, and DSC. The authors found that baking

1251 resulted in gelatinization of only 60% of the crust starch, and this fraction retook its

1252 cristallinity after a long time, compared to crumb. The authors, thus, concluded that staling of

1253 the crust cannot be ascribed to amylopectin retrogradation that was measurable only after 2

1254 days of storage, while loss of bread crust freshness happened before 1 day of storage, as

1255 already reported by Primo-Martín and others (2006).

1256   A very interesting application was that proposed by Botre and Garphure (2006) who used

1257   a tin oxide sensor array and self-organized map (SOM)-based E-nose for analysis of volatile

1258   bread aroma, in order to correlate the obtained data with bread freshness and, thus, predict

1259   staling. Data obtained on bread stored for 5 days at 25 °C over 3 weeks and purchased by 3

1260   producers showed that the E-nose was able to predict freshness or staleness of bread with an

1261   accuracy of up to 97%, when using data sets and the SOM network of the same week, while

1262   this value dropped to 75–85% when considering the 3 weeks. Moreover, when different bread

1263   producers were considered, the accuracy value was again high and ranged from 76 to 83%.

1264   The authors, thus, suggested that the SnO_2 gas sensor and SOM neural network based

1265   electronic nose was an attractive, low-price alternative for assessing bread freshness.

1266   Lagrain and others (2012) considered bread crumb as a linear-elastic, cellular solid with

1267   open cells in order to better understand its mechanical properties at the fresh state and during

1268   storage, when applying low stresses in the evaluation. They used static compression of bread

1269   crumb and developed a new instrument probe to determine the shear storage modulus by

1270   applying a sinusoidal shear force to the sample. Cellular structure evolution during storage

1271   was assessed by digital image analysis, while a noncontact ultrasound technique was used to

1272   measure crumb open porosity and mean size of the intersections in the crumb cell walls.

1273   Results of image and acoustic analyses showed that the original crumb structure was not

1274   affected by staling and crumb physical measurement confirmed this behavior, as the Poisson

1275   coefficient ν obtained from texture data yielded a time-independent value. Moreover, by

1276   changing gluten functionality with redox agents (potassium bromate and glutathione) the

1277   authors found that the increase in evolution of the normalized modulus, which was the ratio

1278   between the Young's modulus E and the crumb density ρ (E/ρ), was independent from ρ, thus

1279   molecular changes in the gluten protein network induced by the redox agents had effect on

1280   crumb cell wall stiffening. Finally, changing starch properties with a maltogenic exo-α-

amylase, while reducing crumb stiffening during 168 h of storage, as expected and as revealed by amylopectin recrystallization (DSC), did not result in changes in the cellular structure.

7. Conclusion

Bread staling continues to be responsible for huge food wastes all over the world. The phenomenon is still far from being fully elucidated, but this literature review of the last 10 years confirmed existing theories and gave new insights. The text points out the central role of starch and starch-gluten interactions at the basis of the staling mechanism and highlights the effect of different ingredients (hydrocolloids, enzymes, or WWS), as well as the increased interest in dough or frozen PB bread for extending bread shelf life. Despite new measurement techniques, such as NIRS, NMR, and X-ray, which give novel and interesting details on bread firming and also evidence of their importance as complementary tools to traditional measurement techniques, the real challenge still remains the knowledge of the precise mechanism(s) of staling. Further efforts must be exerted to explore and exploit the power of novel technologies in bread processing, particularly the non-thermal technologies (high hydrostatic pressure, ultrasound processing, pulse-light technology, and other), and their effects on the retardation of bread staling.

8. References

Abu-Ghoush M, Herald TJ, Dowell F, Xie F, Aramouni FM, Madl R. 2008. Effect of preservatives addition on the shelf-life extensions and quality of flat bread as determined by near-infrared spectroscopy and texture analysis. Int J Food Sci Technol 43:357-64.

Aguirre JF, Osella CA, Carrara CR, Sanchez HD, del Pilar Buera M. 2011. Effect of storage temperature on starch retrogradation of bread staling. Starch/Starke 63:587-93.

Akers AA, Hoseney RC. 1994. Water-soluble dextrins from alpha-treated bread and their relationship to bread firming. Cereal Chem 71:223-6.

Alsberg CL. 1928. The role of starch in bread making. In: Walton RP, editor. A Comprehensive survey of starch chemistry. New York, Chemical Catalog Co. p. 87-99.

Alsberg CL. 1936. The stale-bread problem. Wheat Stud Food Res Inst 12:221-47.

Amos AJ. 1955. The use of enzymes in the baking industry. J Sci Food Agric 6:489-95.

Angioloni A, Collar C. 2009a. Gel, dough and fibre-enriched fresh breads: Relationships between quality features and staling kinetics. J Food Eng 91:526-32.

Angioloni A, Collar C. 2009b. Bread crumb quality assessment: a plural physical approach. Eur Food Res Technol 229:21-30.

Angioloni A., Collar C. 2011. Nutritional and functional added value of oat, KamutR, spelt, rye and buckwheat versus common wheat in breadmaking. J Sci Food Agric 91: 1283–1292.

Angioloni A., Collar C. 2012. Effects of pressure treatment of hydrated oat, finger millet and sorghum flours on the quality and nutritional properties of composite wheat breads. J Cereal Sci 56:713-9.

Angioloni A., Collar C. 2013. Suitability of Oat, Millet and Sorghum in Breadmaking. Food Bioprocess Technol 6:1486–1493.

1331   Arendt EK, Ryan LAM, Dal Bello F. 2007. Impact of sourdough on the texture of bread.
1332   Food Microbiol 24:165-74.

1333   Axford DWE., Colwell KH, Cornford SJ, Elton GH. 1968. Effect of loaf specific volume on
1334   the rate and extent of staling in bread. J Sci Food Agric 19:95-101.

1335   Baik BK, Park CS, Paszczynska B, Konzak CF. 2003. Characteristics of noodles and bread
1336   prepared from double-null partial waxy wheat. Cereal Chem 80:627-33.

1337   Barcenas ME, Haros M, Benedito C, Rosell CM. 2003. Effect of freezing and frozen storage
1338   on the staling of part-baked bread. Food Res Int 36:863-9.

1339   Bárcenas ME, Rosell CM. 2005. Effect of HPMC addition on the microstructure, quality and
1340   aging of wheat bread. Food Hydrocolloids 19:1037-43.

1341   Batu A. 2005. Production of lipid and white solid Pekmez in Turkey. J Food Qual 28:417-27.

1342   Beck M, Jekle M, Becker T. 2012a. Sodium chloride – sensory, preserving and technological
1343   impact on yeast-leavened products. Int J Food Sci Technol 47:1798-1807.

1344   Beck M, Jekle M, Becker T. 2012b. Impact of sodium chloride on wheat flour dough for
1345   yeast-leavened products. II. Baking quality parameters and their relationship. J Sci Food
1346   Agric 92:299-306.

1347   Begum R, Rakshit SK, Mahfuzur Rahman SM. 2010. Protein fortification and use of cassava
1348   flour for bread formulation. Int J Food Prop 14:185-98.

1349   Bell DA. 1990. Methylcellulose as a structure enhancer in bread baking. Cereal Food World
1350   35:1001-6.

1351   Besbes E, Jury V, Monteau JY, Le Bail A. 2013. Water vapor transport properties during
1352   staling of bread crumb and crust as affected by heating rate. Food Res Int 50:10-9.

1353   Bhatt CM, Nagaraju J. 2009. Studies on glass transition and starch re-crystallization in wheat
1354   bread during staling using electrical impedance spectroscopy. Innov Food Sci Emerg
1355   10:241-5.

1356   Bhise S, Kaur A. 2013. Polyols to improve quality and shelf life of baked products: A review.

1357   Int J Adv Sci Tec Res 3:262-72.

1358   Biliaderis CG, Izydorczyk MS, Rattan O. 1995. Effect of arabinoxylans on bread-making

1359   quality of wheat flours. Food Chem 53:165-71.

1360   Błaszczak W, Sadowska J, Rosell CM, Fornal J. 2004. Structural changes in the wheat dough

1361   and bread with the addition of alpha-amylases. Eur Food Res Technol 219:348-54.

1362   Bollaín C, Angioloni A, Collar C. 2005. Bread staling assessment of enzyme-supplemented

1363   pan breads by dynamic and static deformation measurements. Eur Food Res Technol

1364   220:83-9.

1365   Bonet A, Rosell CM, Caballero PA, Gómez M, Pėrez-Munuera I, Lluch MA. 2006. Glucose

1366   oxidase effect on dough rheology and bread quality: A study from macroscopic to

1367   molecular level. Food Chem 99:408-15.

1368   Bosmans GM, Lagrain B, Ooms N, Fierens E, Delcour JA. 2013. Biopolymer interactions,

1369   water dynamics, and bread crumb firming. J Agric Food Chem 61:4646-54.

1370   Botre B, Gharpure D. 2006. Analysis of volatile bread aroma for evaluation of bread

1371   freshness using an electronic nose (E-Nose). Mater Manuf Process 21:279-83.

1372   Bowles LK. 1996. Amylolytic enzymes. In: Hebeda RE, Zobel H, editors. Baked goods

1373   freshness. New York: Marcel Dekker. p 105-29.

1374   Butt MS, Tahir-Nadeem M, Ahmad Z, Tauseef Sultan M. 2008. Xylanases and their

1375   applications in the baking industry. Food Technol Biotechnol 46:22-31.

1376   Caballero PA, Gomez M, Rosell CM. 2007. Improvement of dough rheology, bread quality

1377   and bread shelf-life by enzymes combination. J Food Eng 81:42-53.

1378   Carr L, Rodas M, Torre J., Tadini C. 2006. Physical, textural and sensory characteristic of 7

1379   day frozen part- baked French bread. J Food Eng 39:540-7.

1380   Casper JL, Oppenheimer AA, Weber JL, Erickson BJ, Ray MM, inventors. 2006. High-

1381   expansion dough compositions and methods. U.S patent 0083841.

1382   Casper JL, Oppenheimer AA, Erickson B inventors. 2007. Dough compositions having a

1383   moisture barrier and related methods. U.S patent 0275128.

1384   Cauvain SP, Young LS. 2008. Bakery food manufacture and quality: water control and

1385   effects. Chichester, UK: Wiley-Blackwell.

1386   Chavan RS, Chavan SR. 2011. Sourdough technology - A traditional way for wholesome

1387   foods: a review. Comp Rev Food Sci Food Safety 10:170-83.

1388   Chin NL, Abdullah R, Yusof YA. 2012. Glazing effects on bread crust and crumb staling

1389   during storage. J Texture Stud 42:459-67.

1390   Chinachoti P, Vodovotz Y, editors. 2000. Bread staling. Boca Raton, Fla.: CRC Press.

1391   Choi YJ, Ahn SC, Choi HS, Hwang DK, Kim BY, Baik MY. 2008. Role of water in bread

1392   staling. Food Sci Biotechnol 17:1139-45.

1393   Choi YJ, Kim BY, Baik MY. 2010. Analytical methodology for bread staling. J Korean Soc

1394   Appl Biol Chem 53:389-400.

1395   Chung MS, Lee JK, Hur NY, Kim DS, Baik MY. 2003. Textural analysis for bread staling

1396   Food Sci Biotechnol 12:727-36.

1397   Cocchi M, Foca G, Marchetti A, Sighinolfi S, Tassi L, Ulrici A. 2005. Use of multivariate

1398   analysis of MIR spectra to study bread staling. Annali di Chimica 95:657-66.

1399   Codex   Alimentarius   Commission.   2009.   Alinorm   09/32/26.   Available   at

1400   ftp://ftp.fao.org/codex/Circular_letters/CXCL2008/cl08_35e.pdf. Accessed 25 October

1401   2013.

1402   Collar C, Martínez-Anaya MA, Benedito de Barber C. 1994. Interactive effects between

1403   microbial breadmaking starters and wheat flours on sour dough and bread quality. Rev Esp

1404   Cienc Tecnol Aliment 34:191-201.

1405   Collar C, Andreu P, Martinez JC, Armero E. 1999. Optimization of hydrocolloid addition to

1406   improve wheat bread dough functionality: A response surface methodology study. Food

1407   Hydrocolloids 13:467-75.

1408   Collar C. 2003. Significance of viscosity profile of pasted and gelled formulated wheat

1409   doughs on bread staling. Eur Food Res Technol 216:505-13.

1410   Collar C, Bollain C. 2005. Impact of microbial transglutaminase on the staling behaviour of

1411   enzyme-supplemented pan breads. Eur Food Res Technol 221:298-304.

1412   Collar C, Angioloni A. 2014a. Nutritional and functional performance of high β-glucan

1413   barley flours in breadmaking: mixed breads versus wheat breads. Eur Food Res Technol

1414   DOI 10.1007/s00217-013-2128-1.

1415   Collar C, Angioloni A. 2014b. Pseudocereals and teff in complex breadmaking matrices:

1416   Impact on lipid dynamics. J Cereal Sci DOI 10.1016/j.jcs.2013.12.008.

1417   Collar C, Rosell CM. 2013. Bakery and confectioneries. In: Chandrasekaran M, editor.

1418   Valorization of by products from plant-based food processing industries. Boca Raton:

1419   CRC Press, Taylor & Francis Group. p 554-82.

1420   Collar C, Rosell CM. 2013. Bakery and confectioneries. In: Chandrasekaran M, editor.

1421   Valorization of by products from plant-based food processing industries. Boca Raton:

1422   CRC Press, Taylor & Francis Group. p 554-82.

1423   Collins T, Hoyoux A, Dutron A, Georis J, Genot B, Dauvrin T, Arnaut F, Gerday C, Feller G.

1424   2006. Use of glycoside hydrolase family 8 xylanases in baking. J Cereal Sci 43:79-84.

1425   Colwell KH, Axford DWE, Chamberlain N, Elton GAH. 1969. Effect of storage temperature

1426   on the ageing of concentrated wheat starch gels. J Sci Food Agric 20:550-5.

1427   Correa MJ, Pérez GT, Ferrero C. 2012. Pectins as breadmaking additives: effect on dough

1428   rheology and bread quality. Food Bioprocess Tech 5:2889-98.

1429   Curti E, Bubici S, Carini E, Baroni S, Vittadini E. 2001. Water molecular dynamics during

1430   bread staling by nuclear magnetic resonance. Lebensm Wiss Technol 44:854-9.

1431   D'Appolonia BL, Morad MM. 1981. Bread staling. Cereal Chem 58:186-90.

1432   Dal Bello F, Clarke CI, Ryan LAM, Ulmer H, Schober TJ, Ström K, Sjögren J, van Sinderen

1433   D, Schnürer J, Arendt EK. 2007. Improvement of the quality and shelf life of wheat bread

1434   by fermentation with the antifungal strain *Lactobacillus plantarum* FST 1.7. J Cereal Sci

1435   45:309-18.

1436   Davies AP. 1986. Protein functionality in bakery products. In: Blanshard JMV, Mitchell JR,

1437   editors. Chemistry and physics of baking. London: Butterworths. p 313-30.

1438   Davidou S, Le Meste M, Debever E, Bekaert D. 1996. A contribution to the study of staling

1439   of white bread: Effect of water and hydrocolloid. Food Hydrocolloids 10:375-83.

1440   Del Nobile MA, Martoriello T, Mocci G, La Notte E. 2003. Modeling the starch

1441   retrogradation kinetic of durum wheat bread. J Food Eng 59:123-8.

1442   Erdogdu-Arnoczky N, Czuchajowska Z, Pomeranz Y. 1996. Functionality of whey and casein

1443   in fermentation and in bread baking by fixed and optimized procedures. Cereal Chem

1444   73:309-16.

1445   Every D, Gerrard JA, Gilpin MJ, Ross M, Newberry MP. 1998. Staling in starch bread: the

1446   effect of gluten additions on specific loaf volume and firming rate. Starch/Stärke 50:443-6.

1447   Fadda C, Santos E, Piga A, Collar C. 2010. Innovative traditional Italian durum wheat breads:

1448   influence of yeast and gluten on the performance of sourdough "Moddizzosu"-type breads.

1449   Cereal Chem 87:204-13.

1450   Ferrero C, Martino MN, Zaritzky NE. 1993. Stability of frozen starch pastes: effect of

1451   freezing rate, storage and xanthan gum addition. J Food Process Pres 17:191-211.

1452 Fiszman SM, Salvador A, Varela P. 2005. Methodological developments in bread staling

1453   assessment: application to enzyme-supplemented brown pan bread. Eur Food Res Technol

1454   221:616-23.

1455 Gambaro A, Giménez A, Ares G, Gilardi V. 2006. Influence of enzymes on the texture of

1456   brown pan bread. J Texture Stud 37:300-14.

1457 Garimella Purna SG, Miller RA, Seib PA, Graybosch RA, Shi YC. 2011. Volume, texture,

1458   and molecular mechanism behind the collapse of bread made with different levels of hard

1459   waxy wheat flours. J Cereal Sci 54:37-43.

1460 Ghanbari M, Farmani J. 2013. Influence of hydrocolloids on dough properties and quality of

1461   barbari: an Iranian leavened flat bread. J Agr Sci Tech 15:545-55.

1462 Ghiasi K, Hoseney RC, Zeleznak K, Rogers DE. 1984. Effect of waxy barley starch and

1463   reheating on firmness of bread crumb. Cereal Chem 61:281-5.

1464 Gill S, Vasanthan T, Ooraikul B, Rossnagal B. 2002. Wheat bread quality as influenced by

1465   the substitution of waxy and regular barley flours in their native and cooked forms. J Cereal

1466   Sci 36:239-51.

1467 Ghoshal G, Shivhare US, Banerjee UC. 2013. Effect of xylanase on quality attributes of

1468   whole-wheat bread. J Food Qual 36:172-80.

1469 Goesaert H, Slade L, Levine H, Delcour JA. 2009. Amylases and bread firming an integrated

1470   view. J Cereal Sci 50:345-52.

1471 Gomes-Ruffi CR, da Cunha RH, Lopes Almeida E, Chang YK, Steel CJ. 2012. Effect of the

1472   emulsifier sodium stearoyl lactylate and of the enzyme maltogenic amylase on the quality

1473   of pan bread during storage. Lebensm Wiss Technol 49:96-101.

1474 Gómez M, Ronda F, Blanco CA, Caballero PA, Apesteguía A. 2003. Effect of dietary fibre

1475   on dough rheology and bread quality. Eur Food Res Technol 216:51-6.

1476   Gómez M, Oliete B, Pando V, Ronda F, Caballero PA. 2008. Effect of fermentation

1477   conditions on bread staling kinetics. Eur Food Res Technol 226:1379-87.

1478   Gray JA, Bemiller JN. 2003. Bread staling: molecular basis and control. Comp Rev Food Sci

1479   Food Safety F:1-21.

1480   Graybosch R.A. 1998. Waxy wheats: Origin, properties, and prospects. Trends Food Sci

1481   Technol 9:135-42.

1482   Gujral HS, Gaur S, Rosell CM. 2003. Note: Effect of barley flour, wet gluten and ascorbic

1483   acid on bread crumb texture. Food Sci Tech Int 9:17-25.

1484   Gujral HS, Singh GS, Rosell CM. 2008. Extending shelf life of chapatti by partial baking and

1485   frozen storage. J Food Eng 89:466-71.

1486   Hager AS, Ryan LAM, Schwab C, Ganzle MG, O'Doherty JV, Arendt EK. 2011. Influence

1487   of the soluble fibres inulin and oat β-glucan on quality of dough and bread. Eur Food Res

1488   Technol 232:405-13.

1489   Hahn PW, Huang VT, Goedeken DL, Sierzant RL, inventors. 2001. Non-emulsion based,

1490   moisture containing filling for dough products. U.S patent 6280782.

1491   Haros M, Rosell CM, Benedito C. 2002. Effect of different carbohydrates on fresh bread

1492   texture and bread staling. Eur Food Res Technol 215:425-30.

1493   Herz KO. 1965. Staling of bread: A review. Food Technol 19:1828-41.

1494   Hollingworth CS. 2010. Food hydrocolloids: Characteristics, properties and structures. New

1495   York: Nova Science Publishers.

1496   Hoseney RC. 1984. Functional properties of pentosans in baked foods. Food Technol 38:114-

1497   7.

1498   Hoseney C, Miller R. 1998. Current understanding of staling of bread. AIB Res Dept Tech

1499   Bull 20:1-6.

1500 Hromádková Z, Stavová A, Ebringerová A, Hirsch J. 2007. Effect of buckwheat hull

1501   hemicelluloses addition on the bread-making quality of wheat flour. J Food Nut Res

1502   46:158-66.

1503 Hung PV, Maeda T, Morita N. 2006. Waxy and high-amylose wheat starches and flours:

1504   characteristics, functionality and application. Trends Food Sci Technol 17:448-56.

1505 Hung PV, Maeda T, Morita N. 2007a. Dough and bread qualities of flours with whole waxy

1506   wheat flour substitution. Food Res Int 40:273-9.

1507 Hung VP, Maeda T, Fuijta M, Morita N. 2007b. Dough properties and breadmaking qualities

1508   of whole waxy wheat flour and effects of additional enzymes. J Sci Food Agric 87:2538-43.

1509 Hüttner EK, Dal Bello F, Arendt EK. 2010. Fundamental study on the effect of hydrostatic

1510   pressure treatment on the bread-making performance of oat flour. Eur Food Res Technol

1511   230:827-35.

1512 Inagaki T, Seib PA. 1992. Firming of bread crumb with cross-linked waxy barley starch

1513   substituted for wheat starch. Cereal Chem 69:321-5.

1514 Ito M, Kim SJ, Sarker ZJ, Hashimoto N, Noda T, Takigawa S, Matsuura-Endo C, Horibata T,

1515   Nakaura Y, Inouchi N, Fukushima M, Yamauchi H. 2007. Staling and texture of bread

1516   prepared from new Japanese bread wheat varieties with slightly low-amylose starch. Food

1517   Sci Technol Res 13:121-8.

1518 Izydorczyk MS, Dexter JE. 2008. Barley β-glucans and arabinoxylans: Molecular structure,

1519   physicochemical properties, and uses in food products – a Review. Food Res Int 41:850-68.

1520 Jacobs MS, Izydorczyk MS, Preston KR, Dexter JE. 2008. Evaluation of baking procedures

1521   for incorporation of barley roller milling fractions containing high levels of dietary fibre

1522   into bread. J Sci Food Agric 88:558-68.

1523 Jacobson SMH, inventor. 2003. Dough product treatment process and products thereof. U.S

1524   patent 0203091.

1525   Jahromi SHR, Yazdi FT, Karimi M, Mortazavi SA, Davoodi MG, Pourfarzad A, Sourki AH.

1526   2012. Application of glazing for bread quality improvement. Food Bioprocess Technol

1527   5:2381-91.

1528   Jakob F, Steger S, Vogel RF. 2012. Influence of novel fructans produced by selected acetic

1529   acid bacteria on the volume and texture of wheat breads. Eur Food Res Technol 34:493-9.

1530   Jekle M, Becker T. 2012. Effects of acidification, sodium chloride, and moisture levels on

1531   wheat dough: II. Modeling of bread texture and staling kinetics. Food Biophys 7:200-8.

1532   Jiang Z, Bail AL, Wu A. 2008. Effect of the thermostable xylanase B (XynB) from

1533   *Thermotoga maritima* on the quality of frozen partially baked bread. J Cereal Sci 47:172-9.

1534   Jones A, Lamsa M, Frandsen TP, Spendler T, Harris P, Sloma A, Xu F, Nielsen JB, Cherry

1535   JR. 2008. Directed evolution of a maltogenic α-amylase from *Bacillus* sp. TS-25. J

1536   Biotechnol 134:325-33.

1537   Karaoğlu MM. 2006. Effect of baking procedure and storage on the pasting properties and

1538   staling of part-baked and rebaked wheat bran bread. Int J Food Sci Technol 41:77-82.

1539   Karaoğlu MM, Kotancilar HG. 2006. Effect of partial baking, storage and rebaking process

1540   on the quality of white pan bread. Int J Food Sci Technol 41:108-14.

1541   Karim AA, Norziah MH, Seow CC. 2000. Methods for the study of starch retrogradation.

1542   Food Chem 71:9-36.

1543   Katina K, Salmenkallio-Marttila M, Partanen R, Forssell P, Autio K. 2006a. Effects of

1544   sourdough and enzymes on staling of high-fibre wheat bread. Lebensm Wiss Technol

1545   39:479-91.

1546   Katina K, Heiniö RL, Autio K, Poutanen K. 2006b. Optimization of sourdough process for

1547   improved sensory profile and texture of wheat bread. Lebensm Wiss Technol 39:1189-

1548   1202.

1549 Kerch G, Rustichelli F, Ausili P, Zicans J, Merijs Meri R, Glonin A. 2008. Effect of chitosan

1550   on physical and chemical processes during bread baking and staling. Eur Food Res Technol

1551   226:1459-64.

1552 Kerch G, Zicans J, Merijs Meri R. 2010. The effect of chitosan oligosaccharides on bread

1553   staling. J Cereal Sci 52:491-5.

1554 Kerch, G, Glonin A, Zicans J, Merijs Meri R. 2012a. A DSC study of the effect of bread

1555   making methods on bound water content and redistribution in chitosan-enriched bread. J

1556   Therm Anal Calorim 108:185-9.

1557 Kerch, G, Glonin A, Zicans J, Merijs Meri R. 2012b. A DSC study of the effect of ascorbic

1558   acid on bound water content and distribution in chitosan-enriched bread rolls during

1559   storage. J Therm Anal Calorim 108:73-8.

1560 Kim SK, D'Appolonia BL. 1977. Effect of pentosans on the retrogradation of wheat starch

1561   gels. Cereal Chem 54:150-60.

1562 Kim JH, Maeda T, Morita N. 2006. Effect of fungal α-amylase on the dough properties and

1563   bread quality of wheat flour substituted with polished flours. Food Res Int 39:117-26.

1564 Knightly WH. 1973. The evolution of softeners and conditioners used in baked foods. Bakers

1565   Dig 47:64-73.

1566 Kohajdová Z, Karovičová J. 2009. Application of hydrocolloids as baking improvers.

1567   Chemical Pap 63:26-38.

1568 Kohajdová Z, Karovičová J, Schmidt S. 2009. Significance of emulsifiers and hydrocolloids

1569   in bakery industry. Acta Chim Slovaca 2:46-61.

1570 Kulp K, Ponte JG Jr. 1981. Staling of white pan bread: fundamental causes. CRC Critical Rev

1571   Food Sci Nutr 15:1-48.

1572 Lafaye J, Lee H, Blake L, Jenner C. 2013. Waxy durum acts as a unique form of crumb

1573   softener in bread. J Cereal Sci 58:393-9.

1574   Lagrain B, Wilderjans E, Glorieux C, Delcour JA. 2012. Importance of gluten and starch for

1575   structural and textural properties of crumb from fresh and stored bread. Food Biophys

1576   7:173-81.

1577   Lang KW, Eberhardt GM, Entenmann WJ, Shipman FP, inventors. 1987. Glaze composition

1578   for bakery products. U.S patent 4645674.

1579   Larre C. Denery PS, Popineau Y, Deshayes G, Desserme C, Lefebvre J. 2000. Biochemical

1580   analysis and rheological properties of gluten modified by transglutaminase. Cereal Chem

1581   77:32-8.

1582   Lasekan O, Chiemela C, Ossai B, Adzahan NM. 2011. Effect of different pineapple juice

1583   (*Ananas comosus* L.) preparations on the microstructure, staling and textural properties of

1584   wheat bread. J Food Proc Eng 34:1449-63.

1585   Le-Bail A, Boumali K, Jury V, Ben-Aissa F. 2009. Impact of the kinetic of baking on staling

1586   rate and on the mechanical properties of crumb and degassed crumb. J Cereal Sci 50:235-

1587   40.

1588   Le-Bail A, Leray G, Perronnet A, Roelens G. 2011. Impact of the chilling conditions on the

1589   kinetics of staling of bread. J Cereal Sci 54:13-9.

1590   Le-Bail A, Agrane S, Queveau D. 2012. Impact of the baking duration on bread staling

1591   kinetics. Food Bioprocess Technol 5:2323-30.

1592   Le Meste M, Huang VT, Panama J, Anderson G, Lentz R. 1992. Glass transition of bread.

1593   Cereal Food World 37:264-7.

1594   León AE, Durán E, De Barber CB. 2002. Utilization of enzyme mixtures to retard bread

1595   crumb firming. J Agric Food Chem 50:1416-9.

1596   León AE, Barrera GN, Pérez GT, Ribotta PD, Rosell CM. 2006. Effect of damaged starch

1597   levels on flour-thermal behaviour and bread staling. Eur Food Res Technol 224:187-92.

1598   Liu Z, Scanlon MG. 2004. Revisiting crumb texture evaluation methods. Tension,

1599   compression, and indentation. Cereal Food Worlds 49:76-82.

1600   Lodi A, Abduljalil AM, Vodovotz, Y. 2007a. Characterization of water distribution in bread

1601   during storage using magnetic resonance imaging. Magn Reson Imaging 25:1449-58.

1602   Lodi A, Tiziani S, Vodovot, Y. 2007b. Molecular changes in soy and wheat breads during

1603   storage as probed by nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR). J Agric Food Chem 55:5850-7.

1604   Lodi A, Vodovotz Y. 2008. Physical properties and water state changes during storage in soy

1605   bread with and without almond. Food Chem 110:554-61.

1606   Lonergan DA, inventor 1999. Glaze for dough products. U.S patent 5965180.

1607   Maeda T, Hashimoto T, Minoda M, Tamagawa S, Morita N. 2003. Effects of mutant

1608   thermostable α-amylase on rheological properties of wheat dough and bread. Cereal Chem

1609   80:722-7.

1610   Maeda T, Morita N. 2003. Flour quality and pentosan prepared by polishing wheat grain on

1611   breadmaking. Food Res Int 36:603-10.

1612   Maga JA. 1975. Bread staling. CRC Critical Rev Food Technol 5:443-86.

1613   Majzoobi M, Farahnaky A, Agah S. 2011a. Properties and shelf-life of part-and full-baked

1614   flat bread (Barbari) at ambient and frozen storage. J Agr Sci Tech 13:1077-90.

1615   Majzoobi M, Ghavi FS, Farahnaky A, Jamalian J, Mesbahi G. 2011b. Effect of tomato

1616   pomace powder on the physicochemical properties of flat bread (Barbari bread). J Food

1617   Process Pres 35:247-56.

1618   Majzoobi M, Farhoodi S, Farahnaky A, Taghipour MJ. 2012. Properties of dough and flat

1619   bread containing wheat germ. J Agr Sci Tech 14:1053-65.

1620   Maleki G, Milani JM, Amiri Z. 2012. Effect of different hydrocolloids on staling of Barbari

1621   bread. Adv Food Sci 34:1-7.

1622   Mandala IG, Sotirakoglou K. 2005. Effect of frozen storage and microwave reheating on

1623   some physical attributes of fresh bread containing hydrocolloids. Food Hydrocolloids

1624   19:709-19.

1625   Mandala I, Karabela D, Kostaropoulos A. 2007. Physical properties of breads containing

1626   hydrocolloids stored at low temperature. I. Effect of chilling. Food Hydrocolloid 21:1397-

1627   1406.

1628   Mandala I, Kapetanakou A, Kostaropoulos A. 2008. Physical properties of breads containing

1629   hydrocolloids stored at low temperature. I. Effect of freezing. Food Hydrocolloid 22:1443-

1630   51.

1631   Mandala I, Polaki A, Yanniotis S. 2009. Influence of frozen storage on bread enriched with

1632   different ingredients. J Food Eng 92:137-45.

1633   Manzocco L, Calligaris S, Da Pieve S, Marzona S, Nicoli MC. 2012. Effect of

1634   monoglyceride-oil–water gels on white bread properties. Food Res Int 49:778-82.

1635   Matuda TG, Parra DF, Lugao AB, Tadini CC. 2005. Influence of vegetable shortening and

1636   emulsifiers on the unfrozen water content and textural properties of frozen French bread

1637   dough. Lebens Wiss Technol 38:275-80.

1638   Matz SA 1989. Sweeteners and malt syrup. In: Matz SA, editor. Technology of the materials

1639   of baking. Chicago, USA: Elsevier Science Publishers. p 116-9.

1640   Mentes Ö, Bakkalbassi E, Ercan R. 2008. Effect of the use of ground flaxseed on quality and

1641   chemical composition of bread. Food Sci Tech Int 14:299-306.

1642   Milani J, Maleki G. 2012. Hydrocolloids in food industry. In: Valdez B, editor. Food

1643   industrial processes - Methods and equipment. Ryieka: InTech. P16-38. Open access,

1644   available from: http://www.intechopen.com/books/food-industrial-processes-methods-and

1645   equipment/hydrocolloids-in-food-industry.

1646   Miyazaki M, Maeda T, Morita N. 2004. Effect of various dextrin substitutions for wheat flour

1647   on dough properties and bread qualities. Food Res Int 37:59-65.

1648   Miyazaki M, Hung PV, Maeda T, Morita N. 2006. Recent advances in application of

1649   modified starches for breadmaking. Trends Food Sci Technol 17:591-9.

1650   Miyazaki M, Maeda T, Morita N. 2008. Bread quality of frozen dough substituted with

1651   modified tapioca starches. Eur Food Res Technol 227:503-9.

1652   Mnif I, Besbes S, Ellouze R, Ellouze-Chaabouni S, Ghribi D. 2012. Improvement of bread

1653   quality and bread shelf-life by *Bacillus subtilis* biosurfactant addition. Food Sci Biotechnol

1654   21:1105-12.

1655   Morgan KR, Hutt L, Gerrard J, Every D, Ross M, Gilpin M. 1997. Staling in starch breads.

1656   The effect of antistaling α-amylase. Starch/Stärke 49:54-9.

1657   Motoki M, Seguro K. 1998. Transglutaminase and its use for food processing. Trends Food

1658   Sci Technol 9:204-10.

1659   Mouliney M, Lavery B, Sharma R, Jenner C. 2011. Waxy durum and fat differ in their

1660   actions as improvers of bread quality. J Cereal Sci 54:317-23.

1661   Mouneim H, Besbes E, Jury V, Monteau JY, Le-Bail A. 2012. Combined effects of baking

1662   conditions and bacterial α-amylases on staling kinetics of degassed and porous bread

1663   crumb. Food Bioprocess Tech 5:3032-41.

1664   Nilufer-Erdil D, Serventi L, Boyacioglu D, Vodovotz Y. 2012. Effect of soy milk powder

1665   addition on staling of soy bread. Food Chem 131:1132-9.

1666   O'Brien C, Mueller A, Scannell A, Arendt EK. 2003. Evaluation of the effects of fat replacers

1667   on the quality of wheat bread. J Food Eng 56:265-7.

1668   Oliveira DS, Telis-Romero J, Da-Silva R, Franco CML. 2014. Effect of a *Thermoascus*

1669   *aurantiacus* thermostable enzyme cocktail on wheat bread quality. Food Chem 143:139-46.

1670   Ozkoc SO, Sumnu G, Sahin S, Turabi E. 2009. Investigation of physicochemical properties of

1671   breads baked in microwave and infrared-microwave combination ovens during storage. Eur

1672   Food Res Technol 228:883-93.

1673   Park CS, Baik BK. 2007. Characteristics of French bread baked from wheat flours of reduced

1674   starch amylose content. Cereal Chem 84:437-42.

1675   Patel BK, Waniska RD, Seetharaman K. 2005. Impact of different baking processes on bread

1676   firmness and starch properties in breadcrumb. J Cereal Sci 42:173-84.

1677   Pateras IMC. 2007. Bread spoilage and staling. In: Cauvain SP, Young LS, editors.

1678   Technology of breadmaking. London: Blackie Academic and Professional. p 275-98.

1679   Peng Q, Chuan-xi M, Rong-lin W, Zhi-you K, Bo-qiao Z. 2009. Effect of waxy wheat flour

1680   blends on the quality of fresh and stale bread. Agric Sci Chi 8:401-9.

1681   Peressini D, Sensidoni A. 2009. Effect of soluble dietary fibre addition on rheological and

1682   breadmaking properties of wheat doughs. J Cereal Sci 49:190-201.

1683   Piccinini M, Fois S, Secchi N, Sanna M, Roggio T, Catzeddu P. 2012. The application of NIR

1684   FT-Raman spectroscopy to monitor starch retrogradation and crumb firmness in semolina

1685   bread. Food Anal Methods 5:1145-9.

1686   Pikus S, Olszewska E, Bęcal M. 2006. Investigation of the staling process of bread using the

1687   small-angle X-ray scattering (SAXS) method. Flavour Fragr J 21:37-41.

1688   Pla ME, Rojas AM, Gerschenson LM. 2013. Effect of butternut (*Cucurbita moschata*

1689   Duchesne ex Poiret) fibres on bread making, quality and staling. Food Bioprocess

1690   Technol 6:828-38.

1691   Plessas S, Bekatorou A, Kanellaki M, Koutinas AA, Marchant R, Banat IM., 2007. Use of

1692   immobilized cell biocatalysts in baking. Process Biochem 42:1244-9.

1693   Poinot P, Arvisenet G, Grua-Priol J, Fillonneau C, Le-Bail A, Prost C. 2010. Influence of

1694   inulin on bread: kinetics and physicochemical indicators of the formation of volatile

1695   compounds during baking. Food Chem 119:1474-84.

1696   Ponte JG Jr, Faubion JM. 1985. Rheology of bread crumb. In: Faridi H, editor. Rheology of

1697   wheat products. St. Paul, Minn.: American Association of Cereal Chemists. p 241-73.

1698   Ponte JG Jr, Ovadia DZ. 1996. Instrumental methods. In: Hebeda RE, Zobel H, editors.

1699   Baked goods freshness. New York: Marcel Dekker. p 151-70.

1700   Popov-Raljić JV, Mastilović JS, Laličić-Petronijević JC, Popov VS. 2009. Investigations of

1701   bread production with postponed staling applying instrumental measurements of bread

1702   crumb color. Sensors 9: 8613-23.

1703   Pourfarzad A, Khodaparast MHH, Karimi M, Mortazavi SA, Davoodi MG, Sourki AH,

1704   Razavizadegan Jahromi SH. 2011. Effect of polyols on shelf-life and quality of flat bread

1705   fortified with soy flour. J Food Process Eng 34:1435-48.

1706   Poufarzad A, Habibi-Najafi MB. 2012. Optimization of a liquid improver for Barbari bread:

1707   staling dough rheology and image characteristics. J Texture Stud 43:484-93.

1708   Primo-Martín C, Pijpekamp A, van de Vliet T, van de Jongh HHJ, Plijter JJ, Hamer RJ. 2006.

1709   The role of the gluten network in the crispness of bread crust. J Cereal Sci 43:342-52.

1710   Primo-Martín C, van Nieuwenhuijzen NH, Hamer RJ, van de Vliet T. 2007. Crystallinity

1711   changes in wheat starch during the bread-making process: Starch crystallinity in the bread

1712   crust. J Cereal Sci 45:219-26.

1713   Purhagen JK, Sjöö ME, Eliasson AC. 2008. Staling effects when adding low amounts of

1714   normal and heat-treated barley flour to a wheat bread. Cereal Chem 85:109-14.

1715   Purhagen JK, Sjöö ME, Eliasson AC. 2011a. Starch affecting antistaling agents and their

1716   function in free-standing and pan-baked bread. J Food Hydrocolloids 25:1656-66.

1717　Purhagen JK, Sjőő ME, Eliasson AC. 2011b. The use of normal and heat-treated barley flour

1718　　and waxy barley starch as antistaling agents in laboratory and industrial baking processes. J

1719　　Food Eng 104:414-21.

1720　Purhagen JK, Sjőő ME, Eliasson AC. 2012. Fibre-rich additives – the effect on staling and

1721　　their function in free-standing and pan-baked bread. J Sci Food Agric 92:1201-13.

1722　Rao JLUM, Satyanarayana T. 2007. Improving production of hyperthermostable and high-

1723　　maltose-forming *a*-amylase by an extreme thermophile *Geobacillus thermoleovorans* using

1724　　response surface methodology and its applications. Bioresource Technol 98:345-52.

1725　Ribotta PD, Pérez GT, León AE, Añón MC. 2004a. Effect of emulsifier and guar gum on

1726　　microstructural, rheological, and baking performance of frozen bread dough. Food

1727　　Hydrocolloids 18:305-13.

1728　Ribotta PD, Cuffini S, León AE, Añón MC. 2004. The staling of bread: an X-ray diffraction

1729　　study. Eur Food Res Technol 218:219-23.

1730　Ribotta PD, Le-Bail A. 2007. Thermo-physical assessment of bread during staling. Lebensm

1731　　Wiss Technol 40:879-84.

1732　Rojas JA, Rosell CM, Benedito de Barber C. 1999. Pasting properties of different wheat

1733　　flour-hydrocolloid systems. Food Hydrocolloids 13:27-33.

1734　Ronda F, Caballero PA, Quilez J, Roos YH. 2011. Staling of frozen partly and fully baked

1735　　breads. Study of the combined effect of amylopectin recrystallization and water content on

1736　　bread firmness. J Cereal Sci 53:97-103.

1737　Rosell CM, Gómez M. 2007. Freezing in breadmaking performance: frozen dough and part-

1738　　baked bread. Food Rev Int 23:303-19.

1739　Rosell CM, Santos E. 2010. Impact of fibers on physical characteristics of fresh and staled

1740　　bake off bread. J Food Eng 98:273-81.

1741   Russell PL. 1983. A kinetic study of bread staling by differential scanning calorimetry and

1742   crumb compressibility measurements. The effect of added monoglycerides. J Cereal

1743   Sci:297-303.

1744   Sabanis D, Soukoulis C, Tzia C. 2009. Effect of raisin juice addition on bread produced from

1745   different wheat cultivars. Food Sci Tech Int 15:325-36.

1746   Salehifar M, Shahedi M. 2007. Effects of oat flour on dough rheology, texture and

1747   organoleptic properties of taftoon bread. J Agric Sci Technol 9:227-34.

1748   Sawa K, Inoue S, Lysenko E, Edwards NM, Preston KR. 2009. Effects of purified

1749   monoglycerides on Canadian short process and sponge and dough mixing properties, bread

1750   quality and crumb firmness during storage. Food Chem 115:884-90.

1751   Schiraldi A, Fessas D. 2001. Mechanism of staling: An overview. In: Chinachoti P, Vodovotz

1752   Y, editors. Bread staling. Boca Raton, Fla.: CRC Press. p 1-17.

1753   Seetharaman K, Chinnapha N, Waniska RD, White P. 2002. Changes in textural, pasting and

1754   thermal properties of wheat buns and tortillas during storage. J Cereal Sci 35:215-23.

1755   Selomulyo VO, Zhou W. 2007. Frozen bread dough: Effects of freezing storage and dough

1756   improvers. J Cereal Sci 45:1-17.

1757   Shaikh IM, Shalini GK and Laxmi A. 2008. Inhibition of staling in chapatti (Indian

1758   unleavened flat bread). J Food Process Pres 32:378-403.

1759   Shalini GK, Laxmi A. 2007. Influence of additives on rheological characteristics of whole-

1760   wheat dough and quality of chapatti (Indian unleavened flat bread). Part l. Hydrocolloids.

1761   Food Hydrocolloid 21:110-7.

1762   Shalini GK. 2009. Effect of guar gum on dough stickiness and staling in chapatti: an Indian

1763   unleavened flat bread. Int J Food Eng 5:1-19.

1764   Sharadanant R, Khan K. 2003. Effect of hydrophilic gums on frozen. dough. II. Bread

1765   characteristics. Cereal Chem 80:773-80.

1766   Sharma P, Gujral HS. 2014. Antistaling effects of β-glucan and barley flour in wheat flour

1767   chapatti. Food Chem 145:102-8.

1768   Shittu TA, Raji AO, Sanni LO. 2007. Bread from composite cassava-wheat flour: I. Effect of

1769   baking time and temperature on some physical properties of bread loaf. Food Res Int

1770   40:280-90.

1771   Shittu TA, Raji AO, Abulude EO. 2009. Functional effects of xanthan gum on composite

1772   cassava-wheat dough and bread. Food Hydrocolloids 23:2254-60.

1773   Shon J, Yun Y, Shin M, Chin KB, Eun JB. 2009. Effects of milk proteins and gums on

1774   quality of bread made from frozen dough. J Sci Food Agric 89:1407-15.

1775   Shyu YS, Hwang JY, Hsu CK. 2008. Improving the rheological and thermal properties of

1776   wheat dough by the addition of γ-polyglutamic acid. Lebensm Wiss Technol 41:982-7.

1777   Skendi A, Biliaderis CG, Papageorgiou M, Izydorczyk MS. 2010. Effects of two barley β-

1778   glucan isolates on wheat flour dough and bread properties. Food Chem 119:1159-67.

1779   Sidhu JS, Al-Saqer J, Al-Zenki S. 1996. Comparison of methods for the assessment of the

1780   extent of staling in bread. Food Chem 58:161-7.

1781   Sim SY, Noor Aziah AA, Cheng LH. 2011. Characteristics of wheat dough and Chinese

1782   steamed bread with added sodium alginates or konjac glucomannan. Food Hydrocolloids

1783   25:951-7.

1784   Sivam AS, Sun-Waterhouse D, Young Quek S, Perera CO. 2010. Properties of bread dough

1785   with added fiber polysaccharides and phenolic antioxidants: a review. J Food Sci

1786   75:R163-R74.

1787   Slade L, Levine H. 1987. Recent advances in starch retrogradation. In: Stivala SS, Crescenzi

1788   V, Dea ICM, editors. Industrial polysaccharides -The impact of biotechnology and

1789   advanced methodologies. New York: Gordon and Breach. p 387-430.

1790 Slade L, Levine H. 1989. A food polymer science approach to selected aspects of starch

1791   gelatinization and retrogradation. In: Frontiers in carbohydrate research–1. Millane RP,

1792   Bemiller JN, Chandrasekaran R, editors. London: Elsevier Applied Science. p 215-70.

1793 Smith PR, Johansson J. 2004. Influences of the proportion of solid fat in shortening on loaf

1794   volume and staling of bread. J Food Process Pres 28**:**359-67.

1795 Smitha S, Rajiv J, Begum K, Indrani D. 2008. Effect of hydrocolloids on rheological,

1796   microstructural and quality characteristics of parotta: an unleavened Indian flat bread. J

1797   Texture Stud 39:267-83.

1798 Stampfli L, Nersten B. 1995. Emulsifiers in bread making. Food Chem 52:353-60.

1799 Symons LJ, Brennan CS. 2004. The effect of barley beta-glucan fibre fractions on starch

1800   gelatinization and pasting characteristics. J Food Sci 69:257-61.

1801 Tamani RJ, Goh KKT, Brennan CS. 2013. Physico-chemical properties of sourdough bread

1802   production using selected *Lactobacilli* starter cultures. J Food Qual 36:245-52.

1803 Tavakolipour H, Kalbasi-Ashtari A. 2007. Influence of gums on dough properties and flat

1804   bread quality of two Persian wheat varieties. J Food Process Eng 30:74-87.

1805 Tian YQ, Li Y, Jin ZY, Xu XM, Wang YP, Jiao AQ, Yu B, Talba T. 2009. β-Cyclodextrin

1806   (β-CD): A new approach in bread staling. Thermochim Acta 489:22-6.

1807 Tipples KH. 1969. The relation of starch damage to the baking performance of flour. Bakers'

1808   Dig 43:28-32, 44.

1809 Toufeili I, Habbal Y, Shadarevian S, Olabi A. 1999. Substitution of wheat starch with non-

1810   wheat starches and cross-linked waxy barley starch affects sensory properties and staling of

1811   Arabic bread. J Sci Food Agric 79:1855-60.

1812 Vallons KIR, Ryan LAM, Koehler P, Arendt EK. 2010. High pressure–treated sorghum flour

1813   as a functional ingredient in the production of sorghum bread. Eur Food Res Technol

1814   231:711-7.

1815 Van der Maarel MJEC, van der Veen B, Uitdehaag JCM, Leemhuis H, Dijkhuizen L. 2002.

1816   Properties and applications of starch-converting enzymes of the α-amylase family. J

1817   Biotechnol 94:137-155.

1818 Vittadini E, Vodovotz Y. 2003. Changes in the physico-chemical properties of wheat and soy

1819   containing breads during storage as studied by thermal analyses. J Food Sci 68:2022-7.

1820 Vodovotz Y, Baik M, Vittadini E, Chinachoti P. 2001. Instrumental techniques used in bread

1821   staling analysis. In: Chinachoti P, Vodovotz Y, editors. Bread staling. New York: CRC

1822   Press. p 93-111.

1823 Wang J, Rosell C, Beneditodebarber C. 2002. Effect of the addition of different fibres on

1824   wheat dough performance and bread quality. Food Chem 79:221-6.

1825 Wang JS, Zhao MM, Yang XQ, Jiang YM. 2006. Improvement of emulsifying properties of

1826   wheat gluten hydrolysate /λ-carrageenan conjugates. Food Technol Biotechnol 44:25-32.

1827 Wang JS, Zhao M., Yueming J., 2007. Effects of wheat gluten hydrolysate and its

1828   ultrafiltration fractions on dough properties and bread quality. Food Technol Biotechnol

1829   45:410-4.

1830 Watanabe M, Maeda T, Tsukahara K, Kayahara H, Morita N. 2004. Application of

1831   pregerminated brown rice for breadmaking. Cereal Chem 81:450-5.

1832 Waters DM, Murray PG, Ryan LA, Arendt EA, Tuohy MG. 2010. *Talaromyces emersonii*

1833   thermostable enzyme systems and their applications in wheat baking systems. J Agric Food

1834   Chem 58:7415-22.

1835 Woo KS, Seib PA. 2002. Cross-linked resistant starch: Preparation and properties. Cereal

1836   Chem 79: 819-25.

1837 Wu KL, Sung WC, Yang CH. 2009. Characteristics of dough and bread as affected by the

1838   incorporation of sweet potato paste in the formulation. J Mar Sci Technol 17:13-22.

1839   Xie F, Dowell FE, Sun XS. 2003. Comparison of near-infrared reflectance spectroscopy and
1840   texture analyzer for measuring wheat bread changes in storage. Cereal Chem 80:25-9.

1841   Xie F, Dowell FE, Sun XS. 2004. Using visible and near-infrared reflectance spectroscopy
1842   and differential scanning calorimetry to study starch, protein and temperature effects on
1843   bread staling. Cereal Chem 81:249-54.

1844   Yi J. 2008. Improving frozen bread dough quality through processing and ingredients. PhD
1845   Dissertation, Food Science and Technology, University of Georgia.

1846   Yi J, Kerr WL. 2009. Combined effects of dough freezing and storage conditions on bread
1847   quality factors. J Food Eng 93:495-501.

1848   Yi J, Johnson JW, Kerr WL. 2009. Properties of bread made from frozen dough containing
1849   waxy wheat flour. J Cereal Sci 50:364-9.

1850   Yook C, Pek UH, Park KH. 1993. Gelatinization and retrogradation characteristics of
1851   hydroxypropylated and cross-linked rice. J Food Sci 58:405-7.

1852   Yun Y, Eun JB. 2006. Effects of milk proteins and gums on quality of bread made from
1853   frozen dough following freeze-thaw cycles. Food Sci Biotechnol 15:805-13.

1854   Zhang D, Moore WR, Doehlert DC. 1998. Effects of oat grain hydrothermal treatments on
1855   wheat-oat flour dough properties and bread baking quality. Cereal Chem 75:602-5.

1856   Zheng GH, Han HL, Bhatty RS. 1999. Functional properties of cross-linked and
1857   hydroxypropylated waxy hull-less barley starches. Cereal Chem 76:182-8.

1858   Zheng H, Guo B, Chen XL, Fan SJ, Zhang YZ. 2011. Improvement of the quality of wheat
1859   bread by addition of glycoside hydrolase family 10 xylanases. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol
1860   90:509-15.

1861   Zhou Y, Wang D, Wan X, Zhang L, Du X, Hu W. 2009. Effect of tea polysaccharide addition
1862   on the properties of bread made from two flours. J Food Process Pres 33:798-813.

1863

1864

1865   Table 1 – Topics regarding bread staling covered by reviews or book chapters.

Topic	Review	Book or book chapter
Enzymes	Amos 1955; Haros and others 2002; van der Mareel and others 2002; Butt and others 2008; Goesaert and others 2009.	Bowles 1996.
Fibers	Sivam and others 2010.	
Freezing and partial baking	Rosell and Gomez 2007; Selomulyo and Zhou 2007; Yi 2008.	
Fundamental causes	Kulp and Ponte 1981; Le Meste and others 1992.	
Hydrocolloids	Izydorczyk and Dexter 2008; Kohajdová and Karovičová 2009; Kohajdova and others 2009.	Milani and Maleki 2012.
Methodologies	Choi and others 2010; Karim and others 2000; Chung and others 2003; Liu and Scanlon 2004.	Ponte and Faubion 1985; Ponte and Ovadia 1996; Vodovotz and others 2001.
Pentosans	Hoseney 1984.	
Polyols	Bhise and Kaur 2013.	
Proteins		Davies 1986.
Sodium chloride	Beck and others 2012a.	
Sourdough	Arendt and others 2007; Chavan and Chavan 2011.	
Starch	Myiazaki and others 2006.	Alsberg 1928; Slade and Levine 1987; Slade and Levine 1989; Hung and others 2006.
Staling	Hertz 1965; Zobel 1973; Maga 1975; Knightly 1977; D'Appolonia and Morad 1981; Hoseney and Miller 1998; Schiraldi and Fessas 2001; Gray and Bemiller 2003.	Alsberg 1936; Chinachoti and Vodovotz 2000; Pateras 2007; Cauvain and Young 2008.
Surface-active lipids and shortenings	Knightly 1973; Stampfli and Nersten 1995; Kohajdova and others (2009a).	

	Water	Choi and others 2008.	Cauvain and Young 2008.

1866
1867

1868

1869 Table 2 – Main hydrocolloids proposed during the last decade for staling reduction.

Hydrocolloid class	Hydrocolloid name	Effect	Suggested references
Cellulose	HPMC[a]	Interaction with other bread constituents and in particular with water (retention capacity and starch-gluten interactions)	Bell 1990; Collar and others 1999; Barcenas and Rosell 2005; Tavakolipour and Kalbasi-Ashtari 2007.
Hemicellulose	GG	Inhibition of amylopectin retrogradation	Ribotta and others 2004; Shalini and Laxi 2007.
	LBG	Increased loaf volume and improved texture	Sharadanant and Khan 2003; Selomulyo and Zhou 2007; Angioloni and Collar 2009a.
	KGM	Hindering effect on macromolecular entanglements	Sim and others 2011.
	Arabinoxylans and β-glucan	Competition for water, limitation of starch swelling and gelatinization	Izydorczyk and Dexter 2008; Jacobs and others 2008; Hager and others 2011.
Microbial	XG	Increased water absorption, retardation of amylose retrogradation, gluten-starch interactions	Collar and others 1999; Mandala and Sotirakoglou 2005; Mandala and others 2007; Shittu and others 2009
Pectins	Pectin, HMP	Competition for water, reduction of amylopectin recrystallization	Rosell and Santos 2010; Correa and others 2012
Animal	Chitosan	Inhibition of crosslink formation between	Kerch and others 2010, 2012a,

	starch granules and protein fibrils	2012b.

1870   [a]For abbreviations see the list of abbreviations at the start of this review.

1871

1872