Federica Russo

Causality and Causal Modelling in the Social Sciences

Measuring Variations

Springer

Contents

Preface xiii

Introduction 1
1 Scope of the Book and Methodology 1
2 Structure of the Book 3
3 Philosophical Issues at the Back of One's Mind 5
4 Philosophy at the Service of Social Research 9
5 Open Problems: Causal Realism, Objectivity, and Social Ontology 11

1 What Do Social Scientists Do? 15
1.1 Different Causal Claims? 16
1.2 Smoking and Lung Cancer 20
1.3 Mother's Education and Child Survival 21
1.4 Health and Wealth 23
1.5 Farmers' Migration 24
1.6 Job Satisfaction 25
1.7 Methodological and Epistemological Morals 25
1.7.1 Statistical Causality in the Social Sciences 26
1.7.2 Causal Claims in Causal Contexts 30
1.7.3 Testing Variations 31
1.7.4 Modelling Mechanisms 32

2 Probabilistic Approaches 35
2.1 Philosophical Accounts: Good and Suppes 36
2.1.1 Good (1960–1961) 36
2.1.2 Suppes (1970) 40
2.1.3 Good and Suppes: Common Features 43
2.2 Probabilistic Theories: Traditional Criticisms 44
2.2.1 Probabilistic Theories vs. Deterministic Theories 44
2.2.2 Negative Causes and Twofold Causality 46
2.3 Bringing Causal Theory to Maturity 50

3 **Methodology of Causal Modelling** 53
3.1 Methods and Assumptions of Causal Modelling 54
3.1.1 Path Models and Causal Diagrams 54
3.1.2 Covariance Structure Models 60
3.1.3 Granger-Causality 61
3.1.4 Rubin's Model 63
3.1.5 Multilevel Analysis 64
3.1.6 Contingency Tables 67
3.2 Hypothetico-Deductive Methodology 70
3.3 Difficulties and Weaknesses of Causal Modelling 75
3.3.1 Background Knowledge and the Formulation of Causal Hypotheses 76
3.3.2 Theorising or Modelling? 77
3.3.3 Lack of Theory 78
3.3.4 Establishing Social Laws 79
3.3.5 Concepts and Indicators 80
3.3.6 Causal Directionality 83
3.3.7 Searching Causes of Effects or Effects of Causes? 83
3.3.8 Underdetermination 84
3.3.9 Complexity of Causal Structures 85
3.3.10 Interpretation of Tests 86
3.3.11 Validity 87
3.3.12 Generalisability 90

4 **Epistemology of Causal Modelling** 91
4.1 The Rationale of Causality: Measuring Variations 92
4.1.1 Methodological Arguments 94
4.1.2 Foundations 101
4.1.3 Arguments from the Philosophical Literature 105
4.1.4 Objections, or Further Evidence for Variation 107
4.2 Varieties of Variations 114
4.3 What Guarantees the Causal Interpretation? 116
4.3.1 Associational Models 117
4.3.2 Causal Models 119

5 **Methodological Consequences: Objective Bayesianism** 133
5.1 Probabilistic Causal Inferences 134
5.2 Interpretations of Probability 135
5.2.1 Classical and Logical Interpretation 135
5.2.2 Physical Interpretation: Frequentist and Propensity 136
5.2.3 Bayesian Interpretations 137
5.3 The Case for Frequency-Driven Epistemic Probabilities 139
5.3.1 Probability as a Twofold Concept 140
5.3.2 Frequency-Driven Epistemic Probabilities 141
5.3.3 Credence-Driven Physical Probabilities 145

5.3.4 Objections 146
5.4 Objective Bayesianism in Causal Modelling 150
5.4.1 Empirically-Based vs. Objective Bayesianism 150
5.4.2 Design and Interpretation of Tests 151
5.4.3 Guide for Action 153

6 Methodological Consequences: Mechanisms and Levels of Causation 155
6.1 Mechanisms 156
6.1.1 Modelling Mechanisms 156
6.1.2 Mixed Mechanisms 163
6.1.3 Explaining Through Mechanisms 165
6.1.4 Modelling Causal Mechanisms vs. Modelling Decision-Making Processes 171
6.2 Levels of Causation 172
6.2.1 Twofold Causality 173
6.2.2 The Connecting Principle 179
6.3 Levels of Analysis 183
6.3.1 Types of Variables and of Fallacies 184
6.3.2 Levels of Analysis vs. Levels of Causation 186
6.3.3 Levels of Analysis 187
6.3.4 Levels of Analysis and Variation in Multilevel Models ... 189

7 Supporting the Rationale of Variation 193
7.1 Variation in Mechanist Approaches 194
7.2 Variation in Counterfactuals 197
7.3 Variation in Agency Theories 200
7.4 Variation in Manipulability Theories 203
7.5 Variation in Epistemic Causality 205
7.6 Variation in Single Instances 207

Concluding Remarks 211
1 Objectives, Methodology, and Results 211
2 The Methodological Import of Philosophical Results 214

Bibliography 217

Index 231