

#### CAUSATION AND CREATION IN LATE ANTIQUITY

Written by a group of leading scholars, this unique collection of essays investigates the views of both pagan and Christian philosophers on causation and the creation of the cosmos. Structured in two parts, the volume first looks at divine agency and how late antique thinkers, including the Stoics, Plotinus, Porphyry, Simplicius, Philoponus and Gregory of Nyssa, tackled questions such as: is the cosmos eternal? Did it come from nothing or from something pre-existing? How was it caused to come into existence? Is it material or immaterial? The second part looks at questions concerning human agency and responsibility, including the problem of evil and the nature of will, considering thinkers such as Plotinus, Porphyry, Proclus and Augustine. Highlighting some of the most important and interesting aspects of these philosophical debates, the volume will be of great interest to upper-level students and scholars of philosophy, classics, theology and ancient history.

ANNA MARMODORO is an Official Fellow in Philosophy at Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford. She is the author of *Aristotle on Perceiving Objects* (2014), and editor of a number of volumes including *The Author's Voice in Classical and Late Antiquity* (co-edited with Jonathan Hill, 2013) and *The Metaphysics of Powers: Their Grounding and their Manifestations* (2010).

BRIAN D. PRINCE is a Postdoctoral Researcher at the University of Oxford. He has published articles in journals including *Apeiron:* A Journal for Ancient Philosophy and Science and Plato: The Internet Journal of the International Plato Society.





# CAUSATION AND CREATION IN LATE ANTIQUITY

ANNA MARMODORO
and
BRIAN D. PRINCE





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107061538

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Causation and creation in late antiquity / edited by Anna Marmodoro and Brian D. Prince.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-06153-8 (Hardback)

I. Causation. 2. Cosmogony. 3. Creation. 4. Cosmology. I. Marmodoro, Anna, 1975– editor. BD591.C38 2014

122.09-dc23 2014026342

ISBN 978-1-107-06153-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

Notes on contributors Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii xi
	roduction a Marmodoro and Brian D. Prince	I
PAF	RT I: THE ORIGIN OF THE COSMOS	
Ι	Two early Stoic theories of cosmogony Ricardo Salles	II
2	Plotinus' account of demiurgic causation and its philosophical background  Riccardo Chiaradonna	31
3	Creation and divine providence in Plotinus Christopher Isaac Noble and Nathan M. Powers	51
4	Waiting for Philoponus  Richard Sorabji	71
5	Gregory of Nyssa on the creation of the world <i>Anna Marmodoro</i>	94
6	Simplicius on elements and causes in Greek philosophy: critical appraisal or philosophical synthesis?  Han Baltussen	III



V1	Table of Contents	
PAI	RT II: THE ORIGINS OF HUMAN AGENCY	
7	Divine and human freedom: Plotinus' new understanding of creative agency <i>Kevin Corrigan</i>	131
8	Consciousness and agency in Plotinus D. M. Hutchinson	150
9	Neoplatonists on the causes of vegetative life James Wilberding	171
IO	Astrology and the will in Porphyry of Tyre Aaron P. Johnson	186
II	Proclus on the ethics of self-constitution  Michael Griffin	202
12	Deficient causes: Augustine on creation and angels <i>Gillian Clark</i>	220
13	Willed causes and causal willing in Augustine  Mark Edwards	237
Ref	erences	253
-	Index locorum	

General index

275

289



#### Contributors

HAN BALTUSSEN is the Hughes Professor of Classics at the University of Adelaide and a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities. He has published on a wide range of topics in the history of philosophy. He is the author, editor or translator of five books, including *Theophrastus Against the Presocratics and Plato* (2000), *Philosophy, Science and Exegesis in Greek, Latin and Arabic Commentaries* (with P. Adamson and M. Stone, 2004), *Philosophy and Exegesis in Simplicius: The Methodology of a Commentator* (2008), *Simplicius' Commentary on Aristotle's* Physics 1.5–9 (with M. Share, M. Atkinson and I. Mueller, 2012) and *Greek and Roman Consolations: Eight Studies of a Tradition and its Afterlife* (2013).

Professor of Ancient Philosophy at Roma Tre University. His publications include Sostanza Movimento Analogia: Plotino Critico di Aristotele (2002), Plotino (2009), Physics and Philosophy of Nature in Greek Neoplatonism (with F. Trabattoni, 2009), Universals in Ancient Philosophy (with G. Galluzzo, 2013), as well as numerous articles on Plotinus, Neoplatonism, the Ancient Commentators and Galen.

GILLIAN CLARK FBA is Professor Emerita of Ancient History at the University of Bristol. She works on the social and intellectual history of late antiquity. Her publications include *Porphyry: On Abstinence* (2000), *Christianity and Roman Society* (2004), *Late Antiquity: A Very Short Introduction* (2011), *Body and Gender, Soul and Reason in Late Antiquity* (2011), and many papers on Augustine. Her main work in progress is a commentary project on *City of God* (www.epiphanius.org). She also coedits *Oxford Early Christian Studies* and *Translated Texts for Historians* 300–800.

KEVIN CORRIGAN is Samuel Candler Dobbs Professor of Interdisciplinary Humanities and Director of the Graduate Institute of the Liberal



viii

#### Notes on contributors

Arts at Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia. His recent works include Evagrius and Gregory: Mind, Soul and Body in the 4th Century (2009), Religion and Philosophy in the Platonic and Neoplatonic Traditions: From Antiquity to the Early Medieval Period (edited with J. D. Turner and P. Wakefield, 2012) and Reason, Faith and Otherness in Neoplatonic and Early Christian Thought (2013).

- MARK EDWARDS is Tutor in Theology at Christ Church, Oxford, and Lecturer in Patristic Theology in the Faculty of Theology and Religion at the University of Oxford. He is the author of *Neoplatonic Saints* (2000), *Origen against Plato* (2002), *John through the Centuries* (2003), Constantine and Christendom (2004), Culture and Philosophy in the Age of Plotinus (2006), Catholicity and Heresy in the Early Church (2009) and Image, Word and God in the Early Christian Centuries (2012).
- MICHAEL GRIFFIN is Assistant Professor in Classics and Philosophy at the University of British Columbia. He has published on Neoplatonism and the Aristotelian tradition in antiquity, and is the author of *Aristotle's* Categories in the Early Roman Empire (2014). He is co-editor of the Ancient Commentators on Aristotle series. The first volume of his translation of Olympiodorus of Alexandria's commentary on the Alcibiades I is due to be published with the same series in 2014.
- D. M. HUTCHINSON is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at St Olaf College. He specialises in Plotinus and late ancient philosophy, and has published on Plotinus. He is currently writing a book on Plotinus' theory of consciousness.
- AARON P. JOHNSON teaches classics at Lee University and works on Greek literature in late antiquity. He has authored *Ethnicity and Argument in Eusebius*' Praeparatio Evangelica (2006), *Religion and Identity in Porphyry of Tyre* (2013) and *Eusebius* (2014), as well as several discussions of various aspects of intellectual culture in the third and fourth centuries.
- ANNA MARMODORO is an Official Fellow in Philosophy at Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford. She specialises in ancient philosophy and contemporary metaphysics, with research interests also in medieval philosophy, the philosophy of mind and philosophy of religion. Her publications span all these areas. Recent work in press include a monograph on *Aristotle on Perceiving Objects* (2014), a number of edited volumes, among them *The Metaphysics of Relations* (with David



#### Notes on contributors

Yates, 2015) and *The Metaphysics of Powers: Their Grounding and their Manifestations* (2010), and numerous articles in peer-reviewed journals and edited collections. Dr Marmodoro directs a large research group investigating Power Structuralism in Ancient Ontologies, based in the Faculty of Philosophy of the University Oxford.

CHRISTOPHER ISAAC NOBLE is a Post-doctoral Fellow at the Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München. He works primarily on Plotinus, and has published articles on various aspects of ancient Greek psychology, physics and cosmology.

NATHAN M. POWERS is an Associate Professor of Philosophy at the State University of New York at Albany. He works primarily on Plato and on Hellenistic philosophy, and has published articles on various aspects of ancient Greek natural philosophy, epistemology and philosophical theology.

RICARDO SALLES is Reseacher at the Institute for Philosophical Research of the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, a former Fellow of the Center of Hellenic Studies in Washington DC (2003–4) and a former Member of the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton (2010–11). His work centres on ancient ethics, metaphysics and science. He is the author of *The Stoics on Determinism and Compatibilism* (2005), the co-author of *Alejandro de Afrodisia, Sobre el Destino: Introducción, Traducción y Notas* (2009), the editor of *God and Cosmos in Stoicism* (2009), and co-author of *Los Filósofos Estoicos: Ontología, Lógica, Física y Ética* (2014).

RICHARD SORABJI is Honorary Fellow of Wolfson College, Oxford. He is the author of 16 books, editor of 100 volumes of translation of later Greek philosophy, and editor or co-editor of another 10 volumes. These books include Necessity, Cause and Blame (1980), Time, Creation and the Continuum (1983), Matter, Space and Motion (1988), Animal Minds and Human Morals (1993), Emotion and Peace of Mind: From Stoic Agitation to Christian Temptation (2000), The Philosophy of the Commentators, 200–600 AD: A Sourcebook (3 vols., 2004), Self: Ancient and Modern Insights about Individuality, Life and Death (2006), Opening Doors: The Untold Story of Cornelia Sorabji, Reformer, Lawyer and Champion of Women's Rights in India (2010), Gandhi and the Stoics: Modern Experiments on Ancient Values (2012) and Moral Conscience through the Ages (2014).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

ix



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-06153-8 - Causation and Creation in Late Antiquity Edited by Anna Marmodoro and Brian D. Prince Frontmatter More information

Notes on contributors

James Wilberding is Professor of Ancient and Medieval Philosophy at the Ruhr University, Bochum. He is the author of numerous articles on ancient moral psychology and the intersection of philosophy and ancient science, especially medicine and embryology, with a particular focus on Plato, the Platonic tradition, and the ancient commentators on Aristotle. His publications include *Plotinus' Cosmology: A Study of Ennead ii.1* (2006), *Philoponus: Against Proclus on the Everlastingness of the World 12–18* (2006), *Porphyry: To Gaurus on How Embryos are Ensouled and What is in our Power* (2011), *Neoplatonism and the Philosophy of Nature* (with C. Horn, 2012) and *Philosophical Themes in Galen* (with P. Adamson and R. Hansberger, 2014).



## Acknowledgements

This book project began with a seminar series co-organised by the editors and Dr Neil McLynn in Corpus Christi College, Oxford, to which the three of them are affiliated. The seminar series, as well the subsequent work on the volume itself, were part of Anna Marmodoro's ongoing project, Power Structuralism in Ancient Ontologies, supported by a starting investigator award (number 263484) from the European Research Council. The editors are grateful for the generous support of the European Research Council which made this work possible. They also want to express gratitude to their colleagues and seminar participants for the intellectual stimulation that engendered this project; and to the Cambridge University Press anonymous readers for many insightful and helpful suggestions on an earlier draft of the manuscript.