

Cognition and Multi-Agent Interaction

From Cognitive Modeling to Social Simulation

This book explores the intersection between cognitive sciences and social sciences. In particular, it explores the intersection between individual cognitive modeling and modeling of multi-agent interaction. The two contributing fields – individual cognitive modeling (especially cognitive architectures) and modeling of multi-agent interaction (including social simulation and, to some extent, multi-agent systems) – have seen phenomenal growth in recent years. However, the interaction of these two fields has not been sufficiently developed. The interaction of the two may be more significant than either alone. They bring with them enormous intellectual capitals. These intellectual capitals can be profitably leveraged in creating true synergy between the two fields, leading to better understanding of both individual cognition and sociocultural processes. It is possible that an integrative field of study in cognitive and social sciences is emerging and we are laying the foundation for it.

Ron Sun is Professor of Cognitive Science at Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute. A well-known researcher in cognitive science, Ron Sun leads research projects investigating fundamental structures of the human mind. In particular, he recently published *Duality of the Mind*, exploring the interaction of implicit and explicit cognition. He is also the founding co-editor-in-chief of the journal *Cognitive Systems Research*, focusing on integrative cognitive research.



Cognition and Multi-Agent Interaction

From Cognitive Modeling to Social Simulation

Edited by

RON SUN

Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521839648

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Cognition and multi-agent interaction : from cognitive modeling to social simulation / edited by Ron Sun.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-83964-8 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-83964-5 (hardback)

1. Intelligent agents (Computer software) 2. Computer systems. 3. Cognition.

I. Sun, Ron, 1960-.

QA76.76.I58C635 2005

006.3 – dc22

2005014851

ISBN-13 978-0-521-83964-8 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-83964-5 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List	of Contributors	page vii
Prej	face	xi
PA	RT 1 INTRODUCTION	
1	Prolegomena to Integrating Cognitive Modeling and Social Simulation <i>Ron Sun</i>	3
PA	RT 2 OVERVIEWS OF COGNITIVE ARCHITECTURES	
2	Modeling Paradigms in ACT-R Niels Taatgen, Christian Lebiere, and John Anderson	29
3	Considering Soar as an Agent Architecture Robert E. Wray and Randolph M. Jones	53
4	The CLARION Cognitive Architecture: Extending Cognitive Modeling to Social Simulation <i>Ron Sun</i>	79
	RT 3 MODELING AND SIMULATING COGNITIVE AND CIAL PROCESSES	
5	Cognitive Architectures, Game Playing, and Human Evolution Robert L. West, Christian Lebiere, and Dan J. Bothell	103
6	Simulating a Simple Case of Organizational Decision Making Isaac Naveh and Ron Sun	124
7	Cognitive Modeling of Social Behaviors William J. Clancey, Maarten Sierhuis, Bruce Damer, and Boris Brodsky	151

V



vi		Contents
8	Cognitive Agents Interacting in Real and Virtual Worlds Bradley J. Best and Christian Lebiere	186
9	Modeling Social Emotions and Social Attributions Jonathan Gratch, Wenji Mao, and Stacy Marsella	219
10	Communicating and Collaborating with Robotic Agents J. Gregory Trafton, Alan C. Schultz, Nicholas L. Cassimatis, Laura M Hiatt, Dennis Perzanowski, Derek P. Brock, Magdalena D. Bugajska, and William Adams	. 252
11	Behavior-Based Methods for Modeling and Structuring Control of Social Robots Dylan A. Shell and Maja J. Matarić	279
12	Evolution of a Teamwork Model Nathan Schurr, Steven Okamoto, Rajiv T. Maheswaran, Paul Scerri, and Milind Tambe	307
13	Sociality in Embodied Neural Agents Domenico Parisi and Stefano Nolfi	328
14	Cognitive Architecture and Contents for Social Structures and Interactions Cristiano Castelfranchi	355
PART 4 A SYMPOSIUM		
15	Cognitive Science and Good Social Science Scott Moss	393
16	Collective Cognition and Emergence in Multi-Agent Systems Pietro Panzarasa and Nicholas R. Jennings	401
17	Social Judgment in Multi-Agent Systems Tom R. Burns and Ewa Roszkowska	409
18	Including Human Variability in a Cognitive Architecture to Improve Team Simulation Frank E. Ritter and Emma Norling	417
19	When Does Social Simulation Need Cognitive Models? Nigel Gilbert	428
Index		433



Contributors

William Adams

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5515 Washington, DC 20375-5337 adams@aic.nrl.navy.mil

John Anderson

Department of Psychology Carnegie Mellon University 5000 Forbes Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15213 ja@cmu.edu http://act.psy.cmu.edu/

Brad Best

Micro Analysis and Design 6800 Thomas Blvd Pittsburgh, PA 15208 bbest@mmad.com.

Dan J. Bothell

Department of Psychology Carnegie Mellon University 5000 Forbes Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15213 db30@andrew.cmu.edu

Derek P. Brock

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5513 Washington, DC 20375-5337 brock@itd.nrl.navy.mil

Boris Brodsky

Booz Allen Hamilton Inc 8283 Greensboro Drive McLean, VA 22102 brodsky_boris@bah.com

Magdalena D. Bugajska

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5515 Washington, DC 20375-5337 magda@aic.nrl.navy.mil

Tom R. Burns

Department of Sociology University of Uppsala Box 624, 75126 Uppsala, Sweden tom.burns@soc.uu.se

Nicholas L. Cassimatis

Department of Cognitive Science Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute Troy, NY 12180 cassin@rpi.edu

Cristiano Castelfranchi

Department of Communication Sciences University of Siena Siena, Italy cristian.castelfranchi@istc.cnr.it

vii



viii Contributors

William J. Clancey

NASA Ames Research Center and Institute for Human and Machine Cognition at UWF Computational Sciences Division, MS 269-3

Moffett Field, CA 94028 william.j.clancey@nasa.gov http://bill.clancey.name

Bruce Damer

DigitalSpace Corporation 343 Soquel Avenue, Suite 70 Santa Cruz, CA 95062 damer@digitalspace.com http://www.digitalspace.com

Nigel Gilbert

School of Human Sciences
University of Surrey
Surrey, GU2 7XH, UK
n.gilbert@soc.surrey.ac.uk
http://www.soc.surrey.ac.uk/
nigel_gilbert.htm

Ionathan Gratch

University of Southern California 13274 Fiji Way Marina del Rey, CA 90292 gratch@ict.usc.edu http://www.ict.usc.edu/~gratch

Laura M. Hiatt

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5515 Washington, DC 20375-5337 hiatt@aic.nrl.navy.mil

Nicholas R. Jennings

School of Electronics and Computer Science University of Southampton Southampton SO17 1BJ, UK nrj@ecs.soton.ac.uk

Randolph M. Jones

Colby College & Soar Technology 5857 Mayflower Hill Waterville, ME 04901-8858 rjones@soartech.com

Christian Lebiere

Micro Analysis and Design 6800 Thomas Blvd Pittsburgh, PA 15208 clebiere@maad.com http://www.maad.com

Rajiv T. Maheswaran

Department of Computer Science University of Southern California 3737 Watt Way Los Angeles, CA 90089-0273 maheswar@usc.edu http://pollux.usc.edu/~maheswar

Wenji Mao

University of Southern California 13274 Fiji Way Marina del Rey, CA 90292 mao@ict.usc.edu

Stacy Marsella

University of Southern California 13274 Fiji Way Marina del Rey, CA 90292 marsella@isi.edu http://www.isi.edu/~marsella

Maja J Matarić

Computer Science Department University of Southern California 941 West 37th Place, SAL 300 Los Angeles, California mataric@usc.edu http://robotics.usc.edu/~maja



Contributors

Scott Moss

Centre for Policy Modelling Manchester Metropolitan University Manchester M1 3GH, UK s.moss@mmu.ac.uk http://cfpm.org/~scott

Isaac Naveh

Department of Computer Science University of Missouri–Columbia Columbia, MO 65211 yizchaknaveh@yahoo.com

Stefano Nolfi

Institute of Cognitive Sciences and Technologies National Research Council Viale Marx 15, 00137 Roma, Italy s.nolfi@istc.cnr.it http://gral.ip.rm.cnr.it/nolfi

Emma Norling

Department of Computer Science and Software Engineering The University of Melbourne Victoria 3010, Australia norling@acm.org http://www.cs.mu.oz.au/~ejn

Steven Okamoto

Department of Computer Science University of Southern California 3737 Watt Way Los Angeles, CA 90089-0273 stevenokamoto@yahoo.com

Pietro Panzarasa

Centre for Business Management Queen Mary College, University of London Mile End Road London, E1 4NS, UK p.panzarasa@qmul.ac.uk

Domenico Parisi

Institute of Cognitive Sciences and Technologies National Research Council Viale Marx 15, 00137 Roma, Italy d.parsi@istc.cnr.it http://gral.ip.rm.cnr.it/dparisi/

Dennis Perzanowski

Naval Research Laboratory Washington, DC 20375-5337 dennisp@aic.nrl.navy.mil

Frank E. Ritter

School of Information Sciences and Technology The Pennsylvannia State University University Park, PA 16802 frank.ritter@psu.edu http://www.frankritter.com

Ewa Roszkowska

Faculty of Economics University of Bialystok Warszawska 63, 15-062 Bialystok, Poland erosz@w3cache.uwb.edu.pl

Paul Scerri

Robotics Institute Carnegie Mellon University 5000 Forbes Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15213 pscerri@cs.cmu.edu http://www.cs.cmu.edu/~pscerri

Alan C. Schultz

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5515 Washington, DC 20375-5337 schultz@aic.nrl.navy.mil



x Contributors

Nathan Schurr

Department of Computer Science University of Southern California 3737 Watt Way Los Angeles, CA 90089-0273 schurr@usc.edu http://teamcore.usc.edu/schurr

Dylan A. Shell

Computer Science Department University of Southern California 941 West 37th Place, SAL 300 Los Angeles, California shell@usc.edu http://robotics.usc.edu/~dshell

Maarten Sierhuis

NASA Ames Research Center, MS 269-1 Moffett Field, CA 94028 msierhuis@mail.arc.nasa.gov http://home.comcast.net/ ~msierhuis

Ron Sun

Department of Cognitive Science Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute Troy, NY 12180 rsun@rpi.edu http://www.cogsci.rpi.edu/~rsun

Niels Taatgen

Department of Psychology Carnegie Mellon University 5000 Forbes Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15213 taatgen@cmu.edu http://www.ai.rug.nl/~niels

Milind Tambe

Department of Computer Science University of Southern California 3737 Watt Way Los Angeles, CA 90089-0273 tambe@usc.edu http://teamcore.usc.edu/tambe

J. Gregory Trafton

Naval Research Laboratory, Code 5515 Washington, DC 20375-5337 trafton@itd.nrl.navy.mil http://www.aic.nrl.navy.mil/ ~trafton/trafton.html

Robert L. West

Department of Psychology and Institute of Cognitive Science Carleton University Ottawa, Ontario, Canada robert_west@carleton.ca http://www.carleton.ca/~rlwest/

Robert E. Wray

Soar Technology 3600 Green Court, Suite 600 Ann Arbor, MI 48105 wray@soartech.com http://www.soartech.com



Preface

This book explores the intersection between the cognitive sciences and the social sciences. More specifically, it explores the intersection between individual cognitive modeling and modeling of multi-agent interaction. The two contributing fields – computational cognitive modeling (especially cognitive architectures) and modeling of multi-agent interaction (including social simulation and, to some extent, multi-agent systems) – have seen phenomenal growth in recent years. Both have been seen as breakthrough developments. However, the interaction of these two fields has not been sufficiently developed. We believe that the interaction of the two may be more significant than either alone. They bring with them enormous intellectual capitals. These intellectual capitals can be profitably leveraged in creating true synergy between the two fields, leading to more in-depth studies of both individual cognition and sociocultural processes. It is possible that an integrative field of study in cognitive and social sciences may be emerging.

This book is intended for researchers and students in cognitive, behavioral, and social sciences. It may also be read by interested laypersons and people whose primary scholarly interests are elsewhere – they can profit from general introductions to cognitive modeling (especially cognitive architectures) and examples of social simulations. The intellectual issues explored in the book are broad and significant, and thus the book may appeal to a sizable audience in philosophy, psychology, sociology, anthropology, education, economics, neuroscience, artificial intelligence, and so on. As these issues are central to the understanding of the human mind and human society, the book may prove to be of lasting theoretical and practical relevance.

We believe that investigation and simulation of social phenomena need cognitive science, because such endeavors need a better understanding, and better models, of individual cognition, which can provide a foundation for understanding social interaction. Conversely, cognitive science



xii Preface

also needs multi-agent systems, social simulation, and social sciences in general. Cognitive science is very much in need of new theoretical frameworks and new conceptual tools, especially for analyzing sociocultural aspects of cognition and cognitive processes involved in multi-agent interaction. Thus, there needs to be an integration (to some extent) of these two strands. In response to such a need, the present volume addresses the integration of the studies of the social and the cognitive.

This volume brings together cognitive scientists, social scientists, as well as AI researchers, with a wide range of background and expertise, to address the dual issue of understanding social processes through modeling individual cognition (especially through employing cognitive architectures) and understanding and modeling individual cognition through taking account of social processes. These two issues are of broad importance, especially in understanding the relationship between cognitive and social processes.

This volume consists of four parts. Part 1 contains one introductory chapter. Part 2 includes three chapters. They review some of the best cognitive architectures in existence, which form the basis of modeling individual cognition and may be extended for addressing collective processes. Part 3 develops models of cognition and social interaction using cognitive architectures as well as other approaches. Those models shed light on the relationship between cognitive modeling and multi-agent social simulation, as well as their synergy. To provide a better understanding of these models and approaches, Part 4 presents theoretical positions, arguments, and issues concerning various possibilities in integrating cognitive modeling and social simulation.

These chapters, written by leading researchers in various disciplines, provide provocative new insights into relevant issues, as well as solid research results pertinent to these issues.

I would like to thank all contributing authors. Many of them not only contributed chapters, but also participated in mutual reviews of drafts, thus helping to ensure the quality of this book.

Note that this volume is, in many ways, an outgrowth of the workshop on cognitive modeling of agents and multi-agent interaction, chaired by Ron Sun, held in Acapulco, Mexico, in the summer of 2003. In this regard, I would like to thank members of the program committee of the workshop: Christian Lebiere, Cristiano Castelfranchi, Jan Treur, and Robert West, for their help in organizing the event. Thanks are also due to Greg Trafton, Catholijn Jonker, Pietro Panzarasa, Jonathan Gratch, Bill Clancey, Frank Ritter, Robert West, Joseph Giampapa, and a few others for their help in reviewing papers.

 $^{^1}$ For further information about this workshop, see the Web page at: http://www.cogsci.rpi.edu/~rsun/wsp03.html



Preface xiii

I would like to thank Cambridge University Press for taking on this project. In particular, I would like to thank Phil Laughlin of Cambridge University Press for being such a helpful editor throughout the long process of putting together this book.

Ron Sun Troy, New York