

COMPARATIVE LAW IN A CHANGING WORLD

Second edition

Peter de Cruz, LLB, LLM, PhD
Professor of Law
Staffordshire University



Cavendish
Publishing
Limited

London • Sydney

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>	
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xix</i>	
1	INTRODUCING COMPARATIVE LAW	1
	Introduction	1
	Definitions and derivations	3
	Terminology: subject or method?	3
	The elements of 'comparative law'	7
	Comparative law distinguished from other disciplines	7
	Private international law and comparative law	8
	Public international law and comparative law	9
	Legal history, legal ethnology and comparative law	9
	Sociology of law and comparative law	10
	A rationale for comparative law	10
	The origins of comparative law	11
	Early comparative law	11
	The roots of comparative law	13
	Comparative law in England	16
	The contemporary significance of comparative law	18
	Functions and purposes of comparative law	18
	Comparative law as an academic discipline	18
	Comparative law as an academic tradition	19
	Using comparative law in research	19
	A tool of construction	21
	Aid to understanding legal rules	22
	The African situation	24
	The international law dimension	24
	Key concepts in the comparative law method	26
	The parent legal family and legal traditions	26
	Sources of law	28
	Comparative law method	29
	Selective bibliography	30
2	THE CLASSIFICATION OF LEGAL SYSTEMS	
	INTO LEGAL FAMILIES	33
	Terminology	33
	Legal traditions and legal families	33
	Classification of legal systems	34
	Criteria used to classify legal systems	36
	Examination and application of the criteria	36
	Historical development	36
	Mode of legal thinking	38

Distinctive legal institutions	39
Choice of sources of law	40
Ideology of a legal system	40
Convergence theory and legal unity	41
Selective bibliography	42
3 THE CIVIL LAW SYSTEM	43
Terminology	43
Different meanings of 'civil law'	43
Meaning of codification in the civil law context	46
Historical development of the civil law tradition	47
Roman law and Western civilisation	47
History of French law	59
Structure and overview of the French Civil Code	64
Sources of law	66
Doctrine	67
Status of judicial decisions (jurisprudence) in French law	68
Key features of the French legal system	69
Public and private law	74
Distinctive French legal doctrines and concepts	77
History of German law	79
Application of the BGB	90
Overview of the civil law tradition	95
Selective bibliography	96
4 THE ENGLISH COMMON LAW SYSTEM	99
Introduction	99
Terminology	101
The English common law tradition	102
The common law in the United States	107
Preliminary observations	107
Linguistic issues	108
History of American law: some observations	108
Uniformity and diversity in American law	114
Comparative overview	118
The common law tradition in South East Asia	118
Historical introduction to the English legal world in South East Asia	119
Reception of English law in Singapore and Malaysia	121
Reception of English law in Singapore	122
Reception of English law in Malaysia	123
The common law in India	125
The common law in the Far East: Hong Kong	127

New legislative formula	128
Hong Kong after 1997	129
Can socialism and capitalism co-exist?	131
The future of the common law in Hong Kong	132
Comparative overview	136
Selective bibliography	137
5 EUROPEAN COMMUNITY LAW	139
Introduction	139
Scope of chapter	140
Monism, dualism and accession of Britain	140
The Single European Act 1986	144
The institutional framework of the Community	144
EC institutions and traditional international organisations	145
The Council of Ministers	146
The European Commission	147
The European Parliament	149
The European Court of Justice	150
Difficulties in comparison	156
Comparison of legal style	
of Community law with other systems	157
The influence of French law	158
The influence of German law	160
The influence of the common law tradition	161
The language of Community law	162
Legislation as language	163
The Community's legal order / regime	164
Nature of Community law	164
Direct applicability and direct effect	165
Supremacy of Community law	168
Community techniques of legal interpretation	169
Distinctive legal institutions / doctrines	170
Choice of sources of law	171
Ideology of the system	172
The Maastricht Treaty	174
The general aims of the Treaty	175
Steps to European Union	175
Subsidiarity	175
European citizenship	176
A single economy	176
Powers of the European Parliament	176
Education	176
Culture	177
Justice and Home Affairs	177

	The Social Chapter and social policy	177
	Conclusions	178
	Selective bibliography	180
6	SOCIALIST LAW AND OTHER TYPES OF LEGAL SYSTEMS	183
	Scope of chapter	183
	The socialist system and Russia	183
	The socialist concept of law	184
	Differences between civil law and socialist systems	186
	Similarities between civil law and socialist systems	186
	Was the socialist system part of the civil law system?	188
	Inquest on the Russian Empire	189
	The end of the USSR and the new Russian Federation	190
	Russian law – return to civil law or hybrid system?	191
	Towards a Russian social democratic State?	200
	Other recent developments	201
	Hybrid legal systems	202
	Other types of law	203
	Eastern legal conceptions	203
	The Chinese conception of law	204
	The Japanese conception of law	207
	Selective bibliography	212
7	TECHNIQUES OF COMPARATIVE LAW	213
	Scope of chapter	213
	General considerations	213
	Linguistic/terminological problems	214
	Cultural differences between systems	216
	Arbitrary selection of objects of study	219
	‘Comparability’ in comparison	220
	Viability of theory of a common legal pattern	222
	Imposition of one’s own legal conceptions	223
	Omission of extra-legal factors	224
	The quest for methodology	225
	Introduction	225
	Clarifying the general character of comparative law	225
	The subject matter of the comparison	226
	Macro-comparison and micro-comparison	227
	Suitability of topics for micro-comparison	228
	Comparative method: requirements	228
	The test of functionality	230
	The comparative law method	233

A three stage approach	233
A method of comparison: a blueprint	235
Selective bibliography	240
8 A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF JUDICIAL STYLES AND CASE LAW	243
The meaning of 'case law'	243
Case law as a source of law	243
Key issues	244
The authority of case law in non-common law jurisdictions	244
The authority of case law in non-common law countries	244
Styles of judicial decisions	247
Appellate court decisions	247
The five styles of judgments	247
<i>Ratio</i> and <i>dicta</i>	248
The French style of judgment	252
The German style of judgment	254
General style of Federal Supreme Court judgments	256
The Swedish type of judgment	258
The relevance of overriding general principles	259
<i>Aequitas</i>	259
Selective bibliography	263
9 A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF STATUTORY INTERPRETATION	265
Defining 'statutory interpretation'	265
Defining 'interpretation'	265
General comparative observations	265
Methods/techniques of statutory interpretation	267
Civil law approaches	267
The logical interpretation methodology	267
The legislative history approach	269
The teleological approach	270
Scope and limitations of the teleological approach	270
Common law approaches to statutory interpretation	271
Inadmissible evidence of statutory intent	272
Summary of legislative history position	274
The mischief rule	275
Filling gaps in a statute	277
Other linguistic canons of construction/interpretation	278
Presumptions and precedents	280
Conflict of statutes with other legal principles	281
Scholarly/doctrinal writing in English	281

	statutory interpretation	282
	Typical structure of English statutes	283
	Comparative overview	284
	Similarities in approaches between legal systems	285
	Common judicial arguments on statutory interpretation	286
	Differences in statutory interpretation between the systems	287
	Conclusions	290
	Selective bibliography	290
10	THE LAW OF OBLIGATIONS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CONTRACT AND TORT	293
	Introduction	293
	Historical development: a comparative analysis	294
	The early Roman law of obligations	294
	Contracts	294
	Origins of the modern English law of contract	300
	Tortious or delictual liability	304
	Law of obligations: contract in civil law	308
	Tort and contract: contemporary comparative aspects	312
	Formation of contracts	312
	German law	314
	French law	317
	German law	318
	English law	319
	Scope of tortious liability	320
	American law	324
	Civil law	325
	Tort law and traffic accidents	331
	French law	331
	English law	332
	German law	333
	Fault in the law of contract and tort	334
	Interaction of tort and contract	336
	Comparative overview	338
	Selective bibliography	339
11	CORPORATE AND COMMERCIAL LAW	341
	Scope of analysis	341
	Problems in comparison of company laws	342
	Key conceptual questions	342
	Paillusseau's enterprise notion	344
	Forms of business organisation: a comparative overview	345
	Corporate terminology in France and Germany	345

Companies and contracts	349
Partnership law	351
Company law in France	354
Legislative sources of law	356
Incorporation of a société	356
Status of a société pending incorporation	357
SAs and SARLs	357
Société à responsabilité limitée (SARL)	358
The GIE and the GEIE	359
Company law in Germany	362
Types of business organisation	363
Partnerships and sole traders	364
Sole traders	364
Partnerships	365
The silent partnership	368
Limited companies and public limited companies	368
A comparative overview of agency	371
Historical origins	371
Modern agency law: common law v civil law	373
European Community corporate law	377
The notion of European Community (EC) law	377
The <i>Daily Mail</i> case	378
Non-profit making undertakings	378
Removal of restrictions on freedom of movement	378
Statutory foundations of harmonisation of laws	379
Nature of EC company law	379
Directives already in force in the United Kingdom	380
Comparative corporate law: conclusions	380
Selective bibliography	381
12 SALE OF GOODS	383
Introduction	383
The historical background	384
Sale of goods in Roman law	384
The law merchant	385
Key issues in sales of goods	387
Comparative study of European civil law countries	388
French law	388
German law	394
Remedies of buyer and seller	398
Contributory fault in damages	400
Seller's remedies	402
The English common law approach	404
General	404

	Definition of goods under English law	405
	Transfer of property and transfer of ownership	406
	Transfer of ownership and risk of loss	407
	The <i>Romalpa</i> case	415
	Effect of the <i>Romalpa</i> case	415
	Principle of the <i>Romalpa</i> case	416
	Delivery at seller's own risk	417
	Duties of buyer and seller	417
	Remedies of the buyer and seller	430
	The Supply of Goods and Services Act 1982	434
	The uniform laws on international sales	436
	Meaning of 'international sale'	437
	Sale of goods	438
	Validity and passing of property excluded	443
	Interpretation of the Convention	443
	Ratifications	444
	Comparative overview	445
	Selective Bibliography	446
13	LABOUR LAW	449
	Scope of chapter	449
	Historical development	449
	Great Britain	449
	Germany	452
	France	463
	Comparative overview	472
	Selective bibliography	474
14	A NEW WORLD ORDER?	475
	Introduction	475
	The significance of legal history	477
	A new world order?	478
	Global wars and civil strife: historical perspectives	478
	Reasons for the transformation of the world order	479
	Reasons for the fall of communism in Eastern Europe	480
	Theories of convergence	481
	Current convergent trends	481
	European convergence	482
	Philosophies of convergence	485
	The <i>jus commune</i> theory	485
	Global convergence and the Fukuyama thesis	488
	Unification of legal systems	490

Contents

Strategies of convergence	490
Legal transplants	491
Natural convergence	491
Convergence and divergence between common law and civil law	492
Convergence between European countries	493
The dawn of a new era in world history	494
Conclusions	495
Selective bibliography	496
<i>Index</i>	499