

Data Analysis Using Regression and Multilevel/Hierarchical Models

Data Analysis Using Regression and Multilevel/Hierarchical Models is a comprehensive manual for the applied researcher who wants to perform data analysis using linear and nonlinear regression and multilevel models. The book introduces and demonstrates a wide variety of models, at the same time instructing the reader in how to fit these models using freely available software packages. The book illustrates the concepts by working through scores of real data examples that have arisen in the authors' own applied research, with programming code provided for each one. Topics covered include causal inference, including regression, poststratification, matching, regression discontinuity, and instrumental variables, as well as multilevel logistic regression and missing-data imputation. Practical tips regarding building, fitting, and understanding are provided throughout.

Andrew Gelman is Professor of Statistics and Professor of Political Science at Columbia University. He has published more than 150 articles in statistical theory, methods, and computation and in applications areas including decision analysis, survey sampling, political science, public health, and policy. His other books are *Bayesian Data Analysis* (1995, second edition 2003) and *Teaching Statistics: A Bag of Tricks* (2002).

Jennifer Hill is Assistant Professor of Public Affairs in the Department of International and Public Affairs at Columbia University. She has coauthored articles that have appeared in the Journal of the American Statistical Association, American Political Science Review, American Journal of Public Health, Developmental Psychology, the Economic Journal, and the Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, among others.





Analytical Methods for Social Research

Analytical Methods for Social Research presents texts on empirical and formal methods for the social sciences. Volumes in the series address both the theoretical underpinnings of analytical techniques and their application in social research. Some series volumes are broad in scope, cutting across a number of disciplines. Others focus mainly on methodological applications within specific fields such as political science, sociology, demography, and public health. The series serves a mix of students and researchers in the social sciences and statistics.

Series Editors:

R. Michael Alvarez, California Institute of Technology Nathaniel L. Beck, New York University Lawrence L. Wu, New York University

Other Titles in the Series:

Event History Modeling: A Guide for Social Scientists, by Janet M. Box-Steffensmeier and Bradford S. Jones

Ecological Inference: New Methodological Strategies, edited by Gary King, Ori Rosen, and Martin A. Tanner

Spatial Models of Parliamentary Voting, by Keith T. Poole

Essential Mathematics for Political and Social Research, by Jeff Gill

 $Political\ Game\ Theory:\ An\ Introduction,\ by\ Nolan\ McCarty\ and\ Adam\ Meirowitz$





Data Analysis Using Regression and Multilevel/Hierarchical Models

ANDREW GELMAN Columbia University

JENNIFER HILL
Columbia University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521686891

© Andrew Gelman and Jennifer Hill 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007 Reprinted with corrections 2007 13th printing 2015

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Gelman, Andrew.

Data analysis using regression and multilevel/hierarchical models / Andrew Gelman.

Jennifer Hill.

p. cm. – (Analytical methods for social research) Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-86706-1 (hardcover) – ISBN 0-521-68689-X (pbk.)

1. Regression analysis. 2. Multilevel modes (Statistics). 1. Hill, Jennifer, 1969-

II. Title. III. Series.

HA31.3.G45 2006

519.5'36-dc22 2006040566

ISBN 978-0-521-86706-1 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-68689-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing, but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



For Zacky and for Audrey





Contents

List of examples page		e xvii	
P	refac	е	xix
1	Why?		
	1.1	What is multilevel regression modeling?	1
	1.2	Some examples from our own research	3
	1.3	Motivations for multilevel modeling	6
	1.4	Distinctive features of this book	8
	1.5	Computing	9
2	Concepts and methods from basic probability and statistics		
	2.1	Probability distributions	13
	2.2	Statistical inference	16
	2.3	Classical confidence intervals	18
	2.4	Classical hypothesis testing	20
	2.5	Problems with statistical significance	22
	2.6	55,000 residents desperately need your help!	23
	2.7	Bibliographic note	26
	2.8	Exercises	26
Pa	art 1.	A: Single-level regression	29
3	Line	ear regression: the basics	31
	3.1	One predictor	31
	3.2	Multiple predictors	32
	3.3	Interactions	34
	3.4	Statistical inference	37
	3.5	Graphical displays of data and fitted model	42
	3.6	Assumptions and diagnostics	45
	3.7	Prediction and validation	47
	3.8	Bibliographic note	49
	3.9	Exercises	49
4	Linear regression: before and after fitting the model		
	4.1	Linear transformations	53
	4.2	Centering and standardizing, especially for models with interactions	55
	4.3	Correlation and "regression to the mean"	57
	4.4	Logarithmic transformations	59
	4.5	Other transformations	65
	4.6	Building regression models for prediction	68
	4.7	Fitting a series of regressions	73



X	CONTE		
	4.8	Bibliographic note	74
	4.9	Exercises	74
5	Logi	stic regression	79
	5.1	Logistic regression with a single predictor	79
	5.2	Interpreting the logistic regression coefficients	81
	5.3	Latent-data formulation	85
	5.4	Building a logistic regression model: wells in Bangladesh	86
	5.5	Logistic regression with interactions	92
	5.6	Evaluating, checking, and comparing fitted logistic regressions	97
	5.7	Average predictive comparisons on the probability scale	101
	5.8	Identifiability and separation	104
	5.9	Bibliographic note	105
	5.10	Exercises	105
6	Gen	eralized linear models	109
	6.1	Introduction	109
	6.2	Poisson regression, exposure, and overdispersion	110
	6.3	Logistic-binomial model	116
	6.4	Probit regression: normally distributed latent data	118
	6.5	Ordered and unordered categorical regression	119
	6.6	Robust regression using the t model	124
	6.7	Building more complex generalized linear models	125
	6.8	Constructive choice models	127
	6.9	Bibliographic note	131
	0.10	Exercises	132
Pa	rt 1I	3: Working with regression inferences	135
7	Sim	ulation of probability models and statistical inferences	137
	7.1	Simulation of probability models	137
	7.2	Summarizing linear regressions using simulation: an informal	
		Bayesian approach	140
	7.3	Simulation for nonlinear predictions: congressional elections	144
	7.4	Predictive simulation for generalized linear models	148
	7.5	Bibliographic note	151
	7.6	Exercises	152
8		ulation for checking statistical procedures and model fits	155
	8.1	Fake-data simulation	155
	8.2	Example: using fake-data simulation to understand residual plots	157
	8.3	Simulating from the fitted model and comparing to actual data	158
	8.4	Using predictive simulation to check the fit of a time-series mode.	
	8.5	Bibliographic note	165
	8.6	Exercises	165
9	Cau	sal inference using regression on the treatment variable	167
	9.1	Causal inference and predictive comparisons	167
	9.2	The fundamental problem of causal inference	170
	9.3	Randomized experiments	172
	9.4	Treatment interactions and poststratification	178



CC	NTE	NTS	X
	9.5	Observational studies	181
	9.6	Understanding causal inference in observational studies	186
	9.7	Do not control for post-treatment variables	188
	9.8	Intermediate outcomes and causal paths	190
	9.9	Bibliographic note	194
		Exercises	194
10		sal inference using more advanced models	199
	10.1	Imbalance and lack of complete overlap	199
	10.2	Subclassification: effects and estimates for different subpopulations	204
	10.3	Matching: subsetting the data to get overlapping and balanced	
		treatment and control groups	206
	10.4	Lack of overlap when the assignment mechanism is known:	
		regression discontinuity	212
	10.5	Estimating causal effects indirectly using instrumental variables	215
	10.6	Instrumental variables in a regression framework	220
	10.7	Identification strategies that make use of variation within or between	
		groups	226
	10.8	Bibliographic note	229
	10.9	Exercises	231
Pa	${ m rt} {f 2} {\it A}$	A: Multilevel regression	235
11	Mul	tilevel structures	237
	11.1	Varying-intercept and varying-slope models	237
	11.2	Clustered data: child support enforcement in cities	237
	11.3	Repeated measurements, time-series cross sections, and other	
		non-nested structures	241
	11.4	Indicator variables and fixed or random effects	244
	11.5	Costs and benefits of multilevel modeling	246
	11.6	Bibliographic note	247
	11.7	Exercises	248
10	N / 1		051
12		tilevel linear models: the basics	251
		Notation	251
		Partial pooling with no predictors	252
		Partial pooling with predictors	254
		Quickly fitting multilevel models in R	259
		Five ways to write the same model	262
		Group-level predictors	265
		Model building and statistical significance	270
		Predictions for new observations and new groups	272
	12.9	How many groups and how many observations per group are	
		needed to fit a multilevel model?	275
		Bibliographic note	276
	12.11	Exercises	277
13	Mul	tilevel linear models: varying slopes, non-nested models, and	
	othe	r complexities	279
	13.1	Varying intercepts and slopes	279
		Varying slopes without varying intercepts	283



xii		CONTE	NTS
	13.3	Modeling multiple varying coefficients using the scaled inverse-	
		Wishart distribution	284
	13.4	Understanding correlations between group-level intercepts and	
		slopes	287
		Non-nested models	289
		Selecting, transforming, and combining regression inputs	293
		More complex multilevel models	297
		Bibliographic note	297
	13.9	Exercises	298
14	Mul	tilevel logistic regression	301
		State-level opinions from national polls	301
		Red states and blue states: what's the matter with Connecticut?	310
		Item-response and ideal-point models	314
		Non-nested overdispersed model for death sentence reversals	320
		Bibliographic note	321
	14.6	Exercises	322
15	Mul	tilevel generalized linear models	325
	15.1	Overdispersed Poisson regression: police stops and ethnicity	325
	15.2	Ordered categorical regression: storable votes	331
	15.3	Non-nested negative-binomial model of structure in social networks	332
	15.4	Bibliographic note	342
	15.5	Exercises	342
Pa	rt 2E	3: Fitting multilevel models	343
16	Mul	tilevel modeling in Bugs and R: the basics	345
		Why you should learn Bugs	345
	16.2	Bayesian inference and prior distributions	345
	16.3	Fitting and understanding a varying-intercept multilevel model	
		using R and Bugs	348
		Step by step through a Bugs model, as called from R	353
		Adding individual- and group-level predictors	359
		Predictions for new observations and new groups	361
		Fake-data simulation	363
		The principles of modeling in Bugs	366
		Practical issues of implementation	369
		Open-ended modeling in Bugs	370
		Bibliographic note	373
	16.12	Exercises	373
17	Fitti	ng multilevel linear and generalized linear models in Bugs	
	and		375
	17.1	Varying-intercept, varying-slope models	375
		Varying intercepts and slopes with group-level predictors	379
		Non-nested models	380
	17.4	Multilevel logistic regression	381
		Multilevel Poisson regression	382
	17.6	Multilevel ordered categorical regression	383
	17.7	Latent-data parameterizations of generalized linear models	384



CON	ITE	NTS	xiii
1	7.8	Bibliographic note	385
		Exercises	385
		lihood and Bayesian inference and computation	387
		Least squares and maximum likelihood estimation	387
		Uncertainty estimates using the likelihood surface	390
1	8.3	Bayesian inference for classical and multilevel regression	392
		Gibbs sampler for multilevel linear models	397
1	8.5	Likelihood inference, Bayesian inference, and the Gibbs sampler:	
		the case of censored data	402
1	8.6	Metropolis algorithm for more general Bayesian computation	408
1	8.7	Specifying a log posterior density, Gibbs sampler, and Metropolis	
		algorithm in R	409
1	8.8	Bibliographic note	413
1	8.9	Exercises	413
10 T)ob:	ugging and speeding convergence	415
		Debugging and confidence building	415
		General methods for reducing computational requirements	418
		Simple linear transformations	419
		Redundant parameters and intentionally nonidentifiable models	419
		Parameter expansion: multiplicative redundant parameters	419
		Using redundant parameters to create an informative prior	424
1	9.0	distribution for multilevel variance parameters	427
1	0.7	Bibliographic note	434
		Exercises	434
1	<i>3</i> .0	LACICISCS	404
Part	3:	From data collection to model understanding to model	
c	hec	king	435
20 S	am	ple size and power calculations	437
		Choices in the design of data collection	437
		Classical power calculations: general principles, as illustrated by	10.
_	٠. _	estimates of proportions	439
2	0.3	Classical power calculations for continuous outcomes	443
		Multilevel power calculation for cluster sampling	447
		Multilevel power calculation using fake-data simulation	449
		Bibliographic note	454
		Exercises	454
_		erstanding and summarizing the fitted models	457
		Uncertainty and variability	457
	1.2	Superpopulation and finite-population variances	459
		Contrasts and comparisons of multilevel coefficients	462
		Average predictive comparisons	466
		R^2 and explained variance	473
		Summarizing the amount of partial pooling	477
		Adding a predictor can <i>increase</i> the residual variance!	480
		Multiple comparisons and statistical significance	481
		Bibliographic note	484
2	1.10	Exercises	485



xiv	r	CONTE	ENTS
22	Ana	lysis of variance	487
		Classical analysis of variance	487
		ANOVA and multilevel linear and generalized linear models	490
		Summarizing multilevel models using ANOVA	492
		Doing ANOVA using multilevel models	494
		Adding predictors: analysis of covariance and contrast analysis	496
		Modeling the variance parameters: a split-plot latin square	498
		Bibliographic note	501
		Exercises	501
23	Cau	sal inference using multilevel models	503
	23.1	Multilevel aspects of data collection	503
	23.2	Estimating treatment effects in a multilevel observational study	506
	23.3	Treatments applied at different levels	507
	23.4	Instrumental variables and multilevel modeling	509
	23.5	Bibliographic note	512
	23.6	Exercises	512
24	Mod	lel checking and comparison	513
	24.1	Principles of predictive checking	513
	24.2	Example: a behavioral learning experiment	515
	24.3	Model comparison and deviance	524
	24.4	Bibliographic note	526
	24.5	Exercises	527
25	Miss	sing-data imputation	529
	25.1	Missing-data mechanisms	530
	25.2	Missing-data methods that discard data	531
	25.3	Simple missing-data approaches that retain all the data	532
	25.4	Random imputation of a single variable	533
	25.5	Imputation of several missing variables	539
	25.6	Model-based imputation	540
	25.7	Combining inferences from multiple imputations	542
	25.8	Bibliographic note	542
	25.9	Exercises	543
ΑĮ	pend	lixes	545
\mathbf{A}	Six	quick tips to improve your regression modeling	547
	A.1		547
	A.2	Do a little work to make your computations faster and more reliable	547
	A.3	Graphing the relevant and not the irrelevant	548
	A.4	Transformations	548
	A.5	Consider all coefficients as potentially varying	549
	A.6	Estimate causal inferences in a targeted way, not as a byproduct	
		of a large regression	549
В	Stat	istical graphics for research and presentation	551
	B.1	Reformulating a graph by focusing on comparisons	552
	B.2	Scatterplots	553
	B.3	Miscellaneous tips	559



CONTENTS			XV		
	B.4	Bibliographic note	562		
	B.5	Exercises	563		
\mathbf{C}	Software				
	C.1	Getting started with R, Bugs, and a text editor	565		
	C.2	Fitting classical and multilevel regressions in R	565		
	C.3	Fitting models in Bugs and R	567		
	C.4	Fitting multilevel models using R, Stata, SAS, and other software	568		
	C.5	Bibliographic note	573		
R	efere	nces	575		
A۱	Author index 60				
Si	biec	tindex	607		





List of examples

Home radon	3, 36, 252, 279, 479
Forecasting elections	3, 144
State-level opinions from national polls	4, 301, 493
Police stops by ethnic group	5, 21, 112, 325
Public opinion on the death penalty	19
Testing for election fraud	23
Sex ratio of births	27, 137
Mothers' education and children's test scores	31, 55
Height and weight	41, 75
Beauty and teaching evaluations	51, 277
Height and earnings	53, 59, 140, 288
Handedness	66
Yields of mesquite bushes	70
Political party identification over time	73
Income and voting	79, 107
Arsenic in drinking water	86, 128, 193
Death-sentencing appeals process	116, 320, 540
Ordered logistic model for storable votes	120, 331
Cockroaches in apartments	126, 161
Behavior of couples at risk for HIV	132, 166
Academy Award voting	133
Incremental cost-effectiveness ratio	152
Unemployment time series	163
The Electric Company TV show	174, 503
Hypothetical study of parenting quality as an intermediate out	come 188
Sesame Street TV show	196
Messy randomized experiment of cow feed	196
Incumbency and congressional elections	197

xvii



XVIII	LIST OF EXAMPLES
Value of a statistical life	197
Evaluating the Infant Health and Development Program	201, 506
Ideology of congressmembers	213
Hypothetical randomized-encouragement study	216
Child support enforcement	237
Adolescent smoking	241
Rodents in apartments	248
Olympic judging	248
Time series of children's CD4 counts	249, 277, 449
Flight simulator experiment	289, 464, 488
Latin square agricultural experiment	292, 497
Income and voting by state	310
Item-response models	314
Ideal-point modeling for the Supreme Court	317
Speed dating	322
Social networks	332
Regression with censored data	402
Educational testing experiments	430
Zinc for HIV-positive children	439
Cluster sampling of New York City residents	448
Value added of school teachers	458
Advanced Placement scores and college grades	463
Prison sentences	470
Magnetic fields and brain functioning	481
Analysis of variance for web connect times	492
Split-plot latin square	498
Educational-subsidy program in Mexican villages	508
Checking models of behavioral learning in dogs	515
Missing data in the Social Indicators Survey	529



Preface

Aim of this book

This book originated as lecture notes for a course in regression and multilevel modeling, offered by the statistics department at Columbia University and attended by graduate students and postdoctoral researchers in social sciences (political science, economics, psychology, education, business, social work, and public health) and statistics. The prerequisite is statistics up to and including an introduction to multiple regression.

Advanced mathematics is not assumed—it is important to understand the linear model in regression, but it is not necessary to follow the matrix algebra in the derivation of least squares computations. It is useful to be familiar with exponents and logarithms, especially when working with generalized linear models.

After completing Part 1 of this book, you should be able to fit classical linear and generalized linear regression models—and do more with these models than simply look at their coefficients and their statistical significance. Applied goals include causal inference, prediction, comparison, and data description. After completing Part 2, you should be able to fit regression models for multilevel data. Part 3 takes you from data collection, through model understanding (looking at a table of estimated coefficients is usually not enough), to model checking and missing data. The appendixes include some reference materials on key tips, statistical graphics, and software for model fitting.

What you should be able to do after reading this book and working through the examples

This text is structured through models and examples, with the intention that after each chapter you should have certain skills in fitting, understanding, and displaying models:

- Part 1A: Fit, understand, and graph classical regressions and generalized linear models
 - Chapter 3: Fit linear regressions and be able to interpret and display estimated coefficients.
 - Chapter 4: Build linear regression models by transforming and combining variables.
 - Chapter 5: Fit, understand, and display logistic regression models for binary
 - Chapter 6: Fit, understand, and display generalized linear models, including Poisson regression with overdispersion and ordered logit and probit models.
- Part 1B: Use regression to learn about quantities of substantive interest (not just regression coefficients).
 - Chapter 7: Simulate probability models and uncertainty about inferences and predictions.



xx PREFACE

- Chapter 8: Check model fits using fake-data simulation and predictive simulation.

- Chapter 9: Understand assumptions underlying causal inference. Set up regressions for causal inference and understand the challenges that arise.
- Chapter 10: Understand the assumptions underlying propensity score matching, instrumental variables, and other techniques to perform causal inference when simple regression is not enough. Be able to use these when appropriate.
- Part 2A: Understand and graph multilevel models.
 - Chapter 11: Understand multilevel data structures and models as generalizations of classical regression.
 - Chapter 12: Understand and graph simple varying-intercept regressions and interpret as partial-pooling estimates.
 - Chapter 13: Understand and graph multilevel linear models with varying intercepts and slopes, non-nested structures, and other complications.
 - Chapter 14: Understand and graph multilevel logistic models.
 - Chapter 15: Understand and graph multilevel overdispersed Poisson, ordered logit and probit, and other generalized linear models.
- Part 2B: Fit multilevel models using the software packages R and Bugs.
 - Chapter 16: Fit varying-intercept regressions and understand the basics of Bugs. Check your programming using fake-data simulation.
 - Chapter 17: Use Bugs to fit various models from Part 2A.
 - Chapter 18: Understand Bayesian inference as a generalization of least squares and maximum likelihood. Use the Gibbs sampler to fit multilevel models.
 - Chapter 19: Use redundant parameterizations to speed the convergence of the Gibbs sampler.

• Part 3:

- Chapter 20: Perform sample size and power calculations for classical and hierarchical models: standard-error formulas for basic calculations and fake-data simulation for harder problems.
- Chapter 21: Calculate and understand contrasts, explained variance, partial pooling coefficients, and other summaries of fitted multilevel models.
- Chapter 22: Use the ideas of analysis of variance to summarize fitted multilevel models; use multilevel models to perform analysis of variance.
- Chapter 23: Use multilevel models in causal inference.
- Chapter 24: Check the fit of models using predictive simulation.
- Chapter 25: Use regression to impute missing data in multivariate datasets.

In summary, you should be able to fit, graph, and understand classical and multilevel linear and generalized linear models and to use these model fits to make predictions and inferences about quantities of interest, including causal treatment effects.



PREFACE xxi

The website www.stat.columbia.edu/~gelman/arm/ contains datasets used in the examples and homework problems of the book, as well as sample computer code. The website also includes some tips for teaching regression and multilevel modeling through class participation rather than lecturing. We plan to update these tips based on feedback from instructors and students; please send your comments and suggestions to gelman@stat.columbia.edu.

O i e f a c e

When teaching a course based on this book, we recommend starting with a self-contained review of linear regression, logistic regression, and generalized linear models, focusing not on the mathematics but on understanding these methods and implementing them in a reasonable way. This is also a convenient way to introduce the statistical language R, which we use throughout for modeling, computation, and graphics. One thing that will probably be new to the reader is the use of random simulations to summarize inferences and predictions.

We then introduce multilevel models in the simplest case of nested linear models, fitting in the Bayesian modeling language Bugs and examining the results in R. Key concepts covered at this point are partial pooling, variance components, prior distributions, identifiability, and the interpretation of regression coefficients at different levels of the hierarchy. We follow with non-nested models, multilevel logistic regression, and other multilevel generalized linear models.

Next we detail the steps of fitting models in Bugs and give practical tips for reparameterizing a model to make it converge faster and additional tips on debugging. We also present a brief review of Bayesian inference and computation. Once the student is able to fit multilevel models, we move in the final weeks of the class to the final part of the book, which covers more advanced issues in data collection, model understanding, and model checking.

As we show throughout, multilevel modeling fits into a view of statistics that unifies substantive modeling with accurate data fitting, and graphical methods are crucial both for seeing unanticipated features in the data and for understanding the implications of fitted models.

 $Ac \qquad edg \quad e$

We thank the many students and colleagues who have helped us understand and implement these ideas. Most important have been Jouni Kerman, David Park, and Joe Bafumi for years of suggestions throughout this project, and for many insights into how to present this material to students.

In addition, we thank Hal Stern and Gary King for discussions on the structure of this book; Chuanhai Liu, Xiao-Li Meng, Zaiying Huang, John Boscardin, Jouni Kerman, Alan Zaslavsky, David Dunson, Maria Grazia Pittau, Aleks Jakulin, and Yu-Sung Su for discussions about multilevel modeling and statistical computation; Iven Van Mechelen and Hans Berkhof for discussions about model checking; Iain Pardoe for discussions of average predictive effects and other summaries of regression models; Matt Salganik and Wendy McKelvey for suggestions on the presentation of sample size calculations; T. E. Raghunathan, Donald Rubin, Rajeev Dehejia, Michael Sobel, Guido Imbens, Samantha Cook, Ben Hansen, Dylan Small, and Ed Vytlacil for concepts of missing-data modeling and causal inference; Eric

xxii PREFACE

Loken for help in understanding identifiability in item-response models; Niall Bolger, Agustin Calatroni, John Carlin, Rafael Guerrero-Preston, Oliver Kuss, Reid Landes, Eduardo Leoni, and Dan Rabinowitz for code in Stata, SAS, and SPSS; Hans Skaug for code in AD Model Builder; Uwe Ligges, Sibylle Sturtz, Douglas Bates, Peter Dalgaard, Martyn Plummer, and Ravi Varadhan for help with multilevel modeling and general advice on R; and the students in Statistics / Political Science 4330 at Columbia for their invaluable feedback throughout.

Collaborators on specific examples mentioned in this book include Phillip Price on the home radon study; Tom Little, David Park, Joe Bafumi, and Noah Kaplan on the models of opinion polls and political ideal points; Jane Waldfogel, Jeanne Brooks-Gunn, and Wen Han for the mothers and children's intelligence data; Lex van Geen and Alex Pfaff on the arsenic in Bangladesh; Gary King on election forecasting; Jeffrey Fagan and Alex Kiss on the study of police stops; Tian Zheng and Matt Salganik on the social network analysis; John Carlin for the data on mesquite bushes and the adolescent-smoking study; Alessandra Casella and Tom Palfrey for the storable-votes study; Rahul Dodhia for the flight simulator example; Boris Shor, Joe Bafumi, and David Park on the voting and income study; Alan Edelman for the internet connections data; Donald Rubin for the Electric Company and educational-testing examples; Jeanne Brooks-Gunn and Jane Waldfogel for the mother and child IQ scores example and Infant Health and Development Program data; Nabila El-Bassel for the risky behavior data; Lenna Nepomnyaschy for the child support example; Howard Wainer with the Advanced Placement study; Iain Pardoe for the prison-sentencing example; James Liebman, Jeffrey Fagan, Valerie West, and Yves Chretien for the death-penalty study; Marcia Meyers, Julien Teitler, Irv Garfinkel, Marilyn Sinkowicz, and Sandra Garcia with the Social Indicators Study; Wendy McKelvey for the cockroach and rodent examples; Stephen Arpadi for the zinc and HIV study; Eric Verhoogen and Jan von der Goltz for the Progresa data; and Iven van Mechelen, Yuri Goegebeur, and Francis Tuerlincx on the stochastic learning models. These applied projects motivated many of the methodological ideas presented here, for example the display and interpretation of varying-intercept, varying-slope models from the analysis of income and voting (see Section 14.2), the constraints in the model of senators' ideal points (see Section 14.3), and the difficulties with two-level interactions as revealed by the radon study (see Section 21.7). Much of the work in Section 5.7 and Chapter 21 on summarizing regression models was done in collaboration with Iain Pardoe.

Many errors were found and improvements suggested by Brad Carlin, John Carlin, Samantha Cook, Caroline Rosenthal Gelman, Kosuke Imai, Jonathan Katz, Uwe Ligges, Wendy McKelvey, Jong-Hee Park, Martyn Plummer, Phillip Price, Song Qian, Giuseppe Ragusa, Dylan Small, Elizabeth Stuart, Sibylle Sturtz, Alex Tabarrok, and Shravan Vasishth. Brian MacDonald's copyediting has saved us from much embarrassment, and we also thank Yu-Sung Su for typesetting help, Sarah Ryu for assistance with indexing, and Ed Parsons and his colleagues at Cambridge University Press for their help in putting this book together. We especially thank Bob O'Hara and Gregor Gorjanc for incredibly detailed and useful comments on the nearly completed manuscript.

We also thank the developers of free software, especially R (for statistical computation and graphics) and Bugs (for Bayesian modeling), and also Emacs and LaTex (used in the writing of this book). We thank Columbia University for its collaborative environment for research and teaching, and the U.S. National Science Foundation for financial support. Above all, we thank our families for their love and support during the writing of this book.