



Decision Making: Social and Creative Dimensions by Carl Martin Allwood; Marcus Selart
Review by: John S. Carroll

Administrative Science Quarterly, Vol. 47, No. 3 (Sep., 2002), pp. 575-577

Published by: [Sage Publications, Inc.](#) on behalf of the [Johnson Graduate School of Management, Cornell University](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3094856>

Accessed: 18/06/2014 04:55

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Sage Publications, Inc. and *Johnson Graduate School of Management, Cornell University* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Administrative Science Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Book Reviews

referenced and, as a whole, creates a substantial foundation for future research.

W. Chan Kim

and

Renée Mauborgne

Strategy and Management Department

INSEAD

Boulevard de Constance

77305 Fontainebleau

France

REFERENCE

Tyler, T. R.

1990 *Why People Obey the Law*.
New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Decision Making: Social and Creative Dimensions.

Carl Martin Allwood and Marcus Selart, eds. Norwell, MA: Kluwer Academic, 2001. 320 pp. \$119.00.

Decision making has been a classic topic of academic research and applied practice. This edited volume by Allwood and Selart continues important recent trends. First, the chapters extend the traditional conceptualization of decision making as an individual cognitive process that is structured in space and time. Second, the book collects multidisciplinary, multimethod, and multicountry voices and approaches, mixing theoretical and practical issues, conceptual frameworks, and empirical studies. The editors state the major goal as "to give recognition to the fact that human decision making typically occurs in changing, dynamic, social contexts, and that researchers interested in decision making in a social context therefore will benefit by considering the relation between creativity and decision making" (p. 10).

The straightforward chapter structure starts with an introductory chapter that categorizes the chapters in terms of theory, method, and practice, creativity in product or process, and individual or collective focus. This is followed by four chapters with reviews of the literatures on creative decision making at individual and group levels, a description of a comprehensive approach to organizational creativity, and an example of institutional decision making about environmental risks. There are three chapters of applications to personal life decisions and six chapters of applications to managerial and organizational decisions.

The decision-making literature is beginning to look beyond intendedly rational choices among alternatives based on pre-existing preferences. Psychologists have criticized economists for assuming that people choose as if they were rational optimizers. But more recently, psychologists themselves have been taken to task for assuming that all decisions are "choices" that are "given" in a bounded space and time, such as making an investment or ordering dinner at a restaurant. As Jonsson et al. state, "Complexity takes the form of contradictory claims based in incompatible logics, as well as

575/ASQ, September 2002

compromises, and a sense of lack of freedom of choice, in combination with responsibility" (p. 241). The decision-making field is starting to embrace sensemaking along with calculation (Weick, 1995), pattern matching as well as choice models in naturalistic decision making (Zsombok and Klein, 1997), expressions of identity that underlie preferences (March, 1994), and construction or improvisation in social practice (Lave, 1988; Hutchins, 1995).

The chapters continue this diffuse movement by exploring creativity and social embeddedness as critical dimensions of decision making. As Engestrom says, ". . . decision making is essentially reconstruction and redefinition of the object of activity in and through specific situated actions" (p. 286). Some chapters link directly into the creativity literature (e.g., Stoycheva and Lubart; Wilke and Kaplan; Basadur), whereas others add creative elements to decision making, such as imagination (Willen), improvisation (Engestrom), flexibility in rule use and creation (Salo and Svenson), and restructuring preferences (Takemura; Pfister and Bohm). Several chapters examine group and organizational decision making in socially enacted real-world tasks (e.g., engineering design, Badke-Schaub and Buerschaper; medical decisions, Engestrom). Attention is given not only to the cognitive aspects of decision making but also to moral dimensions (Pfister and Bohm), political issues (Jonsson et al.; Engestrom), and temporal dynamics (Salo and Svenson; Badke-Schaub and Buerschaper; Jonsson et al.; Engestrom).

It is challenging and instructive to bridge boundaries between disciplines, across continents, or between theory and practice. With apologies to the Japanese, Canadian, and U.S. contributors, I particularly valued the opportunity to read European views (and there are clearly multiple views) on decision making. Some of the work is very consistent with the lines of research we see published in the U.S. journals on brainstorming (Wilke and Kaplan), value-focused thinking (Selart and Boe), and contingent decision making (Takemura; Vinkenburg et al.), but other chapters introduce more unusual concepts. Pfister and Bohm combine causal mental models and moral-ethical principles in their analysis of environmental decision making. Willen uses clinical interviews with couples contemplating divorce to examine the construction of perspectives and options. Jonsson et al. videotaped product management meetings in an auto company and use detailed conversational analysis to understand organizational decisions. Hedelin and Allwood analyze longitudinal interviews about strategic decisions to focus on the Swedish concept of "selling in" alternatives (called "anchoring" in Jonsson et al.) to generate consensus and moral commitment. Engestrom's final chapter was my favorite, applying his activity theory (a type of naturalistic decision making) to examine a real health-care decision with a systematic framework, close analysis of written documents and interviews, and appreciation for decision making as a negotiation among perspectives that can change practice.

In conclusion, the collected chapters offer stimulating possibilities for new decision making theory, research, and practice. The very diverse approaches and concepts are a wel-

576/ASQ, September 2002

Book Reviews

come addition to the standard psychological approaches to decision making. There are several strong chapters with fresh ideas and interesting data, but there are also weaker chapters and a disappointing lack of interaction among the chapters. With their varied traditions, methods, and goals, the chapters sometimes talk past each other. I would have appreciated a core of common questions or debates, a shared conceptual structure, or a concluding chapter to sharpen the many issues that are touched upon.

John S. Carroll
MIT Sloan School of Management
Cambridge, MA 02142

REFERENCES

- Hutchins, E.**
1995 *Cognition in the Wild*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Lave, J.**
1988 *Cognition in Practice: Mind, Mathematics, and Culture in Everyday Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- March, J. G.**
1994 *A Primer on Decision Making: How Decisions Happen*. New York: Free Press.
- Weick, K. E.**
1995 *Sensemaking in Organizations*. London: Sage.
- Zsombok, C. E., and G. Klein (eds.)**
1997 *Naturalistic Decision Making*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Shared Cognition in Organizations: The Management of Knowledge.

Leigh L. Thompson, John M. Levine, and David M. Messick, eds. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1999. 364 pp. \$39.95, paper.

Cognitive science has focused on the study of the workings of the individual mind. As the emphasis is on how an individual thinks, early cognitive research conceptualized cognition as bounded by the individual brain, largely separated from the social environment, but this perspective is changing. Rather than playing a nonexistent or peripheral role, the social context is increasingly seen as being an important input to and/or part of the cognitive process (Nye and Brower, 1996; Resnick, 1991). *Shared Cognition in Organizations* is an edited collection of chapters that reflects this growing interest of cognition in the social environment. As the editors note, this book emerged out of a conference organized to explore "the implications of viewing cognition as a fundamentally social activity" (p. xv). But this book is not only for cognitive and/or social psychologists interested in this new exciting perspective on cognition, it is also for organizational theorists interested in the management of knowledge. With the increasing use of teams in organizations, research on social cognition that investigates how social resources—whether it be individuals and/or norms—are mobilized in the cognitive process would have rich implications for organizational theorists' research on the efficient and effective integration and creation of knowledge.

This book is divided into three sections. The first section, "Knowledge Systems," deals with how knowledge is created, stored, and acted upon within organizations. The chapters in this section highlight how social processes determine the individual or shared cognition that emerges. Moreland shows

577/ASQ, September 2002