Decisions with Multiple Objectives
Preferences and Value Tradeoffs

RALPH L. KEENEY
Institute of Safety and Systems Management
University of Southern California

and

HOWARD RAIFFA
Frank P. Ramsey Chair in Managerial Economics
Graduate School of Business and Kennedy School of Government
Harvard University

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
## Contents

Preface to the Cambridge University Press Edition \(\text{xi}\)
Preface to First Edition \(\text{xv}\)

1. **THE PROBLEM** \(\text{1}\)
   1.1 Sketches of Motivating Examples \(\text{1}\)
   1.2 Paradigm of Decision Analysis \(\text{5}\)
   1.3 Comments About the Paradigm \(\text{7}\)
   1.4 Complex Value Problems \(\text{14}\)
   1.5 Classes of Examples and Methodological Nightmares \(\text{19}\)
   1.6 Organization of Remaining Chapters \(\text{26}\)

2. **THE STRUCTURING OF OBJECTIVES** \(\text{31}\)
   2.1 Objectives and Attributes \(\text{32}\)
   2.2 Generation of Objectives and Attributes \(\text{34}\)
   2.3 Hierarchical Nature of Objectives \(\text{41}\)
   2.4 Sets of Objectives and Attributes \(\text{49}\)
   2.5 Proxy Attributes and Direct Preference Measurements \(\text{55}\)
   2.6 Summary and Perspective on the Practical Aspects of Specifying Objectives and Attributes \(\text{64}\)

3. **TRADEOFFS UNDER CERTAINTY** \(\text{66}\)
   3.1 The Multiattribute Value Problem \(\text{66}\)
   3.2 Choice Procedures That Do Not Formalize Preference Structures \(\text{69}\)
   3.3 Structuring of Preferences and Value Functions \(\text{77}\)
   3.4 Preference Structures and Value Functions for Two Attributes \(\text{82}\)
CONTENTS

3.5 The Case of Three Attributes 100
3.6 The Case of More Than Three Attributes 108
3.7 Assessment of an Additive Value Function: An Abstract Hypothetical Example 117
3.8 Willingness to Pay 125
3.9 Brief Summary and Guide to Some Relevant Literature 129

4. UNIDIMENSIONAL UTILITY THEORY 131
4.1 The Motivation for Utility Theory 131
4.2 Direct Assessment of Utilities for Consequences 140
4.3 Unidimensional Utility Functions 141
4.4 Risk Aversion 148
4.5 A Measure of Risk Aversion 159
4.6 Constant, Decreasing, and Increasing Risk Aversion 165
4.7 Proportional Risk Aversion 174
4.8 Monotonically Decreasing and Nonmonotonic Utility Functions 179
4.9 A Procedure for Assessing Utility Functions 188
4.10 Illustrations of the Assessment of Unidimensional Utility Functions 203
4.11 Explicating a Single Attribute by Means of Multiple Attributes 212
4.12 Conditional Unidimensional Utility Theory 214
4.13 Where We Stand 218

5. MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: THE TWO-ATTRIBUTE CASE 219
5.1 Approaches for Multiattribute Assessment 219
5.2 Utility Independence 224
5.3 Additive Independence and the Additive Utility Function 229
5.4 The Implications of Mutual Utility Independence 232
5.5 Use of Certainty Equivalents 242
5.6 Utility Functions with One Utility-Independent Attribute 243
5.7 What to Do if No Independence Properties Hold 255
5.8 Assessment Procedure for Multiatribute Utility Functions 261
5.9 Interpreting the Scaling Constants 271
5.10 The Assessment of a Utility Function in a Hospital Blood Bank 273
### 6. MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: MORE THAN TWO ATTRIBUTES

- 6.1 Overview of the Chapter
- 6.2 Utility Functions with Three Attributes
- 6.3 The Multiplicative Utility Function
- 6.4 The Multilinear Utility Function
- 6.5 The Additive Utility Function
- 6.6 Assessing Multiattribute Utility Functions
- 6.7 A Fundamental Relationship Between Preferential Independence and Utility Independence
- 6.8 Relationships Among Utility Independence Assumptions
- 6.9 Decomposition of Multiattribute Utility Functions
- 6.10 Additional Representation Theorems
- 6.11 Hierarchical Structures and Conditional Preferences
- 6.12 Summary

**Appendix 6A** Generalization of Preferential Independence and Utility Independence

**Appendix 6B** Evaluating the Scaling Constant in the Multiplicative Utility Function

**Appendix 6C** An Interactive Computer Program for Assessing and Using Multiattribute Utility Functions

### 7. ILLUSTRATIVE APPLICATIONS

- 7.1 Air Pollution Control
- 7.2 Preference Tradeoffs among Instructional Programs
- 7.3 Fire Department Operations
- 7.4 Structuring Corporate Preferences for Multiple Objectives
- 7.5 Evaluating Computer Systems
- 7.6 Siting and Licensing of Nuclear Power Facilities
- 7.7 Other Applications

### 8. AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT FOR MEXICO CITY: A CASE STUDY

- 8.1 The Problem
- 8.2 Background Information
- 8.3 Evolution of the Analysis
- 8.4 The Static Model
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8.5</th>
<th>Specifying the Possible Impacts of Each Alternative</th>
<th>445</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>Assessing the Multiattribute Utility Function</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>The Analysis</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>The Dynamic Analysis</td>
<td>463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>Impact of the Results</td>
<td>470</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>9.</th>
<th>PREFERENCES OVER TIME</th>
<th>473</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Characteristics of the Time Problem</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>The Certainty Case: Value Functions over Time Streams</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>The Uncertainty Case: Utility Functions over Time Streams</td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Relaxing the Independence Assumptions</td>
<td>494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Uncertain Horizon</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>State-Dependent Utilities</td>
<td>501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>Problems of Application</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>Time Resolution of Uncertainty</td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendix 9A. Derivation of a Utility Function</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for Consumption and Lifetime</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>513</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10.</th>
<th>AGGREGATION OF INDIVIDUAL PREFERENCES</th>
<th>515</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>The Decision Maker as Synthesizer or Amalgamator</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Aggregating Individuals' Preferences under Certainty</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Additive Utility and Equity Considerations</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Appraisal of the Independence Assumptions</td>
<td>536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Assessing Group Utility Functions</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>Uses of Multiattribute Utility Analysis for Groups</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bibliography

Index