

Decisions with Multiple Objectives

Preferences and Value Tradeoffs

RALPH L. KEENEY

*Institute of Safety and Systems Management
University of Southern California*

and

HOWARD RAIFFA

*Frank P. Ramsey Chair in Managerial Economics
Graduate School of Business and Kennedy School of Government
Harvard University*



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Preface to the Cambridge University Press Edition	xi
Preface to First Edition	xv
1. THE PROBLEM	1
1.1 Sketches of Motivating Examples	1
1.2 Paradigm of Decision Analysis	5
1.3 Comments About the Paradigm	7
1.4 Complex Value Problems	14
1.5 Classes of Examples and Methodological Nightmares	19
1.6 Organization of Remaining Chapters	26
2. THE STRUCTURING OF OBJECTIVES	31
2.1 Objectives and Attributes	32
2.2 Generation of Objectives and Attributes	34
2.3 Hierarchical Nature of Objectives	41
2.4 Sets of Objectives and Attributes	49
2.5 Proxy Attributes and Direct Preference Measurements	55
2.6 Summary and Perspective on the Practical Aspects of Specifying Objectives and Attributes	64
3. TRADEOFFS UNDER CERTAINTY	66
3.1 The Multiattribute Value Problem	66
3.2 Choice Procedures That Do Not Formalize Preference Structures	69
3.3 Structuring of Preferences and Value Functions	77
3.4 Preference Structures and Value Functions for Two Attributes	82

3.5	The Case of Three Attributes	100
3.6	The Case of More Than Three Attributes	108
3.7	Assessment of an Additive Value Function: An Abstract Hypothetical Example	117
3.8	Willingness to Pay	125
3.9	Brief Summary and Guide to Some Relevant Literature	129
4.	UNIDIMENSIONAL UTILITY THEORY	131
4.1	The Motivation for Utility Theory	131
4.2	Direct Assessment of Utilities for Consequences	140
4.3	Unidimensional Utility Functions	141
4.4	Risk Aversion	148
4.5	A Measure of Risk Aversion	159
4.6	Constant, Decreasing, and Increasing Risk Aversion	165
4.7	Proportional Risk Aversion	174
4.8	Monotonically Decreasing and Nonmonotonic Utility Functions	179
4.9	A Procedure for Assessing Utility Functions	188
4.10	Illustrations of the Assessment of Unidimensional Utility Functions	203
4.11	Explicating a Single Attribute by Means of Multiple Attributes	212
4.12	Conditional Unidimensional Utility Theory	214
4.13	Where We Stand	218
5.	MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: THE TWO-ATTRIBUTE CASE	219
5.1	Approaches for Multiattribute Assessment	219
5.2	Utility Independence	224
5.3	Additive Independence and the Additive Utility Function	229
5.4	The Implications of Mutual Utility Independence	232
5.5	Use of Certainty Equivalents	242
5.6	Utility Functions with One Utility-Independent Attribute	243
5.7	What to Do if No Independence Properties Hold	255
5.8	Assessment Procedure for Multittribute Utility Functions	261
5.9	Interpreting the Scaling Constants	271
5.10	The Assessment of a Utility Function in a Hospital Blood Bank	273

6. MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: MORE THAN TWO ATTRIBUTES	282
6.1 Overview of the Chapter	282
6.2 Utility Functions with Three Attributes	286
6.3 The Multiplicative Utility Function	288
6.4 The Multilinear Utility Function	293
6.5 The Additive Utility Function	295
6.6 Assessing Multiattribute Utility Functions	297
6.7 A Fundamental Relationship Between Preferential Independence and Utility Independence	310
6.8 Relationships Among Utility Independence Assumptions	316
6.9 Decomposition of Multiattribute Utility Functions	319
6.10 Additional Representation Theorems	324
6.11 Hierarchical Structures and Conditional Preferences	332
6.12 Summary	344
Appendix 6A Generalization of Preferential Independence and Utility Independence	345
Appendix 6B Evaluating the Scaling Constant in the Multiplicative Utility Function	347
Appendix 6C An Interactive Computer Program for Assessing and Using Multiattribute Utility Functions	349
 7. ILLUSTRATIVE APPLICATIONS	 354
7.1 Air Pollution Control	355
7.2 Preference Tradeoffs among Instructional Programs	365
7.3 Fire Department Operations	377
7.4 Structuring Corporate Preferences for Multiple Objectives	390
7.5 Evaluating Computer Systems	408
7.6 Siting and Licensing of Nuclear Power Facilities	412
7.7 Other Applications	417
 8. AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT FOR MEXICO CITY: A CASE STUDY	 436
8.1 The Problem	436
8.2 Background Information	437
8.3 Evolution of the Analysis	441
8.4 The Static Model	442

8.5	Specifying the Possible Impacts of Each Alternative	445
8.6	Assessing the Multiattribute Utility Function	451
8.7	The Analysis	459
8.8	The Dynamic Analysis	463
8.9	Impact of the Results	470
9.	PREFERENCES OVER TIME	473
9.1	Characteristics of the Time Problem	474
9.2	The Certainty Case: Value Functions over Time Streams	476
9.3	The Uncertainty Case: Utility Functions over Time Streams	488
9.4	Relaxing the Independence Assumptions	494
9.5	Uncertain Horizon	497
9.6	State-Dependent Utilities	501
9.7	Problems of Application	503
9.8	Time Resolution of Uncertainty	509
Appendix 9A.	Derivation of a Utility Function for Consumption and Lifetime	513
10.	AGGREGATION OF INDIVIDUAL PREFERENCES	515
10.1	The Decision Maker as Synthesizer or Amalgamator	516
10.2	Aggregating Individuals' Preferences under Certainty	523
10.4	Additive Utility and Equity Considerations	532
10.5	Appraisal of the Independence Assumptions	536
10.6	Assessing Group Utility Functions	539
10.7	Uses of Multiattribute Utility Analysis for Groups	542
	Bibliography	549
	Index	561