

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-87898-2 - Demystifying Legal Reasoning  
Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Demystifying Legal Reasoning

*Demystifying Legal Reasoning* defends the proposition that there are no special forms of reasoning peculiar to law. Legal decision makers engage in the same modes of reasoning that all actors use in deciding what to do: open-ended moral reasoning, empirical reasoning, and deduction from authoritative rules. This book addresses common-law reasoning, when prior judicial decisions determine the law, and interpretation of texts. In both areas, the popular view that legal decision makers practice special forms of reasoning is false.

Larry Alexander is a Warren Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of San Diego School of Law. He is the author of *Is There a Right of Freedom of Expression?* (Cambridge, 2005); (with Emily Sherwin) *The Rule of Rules: Morality, Rules, and the Dilemmas of Law* (2001); *Constitutionalism: Philosophical Foundations* (Cambridge, 1998); (with Paul Horton) *Whom Does the Constitution Command?* (1988); several anthologies; and more than 160 articles, book chapters, and review essays in jurisprudence, constitutional law, criminal law, and normative ethics. He has been a member of the faculty at the University of San Diego School of Law since 1970. He is coeditor of the journal *Legal Theory* (Cambridge), and he serves on the editorial boards of *Ethics*, *Law and Philosophy*, and *Criminal Law and Philosophy*. He is co-executive director of the Institute for Law and Philosophy at the University of San Diego, and he is past president of AMINTAPHIL.

Emily Sherwin is Professor of Law at Cornell Law School. She specializes in jurisprudence, property, and remedies. She is the author (with Larry Alexander) of *The Rule of Rules: Morality, Rules, and the Dilemmas of Law* (2001) and has published numerous book chapters, articles, and reviews in her subjects of specialty. She was a member of the faculty at the University of Kentucky College of Law from 1985 to 1990 and the University of San Diego School of Law from 1990 to 2003, when she moved to Cornell University. She is a member of the advisory committee for the American Law Institute's Restatement (Third) of Restitution and Unjust Enrichment and a regular participant in roundtable conferences of the University of San Diego's Institute for Law and Philosophy.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-87898-2 - Demystifying Legal Reasoning  
Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Cambridge Introductions to Philosophy and Law

William A. Edmundson, *Georgia State University*

This introductory series of books provides concise studies of the philosophical foundations of law, of perennial topics in the philosophy of law, and of important and opposing schools of thought. The series is aimed principally at students in philosophy, law, and political science.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-87898-2 - Demystifying Legal Reasoning  
Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Demystifying Legal Reasoning

---

**LARRY ALEXANDER**  
*University of San Diego School of Law*

**EMILY SHERWIN**  
*Cornell Law School*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-87898-2 - Demystifying Legal Reasoning  
 Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press  
 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA  
[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521703956](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521703956)

© Larry Alexander, Emily Sherwin 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Alexander, Larry, 1943–  
 Demystifying legal reasoning / Larry Alexander, Emily Sherwin.  
 p. cm. – (Cambridge introductions to philosophy and law)  
 Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.  
 ISBN 978-0-521-87898-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-70395-6 (pbk.)  
 1. Law – Methodology. 2. Logic. 3. Reasoning. I. Sherwin, Emily, 1955– II. Title  
 III. Series.

K213.A429 2008  
 340'.1–dc22 2007045107

ISBN 978-0-521-87898-2 hardback  
 ISBN 978-0-521-70395-6 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

## Contents

Introduction	<i>page</i> 1
<b>PART ONE Law and Its Function</b>	
I Settling Moral Controversy	9
<b>PART TWO Common-Law Reasoning: Deciding Cases When Prior Judicial Decisions Determine the Law</b>	
II Ordinary Reason Applied to Law: Natural Reasoning and Deduction from Rules	31
III The Mystification of Common-Law Reasoning	64
IV Common-Law Practice	104
<b>PART THREE Reasoning from Canonical Legal Texts</b>	
V Interpreting Statutes and Other Posited Rules	131
VI Infelicities of the Intended Meaning of Canonical Texts and Norms Constraining Interpretation	167
	vii

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-87898-2 - Demystifying Legal Reasoning  
Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

viii	CONTENTS
VII Nonintentionalist Interpretation	191
VIII Is Constitutional Interpretation Different? Why It Isn't and Is	220
Epilogue: All or Nothing	233
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	237
<i>Index</i>	247