

Canadian Journal of Forest Research

Different vital rates of Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir explain discordance in understory/overstory dominance

Journal:	Canadian Journal of Forest Research
Manuscript ID	cjfr-2018-0182.R1
Manuscript Type:	Article
Date Submitted by the Author:	25-Aug-2018
Complete List of Authors:	Andrus, Robert; University of Colorado Boulder, Geography Harvey, Brian; University of Washington College of the Environment Chai, Rachel; University of Colorado Boulder, Geography Veblen, Thomas; University of Colorado
Keyword:	forest demography, seedling bank, forest dynamics, Colorado Front Range, permanent plot
Is the invited manuscript for consideration in a Special Issue? :	Not applicable (regular submission)



- 1 Title: Different vital rates of Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir explain discordance in
- 2 understory/overstory dominance
- 3 Authors: Robert A. Andrus^{1a}, Brian J. Harvey², Rachel K. Chai¹, Thomas T. Veblen¹
- 4 Affiliations: ¹Dept. of Geography, University of Colorado Boulder, Boulder, CO
- 5 ² School of Environmental and Forest Sciences, University of Washington, Seattle, WA
- ⁶ ^a Corresponding author; Robert Andrus, Address GUGG 110, 260 UCB, Boulder, CO 80309-
- 7 0260 USA; Mobile 1-360-774-0449, e-mail: robert.andrus@colorado.edu
- 8 <u>non-corresponding author emails: bjharvey@uw.edu, rachel.chai@colorado.edu,</u>
- 9 <u>Thomas.veblen@colorado.edu</u>



10 ABSTRACT

11 Studies of forest dynamics commonly assume that species composition of the seedling 12 bank reflects the composition of the future forest canopy. However, many forest types exhibit 13 persistent differences in relative dominance of species in the seedling bank versus the forest 14 canopy. Species-specific differences in tree vital rates (e.g. in-growth, mortality, height growth, 15 canopy residence time) across canopy positions may explain this discord in dominance between 16 seedling banks and forest canopies. We tested for differences in tree vital rates for two widely 17 distributed, coexisting species in subalpine forests of the Rocky Mountains, North America. We 18 quantified seedling bank dynamics (> 950 aged seedlings) and vital rates in permanent plots 19 (>2,500 trees) from 1982-2017 to determine if differences in vital rates explained the shift from 20 seedling bank dominance by subalpine fir (*Abies lasiocarpa*) to codominance of the main canopy 21 by subalpine fir and Engelmann spruce (*Picea engelmannii*). Higher rates of fir recruitment into 22 the main canopy were balanced by equally high rates of mortality, whereas spruce exhibited 23 higher rates of net population increase and longer residence time in the main canopy. Projections 24 of future forest trajectories from seedling bank composition can be improved by considering 25 species-specific differences in vital rates.

26 Key words: Permanent forest plots, long-term study, forest demography, seedling bank, forest

27 dynamics, Colorado Front Range

28 INTRODUCTION

29 Tree seedlings are the source of the future forest canopy. Studies of forest dynamics 30 commonly assume that species composition of the seedling bank reflects the composition of the 31 future forest canopy (i.e. correspondence, Veblen 1992; or 'accordance' criterion of Braun 32 1950). However, in some forest types the relative abundance of tree species in the seedling 33 community commonly differs from the forest canopy and this discrepancy can persist for 34 centuries (Whipple and Dix 1979; Nagel et al. 2010). Initially this discrepancy was interpreted 35 as instability in forests (Braun 1950), but many studies have demonstrated that population 36 processes, disturbance regimes, and non-stationarity in climate may explain a lack of 37 correspondence between the understory and overstory communities (White et al. 1985; 38 Harcombe 1987).

39 Whereas differences in recruitment, in-growth, mortality, and height growth (collectively, 40 vital rates) play an instrumental role in the dynamics of canopy tree replacement and species 41 coexistence (Peet and Christensen 1980), few studies have observed and quantified vital rates 42 (e.g. Harmon and Pabst 2015; Levine et al. 2016). Inference of tree vital rates from static stand 43 structure (age or size distribution at one point in time) and/or multiple stand structures of 44 different ages (i.e. chronosequences or space-for-time substitution) depend on assumptions of 45 constant and equal rates of recruitment and mortality (Veblen 1992; Johnson et al. 1994). 46 However, tree vital rates commonly differ by species, life stage, and environmental conditions 47 (Franklin and DeBell 1988; Levine et al. 2016). A more robust approach to measuring vital rates is to regularly census individually tagged trees in permanent forest plots over decades (Bakker et 48 49 al. 1996; Harmon and Pabst 2015). The resulting vital rates can be used to test long-standing

50 hypotheses about mechanisms of species coexistence and patterns of vegetation change or stasis 51 through time (Peet and Christensen 1980; Franklin and DeBell 1988; Harmon and Pabst 2015). 52 Persistent pools of suppressed tree seedlings in the forest understory (i.e. seedling banks) 53 are often the source of replacement for canopy tree mortality and therefore play a pivotal role in 54 structuring the future forest canopy (Grime 1979; Canham 1989). Whereas new seedling 55 establishment (germination and survival) may be the primary mode of canopy tree replacement 56 following some disturbances such as fire which kill the previous understory (White 1979), 57 existing trees in the seedling bank have a considerable advantage over new establishment for 58 filling canopy gaps (Grime 1979; Antos et al. 2005) and for growing a new canopy following 59 disturbances such as bark beetle outbreaks or blowdown (Kulakowski and Veblen 2003; DeRose 60 and Long 2010). Live trees in the seedling bank respond to overstory tree mortality with 61 accelerated growth (i.e. growth releases) or suppression-release cycles as they compete for a 62 position in the canopy (Wright et al. 2000). Greater relative abundance for one species in the 63 seedling bank may appear advantageous, but faster height growth by another species may 64 counterbalance this perceived advantage (Antos et al. 2000). Such trade-offs in life history traits 65 of tree species may partially explain species coexistence in some forest types in temperate (Antos 66 et al. 2005) and tropical regions (Denslow 1980). While seedling bank composition is expected 67 to influence the species composition of the future forest canopy, using static tree age or size 68 structure data to predict trajectories in relative abundances of different species in the forest 69 canopy depends on several assumptions that cannot be tested without long-term demographic measurements (White et al. 1985; Veblen 1992; Lertzman 1995). 70 71 Engelmann spruce (*Picea engelmannii* Parry ex Engelmann) and subalpine fir (*Abies*

72 *lasiocarpa* (Hook) Nutt.) coexist in old-growth stands (dominated by trees > 200 yr old) in the

73 Rocky Mountains of western North America and are the source of a long-standing paradox of 74 stand dynamics. For more than a century, researchers have documented that the seedling bank (< 75 4 cm dbh) of old-growth stands is dominated by fir, often times outnumbering spruce several 76 fold, but the species composition of the forest canopy is roughly co-dominated by spruce and fir 77 (Hodson and Foster 1910; Oosting and Reed 1952; Whipple and Dix 1979; Kneeshaw and 78 Burton 1997). These conditions regularly persist for time periods greater than that required for 79 species turnover (centuries) at the stand-scale (i.e. compositional equilibrium, Veblen 1992; or 80 *near steady-state*, Antos and Parish 2002). Three non-mutually exclusive hypotheses may 81 explain the coexistence of spruce and fir (summarized in Veblen 1986a). First, according to a 82 non-equilibrium hypothesis, coarse-scale disturbance by fire, blowdown, or bark beetles create 83 conditions that are favorable to new establishment or release of spruce juveniles, and the interval 84 between successive disturbances is insufficient for competitive exclusion of spruce by fir 85 (Whipple and Dix 1979; Peet 1981; Aplet et al. 1988). Second, according to a hypothesis based 86 on regeneration niche differentiation, the two conifers require different levels of resource 87 availability (solar radiation, seed bed conditions) for establishment so that heterogeneity of 88 understory conditions prevent fir from excluding spruce (Knapp and Smith 1982). Third, 89 according to a hypothesis based on species differences in life history traits (i.e. vital rates), the 90 greater abundance of fir in the understory is balanced by a substantially lower death rate among 91 spruce adults (Oosting and Reed 1952; Veblen 1986a; Antos and Parish 2002). The latter 92 viewpoint is supported by the greater longevity of spruce versus fir (> 600 y versus c. 350 y; 93 Oosting and Reed 1952, Bigler and Veblen 2009) and higher treefall rates of fir (Veblen 1986a). 94 In the current study, we further examine differences in adult tree recruitment (i.e. in-growth into 95 larger size classes), mortality, and persistence (i.e. residence time in a size class) as likely

96 explanations for the discrepancy in dominance between seedling banks and the main canopy97 composition of old-growth spruce-fir forests.

98	The current study quantifies vital rates for Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir in six
99	permanent forest plots (>2,500 trees) monitored from 1982-2017 and seedling age and growth
100	rates from > 950 destructively sampled spruce and fir seedlings (< 1 m in height) in the Colorado
101	Front Range (CFR; Fig. 1). Using comparisons of vital rates, we offer a new perspective on a
102	long-standing question: Do species differences in juvenile tree growth rates and adult tree vital
103	rates explain the shift from seedling bank dominance by subalpine fir (Abies lasiocarpa) to more
104	equal dominance of the main canopy by subalpine fir and Engelmann spruce (Picea
105	engelmannii)? For juvenile trees in the seedling and sapling size class (<4 cm dbh), we
106	hypothesize that spruce seedlings grow faster and are more likely to transition into the tree size
107	class (> 4cm dbh) than fir. For subcanopy (4-20 cm dbh) and main canopy trees (> 20 cm dbh),
108	we hypothesize that spruce exhibits lower mortality rates and longer persistence in the main
109	canopy size class (> 20 cm dbh).

110

METHODS

111 Study Area

We resurveyed 6 permanent forest plots to assess differences in demographic rates between Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir (hereafter *permanent plots*), and at 10 sites we destructively sampled spruce and fir seedlings to determine dates of seedling establishment and annual height growth rates (hereafter *seedling plots*). All sites are located in subalpine forests in the Arapaho-Roosevelt National Forest on the eastern slope of the Colorado Front Range (Fig. 1). Both plot types span the full range of subalpine, spruce-fir forest types [*Picea-Abies* bogs (E-2), wet *Picea-Abies* (E-3), mesic *Picea-Abies* (E-4), xeric *Picea-Abies* (E-5), and subalpine

119	Picea-Abies (E-6)] in the CFR as described by Peet (1981). The permanent plots are distributed
120	across the Niwot Ridge Long Term Ecological Research (LTER) site (40° 3' N, 105° 33' W)
121	from 2980 to 3260 m (Supplement A ³). Plots are located in stands composed of spruce and fir in
122	compositional equilibrium $(n = 4)$ and in old seral stands composed of spruce and fir mixed with
123	lodgepole (Pinus contorta var. latifolia) and/or limber pine (Pinus flexilis) (n=2). The maximum
124	tree ages in the compositional equilibrium spruce-fir stands are >460 yr, whereas maximum tree
125	ages in the old seral correspond to their origin after stand-replacing fires, c. 355 to 375 yr ago
126	(Smith et al. 2015). Seedling plots were clustered in four sampling areas that span 25-km north-
127	south and c. 400 m in elevation across the core distribution of subalpine forests (c. $2,900 - 3,400$
128	m). Seedling plots were predominately located in stands dominated by spruce and fir, but we also
129	included an open stand dominated by limber pine with spruce and fir in the understory. Stand
130	structures where seedlings were destructively sampled range from c. 120 yr-old post-fire stands
131	to stands with tree ages > 500 yr. Both sample plot types are distributed across moisture
132	gradients (hydric, mesic, xeric) representative of CFR subalpine forests and located in areas
133	without evidence of recent (last 100 yr) major disturbance (e.g. fire, blowdown, avalanche).
134	The climate of the study area is continental – characterized by long, snowy winters and a
135	short, dry growing season. The majority (c. 70%) of the 670 \pm 130 mm of precipitation falls as
136	snow during the winter and spring months (Oct May), but convective storms during the
137	summer can produce sporadic, intense rainfall (Kittel et al. 2015). The average annual
138	temperature is 1.8°C with temperatures reaching an average monthly maximum of 19.8°C in July
139	and a minimum of -1.9°C in January (C-1 climate station: 40.0362 N, -105.5434 W, 3048 m,
140	1953 – 2016, NWT LTER 2016). Although annual precipitation has not significantly changed

³ Supplement A

from 1978 to 2010 (Kittel et al. 2015), mean (0.2°C per decade) and maximum (0.44°C per
decade) annual average temperatures increased in the subalpine zone in the CFR from 1953-2008

143 (McGuire et al. 2012).

144 Field Methods

145 Permanent forest plot installation and remeasurement protocol: Permanent plots were installed 146 in summer 1982 or 1983, and subjectively located in areas not disturbed by logging (i.e. lacking 147 cut stumps, Veblen 1986b). Two sizes of permanent plots were included in this study. The four 148 large permanent forest plots (hereafter 'large plots') range in size from 0.19 to 0.29 ha. Size was 149 determined by the area necessary to include > 400 trees. Twenty-four smaller permanent forest 150 plots (size range: 60 to 336 m²) were located beneath canopy openings adjacent to two of the 151 large permanent plots (c. 50 m separation between plot types). Each smaller plot includes c. 40 152 trees per plot. Canopy openings did not originate from timber cutting, rather they were created 153 by small natural openings in the forest or treefalls. In the current study, data from each cluster of 154 smaller permanent plots (hereafter "gap plots") was aggregated to produce one sampling unit, 155 which was approximately the same size as the larger permanent plots. To justify including gap 156 plots and large permanent plots in our analyses, we demonstrate similarity in patterns of stand 157 dynamics and vital rates for both plot types ('gap' and 'large') in Supplement B⁴.

In 1982, all trees were permanently tagged, and the following was measured for all live and dead trees > 4 cm dbh: diameter at breast height (1.4 m), status (live or dead), height class (main canopy, intermediate, subcanopy). Additionally, all seedlings (c. 5 cm to 1.4 m in height) and saplings (1.4m in height to < 4 cm dbh) were counted by species in 1982 within both the large and gap permanent plots. Species composition and structure is described in an initial study

⁴ Supplement B

163	of stand dynamics (Veblen 1986b) and a more recent study of tree mortality (Smith et al. 2015).
164	Censuses of tree mortality, including cause of death, were conducted every three years, except
165	during the period $1997 - 2003$, and censuses of recruitment into the > 4 cm dbh size class were
166	only conducted in 2007 and 2016. Given differences in frequency of censuses and our goal of
167	examining long-term trends in vital rates (rather than interannual effects of climate) and to avoid
168	census period bias, vital rates were calculated over the total period of the study. Following Sheil
169	and May (1996), trees that recruited into the > 4 cm dbh size class and then died were not
170	included in the study.
171	Following the original installation protocol (described above, Veblen 1986b), we
172	conducted a complete re-census of trees (> 4 cm dbh) in summer 2016 and counted all seedlings
173	and saplings (< 4 cm dbh) by species in summer 2017 in all four large permanent plots and
174	associated gap plots. For all trees, we remeasured dbh, status, and canopy position. Trees
175	recruiting (i.e. in-growth) into the > 4 cm dbh class were tagged and measured.
176	Seedling plots and lab procedures
177	For the purpose of developing age versus height relationships and calculating growth
178	rate, we destructively sampled c. 50 spruce and c. 50 fir seedlings (> 5 cm and < 100 cm in
179	height) originating from seed in ten randomly located plots (Fig. 1). Plot size varied based on
180	seedling density ³ . The height of each seedling was measured as the length of the stem (including
181	curvature) from the root collar to the tip of the terminal bud. Seedling germination year was
182	assessed for each seedling as the maximum annual ring count from multiple cross-sections cut at
183	the root-shoot boundary. Each cross-section was sanded with progressively finer sandpaper and
184	dated with multiple ring counts from the outer ring to the pith with a microscope (40x

³ Supplement A

185 magnification). Field and laboratory procedures are described in more detail in Andrus et al.

186 (2018).

187 Data analysis

188 *Testing for differences in seedling growth rates and sapling recruitment rates*

189 To test our hypothesis that spruce seedlings have a shorter residence time in the seedling 190 bank by growing faster and are more likely to transition out of the sapling size class, we modeled 191 spruce and fir age against height relationships, compared growth rates from our destructively 192 sampled seedling plots, and computed sapling recruitment rates. To exclusively compare 193 seedlings with the shortest residence time in the seedling bank and those most likely to transition 194 out of the seedling size class, we selected the upper 10th percentile of growth rates for each 195 species from each destructively sampled plot. These criteria were intended to exclude damaged 196 seedlings (Antos et al. 2000) and the slower growing seedlings that are less likely to attain a 197 position in the main canopy in comparison with undamaged, faster growing individuals. Species 198 differences in growth rates based on inclusion of all seedlings were similar to those exhibited by 199 the upper 10th percentile (Supplement C⁵). Seedling average annual growth rate was computed as 200 height (cm) divided by age, and differences in spruce and fir growth rates were statistically tested 201 using a non-parametric Mann-Whitney U test ($\propto = 0.05$). We also modeled the growth rate of 202 spruce and fir from the age vs. height relationship using linear regression models forced through 203 the zero origin (R Core Team 2016) for comparison with similar studies (Antos et al. 2000). 204 Higher rates of recruitment (i.e. in-growth) from the sapling size class into the tree size 205 class (> 4cm dbh) for spruce than fir may illustrate a possible advantage for spruce and

206 difference in life history strategies. Using data from the permanent plots, annualized recruitment

⁵ Supplement C

207	(R) from the sapling to the tree size class was computed for each species as $(T_r/T_i)/P*100 = R$,
208	where T _r represents the number of trees that recruited from sapling size class to next larger size
209	class during the time period P (entire study period) and T _i represents the initial live sapling count
210	at time of plot installation (Levine et al. 2016). Slow growth rates of seedlings in subalpine
211	forests (Antos et al. 2000) make it unlikely that new recruits into the > 4 cm dbh class would
212	have been < 1.4 m in height in the initial census. Following Levine et al. (2016), we computed
213	recruitment rates over the entire length of the study to not introduce census-period dependence
214	bias.
215	Testing for differences in vital rates
216	To quantify changes in the size of tree populations in the permanent plots from 1982-
217	2017, we compared percent change in stems per hectare (> 4 cm dbh) by species in the following
218	size classes: SC1 (< 4 cm dbh), SC2 (> 4 to < 20 cm dbh), and SC3 (> 20cm dbh). These size
219	classes correspond to seedling and saplings (SC1), subcanopy trees (SC2), and main canopy trees
220	(SC3), which were also applied at the time of plot installation (Veblen 1986a).
221	We compared differences in vital rates for spruce and fir by monitoring tree populations
222	in the permanent plots from the early 1980s to 2016-17. In three size classes [SC2, SC3, and total
223	stems (SC2 and SC3 combined)], we quantified the following four vital rates over the entire
224	study period (i.e. results of individual censuses were excluded, see explanation above): 1)
225	annualized recruitment rates (percent) into each size class; 2) annualized tree mortality rates
226	(percent) in each size class; 3) annualized net change (percent) in the size of the population in
227	each size class; and 4) annualized persistence of tree stems (percent) in each size class. Trees in
228	SC1 were not tagged and therefore vital rates could not be quantified accurately for this size
229	class.

230 Annualized recruitment rate (i.e. in-growth) into larger size classes was computed as $(T_r/$ 231 T_i /P*100 = R, where T_r represents the number of trees that recruited to the next larger class 232 during the time period P and T_i represents the initial live tree count in the larger size class (see 233 justification above, Levine et al. 2016). Annualized mortality rate was computed as $(T_m/$ 234 T_i /P*100 = M, where T_m represents the number of trees that died in a size class during time 235 period P and T_i represents the initial live tree count in the same size class (Smith et al. 2015). 236 Mortality from all causes was aggregated (e.g. bark beetles, blow down, unknown agents) and 237 included. One mortality rate was calculated for each species in each site over the entire study 238 period to not introduce census-period bias (Sheil and May 1996). The annual net change in 239 population was computed as $((T_r - T_m)/T_i)/P*100 = N_c$. This rate indicates whether a species is 240 increasing or decreasing in abundance within a size class. Annualized persistence of tree stems in 241 each size class was computed as $(T_p/T_i)/P*100 = P$, where T_p represents the number of trees that 242 remained in a size class during time period P and T_i represents the initial live tree count in the 243 size class. Persistence indicates the capacity to remain in a size class without either dying or 244 recruiting into a larger size class (i.e. residence time). Persistent populations below the main 245 canopy may be necessary for future recruitment into the main canopy; e.g., following future 246 mortality of canopy trees from windthrow, insects or other pulses of mortality. All these 247 demographic measures are based on complete censuses of the monitored populations rather than 248 samples. Thus, probability measures of the accuracy (e.g. standard errors) of parameters, such as 249 means, are not appropriate.

250 **RESULTS**

251 Seedling bank age and seedling recruitment

252	Recruitment into the seedling bank was episodic and variable through time (1910-2010),
253	resulting in a multi-aged seedling bank (Fig. 2; Supplement C ⁵). Across all plots and for both
254	Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir, > 60% of seedling establishment (germination and survival)
255	occurred during c. 15 episodes (i.e. pulses) of establishment (\geq 10 seedlings establishing per
256	year) after 1950 (Fig. 2). Both species endured long periods of suppression in the seedling bank
257	as evidenced by the lengthy record of recruitment and persistence in the seedling bank. For
258	example, many spruce (47.4% of samples) and fir (41.5% of samples) seedlings were older than
259	c. 50 y, but the median age of spruce (45 y, range 7-184 y) was greater than fir (40 y, range 7 –
260	122 y). When only considering seedlings from 50 to 100 cm in height, spruce (62 y) and fir (63.5
261	y) had a similar median age.
262	Seedling height growth rates and sapling recruitment rates
263	The upper 10 th percentile of seedling height growth rates indicate that spruce and fir
264	seedlings grow very slowly (c. 1.25 cm/yr) and often do not reach a height of 75 cm until c. 60 yr
265	after germination (Fig. 3). Spruce seedlings reached a greater height in fewer years (Fig. 3A) by
266	growing faster than fir (Fig. 3B). Age was a good predictor of height for both species ($P <$
267	0.001, $r^2 > 0.94$) and the greater coefficient of spruce ($\beta = 1.36$ cm, ± 0.03) than fir ($\beta = 1.2$ cm,
268	\pm 0.02) indicates that spruce attains a greater height in fewer years (linear model in Fig. 3A).
269	Across all plots, spruce had a 0.1 cm/year faster median growth rate than fir (Mann-Whitney U:
270	P < 0.001, Fig. 3B); producing a 5 cm taller spruce seedling over 50 yr at median growth rates.
271	This relationship occurred in all seedling growth plots (Supplement D ⁶). Additionally, the

annualized recruitment rate out of the sapling size class (1.4 m in ht to < 4 cm dbh) and into the

⁵ Supplement C

⁶ Supplement D

- subcanopy (SC2) in the permanent plots was greater for spruce (1.00%) than fir (0.93%, Fig.
- 274 3C). This pattern was consistent across two-thirds of the permanent plots.
- 275 Changes in stem density 1982-2017

276 Total stem density (number of stems per hectare) across all permanent plots decreased 277 24% (median) from 1982 to 2017 (Fig. 4), with greater population losses for spruce (median loss 278 34%) than fir (median loss 18%). Only one of six plots showed a population increase. For both 279 species, the greatest decrease in stem density occurred in the seedling and sapling size class 280 (SC1, total median loss -27.1%), the size-class with the largest population⁷. Spruce lost a greater 281 percent of its population (median loss 50%) than fir (median loss 19%) in the seedling and 282 sapling size class and this trend was consistent in all but one plot. In the subcanopy (SC2), stem 283 density declined in all plots, but percent losses of fir (median loss 23%) were greater than spruce 284 (median loss 20%). In contrast, total stem density increased in the main canopy (SC3) by 12% 285 (increase in 4 of 6 plots), with greater gains for spruce (median 9.2%) than fir (median gain 286 5.3%).

287 Despite changes in stem density in all size classes, subalpine fir was significantly more 288 abundant than spruce in the seedling bank, while species dominance in the main canopy favored 289 spruce or equal dominance between species⁷. For example, in the 2016/2017 remeasurement, fir 290 was on average 7 times (range of ratio between fir and spruce 3.4-14.8x) more abundant than 291 spruce in the seedling bank and spruce was on average 1.6 times (range of ratio between spruce 292 and fir, 0.64-2.6x) more abundant than fir in the main canopy.

293 *Adult tree vital rates*

⁷ Supplement E

294 For all trees ('total stems'), subalpine fir recruited at higher rates (0.18% greater median 295 recruitment, Fig. 5A) and died at higher rates (0.10% higher median mortality, Fig. 5B) than 296 Engelmann spruce, resulting in a slight net increase in total fir populations (0.05% greater 297 median net change, Fig. 5C) (see Supplement E⁷ for plot-level vital rate figures). Lower spruce 298 mortality and recruitment rates than fir resulted in higher rates of spruce persistence within a size 299 class (0.12% higher median persistence, Fig. 5D). These trends in vital rates occurred in most 300 plots⁷. However, findings differed by size class, with much greater disparity in median vital rates 301 between species in the main canopy than subcanopy. Considerably higher fir than spruce 302 recruitment rates in main canopy (0.54% greater median recruitment, Fig. 5A) were offset by 303 slightly higher fir mortality rates (0.62% higher median mortality, Fig. 5B). Consequently, 304 spruce populations exhibited greater net increase (0.14% greater median net change, Fig. 5C) and 305 persistence than fir in main canopy (0.53% higher median persistence, Fig. 5D). In the main 306 canopy, trends in recruitment, mortality and persistence rates were consistent with the pattern in 307 vital rates in all but one plot⁷. We found no pattern in net change in population within plots. In 308 the subcanopy, fir and spruce recruited at the same rate (median 0.5% and no trend across plots). 309 Trends in mortality, persistence, and net change in subcanopy were generally consistent with 310 main canopy, but the magnitude of the difference between spruce and fir vital rates was minimal. 311 DISCUSSION 312 Differences in vital rates between subalpine fir and Engelmann spruce, quantified from 313 35 years of monitoring permanent forest plots and from destructively sampling seedlings,

elucidate the mechanisms behind a shift from seedling bank dominance by fir to codominance of

315 spruce and fir in the main canopy. Consistent with our hypothesis for juvenile trees (< 4 cm dbh),

⁷ Supplement E

316 we found that spruce seedlings grow faster and are more likely to transition out of the sapling 317 size class than fir, which may be advantageous for outcompeting fir and attaining a position in 318 the main canopy. Although we found relatively minimal differences in vital rates for subcanopy 319 trees, considerably lower spruce mortality rates and higher persistence rates than fir in the main 320 canopy support our hypothesis that differences in vital rates favor codominance of spruce and fir. 321 Our results show variability in recruitment rates into the seedling bank, seedling growth rates, in-322 growth into larger size classes, and mortality between species and across size classes that lead to 323 differences in species persistence (i.e. canopy residence time). Projecting future forest 324 trajectories from seedling bank composition (i.e. understory/overstory correspondence) is 325 therefore problematic for spruce-fir forests, because key assumptions of the correspondence 326 framework are not supported (e.g. that the target species have similar vital rates; White et al. 327 1985, Veblen 1992).

328 Seedling bank dynamics

329 Both Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir seedlings recruited episodically, but at different 330 abundances into the seedling bank. Across multiple plots in different watersheds, broad-scale 331 establishment (germination and survival) occurred as frequently as every two years, but there 332 were also much longer intervals (21 yr for fir and 24 yr for spruce) between broad-scale 333 establishment events (Andrus et al. 2018). This is to be expected for species that infrequently 334 produce abundant seed crops (Woodward et al. 1994; Buechling et al. 2016), experience high 335 rates of seed predation (Johnson and Fryer 1996), and require alignment of abundant seed 336 availability with favorable climate conditions for germination and survival (Kueppers et al. 2017; 337 Andrus et al. 2018). The presence of spruce and fir in the seedling bank strongly suggests that 338 the biophysical conditions, including sites beneath individual and clusters of tree mortality and 339 canopy gaps, are suitable for the regeneration of both species in mature spruce-fir forests.

340 However, the greater relative abundance of fir in the seedling bank implies that slight differences 341 in the regeneration niche, such as fir's larger seed size, greater ability to penetrate deeper litter layers and survive at low light levels under a dense forest canopy (Knapp and Smith 1982), play 342 343 an important role in structuring seedling bank composition. 344 Following establishment, individuals of both species grew very slowly in height (1-1.5 345 cm/yr) and endured long-periods of suppression in the seedling bank (> 70 yr), a finding 346 supported by other seedling bank studies in spruce-fir forests in south-central British Columbia 347 (Antos et al. 2000) and the intermountain western United States (McCaughey and Schmidt 348 1982). Indeed, many seedlings were of sufficient age to be canopy trees under different growing 349 conditions (e.g. at open post-fire sites) or in other forest types. The present study and others 350 averaging seedling growth rates from basal tree-ring estimates of age (instead of bud-scar 351 counts) and height have found that spruce seedlings generally grow at the same rate or faster than 352 fir (e.g. McCaughey and Schmidt 1982, Antos et al. 2000). In the context of spruce-fir forest 353 dynamics where release of suppressed individuals into canopy gaps is the main source of canopy 354 replacement (Veblen 1986b, Parish et al. 1999), spruce's greater performance (i.e. height growth 355 rate) reduces its residence time in the seedling bank and helps to explain the understory/overstory 356 discordance typical of old-growth spruce-fir forests (Antos et al. 2000). However, canopy 357 replacement and the composition of the forest canopy is equally or more strongly influenced by 358 trends in adult-tree mortality and recruitment as well as the length of canopy residence time (i.e. 359 persistence) during later life stages (Lertzman 1995). 360 Adult tree vital rates explain shift in composition

361 Despite changes in stand density across size classes in the permanent plots from 1982362 2017, subalpine fir maintained greater densities in the seedling bank, while Engelmann spruce
363 either dominated the main canopy or was codominant with fir at the stand-scale. This is the

364 expected trend for spruce-fir stands in *compositional equilibrium* (Whipple and Dix 1979; Aplet 365 et al. 1988; Antos and Parish 2002). We found that higher rates of fir recruitment into the main 366 canopy were balanced by equally high rates of mortality, which lead to a slightly higher net 367 increase in spruce populations and considerably longer canopy residence time of spruce. As 368 identified by the present and previous studies, fir appears more susceptible to the interannual 369 effects of climate on mortality than spruce in old-growth forests (Smith et al. 2015), likely from 370 endemic-level western balsam bark beetle [Dryocoetes confusus (Swaine)] attack and Armillaria 371 sp. root rot (Parish et al. 1999; Maclauchlan 2016). Additionally, the quantified difference in 372 mortality rates is clear evidence for the lower mortality rate of spruce inferred from lower 373 frequency of treefalls and greater longevity in stand structure analysis in Rocky Mountain 374 spruce-fir forests (Oosting and Reed 1952; Veblen 1986a; Antos and Parish 2002) and in 375 Appalachian (White et al 1985) and montane Northeastern China (Okitsu et al. 1995) spruce-fir 376 forests.

377 Implications for studies of forest dynamics

378 Differences in species vital rates are one of many factors influencing changes (or lack 379 thereof) in forest community composition and structure over time (Peet and Christensen 1980). 380 By monitoring permanent plots through time, it is possible to address assumptions commonly 381 applied in studies of forest dynamics and expectations based on models (e.g. transition 382 probability matrices) and stand structure analysis (Lertzman 1995). The traditional concept of 383 correspondence between the seedling bank and main canopy relies on many assumptions, namely 384 that species survivorship curves are similar across species, constant through time, and that 385 species' have similar longevity (White et al. 1985; Veblen 1992). If one were to apply the 386 correspondence framework to stand structure data from spruce-fir forests, they would likely

387	conclude that fir will become the dominant species in the main canopy, because of its greater
388	abundance in the seedling bank and similarity in longevity. However, differences in vital rates,
389	as illustrated by fir's greater fecundity and mortality, and spruce's greater persistence, do not
390	support this assumption in spruce-fir forests. Instead, we show that differences in vital rates are
391	critical for allowing species to coexist and maintaining similar composition and structure in old-
392	growth spruce-fir forests over time, a phenomenon also observed in old-growth Fagus-Abies
393	forests in Bosnia-Herzegovina (Nagel et al. 2010), old-growth Abies-Picea forests in northern
394	Japan (Takahashi 1997), and subalpine Abies-Betula forests in China (Taylor and Zisheng 1988).
395	In addition to explaining the discordance between understory/overstory composition, our
396	results apply more generally to assumptions and interpretations of stand structure analysis. For
397	example, a common practice in interpreting static age structure data is to assume individuals of
398	older age classes are survivors of initially equal-sized cohorts (Knowles and Grant 1983), which
399	implies constant input into populations (Veblen 1992; Johnson et al. 1994). In the present study,
400	recruitment into the seedling bank and larger size classes varied considerably over time. Thus,
401	assumptions of equal sized cohorts, necessary for computing mortality rates from static age
402	structure, would lead to erroneous mortality rates. Interpretation of vital rates from static age
403	structure has also led to speculation about general trends in mortality with tree size and age (e.g.
404	constant or U-shaped). Our findings support the concept that intermediate size classes can exhibit
405	lower mortality rates than larger size classes (Fraver et al. 2008). This phenomenon directly
406	counters expectations of constant or declining rates of mortality in larger size classes as
407	interpreted from stand structure data that fit inverse-J and Deevey (II and III) curves (sensu
408	Harcombe 1987), or constant transition or mortality probabilities through time in transition
409	probability models (Lertzman 1995).

410	CONCLUSION
411	In Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir forests, species-specific differences in life history
412	traits, as expressed through tree population vital rates, strongly affect forest community
413	composition and structure. Slight differences in the regeneration niche affect structure and
414	composition of the seedling bank, whereas differences in vital rates of adult-trees influence the
415	structure and composition of the forest canopy. Differences in vital rates across tree size classes
416	for two species with similar regeneration niches need to be explicitly considered when inferring
417	long-term trends from static age or size structures. Using permanent plots, we demonstrate that
418	differences in vital rates can result in the transition from fir dominance in the seedling bank to
419	dominance by spruce or codominance by spruce and fir in the main canopy. Our results
420	underscore the importance of explicitly considering potential differences in tree population vital
421	rates when comparing seedling banks to forest canopy composition and when inferring future
422	trajectories of forest stand dominance.
423	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
424	For field assistance, we thank Joao Fernandes Marcico Ribeiro, Ellen Waddle, Jackie Dean,
425	Logan Barrett, Brandon Quick Bear, Markéta Nováková, Alexandra Orrego, Evelyn Flamenco,
426	and Shala Wallace. For helpful comments on the manuscript we thank Philip Burton and two
427	anonymous reviewers. Research was funded by the David H. Smith Fellowship in Conservation
428	Science and National Science Foundation Awards 1262687, 1634163, and 1637686.

429	REFERENCES
430	Andrus, R.A., Harvey, B.J., Rodman, K.C., Hart, S.J., and Veblen, T.T. 2018. Moisture
431	availability limits subalpine tree establishment. Ecology 99(3): 567-575.
432	doi:10.1002/ecy.2134.
433	Antos, J.A., Guest, H.J., and Parish, R. 2005. The tree seedling bank in an ancient montane
434	forest: stress tolerators in a productive habitat. J. Ecol. 93(3): 536–543.
435	doi:10.1111/j.1365-2745.2005.00968.x.
436	Antos, J.A., and Parish, R. 2002. Structure and dynamics of a nearly steady-state subalpine forest
437	in south-central British Columbia, Canada. Oecologia 130(1): 126–135.
438	doi:10.1007/s004420100787.
439	Antos, J.A., Parish, R., and Conley, K. 2000. Age Structure and Growth of the Tree-seedling
440	Bank in Subalpine Spruce-fir Forests of South-central British Columbia. Am. Midl. Nat.
441	143(2): 342-354. doi:10.1674/0003-0031(2000)143[0342:ASAGOT]2.0.CO;2.
442	Aplet, G., Laven, R., and Smith, F. 1988. Patterns of Community Dynamics in Colorado
443	Engelmann Spruce-Subalpine Fir Forests. Ecology 69(2): 312–319.
444	Bakker, J., Olff, H., Willems, J., and Zobel, M. 1996. Why do we need permanent plots in the
445	study of long-term vegetation dynamics? J. Veg. Sci. 7(2): 147-156.
446	doi:10.2307/3236314.
447	Bigler, C., and Veblen, T.T. 2009. Increased early growth rates decrease longevities of conifers
448	in subalpine forests. Oikos 118(8): 1130–1138. doi:10.1111/j.1600-0706.2009.17592.x.
449	Braun, E.L. 1950. Deciduous forests of eastern North America. McGraw-Hill.
450	Buechling, A., Martin, P.H., Canham, C.D., Shepperd, W.D., and Battaglia, M.A. 2016. Climate
451	drivers of seed production in Picea engelmannii and response to warming temperatures in

- 452 the southern Rocky Mountains. J. Ecol. 104(4): 1051–1062. doi:10.1111/1365-
- 453 2745.12572.
- 454 Canham, C.D. 1989. Different responses to gaps among shade-tolerant tree species. Ecology
 455 70(3): 548–550.
- 456 Denslow, J.S. 1980. Gap Partitioning among Tropical Rainforest Trees. Biotropica 12(2): 47.
 457 doi:10.2307/2388156.
- 458 DeRose, R.J., and Long, J.N. 2010. Regeneration response and seedling bank dynamics on a
- 459 Dendroctonus rufipennis-killed Picea engelmannii landscape. J. Veg. Sci. 21(2): 377–
- 460 387. doi:10.1111/j.1654-1103.2009.01150.x.
- 461 Franklin, J.F., and DeBell, D.S. 1988. Thirty-six years of tree population change in an old462 growth Pseudotsuga–Tsuga forest. Can. J. For. Res. 18(5): 633–639.
- 463 Fraver, S., Jonsson, B.G., Jönsson, M., and Esseen, P.-A. 2008. Demographics and disturbance
- history of a boreal old-growth *Picea abies* forest. J. Veg. Sci. 19(6): 789–798.
- doi:10.3170/2008-8-18449.
- 466 Grime, J.P. 1979. Plant strategies and vegetation processes. Wiley, Chichester; New York.
- 467 Harcombe, P.A. 1987. Tree Life Tables. BioScience 37(8): 557–568. doi:10.2307/1310666.
- 468 Harmon, M.E., and Pabst, R.J. 2015. Testing predictions of forest succession using long-term
- 469 measurements: 100 yrs of observations in the Oregon Cascades. J. Veg. Sci. 26(4): 722–
- 470 732. doi:10.1111/jvs.12273.
- 471 Hodson, E.R., and Foster, J.H. 1910. Engelmann spruce in the Rocky Mountains. Cir., U.S. Dept.
 472 Agr. Forest Serv.
- 473 Johnson, E.A., and Fryer, G.I. 1996. Why Engelmann spruce does not have a persistent seed
- 474 bank. Can. J. For. Res. 26(5): 872–878. doi:10.1139/x26-095.

475	Johnson, E.A., Miyanishi, K., and Kleb, H. 1994. The Hazards of Interpretation of Static Age
476	Structures as Shown by Stand Reconstructions in a Pinus Contorta Picea Engelmannii
477	Forest. J. Ecol. 82(4): 923. doi:10.2307/2261455.
478	Kittel, T.G.F., Williams, M.W., Chowanski, K., Hartman, M., Ackerman, T., Losleben, M., and
479	Blanken, P.D. 2015. Contrasting long-term alpine and subalpine precipitation trends in a
480	mid-latitude North American mountain system, Colorado Front Range, USA. Plant Ecol.
481	Divers. 8(5-6): 607-624. doi:10.1080/17550874.2016.1143536.
482	Knapp, A.K., and Smith, W.K. 1982. Factors influencing understory seedling establishment of
483	Engelmann spruce (Picea engelmannii) and subalpine fir (Abies lasiocarpa) in southeast
484	Wyoming. Can. J. Bot. 60(12): 2753-2761. doi:10.1139/b82-337.
485	Kneeshaw, D.D., and Burton, P.J. 1997. Canopy and age structures of some old sub-boreal Picea
486	stands in British Columbia. Journal of Vegetation Science 8(5): 615–625.
487	doi:10.2307/3237365.
488	Knowles, P., and Grant, M.C. 1983. Age and Size Structure Analyses of Engelmann Spruce,
489	Ponderosa Pine, Lodgepole Pine, and Limber Pine in Colorado. Ecology 64(1): 1–9.
490	doi:10.2307/1937322.
491	Kueppers, L.M., Conlisk, E., Castanha, C., Moyes, A.B., Germino, M.J., de Valpine, P., Torn,
492	M.S., and Mitton, J.B. 2017. Warming and provenance limit tree recruitment across and
493	beyond the elevation range of subalpine forest. Glob. Change Biol. 23(6): 2383–2395.
494	doi:10.1111/gcb.13561.
495	Kulakowski, D., and Veblen, T.T. 2003. Subalpine forest development following a blowdown in
496	the Mount Zirkel Wilderness, Colorado. J. Veg. Sci. 14(5): 653-660.
497	Lertzman, K.P. 1995. Forest dynamics, differential mortality and variable recruitment

- 498 probabilities. J. Veg. Sci. 6(2): 191–204. doi:10.2307/3236214.
- 499 Levine, C.R., Krivak-Tetley, F., van Doorn, N.S., Ansley, J.-A.S., and Battles, J.J. 2016. Long-
- 500 term demographic trends in a fire-suppressed mixed-conifer forest. Can. J. For. Res.
- 501 46(5): 745–752. doi:10.1139/cjfr-2015-0406.
- 502 Maclauchlan, L. 2016. Quantification of Dryocoetes confusus-caused mortality in subalpine fir
- 503 forests of southern British Columbia. For. Ecol. Manag. 359: 210–220.
- 504 doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2015.10.013.
- 505 McCaughey, W.W., and Schmidt, W.C. 1982. Understory Tree Release Following Harvest
- 506 Cutting in Spruce-Fir Forests of the Intermountain West. USDA For. Ser. Res. Pap. INT-507 285.
- 508 McGuire, C.R., Nufio, C.R., Bowers, M.D., and Guralnick, R.P. 2012. Elevation-Dependent
- 509 Temperature Trends in the Rocky Mountain Front Range: Changes over a 56- and 20-
- 510 Year Record. PLoS ONE 7(9): e44370. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0044370.
- 511 Nagel, T.A., Svoboda, M., Rugani, T., and Diaci, J. 2010. Gap regeneration and replacement
- 512 patterns in an old-growth Fagus–Abies forest of Bosnia–Herzegovina. Plant Ecol. 208(2):
- 513 307–318. doi:10.1007/s11258-009-9707-z.
- 514 NWT LTER. 2016, January 11. Data Access Home[online]. Available from
- 515 http://niwot.colorado.edu/data.
- 516 Okitsu, S., Ito, K., and Li, C. 1995. Establishment processes and regeneration patterns of
- 517 montane virgin coniferous forest in northeastern China. J. Veg. Sci. 6(3): 305–308.
- 518 doi:10.2307/3236228.
- 519 Oosting, H.J., and Reed, J.F. 1952. Virgin Spruce-Fir of the Medicine Bow Mountains,
- 520 Wyoming. Ecol. Monogr. 22(2): 69–91. doi:10.2307/1943512.

~	-
')	5
_	2

521	Parish, R., Antos, J.A., and Fortin, MJ. 1999. Stand development in an old-growth subalpine
522	forest in southern interior British Columbia. Can. J. For. Res. 29(9): 1347-1356.
523	Peet, R.K. 1981. Forest vegetation of the Colorado front range. Vegetation 45(1): 3–75.
524	Peet, R.K., and Christensen, N.L. 1980. Succession: a population process. Vegetation 43: 131-
525	140.
526	R Core Team. 2016. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
527	Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. Available from http://www.R-project.org/.
528	Sheil, D., and May, R.M. 1996. Mortality and Recruitment Rate Evaluations in Heterogeneous
529	Tropical Forests. J. Ecol. 84(1): 91. doi:10.2307/2261703.
530	Smith, J.M., Paritsis, J., Veblen, T.T., and Chapman, T.B. 2015. Permanent forest plots show
531	accelerating tree mortality in subalpine forests of the Colorado Front Range from 1982 to
532	2013. For. Ecol. Manag. 341: 8-17. doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2014.12.031.
533	Takahashi, K. 1997. Regeneration and coexistence of two subalpine conifer species in relation to
534	dwarf bamboo in the understorey. J. of Veg. Sci. 8(4): 529–536.
535	Taylor, A.H., and Zisheng, O. 1988. Tree replacement patterns in subalpine Abies-Betula forests,
536	Wolong Natural Reserve, China. Vegetatio 78(3): 141–149.
537	Veblen, T. 1986a. Treefalls and the Coexistence of Conifers in Subalpine Forests of the Central
538	Rockies. Ecology 67(3): 644–649.
539	Veblen, T.T. 1986b. Age and Size Structure of Subalpine Forests in the Colorado Front Range.
540	Bull. Torrey Bot. Club 113(3): 225. doi:10.2307/2996361.
541	Veblen, T.T. 1992. Regeneration Dynamics. In Plant Succession: Theory and Prediction. Edited
542	by D. C. Glenn-Lewin, R. K. Peet, and T. T. Veblen. Chapman and Hall, London. pp.
543	152–183.

544	Whipple, S.A., and Dix, R.L. 1979. Age Structure and Successional Dynamics of a Colorado
545	Subalpine Forest. Am. Midl. Nat. 101(1): 142–158. doi:10.2307/2424909.
546	White, P.S. 1979. Pattern, process, and natural disturbance in vegetation. Bot. Rev. 45(3): 229-
547	299. doi:10.1007/BF02860857.
548	White, P.S., MacKenzie, M.D., and Busing, R.T. 1985. A critique on overstory/understory
549	comparisons based on transition probability analysis of an old growth spruce-fir stand in
550	the Appalachians. Vegetation 64(1): 37–45.
551	Whitmore, T.C. 1989. Canopy Gaps and the Two Major Groups of Forest Trees. Ecology 70(3):
552	536–538. doi:10.2307/1940195.
553	Woodward, A., Silsbee, D.G., Schreiner, E.G., and Means, J.E. 1994. Influence of climate on
554	radial growth and cone production in subalpine fir (Abies lasiocarpa) and mountain
555	hemlock (Tsuga mertensiana). Can. J. For. Res. 24: 1133–1143.
556	Wright, E.F., Canham, C.D., and Coates, K.D. 2000. Effects of suppression and release on
557	sapling growth for 11 tree species of northern, interior British Columbia. Can. J. For. Res.
558	30(10): 1571–1580. doi:10.1139/x00-089.
559	

560	FIGURE LEGENDS
561	Figure 1: Study area map A) Extent of Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir from southwestern
562	USA to central British Columbia, Canada (dark gray) in North America. B) Location of study
563	area in Colorado and extent of spruce-fir forest in Colorado, USA. C) Location of permanent
564	plots (tree) and destructively sampled seedling plots (circle with dot) on the eastern slope of the
565	Colorado Front Range in the Arapaho-Roosevelt National Forest. Seedling plot sampling areas:
566	(1) BL - Brainard Lakes Recreation Area, (2) MRS - University of Colorado's Mountain
567	Research Station, (3) BW - Boulder watershed, and (4) RP - Rollins Pass.
568	
569	Fig. 2: Proportion of Engelmann spruce (A) and subalpine fir (B) seedlings (< 1 m in height)
570	establishing by year from 10 sites in the Colorado Front Range based on destructive sampling of
571	976 stems (after Andrus et al. 2018). The oldest spruce (establishment year 1831) and fir
572	(establishment year 1893) seedlings were omitted from the graph to improve interpretability.
573	
574	Fig. 3: A) Seedling height (length of main stem) vs. age for the upper 10th percentile of seedling
575	growth rates in each plot for Engelmann spruce (black) and subalpine fir (gray). The regression
576	line is forced through the zero origin and the shaded region is the 95% confidence interval. B)
577	Comparison of upper 10th percentile of growth rates (GR, cm/year) from each plot for spruce (n
578	= 49) and fir (n = 51). Statistical significance between species was tested with a Mann-Whittney
579	test (*** = <0.001). C) Annualized sapling recruitment rate year ⁻¹ for spruce and fir. Annualized
580	recruitment rate is the number of saplings (1.4 m in height to < 4 cm dbh) transitioning to
581	subcanopy (> 4 cm to < 20 cm dbh) between 1982 and 2016 divided by the total initial sapling
582	population. The thick horizontal line within the box is the median, the box represents the

interquartile range (25^{th} - 75^{th} percentiles; IQR) of the distribution, and the whiskers extend no further than ±1.5 times the IQR.

585

Fig 4: Percent change in stems per hectare by diameter at breast height (dbh) size class for Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir (individually and together) from 1982 to 2017 in six permanent plots in the Colorado Front Range. In the boxplots, the thick horizontal line within the box is the median, the box represents the interquartile range (25^{th} - 75^{th} percentiles; IQR) of the distribution, and the whiskers extend no further than ± 1.5 times the IQR. The dots plotted over each boxplot represent an individual plot.

592

593 Fig 5: Annualized recruitment rate (in-growth) (A), mortality (B), net change in population (C), 594 and persistence (D) by size class (SC2: > 4 cm dbh - < 20 cm dbh, SC3: > 20 cm dbh, All: > 4 cm 595 dbh) for Engelmann spruce and subalpine fir from 1982 to 2017 in six permanent plots in the 596 Colorado Front Range. In the boxplots, the thick horizontal line within the box is the median, the 597 box represents the interquartile range (25th-75th percentiles; IQR) of the distribution, and the 598 whiskers extend no further than ± 1.5 times the IQR. The dots plotted over each boxplot represent 599 the value for an individual plot by species. See *methods* for details on how each annualized rate 600 was calculated.



FIGURES

603 **Fig. 1**



604





608 Fig. 3



610 Fig. 4



613 Fig. 5

