

# **Direct Effect**

Rethinking a Classic of EC Legal Doctrine

Jolande M. Prinssen & Annette Schrauwen (Editors)

The Hogendorp Papers (3)

Proceedings of the Annual Colloquium of the  
G.K. van Hogendorp Centre for European Constitutional Studies



## Contents

	<b>Preface</b>	v
<b>CHAPTER I</b>	<b>Direct Effect: Myth, Mess or Mystery?</b> Judge David O.A. Edward	
I	Direct effect: myth, mess or mystery?	3
<b>CHAPTER II</b>	<b>Direct Effect Reconsidered, Redefined and Rejected</b> Prof. dr. Sacha Prechal	
I	Introduction	17
2	The plea against direct effect	18
2.1	The concept has become broad, diluted and leads to more confusion than assistance in addressing the relevant issues	18
2.2	The traditional conditions for direct effect are of very limited value. What sense does it make to verify their existence?	21
2.3	The context within which direct effect operates is changing	22
3	Redefining direct effect	23
4	Direct effect rejected ... what next?	25
4.1	Impact on legal relationships	27
4.2	The final character of the obligation	31
4.3	Defining legal consequences	34
5	Uniformity v. divergence	39
<b>CHAPTER III</b>	<b>More than an 'Infant Disease'; Individual Rights, EC Directives, and the Case for Uniform Remedies</b> Dr. Angela Ward	
I	Introduction	45
2	Individual what? The parameters of Court of Justice discourse on 'rights'	49
3	Ramifications of reliance on 'individual rights' for the development of effective sanctions against EC institutions	54

3.1	Liability of Community institutions under Article 288(2)	54
3.2	Article 230(4) nullity review	58
3.3	Article 234 validity review	60
4	Setting the boundaries: Court of Justice regulation of Member State remedies and procedural rules?	64
4.1	Uniform treatment?	66
4.1.1	Interim relief	66
4.1.2	Excusable error	68
4.1.3	The raising of new arguments on appeal	69
4.2	Payment of interest	70
4.3	Vacillating boundaries and the principle of non-discrimination	71
5	Procedural rules and remedies and non-directly effective directives	73
6	Conclusion	75

## CHAPTER IV

**The Doctrine of Consistent Interpretation; Managing Legal Uncertainty**

Dr. Gerrit Betlem

1	Introduction	79
2	The doctrine of consistent interpretation: the <i>Von Colson</i> principle	81
2.1	The time factor: is expiry of transposition period for directives relevant?	85
2.2	Limits to consistent interpretation: the ECJ's inconsistent <i>Arcaro</i> judgment	88
2.3	Disguised indirect effect and the communitarization of private international law	90
2.4	The 'incidental' effect of directives	92
2.5	Inverse vertical indirect effect of Community law: a bridge too far?	96
2.6	Comparative note: 'the English <i>Marleasing</i> ' (Human Rights Act 1998, S. 3)	98
3	Direct effect and <i>Francovich</i> liability: independent but not unconnected	101
4	Conclusion	103

CHAPTER V	<b>Direct Effect: Convergence or Divergence? A Comparative Perspective</b>	
	Prof. dr. Jan H. Jans & Jolande M. Prinssen, LL.M	
1	Introduction	107
2	National case law and the direct effect doctrine 'as such'	107
2.1	Questioning the doctrine and its consequences; Dutch, French and Spanish case law	108
2.2	Formulating the conditions; the House of Lords in the <i>Three Rivers</i> case	111
2.3	Horizontal direct effect or not; Spanish and Italian approaches	114
2.4	Horizontal side-effects of vertical direct effect; examples of national (mainly English, German and Dutch) case law	116
2.5	Conclusions	119
3	National case law and the 'modalities' of applying the doctrine of direct effect; the <i>Berkeley</i> case	120
4	Direct effect from the perspective of minimum harmonization	122
5	Conclusions	125
CHAPTER VI	<b>Direct Effect in Germany and France; A Constitutional Comparison</b>	
	Prof. dr. Jörg Gerkrath	
1	Introductory remarks	129
1.1	The relevance of the constitutional law position	129
1.2	The appropriateness of the comparative approach	130
1.3	The convenience of the choice of Germany and France	133
2	What the Constitution says	135
2.1	General clauses on the domestic effect of international law	135
2.1.1	The German Basic Law	135
2.1.2	The French Constitution	137
2.2	Special provisions on European integration	138
2.2.1	Participation in the European Union	140
2.2.2	Transfer of powers	141
2.2.3	Association of national parliaments	142
3	What the judges say that the Constitution says	144
3.1	... interpreting the specific clauses on international and EC law	145

3.1.1	The principle of direct effect is generally accepted under the domestic Constitution	145
3.1.2	Both constitutional courts maintain limits to direct effect deriving from domestic constitutional law	149
3.2	... interpreting other constitutional clauses related to the principle of direct effect	151
4	Conclusion	153
CHAPTER VII	<b>The Direct Effect of Public International Law</b> Prof. dr. André Nollkaemper	
1	Introduction	157
2	The concept of direct effect	159
3	The conditional nature of direct effect	164
4	The voluntary acceptance of direct effect	167
5	The determinants of direct effect	169
6	Conclusion	179
CHAPTER VIII	<b>The Enforcement of Customary International Law Through EC Law</b> Prof. dr. Jan Wouters & Dries Van Eeckhoutte	
1	Introduction	183
2	The position of customary international law in Community law	185
2.1	Customary international law as a limit on State/EC jurisdiction and powers	186
2.2	Customary international law as providing rules of interpretation	191
2.3	Customary international law as gap-filler	194
2.4	Reviewing the legality of EU acts based on customary international law?	196
3	An analysis of <i>Opel Austria</i> and <i>Racke</i>	200
3.1	The facts of both cases	200
3.2	An analysis of <i>Racke</i>	201
3.3	An analysis of <i>Opel Austria</i>	208
4	The invocability of international agreements <i>viz.</i> customary international law: consistent case law?	215
4.1	Introduction	215
4.2	International agreements in general	215

4.3	GATT and WTO	219
4.4	Comparing the case law on the invocability of international agreements <i>viz.</i> of customary international law	223
5	By way of conclusion: the nature of customary international law and its invocability	229
5.1	The nature of customary international law	229
5.2	The invocability of customary international law	232
CHAPTER IX	<b>Direct Effect, the Test and the Terms; In Praise of a Capital Doctrine of EU Law</b> Prof. dr. Tom Eijsbouts	
1	Introduction	237
2	Logic, limit, law	238
3	The test and its saving flaws	239
4	The spirit	242
5	From rights to obligations	244
6	The terms	246
7	Conclusion	249
CHAPTER X	<b>Epilogue: Symbiosis?</b> Prof. dr. Pieter-Jan Kuijper	
1	Introduction	253
2	International law background to direct effect	253
2.1	Direct effect in monist and dualist systems	255
2.2	State responsibility	256
3	International law, Community law and direct effect	257
3.1	Opening up the Community legal order to international law	257
3.2	Imposing supremacy and direct effect as a constitutional court	260
3.2.1	The Treaty itself and regulations	260
3.2.2	Directives	260
4	The doctrine of 'direct effect of directives'	262
4.1	Non-implemented directives	263
4.2	Directives and individuals	264
4.3	Uniform application and remedies	265
5	Concluding remarks	267

<b>Bibliography</b>	269
<b>Table of Cases</b>	291
<b>Abbreviations</b>	305
<b>Index</b>	309
<b>Contributors</b>	317