



Pepin N, Bradley RS, Diaz HF, Baraer M, Caceres EB, Forsythe N, Fowler H, Greenwood G, Hashmi MZ, Liu XD, Miller JR, Ning L, Ohmura A, Palazzi E, Rangwala I, Schöner W, Severskiy I, Shahgedanova M, Wang MB, Williamson SN, Yang DQ. <u>Elevation-dependent warming in mountain regions of the world</u>. *Nature Climate Change* 2015, 5(5), 424-430.

^ -	_	. •	- 1	١.	
Co	n۱	/rı	σ	'n	t.
U	M		b	••	

© 2015 Macmillan Publishers Limited.

DOI link to article:

http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2563

Date deposited:

16/06/2015

Embargo release date:

23 October 2015



This work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported License</u>

Elevation-Dependent Warming in Mountain Regions of the World

Mountain Research Initiative EDW Working Group^a

Abstract

It is generally accepted that the observed warming of our climate system is amplified in the Arctic. In contrast, despite model predictions of future amplified warming in high elevation regions, analyses of limited mountain observations available do not always agree. This is partly because of inherent complexities in mountain climate, but also because current monitoring is inadequate and skewed towards lower elevations. We review important physical mechanisms which could potentially contribute to elevation-dependent warming (EDW) that include: a) snow albedo and surface-based feedbacks, b) water vapour changes and latent heat release, c) surface water vapour and radiative flux changes, d) surface heat loss and temperature change, and e) aerosols. Mechanisms either encourage an enhancement of warming with elevation, or enhance warming in a critical elevation band. The variable combination of mechanisms may cause contrasting patterns of EDW in different regions. We propose future needs to improve knowledge of mountain temperature trends and their controlling mechanisms through improved observations, use of satellite data, and model simulations. Improved understanding of EDW is of critical societal importance because EDW can enhance climate change impacts in mountain ecosystems by accelerating changes in cryospheric systems, hydrological regimes, ecosystem response and biodiversity.

Introduction

It is well-known that the rate of temperature change with increased levels of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere is amplified at high latitudes, but there is also growing evidence that the rate of warming is amplified with elevation, such that high mountain environments are experiencing more rapid changes in temperature than at lower elevations. This "elevation-dependent warming" (EDW) has important implications for the mass balance of the high altitude cryosphere and associated runoff, for ecosystems and farming communities in high mountain environments, as well as for species that reside in restricted altitudinal zones within a mountain range. However, because of sparse high elevation observations, there is a danger that we may not be monitoring some of the regions of the globe that are warming the most. Here we review the evidence for EDW, and examine the mechanisms that may account for this phenomenon. We conclude with a strategy for future research that is needed to reduce current uncertainties and to

^a N. Pepin, R.S. Bradley, H.F. Diaz, M. Baraer, E.B. Caceres, N. Forsythe, H. Fowler, G. Greenwood, M.Z. Hashmi, X.D. Liu, J. Miller, L. Ning, A. Ohmura, E. Palazzi, I. Rangwala, W. Schoener, I. Severskiy, M. Shahgedanova, M.B. Wang, S.N. Williamson and D.Q. Yang

ensure that the changes taking place in remote high elevation regions of the planet are adequately observed and accounted for.

Evidence for EDW

In theory, it ought to be a simple matter to document the rate and geographical pattern of warming with elevation over recent decades. However, many factors make it extremely difficult to determine the rate of warming in mountainous regions. First and foremost, long-term meteorological stations (with >20 years of record) are extremely sparse at high elevations. For example, in the GHCNv3 database of homogenized stations, out of 7297 stations, only 191 (3%) are above 2000m and 54 (0.7%) above 3000m, and long-term data are simply non-existent above 5000m in any mountain range¹. Unlike in the Arctic, which is relatively homogenous, mountain temperatures also suffer from extreme local variability due to factors such as topography, slope, aspect and exposure. Furthermore, observations within mountain regions are often taken from valleys with distinct microclimates prone to cold air drainage^{2,3}, which makes it hard to separate noise from trend.

Evidence for EDW could also come from satellite data, atmospheric reanalysis or model studies but these sources also have limitations. Satellites generate surface ("skin") temperature, which is not generally recorded at surface meteorological stations. Moreover, satellite data are of limited duration⁴ and are not well validated in high elevation regions where clouds are common. Reanalysis data sets are heavily dependent on free air (not just surface) data, and they are not homogenised for climate trend analysis. Models generally have poor spatial resolution and require observational data for validation, making it difficult to be sure that simulations are accurate.

Notwithstanding these limitations, there have been many studies that have attempted to quantify EDW (Table 1). More detail concerning individual studies (including metadata) is given in the Supplementary Information. Here we summarize the literature as a whole. A majority of studies suggest that warming is more rapid at higher elevations (first row of Table 1) but there are a number of studies which show no relationship or a more complex situation (other three rows). This is particularly true for observational studies which are in less agreement than model simulations. This may be because most models integrate trends over a long time period (typically up to the end of the 21st century) when EDW may become more widespread than it has been so

far. It is also noticeable that minimum temperatures show a stronger tendency towards EDW than maximum temperatures, and so separate mechanisms may be at work during the day and night. Of the studies listed in Table I, there are relatively few global studies that have examined surface (~2m) temperature data for evidence of EDW⁵⁻⁸. Overall there has also been a lack of consistency in the methods and data used to quantify the rate and patterns of warming. Differences in the time periods examined, the stations compared, the elevational range selected, and the temporal resolution of the data (i.e. daily vs monthly or annual temperatures) all vary (see Supplementary Information) and thus contribute to differences in trends. Many studies are relatively short (<50 years) and so strong inter-decadal variability often contributes to observed trends. Although some data homogenization has been achieved for station records in Europe and North America, there is a particular problem with the mountain data in the tropics which is both sparse and inhomogeneous.

The most striking evidence for EDW is from Asia. Yan & Liu⁹ investigated warming trends (1961-2012) using 139 stations on and around the Tibetan Plateau, the most extensive high elevation area in the world. Figure 1 shows mean warming rates (°C/decade) for contrasting periods for stations in 500m wide altitudinal bands starting at 1000m. Systematic increases in warming rate with elevation are uncovered for annual mean temperature, and warming rates have increased in recent decades (Figure 1a). Mean minimum temperatures also show EDW on an annual basis (Figure 1b) as do mean temperatures in autumn (Figure 1c) and winter (Figure 1d). There was no strong elevational effect in other seasons, or for mean maximum temperatures, a result that is consistent with findings in other areas.

Model simulations have also been used to identify EDW, both in historical and future projections¹⁰⁻¹². In general, most GCMs indicate that EDW in the free atmosphere is a characteristic of low latitude regions, with a maximum warming signal around 400-200 hPa in the AR5 RCP scenarios for example¹³ (Fig 12.12 therein). This EDW does not extend into the mid and high latitudes, and in most models warming is concentrated at the surface (>800 hPa) n the high latitudes, especially in the northern hemisphere. Few studies have been specifically designed to investigate the geographical pattern of and processes associated with EDW at the mountain surface which is sometimes dissimilar to the free atmosphere¹⁴. The climate response to greenhouse gas forcing within complex mountain topography can only be adequately captured using models with a spatial resolution of 5 km or less¹⁵ that generally implement non-hydrostatic

equations for the atmosphere. Such simulations can be done for both historical case studies (using reanalyses as boundary forcing) and future scenarios (using GCM projections); and although the computational demands are high at present, novel and selective experimental designs to conduct studies at such high resolutions are feasible ^{16,17}. Of those modeling studies that have identified EDW, the most common explanation is associated with the snow/albedo feedback mechanism, which is often discussed in terms of the upslope movement of the zero-degree isotherm ¹⁰, although other factors such as elevation-dependent changes in cloud cover and soil moisture have also been suggested as possible forcings ¹⁸.

Regional variability in EDW could also be influenced by inter-annual to decadal-scale variability in large-scale circulation, e.g. ENSO, NAO, PDO, etc. For example, it has been found that during positive NAO winters in the late 1980s and early 1990s, there was enhanced warming at high elevations in the European Alps, associated with warm wet winters¹⁹. This pattern was reversed during years with a negative NAO index. In the tropical Andes, increasing freezing level heights between 1958 and 1990 were related to El Niño conditions (warmer sea surface temperatures in the eastern tropical Pacific) and attendant changes in clouds and atmospheric water vapor, which can drive regional variability in EDW²⁰. Because of all of these factors, we can only say at present that there is evidence that many, but not all, mountain ranges show enhanced warming with elevation. Understanding the physical mechanisms that drive EDW is therefore essential to explain the regional variations, as discussed in the next section.

Hypotheses and Mechanisms for EDW

Temperature change at the earth's surface is primarily a response to the energy balance, and therefore factors which preferentially increase the net flux of energy to the surface along an elevation gradient would lead to enhanced warming as a function of elevation. Here we discuss various mechanisms and processes that have been linked to EDW²¹. The physical shape of the associated elevational signal is expressed in Figure 2.

a) Albedo

Snow albedo feedback is an important positive feedback in Arctic amplification^{22,23}, but it is also relevant in snow-dominated high elevation regions^{10,24,25} where the seasonal timing of snow cover varies with elevation, and maximum warming rates commonly occur near the annual 0°C isotherm^{6,26}. In the Swiss Alps the daily mean 2m temperature of a spring day without snow

cover is 0.4°C warmer than one with snow cover²⁷ (mean value for 1961-2012). The current snowline, which varies in elevation across different mountain ranges, is expected to retreat to higher elevations as the overall climate system warms. Furthermore, the elevation dependency of snow cover duration (and also of the snow/rain ratio) is non-linear so the rate of snowline retreat may increase as temperatures rise²⁸. This will result in significant increases in the surface absorption of incoming solar radiation around the retreating snowline (approximated by the 0°C isotherm), initially causing enhanced warming at that elevation²⁹. As the snowline migrates upslope, this effect will extend to increasingly higher elevations (Figure 2a). A similar process is expected to result from an upslope migration of tree-lines, owing to the accompanying reduction in surface albedo through greening^{30,31}. Changes in the ratio of snow to rain are also likely to occur over a wider elevation band, as already noted in the Tibetan Plateau/Himalaya region, where the snow cover season has shortened, and more precipitation is now falling as rain³²⁻³⁴. The snow/albedo mechanism has a stronger influence on maximum than minimum temperatures because of the increase in absorbed solar radiation, as noted by Kothawale et al. 35 who compared maximum and minimum temperature trends in the western Himalayas between 1971 and 2007. A regional climate model study¹⁰ also found EDW in the Alps and suggested that the increasing influence of the snow-albedo feedback mechanism, primarily during spring and summer, was responsible. The specific temperature response (Tmin vs. Tmax) will depend on soil moisture; if the increased surface shortwave absorption is balanced by increases in sensible heat fluxes (latent heat fluxes), the response will be more prominent in Tmax (Tmin). A more amplified response has been found in Tmin relative to Tmax in lower elevation regions (1500-2500m) of the Colorado Rocky Mountains during winter from regional climate models³⁶. This was caused in part, by the increases in the absorbed solar radiation at the surface, primarily balanced by increases in the latent heat fluxes caused by the increases in surface soil moisture from snowmelt.

b) Clouds

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

Observations of long-term changes of clouds and cloud properties are sparse, particularly in high elevation regions, and there are few studies that discuss how changes in clouds might affect EDW^{37,38}. Changes in cloud cover and cloud properties affect both shortwave and longwave radiation and thus the surface energy budget. They also affect warming rates in the atmosphere through condensation. A band of enhanced warming caused by latent heat release is

expected near the condensation level, which could be further augmented because of higher atmospheric water vapor content²⁰ resulting from global warming (Figure 2b). If the condensation level rises (which may occur if temperatures also warm and dew point depression increases at sea-level) then a band of reduced warming would occur immediately below the new cloud base level (dotted line on Figure 2b) with enhanced warming above. Thus, the overall implications of a warmer and moister atmosphere support enhanced warming at high elevations^{39,40}. For the Tibetan Plateau between 1961 and 2003, decreasing cloud cover during the daytime, but increasing low level clouds at night, has caused minimum temperatures to increase⁴¹. Using weather stations and high-resolution climate model output, Liu et al.³⁸ found that cloud-radiation effects were partly responsible for EDW on the Tibetan Plateau. A similar response was observed in the Alps¹⁹ with an altitudinal dependence of temperature anomalies, except that lower elevations were affected by changes in fog and stratus clouds.

c) Water Vapor and Radiative Fluxes

Processes associated with the relationships between longwave radiation, moisture and thermal regimes along an elevation gradient are expected to lead to an elevation-dependent warming. These include i) the sensitivity of downward longwave radiation (DLR) to specific humidity (q), and ii) the relationship between temperature and outgoing longwave radiation (OLR). DLR increases in response to increasing specific humidity, however this relationship is non-linear (Figure 2c) with substantially higher sensitivities at low levels of specific humidity, especially below 2.5g kg⁻¹, which are found in many high elevation regions 40,42,43. These high sensitivities occur because, below a certain specific humidity threshold, the air becomes optically under-saturated in the longwave water vapor absorption lines. In such conditions, small water vapor increases can have a substantial influence on DLR, resulting in a significantly greater warming response at higher elevations. Both observations 40,44 and climate model simulations 12,25 suggest that this mechanism has contributed to EDW. In the Alps, the DLR-q sensitivity is particularly high for q below 5g kg⁻¹, conditions that are more likely at higher elevations and during the cold season in the extra-tropics 42. A similar finding was also reported for the Colorado Rocky Mountains 45, which also showed that clouds have limited effect on DLR-q sensitivities.

Another mechanism related to radiative fluxes is a direct consequence of the functional shape of blackbody emissions. For a given heat flux exchange (e.g., an increase in OLR), this relationship will result in a larger temperature change at lower temperatures⁴⁶. OLR is one of the

major mechanisms through which the land surface loses heat and is proportional to the fourth power of temperature (the Stephan-Boltzmann law). Therefore, for a given change in radiative heating, higher elevations will experience enhanced warming rates along an elevational gradient. This effect will not be sensitive to seasons or geography (Figure 2d).

d) Aerosols

Most of the atmospheric loading of aerosol pollutants (e.g. atmospheric brown clouds and associated black carbon in Asia) is concentrated at relatively low elevations (<3km)⁴⁷, which would be expected to decrease the flux of shortwave radiation to lower mountain slopes (surface dimming effect), but have limited or no effects on higher mountains, above the polluted layer (Figure 2e). However, there has been little systematic investigation of the elevational signal of anthropogenic pollutants in mountain regions. High levels of black carbon have been found at 5000m in the Himalayas during the pre-monsoon season⁴⁸, but whether such conditions reflect local up-valley transport or more regional conditions is unclear. Certainly, aerosols are transported to elevations above 10km over Tibet and much of central Asia during convective monsoon activity^{49,50}.

Black carbon affects the radiation budget in two ways. It absorbs radiation (principally in the mid to lower troposphere) and decreases the surface albedo when deposited on snow⁵¹⁻⁵³. It has been suggested⁴⁷ that black carbon could account for half the total warming in the Himalayas during the last several decades. Aerosols such as dust depend on other factors such as land-use change. For example, the disturbance of ground cover in the western U.S. causes dust to be readily transferred into the atmosphere and transported by wind into the mountains where it settles on snow, reduces albedo and leads to enhanced warming at higher elevations⁵⁴.

Combination of Mechanisms

The resulting response to all these factors and their interactions is complex. Some factors will be more influential than others in certain parts of the globe, and at certain times of year and this may partly account for the differences in EDW reported in Table 1. Albedo feedback will be strongest wherever snowlines are retreating but their elevational focus will be narrowed (and more prominent) in the tropics where there is reduced seasonal variation in snowline elevation. The cloud feedback (latent heat release) will be enhanced at high temperatures and is therefore

also dominant in the tropics, particularly in the free atmosphere where it is responsible for amplified warming in most IPCC simulations⁵⁵. In contrast, aerosol loading is concentrated in mid-latitudes (particularly Asia) and the water vapor/radiative feedbacks are enhanced at low temperatures so should be dominant at higher latitudes, at night and in winter. All the physical processes either point to an expected increase in warming with elevation, or an enhanced band of sensitivity that will move upslope with time. Although the physical reasons for the existence of EDW are strong, the observational evidence for EDW is not yet as clear cut. Therefore, we urgently need to develop a more systematic method of climate monitoring at high elevations to quantify the extent of the phenomenon and its spatial variability.

Future needs

The surface in-situ climate observing network needs to be expanded to cover data poor regions, and to include more variables. Air temperature observations at ground stations are essential but many high-altitude areas (e.g., greater than 4000m) are still heavily under-sampled. Therefore, special efforts should be made to extend observations upward to the highest summits with transects of highly accurate instruments (as used, for example, in NOAA's Climate Reference Network) measuring a broad array of variables (e.g., humidity, radiation, clouds, precipitation, soil moisture and snow cover, besides temperature) in order to fill the pronounced high-altitude observational gap. Targeted field campaigns should be devised to detect and better understand EDW in areas where its signal is expected to be strongest (see the previous discussion on mechanisms). For example radiation measurements, together with measurements of humidity, albedo, temperature and soil moisture could be focused around tree-line, and above and below the snowline in areas with high interannual variation in snowline position, to determine the partitioning of energy fluxes; black carbon and other aerosols should be monitored more widely to determine their relationship to other meteorological parameters. More details are given in the Supplementary Information.

Much high elevation data that have been collected are also largely inaccessible due to poorly managed data archives in different countries, and this issue has limited efforts to create homogenous high elevation global datasets. Thus, in addition to new observations, we need a strong effort to locate and evaluate what already exists. Powerful methods for homogenizing climate data are available (see e.g. www.homogenisation.org) but better metadata (e.g. station

characteristics such as topography) and information on station location and instrument changes needs to be incorporated more systematically into high elevation datasets. Finally we need agreed metrics to measure and quantify EDW once data are collected.

To further overcome limitations arising from the sparseness of in-situ stations in undersampled high-altitude regions, spatially continuous remotely-sensed land surface temperature (LST) data from satellites could be used⁴. The availability of new products based on a combination/merging of remotely-sensed land-surface temperature and in situ air temperature data represents an essential ingredient for the study of EDW and should be strongly encouraged for studies of high mountain regions. However, new approaches may be required to resolve temperature trends in complex topographic settings, where cloud cover is often present.

To complement an enhanced observational network, both global and fine-scale regional climate model simulations (historical and future) should be analyzed for sensitive regions in order to (1) investigate how well the models represent the specific climate variables as well as the interactions among them, and (2) identify and quantify the processes which are responsible for EDW. For regional studies, both statistically and dynamically downscaled model simulations may be useful, although multi-decadal simulations will be needed to fully investigate future projections of EDW. Models can also be used to perform sensitivity studies to investigate and quantify the role of specific climate variables. For example, although models have been used to quantify the magnitude of the snow/albedo feedback in the Arctic⁵⁶⁻⁵⁸, there has been little attempt to do this in high elevation regions¹². By doing a detailed analysis of regional energy budgets, one can potentially determine which energy budget component(s) are most responsible for temperature change and then in turn which climate variable(s) are most responsible for the change in energy budget. However, many of the variables interact with each other, and it can be difficult to untangle the dependencies. There have been statistical analyses that attempt to quantify specific processes (e.g. Naud et al. 45 who used a neural network method to quantify the sensitivity of downward longwave fluxes to changes in water vapor) but the dependencies among different variables remains problematic and new techniques are still required to improve such analyses.

Conclusion

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

Elevation-dependent warming is a poorly observed phenomenon that requires urgent attention, to ensure that potentially important changes in high mountain environments are adequately recorded by the global observational network. More rapid changes in high mountain climates would have consequences far beyond the immediate mountain regions, as mountains are "water towers" and the major source of water for large populations in lower elevation regions⁵⁹. The social and economic consequences of enhanced warming in mountain regions could therefore be large, and this alone requires that close attention be paid to the issue. In addition, mountains provide habitat for many of the world's rare and endangered species, and the presence of many different ecosystems in close proximity enhances the ecological sensitivity of mountains to environmental change. Understanding how future climatic changes may impact the zonation of ecosystems in high mountain regions provides an equally compelling argument for fully understanding this issue. A strategy that combines a network of field observations, satellite remote sensing and high resolution climate modeling is required to fully address the problem.

296297

298

References

- 299 1. Lawrimore, J.H. et al. An overview of the Global Historical Climatology Network monthly
- 300 mean temperature data set, version 3. *J. Geophys. Res.* 116, D19121, doi:10.1029/2011JD016187
- 301 (2011).
- 302 2. Whiteman, C.D. Mountain Meteorology: Fundamentals and Applications. Oxford: Oxford
- 303 University Press, 355pp (2000).
- 304 3. Pepin, N.C. Daly, C. & Lundquist, J. The influence of surface versus free-air decoupling on
- 305 temperature trend patterns in the western United States. J. Geophys. Res. 116, D10109,
- 306 doi:10.1029/2010JD014769 (2011).
- 4. Qin, J. Yang, K. Liang, S. & Guo, X. The altitudinal dependence of recent rapid warming over
- 308 the Tibetan Plateau. Clim. Chang. 97, 321-327 (2009).
- 5. Diaz, H.F. & Bradley, R.S. Temperature variations during the last century at high elevation
- 310 sites. Clim. Chang. 36, 253–279 (1997).
- 311 6. Pepin, N.C. & Lundquist, J.D. Temperature trends at high elevations: Patterns across the
- 312 globe. Geophys. Res. Lett. 35, L14701, doi:10.1029/2008GL034026 (2008).

- 7. Ohmura, A. Enhanced temperature variability in high-altitude climate change. *Theor. Appl.*
- 314 *Climatol.* 110, 499–508 (2012).
- 8. Wang, Q. Fan, X. & Wang, M. Recent warming amplification over high elevation regions
- 316 across the globe. Clim. Dyn. 43, 87-101 (2014).
- 9. Yan, L. & Liu, X. Has Climatic Warming over the Tibetan Plateau Paused or Continued in
- Recent Years? *Journal of Earth, Ocean and Atmospheric Sciences*, 1, 13-28 (2014)
- 319 10. Giorgi, F. Hurrell, J. Marinucci, M. & Beniston, M. Elevation dependency of the surface
- 320 climate change signal: a model study. *J. Clim.* 10, 288–296 (1997).
- 321 11. Bradley, R.S. Keimig, F.T. & Diaz, H.F. Projected temperature changes along the American
- 322 cordillera and the planned GCOS network. Geophys. Res. Lett. 31, L16210,
- 323 doi:10.1029/2004GL020229 (2004).
- 324 12. Rangwala, I. Amplified water vapour feedback at high altitudes during winter. Int. J.
- 325 *Climatol.* 33, 897–903 (2013).
- 326 13. Collins, M. et al. Long-term Climate Change: Projections, Commitments and Irreversibility.
- 327 In: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the
- 328 Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Stocker, T.F. et al.
- 329 (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, pp.
- 330 1029–1136, doi:10.1017/CBO9781107415324.024 (2013).
- 331 14. Pepin, N. & Seidel, D.J. A global comparison of surface and free-air temperatures at high
- 332 elevations. *J. Geophys. Res.* 110, D03104 (2005).
- 333 15. Rasmussen, R. et al. High-Resolution Coupled Climate Runoff Simulations of Seasonal
- 334 Snowfall over Colorado: A Process Study of Current and Warmer Climate. J. Climate, 24 (12),
- 335 3015–3048 (2011).
- 336 16. Rasmussen, R. et al. Climate Change Impacts on the Water Balance of the Colorado
- 337 Headwaters: High-Resolution Regional Climate Model Simulations. Journal of
- 338 *Hydrometeorology*, 15:3, 1091-1116 (2014).
- 339 17. Kendon, E.J. et al. Heavier summer downpours with climate change revealed by weather
- 340 forecast resolution model. *Nature Climate Change*, 4(7), 570-576 (2014).
- 341 18. Kotlarski, S. Bosshhard, T. Luthi, D. Paul, P. & Schar, C. Elevation gradients of European
- 342 climate change in the regional climate model COSMO-CLM. Clim. Change, 112: 189-215
- 343 (2012)

- 344 19. Beniston, M. & Rebetez, M. Regional behavior of minimum temperatures in Switzerland for
- 345 the period 1979–1993. *Theor. Appl. Climatol.* 53, 231–243 (1996).
- 346 20. Diaz, H.F. & Graham, N.E. Recent changes in tropical freezing heights and the role of sea
- 347 surface temperature. *Nature* 383, 152–155 (1996).
- 348 21. Rangwala, I. & Miller, J.R. Climate change in mountains: a review of elevation-dependent
- 349 warming and its possible causes. *Clim. Chang.* 114, 527–547 (2012).
- 22. Chapin, F.S. et al. Role of land-surface changes in arctic summer warming. Science 310,
- 351 657–660 (2005).
- 352 23. Jeong, J.-H. et al. Greening in the circumpolar high-latitude may amplify warming in the
- 353 growing season. *Clim. Dyn.* 38(7-8), 1421-1431 (2012).
- 354 24. Fyfe, J.C. & Flato, G.M. Enhanced climate change and its detection over the Rocky
- 355 Mountains. J. Clim. 12, 230–243 (1999).
- 356 25. Rangwala, I. Miller, J.R. Russell, G.L. & Xu, M. Using a global climate model to evaluate
- 357 the influences of water vapor, snow cover and atmospheric aerosol on warming in the Tibetan
- Plateau during the twenty-first century. Clim. Dyn. 34, 859–872 (2010).
- 359 26. Ceppi, P. Scherrer, S.C. Fischer, A.M. & Appenzeller, C. Revisiting Swiss temperature
- 360 trends 1959-2008. *Int. J. Climatol.* 32, 203–213 (2010).
- 361 27. Scherrer, S. Ceppi, P. Croci-Maspoli, M. & Appenzeller, C. Snow-albedo feedback and
- 362 Swiss spring temperature trends. *Theor Appl Climatology* 110, 509-516 (2012).
- 363 28. Hantel, M., Ehrendorfer, M. & Haslinger, A. Climate sensitivity of snow cover duration in
- 364 Austria. Int. J of Climatol. 20, 615-640 (2000).
- 365 29. Barnett, T.P. et al. Human-Induced Changes in the Hydrology of the Western United States,
- 366 *Science* 319, 1080-1083 (2008).
- 367 30. Holtmeier, F-K. & Broll, G. Sensitivity and response of northern hemisphere altitudinal and
- polar treelines to environmental change at landscape and local scales. Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.
- 369 14(5), 395–410 (2005).
- 370 31. Jiang, D. Zhang, Y. & Lang, X. Vegetation feedback under future global warming. *Theor.*
- 371 Appl. Climatol. 106, 211–227 (2011).
- 372 32. Rikiishi, K. & Nakasato, H. Height dependence of the tendency for reduction in seasonal
- snow cover in the Himalaya and the Tibetan Plateau region, 1966-2001. Ann. Glaciol. 43, 369–
- 374 377 (2006).

- 375 33. Archer, D.R. & Fowler, H.J. Spatial and temporal variations in precipitation in the Upper
- 376 Indus Basin, global teleconnections and hydrological implications. Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. 8,
- 377 47–61 (2004).
- 378 34. Bhutiyani, M. Kale, V. & Pawar, N. Climate change and the precipitation variations in the
- 379 northwestern Himalaya: 1866–2006. *Int. J. Climatol.* 30, 535–548 (2010).
- 380 35. Kothawale, D. Munot, A. & Kumar, K.K. Surface air temperature variability over India
- during 1901-2007, and its association with ENSO. Clim. Res. 42, 89–104 (2010).
- 382 36. Rangwala, I. Barsugli, J. Cozzetto, K. Neff, J. & Prairie, J. Mid-21st century projections in
- temperature extremes in the southern Colorado Rocky Mountains from regional climate models.
- 384 *Clim Dyn.* doi:10.1007/s00382-011-1282-z (2012).
- 385 37. Vuille, M. Bradley, R. Werner, M. & Keimig, F. 20th century climate change in the tropical
- Andes: observations and model results. *Clim. Chang.* 59, 75–99 (2003).
- 387 38. Liu, X. Cheng, Z. Yan, L. & Yin, Z.-Y. Elevation dependency of recent and future minimum
- surface air temperature trends in the Tibetan Plateau and its surroundings. *Glob. Planet. Chang.*
- 389 68, 164–174 (2009).
- 390 39. Held, I. M. & Soden, B.J. Robust responses of the hydrological cycle to global warming. J.
- 391 *Clim.* 19, 5686–5699 (2006).
- 392 40. Rangwala, I. Miller, J. & Xu, M. Warming in the Tibetan Plateau: Possible influences of the
- changes in surface water vapor. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 36, L06703 (2009).
- 394 41. Duan, A. & Wu, G. Change of cloud amount and the climate warming on the Tibetan
- 395 Plateau. Geophys. Res. Lett. 33, L22704 (2006).
- 396 42. Ruckstuhl, C. Philipona, R. Morland, J. & Ohmura, A. Observed relationship between
- 397 surface specific humidity, integrated water vapor, and longwave downward radiation at different
- 398 altitudes. J. Geophys. Res. 112, D03302 (2007).
- 399 43. Naud, C. M. Miller, J. R. & Landry, C. Using satellites to investigate the sensitivity of
- 400 longwave downward radiation to water vapor at high elevations. J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos. 117,
- 401 D05101, doi:10.1029/2011JD016917 (2012).
- 402 44. Philipona, R. Dürr, B. Ohmura, A. & Ruckstuhl, C. Anthropogenic greenhouse forcing and
- strong water vapor feedback increase temperature in Europe. Geophys. Res. Lett. 32, L19809
- 404 (2005).

- 405 45. Naud, C. M. Chen, Y. Rangwala, I. & Miller, J. R. Sensitivity of downward longwave
- 406 surface radiation to moisture and cloud changes in a high elevation region. J. Geophys. Res
- 407 118,10,072–10,081, doi:10.1002/jgrd.50644. (2013).
- 408 46. Ohmura, A. On the cause of "Fram" type seasonal change in diurnal amplitude of air
- 409 temperature in polar regions. J. Climatol. 4, 325-338 (1984).
- 410 47. Ramanathan, V. & Carmichael, G. Global and regional climate changes due to black carbon.
- 411 *Nat. Geosci.* 1(4), 221–227 (2008).
- 412 48. Bonasoni, P. et al., Atmospheric Brown Clouds in the Himalayas: first two years of
- 413 continuous observations at the Nepal-Climate Observatory at Pyramid (5079 m). *Atmos. Chem.*
- 414 *Phys. Discuss.*, 10, 4823-4885 (2010).
- 49. Vernier, J-P., Thomason, L.W. & Kar, J. CALIPSO detection of an Asian tropopause aerosol
- 416 layer, Geophysical Research Letters, 38, L07804, doi:10.1029/2010GL046614 (2011)
- 417 50. Lawrence, M.G., Asia under a high-level brown cloud. Nature Geoscience, 4, 352-353
- 418 (2011).
- 419 51. Xu, B. et al. Black soot and the survival of Tibetan glaciers. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.
- 420 106, 22114–22118 (2009).
- 421 52. Lau, W. Kim, M. Kim, K. & Lee, W. Enhanced surface warming and accelerated snow melt
- 422 in the Himalayas and Tibetan Plateau induced by absorbing aerosols. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 5 (2),
- 423 025204 (2010).
- 424 53. Gautam, R. Hsu, N.C. Lau, W.K. Yasunari, T. Satellite observations of desert dust-induced
- 425 Himalayan snow darkening *J. Geophys.*, *Res.*, 40(5), 988-993. DOI 10.1002/grl.50226 (2013).
- 426 54. Painter, T.H. et al. Impact of disturbed desert soils on duration of mountain snow cover.
- 427 Geophys. Res. Lett. 34, L12502 (2007).
- 428 55. Santer, B.D. et al., Contributions of anthropogenic and natural forcing to recent tropopause
- 429 height changes. *Science*, 301, 479–483 (2003).
- 430 56. Holland, M.M. & Bitz, C.M. Polar amplification of climate change in coupled models, *Clim*.
- 431 *Dyn.* 21, 221–232 (2003).
- 432 57. Winton, M. Amplified Arctic climate change: What does surface albedo feedback have to do
- 433 with it?, Geophys. Res. Lett., 33, L03701, doi:10.1029/2005GL025244 (2006).

- 434 58. Crook, J. A. Forster, P.M. & Stuber, N. Spatial patterns of modeled climate feedback and
- contributions to temperature response and polar amplification, J. Clim., 24(14), 3575–3592,
- 436 doi:10.1175/2011JCLI3863.1 (2011).
- 437 59. Viviroli, D. Dürr, H.H. Messerli, B. Meybeck, M. & Weingartner, R. Mountains of the
- world, water towers for humanity: Typology, mapping, and global significance. Water Resources
- 439 Research, 43 (7), W07447 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/ 2006WR005653 (2007).
- 440 60. Liu, X. & Chen, B. Climatic Warming in the Tibetan Plateau during recent decades. *Int. J.*
- 441 *Climatol.* 20, 1729-1742 (2000).

442

- 443 Full list of authors and affiliations
- 444 Nick Pepin, University of Portsmouth, UK
- 445 Ray Bradley, University of Massachussetts, USA
- Henry Diaz, CIRES, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, Boulder, USA
- 447 Michel Baraer, ETS University of Quebec, Canada
- 448 Ernesto Caceres, Instituto Nacional de Meterología e Hidrología, Ecuador
- Nathan Forsythe, University of Newcastle, UK
- 450 Hayley Fowler, University of Newcastle, UK
- 451 Greg Greenwood, University of Berne, Switzerland
- 452 Muhammad Zia Hashmi, Water Resources Section, Global Change Impact Studies Centre
- 453 (GCISC), Islamabad, Pakistan
- 454 Xiaodong Liu, SKLLQG, Institute of Earth Environment and CETES, Chinese Academy of
- 455 Sciences, China
- 456 Jim Miller, Rutgers University, USA
- 457 Liang Ning, University of Massachussetts, USA
- 458 Atsumu Ohmura, ETH, Zurich, Switzerland
- 459 Elisa Palazzi, Institute of Atmospheric Sciences and Climate-National Research Council (ISAC-
- 460 CNR), Italy
- 461 Imtiaz Rangwala, Western Water Assessment; Physical Sciences Division, NOAA ESRL,
- 462 Boulder, USA
- Wolfgang Schöner, University of Graz, Austria
- 464 Igor Severskiy, Institute of Geography, Kazakhstan

465 Maria Shahgedanova, University of Reading, UK 466 Mengben Wang, Shanxi University, China 467 Scott Williamson, University of Alberta, Canada 468 Daqing Yang, National Hydrology Research Centre (NHRC), Canada 469 470 Acknowledgements 471 We acknowledge the Mountain Research Initiative for funding an international workshop in 472 Payerbach Austria in April 2014 on Elevation-Dependent Warming at which the idea for this 473 paper was conceived and drafted. 474 **Author Contributions** 475 NP, RB, HF acted as editors for collation and editing of material; NP, HF, EP, IR, JM wrote 476 substantial sections of the main text; NP, SW, EP, NF wrote substantial sections of the 477 supplementary material; SW helped with referencing; XL provided Figure 1; MB provided 478 Figure 2; IR provided Tables. Other group members provided comments and editorial 479 suggestions as appropriate. 480 **Competing Financial Interest Statement** 481 There are no competing financial interests. 482 483 **Figure Captions** 484 Figure 1: Elevation-dependent warming (EDW) over and around the Tibetan Plateau a) from 1961 to 1990 for annual mean surface air temperature (TA, Liu and Chen⁶⁰) compared 485 486 with more recent trends updated to 2012; and from 1961 to 2012 for b) annual mean minimum 487 temperature (TN), c) autumn mean surface temperature, and d) winter mean surface temperature. 488 Bars represent elevation and trend magnitude is plotted on the y axis (presentation format similar 489 to the original paper). 490 Figure 2: Schematic representation of the relative vertical profile in atmospheric warming 491 expected to result from various mechanisms. 492 The details of each mechanism are discussed in the text. The y axis represents elevation, and x 493 axis the rate of warming (or expected trend magnitude). The curves are relative in that the 494 absolute value on the x axis is not important, rather the shape of the signal in terms of contrast

495

with elevation is the key illustration.

Table 1. Results from studies that investigated altitudinal gradient in warming rates (updated from Rangwala and Miller 2012).

Altitudinal gradient in the warming	Observations			Models		
rate	T _{min}	T _{max}	T _{avg}	T _{min}	T _{max}	T _{avg}
Increases with elevation	Annual ^{2,6a,31} Winter ^{2,5g,14} Spring ²¹ Autumn ^{21, 26e}	Annual ^{2,24} Summer ²¹	Annual ^{13,19e,23b,17c,29,12} All Seasons ²¹ Winter ^{26e}	Annual ¹⁴ Winter ^{14,20,9,11} Spring ^{14,20}	Winter ²⁰ Spring ²⁰ Autumn ⁹	Annual ²² Winter ^{3,4,8,22} Spring ^{3,8,22} Summer ³¹
Decreases with elevation	Winter ²	Winter ²¹	Annual ^{15,27} Winter ^{3g} Autumn ^{3g}	Summer ²⁷	-	Annual ^{10f} Spring ^{10f} Autumn ^{10f}
No significant gradient	-	Annual ¹	Annual ^{3,30,7d,25} All Seasons ^{28, 30}	-	-	Annual ³
No significant gradient but largest warming rates at an intermediate elevation	-	Annual ¹⁶	Annual ^{18,20c} Spring ^{3g}	-	-	Spring ³

503 Superscript letters refer to:

 $^{\mathrm{a}}$ No significant gradient but greater warming at higher elevations relative to regions between 0-500m

505 Badiosonde data; clearest signal in the tropics

 $^{\circ}$ 65% of the regional groups examined showed fastest trends at highest elevations and 20% showed fastest trends at

intermediate elevations

508 dHigh-elevation trends based on borehole data

509 ^eSatellite-derived temperature estimations

510 fReanalyses

511 ^gGridded Data

512 Superscript numbers refer to the following studies: 513 ¹Bhutiyani et al. (2007), ²Beniston and Rebetez (1996), ³C

¹Bhutiyani et al. (2007), ²Beniston and Rebetez (1996), ³Ceppi et al. (2010), ⁴Chen et al. (2003), ⁵Diaz and Eischeid (2007), ⁶Diaz and Bradley (1997), ⁷Gilbert and Vincent (2013), ⁸Giorgi et al. (1997), ⁹Hu et al. (2013), ¹⁰Hu et al. (2014), ¹¹Im and Ahn (2011), ¹²Li et al. (2011), ¹³Liu and Chen (2000), ¹⁴Liu et al. (2009), ¹⁵Lu et al. (2010), ¹⁶McGuire et al. (2012), ¹⁷Ohmura (2012), ¹⁸Pepin and Lundquist (2008), ¹⁹Qin et al. (2009), ²⁰Rangwala et al. (2012), ²¹Rangwala et al. (2009), ²²Rangwala et al. (2010), ²³Seidel and Free (2003), ²⁴Shrestha et al. (1999), ²⁵Tang and Arnone (2013), ²⁶Tao et al. (2013), ²⁷Vuille and Bradley (2000), ²⁸Vuille et al. (2003), ²⁹Wang et al. (2014), ³⁰You et al. (2010), ³¹Zubler et al. (2013)

532 References (Table 1)

- Beniston, M. & Rebetez, M. Regional behavior of minimum temperatures in Switzerland for the period 1979–1993. *Theoretical and applied climatology* **53**, 231-243 (1996).
- Bhutiyani, M., Kale, V. & Pawar, N. Long-term trends in maximum, minimum and mean annual air temperatures across the Northwestern Himalaya during the twentieth century. *Climatic Change* **85**, 159-177 (2007).
- 538 3 Ceppi, P., Scherrer, S., Fischer, A. & Appenzeller, C. Revisiting Swiss temperature trends 1959–2008.
 539 *International Journal of Climatology*, doi:10.1002/joc.2260 (2010).
- 540 4 Chen, B., Chao, W. & Liu, X. Enhanced climatic warming in the Tibetan Plateau due to doubling CO2: a model study. *Climate Dynamics* **20**, 401-413 (2003).
- 542 5 Diaz, H. & Eischeid, J. Disappearing 'alpine tundra,' Köppen climatic type in the western United States. 543 *Geophysical research letters* **34**, L18707 (2007).
- 544 6 Diaz, H. F. & Bradley, R. S. Temperature variations during the last century at high elevation sites. *Climatic* 545 *Change* **36**, 253-279 (1997).
- Gilbert, A. & Vincent, C. Atmospheric temperature changes over the 20th century at very high elevations in the European Alps from englacial temperatures. *Geophysical Research Letters* **40**, 2102-2108, doi:10.1002/grl.50401 (2013).
- 549 8 Giorgi, F., Hurrell, J., Marinucci, M. & Beniston, M. Elevation dependency of the surface climate change signal: a model study. *Journal of Climate* **10**, 288-296 (1997).
- Hu, Y., Maskey, S. & Uhlenbrook, S. Expected changes in future temperature extremes and their elevation dependency over the Yellow River source region. *Hydrology and Earth System Sciences* **17**, 2501-2514 (2013).
- 554 10 Hu, Z., Zhang, C., Hu, Q. S. & Tian, H. Temperature Changes in Central Asia from 1979 to 2011 Based on Multiple Datasets. *Journal of Climate* **27**, 1143-1167, doi:DOI: 10.1175/JCLI-D-13-00064.1 (2014).
- 556 11 Im, E.-S. & Ahn, J.-B. On the elevation dependency of present-day climate and future change over Korea 557 from a high resolution regional climate simulation. *Journal of the Meteorological Society of Japan* **89**, 89-558 100 (2011).
- 559 12 Li, Z. *et al.* Spatial and temporal trends of temperature and precipitation during 1960–2008 at the Hengduan Mountains, China. *Quaternary International* **236**, 127-142 (2011).
- 561 13 Liu, X. & Chen, B. Climatic warming in the Tibetan Plateau during recent decades. *International Journal of Climatology* **20**, 1729-1742 (2000).
- 563 Liu, X., Cheng, Z., Yan, L. & Yin, Z. Elevation dependency of recent and future minimum surface air temperature trends in the Tibetan Plateau and its surroundings. *Global and Planetary Change* **68**, 164-174 (2009).
- 566 15 Lu, A., Kang, S., Li, Z. & Theakstone, W. Altitude effects of climatic variation on Tibetan Plateau and its vicinities. *Journal of Earth Science* **21**, 189-198 (2010).
- McGuire, C. R., Nufio, C. R., Bowers, M. D. & Guralnick, R. P. Elevation-dependent temperature trends in the Rocky Mountain Front Range: changes over a 56-and 20-year record. *PloS one* **7**, e44370 (2012).
- 570 Ohmura, A. Enhanced temperature variability in high-altitude climate change. *Theoretical and Applied Climatology* **110**, 499-508 (2012).
- Pepin, N. & Lundquist, J. Temperature trends at high elevations: patterns across the globe. *Geophysical research letters* **35**, 1-L14701 (2008).
- 574 19 Qin, J., Yang, K., Liang, S. & Guo, X. The altitudinal dependence of recent rapid warming over the Tibetan Plateau. *Climatic Change* **97**, 321-327 (2009).

576	20	Rangwala, I., Barsugli, J., Cozzetto, K., Neff, J. & Prairie, J. Mid-21st century projections in temperature
577		extremes in the southern Colorado Rocky Mountains from regional climate models. Climate Dynamics 39,
578		1823-1840 (2012).

- Rangwala, I., Miller, J., Russell, G. & Xu, M. Warming in the Tibetan Plateau: Possible influences of the changes in surface water vapor. *Geophysical research letters* **36**, L06703 (2009).
- Rangwala, I. & Miller, J. R. Twentieth Century Temperature Trends in Colorado's San Juan Mountains. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research* **42**, 89-97 (2010).
- Seidel, D. & Free, M. Comparison of lower-tropospheric temperature climatologies and trends at low and high elevation radiosonde sites. *Climatic Change* **59**, 53-74 (2003).
- Shrestha, A., Wake, C., Mayewski, P. & Dibb, J. Maximum temperature trends in the Himalaya and its vicinity: an analysis based on temperature records from Nepal for the period 1971–94. *Journal of Climate* 12, 2775-2786 (1999).
- Tang, G. & Arnone, J. A. Trends in surface air temperature and temperature extremes in the Great Basin during the 20th century from ground-based observations. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres* 118, 3579-3589 (2013).
- Tao, J. *et al.* Elevation-dependent temperature change in the Qinghai–Xizang Plateau grassland during the past decade. *Theoretical and Applied Climatology* **117**, 61-71 (2013).
- 593 Vuille, M. & Bradley, R. Mean annual temperature trends and their vertical structure in the tropical Andes. 594 *Geophys. Res. Lett* **27**, 3885–3888 (2000).
- Vuille, M., Bradley, R., Werner, M. & Keimig, F. 20th century climate change in the tropical Andes: observations and model results. *Climatic Change* **59**, 75-99 (2003).
- Wang, Q., Fan, X. & Wang, M. Recent warming amplification over high elevation regions across the globe. Climate Dynamics **43**, 87-101 (2014).
- You, Q. et al. Relationship between temperature trend magnitude, elevation and mean temperature in the Tibetan Plateau from homogenized surface stations and reanalysis data. Global and Planetary Change (2010).
- Zubler, E. M. *et al.* Localized climate change scenarios of mean temperature and precipitation over Switzerland. *Climatic Change* **125**, 237-252 (2014).

604





