

### **Ethnicity and Electoral Politics**

This book asks what distinguishes peaceful plural democracies from violent ones and what distinguishes violent ethnic groups from peaceful ones within the same democracy. Contrary to conventional wisdom, it suggests that ethnic groups and their political demands are not inherently intransigent and that violence is not a necessary corollary of ethnic politics. The book posits that ethnic identity serves as a stable but flexible information shortcut for political choices, influencing party formation and development in new and maturing democracies. It furthermore argues that political intransigence and violence expressed by some ethnic groups stem from circumstances exogenous to ethnic affiliations. In particular, absolute restrictions on ethnic access to the executive produce conditions under which ethnic group incentive to participate in peaceful electoral politics is eliminated. A number of case studies and statistical analysis of all electoral democracies since 1945 are used to test and support the formal argument.

Jóhanna Kristín Birnir is assistant professor of political science at the University at Buffalo, State University of New York. She received her Ph.D. from the University of California, Los Angeles, in 2001. She has done extensive field research in Eastern Europe and Latin America and has published articles in Comparative Political Studies, Latin American Research Review, Studies in Comparative International Development, Research Policy, and Journal of Engineering and Technology Management.



# **Ethnicity and Electoral Politics**

JÓHANNA KRISTÍN BIRNIR

University at Buffalo, State University of New York





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521861359

© Jóhanna Kristín Birnir 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Birnir, Jóhanna Kristín, 1969– Ethnicity and electoral politics / Jóhanna Kristín Birnir. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-86135-7 (hardback)

1. Minorities – Political activity. 2. Ethnicity – Political aspects.

3. Elections. 4. Political participation. I. Title.

JF1061.B57 2006

324.90089 - dc22

2006005657

ISBN-13 978-0-521-86135-9 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-86135-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my boys



## **Contents**

List of Tables and Figures Acknowledgments		page ix xiii
2	Ethnic Attractors	19
3	Ethnic Attractors and Exogenous Constraints	41
4	Ethnic Voting in Romania	60
5	Ethnic Voting and Party System Stability	83
6	Ethnic Politics and Access	114
7	The Ethnic Effect on Regime Stability	148
8	Conclusions	200
Αţ	ppendix A: The Model (Formal Version)	213
Appendix B: Measurements and Other Methods Issues		225
References		253
Index		273

vii



## **Tables and Figures**

#### **TABLES**

3.1	Testable implications: Costs associated with the ethnic voter's electoral choice as determined by ethnic issue salience and representative capabilities of parties	page 51
4.1	Ethnic fractionalization on the fictitious continent Ethnica	68
4.2	Regression results: The relationship between county level volatility and ethnic fractionalization in Romania between the 1992 and 1996 elections	71
4.3	Change in vote share of selected Romanian political parties after the 2000 parliamentary elections	77
4.4	Volatility and fractionalization in selected countries	78
4.5	Average volatilities in new democracies over time	79
5.1	List of new democracies and their volatilities in the first election period	86
5.2	Bivariate correlations between volatility and linguistic, volatility linguistic and racial, and volatility and religious fractionalization indexes in new democracies	88
5.3	Test of the difference in the mean diversity in countries that use plurality electoral systems compared to countries that use either mixed or proportional electoral systems	91
5.4	Summary statistics for variables included in the analysis of the first election period (elections one and two) in new	
	democracies	97

ix



> Tables and Figures x 5.5 Regression: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility in the first election period (elections one and two) 101 5.6 Relationship between ethnic fractionalization and volatility over time 105 5.7 Regression: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility, first three election periods, controlling for Mauritius, Peru, Thailand, Spain, and Lithuania 109 6.1 Acronyms and organizational names used in the chapter 115 6.2 Population numbers in Basque Country, Catalunya, and Galicia 142 7.1 Electoral support for Basque and Catalan parties in Spain and Turkish parties in Bulgaria, with respect to national volatility levels 150 7.2 Regression: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility in new democracies, all elections 153 7.3 Regression: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility in new democracies, all elections 157 7.4 The relationship between ethnic access (through ethnic parties) and protest and violence, and size of the ethnic group in the legislature (leverage) and protest and violence 171 7.5 Cases included in the analysis: By country and group, average time since the group has had access to government through an ethnic or a nonethnic party 177 7.6 Summary statistics: Ethnic access, protest, and violence in all democracies with electorally active ethnic groups since 184 7.7 Regression: Ethnic access, violence, and protest in all democracies with electorally active ethnic groups 186 7.8 Electoral barriers and unmobilized groups 196 A.1 Testable implications: Costs associated with the ethnic voter's (party left) electoral choice as determined by ethnic issue salience and representative capabilities of parties 223 B.1 Case inclusion criteria for a national level test of the relationship between ethnic diversity and vote stability 228 B.2 Electoral democracies excluded for the tests of ethnic electoral behavior in Chapters Four and Seven 228 B.3 Case selection criteria for the test of the effects of ethnic 233 access in Chapter Seven



Tables and Figures	xi
B.4 Case selection concerns	234
B.5 Electorally active minorities in democracies that are excluded from the analysis of access in Chapter Seven	236
B.6 Electorally active minorities in democracies that are added for the test of access in Chapter Seven	240
B.7 Cases included in the analysis of access in Chapter Seven (by country and group, average violent rebellion, and peaceful protest)	245
B.8 Missing cases pertaining to summary in Table 7.6 and analysis in Table 7.7	250
FIGURES	
4.1 Percentage of minority Romanians and the ethnic fractionalization index by county	69
4.2 The substantive effect of ethnic fractionalization on county level vote stability in Romania between the 1992 and 1996 elections, excluding Covasna and Harghita	71
4.3 Numbers of votes and minority group members in Romania in 1992	73
4.4 Numbers of votes in 2000 and minority group members in 2002 in Romania	74
4.5 Change in numbers of votes (1992–1996) and minority group members (1992–2002) in Romania	75
4.6 The relationship between volatility and ethnic diversity in democratizing countries since 1945 (first election period)	78
4.7 Ethnic diversity in democratizing countries at the time of first election	80
4.8 Relationship between ethnic diversity and volatility in Eastern Europe (first election period)	81
5.1 Residual plot: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility, first three election periods (elections one through four)	106
5.2 Substantive effect as ethnic fractionalization varies one standard deviation around the mean	110
7.1 Residual plot: Ethnic fractionalization and volatility in new democracies, all elections	155
7.2 Substantive effect as ethnic fractionalization varies one standard deviation around its mean	158



xii

Tables and Figures

7.3 Substantive effect: Change in predicted probabilities of violence associated with a change of one-half standard deviation around the mean of each independent variable: Time since ethnic group has been in government (Access), GDP growth, GDP per capita, and number of parties with seats in the legislature (Institutions)

192



## Acknowledgments

I can trace the genesis of this book back to the Hungarians and Romanians I met while residing in a small village in Covasna, Romania, in 1992, or perhaps even further to the Catalans I befriended and my Basque teacher in Spain in the late 1980s. This work has been a great journey of discovery, and the highlights are the people I met in the process who helped shape and enhance this project. I owe my greatest intellectual debt to my mentor and good friend Barbara Geddes. Carrying on the tradition, she taught me to discern the "attractors" in the chaotic system of electoral politics. Long after her mentoring responsibilities have ceased I still rely on her sage insights about politics, professional and personal.

My second mentor, Mike Thies, I thank for the coffee and pretzels but mostly for his endless patience, and Dan Treisman for pushing me to improve the theory and write the second part of the book. I am indebted to John Londregan for teaching me statistical solutions and for showing me the first part of the model and to my brother Bibbi for helping me complete the model. I thank Frank Zagare and my friend Allyson Benton for reading the model at various stages of development.

During the research I have had the great pleasure and privilege of meeting and being assisted by innumerable people, including scholars and public officials. Only some of their contributions made it onto these pages, but all inform the study. While I cannot possibly name all those who have helped, I would like to single out a few. For help with the research and living in Romania I would like to thank Radu Niculescu and Gabriel Ionescu and their families, Gail Kligman, Petre Datculescu at the Institutul Roman de Sondaj si Opinia Publica (IRSOP), Anton Niculescu, and the staff of the Monitorul Oficial. For information on Hungary I

xiii



xiv

Acknowledgments

thank Levente Soltész. For the research in Ecuador I wish to thank the vice president of the Tribunal Supremo Electoral, Eduardo Villaquiran, and Felipe Burbano de Lara, Diego Jarrin Hurtado, Andres Mejia Acosta, and Alfonzo Perez. For assistance with my research in Peru I want to thank the president of the Oficina National de Procesos Electorales, Fernando Tuesta Soldevilla, and the president of the Jurado Nacional de Elecciones, Fernando Ballón-Landa Córdova. I thank Maximo Torero and the other scholars and staff at the Grupo de Análisis para el Desarrollo (GRADE) for giving me institutional affiliation and advising me on the project. For help with the research in Bolivia I would like to thank Donna Lee Van Cott, who also provided comments on the manuscript and insights about ethnic politics, George Grey, Xavier Albó, Oscar Basoberry, Ricardo Calla Ortega, Carlos F. Toranzo Roca, and Lic. Miguel Ramirez and Karina Aguilera at the Corte Nacional de Elecciones. In addition I would like to thank all the politicians and other officials in all of these countries, as well as in Bulgaria, who graciously donated their time for interviews or assisted in other ways. For grants, I would like to thank the Tinker Foundation, the U.S. Department of Education, and the Charles F. Scott Foundation. Some of this research was carried out while I was still at the University of California, Los Angeles, and was funded by the Latin American Center, the Center for European Studies, and International Studies and Overseas Programs (ISOP).

During my tenure at Buffalo the Baldy Center has funded much of the data collection on site and off and data revisions for the book, for which I am very grateful. I especially want to thank the director of the center, Lynn Mather, for organization of an excellent book workshop and for encouragement along the way. I am indebted to colleagues from various departments who participated in the workshop and the commentators David Laitin and G. Bingham Powell for thorough reviews of the manuscript that led to a complete overhaul of the book, much improving it. The integration of the two halves of the manuscript owes especially much to Bing's repeated and instructive reviews. I would also like to thank the Dean's Office at the College of Arts and Sciences here at Buffalo for its contribution from the Julian Park Fund for the development of the manuscript.

This book would never have been completed without the diligent research assistance of Nil Şatana and Rafael Davtian. I am deeply grateful to both of them, as well as for the assistance of Nicoleta Dascalu and Eric Wilk. My colleagues and students in the department of political science at the University at Buffalo have contributed to the manuscript in many



## Acknowledgments

xv

ways. Others who have read parts or all of the book and/or spent long hours discussing it and whose comments have improved the manuscript enormously include Ivan Szelenyi, Jim DeNardo, Stathis Kalyvas, Raúl Madrid, Gabor Tóka, Steven Saideman, Leslie Schwindt-Bayer, Frances Rosenbluth, Jim Gardner, John Zaller, and anonymous reviewers. Colleagues who shared their country knowledge include Steven Roper, Steven Bloom, Jeeyang Baum, Allen Hicken, David Carol, Steven Wilkinson, and Cecilia Martínez-Gallardo. I am grateful to Dan Posner for reading parts of the manuscript, sharing his knowledge about ethnic politics, and providing good advice on writing. I thank Margaret Levy and Kanchan Chandra for encouragement along the way and Jill Lally and Susan Thornton for editing the manuscript. I also thank Lewis Bateman and Janis Bolster at Cambridge for skillful direction during the publishing process. Needless to say, I alone am responsible for any remaining flaws. Special thanks go to Sif, my siblings, and my parents for enduring multiple reports of the process with unwavering enthusiasm.

Last but not least I want to thank the most important people in my life, to whom this book is dedicated: my husband and greatest supporter, Dave, who has read and improved upon more versions of this manuscript than anyone should have to, and my sons, Óðinn and Sigþór, whom I thank for keeping me focused on the truly important things in life, them.