

Face Masks Reduce the Release of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Cough Aerosols when Worn for Clinically-Relevant Time Periods

CF Cough Aerosol Group (2018). Face Masks Reduce the Release of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Cough Aerosols when Worn for Clinically-Relevant Time Periods. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine*, *198*(10), 1339-1342. https://doi.org/10.1164/rccm.201805-0823LE

Published in:

American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal

Publisher rights

© 2018 by the American Thoracic Society. This work is made available online in accordance with the publisher's policies. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

1	Face masks reduce the release of <i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i> cough aerosols when worn for
2	clinically-relevant time periods
3	
4	Rebecca E Stockwell ^{1,2} , Michelle E Wood ^{1,2,3} , Congrong He ⁴ , Laura J Sherrard ⁵ , Emma L
5	Ballard ⁶ , Timothy J Kidd ^{1,7} , Graham R Johnson ⁴ , Luke D Knibbs ⁸ , Lidia Morawska ⁴ , Scott C
6	Bell ^{*1,2,3} ; CF Cough Aerosol Group.
7	
8	CF cough aerosol group members:
9	Maureen Peasey, Christine Duplancic, Kay A Ramsay, Nassib Jabbour, Peter O'Rourke,
10	Claire E Wainwright, Peter D Sly
11	
12	¹ Lung Bacteria Group, QIMR Berghofer Medical Research Institute, 300 Herston Road,
13	Herston QLD 4006, Australia
14	² Faculty of Medicine, The University of Queensland, Herston QLD 4006, Australia
15	³ Adult Cystic Fibrosis Centre, The Prince Charles Hospital, 627 Rode Road, Chermside, QLD
16	4032, Australia
17	⁴ International Laboratory for Air Quality and Health, Queensland University of Technology,
18	Brisbane QLD 4000, Australia
19	⁵ Queen's University Belfast, 97 Lisburn Road, Belfast BT9 7BL, United Kingdom
20	⁶ Statistical Support Group, QIMR Berghofer Medical Research Institute, 300 Herston Road,
21	Herston QLD 4006, Australia
22	⁷ School of Chemistry and Molecular Biosciences, The University of Queensland, St Lucia
23	QLD 4067, Australia
24	⁸ School of Public Health, The University of Queensland, Herston QLD 4006, Australia

		• •
26	Him	01.
20	Ema	an.

- 27 rebecca.stockwell@qimrberghofer.edu.au
- 28 michelle.wood2@health.qld.gov.au
- 29 c.he@qut.edu.au
- 30 l.sherrard@qub.ac.uk
- 31 emma.ballard@qimrberghofer.edu.au
- 32 t.m.kidd@uq.edu.au
- 33 g.johnson@qut.edu.au
- 34 l.knibbs@uq.edu.au
- 35 l.morawska@qut.edu.au
- 36 scott.bell@qimrberghofer.edu.au
- 37

38 *Corresponding author. Lung Bacteria Group, QIMR Berghofer Medical Research Institute,

39 300 Herston Road, Herston, Brisbane QLD 4006, Australia.

40 Tel: +61 7 3139 4770; Email: scott.bell@qimrberghofer.edu.au

41

Author contributions: G.R.J., L.D.K., T.J.K., R.E.S., L.J.S., L.M. and S.C.B. conceived and 42 designed the experiment. S.C.B., T.J.K. and L.M. led the funding applications with other 43 members of the CF cough aerosol group (C.E.W and P.D.S.). M.E.W. and S.C.B. recruited 44 the study participants. R.E.S. and C.H. conducted the cough studies. G.R.J. acquired the 45 aerosol data. R.E.S. performed microbiological analysis. E.L.B. led the data analysis. R.E.S. 46 and S.C.B. provide overall responsibility for the data and wrote the manuscript, with input 47 from all co-authors. M.P., C.D., K.A.R., N.J., P.O., C.E.W and P.D.S. provided support to the 48 study including analysis and/or microbiology expertise and/or clinical supervision. 49 50

Funding support: The project was funded by Cystic Fibrosis Foundation Therapeutics USA
(BELL14AO). T.J.K. acknowledges National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC)
Early Career (GNT10884488) and ERS-EU RESPIRE2 Marie Sklodowska-Curie Postdoctoral
Research (#4571-2013) Fellowship support. L.D.K. acknowledges an NHMRC Early Career
Fellowship (APP1036620). R.E.S acknowledges The Prince Charles Hospital Foundation and
Advance Queensland PhD Scholarships.

57

58 List ONE descriptor number that best classifies the subject of your manuscript: 9.17

- 59 Cystic Fibrosis: Translational & Clinical Studies
- **Total word count for the body of the manuscript** = 1328

61

62 Abstract

Introduction: The cystic fibrosis (CF) infection control guidelines recommend that people with 63 CF wear face-masks when in communal areas of hospitals. Recently, we reported short-term 64 wear of face-masks (~10-minutes) reduced the release of Pseudomonas aeruginosa aerosols 65 during coughing. However, there is limited evidence to determine if face-masks continue to be 66 effective at reducing the release of infectious cough aerosols after longer wear times. Methods: 67 We recruited 25 people with CF and chronic P. aeruginosa infection and 10 healthy volunteers. 68 All participants underwent up to 5 cough tests in a validated cough rig: 1) uncovered cough; 2) 69 coughing with surgical mask worn for 10-minutes; 3) coughing with surgical mask worn for 70 71 20-minutes; 4) coughing with a surgical mask worn for 40-minutes; 5) coughing with an N95 respirator worn for 20-minutes (optional). The wear time of the mask included a 5-minute cough 72 period in the aerosol collection rig. Sputum samples and cough aerosols were collected from 73 74 participants with CF as previously described. All participants rated their level of comfort posttest. Results: Surgical masks and N95 respirators were effective at reducing the release of P. 75 aeruginosa aerosols during coughing after 40-minutes total wear and 20-minutes total wear 76 respectively. Both participants with CF and healthy volunteers rated the surgical masks as more 77 comfortable compared to N95 respirators. Conclusions: Surgical masks were the preferred 78 interface to wear as source control and were effective at reducing the release of *P. aeruginosa* 79 aerosols during coughing after 40-minutes of total wear. 80

81 Introduction

Aerosol dissemination of respiratory pathogens may contribute to person-to-person transmission in people with cystic fibrosis (CF) [1]. This evolving knowledge of transmission modes has led to an update of the CF Foundation Infection and Prevention Control Guidelines recommending people with CF wear surgical masks in communal hospital areas to prevent the spread of CF respiratory pathogens [2]. These guidelines recommended the use of surgical masks as source control despite limited evidence for this application.

88

We recently demonstrated that short-term wear of face-masks (10-minutes total wear) significantly reduces the release of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* aerosols during coughing in people with CF [3]. These findings are consistent with an earlier study of people with CF that reached the same conclusion after very short-term wear of surgical masks (worn for 21 coughs) [4]. These results and a recent editorial to our short-term mask wear study [5] support our current aim to investigate the effectiveness, tolerability and functionality of face-masks as source control after extended wear.

96

97 Methods

We recruited 25 people with CF and chronic P. aeruginosa infection [6] from the Adult Cystic 98 Fibrosis Centre, The Prince Charles Hospital, Brisbane, Australia. Ten healthy volunteers were 99 recruited from hospital and research staff to assess mask comfort and mask weight change. All 100 participants performed up to five randomly ordered tests in a validated cough system [7]: 1) 101 uncovered cough; 2) coughing with surgical mask worn for 10-minutes); 3) coughing with 102 surgical mask worn for 20-minutes; 4) coughing with surgical mask worn for 40-minutes; 5) 103 coughing with N95 mask worn for 20-minutes [3, 7]. The N95 test was an optional test based 104 on the poor comfort ratings observed in our earlier mask study [3]. 105

107 The duration of the mask wear tests were selected based on observation of patients moving around communal areas of the hospital described here. Two types of masks were tested: 108 "surgical mask" [Catalogue # 47107; Halyard FLUIDSHIELD Level 3 Fog-Free Procedure 109 Mask ($\Delta P \le 2.5$), Georgia, USA] and "N95 mask" [Catalogue # 46827 (small) or 46727 110 (regular), Halvard FLUIDSHIELD N95 Particulate Filter Respirator and Surgical Mask, 111 112 Georgia, USA]. New masks were used for each test. The total wear time of the masks included 1-minute positioning of the participant into the rig, 2-minutes of tidal breathing with HEPA-113 filtered air, a 5-minute cough period, followed by another 2-minutes of tidal breathing. Cough 114 115 aerosol collection, sputum processing and P. aeruginosa genotyping were performed as previously described [1, 3, 8]. All participants rated their comfort levels after each test [3, 9]. 116 All masks were weighed before and following each test. 117

118

SPSS version 25 was used for statistical analysis. Participants with CF were stratified by the 119 amount of aerosol colony forming units (CFU) produced during the uncovered cough test: high 120 producer (total CFU was ≥ 10) or no/low producer (total CFU was < 10) [3]. Categorical 121 variables were examined using Pearson Chi-squared test or Fisher's Exact test. Continuous 122 variables were examined using a Student t-test or Mann-Whitney U test. CFU were log 123 transformed and the paired t-test examined changes over time. The McNemar-Bowker test was 124 used to examine comfort scores over time. The Wilcoxon Signed Rank Test was used to 125 examine the change in mask weight over time. 126

127

128 Results

P. aeruginosa was cultured from the sputum of 25/25 participants with CF and was cultured in
cough aerosols during the uncovered cough test of 20/25 participants (Table 1). *P. aeruginosa*

was cultured from cough aerosols of 9/20 participants during any of the surgical mask tests (10minutes, 20-minutes and 40-minutes total wear time) and 4/20 participants during the N95 mask
test of 20-minutes total wear. The CFU were significantly reduced for the surgical mask tests
compared with the uncovered cough test (p<0.001). Between mask tests, the CFU count
remained similar as the duration of surgical mask wear increased as well as between mask types
(Table 1). The *P. aeruginosa* strain types found in the cough aerosols were genetically
indistinguishable from the paired sputum sample of each participant.

138

Participants with CF rated surgical masks less comfortable than healthy volunteers for all test
durations (surgical mask: 10-minutes, p=0.001; 20-minutes, p=0.007; 40-minutes, p=0.023;
N95: 20-minutes, p=0.018) (Table 2). Participants with CF were more tolerant of surgical mask
wear (good comfort) after 10- and 20-minutes total wear time if they had higher lung function,
yet this difference was lost after 40-minutes of surgical mask wear. N95 masks were rated less
comfortable in both participants with CF and healthy volunteers (Table 2).

145

The change in mask weight for each test ranged from no weight change to a maximum weight change of 0.02g and was comparable between participants with CF and healthy volunteers (Table 2). There was a minor increase in surgical mask weight (median change, 0.01g) after 40minutes compared with 10-minutes wear (p=0.031) (Table 2). No statistical differences in mask weight change were seen in other time or mask type comparisons (Table 2).

151

152 **Discussion**

Our study demonstrates that face masks worn for clinically-relevant time periods are effective at reducing the release of potentially infectious aerosols during coughing in people with CF. These results extend upon our earlier observations that demonstrated surgical masks and N95 masks were both effective at reducing the release of infectious cough aerosols when the mask wear was of shorter duration [3]. The outcomes of our studies demonstrate that surgical masks are effective and tolerable as source control [3] and support the CF Foundation (USA) recommendations for surgical mask wear to reduce the risk of CF pathogen transmission in the hospital setting [2].

Surgical masks were the preferred mask type for source control in terms of comfort, which is similar to our short-term wear mask study findings [3]. Healthy volunteers tolerated the surgical masks better than those with CF and participants with CF who had higher lung function tolerated surgical masks better. When the comfort of surgical masks was assessed after extended wear in this cohort, a major finding was that the comfort ratings remained unchanged regardless of wear time for both people with and without CF. Therefore, surgical masks are not only effective but are also well tolerated by participants after 40-minutes total wear.

169

An accompanying editorial of our recent mask study [3] questioned if mask dampness may 170 affect the ability of the mask to function as source control after prolonged wear times [5]. The 171 CF infection control guidelines indicate that masks being used as source control should be 172 173 replaced when damp [2] and excessive moisture accumulation was a common reason for surgical mask replacement in people with tuberculosis using surgical masks as source control 174 [10]. Our data indicates that although there was evidence of surgical mask moisture 175 accumulation after 40-minutes total wear (estimated by increased weight), the surgical mask 176 continued to function effectively as source control mitigating this concern. 177

178

There are several limitations to this study: 1) The infectious dose of *P. aeruginosa* is unknownand therefore the infection risk cannot be determined; 2) Participants remained in view of staff

¹⁶¹

while wearing the masks and this may have modified the extent to which participants interfered 181 182 with the mask leading to an incorrect estimation on the masks protective effects; 3) Participants were seated during the cough testing and this may have impacted on the participant's ability to 183 cough freely; 4) While some participants experienced episodes of spontaneous cough during 184 testing, we were unable to differentiate between spontaneous and voluntary cough. Therefore, 185 the protective effects of the masks may be overestimated; 5) The effectiveness and tolerability 186 of masks is reported in adults only and these characteristics need to be studied in children; 6) 187 Our study had a maximum wear time of 40-minutes and the effectiveness of masks worn for 188 longer periods is unknown; 7) We did not assess inward protection provided by masks but this 189 190 has been highlighted as an understudied field of research [11].

191

Our study confirms the effectiveness of surgical masks at reducing the release of *P. aeruginosa*cough aerosols in people with CF and provides evidence of patient tolerability and functionality
of these masks as source control after 40-minutes of total wear.

195

Acknowledgements: We thank Dr Farhad Salimi for his aerosol support to the study. We thank
Greg Flohr and staff from the Central Pathology Laboratory (Royal Brisbane and Women's
Hospital), Pathology Queensland for microbiological support to the study. We thank the Adult
CF Centre team in supporting recruitment to the studies. We also thank all the participants in
the study for supporting the work.

201

	Group			Production level in CF participants			
	Healthy	CF	p-value	No/low (<10 CFU)	High (≥ 10 CFU)	p-value	
	(n = 10)	(n = 25)		(n = 14)	(n = 11)		
Participant characteristics							
Age, years, mean (SD)	37.3 (12.3)	33.3 (9.0)	0.29	36.7 (9.3)	28.9 (6.9)	0.029	
Sex, male, n (%)	6 (60.0)	15 (60.0)	1.00	9 (64.3)	6 (54.5)	0.70	
Body mass index (BMI), kg/m ² , mean (SD)	24.6 (3.5)	22.8 (3.2)	0.14	22.5 (3.7)	23.1 (2.6)	0.63	
FEV ₁ % predicted, mean (SD)	92.6 (9.2)	53.8 (20.8)	< 0.001	54.2 (23.2)	53.3 (18.2)	0.91	
Mean <i>P. aeruginosa</i> sputum concentration, x 10 ⁷ CFU/mL (95% CI) ^a	n/a	5.2 (2.1 – 12.9)	-	1.9 (0.7 – 5.7)	18.3 (4.7 – 70.9)	0.008	
Participants with P. aeruginosa detected in cough aerosols							
Uncovered cough test							
n (%)	n/a	20 (80.0)	-	9 (64.3)	11 (100.0)		
Mean CFU (95% CI) ^a		17 (7 - 43)		2 (1-4)	75 (34 – 165)	$< 0.001^{d}$	
Surgical mask tests							
10-minutes total wear							
n (%)	n/a	9 (36.0)	-	1 (7.1)	8 (72.7)		
Mean CFU (95% CI) ^a		4 (1 – 10)		1	5 (1 – 13)		
20-minutes total wear							
n (%)	n/a	9 (36.0)	-	1 (7.1)	8 (72.7)		
Mean CFU (95% CI) ^a		4 (1 – 10)		1	4 (1 – 11)	0.99 ^e	
40-minutes total wear							
n (%)	n/a	9 (36.0)	-	1 (7.1)	8 (72.7)		
Mean CFU (95% CI) ^a		3 (1 – 7)		1	4 (1 – 9)	$0.56^{\rm f}, 0.64^{\rm g}$	
N95 mask test~							
20-minutes total wear (n=23)	,						
n (%)	n/a	4 (17.4)	-	$0 (0.0)^{b}$	4 (40.0)°	ŀ	
Mean CFU (95% CI) ^a		2(0-6)		n/a	2(0-6)	0.19 ^h	

Table 1: Demographic and clinical characteristics of the study participants

- 203 *Definitions:* FEV₁, forced expiratory volume in 1 second; CFU, colony forming unit; CFU/mL, CFU per millilitre of sputum; SD, standard deviation; 204 CI, confidence interval, n/a, not applicable \sim Optional test
- 205
- 206 ^ageometric mean
- 207 ^bparticipant number (n) = 13
- 208 ^cparticipant number (n) = 10
- ^dUncovered cough (geometric mean CFU) compared to each surgical mask test (geometric mean CFU)
- ^eSurgical masks (geometric mean CFU): 10-minutes versus 20-minutes total wear
- ^fSurgical masks (geometric mean CFU): 10-minutes *versus* 40-minutes total wear
- ^gSurgical masks (geometric mean CFU): 20-minutes *versus* 40-minutes total wear
- ^hMean CFU surgical mask 20-minutes total wear *versus* mean CFU N95 mask 20-minutes total wear

214 Table 2: Summary of mask properties

	Mask comfort			Mask weight change		
Mask properties	Healthy n (%)	CF n (%)	p-value	All participants Median (IQR)	p-value n/a	
Uncovered cough comfort level		\$ £	1.00	n/a		
Poor	0 (0.0 %)	0 (0.0 %)				
Sufficient	1 (10.0 %)	2 (8.0 %)				
Good	9 (90.0 %)	23 (92.0 %)				
Coughing wearing a surgical mask – 10-minutes total wear			0.001	0.01g(0.00g-0.02g)	n/a	
Poor	1 (10.0 %)	0 (0.0 %)				
Sufficient	0 (0.0 %)	15 (60.0 %)				
Good	9 (90.0 %)	10 (40.0 %)				
Coughing wearing a surgical mask – 20-minutes total wear			0.007	0.01g(0.00g-0.02g)	0.73 ^a	
Poor	1 (10.0 %)	1 (4.0 %)				
Sufficient	0 (0.0 %)	13 (52.0 %)				
Good	9 (90.0 %)	11 (44.0 %)				
Coughing wearing a surgical mask – 40-minutes total wear			0.023	0.02g(0.01g-0.03g)	$0.25^{\rm b}, 0.03^{\circ}$	
Poor	1 (10.0 %)	2 (8.0 %)				
Sufficient	1 (10.0 %)	15 (60.0 %)				
Good	8 (80.0 %)	8 (32.0 %)				
Coughing wearing N95 mask -20-minutes total wear			0.018	0.02g(0.00g-0.04g)	0.21 ^d	
Poor	0 (0.0 %)	11 (47.8 %)				
Sufficient	7 (77.8 %)	8 (34.8 %)				
Good	2 (22.2 %)	4 (17.4 %)				

215

216 ^aSurgical mask weight change: 10-minutes *versus* 20-minutes total wear

^bSurgical mask weight change: 20-minutes *versus* 40-minutes total wear

218 ^cSurgical mask weight change: 10-minutes *versus* 40-minutes total wear

^dMask weight change after 20-minutes wear: surgical mask *versus* N95 mask

220 **References:**

221	1.	Knibbs, L.D., Johnson, G.R., Kidd, T.J., Cheney, J., Grimwood, K., Kattenbelt, J.A.,
222		O'Rourke, P.K., Ramsay, K.A., Sly, P.D., Wainwright, C.E., Wood, M.E., Morawska,
223		L., and Bell, S.C. Viability of Pseudomonas aeruginosa in cough aerosols generated by
224		persons with cystic fibrosis. Thorax. 2014;69(8):740-5
225	2.	Saiman, L., Siegel, J.D., LiPuma, J.J., Brown, R.F., Bryson, E.A., Chambers, M.J.,
226		Downer, V.S., Fliege, J., Hazle, L.A., Jain, M., Marshall, B.C., O'Malley, C., Pattee,
227		S.R., Potter-Bynoe, G., Reid, S., Robinson, K.A., Sabadosa, K.A., Schmidt, H.J., Tullis,
228		E., Webber, J., and Weber, D.J. Infection prevention and control guideline for cystic
229		fibrosis: 2013 update. Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol. 2014;35 Suppl 1:S1-s67
230	3.	Wood, M.E., Stockwell, R.E., Johnson, G.R., Ramsay, K.A., Sherrard, L.J., Jabbour, N.,
231		Ballard, E., O'Rourke, P., Kidd, T.J., Wainwright, C.E., Knibbs, L.D., Sly, P.D.,
232		Morawska, L., and Bell, S.C. Face Masks and Cough Etiquette Reduce the Cough
233		Aerosol Concentration of Pseudomonas aeruginosa in People with Cystic Fibrosis. Am
234		J Respir Crit Care Med. 2018;197(3):348-355
235	4.	Driessche, K.V., Hens, N., Tilley, P., Quon, B.S., Chilvers, M.A., de Groot, R., Cotton,
236		M.F., Marais, B.J., Speert, D.P., and Zlosnik, J.E. Surgical masks reduce airborne
237		spread of Pseudomonas aeruginosa in colonized patients with cystic fibrosis. Am J
238		Respir Crit Care Med. 2015;192(7):897-9
239	5.	Simmonds, N.J. and Bush, A. The Man in the Paper Mask: One (Mask) for All and All
240		for Cystic Fibrosis? Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2018;197(3):281-283
241	6.	Ramsay, K.A., Sandhu, H., Geake, J.B., Ballard, E., O'Rourke, P., Wainwright, C.E.,
242		Reid, D.W., Kidd, T.J., and Bell, S.C. The changing prevalence of pulmonary infection
243		in adults with cystic fibrosis: A longitudinal analysis. J Cyst Fibros. 2017;16(1):70-77

244	7.	Johnson, G.R., Knibbs, L.D., Kidd, T.J., Wainwright, C.E., Wood, M.E., Ramsay, K.A.,
245		Bell, S.C., and Morawska, L. A Novel Method and Its Application to Measuring
246		Pathogen Decay in Bioaerosols from Patients with Respiratory Disease. PLoS One.
247		2016;11(7):e0158763
248	8.	Syrmis, M.W., Kidd, T.J., Moser, R.J., Ramsay, K.A., Gibson, K.M., Anuj, S., Bell,
249		S.C., Wainwright, C.E., Grimwood, K., Nissen, M., Sloots, T.P., and Whiley, D.M. A
250		comparison of two informative SNP-based strategies for typing Pseudomonas
251		aeruginosa isolates from patients with cystic fibrosis. BMC Infect Dis. 2014;14:307
252	9.	Gregoretti, C., Confalonieri, M., Navalesi, P., Squadrone, V., Frigerio, P., Beltrame, F.,
253		Carbone, G., Conti, G., Gamna, F., Nava, S., Calderini, E., Skrobik, Y., and Antonelli,
254		M. Evaluation of patient skin breakdown and comfort with a new face mask for non-
255		invasive ventilation: a multi-center study. Intensive Care Med. 2002;28(3):278-84
256	10.	Dharmadhikari, A.S., Mphahlele, M., Stoltz, A., Venter, K., Mathebula, R., Masotla, T.,
257		Lubbe, W., Pagano, M., First, M., Jensen, P.A., van der Walt, M., and Nardell, E.A.
258		Surgical face masks worn by patients with multidrug-resistant tuberculosis: impact on
259		infectivity of air on a hospital ward. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2012;185(10):1104-9
260	11.	MacIntyre, C.R., and Chughtai, A.A. Facemasks for the prevention of infection in
261		healthcare and community settings. BMJ. 2015;350:h694