

Foodways and Foodwashing: Israeli Cookbooks and the Politics of Culinary Zionism

ILAN ZVI BARON 
Durham University, UK

AND

GALIA PRESS-BARNATHAN
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel

The paper explores the political narratives produced in English-language Israeli cookbooks. We examine an understudied, yet central component of everyday international relations, everyday nationalism, and identity contestations as practiced through gastronomy, and highlight the dilemma between the different political uses of popular culture in the context of conflict resolution and resistance. Our argument identifies different narratives represented in what we term Culinary Zionism. One narrative is explicitly political, discusses Israeli cuisine as a foodway, and contributes to creating a space of, and a path for, coexistence and recognition of the Other. A second narrative is found in tourist-orientated cookbooks that offer a supposedly apolitical story of culinary tours in Israel. We problematize the political and normative implications of these narratives by exploring the potential role of these books to open space for dialogue and to increase the familiarity and interest of foreign audiences of Israel and the conflict. We contrast this possibility with their potential to what we term foodwashing, namely the process of using food to symbolically wash over violence and injustices (the violence of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict in this case).

Cet article explore les récits politiques apparaissant dans des livres de cuisine israéliens anglophones. Nous avons examiné une composante centrale mais insuffisamment étudiée des relations internationales quotidiennes, du nationalisme quotidien et des contestations d'identité telles qu'elles sont pratiquées par le biais de la gastronomie, et nous avons ainsi mis en évidence le dilemme entre les différentes utilisations politiques de la culture populaire dans le contexte de la résolution des conflits et de la résistance. Notre argument fait référence à différents récits présents dans ce que nous qualifions de Sionisme culinaire. L'un des récits est explicitement politique et aborde la cuisine israélienne en tant que « foodway » (les « foodways » sont les pratiques culturelles, sociales et économiques en lien avec la production et la consommation de nourriture). Il contribue à la création d'un chemin et d'un espace pour la coexistence et la reconnaissance de l'Autre. Un autre récit prétendument apolitique invitant à des excursions culinaires en Israël apparaît dans des livres de cuisine à destination des touristes. Nous problématisons les implications politiques et normatives de ces récits en explorant le rôle potentiel de ces livres dans l'ouverture d'un espace de dialogue et dans la familiarisation

et l'accroissement de l'intérêt du public pour Israël et le conflit. Nous opposons cette possibilité à un autre potentiel de ces récits, celui que nous qualifions de « foodwashing », le processus consistant à utiliser de la nourriture pour laver symboliquement la violence et les injustices (la violence du conflit israélo-palestinien dans notre cas).

El artículo explora las narrativas políticas que se producen en los libros de cocina israelí en lengua inglesa. Analizamos un componente poco estudiado pero central de las relaciones internacionales cotidianas, el nacionalismo cotidiano y las disputas identitarias que se practican a través de la gastronomía, y destacamos el dilema entre los diferentes usos políticos de la cultura popular en el contexto de la resolución de conflictos y la resistencia. Nuestro argumento identifica diferentes narrativas representadas en lo que denominamos “sionismo culinario.” Una narrativa es explícitamente política: examina la cocina israelí como tradición alimentaria y contribuye a la creación de un espacio y un camino para la coexistencia y el reconocimiento del Otro. Una segunda narrativa se encuentra en los libros de cocina orientados al turismo, que ofrecen una historia supuestamente apolítica de las excursiones culinarias en Israel. Problematicamos las implicaciones políticas y normativas de estas narrativas mediante la exploración del papel potencial de estos libros para abrir un espacio de diálogo y aumentar la familiaridad y el interés del público extranjero por Israel y el conflicto. Contrastamos esta posibilidad con su potencial para lo que denominamos “lavado alimentario” (foodwashing); es decir, el proceso de utilizar la comida para “lavar” simbólicamente la violencia y las injusticias (en este caso, la violencia del conflicto israelí-palestino).

Cookbooks that offer the idea of a national cuisine function as part of a political project that seeks the recognition and constitution of a particular nationalist political claim. However, most discussions about food and identity focus on the domestic or local level, where a national identity is being created, contested, and maintained through food politics and culture. An intriguing phenomenon for international relations scholars is how the politics of food and identity play out internationally, across multiple sites of belonging and identification that cross strictly statist boundaries. This political process is especially visible in English-language Israeli cookbooks. Israeli cuisine has become something of an international commodity. Beyond the existence of many Israeli restaurants in New York or London, the proliferation of English-language Israeli cookbooks provides the best evidence for this trend. By our account, and excluding more general Jewish cookbooks and Palestinian cookbooks (more on them later), twenty-one English-language Israeli cookbooks were published between the years 2000 and 2016, with thirteen of those published after 2014, and only four published in earlier years.¹

Cookbooks are an interesting and understudied type of popular culture commodity. Unlike cookbooks written in the local language for the local population, self-proclaimed (non-Anglophone) national cookbooks written in English aim at an international audience and thus become a popular culture product that circulates internationally. Popular culture products offer unique mobilizing characteristics (Press-Barnathan 2017, 167) because they are easily accessible and readily consumable and carry with them powerful emotional and aesthetic content. All these elements exist in cookbooks.

¹The search for Israeli cookbooks used the British Library's catalogue, Amazon.com, Amazon.co.uk, Abebooks.com, and Blackwell's online bookshop using a keyword search for Israeli food, Israeli cuisine, and Israeli cooking (September 21, 2016), as well as handsearching in a specialty cookbook shop (Kitchen Arts & Letters Inc) in Manhattan, New York City in 2019. We identified Israeli cookbooks according to geographical references made in the book and which explicitly refer to Israel.

The study of popular culture in world politics has surged (Dittmer and Dodds 2008; Muller 2008; Grayson, Davies, and Philpott 2009; Dittmer 2010; Sucharov 2013; Caso and Hamilton 2015; Dodds 2015; Payne 2016; Shapiro 2016; Furman and Musgrave 2017; Kirby 2017; Crilly 2020), complementing the aesthetic turn in international political theory (Bleiker 2001). However, while scholars of politics and international relations have considered fiction (Edkins 2013), visual culture (Hughes 2007; Eroukhmanoff 2019), television programs (Wedes 1999; Neumann 2001; Shepherd 2013; Deylami and Havercroft 2016; Clapton and Shepherd 2017; Press-Barnathan 2019), video games (Robinson 2012; Auchter 2016; Eken 2016), cartoons (Reinke de Buitrago 2019), alcoholic beverages (Jackson 2015; Saunders and Holland 2018), film (Dodds 2005; Shapiro 2008; Löffmann 2013; Larson 2015; Eken 2019;), and music (Davies and Franklin 2015; Franklin 2016; Baker 2017; Press-Barnathan and Lutz 2020), they have neither focused on food nor considered cookbooks more specifically. One exception is Ferguson (2020), who highlights the different ways that cookbooks have political characteristics.

Ferguson's thesis is that cookbooks are political because they build on and reaffirm spatial, identity and economic claims. His argument expands on Arjun Appadurai's (1988) famous article about Indian cookbooks, which highlights how the production of a national cuisine is a political project. Similar to Ferguson, and Appadurai before him, we claim that cookbooks are sites where international conflicts play out in our kitchens and dining rooms or, at least, on the shelf of unopened cookery books, and that English-language Israeli cookbooks provide an illustrative case.

English-language Israeli cookbooks provide an opening into the different representations of Israel in the context of ongoing conflicts with the Palestinians and its Arab neighbours, as well as in the context of the diversity of the Israeli population. Such cookbooks do so not only through their content (recipes), but especially through their narratives. An examination of the political narratives and their implications in these cookbooks will contribute to the growing body of literature that explores the politics in, and of, popular culture products. In addition, linking this discussion to the literature on gastro-diplomacy offers insights into three important aspects of popular culture in world politics: it opens an exploration of an understudied, yet central, component of everyday international relations, everyday nationalism, and identifies contestations as practiced through gastronomy; it raises issues related to the more formal use of popular culture as a diplomatic tool; and it raises an increasingly relevant dilemma between the different political uses of popular culture in the context of conflict resolution and resistance.

In this paper, we first provide an overview of the politics of food. Here we point to the political roles of food in the context of national identity making, including the contexts of gastro-diplomacy or culinary diplomacy. Second, we frame the development of Israeli cuisine as Culinary Zionism. Culinary Zionism represents the production of Israeli cuisine as a good for export and is illustrative of the success of Cultural Zionism. Culinary Zionism is characterized by narratives that collectively represent the success of the Zionist project and represent the normalization of the ongoing conflict in Israel/Palestine. We also explain what is meant by the not-so-obvious concept of "Israeli cookbooks."

Third, we explore the narratives found in Israeli cookbooks published in English. We identify two. The first is explicitly political and frames Israeli cuisine as a *foodway* that contributes to creating a space of, and a path for, coexistence and recognition of the Other, and may serve as a form of food diplomacy. The second is found in more touristy cookbooks, which offer a supposedly apolitical story of culinary tours in Israel.

Fourth, we problematize the political and normative implications of these two narratives. On the one hand, by reflecting and engaging the rich foodways of Israel (including their local, multiethnic, Jewish, Palestinian, Druze traditions), these

books open space for dialogue, increase the familiarity and interest of foreign audiences with regard to different groups within Israel—Jewish, Palestinian, and others—and can, therefore, generate greater moral and political responsiveness. However, on the other hand, these same texts also generate a process that we describe as *foodwashing*. Foodwashing refers to the process of using food to symbolically wash over violence and injustices (the violence of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict in this case). The focus on food, or cuisine, and culinary engagement serves as a cover that either enables the appearance of a progressive narrative or offers a means to disguise or dismiss the violence of the region and normalize the conflict.

Foodwashing need not be an intended goal. This tension between increasing familiarity and generating spaces for dialogue through these popular cookbooks, and the often unintended (and at times intended) consequences of foodwashing, generates a dilemma—practical and normative—as we try to make sense of these cookbooks as social and political texts. This dilemma exists not only with regard to the unique niche of cookbooks (Baron 2016), but also in other spheres of cultural engagement, where the political power of engagement versus disengagement as a political tool is debated (Adorno 1991). As such, our analysis can be applied to debates about the politics of other popular culture products in the context of different types of conflict.

The Politics of National Cuisine, Gastro-nationalism, Gastro-diplomacy, and Cookbooks

There is a close relationship between the idea of a national cuisine and that of the nation or, to be more precise, that of the nation-state (Appadurai 1988). Food carries important meanings, including cultural and political ones (Bourdieu 1984; Tuchman and Levine 1993; Bell and Valentine 1997; Gvion 2012; Baron 2016; Ferguson 2020). The idea of a national cuisine is a political product or project, contributing to creating a cultural heritage and a sense of belonging within a certain community (Brulotte and Di Giovine 2016) that can also be used as a cultural commodity for tourists (Long 2010). The politics of food is related to issues of national-identity formation, national-identity management, and gastro-diplomacy at multiple levels (Ichiro and Ranta 2016; Ichiko, Johannes, and Ranta 2019).

Food is directly linked to the notion of banal nationalism, where nationalism is flagged daily in a manner easily missed (Billig 1995). Food is especially relevant to the growing work on everyday nationalism that stresses the everyday practices and experiences of nationhood and that considers human agency and different vernacular understandings of individuals and groups in society (e.g., Fox and Miller-Idriss 2008; Skey 2009; Knott 2015). Such nationalism can find expression in the daily lived practices of people (cooking meals at home) and also in public performance (e.g., when we talk of “cuisine,” and in public banquets) (Wilk 2002, 70). At the most formal and symbolic level, this reading is illustrated via culinary diplomacy and how state dinners serve to highlight particular locales, ingredients, and dishes that speak to the idea of the nation but can also serve a diplomatic function in acknowledging the cultural products of the guest nation.

Culinary diplomacy refers to the use of food for diplomatic purposes to gratify or convey subtle messages to officials of other countries, as is indeed reflected in official state dinners. For example, at the White House State Dinner (White House 2016) in honour of Canadian Prime Minister Justin Trudeau, the six-page menu offered a story that sought to emphasize the cultural richness of both countries and used regional ingredients to signify the diplomatic ties between the United States and Canada. The menus of any state dinner not only provide an important moment in which to demonstrate a nationalist narrative, but they also reflect identity sensitivities and unresolved issues both within the national narrative and in the narrative

of the interstate relations. One example of such complexities appeared during President Trump's visit to South Korea and Japan in 2017. In South Korea, the menu entailed grilled Korean beef with 360-year old (!) soy sauce, emphasizing ancient Korean tradition (and national pride), and also inserted a jibe against Japan with a portion of shrimp caught off the contested islets with Japan in the Sea of Japan. For President Trump's visit to Japan, the Japanese hosts' emphasis was to show modern Japan and its intimate relations with the United States, so the lunch menu included burger and fries (Chandran 2017).

In this spirit, Michaela DeSoucey coined the concept of *gastronationalism*. Gastronationalism explores the political construction of foods as institutionalized vehicles of national cultural identities and focuses on the use of food production, distribution, and consumption to demarcate and sustain the emotive power of national attachment (DeSoucey 2010, 433; see also Ichiro 2020). Gastro-diplomacy is a type of public diplomacy that refers to concerted and sustained campaigns of public relations and investment by governments and states, often in collaboration with non-state actors, to increase the value and standing of their national brand through food (Chapple-Sokol 2013; Rockower 2014; Suntikul 2019).

The underlying logic behind gastro-diplomacy is its ability to promote a process of familiarization, which would bring foreign audiences to a newfound respect for one's cuisine. Gastro-diplomacy builds on the assumptions of contact theory, whereby greater contact and exposure leads to more positive associations (see Suntikul 2019, 4–6). However, practices of gastro-diplomacy are not immune to competition or conflict. One expression of how national cuisines may compete can be found in various prestigious international culinary competitions, where individual chefs' reputations and careers merge with the pride associated with a certain national cuisine (Ferguson 2010). Another is the ongoing debates taking place in UNESCO about recognition of various dishes/culinary traditions as the intangible cultural heritage of a specific state or region, which should be safeguarded (e.g., Broude 2015). Such conflicts speak to a third expression of the contentious nature of food politics that is explored in this article and that pertains to the narratives attached to cuisine and allegedly national dishes. Such narratives reflect political contestations about identity, including the power relations in shaping the narratives locating the national cuisine. This is where we turn to the cookbooks.

Cookbooks serve as culinary consciousness raisers, tying food to place, and they do so whether or not we put the recipe in the oven and on the table. As such they can play a central role in culinary nationalism (Ferguson 2010, 102). Cookbooks are particularly interesting because they offer more than recipes or a meal/culinary experience. Cookbooks tell a story and are a material entry point into the international politics of the everyday. If cookbooks play an important role domestically, English-language Israeli cookbooks offer a window to these domestic complexities and power relations for an international audience. These books provide a cultural commodity by which local food cultures are exported and thus offer a different hermeneutic than those written primarily for domestic consumption. Cookbooks that represent a national cuisine act as representatives of a nation, albeit in an informal way, and as cultural commodities serve as focal points for broader discussions and contestations about the nature of their representations.

Our focus on national cookbooks in a foreign language (English) connects them to a gastro-diplomacy context, albeit without official state support or involvement. The cookbooks we discuss here are not sponsored by, or linked to, the Israeli government. As such, they could fit what Suntikul (2019) describes as citizen people-to-people gastro-diplomacy. In line with what we describe above, national cuisine cookbooks can serve as a diffusion instrument of food heritage and what is associated with it. They open a door to familiarize foreign audiences to a local or national foodway. Foodways describe the intersection of food, culture, and history. They reflect the connection between food-related behavior and patterns of membership

in a cultural community, group, and society. The combination of recipes, the narratives within which they are embedded, and the photos attached to them, offer a powerful tool to travel this foodway. By doing so, they can be seen as generating new contact zones of gastro-diplomacy. [Suntikul \(2019, 13\)](#) discusses ethnic restaurants as such contact zones, where members of different cultures meet and attempt to come to terms with one another. The cookbooks we explore can be seen as creating virtual contact zones.

The relations of food and national identity are often intertwined with the externally oriented use of food, as described in the gastro-diplomacy literature. Thus, for example, most states that practice gastro-diplomacy are former European colonies and their focus on gastro-nationalism was employed also as part of a strategy to combat colonialism ([Tettner and Kolyoncu 2016](#)). Similarly, in some of the books we discuss, the Israeli authors are portraying a certain view and vision of Israel for their (non-Israeli) readers, while at the same time reflecting on their own sense of national identity. Israeli cuisine cannot avoid references to the legacy of Israel as a settler-colonial state and being a product of Zionism.

Culinary Zionism and Israeli Cookbooks

In fin-de-siècle Europe, a Jewish author named Asher Zvi Hirsch Ginsberg, writing under the pen name Ahad Ha'Am, which is Hebrew for one of the people, produced a variant of Zionism called Cultural Zionism. For Ahad Ha'am, the goal of Zionism was not a sovereign nation-state, but a revitalization of the Jewish people. The development of modern Hebrew is one of the more significant achievements of Zionism that speaks to the goals of Cultural Zionism. Culinary Zionism is a manifestation of this Jewish national revitalization but, instead of language, what is produced is a national cuisine.

The food studies scholar, Sidney [Mintz \(1996\)](#), argues that cuisines can never be national but only regional because food cultures do not respect the artificially produced borders of the nation-state. Nevertheless, the notion of a national cuisine is in itself a political social construct. Consequently, the idea of Israeli cuisine is logically and politically a product of the Israeli state. Israeli cuisine is not an indigenous good, but one that combines the contributions of Jewish immigrant populations from across Europe, the Arab world, and beyond, local Palestinian food cultures, and local ingredients. Culinary Zionism represents not just the ingathering of the exiles, but also the political geography of present-day Israel. Historically, Israeli cookbooks in Hebrew helped generate and represent the successes of cultural Zionism for the citizens of the new state. The more recent phenomenon of cookbooks produced for an international (English-speaking) audience suggests that the meaning they produce is no longer only for domestic consumption. Rather, these books function as a form of political representation that markets the Israeli state's cultural successes internationally.

Cookbooks are social texts that serve as agents of representation. They can also be agents of appropriation of ethnic or local knowledge, enabling a discussion of the links between culinary processes and political processes, and the tracing of the dominant groups who provide "legitimate" knowledge ([Gvion 2005, 67](#)). Until the late 1970s, Israeli cookbooks were characterized by a didactic, national, and collectivist approach. Books written later introduce cooking as a means of identity-building and as a source of pleasure for individual consumers. Already before the creation of the state of Israel, the social construction of a national cuisine was an important national goal ([Tene 2005, 127](#)). Cookbooks helped shape a Zionist, Israeli, kitchen. In 1935, The Women's International Zionist Organization (WIZO) sponsored a book called "How to Cook in Palestine?" This was a national manifesto, published in Palestine for a Jewish audience, calling upon housewives to make a conscious effort to abandon the European kitchen they were used to and adopt the kitchen of *Erez Israel*

(the land of Israel) (Raviv 2015). The gradual building of a national cuisine also required connecting to the local land and its ingredients. This process included gradually taking over and nationalizing what were originally Arab–Palestinian dishes, most famously falafel and hummus, two foods that eventually became classic symbols of Israel. This process (Kleinberg 2005; Gvion 2012) clearly identifies how effort to build a Zionist–Jewish–Israeli identity through the construction of a national taste involved a colonizing process of local Palestinian cuisine. This symbolic appropriation was conducted, in part, in the context of the violent reality following the 1948 war and the displacement of local Palestinians now turned refugees, as well as the 1967 war that led to the Israeli occupation of the West Bank and Gaza.

Culinary Zionism is an expansion of this national taste and, by becoming a product consumed internationally, demonstrates the success of the Zionist project. Cookbooks offer a textual representation of Israel’s success, as well as offer an entry point to the Israeli foodway, with its unique particularities and challenges.

Israeli cookbooks have been generating much interest. *The New York Times* (2016) named *Breaking Breads: A New World of Israeli Baking* (Scheft 2016) as one of the “best of the rest” in its list of the “Best Cookbooks of 2016.” The 2012 cookbook, *Jerusalem*, by the London-based Israeli/Palestinian duo, Yotam Ottolenghi and Sami Tamimi (2012), was described by Publishers Weekly (Rotella 2013) as “the future of cookbooks,” while the Boston Globe reported how the cookbook was “a craze,” with a ready-made audience: “cooks who talk about ‘worshiping’ one of the authors; and people interested in anything Jerusalem” (Teitell 2013). Relatedly, Julia Moskin (2013) of the *New York Times* has referred to “Jerusalem fever,” while another reporter (Butnick 2013) noted how, “It’s safe to say no cookbook has had as much cultural impact in recent years as ‘Jerusalem: A Cookbook.’” Israeli cuisine has a captive international audience and market.

What, however, characterizes an “Israeli cookbook”? It is not obvious what defines Israeli cuisine. Indeed, we find many similar foods across the Levant, as evident in such cookery books as *Soframitz: A Middle Eastern Bakery Book* (Sortun and Kilpatrick 2016), *Sirocco* with its subheading “fabulous foods from the Middle East” but with recipes “inspired by flavours of the Middle East but [using] the fresh produce, techniques and cookery styles of the West” (Ghayour 2016, 8), and Ghayour’s (2014) book, *Persiana*. These cookbooks are indicative of a diverse spatial geography of food. The spatial politics of East meets West in *Sirocco* begs many questions about which Western locales she has in mind and what the borders of the East are. The book includes one recipe for latkes. Latkes is the term used by Jews to refer to a version of potato pancakes usually served on Hanukah and associated with Ashkenazi Jewish cooking. *Sirocco* also includes a recipe for the traditional Jewish Shabbat bread Challah that, in her book, is connected to a recipe from New York.

An additional complication when considering Israeli cuisine is how it intersects with Jewish cuisine. The latter is, of course, geographically more dispersed (Roden 1999). The geography of food comes with urban or regional variations as well as international ones. Variations of a specific recipe can be both national and urban, as in the different falafel recipes in the *Honey & Co* cookbook (Packer and Srulovich 2014), one for Haifa, another for Jerusalem, and a third Yemeni style.

Trying, then, to define national cuisines by recourse to the food, ingredients, and cooking styles can be deceptively complicated. The historian Jeffrey Pilcher (2006, 65) writes in *Food in World History*:

... Just as nations have been described as “imagined communities,” one could question whether national cuisines exist except as artificial collections of foods eaten by people within arbitrary political boundaries. Culinary practices invariably differ from one region to the next, so for national cuisines to exist at all, they must likewise be imagined from diverse local foods.

Indeed, on occasion Israeli cookbooks highlight the difficulty in identifying Israeli cuisine. The chef Danielle Oron (2017, 9) observes:

It's very hard to pinpoint what Israeli cuisine is, exactly. Israel is a melting pot of several cultures that migrated to what was once called Palestine. Many ethnicities influence the cuisine you'll find there today, including Moroccan, Eastern European, Yemeni, Egyptian, Iraqi and Turkish. So when I use the term *Israeli cooking*, it doesn't necessarily mean it was born in the state of Israel, it means that you can find it there now. It's a combination of old-world and new-world cuisines. (Emphasis in the original).

As if acknowledging the socially constructed character of Israeli cuisine, the chef Michael Solomonov (Solomonov and Cook 2015, 19–20) observes how,

There aren't really Israeli restaurants in Israel, as strange as that sounds. There are Bulgarian restaurants and Arabic restaurants and Georgian restaurants and Yemenite restaurants—and many, many more. What connects them, what makes them Israeli, is an approach to dining that is shaped by a shared experience.

National cuisines are socially constructed. And the social construction of an Israeli national cuisine is closely intertwined with the complexities of building and defining the Israeli state, including constructing a common Israeli identity that combines multiple faces and tensions. These include diasporic versus (connection to) the land of Israel, religious versus secular, nationalist versus cosmopolitan, East versus West, divides between different immigrant groups, and the complex relations between the Jewish people and the Arab–Palestinian inhabitants of Israel and of its neighbors (Shafir and Peled 2002). All these are quite easily observed as cookbooks present different ethnic groups' recipes, reference (or not) traditional Jewish recipes (which are detached from the geography of Israel), shift their framing between “Israeli,” “Middle Eastern,” or “Mediterranean” cuisine, and refer explicitly or not to Arab elements in Israeli cuisine.

To clarify, it is not which recipes the cookbooks offer that is central to the following analysis. Such a focus invites claims about authenticity and ownership, which we are less interested in here.² Rather, it is the narratives that contextualize the food that are of immediate interest. Moreover, and in any case, there is considerable overlap across the cookbooks in regard to ingredients and recipes (roast meats with similar spices, similar salads, eggplant dishes, falafel, hummus, baharat spice mixture, etc.) and they each share cultural geographic reference point.

In what follows, we examine the main political narratives found in contemporary Israeli cookbooks in English. Given the complexity in identifying a cookbook as Israeli, we explored books that met the following criteria. We identified cookbooks as Israeli that are either explicitly framed as such or where the author(s) are clearly referencing foods regularly found in Israel and Israeli geography (either cultural or physical). One example of the latter are the two *Honey & Co* cookbooks (Packer and Srulovich 2014, 2015). These cookbooks are consciously not defined as Israeli but instead as Middle-Eastern. Yet, the chefs and the geographic references (Haifa and Jerusalem) are Israeli. There is a considerable overlap of themes across the cookbooks listed, and we have limited our engagement to those texts that most clearly reflect these points of similarity.

Before continuing we want to highlight how, in recent years, new cookbooks have been published that are explicitly Palestinian, rather than Israeli. Palestinian cookbooks in English seek to highlight Palestinian culture and share with the world their own cultural goods on their own terms. Cookbooks such as the *Gaza Kitchen* (El-Haddad and Schmitt 2013) or *Palestine on a Plate* (Kalla 2017) or *The Palestinian Table* (Kassis 2017) are not only repositories of recipes, but also political treatises

² For such an analysis related to cookbooks, see Baron (2016).

on behalf of the Palestinians. The introduction to *Palestine on a Plate* (2017, 8), for example, states that “Palestinian food is an identity.” This statement could just as easily be from Rashid Khalidi’s (2010) classic work on Palestinian identity, although he does not discuss food anywhere in that text. Indeed, as Reem Kassis notes, Palestinian cookbooks seek in part to counter the move through which the concept of “Israeli food” “erases Palestinians from history” (Kassis 2020). Due to space constraints, we do not examine in this article the narratives emerging in these cookbooks. We mention them here to demonstrate how their framing clearly demarcates them as distinct from Israeli cookbooks. The way that national cuisines are produced or re-produced in cookbooks functions as a locus where national and international politics play out on the plate. And Israeli cookbooks provide an opening into the different representations of Israel in the context of the ongoing conflicts with the Palestinians and with its Arab neighbors, as well as in the context of Israel’s diverse population.

The Political Narratives in Israeli Cookbooks

The cookbooks we reviewed reveal different narratives, which can be roughly divided into two. The first addresses, albeit carefully, the issue of Israeli and Palestinian existence in Israel through their divided and overlapping foodways. Here we find narratives that reflect a political vision of how food serves as a means to explore and build bridges of communication with the Other. At times, the narratives in this type are more explicit about the violence in the region, but even then they are still trying to use food as a means to escape this violence. The violent reality has many faces, replicating the many ways in which violence is structured and experienced (Baron et al. 2019). It includes the ongoing occupation of the West Bank, the siege on Gaza, multiple forms of cultural appropriation, the multiple military operations vis-à-vis Hamas in Gaza, the terrorist attacks against Israeli civilians, Hizbullah military attacks on the border with Lebanon, ongoing rocket attacks on civilians in the Southern part of Israel, and the ongoing memories of the wars fought between Israel and its neighbors. A second type of narrative initially appears to be apolitical. Here we find narratives that are structured for tourists interested in exploring and experiencing Israel, stressing the return to the biblical land of the Jews, as well as books that offer a standard touristic narrative exploring Israel as simply another culinary tourist attraction. The challenges and scars of the violent realities of the land are not referred to in these books. In this section, we discuss these different narratives. In the next section, we address how cookbooks may promote (or reflect) the normalization of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict and the ongoing Israeli occupation of the West Bank. We term this normalization: *foodwashing*. While the two types of narratives explored here are different, one apparently more political than the other, in practice they are all political texts that share a theme that normalizes Israel.

Several cookbooks use food as a means to acknowledge the existence of a Palestinian Other via the acknowledgement of Palestinian dishes, and as a possible means of communication—foodway as a ground for coexistence perhaps. These come in more or less explicit forms. The *Jerusalem* cookbook is one such example. It provides a story about an idealized Middle East, one of hope for a peaceful future in Israel/Palestine (Baron 2016). The authors of *Jerusalem*, Jewish-Israeli Yotam Ottolenghi and Palestinian Sami Tamimi, are clearly aware of the politics of food as their cookbook provides a modification of the Israeli versus Palestinian nationalist narrative in that both its Jewish and Palestinian authors are laying claim to a shared regional food culture, not an antagonistic one. Their hope is to bring together two different nations into a single culinary narrative.

For example, hummus in *Jerusalem* is not an example of the Israeli appropriation of a Palestinian national dish, but a shared food experience with the power to unite,

not divide. Or at least, that is part of the story its authors want to tell. As they write (Ottolenghi and Tamimi 2012, 12–13):

Alas, although Jerusalemites have so much in common, food, at the moment, seems to be the only unifying force in this highly fractured place. The dialogue between Jews and Arabs, and often between Jews themselves, is almost non-existent. It is sad to note how little daily interaction there is between communities, with people sticking together in closed homogenous groups. Food, however, seems to break down those boundaries on occasion... It takes a giant leap of faith, but we are happy to take it—what have we got to lose?—to imagine that hummus will eventually bring Jerusalem together, if nothing else will.

The book provides a narrative about Jerusalem that reflects the imaginary of an idealized, peaceful Middle East.

Locating themselves at the center of their narrative about Jerusalem, the authors self-consciously create a story that is simultaneously nostalgic about the past and hopeful for the future. Exploring Jerusalem together, as an Israeli Jew and as a Palestinian, they co-produce an ethnographic representation of Jerusalem's foodways. This journey is one of exploration and personal reflection. They rediscover the foods they grew up with and discover the foods of the Other. There is a temporal dimension to this re-production of Jerusalem. The narrative is based in their past, in their hope for a better future, and in the ambivalent present where the past is deeply problematic and the future uncertain. Because of its joint Israeli/Palestinian authorship, it is very easy to see the narrative that *Jerusalem* provides as one of possible coexistence between Israelis and Palestinians, where both find respect in each other's culture. They reflect on how both Palestinian Sami and Jewish-Israeli Yotam were, as children, eating very similar dishes (couscous and *ptitim*) in very different places (Ottolenghi and Tamimi 2012, 8). Furthermore, Ottolenghi and Tamimi (2012, 16) take turns on the question of food ownership:

In the part of world we are dealing with everybody wants to own everything... Existence feels so uncertain and so fragile that people fight fiercely and with great passion to hold onto things: land, culture, religious symbols, food... The result is fiery arguments about ownership, about provenance, about who and what came first.

When it comes to food, however, they argue, these arguments are futile.

Another example of this normative vision is in two *Honey & Co* cookbooks. These cookbooks locate themselves as Middle Eastern, not Israeli. The chefs, however, are both Israeli and their choice to frame the cuisine as Middle Eastern and not Israeli is clearly a conscious one. Most of the geographic references in the introduction to their first cookbook (Packer and Srulovich 2014) are Israeli: a market in Haifa, sandwiches in Jerusalem, a Jordanian restaurant in East Jerusalem, kebabs in Tel Aviv, etc. However, the book also references Jordan, Turkey, Lebanon, Yemen, and Morocco. In this sense, the cookbook represents a story of Israel as a part of the Middle East when, because of the international relations of the region, it can be difficult to understand Israel in this way. Their narrative represents the argument made by Sidney Mintz, mentioned before, that food cultures do not respect artificial state borders.

Jerusalem and *Honey & Co* offer complementary narratives. In their own ways, each speaks to an idealization of what Israel could be. In *Jerusalem*, it is hope for peace between Israelis and Palestinians, where they can coexist and live in harmony in the same city. In *Honey & Co*, it is the vision of Israel as a part of the Middle East, not only learning and benefiting from the culinary traditions in the region, but also offering its own culinary contributions. Another complementary version is in *Zahav* (Solomonov and Cook 2015).³ *Zahav* offers a vision where violence, war, and

³“Zahav” translates into English as “gold,” and it is most likely a reference to Jerusalem, which is often referred to as the “city of gold,” as in the famous Israeli song, “Jerusalem of Gold” by Naomi Shemer.

militarism are forgotten, and a diverse melting pot comes together to produce a wonderfully rich culture. Solomonov and Cook's (2018) second cookbook, *Israeli Soul*, offers a similar representation. These texts use food as a way to discover a country outside of conflict, violence, and war.

Whereas *Jerusalem* addresses Israeli and Palestinian cuisines carefully, from a distance, and more as a provocation for future peaceful cooperation, David Haliva's (2016) *Divine Food: Israeli and Palestinian Food Culture and Recipes* places both Israeli and Palestinian food cultures on an equal footing. The contents of this book accurately reflect the title, with foods and cultural narratives representing local Palestinian histories and practices as well as Israeli (Jewish) ones. In this book, food is treated as a language to help form a common reference point for both Israelis and Palestinians to connect over, and explicitly acknowledges how Israel has appropriated Palestinian foods (Haliva 2016, 9):

Arab dishes like hummus with tahini and falafel were adopted by Jews, turning them into "national" Israeli dishes, much to the dissatisfaction of the Palestinians who saw this cultural appropriation as a mirror of the occupation, a symbol of the continuing Arab-Israeli conflict. For many years, local Arab restaurants were referred to in Hebrew as "Oriental," a vague term that avoided engaging in a definition of Palestinian identity through its cuisine.

This text is one of the most explicit out of those surveyed in acknowledging the seriousness of the political contestations over cultural goods, but it wants to use gastro-diplomacy as a means to overcome the conflict: "good food has the power to bring us all together" (Haliva 2016, 8).

Similarly, Claudia Roden, the author of *The Book of Jewish Food* (Roden 1999), writes in the forward to Robin Soans' *The Arab-Israeli Cookbook* (Soans 2004, 7):

... The recipes in this book have a personal touch. They are well-trying family recipes given by people who cook and eat them regularly and for whom they mean a great deal because they love the food, and because for them it is charged with emotion. For Palestinians, they represent an affirmation of cultural identity and the dream of an independent state. For Israelis whose parents came from Arab lands, they evoke ancestral memories and vanished worlds. For others, they are the foods adopted early on in their young idealist state. The cooking also reflects the shared culture and centuries of history when Jews and Arabs lived together in harmonious symbiosis.

In this book, there are also short quotes scattered throughout from the cooks who provided the recipes and which are designed to humanize Palestinians as neighbours and not enemies, while also trying to weaken any nationalist Israeli claims by describing Israeli cuisine as "cosmopolitan" (Soans 2004, 60).

There are clear attempts at using cookbooks as a tool of gastro-diplomacy by using food to find opportunities for Jews and Arabs to connect in a positive way. The *Jerusalem* cookbook may be the most famous of this brand of food diplomacy cookbooks, but it is not alone. Arab and Palestinian cookbooks, such as *The Gaza Kitchen*, also contribute to this process whereby Palestinians (Palestinian women in the case of the *Gaza Kitchen* (El-Haddad and Schmitt 2013)) demonstrate the culinary richness of Palestinian food, offering a different opportunity for encountering Palestinians, not only in the context of either terrorism or victimhood.

Unlike *Jerusalem*, with its explicit reference to peace, the cookbook *Zahav* provides a story that claims to be apolitical, which in this instance means that it is exceptionally political. The *Zahav* narrative is potentially more powerful than that in *Jerusalem* because of the tragic yet redemptive personal story it tells. Here we find a clearly emotional story in which it becomes necessary to find some positive means to connect to Israel in way that either transcends the violence or hides it.

The story behind *Zahav* is that of the relationship between the chef Michael Solomonov (the lead author), his late brother David, and the State of Israel. The

book is dedicated to David, who was killed tragically near the Lebanon border by a Hezbollah sniper in 2003 while he was covering a patrol shift on Yom Kippur for a religious soldier (Solomonov and Cook 2015, 17). Michael, although born in Israel, lived most of his life in the United States and did not serve in the Israeli army. His path eventually brought him into the kitchen and, unlike his brother, his relationship with Israel was ambivalent at best (Solomonov and Cook 2015, 15). The tragedy and shock of his brother's death haunted Michael, but eventually he found a way to reconnect to the memory of his brother in a positive way: through Israeli cooking. As he writes (Solomonov and Cook 2015, 18), "The more my menu at Marigold leaned toward Israel, the more passionate I became about cooking.... My brother had died fighting for Israel, and nothing I could do would change that. But for the first time, I began to see cooking as a powerful way to honor David's memory." Against the very political backdrop of the continued violence on Israel's Lebanese border (three years after the Israeli military retreated from Lebanon), as well as Solomonov's own politics of belonging, he then makes a remarkable statement: "I would expose people to a side of Israel that had nothing to do with politics and didn't ever make the evening news" (Solomonov and Cook 2015, 19).

In a way it seems odd that Solomonov would want to define his book in this way, through a deeply traumatic and personal crisis. However, the story is powerful. This autobiography, more than the collection of recipes, is central to the narrative that this cookbook provides. It demonstrates how the normative power in Israeli cookbooks is not the recipes they provide but the hermeneutics by which such recipes are introduced and presented. In the case of *Zahav*, just like in *Jerusalem*, there is a very clear meaning that is being produced and which, contrary to Solomonov's statement, is deeply political. What is being produced is the idea that we can find within Israel a source of pride, honour, and hope for the future. Israel, in this narrative, is a land of diversity and creativity, a land and a people that can be read outside of the violence of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict and instead according to the delicious cultural goods that its collective inhabitants contribute to producing. Said differently, Israel offers a heterogeneous community of vitality and creativity, not a violent nation-state of cultural appropriation and military occupation. He is attempting to depoliticize the Israeli experience. Three years later, Solomonov published a second book called *Israeli Soul* (Solomonov and Cook 2018). This book offers a narrative that stresses the multiple roots of Israeli food, coming together after the creation of the state of Israel in 1948, but being transferred from one generation to another (*l'dor vedor*)—a very political narrative, but one that tries to depoliticize the story of food in Israel. Thus, for example, a whole section is dedicated to the origins of falafel. While accurately describing the political history of falafel, the bottom line is that "falafel is where your heart is" (Solomonov and Cook 2018, 26).

This pluralistic vision of Israel is reproduced again and again across the range of Israeli cookbooks. In part, there is nothing surprising about this since the cookbooks would no doubt not be very good business investments if their narratives referred to military checkpoints or suicide bombings. Nevertheless, it is an interesting narrative if only because it clearly offers a normative vision of Israel.

All of the cookbooks surveyed tell a story. While the story in the first narrative we examined is self-reflexive and explicit in its gastro-diplomacy intentions, a second type of culinary narrative is one where the political narrative is repackaged into a seemingly apolitical anthropology about Israeli diversity. These books wrap the culinary tour in a broader story of a triumphant, non-reflexive, Zionism.

Janna Gur's (2007) *The Book of New Israeli Food* is a journey into the fairly typical political Zionist narrative of Israel. In this account, there is little that is reflexive about how Israeli foods are in part borrowed from the local regions and indebted to Arab and Palestinian foodways. The introduction does acknowledge the contribution of Palestinians to local food cultures in its reference to Arab-owned restaurants that

offer “authentic Palestinian dishes on their menus, showing the Jewish population that their cuisine is not all about hummus and shish-kebab” (Gur 2007, 16). Yet, by and large, the narrative offered in this cookbook is clearly intended for the Zionist tourist who is keen to hear about the Jewish return to the Land of Israel and of the dream of the Zionist pioneers “to create a new Israeli who will speak Hebrew and work the land, who will be tough and strong and able to defend himself” (Gur 2007, 11). The introduction repeats this traditional Zionist story, albeit with the added acknowledgment of how the early Zionists self-consciously engaged in a negation of the Diaspora and cultural appropriation (Gur 2007, 11):

The early settlers were idealistic youngsters driven by the vision of building a homeland for their long-suffering people.... This meant severing ties with the recent past—ones representing suffering and humiliation: the language, music, customs and foods of the Diaspora. For inspiration the early settlers looked to their Arab neighbours, whose appearance and lifestyle they felt represented the continuation of the Biblical Hebrew. Incidentally, they were not mistaken as current research indicates that Arab peasants and shepherds have indeed preserved many cultural traditions that go back to the age of Biblical Israel.

This is a much more explicit narrative than in the other cookbooks and can be rephrased more bluntly: the local Palestinian culinary traditions are really ancient Hebraic traditions and the Zionists did not steal anything but only took back what was theirs and which the locals were unknowingly preserving for them.

In *The Book of New Israeli Food*, the narrative is about the redemption of the Jews via the successes of Zionism. This success can be read not just in the fact of Israel's existence, but also in its cultural progress. The book's introduction opens with the following statement (Gur 2007, 6):

They say nobody comes to Israel for the food. There are so many reasons to visit this unique land, food is certainly not at the top of the list. Twenty to thirty years ago the only memorable culinary experiences tourists might have had was a good hummus in the Old City of Jerusalem or a hearty Israeli breakfast at a hotel. If they come back today they're in for a surprise.

The story is one of progress: there is so much more one can come to Israel today for, especially food. It is not surprising that this cookbook is directed at the tourist market.

Whereas *The New Book of Israeli Food* seems destined for shoppers at Ben Gurion airport (and is published in Israel), the 2016 *Israel Eats* (Rothfeld 2016) offers a different kind of tourist cookbook. *Israel Eats* is written by someone who is not from Israel and is discovering the country for the first time. The cookbook is a kind of travelogue with recipes coming from restaurants visited across Israel and replete with vignettes about people met in the course of compiling the cookbook. Each recipe is preceded by a brief story about where the recipe comes from. Sea bass from Chef Alaa Muse in Akko, spinach and bulgur salad inspired by the Arabic restaurant Ezba in Rameh, roast cauliflower from a restaurant in Tel Aviv, and so on. This kind of personal touch offers a direct and seemingly authentic point of contact with the diverse foodways of Israel, one that speaks to people and not ideology. The book does a reasonable job of highlighting the ethnic and religious diversity in Israel and includes a recipe from a Druze couple from Julis in the Galilee (Rothfeld 2016, 100). However, the political narrative in this book is not about Israeli demographic politics, it is about describing the abundant wealth that is Israeli cuisine. In this sense, the book serves a similar function to that of *Start-up Nation* (Senor and Singer 2009), which seeks to emphasize Israel's high-tech success, but in this case the success is of a different type of good. In this sense, the increase of Israeli cookbooks in English represents an accomplishment of the Zionist project. Not only did Zionism succeed in developing a nation-state in Palestine

called Israel, but it has also produced a national culinary culture, hence Culinary Zionism.

The idea of Israeli cuisine being ready for international consumption makes sense in a complex hermeneutic that involves the idea of Israel, its physical borders, the cultural diversity of its inhabitants that contribute unique foodways from around the world, and the recognition that there is something special going on as Israeli cuisine develops into a coherent concept. The development of Israeli cuisine can, consequently, be read as a success of Cultural Zionism.

While some of these cookbooks are clearly designed for a Jewish audience, with recipes reflecting the Jewish calendar, or designed to represent a part of Jewish-Israeli culture and export it, the power of the success of Culinary Zionism is reflected in another cookbook, Degutiene's *A Taste of Israel*. In this book, a non-Jew fulfils the Cultural Zionist ethos of Israel, providing the basis for regenerating Jewish culture for the benefit of the Diaspora. This cookbook was originally written in Lithuanian by a freelance journalist with very little knowledge of Israel or Judaism. She came to Israel in 2009 with her husband who was taking up an appointment as the Lithuanian ambassador to Israel. Much like *Israel Eats*, this book offers a culinary tour of Israel from the perspective of an outsider who is learning about Israel and is surprised at just how diverse its food options are. Yet, in spite of the author's lack of background knowledge (or perhaps because of it), the introduction to this book provides a remarkably lucid representation of the narrative that underpins much about the idea of Israeli cuisine. As she writes (Degutienė and Tribinevičius 2015, 6):

Over centuries of living in exile from the Promised Land the Israelites not only shared their culinary innovations with their host country, but also enriched their own traditions with the dishes from their adopted lands. When they returned to their historical homeland—Israel—the Jews brought with them the best culinary traditions from all around the world.

Despite the differences in the narratives of the tourist cookbooks described here, they all share this non-reflexive Zionist culinary narrative of a Jewish Israeli cuisine, reunited in the state of Israel, the ancient land of the Bible.

Foodways for Coexistence or Foodwashing?

Exploring the political narratives found in cookbooks is directly linked to the importance of exploring the international politics of the everyday. The links between food, culture, history, identity, and (in some cases) conflict and politics offer readers an intimate understanding of the foodways of Israel. As such, and in line with arguments about gastro-diplomacy, they offer greater familiarization with Israel and may generate what Suntutkul (2019, 1087) refers to as “contact zones of gastrodiplomacy.” This argument about the positive potential of gastro-diplomacy is, however, countered by an argument about the potential foodwashing effect of such cookbooks. The dilemma is that familiarization with the multiple tastes and stories embedded in food in Israel/Palestine risks normalization and consequent numbness with regard to ongoing Israeli policies vis-à-vis the Palestinians, but, at the same time, may also be crucial to generate meaningful responsiveness to those variously involved, either locally or from a distance, in this conflict. It is an argument that appears with regard to various types of cultural and economic interactions in asymmetric conflicts, which on the one hand promote cooperation and perhaps greater understanding and can promote conflict resolution, but on the other hand may conceal the extremely unequal nature of the interactions, as well as other problematic dimensions of the relations. In this section, we examine this dilemma by discussing foodwashing and the tension between the two opposite roles of these cookbooks.

While some of the cookbooks explored are more explicitly political than others, they all contribute to the production of meaningful narratives about Israel and about the relationships that those living outside of Israel can have with this country. The narratives are therefore all normative and largely political, even when they explicitly try to avoid a political context, and rarely directly mention the Israeli–Palestinian conflict and ongoing Israeli occupation. While the cookbooks offer different stories, they all share an underlying normative story about normalization. The Israeli cookbooks surveyed do not deny the conflict with the Palestinians, nor that there are local Palestinian food cultures that have been appropriated by Israelis. In this sense, there is no denial that the Palestinians have suffered injustices. However, while the books do not deny the violence of the Israeli state and the cultural appropriation of Palestinian foods, the texts are simultaneously involved in producing a narrative whereby the appropriation is normalized as a condition by which Israel’s diversity is able to show itself.

It is this latter point that sets up an especially problematic narrative because it represents Israel’s positives as a product of injustices while inhibiting a narrative that provides grounds for engaging with the consequences of the injustices (Shavit 2013). In short, past injustices become treated as something from the past and can thus be acknowledged without the acknowledgment requiring any change in the present. The injustices in this narrative have led to a positive and, in the case of the cookbooks, the positive is that of a vibrant, rich, and diverse food culture.

Normalization emerges in two different ways through the two main narratives we have described. In the first narrative we explored, books such as *Jerusalem* or *Divine Food* or *the Arab-Israeli Cookbook* do not ignore the relevance of the local Palestinian and wider Arab contributions to Israeli foodways, but they are largely repackaged as, in the words of Danielle Oron (2017, 9), a “melting pot,” or as a past injustice of little current relevance. The politics of Israel are in a sense washed aside by the pleasure of enjoying Israeli cuisine. Israeli cuisine thus serves to foodwash Israel into a bright and flavorful package that is easily divorced from the violence and politics of the Israeli state. In the second narrative, normalization via foodwashing is more clear cut; a central message is that there is nothing exceptional about Israeli cuisine in the sense that, just like all other states, Israel is able to make a claim on the production of local styles of cooking. When thinking about the production of such cookbooks and their popular consumption (as described before), one can easily see how they wash away any conflictual and problematic dimensions of life in Israel.

Such arguments resonate with claims about art-washing or pinkwashing. The idea here is to paint over discriminatory structures, beliefs, or actions while appearing progressive. Yet, the term’s emphasis is that such discriminations remain. In the specific case of the state of Israel, the ostensible washing over conflict is a central argument behind ongoing calls for a full cultural boycott of Israel, as expressed by various Boycott, Divestment and Sanction (BDS) activists and several renowned artists such as Roger Waters (Aoudé, Cooper, and Franklin 2014). For them, it is exactly the everyday politics of enjoying Israeli cultural goods that gradually entrenches the sense of normalcy. For those who wish to pressure the Israeli government to dramatically change its policy toward the Palestinians, such cultural interactions are anathema because they turn an abnormal situation into normal.

For the same reason, advocates of cultural boycotts also support the boycott of private, joint Israeli–Palestinian cultural projects (and, by doing so, hurt Palestinian artists as well). The rationale behind this claim is that such projects create a false impression of a real, equal exchange between two people, which is not the case. This latter argument is most likely to be used when debating whether a popular cookbook like *Jerusalem*, which is explicitly authored by a Jewish-Israeli chef and a Palestinian chef, does more damage than good as far as promoting recognition of the Palestinian plight. The problematic implications of such descriptions of culinary cooperation stem from the highly unequal power relations—clearly

not only between Israel and the Palestinians in the West Bank and Gaza, but also within the state of Israel, between its Jewish and Arab citizens. While most of the international political focus is on the former, the cookbooks actually offer a greater foodwashing challenge for the latter. What is allegedly washed over here are not only past injustices expressed in symbolic appropriation of food, but also current injustices with material consequences. These include the unequal status and opportunities structure for Arab–Israeli citizens, as well as the multiple negative material implications of the ongoing military occupation and conflict with the Palestinians, culinary and beyond. These range from the extreme case of the situation within Gaza, where food insecurity is a major problem, to the everyday realities in the West Bank that generate ongoing structural violence, even in relatively quiet times.

These cookbooks, by definition, normalize the cultural goods that are produced within, and that serve to represent, the Israeli state. This normalization poses a theoretical and methodological difficulty as that which becomes normalized, part of the everyday, is precisely that which becomes very difficult to critique or call into question. It also makes it easier to decouple the culinary experience of Israel from the politics of occupation and their consequences. Moreover, these books are commercial products and, as cultural products for sale, they commodify the conflict into a desirable, user-friendly package (Benjamin 2008). In this sense, even those books that do highlight the cultural appropriations necessary for there to be such a thing as Israeli cuisine, or those books that are based on the idea of food diplomacy, cannot escape the normalizing discourse.

Does this normalization danger outweigh the potential benefits of greater familiarization? Although Israeli cookbooks can be read as contributing to the “normalizing” of the conflict and masquerading the physical and structural violence it entails, quite a few of the cookbooks surveyed recognize that there is a conflict going on and stress the need to find a peaceful resolution.⁴ Furthermore, the cookbooks offer readers a way to walk through Israeli foodways and explore local foods found in Israel. As many of the recipes indeed reflect, this food is intimately linked to different ethnic groups residing in Israel.

For a culinary tourist, these texts may generate an interest in traveling to East Jerusalem, or Arab villages in northern Israel, to explore local cuisine, thereby offering a possibly significant step in contributing to a deeper appreciation of the different communities that reside in, and contribute to, Israeli cultures. One of the main concerns about the normalization effect of these narratives is that it will generate numbness and reduce willingness to politically engage the situation. However, it is also possible to argue that these cookbooks can play a role in generating greater responsiveness. A key factor here is the need to consider these cookbooks in a broader, intertextual context.

People do not only read cookbooks. They watch the news, hear competing political commentaries, and are exposed to multiple calls for (all sorts of) action. A reading of these cookbooks is therefore almost inevitably part of an intertextual experience. Consequently, a critical reading of these books and a reflection upon their open and hidden meanings and implications is likely to help people develop their individual reflective, nuanced, critical, and emotional attitudes on the politics running through and across the dishes. Furthermore, because various cultural texts resonate and interact with each other, the sense of familiarization and personal attachment to certain communities that culinary readers may develop through exploring these cookbooks may in turn enable a stronger cultivation of responsiveness in a different political context (reading a newspaper report, listening to state officials, watching a movie, etc.) (Schiff 2014). This cultivation of responsiveness is

⁴ One of the recent Palestinian cookbook, *Zaitoun—Recipes from the Palestinian Kitchen* (Khan and Russell 2018), includes a written endorsement by the London-based Israeli chef Yotam Ottolenghi, whose cookbook *Jerusalem* we discuss.

encouraged through stories and photos that accompany recipes in a cookbook like *Jerusalem*. It is equally true for the stories and photos that accompany Palestinian cookbooks like Yasmin Khan's *Zaitoun* (e.g., her discussion of the Gaza kitchen, (Khan and Russell 2018, 164–97)). Such a sense of responsiveness may, in turn, be an important trigger for political action as well, rather than numbness. In engaging with Israeli cookbooks, readers may want to ask what political positions underline the narratives offered in the cookbook, who is making a claim to authenticity in regard to specific dishes and why such claims matter, and how the book reproduces or contributes to claims about legitimacy and ownership in regard to particular spaces, histories, and cultures.

Conclusion

We have argued that there are two types of narratives found in Israeli cookbooks in English. The first is explicitly political, discusses Israeli cuisine as a foodway, contributes to creating a space of, and a path for, coexistence and recognition of the Other, and may serve as a form of food diplomacy. The second is found in tourist-oriented cookbooks that offer a supposedly apolitical story of culinary tours in Israel. On the one hand, both of these narratives reflect and engage with the rich foodways of Israel (including their local, multiethnic, Jewish, Palestinian, Druze traditions), and in the process may open space for dialogue, increase the familiarity and interest of foreign audiences with regard to different groups within Israel, Jewish, Palestinian, and others, and can therefore generate greater moral and political responsiveness. However, on the other hand, these same texts also generate a process that we describe as foodwashing. Foodwashing refers to the process of using food to ostensibly symbolically wash over violence and injustices (the violence of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict in this case). The food, or cuisine, serves as a cover that enables either the appearance of a progressive narrative or offers a means to disguise or dismiss the violence of the region and normalize the conflict.

The political power of popular culture lies in the ability of cultural products to spread information, generate emotions, shape identities, and form perceptions of our political geography. Food itself, and cookbooks as our focus here, are one example of such cultural products. The dilemma we presented above is reflective of a broader dilemma about the political potential and implications of cultural interactions in other fields as well. The stories and learning experiences, both indirect and intimate, that readers get from cookbooks like *Jerusalem* may offer them a means to decouple tasty culinary Israel from its political realities (the normalization danger). However, at the same time they also offer a more intimate understanding of the different groups that inhabit this space and can generate responsiveness to different groups involved in the complex and often violent life in Israel/Palestine. The dilemma we raise is possibly unresolvable but should remain, literally and figuratively, on the plate.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to acknowledge the anonymous referees and the editors. Ilan Zvi Baron would like to thank Noam Leshem, Yulia Egorova, Alison Negrin, and Aaron Kinghorn.

Funding

Galia Press-Barnathan would like to acknowledge the financial support of the Israeli Science Foundation (ISF), Grant No. 692/18.

References

- ADORNO, THEODOR W. 1991. *The Culture Industry: Selected Essays on Mass Culture*. New York: Routledge.
- AOUDÉ, IBRAHIM G., MORGAN COOPER, AND FRANKLIN CYNTHIA. 2014. "The 'I' in BDS: Individual Creativity and Responsibility in the Context of Collective Praxis: An Interview with Omar Barghouti and Falastine Dwikat." *Biography* 37 (2): 709–19.
- APPADURAI, ARJUN. 1988. "How to Make a National Cuisine: Cookbooks in Contemporary India." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 30 (1): 3–24.
- AUCHTER, JESSICA. 2016. "Playing War and Genocide: Endgame: Syria and Darfur Is Dying." In *Understanding Popular Culture and World Politics in the Digital Age*, Chapter 8, edited by Caitlin Hamilton and Laura J. Shepherd. London: Routledge.
- BAKER, CATHERINE. 2017. "The 'Gay Olympics'? The Eurovision Song Contest and the Politics of LGBT/European Belonging." *European Journal of International Relations* 23 (1): 97–121.
- BARON, ILAN ZVI. 2016. "Eating Jerusalem: Politics, Food and Identity." *Jewish Studies Quarterly* 23 (3): 267–85.
- BARON, ILAN ZVI, JONATHAN HAVERCROFT, ISAAC KAMOLA, JONNEKE KOOMEN, JUSTIN MURPHY, AND ALEX PRICHARD. 2019. "Liberal Pacification and the Phenomenology of Violence." *International Studies Quarterly* 63 (1): 199–212.
- BELL, DAVID, AND GILL VALENTINE. 1997. *Consuming Geographies: We Are Where We Eat*. London: Routledge.
- BENJAMIN, WALTER. 2008. *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*, translated by James Amery Underwood. London: Penguin.
- BILLIG, MICHAEL. 1995. *Banal Nationalism*. London: SAGE.
- BLEIKER, ROLAND. 2001. "The Aesthetic Turn in International Political Theory." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 30 (3): 509–33.
- BOURDIEU, PIERRE. 1984. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- BROUDE, TOMER. 2015. "A Diet Too Far? Intangible Cultural Heritage, Cultural Diversity, and Culinary Practices." In *Protecting and Promoting Diversity with Intellectual Property Law*, edited by Irene Calboli and Srividhya Radavan. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BRULOTTE, RONDA L., AND MICHAEL A. DI GIOVINE, eds. 2016. *Edible Identities: Food as Cultural Heritage (Heritage, Culture and Identity)*. London: Routledge.
- BUTNICK, STEPHANIE A. 2013. "A 'Jerusalem' Cookbook Rosh Hashanah Meal: Yotam Ottolenghi's High Holiday Menu." *Tablet Magazine*, August 30. Accessed July 5, 2019. <https://www.tabletmag.com/scroll/143323/a-jerusalem-cookbook-rosh-hashanah-meal>.
- CASO, FEDERICA, AND CAITLIN HAMILTON. 2015. *Popular Culture and World Politics: Theories, Methods, Pedagogies*. Bristol: E-International Relations.
- CHANDRAN, NYSHKA. 2017. "Trump Was Served Beef with 360-Year-Old Soy Sauce in South Korea." *CNBC*, November 8. Accessed November 8, 2017, <https://www.cnn.com/2017/11/07/donald-trumps-state-dinner-in-south-korea.html>.
- CHAPPLE-SOKOL, SAM. 2013. "Culinary Diplomacy: Breaking Bread to Win Heart and Minds." *The Hague Journal of Diplomacy* 8: 161–83.
- CLAPTON, WILLIAM, AND LAURA J. SHEPHERD. 2017. "Lessons from Westeros: Gender and Power in Game of Thrones." *Politics* 37 (1): 5–18.
- CRILLY, RHYS. 2020. "Where We At? New Directions for Research on Popular Culture and World Politics." *International Studies Review* 23 (1): 164–80.
- DAVIES, MATT, AND MARIANNE I. FRANKLIN. 2015. "What Does (the Study of) International Politics Sound Like." In *Popular Culture and World Politics: Theories, Methods, Pedagogies*, edited by Federica Caso and Caitlin Hamilton, 120–47. Bristol: e-International Relations.
- DE SOUCEY, MICHAELA. 2010. "Gastronationalism: Food Traditions and Authenticity Politics in the European Union." *American Sociological Review* 75 (3): 432–55.
- DEGUTHIENE, NIDA, AND MEDEINE TRIBINEVICIUS. 2015. *A Taste of Israel: From Classic Litvak to Modern Israeli*. Cape Town: Struik Lifestyle.
- DEYLAMI, SHIRIN, AND JONATHAN HAVERCROFT. 2016. *The Politics of HBO's The Wire: Everything Is Connected*. London: Routledge.
- DITTMER, JASON. 2010. *Popular Culture, Geopolitics, and Identity*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- DITTMER, JASON, AND KLAUS DODDS. 2008. "Popular Geopolitics Past and Future: Fandom, Identities and Audiences." *Geopolitics* 13 (3): 437–57.
- DODDS, KLAUS. 2005. "Screening Geopolitics: James Bond and the Early Cold War Films (1962–1967)." *Geopolitics* 10 (2): 266–89.
- . 2015. "Popular Geopolitics and the War on Terror." In *Popular Culture and World Politics: Theories, Methods, Pedagogies*, edited by Federica Caso and Caitlin Hamilton, 51–62. Bristol: E-International Relations Publishing.

- EDKINS, JENNY. 2013. "Novel Writing in International Relations: Openings for a Creative Practice." *Security Dialogue* 44 (4): 281–97.
- EKEN, M. EVREN. 2016. "The Un-scene Affects of On-Demand Access to War." In *Understanding Popular Culture and World Politics in the Digital Age*, Chapter 9, edited by Caitlin Hamilton and Laura J. Shepherd. London: Routledge.
- . 2019. "How Geopolitical Becomes Personal: Method Acting, War Films and Affect." *Journal of International Political Theory* 15 (2): 210–28.
- EL-HADDAD, LAILA, AND MAGGIE SCHMITT. 2013. *Gaza Kitchen: A Palestinian Culinary Journey*. Washington, DC: Just World Books Publications.
- EROUKHMANNOFF, CLARA. 2019. "Responding to Terrorism with Peace, Love and Solidarity: 'Je Suis Charlie', 'Peace' and 'I Heart MCR'." *Journal of International Political Theory* 15 (2): 167–87.
- FERGUSON, KENNAN. 2020. *Cookbook Politics*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- FERGUSON, PRISCILLA PARKHUST. 2010. "Culinary Nationalism." *Gastronomica* 10 (1): 102–9.
- FOX, JOHN E., AND CYNTHIA MILLER-IDRISS. 2008. "Everyday Nationhood." *Ethnicities* 8 (4): 536–63.
- FRANKLIN, MARIANNE L., ed. 2016. *Resounding International Relations: On Music, Culture, and Politics*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan Springer.
- FURMAN, DANIEL J., AND PAUL MUSGRAVE. 2017. "Synthetic Experiences: How Popular Culture Matters for Images of International Relations." *International Studies Quarterly* 61 (3): 503–16.
- GHAYOUR, SABRINA. 2014. *Persiana: Recipes from the Middle East & Beyond*. London: Mitchell Beazley.
- . 2016. *Sirocco: Fabulous Flavours from East*. London: Mitchell Beazley.
- GRAYSON, KYLE, MATT DAVIES, AND SIMON PHILPOTT. 2009. "Pop Goes IR? Researching the Popular Culture—World Politics Continuum." *Politics* 29 (3): 155–63.
- GUR, JANNA. 2007. *The Book of New Israeli Food: A Culinary Journey*. Tel Aviv: Al Haschulchan.
- GVION, LIORA. 2005. "Hummus—Couscous—Sushi: Food and Ethnicity in Israeli Society." In *A Full Belly—Rethinking Food and Society in Israel*, edited by Aviad Kleiberg, 32–78. Jerusalem: Keter. (Hebrew).
- . 2012. *Beyond Hummus and Falafel: Social and Political Aspects of Palestinian Food in Israel*, translated by David Wesley and Elana Wesley. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- HALIVA, DAVID. 2016. *Divine Food—Israeli and Palestinian Food Culture and Recipes*. Berlin: Die Gestalten Verlag.
- HUGHES, RACHEL. 2007. "Through the Looking Blast: Geopolitics and Visual Culture." *Geography Compass* 1: 976–94.
- ICHIKO, ATSUKO, VENETIA JOHANNES, AND RONALD RANTA, eds. 2019. *The Emergence of National Food: The Dynamics of Food and Nationalism*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- ICHIRO, ATSUKO, AND RONALD RANTA. 2016. *Food, National Identity and Nationalism: From Everyday to Global Politics*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- ICHIRO, ATSUKO. 2020. "Food and Nationalism: Gastronationalism Revisited." *Nationalities Papers* 48 (2): 215–23.
- JACKSON, PATRICK THADDEUS. 2015. "Must International Studies Be a Science?" *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 43 (3): 942–65.
- KALLA, JOUDIE. 2017. *Palestine on a Plate: Memories from My Mother's Kitchen*. London: Jacqui Small LLP.
- KASSIS, REEM. 2017. *The Palestinian Table*. London: Phaidon.
- . 2020. "Here's Why Palestinians Object to the Term 'Israeli Food': It Erases Us from History." *The Washington Post*, February 18, sec. Food. Accessed February 2, 2021. https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/food/heres-why-palestinians-object-to-the-term-israeli-food-it-erases-us-from-history/2020/02/14/96974a74-4d25-11ea-bf44-f5043eb3918a_story.html.
- KHALIDI, RASHID. 2010. *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- KHAN, YASMIN, AND MATT RUSSELL. 2018. *Zaitoun: Recipes and Stories from the Palestinian Kitchen*. London: Bloomsbury.
- KIRBY, PAUL. 2017. "Political Speech in Fantastical Worlds." *International Studies Review* 19 (4): 573–96.
- KLEINBERG, AVIAD, ed. 2005. *A Full Belly—Rethinking Food and Society in Israel*. Jerusalem: Keter. (Hebrew).
- KNOTT, ELEANOR. 2015. "Everyday Nationalism: A Review of the Literature." *Studies on National Movements* 3: 1–17.
- LARSON, JANET. 2015. "Making Feminist Sense Out of 'Charlie Wilson's War.'" *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 17 (1): 77–99.
- LÖFFLMANN, GEORG. 2013. "Hollywood, the Pentagon, and the Cinematic Production of National Security." *Critical Studies on Security* 1 (3): 280–94.
- LONG, LUCY M. 2010. *Culinary Tourism*. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.
- MINTZ, SIDNEY WILFRED. 1996. *Tasting Food, Tasting Freedom: Excursions into Eating, Culture, and the Past*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

- MOSKIN, JULIA. 2013. "Jerusalem' Has All the Right Ingredient." *New York Times*, July 30, sec. Dining & Wine. Accessed February 2, 2021. <https://www.nytimes.com/2013/07/31/dining/jerusalem-has-all-the-right-ingredients.html>.
- MULLER, BENJAMIN J. 2008. "Securing the Political Imagination: Popular Culture, the Security Dispositif and the Biometric State." *Security Dialogue* 39 (2–3): 199–220.
- NEUMANN, IVER B. 2001. "Grab a Phaser, Ambassador': Diplomacy in Star Trek." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 30 (3): 603–24.
- ORON, DANIELLE. 2017. *Modern Israeli Cooking: 100 New Recipes for Traditional Classics*. Salem: Page Street.
- OTTOLENGHI, YOTAM, AND SAMI TAMIMI. 2012. *Jerusalem*. London: Ebury Press.
- PACKER, SARIT, AND ITAMAR SRULOVICH. 2014. *Honey & Co: Food from the Middle East*. London: Saltyard Books.
- . 2015. *Honey & Co: The Baking Book*. London: Saltyard Books.
- PAYNE, RODGER A. 2016. "Laughing off a Zombie Apocalypse: The Value of Comedic and Satirical Narratives." *International Studies Perspectives* 18 (2): 211–24.
- PILCHER, JEFFREY M. 2006. *Food in World History*. London: Routledge.
- PRESS-BARNATHAN, GALIA. 2017. "Thinking About the Role of Popular Culture in International Conflicts." *International Studies Review* 18 (2): 166–84.
- . 2019. "Managing Multiple Identity Challenges and the Origins of Israeli National Television (in Arabic)." *Media, Culture & Society* 41 (4): 449–64.
- PRESS-BARNATHAN, GALIA, AND NAAMA LUTZ. 2020. "The Multilevel Identity Politics of the 2019 Eurovision Song Contest." *International Affairs* 96 (3): 729–48.
- RAVIV, YAEL. 2015. *Falafel Nation: Cuisine and the Making of National Identity in Israel*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- REINKE DE BUTRAGO, SYBILLE. 2019. "Visualisation and Knowledge Production in International Relations: The Role of Emotions and Identity." *Journal of International Political Theory* 15 (2): 246–60.
- ROBINSON, NICK. 2012. "Videogames, Persuasion and the War on Terror: Escaping or Embedding the Military—Entertainment Complex?" *Political Studies* 60 (3): 504–22.
- ROCKOWER, PAUL. 2014. "The State of Gastrodiplomacy." *Public Diplomacy Magazine* 11 (Winter). Accessed February 2, 2021. <https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5be3439285ede1f05a46dafa/t/5be3511daa4a996fcaa498f3/1541624135259/GastroDiplomacy>.
- RODEN, CLAUDIA. 1999. *The Book of Jewish Food: An Odyssey from Samarkand and Vilna to the Present Day*. London: Penguin Books.
- ROTELLA, MARK. 2013. "The Bestselling Cookbooks of 2012." *PublishersWeekly.com*, February 8. Accessed July 7, 2019, <https://www.publishersweekly.com/pw/by-topic/industry-news/cooking/article/55897-cooking-by-the-numbers.html>.
- ROTHFELD, STEVEN. 2016. *Israel Eats*. Layton, UT: Gibbs Smith.
- SAUNDERS, ROBERT A., AND JACK HOLLAND. 2018. "The Ritual of Beer Consumption as Discursive Intervention: Effigy, Sensory Politics, and Resistance in Everyday IR." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 46 (2): 119–41.
- SCHEFT, URI. 2016. *Breaking Breads: A New World of Israeli Baking*. New York: Artisan.
- SCHIFF, JADE. 2014. *Burdens of Political Responsibility: Narrative and the Cultivation of Responsiveness*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- SENROR, DAN, AND SAUL SINGER. 2009. *Start-up Nation: The Story of Israel's Economic Miracle*. New York: Twelve.
- SHAFIR, GERSHON, AND YOAV PELED. 2002. *Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- SHAPIRO, MICHAEL J. 2008. *Cinematic Geopolitics*. New York: Routledge.
- . 2016. *Politics and Time: Documenting the Event*. Cambridge: Polity.
- SHAVIT, ARI. 2013. *My Promised Land: The Triumph and Tragedy of Israel*. New York: Random House.
- SHEPHERD, LAURA J. 2013. *Gender, Violence and Popular Culture: Telling Stories*. New York: Routledge.
- SKKEY, MICHAEL. 2009. "The National in Everyday Life: A Critical Engagement with Michael Billig's Thesis of Banal Nationalism." *The Sociological Review* 57 (2): 331–46.
- SOANS, ROBIN. 2004. *The Arab–Israeli Cookbook*. London: Aurora Metro.
- SOLOMONOV, MICHAEL, AND MICHAEL COOK. 2015. *Zahav: A World of Israeli Cooking*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- . 2018. *Israeli Soul: Easy, Essential, Delicious*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- SORTUN, ANA, AND MAURA KILPATRICK. 2016. *Soframiz: Vibrant Middle Eastern Recipes from Sofra Bakery and Cafe*. Berkeley, CA: Ten Speed Press.
- SUCHAROV, MIRA. 2013. "Imagining Ourselves Then and Now: Nostalgia and Canadian Multiculturalism." *Journal of International Relations and Development* 16 (4): 539–65.

- SUNTIKUL, WANTANEE. 2019. "Gastrodiplomacy in Tourism." *Current Issues in Tourism* 22 (9): 1076–94.
- TEITELL, BETH. 2013. "How a Middle Eastern Cookbook Became a Craze." *BostonGlobe.com*, September 10. Accessed July 7, 2019. <https://www.bostonglobe.com/lifestyle/food-dining/2013/09/10/how-middle-eastern-cookbook-became-craze/k5AWJSPbglUz8A6sUOtFI/story.html>.
- TENE, OFRA. 2005. "'This is How We Cook' at Home in Israel: Reading Cookbooks from the 19430s to the 1980s." In *A Full Belly—Rethinking Food and Society in Israel*, edited by Aviad Kleiberg, 92–130. Jerusalem: Keter. (Hebrew).
- TETTNER, SAMUEL, AND BEGUN KALYONCU. 2016. "Gastrodiplomacy 2.0: Culinary Tourism beyond Nationalism?" *Journal of Tourism Research* 6 (2): 47–55.
- THE NEW YORK TIMES. 2016. "The Best Cookbooks of Fall 2016." *The New York Times*, September 27, sec. Food. Accessed July 7, 2019. <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2016/09/28/dining/best-cookbooks.html>.
- TUCHMAN, GAYE, AND HARRY GENE LEVINE. 1993. "New York Jews and Chinese Food: The Social Construction of an Ethnic Pattern." *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 22 (3): 382–407.
- WELDES, JUTTA. 1999. "Going Cultural: Star Trek, State Action, and Popular Culture." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 28 (1): 117–34.
- WHITE HOUSE. 2016. "State Dinner in Honor of the Right Honorable Justin Trudeau, P.C., M.P., Prime Minister of Canada, and Mrs. Sophie Grégoire Trudeau." White House, Washington DC, March 10.
- WILK, RICHARD R. 2002. "Food and Nationalism: The Origins of 'Belizean Food'." In *Food Nations: Selling Taste in Consumer Societies*, edited by Philip Scranton and Warren James Belasco, 676–91. New York: Routledge.