# Fossil herbivore stable isotopes reveal middle Pleistocene hominin palaeoenvironment in 'Green Arabia'

Patrick Roberts <sup>1\*</sup>, Mathew Stewart <sup>2\*</sup>, Abdulaziz N. Alagaili<sup>3</sup>, Paul Breeze<sup>4</sup>, Ian Candy<sup>5</sup>, Nick Drake<sup>4</sup>, Huw S. Groucutt<sup>1,6</sup>, Eleanor M. L. Scerri<sup>1,6</sup>, Julia Lee-Thorp<sup>6</sup>, Julien Louys<sup>7</sup>, Iyad S. Zalmout<sup>8</sup>, Yahya S. A. Al-Mufarreh<sup>8</sup>, Jana Zech<sup>1</sup>, Abdullah M. Alsharekh<sup>9</sup>, Abdulaziz al Omari<sup>10</sup>, Nicole Boivin<sup>1</sup> and Michael Petraglia <sup>1,11\*</sup>

Despite its largely hyper-arid and inhospitable climate today, the Arabian Peninsula is emerging as an important area for investigating Pleistocene hominin dispersals. Recently, a member of our own species was found in northern Arabia dating to ca. 90 ka, while stone tools and fossil finds have hinted at an earlier, middle Pleistocene, hominin presence. However, there remain few direct insights into Pleistocene environments, and associated hominin adaptations, that accompanied the movement of populations into this region. Here, we apply stable carbon and oxygen isotope analysis to fossil mammal tooth enamel (n = 21) from the middle Pleistocene locality of Ti's al Ghadah in Saudi Arabia associated with newly discovered stone tools and probable cutmarks. The results demonstrate productive grasslands in the interior of the Arabian Peninsula ca. 300-500 ka, as well as aridity levels similar to those found in open savannah settings in eastern Africa today. The association between this palaeoenvironmental information and the earliest traces for hominin activity in this part of the world lead us to argue that middle Pleistocene hominin dispersals into the interior of the Arabian Peninsula required no major novel adaptation.

tudies of Pleistocene hominin dispersals beyond Africa are important for understanding the course of global human evolution and prehistory. In particular, analysis of the environmental context under which members of the genus Homo moved into Europe and Asia in the early and middle Pleistocene (2.6 Ma to 126 ka) relative to that of Homo sapiens populations expanding around the globe in the late Pleistocene (126-12ka) can provide an insight into the potential ecologically unique nature of our species1-3. It has recently been highlighted that our species occupied and used a diversity of extreme environments, including deserts, tropical rainforests, palaearctic environments, and high-altitude settings, around the world during the late Pleistocene<sup>3</sup>. By contrast, the dispersals of other earlier and contemporaneous Homo species into Europe and Asia appear to be best associated with the generalized use of different forest and grassland mosaics proximate to riverine and lacustrine settings<sup>2,4</sup>. Nevertheless, a paucity of associated palaeoenvironmental information has made it difficult to systematically test this distinction, and many hold that non-H. sapiens members of the genus Homo demonstrate significant cultural<sup>5,6</sup> and ecologically adaptive7-9 flexibility.

In spite of its crucial geographical position at the interface of Africa and Eurasia, the Arabian Peninsula has remained remarkably absent from adaptive models of Pleistocene hominin expansions until relatively recently, owing to a lack of well-constrained archaeological and palaeoecological data. Climate modeling<sup>10</sup>, speleothem records<sup>11</sup>, palaeontological findings<sup>12-15</sup>, and geomorphological studies of palaeolake records<sup>16,17</sup> have been used to argue that at intervals in the past, notably during interglacials, the harsh, hyper-arid deserts that cover much of Arabia today were replaced by 'moister' and 'greener' conditions more hospitable to hominin occupation<sup>18,19</sup>. Furthermore, the find of an *H. sapiens* phalanx, in association with middle Palaeolithic stone tools, at the site of Al Wusta dated to ca. 90 ka provides definitive evidence for the early presence of our species in the interior of the Arabian Peninsula<sup>20</sup>. There have also been suggestions that stone tools in the Arabian interior are associated with an earlier period of middle Pleistocene hominin dispersal<sup>21-24</sup>. However, despite the significance of climate and environmental change for hominin dispersal into the region, there has been no direct means of determining what 'wetter' represents in the context of regional ecology nor has there been definitive identification of middle Pleistocene hominin presence.

We undertook renewed archaeological and taphonomic analysis of fossil fauna found at the middle Pleistocene (ca. 300–500 ka) fossil locality of Ti's al Ghadah in the Nefud Desert of Saudi Arabia (Fig. 1; Supplementary Text 1 and 2; Supplementary Figs. 1 and 2) and report, for the first time at the site, lithic artefacts in direct stratigraphic association with the fossil fauna. Ti's al Ghadah is one of the most important palaeontological sites in the region,

 <sup>1</sup>Department of Archaeology, Max Planck Institute for the Science of Human History, Jena, Germany. <sup>2</sup>Palaeontology, Geobiology and Earth Archives Research Centre, School of Biological, Earth and Environmental Science, University of New South Wales, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia.
<sup>3</sup>KSU Mammals Research Chair, Zoology Department, King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia. <sup>4</sup>Department of Geography, King's College, London, UK.
<sup>5</sup>Department of Geography, Royal Holloway, University of London, London, UK. <sup>6</sup>Research Laboratory for Archaeology and the History of Art, School of Archaeology, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK. <sup>7</sup>Environmental Futures Research Institute, Griffith Sciences – Centres and Institutes, Griffith University, Nathan, Queensland, Australia. <sup>8</sup>Department of Paleontology, Saudi Geological Survey, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia. <sup>9</sup>King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia.
<sup>10</sup>Saudi Commission for Tourism & National Heritage, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia. <sup>11</sup>Human Origins Program, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution, Washington DC, USA. \*e-mail: roberts@shh.mpg.de; ms231@uowmail.edu.au; petraglia@shh.mpg.de

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**



Fig. 1 | Map of the sampled fossil and modern sites within Saudi Arabia. **a**, Map showing the position of the Ti's al Ghadah fossil site and the Mahazat as-Sayd Protected Area in the context of Saudi Arabia. **b**, View of the Ti's al Ghadah basin showing in blue the extent of the lacustrine deposit overlying the main fossil faunal deposit.

representing the only dated faunal assemblage recovered from middle Pleistocene Arabia<sup>12-14</sup>. Previous analyses have identified a suite of terrestrial and aquatic animals, including extinct elephants (*Palaeoloxodon* sp.), Asiatic wild ass (*Equus hemionus*), and water birds (*Tachybaptus sp.* and *Anas* sp.)<sup>12-14</sup> (Supplementary Table 2), that have been used to argue that the western Nefud Desert was significantly less arid at times during the middle Pleistocene than it is today. 'Middle Palaeolithic' artefacts of unknown age have also been recovered from the surface of the basin<sup>24</sup>. Yet, the lack of taphonomic analysis and the scarcity of anthropogenic remains have made evaluating the relationship between hominins and fossil fauna difficult.

There has also been no way of analysing, in detail, the vegetation and relative aridity associated with the middle Pleistocene fossil assemblage, and any potential hominin presence, at Ti's al Ghadah. In this study, we performed stable carbon ( $\delta^{13}$ C) and oxygen  $(\delta^{18}O)$  isotope analysis of 21 fossil fauna specimens recovered from the site.  $\delta^{13}C$  analysis of faunal tooth enamel is used to assess different types of biomass in animal diets<sup>25-27</sup>. Most terrestrial plants, including trees, herbs, shrubs, and shade-loving grasses follow the C<sub>3</sub> photosynthetic pathway<sup>28</sup>. C<sub>4</sub> photosynthesis is followed by most arid-adapted grasses and some sedges<sup>29</sup>. C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> plants have distinct and non-overlapping  $\delta^{\rm 13}C$  values  $^{\rm 30}$  that are passed into faunal consumers, allowing reliance on tree and shrub versus grassland biomass to be determined in global ecosystems, including those of Arabia<sup>12</sup>. In faunal diets, before the impact of significant fossil fuel emission, average herbivore  $\delta^{13}$ C values for C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> reliance are ca. -12% and ~0‰, respectively<sup>25-27</sup>.

δ18O data from fossil herbivore tooth enamel reflect precipitation source, humidity, temperature, and also plant water. These multiple influences can often make faunal enamel  $\delta^{18}$ O difficult to interpret as a past environmental signal. This is particularly the case in areas like the Arabian Peninsula where the source water, and therefore δ<sup>18</sup>O, for precipitation may have changed over time<sup>10</sup>. Evaporation exerts a positive effect on  $\delta^{18}$ O, particularly in arid desert regions such as the centre of the Arabian Peninsula, so that continental water bodies and soils in areas with a water deficit are <sup>18</sup>O-enriched. This effect is even stronger in plants due to the process of evapotranspiration<sup>31,32</sup>. The difference between the  $\delta^{18}$ O from the tooth enamel of obligate drinkers such as equids (that must drink from open water sources) and non-obligate drinkers such as Oryx. (that can meet their water requirements through the consumption of plants) is strongly influenced by palaeoaridity<sup>33,34</sup> at a given locale, and is not affected by changes in the precipitation or source water baseline (Supplementary Text 2). Finally, since tooth enamel forms incrementally, sequential  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O analysis of animal tooth enamel can be used to look at temporal changes in vegetation and water sources during the period of tooth enamel formation<sup>35</sup>. The preservation of all samples was also checked using Fourier-transform infrared spectroscopy as per Roberts et al.<sup>36</sup> (Supplementary Text 3).

#### Results

The fossil faunal remains and newly discovered stone tools analysed in this study were recovered from a sandy horizon ('Unit 5') directly beneath a palaeolake deposit in the Ti's al Ghadah basin<sup>14</sup> (Fig. 2). The lithic artefacts, coupled with new taphonomic evidence suggestive of anthropogenic accumulation of bones on-site, confirm a hominin presence in association with the faunal remains analysed in this study (Fig. 2; see also Supplementary Text 4). These findings represent the oldest radiometrically dated hominin presence in the Arabian Peninsula, as well as the first anthropogenically modified faunal assemblage from the Pleistocene. In total, six unretouched flakes and one retouched flake were recovered from Unit 5. A further six chunks were recovered with the artefacts and probably represent highly fragmented debitage. The stone tools and debitage fragments are made on a brown-coloured lacustrine chert, and this material is known from lakebeds across the Nefud18-20. At the MIS 5 site of Al Wusta, 3 km from Ti's al Ghadah, similar lacustrine chert was the main raw material used by hominins<sup>20</sup>. Despite difficulties in knapping such material, the artefacts are finely made and similar to one another in terms of technology (Fig. 2a). The lithics consist of small flakes struck from prepared cores and a side-retouched flake ('side scraper').

In addition, associated faunal material includes two mediumsized ungulate rib fragments that bear tentatively assigned cut marks (TAG13/133 and TAG13/900; Fig. 2d,e). These markings are V-shaped in cross-section, run parallel to each other and either perpendicularly or obliquely to the long axis of the bone. Shoulder effect and shoulder flaking is apparent, the latter in the form of Hertzian cones. No internal microstriations were observed, although fine-scale features, such as microstriations, are quickly removed during chemical alteration<sup>37</sup>. The direction and location of the markings is consistent with cut marks produced during filleting of meat from around the rib<sup>38</sup>. Notches with a broad arcuate planform and conchoidal medullary flake scar, reminiscent of notches produced during hammerstone percussion, were also identified and suggest hominins may have broken open long bones to exploit marrow (Fig. 2b; Supplementary Text 4 and Supplementary Fig. 12). Together with the evidence of the associated newly identified lithics, this makes Ti's al Ghadah the first, at least partially

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**

## ARTICLES



**Fig. 2 | Compilation of stone tools and bones with evidence for anthropogenic modification from the site of Ti's al Ghadah. a**, Chert flakes with dihedral striking platforms (i, iii and iv) and a side-retouched flake (ii). **b**, Medium-sized bovid proximal metacarpal (TAG14/121) in cortical (i) and medullary (ii and iii) view. In the inset, a wide striae field (white box) is visible adjacent to the flake scar (dashed line). An adhering bone flake (arrow) and conchoidal flake scar (dashed line) are visible from the medullary. The refitted piece (iii) exhibits a smooth, oblique fracture pattern indicating that the bone was broken while fresh. **c**, Tibia shaft fragment (TAG14/9235) in cortical (i) and medullary (ii) view. An indeterminate narrow, V-shaped groove with a forked end (arrows) runs parallel to the long axis of the bone. A conchoidal flake scar is present on the medullary surface (dashed line). **d**, Dorsal view (i) of a medium-sized mammalian rib fragment (TAG13/900) with two probable cut marks that run obliquely to the long axis of the rib. Shoulder effect (arrows) is clearly visible in the SEM image (ii). **e**, Medium-sized mammalian rib fragment (TAG13/133) with multiple parallel grooves running perpendicular to the long axis of the bone and shoulder effect in the form of Hertzian cones (triangles) that are clearly visible in the SEM image (ii). **f**, Medium-sized bovid metapodial shaft fragment (TAG14/9257) in cortical (i) and medullary (ii) view with multiple opposing notches and conchoidal flake scars (dashed lines), and numerous carnivore tooth scores (arrows), suggesting the bone was broken open by a large carnivore. **g**, Medium-sized mammalian shaft bone flake (TAG13/9134) in medullary (i) and cortical (ii) view. The smooth and oblique fracture pattern indicates the bone was broken while fresh and probably by a dynamic force. The surface exhibits pitting (arrows) and the bone flake has tentatively been attributed to be the result of hammerstone percussion. Solid scale bar, 0.5 mm.

anthropogenic faunal assemblage from the Arabian Peninsula in the Pleistocene.

The  $\delta^{13}C$  data from all of the sampled fossil mammals (elephants, *Oryx* sp., hartebeest, equids and unidentified bovids) associated with this hominin presence show an unequivocal dominance of C<sub>4</sub> vegetation in the diets of herbivores ( $\delta^{13}C$  range = -0.8 to 3.3%) (Fig. 3 and Supplementary Table 5), and suggest that rainfall occurred during the warm season. The  $\delta^{13}C$  evidence also fits with climate simulations suggesting that the periodic amelioration of Arabian environments reflects the incursion of the African monsoon system<sup>10</sup>. The uniformity of C<sub>4</sub> consumption by all animals suggests the presence of extensive, productive C<sub>4</sub> grasslands in the vicinity of the palaeolake. The  $\delta^{18}O$  range of fauna from Ti's al Ghadah is high ( $\delta^{18}$ O range = -5.6 to 6.2‰), although not higher than Pliocene, Pleistocene and contemporary African ecosystems<sup>33,34,39,40</sup>. Differences in  $\delta^{18}$ O between obligate drinking equids, hartebeest, and elephants and non-obligate drinking *Oryx* sp. allow more detailed estimations of relative environmental aridity to be made (Supplementary Text 2).

The  $\delta^{18}$ O difference (non-obligate drinker median = 0.0%; obligate drinker median = 1.7%, difference = 1.7%) between these taxa is 6.0% lower than that found between modern equids/camels (median = 0.7%) and Arabian oryx (8.4%) in central Arabia today (difference = 7.7%), demonstrating that conditions were considerably wetter in the region's past. This difference is compared to  $\delta^{18}$ O data sets of obligate drinking and non-obligate drinking mammals



Fig. 3 |  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements from the tooth enamel of fossil fauna from Ti's al Ghadah, Saudi Arabia, analysed in this study. VPDB, Vienna PeeDee Belemnite.

in present-day East Africa (where the sample size for each group exceeds n=5)<sup>34</sup> (Fig. 4) (Supplementary Text 2; Supplementary Table 9). While caution is warranted given that taxon-specific habits could vary through time, when the  $\delta^{18}$ O difference between obligate and non-obligate drinkers from Ti's al Ghadah is compared to that of modern-day Tsavo (1.7‰) and Laikipia (1.3‰), middle Pleistocene ecological conditions in the interior of Arabia appear to approximate those of a relatively humid African savannah today (Fig. 4) (Supplementary Text 2). Such a reconstruction is supported by the results of a mixed analysis of variance performed to compare the difference between obligate drinkers and non-obligate drinkers at each site (Supplementary Tables 10 and 11). While Tsavo and Laikipia show no significant difference between these groups at Ti's al Ghadah.

There is no correlation between the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values in the Ti's al Ghadah fossil data set (multiple  $R^2 = 0.04$ , P < 0.01, adjusted  $R^2 = -0.01$ , P < 0.01), indicating that access to vegetation was independent of factors affecting faunal  $\delta^{18}$ O. This is also borne out in sequential  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O analyses of selected fossil teeth that enable the identification of potential environmental seasonality or mobility. The sequential  $\delta^{13}$ C data, from all taxa, document a homogeneous source of lush C<sub>4</sub> vegetation, probably in the form of grasses, at Ti's al Ghadah (Figs. 5 and 6 and Supplementary Tables 5 and 7). This could either be linked to the persistence of C<sub>4</sub> vegetation in the western Nefud Desert or animal movements tracking seasonal availability of C4 resources. Sequential 818O provided more insights in this regard; the  $\delta^{18}$ O of Oryx sp. documents clear, sigmoidal fluctuations usually associated with seasonal variations in regional environmental conditions rather than the use of different water sources<sup>35,40</sup>—in this case, seasonal variation in the evaporative stresses placed on plants consumed (Fig. 5). Similar, although dampened, sigmoidal curves can also be seen in the equid individuals sampled, suggesting seasonal changes in the level of evaporation affecting the drinking water imbibed by these individuals (Fig. 6). These results are consistent with environmental seasonality in the ranges covered by the two taxa sampled. Furthermore, the difference in the degree of acuteness of these seasonal changes between the Oryx sp. and equids further highlights the validity of using the relative magnitude  $\delta^{18}$ O distinctions between non-obligate and obligate drinking taxa as a palaeoaridity indicator.

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**



Fig. 4 |  $\delta^{18}$ O values for non-obligate and obligate drinking taxa at the East African localities of Laikipia (Kenya) and Tsavo (Kenya) reported by Blumenthal et al.<sup>34</sup>, for modern Saudi Arabia and for the middle Pleistocene Ti's al Ghadah (TAG) (Saudi Arabia) assemblage. The boxes show the median and the lower (25%) and upper (75%) quartiles; the whiskers encompass all data points within 1.5 × the interquartile range of the box.

The two P. recki specimens demonstrate very little variation in either  $\delta^{13}$ C or  $\delta^{18}$ O through the formation of the tooth, suggesting reliable access to C4 grasses and stable water bodies (Fig. 6). Given documentation of seasonal patterns in  $\delta^{18}$ O in *Oryx* sp. and equids with more limited ranges, the fact that P. recki documents limited changes suggests that these animals were migrating over much larger distances, perhaps following lake and river systems with relatively similar  $\delta^{18}$ O values. Furthermore, geomorphological insights have also suggested that the Ti's al Ghadah palaeolake would have been relatively shallow (Supplementary Text 1), further suggesting that P. recki had to range to obtain enough water throughout the year. The potential undertaking of significant, long-distance migrations in search of water and vegetation would fit with the behaviours documented among African elephants today<sup>41</sup>. Furthermore, such results are also compatible with suggestions based on palaeolake and palaeoriver modelling, using geographical information systems, which indicate that Ti's al Ghadah was not an isolated oasis, but rather part of a broader, often interconnected, chain of palaeolakes during wet intervals<sup>19</sup>.

#### Discussion

The recovery of unambiguous hominin-produced lithic material, in association with evidence from the fossil record suggestive of hominin butchery activities, reported in this article and dated to ca. 500-300 ka, represents the oldest dated hominin occupation in Arabia. While the small sample size makes detailed descriptions of the assemblage's lithic technology and cultural attributions currently difficult, they demonstrate a middle Pleistocene hominin presence in Arabia. It is considerably older than the previously oldest site of Jebel Qattar 1 at ca. 210 ka<sup>23</sup> and, alongside recent research<sup>42</sup>, highlights the benefits of systematic, detailed taphonomic study of fossil material when exploring hominin arrival in different parts of the world. In addition to recent finds of H. sapiens in the Arabian interior ca. 90 ka<sup>20</sup>, the Ti's al Ghadah evidence highlights that the focus on Pleistocene Homo expansions should not solely be limited to Eurasia, Africa and the Levant. The identification of Afrotropical, Saharo-Arabian and Palaearctic fauna<sup>12-15</sup> in association with hominin presence also highlights the possibility of middle, and perhaps also early, Pleistocene hominin migrations into the Arabian Peninsula from Africa and Eurasia. Future systematic survey and

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**

## ARTICLES



**Fig. 5** | Sequential δ<sup>13</sup>C and δ<sup>18</sup>O measurements for *Oryx* sp. samples TAG 1551, TAG 1541, TAG 149, TAG 942 and TAG 944 from the middle Pleistocene levels of Ti's al Ghadah and one modern Arabian oryx (*O. leucoryx*) sample from the Mahazat as-Sayd Protected Area.

excavation will help to further constrain the chronology and nature of hominin dispersal into this part of the world.

The stable isotope data from fauna directly associated with these traces of hominin activity at Ti's al Ghadah provide detailed insights into palaeoaridity and palaeovegetation in this part of Arabia during periods of hominin migration. A substantial corpus of environmental data exists for the late Pleistocene (from MIS7 onwards) documenting recurrent humid episodes17,19,43,44 (Supplementary Text 5), although generally deficient knowledge of evapotranspiration and insufficient on-the-ground testing of the results of climate change models has led to limited understanding as to what 'wetter' represents in the context of regional vegetation and biomass. Meanwhile, modern Arabian landscapes, to which we might look for analogues, have been heavily modified by Holocene anthropogenic activity. The situation is even worse for the middle Pleistocene (pre-MIS6 on the MIS stage of the date mean). As Supplementary Table 13 shows (Supplementary Text 5), the majority of these three proxies from three locales (the Hoti and Al Mukalla caves in Oman and Yemen, and the alluvial fan complexes of the Hajar mountains). Only a few exist for northern Arabia, demonstrating the importance of the Ti's al Ghadah assemblage for studying environmental conditions associated with hominin incurrences

The data presented in this article highlight the presence of abundant C<sub>4</sub> grasslands and aridity levels somewhat similar to those found in East Africa today. The comparison of the stable oxygen isotopes of obligate and non-obligate drinkers has been littledeveloped beyond Africa, yet we hope to have shown in this article that this methodology could and should be applied to other parts of Asia, such as the Thar Desert, central Asia, and eastern Asia to develop more detailed understandings of hominin adaptations to semi-arid and arid environments in these parts of the world. The data reported in this article also fit with palaeoecological reconstructions based on the fossil taxa identified at Ti's al Ghadah<sup>12-15</sup> (Supplementary Table 2). The presence of various grassland taxa (Palaeoloxodon and an alcelaphine), fish and birds with strong affinities towards water (for example, Anas and Tachybaptus) imply the presence of expansive grasses and large perennial water sources12-15 (Supplementary Fig. 3 and Supplementary Table 2). The presence of a large felid (Panthera gombaszoegensis) and hyena indicate that the western Nefud Desert was also host to a substantial prey biomass<sup>13,14</sup>. Alongside evidence from sequential isotopic analysis of the wideranging P. recki reported in this article, attainment of lake sequences should also help to clarify wider regional environmental trends during the earliest arrival of hominins into Arabia. However, overall,

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**



Fig. 6 | Sequential  $\delta^{18}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements for equid samples SGS180, SGS57 and SGS1094 and *P. recki* samples TAG14 301 and TAG14 129 from the middle Pleistocene levels of Ti's al Ghadah.

early and middle Pleistocene hominin populations would seemingly have been able to extend not only into the Levant, but also deep into the Arabian Peninsula, potentially making use of access to a combination of African and Eurasian medium- and large-sized mammals, as well as similar grassland habitats<sup>4,15,45</sup>.

The identification of late Pleistocene *H. sapiens* and middle Pleistocene hominins in the interior of the Arabian Peninsula opens up the possibility of exploring the adaptive capacities of different hominin taxa in what is, today, an extreme environment. The protoglobal distribution of non-*H. sapiens* middle Pleistocene *Homo*, as

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**

well as growing evidence for its cultural capacity<sup>5,6</sup>, have been argued to represent a potential adaptive threshold, demonstrating the exploitation of new environments (for example, see Morwood et al. 7 and Potts <sup>46</sup>). In line with previous suggestions<sup>4–15</sup>, we demonstrate that middle Pleistocene hominin expansions into the Arabian Peninsula would not necessarily have required new innovations or adaptations to harsh desertic aridity and imply a range expansion similar to other large- and medium-sized mammal populations moving between Africa, the Levant and Eurasia<sup>15</sup>. By contrast, although our own species was also reliant on periods of increased precipitation to access the Arabian Peninsula<sup>20</sup>, it appears to have had a wide geographical spread<sup>20,21,47</sup>, penetrating further into the dune fields and living under conditions that were perhaps harsher than their middle Pleistocene predecessors<sup>16,48</sup>. Recent research in the Kalahari and Namib Deserts of southern Africa has also highlighted that our species was potentially uniquely able to occupy arid regions during periods of limited surface water in the late Pleistocene<sup>49,50</sup>. Future work, and the application of palaeoenvironmental methodologies akin to that developed in this study, should enable further testing as to whether our species is ecologically unique within the genus Homo.

#### Methods

**Lithic and faunal analysis.** Lithic artefacts were recovered from Unit 5 of trench 6. The lithic material and debitage was measured, recorded and drawn following previously published protocols<sup>51</sup>.

Fossil identification and analysis was conducted at the Australian National University and the University of New South Wales, Australia, and facilitated by comparative osteological material. Each specimen was examined by eve and hand lens (×10-20), and at different angles to identify fine-scale surface modifications that only become apparent at certain angles of light exposure. Bone surface modifications, such as tooth and percussion marks, were analysed and recorded following standard methodologies for taphonomic analysis of fossil faunal assemblages (for example, see Capaldo and Blumenschine<sup>52</sup> and Fisher<sup>53</sup>). Cut marks are defined as V-shaped grooves and are often accompanied by features such as shoulder effect, flaking, and microstriations<sup>54</sup>, and were considered when analysing modifications in this study. Markings suspected of being cut marks were further inspected by scanning electron microscopy (SEM) (Supplementary Text 4). Notches were defined as circular to semicircular breaks in the edge of midshaft fragments and are typically produced by both hominins and large carnivores when exploiting within bone nutrients (that is, marrow)<sup>5</sup> Dynamic loading forces associated with hammerstone percussion tend to produce notches that are wider and shallower than those generated by carnivores, allowing notches to be quantitatively differentiated. Notch morphology was determined following the protocol described in Capaldo and Blumenschine<sup>52</sup>; notches were compared to those generated by carnivores, unmodified hammerstones and modified hammerstones under experimental settings<sup>52,55</sup> (Supplementary Fig. 13) (Supplementary Text 4).

Stable isotope analysis. Tooth enamel samples were selected from the available fauna from deposits at Ti's al Ghadah dated to ca. 300–500 ka (Supplementary Texts 1 and 2; Supplementary Table 3). Fossil equids, extinct elephants and hartebeest were targeted for stable oxygen isotope measurement as abundant obligate drinkers, while *Oryx* sp. comprise the non-obligate drinker sample from the site (Supplementary Text 2). To provide a modern baseline estimate of aridity in Saudi Arabia for these taxa,  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements were made on modern equids (*Equus ferus caballus*) (n=4) and Arabian camels (*Camelus dromedarius*) (n=2) reliant on oasis water and compared to the  $\delta^{18}$ O of modern samples of Arabian oryx (*Oryx leucoryx*) (n=7) from the same region (Supplementary Text 2; Supplementary Table 4). Sequential  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O was also measured on two extinct elephant molars, three equids and five *Oryx* fossil teeth (Supplementary Texts 1 and 2). Fourier-transform infrared spectroscopy was used to assess enamel preservation (Supplementary Text 3).

Twenty-one samples were selected for stable carbon and oxygen isotope analysis of tooth enamel from the available fossil material from Unit 5 at Ti's al Ghadah. All teeth that could be confidently identified from excavations by the Palaeodeserts team between 2013 and 2014, as well as excavations by the Saudi Geological Survey in 2011 (Supplementary Table 3), were sampled. We selected five *Oryx*, three *Equus* and two *P. recki* teeth for additional, sequential analysis based on their completeness and robustness to endure additional sampling (Supplementary Tables 3 and 5–7). The five fossil *Oryx* specimens were, in turn, compared to sequential samples from one modern Arabian oryx (Supplementary Tables 4 and 8) to provide a modern baseline for seasonal changes in  $\delta^{18}$ O in this non-obligate drinker.

All teeth or teeth fragments were cleaned using air abrasion to remove any adhering external material. Enamel powder for bulk analysis was obtained using gentle abrasion with a diamond-tipped drill along the full length of the buccal

All enamel powder was pretreated to remove organic or secondary carbonate contaminates. This consisted of a series of washes in 1.5% sodium hypochlorite for 60 min, followed by three rinses in purified  $H_2O$  and centrifuging, before 0.1 M acetic acid was added for 10 min, followed by another three rinses in purified  $H_2O$  (as per Sponheimer et al.<sup>56</sup> and Lee-Thorp et al.<sup>57</sup>). Following reaction with 100% phosphoric acid, gases evolved from the samples were analysed to establish their carbon and oxygen isotopic composition using a Thermo Gasbench 2 connected to a Thermo Delta V Advantage Mass Spectrometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific) at the Department of Archaeology, Max Planck Institute for the Science of Human History. Stable carbon and oxygen isotope values were compared against international standards (NBS 19, MERCK) registered by the International Atomic Energy Agency. Replicate analysis of optical emission spectrometry standards <sup>18</sup>O. Overall measurement precision was studied through the measurement of repeat extracts from a bovid tooth enamel standard ( $n=20, \pm 0.2\%$  for  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\pm 0.3\%$ ).

The relationship between  $\delta^{18}O$  and site and group (obligate and non-obligate drinkers) was determined using a mixed Site\*Group analysis of variance comparative test, followed by post hoc Tukey's pairwise comparisons. Statistical regression analyses were undertaken to discern the statistical correlation between  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{18}O$  at Ti's al Ghadah. All statistical analyses were conducted using the free software environment  $R^{58}$ .

**Reporting Summary.** Further information on research design is available in the Nature Research Reporting Summary linked to this article.

#### Data availability

All data generated or analysed during this study are included in the published article and its supplementary information files.

Received: 25 May 2018; Accepted: 15 September 2018;

#### References

- 1. Gamble, C. Timewalkers: The Prehistory of Global Colonization (Alan Sutton, Gloucester, 1993).
- 2. Gamble, C. Settling the Earth: The Archaeology of Deep Human History (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 2013).
- 3. Roberts, P. & Stewart, B. A. Defining the 'generalist specialist' niche for Pleistocene Homo sapiens. Nat. Hum. Behav. 2, 542–550 (2018).
- Dennell, R. & Roebroeks, W. An Asian perspective on early human dispersal from Africa. *Nature* 438, 1099–1104 (2005).
- Joordens, J. C. A. et al. *Homo erectus* at Trinil on Java used shells for tool production and engraving. *Nature* 518, 228–231 (2016).
- Hoffman, D. L. et al. U-Th dating of carbonate crusts reveals Neandertal origin of Iberial cave art. *Science* 359, 912–915 (2018).
- Morwood, M. J., O'Sullivan, P. B., Aziz, F. & Raza, A. Fission-track ages of stone tools and fossils on the east Indonesian island of Flores. *Nature* 392, 173–176 (1998).
- Zhu, R. X. et al. Early evidence of the genus *Homo* in East Asia. J. Hum. Evol. 55, 1075–1085 (2008).
- 9. Parfitt, S. A. et al. Early Pleistocene human occupation at the edge of the boreal zone in northwest Europe. *Nature* **466**, 229–233 (2010).
- Jennings, R. P. et al. The greening of Arabia: multiple opportunities for human occupation in the Arabian Peninsula during the late Pleistocene inferred from an ensemble of climate model simulations. *Quat. Int* 382, 181–199 (2015).
- Fleitmann, D., Burns, S. J., Neff, U., Mangini, A. & Matter, A. Changing moisture sources over the last 333,000 years in northern Oman from fluid-inclusion evidence in speleothems. *Quat. Res.* 60, 223–232 (2003).
- 12. Thomas, H. et al. First Pleistocene faunas from the Arabian Peninsula: An Nafud desert, Saudi Arabia. C. R. Acad. Sci. II **326**, 145–152 (1998).
- 13. Stimpson, C. M. et al. Stratified Pleistocene vertebrates with a new record of a jaguar-sized pantherine (*Panthera cf. gombaszogensis*) from northern Saudi Arabia. *Quat. Int.* **382**, 168–180 (2015).
- Stimpson, C. M. et al. Middle Pleistocene vertebrate fossils from the Nefud Desert, Saudi Arabia:implications for biogeography and palaeoecology. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 143, 13–36 (2016).
- Stewart, M. et al. Middle and late Pleistocene mammal fossils of Arabia and surrounding regions: implications for biogeography and hominin dispersals. *Quat. Int.* https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quaint.2017.11.052 (2017).
- Rosenberg, T. M. et al. Middle and late Pleistocene humid periods recorded in palaeolake deposits of the Nafud desert, Saudi Arabia. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 70, 109–123 (2013).

#### **NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION**

- 17. Parton, A. et al. Alluvial fan records from southeast Arabia reveal multiple windows for human dispersal. *Geology* **43**, 295–298 (2015).
- Groucutt, H. S. et al. Human occupation of the Arabian Empty Quarter during MIS 5: evidence from Mundafan Al-Buhayrah, Saudi Arabia. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 119, 116–135 (2015).
- Breeze, P. S. et al. Palaeohydrological corridors for hominin dispersals in the Middle East ~250–70,000 years ago. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 144, 155–185 (2016).
- Groucutt, H. S. et al. *Homo sapiens* in Arabia by 85,000 years ago. *Nat. Ecol. Evol.* 2, 800–809 (2018).
- 21. Armitage, S. J. et al. The southern route "out of Africa": evidence for an early expansion of modern humans into Arabia. *Science* **331**, 453–456 (2011).
- 22. Petraglia, M. et al. Middle Paleolithic occupation on a Marine Isotope Stage 5 lakeshore in the Nefud Desert, Saudi Arabia. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **30**, 1555–1559 (2011).
- Petraglia, M. D. et al. Hominin dispersal into the Nefud Desert and middle Palaeolithic settlement along the Jubbah Palaeolake, northern Arabia. *PLoS* ONE 7, e49840 (2012).
- 24. Scerri, E. M. L. et al. Middle to late Pleistocene human habitation in the Nefud Desert, Saudi Arabia. *Quat. Int.* **382**, 200–214 (2015).
- Lee-Thorp, J. A., Sealy, J. C. & van der Merwe, N. J. Stable carbon isotope ratio differences between bone collagen and bone apatite, and their relationship to diet. J. Archaeol. Sci. 16, 585–599 (1989).
- Lee-Thorp, J. A., van der Merwe, N. J. & Brain, C. K. Isotopic evidence for dietary differences between two extinct baboon species from Swartkrans. *J. Hum. Evol.* 18, 183–189 (1989).
- Levin, N. E., Simpson, S. W., Quade, J., Cerling, T. E. & Frost, S. R. in *The Geology of Early Humans in the Horn of Africa* (eds Quade, J. & Wynn, J. G.) 215–234 (Geological Society of America, Boulder, 2008).
- Calvin, M. & Benson, A. A. The path of carbon in photosynthesis. Science 107, 476–480 (1948).
- Hatch, M., Slack, C. R. & Johnson, H. S. Further studies on a new pathway of photosynthetic carbon dioxide fixation in sugar-cane and its occurrence in other plant species. *Biochem. J.* 102, 417–422 (1967).
- Tieszen, L. L. Natural variations in the carbon isotope values of plants: implications for archaeology, ecology, and paleoecology. J. Archaeol. Sci. 18, 227–248 (1991).
- Flanagan, L. B., Comstock, J. P. & Ehleringer, J. R. Comparison of modeled and observed environmental influences on the stable oxygen and hydrogen isotope composition of leaf water in *Phaseolus vulgaris L. Plant Physiol.* 96, 588–596 (1991).
- 32. Barbour, M. M. Stable oxygen isotope composition of plant tissue: a review. *Funct. Plant Biol.* **34**, 83–94 (2007).
- 33. Levin, N. E., Cerling, T. E., Passey, B. H., Harris, J. M. & Ehleringer, J. R. A stable isotope aridity index for terrestrial environments. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci.* USA 103, 11201–11205 (2006).
- Blumenthal, S. A. et al. Aridity and hominin environments. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 114, 7331–7336 (2017).
- Balasse, M. Reconstructing dietary and environmental history from enamel isotopic analysis: time resolution of intra-tooth sequential sampling. *Int. J. Osteoarchaeol.* 12, 155–165 (2002).
- 36. Roberts, P. et al. Fruits of the forest: human stable isotope ecology and rainforest adaptations in late Pleistocene and Holocene (~36 to 3 ka) Sri Lanka. J. Hum. Evol. 106, 102–118 (2017).
- 37. Pineda, A. et al. Trampling versus cut marks on chemically altered surfaces: an experimental approach and archaeological application at the Barranc de la Boella site (la Canonja, Tarragona, Spain). J. Archaeol. Sci. 50, 84–93 (2014).
- Pickering, T. R. et al. Taphonomy of ungulate ribs and the consumption of meat and bone by 1.2-million-year-old hominins at Olduvai Gorge, Tanzania. J. Archaeol. Sci. 40, 1295–1309 (2013).
- Sponheimer, M. & Lee-Thorp, J. A. Isotopic evidence for the diet of an early hominid, Australopithecus africanus. Science 283, 368–370 (1999).
- Sponheimer, M. & Lee-Thorp, J. A. The oxygen isotope composition of mammalian enamel carbonate from Morea Estate, South Africa. *Oecologia* 126, 153–157 (2001).
- 41. Cerling, T. E. et al. Stable isotopes in elephant hair document migration patterns and diet changes. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **103**, 371–373 (2006).
- 42. Ingicco, T. et al. Earliest known hominin activity in the Philippines by 709 thousand years ago. *Nature* 557, 233–237 (2018).
- Parker, A. G. in *The Evolution of Human Populations in Arabia:* Paleoenvironments, Prehistory and Genetics (eds Petraglia, M. D. & Rose, J. I.) 39–49 (Springer, Dordrecht, 2010).
- 44. Drake, N. A., Breeze, P. & Parker, A. Palaeoclimate in the Saharan and Arabian deserts during the middle Palaeolithic and the potential for hominin dispersals. *Quat. Int* **300**, 48–61 (2013).

- Martínez-Navarro, B. in *Human Palaeoecology in the Levantine* Corridor (eds Goren-Inbar, N. & Speth, J. D.) 37–52 (Oxbow Books, Oxford, 2004).
- 46. Potts, R. Hominin evolution in settings of strong environmental variability. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **73**, 1–13 (2013).
- Delagnes, A. et al. Inland human settlement in southern Arabia 55,000 years ago. New evidence from the Wadi Surdud middle Paleolithic site complex, western Yemen. J. Hum. Evol. 63, 452–474 (2012).
- 48. Breeze, P. Prehistory and palaeoenvironments of the western Nefud Desert, Saudi Arabia. Archaeol. Res. Asia 10, 1–16 (2017).
- Nash, D. J. et al. Going the distance: mapping mobility in the Kalahari Desert during the middle Stone Age through multi-site geochemical provenancing of silcrete artefacts. J. Hum. Evol. 96, 113–133 (2016).
- Dewar, G. & Stewart, B. A. in *Africa from MIS 6-2: Population Dynamics and Paleoenvironments* (eds Jones, S. C. & Stewart, B. A.) 195–212 (Springer, Dordrecht, 2016).
- Scerri, E. M. L., Drake, N. A., Jennings, R. & Groucutt, H. S. Earliest evidence for the structure of *Homo sapiens* populations in Africa. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 101, 207–216 (2014).
- Capaldo, S. D. & Blumenschine, R. J. A quantitative diagnosis of notches made by hammerstone percussion and carnivore gnawing on bovid long bones. *Am. Antiq.* 59, 724–748 (1994).
- Fisher, J. W. Jr Bone surface modifications in zooarchaeology. J. Archaeol. Method Theory 2, 7–68 (1995).
- Domínguez-Rodrigo, M., de Juana, S., Galán, A. B. & Rodríguez, M. A new protocol to differentiate trampling marks from butchery cut marks. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 36, 2643–2654 (2009).
- Galán, A. B., Rodríguez, M., de Juana, S. & Domínguez-Rodrigo, M. A new experimental study on percussion marks and notches and their bearing on the interpretation of hammerstone-broken faunal assemblages. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* 36, 776–784 (2009).
- Sponheimer, M. et al. Hominins, sedges, and termites: new carbon isotope data from the Sterkfontein valley and Kruger National Park. J. Hum. Evol. 48, 301–312 (2005).
- Lee-Thorp, J. A. et al. Isotopic evidence for an early shift to C4 resources by Pliocene hominins in Chad. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 109, 20369–20372 (2012).
- 58. R Core Team R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing (R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, 2013).

#### Acknowledgements

We thank HRH Prince Sultan bin Salman, President of the Saudi Commission for Tourism & National Heritage (SCTH) and Vice Presidents A. Ghabban and J. Omar for permission to conduct this study. This project was funded by the European Research Council (grant no. 295719 to M.D.P.), the Max Planck Society, and the SCTH. Z. Nawab, former President of the Saudi Geological Survey, provided research support. We thank A. Gledhill, University of Bradford, for his assistance with the stable isotope analysis. We thank K. Privat of the Mark Wainwright Analytical Centre (UNSW) for assistance with SEM imagery. H.S.G. and E.M.L.S. acknowledge the British Academy for funding. M.S acknowledges The Leakey Foundation for funding. ANA acknowledges the Deanship of Scientific Research at the King Saud University through Vice Deanship of Research Chairs for their additional funding.

#### Author contributions

P.R., M.S. and M.P. planned the project. P.R., M.S., A.N.A., P.B., H.S.G., E.M.L.S., J.L.T., J.L., J.Z. and I.S.Z. performed the experiments. P.R., M.S., A.N.A., P.B., H.S.G., E.M.L.S., J.L.T., J.L., J.Z. and I.S.Z. performed the data analysis. All authors interpreted the data. All authors wrote and provided comment on the manuscript.

#### **Competing interests**

The authors declare no competing interests.

#### **Additional information**

Supplementary information is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41559-018-0698-9.

Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.

**Correspondence and requests for materials** should be addressed to P.R. or M.S. or M.P. **Publisher's note:** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2018

# natureresearch

Patrick Roberts, Mathew Stewart, Michael Corresponding author(s): Petraglia

# **Reporting Summary**

Nature Research wishes to improve the reproducibility of the work that we publish. This form provides structure for consistency and transparency in reporting. For further information on Nature Research policies, see <u>Authors & Referees</u> and the <u>Editorial Policy Checklist</u>.

#### Statistical parameters

When statistical analyses are reported, confirm that the following items are present in the relevant location (e.g. figure legend, table legend, main text, or Methods section).

n/a	Cor	firmed
	$\square$	The exact sample size $(n)$ for each experimental group/condition, given as a discrete number and unit of measurement
	$\square$	An indication of whether measurements were taken from distinct samples or whether the same sample was measured repeatedly
	$\boxtimes$	The statistical test(s) used AND whether they are one- or two-sided Only common tests should be described solely by name; describe more complex techniques in the Methods section.
	$\boxtimes$	A description of all covariates tested
	$\square$	A description of any assumptions or corrections, such as tests of normality and adjustment for multiple comparisons
	$\boxtimes$	A full description of the statistics including <u>central tendency</u> (e.g. means) or other basic estimates (e.g. regression coefficient) AND <u>variation</u> (e.g. standard deviation) or associated <u>estimates of uncertainty</u> (e.g. confidence intervals)
	$\boxtimes$	For null hypothesis testing, the test statistic (e.g. <i>F</i> , <i>t</i> , <i>r</i> ) with confidence intervals, effect sizes, degrees of freedom and <i>P</i> value noted <i>Give P values as exact values whenever suitable.</i>
$\boxtimes$		For Bayesian analysis, information on the choice of priors and Markov chain Monte Carlo settings
$\boxtimes$		For hierarchical and complex designs, identification of the appropriate level for tests and full reporting of outcomes
$\boxtimes$		Estimates of effect sizes (e.g. Cohen's d, Pearson's r), indicating how they were calculated
	$\boxtimes$	Clearly defined error bars State explicitly what error bars represent (e.g. SD, SE, CI)
		Our web collection on statistics for biologists may be useful,

## Software and code

Policy information about availability of computer code

Data collection	Thermo Scientific Mass Spectrometry Software.	
Data analysis	R Core Team, 2013	

For manuscripts utilizing custom algorithms or software that are central to the research but not yet described in published literature, software must be made available to editors/reviewers upon request. We strongly encourage code deposition in a community repository (e.g. GitHub). See the Nature Research guidelines for submitting code & software for further information.

#### Data

Policy information about availability of data

All manuscripts must include a data availability statement. This statement should provide the following information, where applicable:

- Accession codes, unique identifiers, or web links for publicly available datasets
- A list of figures that have associated raw data
- A description of any restrictions on data availability

All teeth are stored at the Geological Survey of the Government of Saudi Arabia, Saudi Arabia and are available (with photographs) on request. All raw data has been reported in the Tables and Supplementary Information, as well as Figures 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6.

# Field-specific reporting

Please select the best fit for your research. If you are not sure, read the appropriate sections before making your selection.

Life sciences Behavioural & social sciences Ecological, evolutionary & environmental sciences

For a reference copy of the document with all sections, see <u>nature.com/authors/policies/ReportingSummary-flat.pdf</u>

# Ecological, evolutionary & environmental sciences study design

All studies must disclose on these points even when the disclosure is negative.

Study description	We studied lithic material found in direct association with fossil remains at the site of T <sup>1</sup> is al Ghadah. We also taphonomically analysed the fossil material for cutmarks and hominin presence. Finally, we undertook stable isotope analysis on preserved fossil teeth associated with the resulting hominin traces to reconstruct palaeoenvironmental conditions.
Research sample	We studied all available lithic and faunal material. We also analysed all suitably-preserved fossil teeth (n=21) from the site of T'is al Ghadah, excavated over the past decade.
Sampling strategy	As above, all lithic and faunal material was analysed. We sampled all 21 available teeth for bulk stable carbon and oxygen isotope data and also a further 11 of these teeth for sequential sampling to look at seasonal environmental changes.
Data collection	Lithic data was undertaken by HG, MP, ES, and MS over a period of one year. Taphonomic data was collected by MS over a period of two years. Isotope data was collected by PR, JZ and JLT over a period of three years.
Timing and spatial scale	The whole process of these analyses took a period of three years. The analyses or experiments are not time-dependent.
Data exclusions	No data was excluded.
Reproducibility	The lithic material was looked at by three separate specialists while the taphonomic analysis was confirmed by two separate specialists. All isotopic measurements performed on the Gasbench involve an average of 10 measurements and replicate analysis of an internal enamel standard and external internationally recognised standards.
Randomization	N/a
Blinding	N/a
Did the study involve field	d work? X Yes No

#### Field work, collection and transport

Field conditions	This is primarily a post-excavation study though some samples were collected from museum and survey fieldwork.
Location	T'is al Ghadah and Mahazat as-Sayd Protected Area
Access and import/export	All relevant permissions were obtained for palaeontological and modern reference samples from the necessary departmnts of the Government of Saudi Arabia.
Disturbance	Minimally destructive sampling was carried out on the palaeontological specimens. However, damage is minor and the teeth remain intact for future study.

# Reporting for specific materials, systems and methods

## Materials & experimental systems Methods

n/a	Involved in the study	n/a	Involved in the study
$\boxtimes$	Unique biological materials	$\boxtimes$	ChIP-seq
$\boxtimes$	Antibodies	$\boxtimes$	Flow cytometry
$\boxtimes$	Eukaryotic cell lines	$\boxtimes$	MRI-based neuroimaging
	Palaeontology		
	Animals and other organisms		
$\boxtimes$	Human research participants		
1			

### Palaeontology

Specimen provenance	T'is al Ghadah
Specimen deposition	All teeth are stored at the Geological Survey of the Government of Saudi Arabia, Saudi Arabia.
Dating methods	No new dates.

Tick this box to confirm that the raw and calibrated dates are available in the paper or in Supplementary Information.

## Animals and other organisms

Policy information about studies involving animals; ARRIVE guidelines recommended for reporting animal research

Laboratory animals	N/a
Wild animals	N/a
Field-collected samples	Dead feral horse, camel, and Oryx sp. were sampled for this study. Collected in the vicinity of T'is al Ghadah and Mahazat as-Sayd Protected Area with full permissions.