

2014

Glacial forcing of central Indonesian hydroclimate since 60,000 y B.P.

James M. Russell

Hendrik Vogel

Bronwen L. Konecky

Satria Bijaksana

Yongsong Huang

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/gsofacpubs>

Terms of Use

All rights reserved under copyright.

Citation/Publisher Attribution

Russell, J. M., Vogel, H., Konecky, B. L., Bijaksana, S., Huang, Y., Melles, M., Wattrus, N.,...King, J. W. (2014).
Glacial forcing of central Indonesian hydroclimate since 60,000 y B.P.. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*, 111(14),
5100-5105. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1402373111

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1402373111>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School of Oceanography at DigitalCommons@URI. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate School of Oceanography Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@etal.uri.edu.

Authors

James M. Russell, Hendrik Vogel, Bronwen L. Konecky, Satria Bijaksana, Yongsong Huang, Martin Melles, Nigel Wattus, Kassandra Costa, and John W. King

Glacial forcing of central Indonesian hydroclimate since 60,000 y B.P.

James M. Russell^{a,1}, Hendrik Vogel^b, Bronwen L. Konecky^a, Satria Bijaksana^c, Yongsong Huang^a, Martin Melles^d, Nigel Watruss^e, Cassandra Costa^a, and John W. King^f

^aDepartment of Geological Sciences, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912; ^bInstitute of Geological Sciences and Oeschger Centre for Climate Change Research, University of Bern, 3012 Bern, Switzerland; ^cFaculty of Mining and Petroleum Engineering, Institut Teknologi Bandung, Bandung 40132, Indonesia; ^dInstitute of Geology and Mineralogy, University of Cologne, D-50674, Cologne, Germany; ^eLarge Lakes Observatory, University of Minnesota Duluth, Duluth, MN 55812; and ^fGraduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island, Narragansett, RI 02882

Edited by Mark H. Thieme, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA, and approved February 28, 2014 (received for review February 7, 2014)

The Indo-Pacific warm pool houses the largest zone of deep atmospheric convection on Earth and plays a critical role in global climate variations. Despite the region's importance, changes in Indo-Pacific hydroclimate on orbital timescales remain poorly constrained. Here we present high-resolution geochemical records of surface runoff and vegetation from sediment cores from Lake Towuti, on the island of Sulawesi in central Indonesia, that continuously span the past 60,000 y. We show that wet conditions and rainforest ecosystems on Sulawesi present during marine isotope stage 3 (MIS3) and the Holocene were interrupted by severe drying between ~33,000 and 16,000 y B.P. when Northern Hemisphere ice sheets expanded and global temperatures cooled. Our record reveals little direct influence of precessional orbital forcing on regional climate, and the similarity between MIS3 and Holocene climates observed in Lake Towuti suggests that exposure of the Sunda Shelf has a weaker influence on regional hydroclimate and terrestrial ecosystems than suggested previously. We infer that hydrological variability in this part of Indonesia varies strongly in response to high-latitude climate forcing, likely through reorganizations of the monsoons and the position of the intertropical convergence zone. These findings suggest an important role for the tropical western Pacific in amplifying glacial–interglacial climate variability.

tropical Pacific | paleoclimate | geochemistry | paleoecology

Three major zones of deep atmospheric convection energize the Earth's moisture and energy budgets: tropical Africa, the Amazon, and the Indo-Pacific. Convection over the Indo-Pacific warm pool (IPWP) is by far the largest of these, and exerts enormous influence on global climate through its role in coupled ocean–atmosphere circulation (1, 2) and its influence on the concentration of atmospheric water vapor, which is the Earth's most important greenhouse gas (3). Despite the region's importance, variations in Indo-Pacific hydroclimate on orbital timescales remain poorly constrained.

Climate models and theory predict that Indo-Pacific hydrology responds strongly to, and interacts with, glacial–interglacial climate variations (4–6). This prediction is partly borne out by terrestrial sedimentary records that suggest widespread drying across the IPWP during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM; refs. 7, 8) between 19,000 and 26,000 y ago (9). Unfortunately, many of these records are relatively short and discontinuous, limiting their utility to detect the relationship between regional climate change and global forcing. New, long, high-resolution oxygen isotopic ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$) records from speleothems from northern Borneo paint a very different picture of Indo-Pacific paleoclimate, suggesting that orbital-scale changes in regional convection are dominantly controlled by changes in equatorial insolation driven by orbital precession (10). On the other hand, marine sedimentary runoff records from southern Java imply little change in IPWP hydrology at glacial–interglacial timescales (11). Given this disagreement, new records—especially long proxy records that respond strongly to precipitation—are needed to understand

the response of Indo-Pacific climate to glacial–interglacial climate change and forcing.

Indonesia lies at the center of the IPWP and has thousands of lakes, the sediments of which represent a largely untapped archive of the region's hydrologic history. Here we present a 60 thousand y (ky) B.P. record of IPWP hydrology from the sediments of Lake Towuti, located on the island of Sulawesi in central Indonesia (Fig. 1). Lake Towuti is the largest tectonic lake in Indonesia, and at 205 m depth, its sediments preserve perhaps the longest and most continuous terrestrial record of climate available from the region. In 2007–2010, we recovered 13 sediment piston cores from Lake Towuti; here we focus on the most continuous radiocarbon-dated stratigraphy from core TOW10-9B (*Material and Methods* and Fig. S1 and Tables S1 and S2).

Study Site and Proxy Interpretations

Sulawesi lies at the center of the humid, unstable air mass overlying the IPWP, and its climate responds strongly to large-scale changes in regional atmospheric circulation and sea surface temperature associated with the Australian–Indonesian summer monsoon (AISM). The Lake Towuti basin receives ~2,700 mm of precipitation annually and is surrounded by dense closed-canopy rainforest (12). This region experiences a wet season from December to May when the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ) migrates southward over Indonesia (13). During this

Significance

Climate variability in the tropical western Pacific exerts enormous influence on global climate, yet its history remains poorly constrained. We present the region's first continuous terrestrial sedimentary record of surface hydrology and vegetation spanning the last 60,000 y based upon geochemical data from Lake Towuti, Indonesia. Our data demonstrate that wet conditions and rainforest ecosystems present during the Holocene and during marine isotope stage 3 were interrupted by severe drying between ~33,000 and 16,000 y B.P., when high-latitude ice sheets expanded and global temperatures cooled. These findings indicate an important role for glacial boundary conditions in pacing tropical western Pacific climate change, and highlight the potential for the western Pacific to amplify global climate change during glacial–interglacial cycles.

Author contributions: J.M.R., S.B., and N.W. designed research; J.M.R., H.V., B.L.K., S.B., Y.H., M.M., N.W., K.C., and J.W.K. performed research; J.M.R., H.V., B.L.K., Y.H., M.M., K.C., and J.W.K. analyzed data; and J.M.R., H.V., B.L.K., and S.B. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Data deposition: Data has been deposited in National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's National Climatic Data Center repository for paleoclimatology. See Tables S1 and S2 for a list of accession numbers.

¹To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: James_Russell@brown.edu.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1402373111/-DCSupplemental.

across a broader range of changing boundary conditions of the past 60 ky B.P.

Previous work suggests that the exposure of the Sunda Shelf could play an important role in transmitting glacial–interglacial signals from the high latitude to the IPWP (30, 35). In many climate model simulations, the exposed land cools strongly relative to the ocean, and, together with reductions in atmospheric latent heating and humidity due to the replacement of ocean with land, weakens atmospheric convection and induces widespread drying over Indonesia (34). Although Sunda Shelf exposure during sea level lowstands could contribute to the dry conditions we observe on Sulawesi during the LGM, the history of shelf exposure is very different from the pattern of climate variability we observe at Lake Towuti. In particular, the shelf had nearly the same exposed area during the LGM and MIS3 (Fig. 2C; 2.3 vs. 1.9×10^6 km², respectively), yet we observe large differences in Sulawesi hydrology between these stages. Thus, shelf exposure alone did not trigger the threshold responses in rainfall that we observe at Towuti. Rather, to explain our observations this mechanism would necessitate large threshold responses in regional rainfall to small changes in the area of exposed land. This possibility has not been investigated in climate models. Moreover, although Sulawesi is not connected to the Sunda shelf and its climate might be less sensitive to shelf exposure, the Borneo $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record also shows little influence of shelf exposure despite the location of that site on Sundaland (10). Taken together, these data suggest shelf exposure alone cannot impose a dry climate across this region.

Alternatively, Sulawesi hydrology could be highly sensitive to changes in global temperature, GHGs, and/or remote forcing by the ice sheets. Lower GHGs reduce precipitation rates in convective regions such as the IPWP through their control on global temperatures and atmospheric water vapor concentrations (4, 35, 36), yet climate model experiments suggest that average tropical precipitation declined by only $\sim 10\%$ during the LGM (35). Although our data cannot precisely quantify past precipitation changes, the shift from rainforest to more open terrestrial ecosystems almost certainly requires a $>10\%$ reduction in regional precipitation in light of the global distribution of C₄ grasslands. The IPWP could have experienced a stronger GHG-driven reduction in precipitation than the tropical mean due to regional temperature and humidity changes; however, regional sea surface temperature records indicate similar temperatures during MIS3 and MIS2 (Fig. 2A) when Towuti experienced large changes. Thus, although GHG forcing may have contributed to drying at Lake Towuti, it is unlikely to be the primary forcing of the pattern of hydrologic change observed between MIS3 and the Holocene.

On the other hand, the drying observed at Lake Towuti from late MIS3 to the LGM closely tracks changes in global ice volume (Fig. 2D; ref. 9), suggesting a strong remote forcing by the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets during the LGM. Indeed, glacial–interglacial variations in proxy data from Lake Towuti are most strongly correlated to changes in ice volume/sea level among these glacial–interglacial forcings (Table S3). Climate modeling studies indicate that both albedo and orographic forcing by the LGM ice sheet can alter tropical Pacific climate. Albedo forcing can alter the interhemispheric thermal gradient, shifting the ITCZ southward (37), and topographic forcing can alter westerly flow over the North Pacific, intensify northern trade wind circulation, and also force the ITCZ to migrate southward (6). The change in tropical winds and moisture convergence shift the locus of western tropical Pacific precipitation southward from equatorial sites such as Lake Towuti.

Although threshold responses of tropical Pacific precipitation to ice sheet forcing have not been explicitly investigated in modeling studies, the Pacific climate has been shown to be extremely sensitive to differences in ice sheet topography. Simulations of the

LGM climate with the Community Climate System Model 3 with differing ice sheet topography can produce very different patterns of atmospheric circulation and temperature over the northern Pacific as well as differences in tropical Pacific SST gradients (38). Given this sensitivity, we suggest that the growth of the Laurentide Ice Sheet during late MIS3 and MIS2 could have triggered a threshold response of the Pacific ITCZ, causing the abrupt changes we observe in Lake Towuti's hydrology. Northwesterly flow from the east Asian winter monsoon, which is also sensitive to remote forcing from the northern ice sheets, strengthened during late MIS3 and the LGM (39), and could also contribute to a southward shift in the locus of precipitation in the region, suppressing rainfall during Sulawesi's rainy season. Although much of northern Australia was dry during the LGM (8), speleothem records from Flores do suggest a southward shift of the ITCZ during the LGM (40), as does a wet MIS2 climate observed at Papua New Guinea (41). Existing data are too sparse to fully document the spatial patterns of IPWP climate during the last 60 ky B.P., and it is certainly possible that the threshold behavior we observe in Sulawesi could result from nonlinear interactions between multiple glacial–interglacial forcings. However, these regional patterns suggest that dynamical changes in the atmospheric circulation, potentially driven by northern high-latitude ice sheet forcing, exert a strong influence on orbital-scale changes in western tropical Pacific precipitation, as suggested by climate modeling experiments (4). Future modeling experiments could better assess thresholds and nonlinear interactions among these forcings in the western Pacific.

Our data also highlight the importance of glacial–interglacial changes in hydroclimate in structuring the vegetation on Sulawesi, one of the most biologically complex and diverse regions on Earth. Glacial–interglacial sea level variations are thought to play a dominant role in the phytogeography of this region through the expansion of land surface areas available for terrestrial ecosystems during Sunda Shelf exposure (42, 43). Indeed, modeling studies of Indonesian biomes suggest that wet evergreen lowland forests are currently in a refugial stage due to the flooding of the Shelf and geographic constraints on plant distributions (42). This stands in contrast to regions in which glacial climate change drove ecological bottlenecks. Our $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{wax}}$ data challenge this prediction, and instead shows that Sulawesi rainforest contracted substantially in a relatively arid glacial climate. This would suggest that glacial–interglacial variations in both climate and geography play an important role in structuring Southeast Asian evergreen forests, which may migrate between climate refugia during glacial and geographic refugia during interglacials.

Records of surface runoff and vegetation from Lake Towuti highlight the strong sensitivity of Sulawesi hydrology and ecosystems to glacial–interglacial climate forcing and particularly forcing from the high-latitude ice sheets. The similarity of regional climate during the Holocene and MIS3, and the abrupt transitions into and out of MIS2, implies that central Indonesian hydrology can exhibit nonlinear, threshold responses to glacial climate forcing, tipping rapidly between wet interglacial and dry glacial climates. Although existing records are inadequate to fully evaluate the history of Indo-Pacific hydrology at glacial–interglacial timescales, such behavior, if widespread, could amplify climate change and ice sheet growth during glaciations through atmospheric water vapor feedbacks and help to synchronize abrupt temperature changes during glacial transitions.

Materials and Methods

Sediment cores were recovered from Lake Towuti using a modified Kullenberg piston corer with core-site selection guided by a high-resolution seismic stratigraphy. Sediment core IDLE-TOW10-9B (abbreviated TOW-9) was recovered from 154 m water depth and is 1,156 cm long. The age model for core TOW-9 is based on 23 radiocarbon dates yielding average sedimentation rates of 19 cm ky⁻¹ (SI Materials and Methods). We carried out high-resolution

elemental analysis using an ITRAX XRF core scanner equipped with a Cr tube. Selected samples were also prepared for elemental analysis using flux fusion and measured on an inductively coupled plasma atomic emission spectrometer (FF-ICP-AES). Ti counts measured by XRF were corrected for water content variations and other matrix effects and show a strong correlation to Ti concentrations measured by FF-ICP-AES (*SI Materials and Methods*).

We also measured the carbon isotopic composition ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$) of long-chain *n*-alkanoic acids (C_{26} , C_{28} , and C_{30}), components of terrestrial leaf waxes. Lipids were extracted by accelerated solvent extraction (Dionex) with $\text{CH}_2\text{Cl}_2\text{:MeOH}$ (9:1). Alkanoic acids were purified from the resulting extract, methylated, and the fatty acid methyl esters were analyzed by gas

chromatography–isotope ratio mass spectrometry (*SI Materials and Methods*). All $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{wax}}$ data are corrected for the isotopic composition of the methyl group added during methylation. The pooled SE of samples measured in triplicate or greater is 0.47‰. See *SI Materials and Methods* for detailed analytical procedures.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank Gerald Tamuntuan, Satrio Wicaksono, and PT Vale Indonesia for field assistance; and David Murray, Joe Orchardo, and Rafael Tarozo for laboratory assistance. This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant 0902845 (to J.M.R.). Research permits for this work were granted by the Indonesian Ministry of Research and Technology (RISTEK).

- Clement AC, Cane MA, Seager R (2001) An orbitally driven tropical source for abrupt climate change. *J Clim* 14:2369–2375.
- Chiang JCH (2009) The tropics in paleoclimate. *Ann Rev Earth Plan Sci* 37:20.21–20.35.
- Pierrehumbert RT (1999) Subtropical water vapor as a mediator of rapid global climate changes. *Mechanisms of Global Climate Change at Millennial Time Scales*. Geophysical Monograph Series, eds Clark PU, Webb RS, Keigwin LD (American Geophysical Union, Washington, DC), Vol 112, pp 339–361.
- Boos WR (2012) Thermodynamic scaling of the hydrological cycle at the Last Glacial Maximum. *J Clim* 25:992–1006.
- Clement AC, Hall A, Broccoli AJ (2004) The importance of precessional signals in the tropics. *Clim Dyn* 22:327–341.
- Timmermann A, Justino F, Jin F-F, Krebs U, Goosse H (2004) Surface temperature control in the North and tropical Pacific during the last glacial maximum. *Clim Dyn* 23:353–370.
- De Deckker P, Tapper NJ, van der Kaars S (2002) The status of the Indo-Pacific Warm Pool and adjacent land at the Last Glacial Maximum. *Global Planet Change* 35:25–35.
- Reeves JM, et al. (2013) Palaeoenvironmental change in tropical Australasia over the last 30,000 years – A synthesis by the OZ-INTIMATE group. *Quat Sci Rev* 74:97–114.
- Clark PU, et al. (2009) The Last Glacial Maximum. *Science* 325(5941):710–714.
- Carolin SA, et al. (2013) Varied response of western Pacific hydrology to climate forcings over the last glacial period. *Science* 340(6140):1564–1566.
- Mohtadi M, et al. (2011) Glacial to Holocene swings of the Australian-Indonesian monsoon. *Nat Geosci* 4:540–544.
- Hope G (2001) Environmental change in the Late Pleistocene and later Holocene at Wanda site, Soroako, South Sulawesi, Indonesia. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol* 191:129–145.
- Aldrian E, Susanto RD (2003) Identification of three dominant rainfall regions within Indonesia and their relationship to sea surface temperature. *Int J Climatol* 23:1435–1452.
- Hendon HH (2003) Indonesian rainfall variability: Impacts of ENSO and local air–sea interaction. *J Clim* 16:1775–1790.
- Haug GH, Hughen KA, Sigman DM, Peterson LC, Röhl U (2001) Southward migration of the intertropical convergence zone through the Holocene. *Science* 293(5533):1304–1308.
- O’Leary MH (1981) Carbon isotope fractionation in plants. *Phytochemistry* 20:553–567.
- Hatch MD (1987) C4 photosynthesis: A unique blend of modified chemistry, anatomy, and ultrastructure. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 895:81–106.
- Bi XH, Sheng GY, Liu XH, Li C, Fu JM (2005) Molecular and carbon and hydrogen isotopic composition of *n*-alkanes in plant leaf waxes. *Org Geochem* 36:1405–1417.
- Chikaraishi Y, Naraoka H (2003) Compound-specific δD - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ analyses of *n*-alkanes extracted from terrestrial and aquatic plants. *Phytochemistry* 63(3):361–371.
- Vogts A, Moossen H, Rommerskirchen F, Rullkötter J (2009) Distribution patterns and stable carbon isotopic compositions of alkanes and alkan-1-ols from plant waxes of African rain forest and savannah C3 species. *Org Geochem* 40:1037–1054.
- Castañeda IS, et al. (2009) Wet phases in the Sahara/Sahel region and human migration patterns in North Africa. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 106(48):20159–20163.
- Hughen KA, Eglinton TI, Xu L, Makou M (2004) Abrupt tropical vegetation response to rapid climate changes. *Science* 304(5679):1955–1959.
- Diefendorf AF, Mueller KE, Wing SL, Koch PL, Freeman KH (2010) Global patterns in leaf ^{13}C discrimination and implications for studies of past and future climate. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 107(13):5738–5743.
- Lajtha K, Marshall JD (2007) Sources of variation in the isotopic composition of plants. *Stable Isotopes in Ecology and Environmental Sciences*, eds Michener RH, Lajtha K (Blackwell Scientific, Oxford), pp 1–21.
- Buchmann N, Kao W-Y, Ehleringer JR (1997) Influence of stand structure on carbon-13 of vegetation, soils, and canopy air within deciduous and evergreen forests in Utah, United States. *Oecologia* 110:109–119.
- Ehleringer JR, Cerling TE, Helliker BR (1997) C4 photosynthesis, atmospheric CO_2 , and climate. *Oecologia* 112:285–299.
- Hemming SR (2004) Heinrich events: Massive late Pleistocene detritus layers of the North Atlantic and their global climate imprint. *Rev Geophys* 42:RG1005.
- Stager JC, Ryves DB, Chase BM, Pausata FSR (2011) Catastrophic drought in the Afro-Asian monsoon region during Heinrich event 1. *Science* 331(6022):1299–1302.
- Griffiths M, et al. (2009) Increasing Australian-Indonesian monsoon rainfall linked to early Holocene sea-level rise. *Nat Geosci* 2:636–639.
- Wang Y, et al. (2008) Millennial- and orbital-scale changes in the East Asian monsoon over the past 224,000 years. *Nature* 451:1909–1093.
- Dam RAC, Fluin J, Suparan P, van der Kaars S (2001) Palaeoenvironmental developments in the Lake Tondano area (N. Sulawesi, Indonesia) since 33,000 yr B. P. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol* 171:147–183.
- Tierney J, et al. (2012) The influence of Indian Ocean atmospheric circulation on Warm Pool hydroclimate during the Holocene epoch. *J Geophys Res* 117:D19108.
- Moermann JW, et al. (2013) Diurnal to interannual rainfall $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ variations in northern Borneo driven by regional hydrology. *Earth Planet Sci Lett* 369–370:108–119.
- DiNezio PN, Tierney JE (2013) The effect of sea level on glacial Indo-Pacific climate. *Nat Geosci* 6:485–491.
- DiNezio PN, et al. (2011) The response of the Walker Circulation to LGM forcing: Implications for detection in proxies. *Paleoceanography* 26:PA3217.
- Held IM, Soden BJ (2006) Robust responses of the hydrological cycle to global warming. *J Clim* 19:5686–5699.
- Chiang JCH, Bitz CM (2005) Influence of high latitude ice cover on the marine intertropical convergence zone. *Clim Dyn* 25:477–496.
- Otto-Bliesner BL, et al. (2006) Last Glacial Maximum and Holocene climate in CCSM3. *J Clim* 19:2526–2544.
- Sun Y, et al. (2011) Influence of Atlantic meridional overturning circulation on the East Asian Winter Monsoon. *Nat Geosci* 5:46–49.
- Ayliffe LK, et al. (2013) Rapid interhemispheric climate links via the Australasian monsoon during the last deglaciation. *Nat Commun* 4:2908.
- Tachikawa K, et al. (2011) The precession phase of hydrological variability in the Western Pacific Warm Pool during the past 400 ka. *Quat Sci Rev* 30(25–26):3716–3727.
- Cannon CH, Morley RJ, Bush ABG (2009) The current refugial rainforests of Sundaland are unrepresentative of their biogeographic past and highly vulnerable to disturbance. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 106(27):11188–11193.
- van Welzen PC, Parnell JAN, Slik JW (2011) Wallace’s line and plant distributions: Two or three phytogeographical areas and where to group Java? *Biol J Linn Soc Lond* 103:531–545.
- Stott L, Timmermann A, Thunell R (2007) Southern Hemisphere and deep-sea warming led deglacial atmospheric CO_2 rise and tropical warming. *Science* 318(5849):435–438.
- Rosenthal Y, Oppo D, Linsley BK (2003) The amplitude and phasing of climate change during the last deglaciation in the Sulu Sea, western equatorial Pacific. *Geophys Res Lett* 30:doi:10.1029/2002GL016612.
- Schilt A, et al. (2010) Atmospheric nitrous oxide during the last 140,000 years. *Earth Planet Sci Lett* 300:33–43.
- Thompson WG, Goldstein SL (2006) A radiometric calibration of the SPECMAP time-scale. *Quat Sci Rev* 25:3207–3215.
- Waelbroeck C, et al. (2002) Sea-level and deep water temperature changes derived from benthic foraminiferal isotopic records. *Quat Sci Rev* 21:295–304.