HOW LATINA/O FAMILY VALUES IMPACT STUDENT PERSISTENCE TO COLLEGE GRADUATION: A MULTI-CASE STUDY

by

Jeremiah R. Riggs

Liberty University

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Education

Liberty University

2018

HOW LATINA/O FAMILY VALUES IMPACT STUDENT PERSISTENCE TO COLLEGE GRADUATION: A MULTI-CASE STUDY

by Jeremiah R. Riggs

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Education

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

2018

APPROVED BY:

Tracey Pritchard, Ed.D., Committee Chair

Katie E. Robinson, Ed.D., Committee Member

Diana H. Azcoitia, Ed.D., Committee Member

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this multi-case study is to discover the common family values of Latino families living in Chicago that were passed down from the parent to the child and how those values may have enabled the child to complete a four-year college degree. This study employed a multi-case qualitative study design. The participants were 12 Latina/o parents in Chicago who had at least one child who had graduated from a four-year college. Data were collected from interviews, field notes, and documents. A pattern-finding approach was used for data analysis. In this study, all participants shared family values that they believed were important to teach their children. Half of the participants each said that faith and respect were important family values. Three-fourths of the participants reported that their method of teaching their children these values was by modeling the behavior or by setting an example. Half of the participants reported that their children faced discrimination at some point during school. Of the 12 participants, 10 reported how they believed the family values they taught their children helped them overcome discrimination and other hardships.

Keywords: College graduates, community cultural wealth, families, familial capital, family values, Hispanic, Latino, race, racism, undocumented.

Dedication Page

This study is dedicated to Kim. Thank you for not just being my support and encouragement, but for being my constant example of how to love like Jesus.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Abbreviations

Critical race theory (CRT)

Latino critical theory (LatCrit)

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Overview

According to recent studies, fewer Latinos are earning bachelor's degrees. In 2014, 14.4% of Latinos 25 years or older had earned a bachelor's degree or higher (Stepler & Brown, 2016), whichis the lowest percentage compared to Asians (51.7%), Whites (33.6%), and Blacks (19.8%;Stepler & Brown, 2016). This study sought to explore the stories of 12 Latina/o parents who have at least one child who has successfully graduated from a four-year college or university. Their experiences may provide valuable insight as to why their children were successful. This study examined the phenomenon of family values and the role they may play to help Latino graduates persist to earn a degree from a four-year college or university.

This chapter begins with the background to the research. Next, I identify my motivation for completing this study and the philosophical assumptions I bring to the study. Afterward, I state the problem and its relevance to the field of education. Following the problem statement, I give the purpose statement, which states the focus and goal of the research. The significance of the study is the next section in which I describe the contributions that this study can have to the field of education. I conclude this chapter by stating the research questions and providing definitions for key terms.

Background

As I began researching, I noticed that the historical, social, and theoretical context of Latina/o college education are somewhat woven together. Current census data on Latinos and education (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012; Stepler & Brown, 2016), surveys of Latina/o parents and youths (Lopez, 2009), and research into theories as to why Latinos persist to graduate from

college (Perry & Calhoun-Butts, 2012) contain data that together are at least in part the foundation for understanding Latino college education.

Historical Context

The Pew Hispanic Center (2012) noted that the number of 18- to 24-year-old Latinas/os who are enrolled in a four-year college or university rose 20% from October 2010 (1.0 million) to October 2011 (1.2 million). This record coincides with a record high number of Latinas/os who had graduated from high school, which was 76% of 18- to 24-year-old Latinas/os in 2011 (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012). The number of Latinas/os who received a four-year college degree also reached record numbers, with 140,000 bachelor's degrees awarded (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012).

Even so, research shows that the number of Latinas/os who graduate with a bachelor's degree remains proportionately low compared to other groups (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012). Specifically, in 2010, 8.5% of bachelor degrees were awarded to Latinas/os, 10% of bachelor degrees were awarded to non-Hispanic Blacks, and 71% of bachelor degrees were awarded to non-Hispanic Whites (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012). According to census data from 2014 compiled by the Pew Hispanic Center, 14.4% of Latinos 25 years or older had earned a bachelor's degree (Stepler & Brown, 2016). The same census showed that 51.7% of Asians, 33.6% of Whites, and 19.8% of Blacks had earned a bachelor's degree (Stepler & Brown, 2016).

Social Context

Despite fewer Latino/as receiving bachelor's degrees compared to other races, Latino/as view education as important and a significant factor in future success. Lopez (2009) reported on the most recent educational survey conducted by the Pew Hispanic Center that 77% of Latina/o youths (ages 16-25), and stated that their parents believed education was important for the future

success of their children. The same report (Lopez, 2009) also stated that 89% of Latina/o youths agreed that a college degree is important, but that only 48% of Latina/o youths planned on getting a bachelor's degree or higher. The overall number of Latinos who believe a college degree is important (89%) is relatively high compared to the general public (74%;Lopez, 2009), but the percentage of Latinos who have a bachelor's degree is comparatively low compared to the general public (Stepler & Brown, 2016). Some reasons indicated in research that give insight into this attainment gap include financial pressures to take care of their family, limited English proficiency, low grades, and a belief that Latina/o students do not need a college degree for their future job (Lopez, 2009; Perry & Calhoun-Butts, 2012).

Theoretical Context

Perry and Calhoun-Butts (2012) noted that there are valuable quantitative studies that examined various theories as to the reasons why some Latinas/os are successful in college and obtain a college degree (Flores & O'Brien, 2002; McWhirter, Torres, Salgado, & Valdez, 2007; Navarro, Flores, & Worthington, 2007). There have also been qualitative studies that examined the perspectives of Latina/o college graduates (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Cavazos et al., 2010; Luna & Martinez, 2013). Cabrera and Padilla (2004) interviewed two students of Mexican heritage with the purpose of discovering the challenges the students faced in school, from kindergarten to their graduation from college. The students reported that the support of their mothers and their personal motivation were the factors that led them to succeed. Cavazos et al. (2010) conducted a study with 11 Latina/o students to determine how the students developed resiliency. Five factors were highlighted, including high educational goals, support and encouragement from parents, intrinsic motivation, internal locus of control, and high self-efficacy. Both studies examined what factors helped Latina/o college students develop academic

resilience, and both noted that parental support was a key factor in that resilience (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Cavazos et al., 2010). Luna and Martinez (2013) surveyed nine Latina/o college students who reported that their parents were influential in them being successful in their educational success. To date, however, no qualitative studies have examined the parents' perspectives of why Latino students are academically successful. This study is valuable because if educators are aware of specific examples of parental support for Latino students who have been academically successful, they may be able to better serve Latina/o families by encouraging the parents to successfully implement those family values that are present in Latino students who are academically successful.

Situation to Self

I am a White male who has taught and worked in various ethnically diverse schools, but the last six years I have worked in schools that were overwhelmingly Latino. I recognize that while I may empathize with Latino families, I cannot fully understand any adversity they have faced in their educational experiences that has been based on ethnicity.

In 14 years of classroom teaching and school-level administration, I have witnessed teachers treat students and parents of color differently than they have treated White students and parents. Some examples include expecting students of color to do poorly in the classroom, expecting parents of students of color to not help with homework, punishing students of color for behaviors for which they did not punish White students, saying that parents of students of color did not care about their children's education, and speaking in meetings that some students "just don't get it and they never will." Specifically, this was said about African-Americans and Latinas/os. As I have conducted home visits with students and their families, it has been evident that most parents who seemed removed from their child's education seemed removed for a

variety of reasons. Those reasons includedthat they had had a bad experience in school and were afraid to get involved, they were intimidated into thinking they could not help because they did not know how, or they believed it was the teacher's job to teach their child. In every visit, however, each parent always wanted the best for their child. Even though they may not have known how they should help in their child's education, they wanted their child to learn and succeed.

I used an epistemological assumption at participants' homes through interviews, field notes, and examining documents. An epistemological assumption in research requires that researchers "get as close as possible to the participants being studied" (Creswell, 2013, p. 20). Knowledge is known in the epistemological assumption through people's subjective experiences, so it is important to conduct the study where the participants live and work (Creswell, 2013).

I used a participatory worldview throughout the study. A participatory worldview is one in which researchers may seek to empower the marginalized but "plans for the social world to be changed for the better" (Creswell & Clark, 2010, p. 41). I also used a Christian worldview based on the Bible, which includes teachings regarding all people being created in God's image (Genesis 1:26-27), that people should treat others the way that they would want to be treated (Matthew 7:12; Luke 6:31), and that people should not show partiality, but instead love their neighbor as themselves (James 2:1-13).

The motivation for this study was to discover the values that Latina/o parents may have instilled in their children that contributed to their academic success. Educators could use this information to provide Latina/o parents with specific examples of family values that they can use to enable Latino students to be academically successful.

Problem Statement

The problem is that Latina/o students are graduating from college at a lower rate than the general public. In 2014, only 14.4% of Latinos 25 years or older had earned a bachelor's degree or higher, compared to 51.7% of Asians, 33.6% of Whites, and 19.8% of Blacks (Stepler & Brown, 2016). The number of Latina/o college graduates is also low compared to how many Latina/o parents think a college education is either important or very important (89%;Stepler, 2016). Recent studies (Cavazos et al., 2010; Luna & Martinez, 2013; Perry & Calhoun-Butts, 2012) have examined the stories of Latina/o college graduates. Cabrera and Padilla (2004) showed that Latina/o college graduates recognized that their parents were influential in their success, and Luna and Martinez (2013) specifically found that Latina/o college students reported that familial capital was influential in their educational success. Both studies used small samplings of college students. Cabrera and Padilla used two students and Luna and Martinez started their study with nine students. Luna and Martinez noted that "One important aspect that merits further research and exploration is Latino parental involvement in instilling educational values and teacher/school recognition of Latino parental involvement" (p. 12). There are few studies that examine the general role that familial capital has in helping Latina/o students persist to earn a college degree. There were no identified studies that provide an in-depth look from Latina/o parents on the specific role that family values have had in helping their students persist to earn a college degree.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. Family values are one component of familial capital (Valdez, 2010), which is defined as "the knowledge and understanding that are nurtured

and passed on through relationships with networks of family and friends" (Larrotta & Yamamura, 2011, p. 76). The two theories guiding this study are critical race theory (CRT) (Delgado, 1995), and Latino critical theory (LatCrit;Valdés, 1997). In education, CRT and LatCrit argue that students of color innately have and can create knowledge (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Valdez & Lugg, 2010; Yosso, 2005). Both of these theories lay the groundwork to understand the nature of the Latino, post-secondary, academic culture within the United States.

Significance of the Study

The theoretical significance of this multi-case study is that it adds the voice of Latina/o parents of college graduates to Latino critical theory. Latino critical theory has thus far been developed through storytelling (Espinoza & Harris, 1997; Lynn & Parker, 2006). This study ensures that at least one more group of stories is told.

Other studies have indicated the importance of parental support and family values regarding Latina/o students being persistent to graduate from college. Sixty-five percent of Latino youths ages 16-25 strongly agreed that their parent played an active role in their education (Lopez, 2009). As noted, the Luna and Martinez (2013) study found that Latina/o college students reported that familial capital played a role in their educational success. The nine students surveyed reported their parents and families supported them through "high expectations, encouragement in the form of advice, stories, and hard work" (p. 6). The authors admitted that more research needed to be done, especially as it related to exploring parental involvement. Yosso (2005) noted that acknowledging lesser recognized forms of cultural wealth such as familial capital brings into the classroom the capital that students of color are bringing from home. In other words, the students have familial capital—among other forms of cultural wealth—educators just need to find ways to acknowledge it in order to bring it into the

classroom. A study by Larotta and Yamamura (2011) suggested that parents use familial capital as they read with their children, which in turn builds more familial capital.

The current study sought to identify if there are common family values that can enable Latinas/os to be successful in education. Educators at all levels may be able to take the common family values this study discovered and help grow and encourage those same values in Latino families in their schools. Finding common family values may be helpful to encourage Latino families at all levels of their children's education, not just college.

Research Questions

The following research question guided this study: How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?

This question is the foundation for the interview questions that required the participants to reflect and analyze on how they raised their children, and if it affected their child's determination and persistence to attend and finish college. Studies have shown that Latina/o college students reported that their parents were influential in their college persistence and success (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Luna & Martinez, 2013). This research question helped gather the participants' perceptions about the influence of the family values that they instilled in their children, and what role the parents believe that family values had in helping their student overcome adversity in their education. The interview questions were open-ended, and there was some overlap in the answers between questions.

Sub-Questions

1. What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?

Studies show that Latina/o parents feel responsible for ensuring their child's academic success (Pew Hispanic Center, 2009; Yamamura, Martinez, & Saenz, 2010). This question sought to discover if there were specific or repeated lessons that the parent tried to teach their child to that end. This question guided me to discover if there were specific teachings to which the parents would point as the foundation of their child's academic success.

2. How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child?

While the first sub-question asked if there were specific values that the parents wanted to teach their child, this question focused on how the parents taught those values. This question sought to discover by what method the parents ensured that they were instilling the values they wanted in their children. Some studies indicate that many Latinos use oral tradition (Jasis & Ordoñez-Jasis, 2012; Larotta & Yamamura, 2011). This is an overlap of community cultural wealth, referred to as linguistic capital (Yosso, 2005).

Definitions

1. *Community cultural wealth* - Community cultural wealth is the "array of cultural knowledge, skills, abilities and contacts possessed by socially marginalized groups that often go unrecognized and unacknowledged" (Yosso, 2005, p. 69).
2. *Critical race theory* - Critical race theory (CRT) was developed in the 1970s as legal scholarship that questioned if tenets of American society "serve to subordinate minority groups" (Monaghan, 1993, p. A7). Villapondo (2004) wrote that "critical race theory and Latino critical theory are conceptual frameworks arising from legal studies that can help improve our understanding of issues related to social justice and racial inequality in society" (p. 42).

3. *Familial capital* - Familial capital is one type of community cultural wealth. Yosso (2005) described it as follows:

   > Familial capital refers to those cultural knowledges nurtured among *familia* (kin) that carry a sense of community history, memory and cultural intuition. This form of cultural wealth engages a commitment to community well-being and expands the concept of family to include a more broad [sic] understanding of kinship. (p. 79)

4. *Family values* – Family values are one component of familial capital (Valdez, 2010).
5. *Latino critical theory* - Latino critical theory (LatCrit) is a specific lens to address issues and forms of oppression in Latinos' lives (Villapondo, 2004). Race is a central construct in both CRT and LatCrit, but LatCrit acknowledges that race intersects with all other aspects of Latino identity (Villapondo, 2004).

Summary

In this chapter, I presented the disproportionate statistics for graduation rates from four-year colleges and universities for Latinas/os compare to Asians, Whites, and Blacks. The problem is that Latina/o students are graduating from college at a lower rate than the general public. In 2014, only 14.4% of Latinos 25 years or older had earned a bachelor's degree or higher compared to 51.7% of Asians, 33.6% of Whites, and 19.8% of Blacks (Stepler & Brown, 2016). The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. I hoped that this study would discover common family values that educators can use with Latino families to help students be successful in all levels of education. There is one central research question and two sub-questions that guided this multi-case study, which is an appropriate qualitative design for examining real-life stories of Latino families.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Overview

Within the theoretical framework in this chapter, I will describe Critical Race Theory (CRT), including its origination and major theorists. I will also describe the Latino critical theory (LatCrit), including its origination and major theorists. I will include an examination of the relationship between CRT and LatCrit, their effects on education, and their connection to this study. In this chapter, I will also review the related literature as it pertains to three themes: Latino educational resiliency, parental factors for Latino education in general, and familial capital, specifically.

The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. At this stage in the research, family values will be defined as "the knowledge and understanding that are nurtured and passed on through relationships with networks of family and friends" (Larrotta & Yamamura, 2011, p. 76).

The methodology for choosing which literature to use was based on three parameters: (a) peer-reviewed journals, (b) time frame, and (c) historical or otherwise significance (Closson, 2010). Peer-reviewed journals were used to ensure scholarliness. Findings from the Pew Hispanic Center and the U. S. Census Bureau were also used for basic statistics. The peer-reviewed articles used in the Literature Review were included from the years 2008 through2016. This short time frame ensured that the research was most current. The only exceptions to this were those articles that were considered historically significant. Works written by the founders of CRT and LatCrit were included, as well as articles that described the beginnings of CRT and LatCrit. Other significant works included books by Lincoln and Guba (2005), Creswell (2007),

and Merriam (2009) on qualitative research, as well as Stake (2005) and Yin (2009) on case study research and methods.

Theoretical Framework

This study is framed by two major theories that are closely related: Critical race theory (CRT) and Latino critical theory (LatCrit). Because LatCrit finds its origins in CRT, a brief explanation of CRT and its main elements is due before delving into LatCrit. When researching Latino education, one would be remiss to neglect using LatCrit as the lens for qualitative research (Delgado, 2002), especially when considering the racial implications (Pérez Huber, 2010; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001) of researching Latinas/os who have graduated from college when relatively few do so (Pew Hispanic Center, 2012).

Critical Race Theory

Critical race theory is a theoretical framework that "mixes strategy, research method, and definitional premises" (Closson, 2010, p. 262), but it has been argued that perhaps a more accurate description of it would be a worldview (Gillborn, 2006). It began as a legal theory (Closson, 2010; Delgado, 2009; Hernandez-Truyol, Harris, & Valdés, 2006) in the 1970s, but theorists such as Solórzano (1997) applied its principles to education no later than 1997.

Origination and major theorists. Hernandez-Truyol et al. (2006) wrote that there are three intellectual sources of CRT and LatCrit: American Legal Realism, Critical Legal Studies, and U.S. Third World feminism. There are certain elements of each that contributed to the beginnings of CRT. American Legal Realism was its strongest in the 1920s and 1930s (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006), and its foundations for CRT and LatCrit were "its radical skepticism about traditional legal discourse, and its desire to replace internal with external critique of that discourse" (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006, p. 172). Critical Legal Studies,

known as CLS, was a product of the 1960s (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). Crits, as they called themselves, believed that law and politics could not be separated, and that much of the law was used to legitimize the power structure (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). The U. S. Third World movement "sought to place questions of colonialism, imperialism, patriarchy, and heteropatriarchy at the center of intellectual analysis rather than at the periphery" (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006, p. 177). The actions of the Third World movement for change resulted in colleges and universities beginning women's and ethnic studies programs (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). Eventually, this led to affirmative action. Each of these movements had intellectual effects on the beginnings of critical race theory, and in turn, on Latino critical theory.

There are three stories of CRT's origins: the Harvard story, the Berkeley story, and the Los Angeles story, all as told by Delgado (2009), one of the early founders of CRT (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006; Taylor, 2008). The first story occurred in 1981, after Derrick Bell resigned from Harvard University. Bell resigned because Harvard had not hired an African American female law professor in Bell's 23-year tenure (Closson, 2010). Upon Bell's resignation, Harvard chose a White professor to teach the class on race law that Bell had formerly taught. The Black students boycotted the course and secured permission from the university to have an alternative, non-credit course that was held on weekends. This course consisted of talks from visiting professors. Many of those professors and some of the students became key figures in the critical race theory movement (Delgado, 2009). The second story happened on the west coast at the University of California, Berkeley. Around the Fall of 1986, some law students started the Boalt Hall Coalition for a Diverse Faculty. They invited professors to present papers on reasons to hire diverse faculty, but the university was slow to do so. The students led a strike that expanded to several other schools (Delgado, 2009). The third story took place in 1987, following the two

aforementioned student movements. When the Critical Legal Studies held a national conference in Los Angeles, a few law professors of color asked permission to speak to the group. The conference leaders agreed, and many of these scholars went on to have papers published and to become a significant voice for the critical race theory movement (Delgado, 2009). It would be difficult to credit any one group with the critical race theory movement, but having three stories of origin may account for its swift growth (Delgado, 2009).

Critical race theory was seen as a needed response to the current racial climate. Taylor (1998) wrote that critical race theory is a "form of legal scholarship that evolved in the 1970s in response to the stalled progress of traditional civil rights litigation to produce meaningful racial reform" (p. 122). Delgado (2009) noted that CRT was a necessary approach because overt racism had been replaced with "types of subtle, unconscious, or institutional racism…that were more deeply entrenched and difficult to combat" (p. 1510). Some of the founders included Derrick Bell, Charles Lawrence, Lani Guinier, Richard Delgado, Mari Matsuda, Patricia Williams, and Kimberle Crenshaw (Taylor, 1998). In the mid- to late-1980s, Derrick Bell at Harvard Law School, Michael Olivas at the University of Houston, and Richard Delgado (who taught at several institutions)—were all noted for their views that accused the judicial system and other institutions of racism toward anyone who was not White (as cited in Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). The initial annual summer workshop on critical race theory was held in 1989 in Madison, Wisconsin and consisted of Matsuda, Delgado, Thomas, Crenshaw, Dalton, Gotanda, Nash, Harris, and Patterson (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). It was not an official conference at that point in time, because there was no official organization, but Delgado (2009) called it a "founding conference, somewhat like the Constitutional Convention that ratified the U. S. Constitution" (p. 1513).

CRT's five basic tenets. Critical race theory consists of five tenets as it pertains to education: (a) the centrality and intersectionality of race and racism with other forms of subordination, (b) a challenge to dominant ideology, (c) a commitment to social justice, (d) the centrality of experiential knowledge, and (e) the interdisciplinary perspective (Solórzano, 1997). These five elements remain,even though they have been subsequently placed a in different order (Delgado, 2002; Solórzano, 1998) and slightly reworded (Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001; Solórzano, Villalpando, & Oseguera, 2005). It is worth noting that CRT as an approach is fluid more than concrete (Gillborn, 2006), so this list of elements is not meant to be all-inclusive (Solórzano, 1997). The same elements of CRT are also the basic elements of LatCrit (Delgado Bernal, 2002), which I will discuss at length in a later section.

The centrality and intersectionality of race and racism with other forms of subordination. Racism is viewed as normal, permanent, and endemic (Gillborn, 2006; Hernandez-Truyol, et al., 2006; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Lynn & Parker, 2006; Solórzano, 1997, 1998). Even though race and racism are central to CRT, they also intersect "with other forms of subordination such as gender and class discrimination" (Solórzano, 1998, p. 122). Racism will always exist in the United States, but should be countered (Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Taylor, 2006). Specifically, laws and institutions favor White people and these injustices should be addressed by giving a voice to minority groups (Aguirre, 2010; Delgado Bernal, 2002; Solórzano & Ornelas, 2004; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006; Villalpando, 2004). For CRT, this was to address the struggles of African-Americans (Davila & de Bradley, 2010). All other elements of CRT stem from this main belief.

A challenge to dominant ideology. Critical race theory seeks to introduce the stories and experiences of minority groups into social and institutional discourses in order to "challenge the

dominant social reality" (Aguirre, 2010, p. 763). This dominant social reality is the traditional claim that educational institutions are objective, color- and gender-blind, race and gender neutral, and have equal opportunity (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Solórzano, 1998; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Villapando, 2004). Solórzano (1998) noted, "The critical race theorist argues that these traditional claims are a camouflage for the self-interest, power, and privilege of dominant groups" (p. 122).

A commitment to social justice. Even though CRT deems racism as permanent (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006), it seeks to lead towards the end of racism, sexism, and poverty (Solórzano, 1998; Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001), both in research and practice (Delgado Bernal, 2002). As the critical race theorist seeks social justice in education, the end of racism also calls for the end of other forms of subordination (Solórzano, 1998).

The centrality of experiential knowledge. Critical race theorists claim that students of color are often silenced from telling their stories because their experiences are viewed as deficits (Delgado Bernal, 2002). One source states, "Critical race theory recognizes that the experiential knowledge of women and men of color is legitimate, appropriate, and critical to understanding, analyzing, and teaching about racial subordination in the field of education" (Solórzano, 1998, p. 122). These students should be able to voice their experiences because they are valuable to understanding the racism they have encountered (Aguirre, 2010; Delgado Bernal, 2002; Gillborn, 2006; Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001; Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006). These experiences are best expressed through counter-stories (Gillborn, 2006; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Yosso, 2006), storytelling (Solórzano, 1998), narratives (Solórzano, 1998; Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006), *testimonios* (Flores & Garcia, 2009; Pérez Huber, 2010), and oral and family histories (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Solórzano, 1998).

The interdisciplinary perspective. While CRT was founded in the law, critical race theorists exist in theology, sociology, political science, and education (Lynn & Parker, 2006). The interdisciplinary approach challenges ahistoricism (Solórzano, 1998) and highlights the historical context of race and racism in these various fields (Solórzano, 1998; Solórzano et al., 2005). Some of these fields, such as ethnic and women's studies, have been influential in creating LatCrit (Delgado Bernal, 2002).

Latino Critical Theory

Latino critical theory is built on CRT (Davila & de Bradley, 2010). Valdés (1996) said that LatCrit is not competing with CRT, but is complementary and supplementary to CRT. They are related, "but not necessarily living under the same roof" (Valdés, 1996, p. 27). LatCrit holds the basic elements of CRT (Delgado Bernal, 2002). Both CRT and LatCrit recognize that students of color are holders and creators of knowledge (Delgado Bernal, 2002). Davila and de Bradley (2010) summarized LatCrit:

> LatCrit provides a context for the social, historical, and political reception and impact of Latinas/os in the U. S., and provides theoretical space to analyze experiences of language and immigration among other lived experiences rooted in the resistance and oppression of Latinas/os. (p. 40)

Origination and major theorists. LatCrit shares an intellectual history with CRT, including American Legal Realism, Critical Legal Studies, and U. S. Third World feminism (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006), all of which were discussed previously. There are also political sources of LatCrit. Affirmative action in the mid- to late-1980s had allowed people of color to graduate from prestigious law schools in numbers that they never had before (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). These students and graduates began to gather with professors of color such as

Derrick Bell, Michael Olivas, and Richard Delgado as they discussed civil rights and its scholarship (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). As CRT gathered steam, it was attacked on many sides (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). The experiences in the CRT workshops led to three dilemmas (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006), whichwere: (a) developing the critical jurisprudence along "counter-disciplinary, inter-national, and trans-cultural lines" (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006, p. 181); (b) should race be employed to mark inclusion, and (c) how to connect practical change with knowledge production (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). Participants of the CRT workshops decided to meet in Puerto Rico to discuss "alternative approaches" (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006, p. 183).

It was at this meeting that the term "LatCrit" was first coined—in 1995 at the Hispanic National Bar Association in Puerto Rico (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). The first symposium for LatCrit was held in 1996 as Latino law professors shared their experiences (Aoki & Johnson, 2008; Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006). The symposium, or LatCrit conference, became an annual event that allowed theorists to share their papers (Aoki & Johnson, 2008). Major theorists, such as Solórzano, Villalpando, Yosso, Delgado Bernal, and others emerged. The term Latino was used to be inclusive of more groups than just Hispanics, so many papers are specific to one ethnic group within the Latino community. As Montoya and Valdés (2008) pointed out, many Latinas/os are Hispanic, but many are not; many are Catholic, but many are not; and many claim Spanish as their language, but many have a local dialect. It is difficult to define such a large and diverse group of people in concise terms (Valdés, 2000). Nevertheless, LatCrit theorists want to go beyond an academic symposium in order to reach the average person and transform communities (Hernandez & Gonzalez, 2011). Solórzano and Delgado Bernal (2001) agreed that

LatCrit "attempts to link theory with practice, scholarship with teaching, and the academy with the community" (p. 312).

LatCrit's emphases over CRT. While there are many similarities between LatCrit and CRT, there are specific elements upon which LatCrit focuses and important dimensions it adds (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Villapando, 2004). Valdés (1997) originally described the four levels or functions of LatCrit: (a) the production of knowledge, (b) the advancement of transformation, (c) the expansion and connection of struggles, and (d) the cultivation of community and coalition. These four levels or functions were later revised to: (a) the production of knowledge, (b) the advancement of social transformation, (c) the expansion and connection of antisubordination struggles, and (d) the cultivation of community and coalition (Hernandez-Truyol et al., 2006, p. 183). The first function of LatCrit, the production of knowledge, is that LatCrit exists to better understand Latinas/os and the law, but with a critical approach as to how the law affects Latinas/os and their communities (Valdés, 1997). LatCrit pursues a different way to define knowledge (Delgado Bernal, 2002). Instead of only using formal schooling, Delgado Bernal (2001) stated that one must understand the pedagogy of the home in order to explore ways that other cultures teach and learn. This production of knowledge is important, but it is not the end goal of LatCrit. Rather, it is only the beginning (Valdés, 1997). Valdés (1997) said that the second function, the advancement of transformation, was to change insight into practice. From LatCrit should come "material social change" (Valdés, 1997, p. 1093) that improves Latinas/os' lives. One should not have theory without praxis (Valdés, 1997). The third function of LatCrit, the expansion and connection of struggles, is that LatCrit recognizes that the Latina/o struggle against racism is not an exclusive one. Rather, LatCrit also recognizes intra-Latina/o struggles as well as other antisubordination struggles (Valdés, 1997). LatCrit emphasizes one struggle to

move "toward a material transformation that fosters social justice for all" (Valdés, 1997, p. 1094). The last function of LatCrit, the cultivation of community and coalition, underscores the idea that LatCrit fosters a community of different, but like-minded scholars who are willing to collaborate (Valdés, 1997). "Because it seeks to expand and connect anti-subordination struggles, the LatCrit enterprise thus far has been a collective design" (Valdés, 1997, p. 1094) rather than individual efforts.

LatCrit's interpretation of CRT's five basic tenets. One of CRT's themes is the centrality and intersectionality of race and racism, but its main focus was on the struggles of African-Americans (Davila & de Bradley, 2010). In addition to the racism encountered by African-Americans, Latino critical theorists focus on discrimination and oppression of all people of color, but for Latinas/os specifically (Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Villapando, 2004). Valdés (1997) noted that LatCrit is representative of the Latino people who are both repressed and resilient. Thus, LatCrit springs from oppression and determination (Valdés, 1997). Other issues such as language, immigration, ethnicity, culture, and gender are also theorized using LatCrit (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Espinoza & Harris, 1997) because CRT cannot or does not analyze these issues (Villapando, 2004). LatCrit analyzes these issues because "class oppression, racial oppression, and gender oppression do not operate in isolation of one another" (Villapando, 2004, p. 43).

Division between CRT and LatCrit

Aoki and Johnson (2008) wrote an assessment of LatCrit theory for its 10-year anniversary. In that assessment, they mentioned that one key difference between CRT and LatCrit is the intellectual aspect. They stated that CRT promotes a star status among its scholars, while LatCrit is inclusive (Aoki & Johnson, 2008). They argued that LatCrit is inclusive of its

scholars to the point that it has hurt the overall quality of LatCrit publications. Aoki and Johnson (2008) also had some praise for LatCrit. They wrote that the theory "has shed fresh new insights on deep, enduring, and complex issues of Latina/o identity, as well as criminal justice, immigration enforcement, and the building of multiracial coalitions for social justice" (Aoki & Johnson, 2008, p. 1156). Based on the inclusive argument, however, they concluded that LatCrit theory has a "lack of intellectual focus" (Aoki & Johnson, 2008, p. 1159).

Montoya and Valdés (2008), two of the theorists for LatCrit, disagreed with Aoki and Johnson (2008), and wrote an article that rebutted Aoki and Johnson's assessment. In their article they described the complexity of representing the Latino people—the multitude of cultures and languages that are included. Because of this, they argued, it was important to include many scholars in their camp, even young scholars who had previously been unpublished. Montoya and Valdés concluded that Aoki and Johnson were "intellectually irresponsible" to say that the entire sum of LatCrit literature is lacking quality (p. 1203). It is worth mentioning again what Valdés (1996) noted previously: At its best, CRT and LatCrit "should operate as close cousins…, but not necessarily living under the same roof" (p. 27).

CRT, LatCrit, and Education

One early major work to apply critical race theory to education was *Toward a Critical Race Theory of Education* (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). Ladson-Billings and Tate based their discussion of social and school inequity on three central propositions that:

> (a) race continues to be a significant factor in determining inequity in the United States; (b) U. S. society is based on property rights; and (c) the intersection of race and property creates an analytic tool through which we can understand social (and, consequently, school) inequity (p. 48).

Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) concluded that critical race theory can be applied to educational inequity in the following ways: (a) "racism as endemic and deeply ingrained in American life, (b) a reinterpretation of ineffective civil rights law, and (c) challenging claims of neutrality, objectivity, color-blindness, and meritocracy" (p. 56). Ladson-Billings and Tate's (1995) work was foundational in developing CRT and LatCrit in education and has subsequently been cited in many works (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Fernández, 2002; Gillborn, 2006; Irizarry, 2012; Lynn & Parker, 2006; Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001; Solórzano et al., 2005; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006; Villalpando, 2004; Yosso, 2005; Yosso et al., 2009).

Solórzano (1998) defined critical race theory in education as "a framework or set of basic perspectives, methods, and pedagogy that seeks to identify, analyze, and transform those structural, cultural, and interpersonal aspects of education that maintain the subordination of scholars of color" (p. 123). One prominent effect that CRT and LatCrit have on education is their willingness to address racism at various levels of education—in the classroom (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Solórzano, 1997), but especially as it relates to transforming the overall educational structure (Davila & de Bradley, 2010; Delgado Bernal, 2002; Lynn & Parker, 2006; Solórzano & Ornelas, 2004; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Taylor, 2006; Villapando, 2004). In the classroom, CRT seeks to value the experiences of students of color (Stovall, 2005) by recognizing them as "holders and creators of knowledge" (Delgado Bernal, 2002, p. 106). Out of the classroom, CRT seeks to identify and transform ways that racism affects educational institutions (Pérez Huber, 2010; Solórzano & Ornelas, 2004; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Villapando, 2004). It does this by addressing discipline, curriculum, and tracking (Davila & de Bradley, 2010) and identifying "patterns of racial exclusion and other forms of discrimination

against college students" (Villalpando, 2004, p. 42). Critical race theory seeks to show that low academic achievement for Latina/o students is not the result of a lack of effort or desire to be successful, but instead it is due to inequities in resources and opportunities that are available (Irizarry, 2012). LatCrit extends this focus to include the intersectionality of race with class, gender, language, ethnicity, and immigration status (Irizarry, 2012; Pérez Huber, 2010; Ramirez, 2013; Solórzano, 1998).

Another element that CRT and LatCrit bring to education is a different theoretical framework (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Pérez Huber, 2010). The lens of CRT and LatCrit allows researchers to examine how race and racism affect all aspects of education (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Pérez Huber, 2010; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001). One debate in education centered on racism is that of inequality. Some of these issues are "segregated schools, inequities in school finance, lack of bilingual education programs and tracking into vocational and special education classes" (Fernández, 2002, p. 47). Taylor (2006) noted that "racial tracking and ability grouping is a factor that stigmatizes minority students and contributes to the achievement gap" (p. 80). Lynn and Parker (2006) suggested that CRT adds to this debate in the areas of: (a) qualitative research methods, (b) pedagogy and practice, and (c) the schooling experiences of marginalized students of color (p. 270). The voices of minority students have not been fully heard regarding education. These two frameworks allow the experiences of those students to be included in the discussion.

Most Euro-Americans have a worldview that is Eurocentric and focuses on "meritocracy, objectivity, and individuality" (Delgado Bernal, 2002, p. 111). These may not be the beliefs of people of color, thus promoting White norms (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Yosso et al., 2009). Education standards and practices are shaped by these norms, which "adversely influence the

educational experiences of Chicanas/Chicanos and other students of color" (Delgado Bernal, 2002, p. 111). One way educational experiences are influenced is by discouraging or prohibiting bilingualism in schools (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Fernández, 2002; Irizarry, 2012). Another way the educational experiences of students of color are influenced is that "They often feel as if their histories, experiences, cultures, and languages are devalued, misinterpreted, or omitted within formal educational settings" (Delgado Bernal, 2002, p. 106). Critical race theory, when applied to education, seeks to highlight racism and determine how it shapes the perspectives of those involved (Closson, 2010).

CRT, LatCrit, and Their Connection to This Study

Critical race theory and LatCrit are relatively new theoretical frameworks in educational research. These theories complement each other and contain important tenets that should be considered when examining the education of minorities in the United States. The voices of minority groups need to be heard, and these theories attempt to create space in literature for that. Methodologically, CRT and LatCrit use storytelling as a key element of scholarship (Delgado, 1995, Solórzano & Yosso, 2002). Fernández (2002) described several different functions of storytelling or narrative:

- It allows the participant to reflect on his or her lived experience.
- It allows the marginalized participant to speak or make public his or her story.
- It subverts the dominant story or the reality that is socially constructed by whites.
- It can also be transformative and empowering. (p. 48)

Luna and Martinez (2013) noted that stories of parental involvement in Latina/o success in education are missing from the literature. The current study helps to fill the gap by providing a voice for the parents of those students. As such, there are at least two elements that make CRT

and LatCrit the best frameworks for this study. First, this study must gather stories qualitatively as part of its methodology. This is best because storytelling is the primary way that Latinas/os pass down experiential knowledge (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Flores & Garcia, 2009; Pérez Huber, 2009b). Storytelling and narratives also help White people see experiences through the eyes of someone in an ethnic minority (Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006). Second, because stories of Latina/o successes in education are missing, it is necessary to explore the role that racism may play. It cannot be assumed that racism does not play a role when such a large percentage of Latinas/os do not graduate from a four-year college or university. As educators, we must use "rigorous research that shows the success of students of color in our schools" (Borrero, 2011, para. 2). After all the factors were considered, this researcher decided that CRT and LatCrit must be applied to this study. To not apply these frameworks, or to ignore them all together, would not be supported by the literature and would be, to borrow a phrase from Montoya and Valdés (2008), intellectually irresponsible.

Related Literature

Four themes were identified from the literature as it relates to Latina/o college graduates. The first theme is Latina/o resilience in education. I discuss the barriers to Latina/o academic success, which are finances, limited exposure to the college application process, discrimination, and microaggressions. I also discuss the factors that contribute to academic resiliency for Latinas/os, which are classified as either personal protective factors or environmental protective factors. The second theme is familial capital. Familial capital is a specific form of cultural wealth. It is the sum total of values and ideas that are instilled by their parents in children as they grow. The third theme is the collection of parental and familial factors in Latina/o education. These factors include the parents' education background and the education of siblings

and extended family members. The fourth theme that was identified from this study is the impact of immigrant status on Latinas/os on their decisions concerning and access to postsecondary education. This includes a discussion between using the term undocumented or illegal when referring to students, the laws and policies that affect admissions to and financial help for postsecondary institutions, and a review of the status of the DREAM Act and the DACA program. The DREAM Act is legislation, which, if passed, would provide a pathway to United States citizenship for undocumented youth. The DACA program is an executive order that stopped the deportation of young undocumented immigrants. It was rescinded on September 5, 2017, but due to a federal court injunction in January 2018, is still in effect as it was before it was rescinded (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2018).

Latina/o Academic Resilience

In difficult situations, some people give up, but other people persevere. This phenomenon that some people can continue and succeed despite obstacles and hardship has been labeled resilience (Benard, 1991; Masten, Best, & Garmezy, 1990). Specifically studied in individuals, "resilience refers to the process of, capacity for, or outcome of successful adaptation despite challenging or threatening circumstances" (Masten et al., 1990, p. 426). Throughout the literature concerning Latinas/os and education is the dominant idea of academic resilience. Cabrera and Padilla (2004) defined it: "In the educational context, resiliency refers to students who despite economic, cultural, and social barriers still succeed at high levels" (p. 152). Academic resiliency has also been described as "how certain factors can promote academic success among individuals facing adversity" (Alfaro & Umaña-Taylor, 2010, p. 553).

Barriers to Latina/o academic success. Many Latina/o students have barriers to their educational success, including financial costs (Borrero, 2011; Nunez & Kim, 2011; Ramirez,

2013); limited exposure to the college application process (Downs et al., 2008; Zarate & Burciaga, 2010); and parents who have limited education (McWhirter, et al., 2007). Another key barrier to Latina/o students' academic success is discrimination (De Luca & Escoto, 2012; Gonzalez, Stein, & Huq, 2013; Pérez Huber, Lopez, Malagon, Velez, & Solórzano, 2008; Próspero, Russell, & Vohra-Gupta, 2012).

Finances. Parents' lack of money and resources is a barrier to many Latinas/os as they consider attending a four-year college or university (Luna & Martinez, 2013; Núñez & 'Kim, 2011; Salgado & Valdez, 2007). Specifically, males in Latino families are generally purposed with providing for their family (Saenz & Ponjuan, 2009). This is common in Latino families because the individual needs are often sacrificed for the needs of the family (Saenz & Ponjuan, 2009). Fry (2005) noted that Latino males who are immigrants come to the United States to work, not to go to college. Latinas/os that do decide to attend a higher education institution are more likely to choose to attend a community college or a two-year college over a four-year institution (Gonzalez, 2012; Pérez, 2010). One of the biggest reasons for this is because of the cost and affordability of community colleges (Pérez, 2010). In at least one study, Latina/o students reported that they chose community college because it was the cheapest (Pérez, 2010). Borrero (2011) reported that Latina/o participants said that the cost of college was a part of their discussion when they were deciding where to attend. One student reported being worried, and that he needed to find scholarships (Borrero, 2011). In a study about Latina/o students who proceed to graduate school, Ramirez (2013) noted that some of the participants chose their graduate school based on the affordability of the institution, instead of how prestigious the institution was. It should be noted that research has shown that financial concerns is also a reason that some Latinas/os decide to attend college. Research indicates that Latinas/os may

attend college because they believe that it is the only way that they can become more financially secure than their parents (Ceja, 2004; Gloria & Castellanos, 2012; Luna & Martinez, 2013). Some students did not want to go to college, but they went anyway so they could help their family (Gloria & Castellanos, 2012).

Limited exposure to the college application process by the students and parents. Participants in separate studies noted that their parents did not understand the college choice process (Ceja, 2006; Luna & Martinez, 2013; Martinez & Cervera, 2012). Ceja (2006) wrote that this was because most of the participants' parents had not been through the experience of choosing a college themselves. This research is confirmed in a study by Luna and Martinez (2013). Because many Latina/o parents have not been to college (Ceja, 2006), Latina/o students are usually unfamiliar with how to navigate the college application process (Luna & Martinez, 2013). The parents' lack of knowledge about the college application process should not be confused with a lack of support (Ceja, 2006; Luna & Martinez, 2013). For some parents, language was a barrier to their ability to help with the college process (Ceja, 2006). College orientations and workshops may be mostly in English, so parents who exclusively speak Spanish only gain information that is indirectly conveyed to them from their children (Ceja, 2006). Another side effect of not being familiar with the college application process is that many Latinas/os may lack the cultural capital to understand what is required to apply or get a loan (Zarate & Burciaga, 2010).

A recent quantitative study by Martinez and Cervera (2012) found that 36.2% of Latina/o students said they have not approached a family member for information on college. That number is almost 10% higher than any other ethnic group (Martinez & Cervera, 2012). The

same study found that Latina/o students were also using college resources such as the college website or guide at a lower rate than any other ethnic group (Martinez & Cervera, 2012).

Even though the parents and students may not know how to navigate the college application process, school counselors should be available to assist students. At least one study noted that this was not the case. Latinas/os reported that their high school counselors were never there for them, including not helping them with the college application process (Vela-Gude et al., 2009). One student noted that if her counselor had been there for her, she would have had more information about scholarships and other opportunities that could have made her more successful in college (Vela-Gude et al., 2009).

Discrimination. Linguistic minorities are defined as students who "are immigrants, speak a primary language other than English at home, and who can be discriminated against on the basis of being a nonnative speaker of English" (Oropeza, Varghese, & Kanno, 2010, p. 217). Even though linguistic minority students may be proficient in English, they may still be discriminated against because their first language is not English (Oropeza et al., 2010). Some teachers and professors assume that all students learn the same way, but that assumption is false. When teachers and professors claim to be color-blind as it pertains to race and ethnicity, "They, in fact, refuse to acknowledge cultural difference that inevitably exists" (Pappamihiel & Moreno, 2011, p. 337). Pappamihiel and Moreno continued, "Because most educators are from the dominant culture, this refusal to admit cultural difference means that most students are treated as if they are part of the dominant culture, in essence as if fair is equal" (p. 337). Recognizing cultural differences does not lower expectations for the student (Pappamihiel & Moreno, 2011). Yosso, Smith, Ceja, and Solórzano (2009) identified three forms of discrimination, called racial microaggressions, that Latinas/os face in pursuit of their undergraduate degree. Defined simply,

microaggressions are subtle and constant putdowns, whether verbal or physical (Pierce, 1995). Pierce noted that microaggressions are more likely to have a cumulative effect than an immediate effect.

Microaggressions. The three forms of microaggressions that Yosso et al. (2009) identified are interpersonal microaggressions, racial jokes, and institutional microaggressions. Interpersonal microaggressions are the verbal and nonverbal racial attacks directed at Latinas/os from others, including students and faculty members. In an academic setting, these interactions can leave the student feeling that their intelligence has been insulted (Irizarry, 2011; Yosso et al., 2009). Irizarry (2011) conducted a two-year ethnographic study of Latina/o high school students and shared several examples of what would be considered interpersonal microaggressions. In one instance, Irizarry told of Latina/o youth who were asked to show hallway passes, while White students were allowed to walk about freely. Irizarry wrote, "The participants articulated, and I personally observed, innumerable instances when the words and actions of many of the adults entrusted with the responsibility to educate them in reality marginalized, silenced, and alienated them from school" (p. 4).

Racial jokes are verbal remarks that are intentional. Yosso et al. (2009) noted that it seems these are "a persistent part of the white campus subculture" (p. 669). These are an attempt at humor that may indicate that the joke-teller and/or the one who laughed at the joke hold racist beliefs (Yosso et al., 2009). Yosso et al. reported that the majority of the time, the joke-teller was a close acquaintance of the minority student, which caused more harm than when a stranger told a racial joke.

Institutional microaggressions are the part of a campus culture that neglects any Latino histories or experiences (Yosso et al., 2009) or programming that excludes Latinos (Villapando,

2004). This would include buildings, flyers, and literature that do not reflect Latino culture. One student noted that his cultural and ethnic history was omitted from his high school studies, leaving him disappointed that students of color were denied their history (Delgado Bernal, 2002). Another example of an institutional microaggression is not allowing Latina/o students to speak Spanish, even in the hallways (Irizarry, 2011). The authors concluded that these three forms of microaggressions can leave Latina/o students feeling rejected and with race-related stress (Yosso et al., 2009).

Factors that contribute to Latina/o academic resiliency. Even though resiliency attributes are fluid and vary from person to person (Campa, 2010; Waxman, Padron, Jee-Young, & Rivera, 2008), there are also common factors of Latina/o students who have shown academic resiliency. These are called protective factors (Benard, 1991; Masten et al., 1990). From the literature, several protective factors were identified specific to Latina/o academic resiliency. Each of the factors can fit into one of two categories: personal protective factors. or environment protective factors (Pérez, Espinoza, Ramos, Coronado, & Cortes, 2009; Waxman et al., 2008).

Personal protective factors. Personal protective factors are the internal factors that affect a student's resiliency. For the current study, they include intrinsic motivation and high self-efficacy.

Intrinsic motivation can come from both positive and negative external motivation (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Ceja, 2004; Morales, 2008). Borrero (2011) reported that students recounted their own motivation as a type of support system. Some students developed motivation to do well in school because their parents helped them with their homework until it was engrained in the student to finish their homework independently (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004). Loera, Rueda, and Nakamoto (2011) noted that parental involvement in reading was positively

related to children's motivation to read. Because the Latino family unit is so close (Alfaro & Umaña-Taylor, 2010; Ojeda et al., 2012), academic support should not only come from parents, but also from siblings. Alfaro and Umaña-Taylor (2010) found that sibling support in academics was "a significant predictor" (p. 549) for academic motivation. Some students developed motivation to do well in school because they did not want to be punished (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004), but many were intrinsically motivated because they wanted to have a better life than their parents (Ceja, 2004; Morales, 2008; Reynoso, 2008).

Close and Solberg (2008) defined self-efficacy as confidence. The importance of high self-efficacy in Latina/o students is evident from the research. Students with higher self-efficacy complete their work, make right choices, and do their best because they understand the positive consequences that will result (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004). Students with higher self-efficacy are able to set attainable goals (Cavazos et al., 2010) and work hard to reach their goals (Morales, 2008). This resilience in middle and high school does not end in secondary school, but has been positively associated with college-going self-efficacy (Gonzalez et al., 2013). Students with higher self-efficacy perform better academically (Close & Solberg, 2008), and in at least one case, self-efficacy of Latina/o middle schoolers has been a positive predictor of standardized math scores (Niehaus, Rudasill, & Adelson, 2012). High self-efficacy is crucial for Latina/o students as they seek to be resilient.

Environmental protective factors. Environmental protective factors are the external factors outside the student's control that affect a student's resiliency (Campa, 2010). They include, but are not limited to, familial support, faculty support, and community support.

Familial support was the most common factor found in the literature of students who exhibit resiliency (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Campa, 2010; Cavazos et al., 2010; Morales, 2008;

Pérez et al., 2009; Reynoso, 2008). This includes support from parents, siblings, and the extended family. It is interesting to note that even though parental support was common, the way that parents showed their support varied, including: (a) helping with homework (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004); (b) providing high expectations (Cavazos et al., 2010; Ceja, 2004; Morales, 2008); and (c) providing alternative ways when they did not know or understand traditional methods (Campa, 2010; Ceja, 2004). Ruiz (2009) identified Latino families as active participants in their children's education if there was at least one parent who communicated with the school, helped with homework, and attended school activities, although it has been implied that Latina/o parents have a positive effect on high school students' academic resiliency even when they do not attend school activities (Mena, 2011). Familial support needed to be noted here, as literature on academic resiliency includes it. It is important enough, however, that it will be discussed at length as its own theme that developed from the literature.

There is not one single factor that results in resiliency, but rather a grouping of factors. For example, faculty and teachers play an important role (Borrero, 2011; Lee & Klugman, 2013; Reynoso, 2008; Waxman et al., 2008). Waxman et al. (2008) discovered that resilient students spent more time in class interacting with the teacher. In contrast, non-resilient students spent more time in class socially interacting with their peers. Faculty support in general is important, but specifically, Latina/o faculty members help build the most social capital with Latina/o students (Ramirez, 2011). Lee and Klugman (2013) reported that Latino families may benefit from co-ethnic schoolteachers, as the teachers may be good mentors and social support for the students. Latina/o staff and teachers are also able to be an ally for Latina/o parents in the school (Lee & Klugman, 2013). Ramirez (2013) reported that some Latina/o college graduates chose their graduate school based on previous experiences with faculty members. At 5.7%, Latinas/os

account for one of the lowest percentage of doctorates earned for an ethnic group (National Science Foundation, 2009). This leads to a small percentage of Latina/o faculty members who are available to mentor and encourage Latina/o students through college (Ramirez, 2011).

In addition to parents and faculty, there are several other people whose support is needed for academic resiliency. When students are deciding if they want to attend college, they may seek help from a family member or from a teacher or staff member to help them develop a plan (Boden, 2011). Once students go to college, they will especially need community support (Bordes-Edgar, Arredondo, Kurpius, & Rund, 2011). Community support persons include mentors (Bordes-Edgar et al., 2011), pastors (Morales, 2008), tutors, counselors, and peers (Pérez et al., 2009; Reynoso, 2008). These community resources are a part of the social capital that Latinas/os possess (Luna & Martinez, 2013; Yosso, 2005). Community members are beneficial in helping immigrant parents understand the complexity of the education system (Zhou, 2009). While friends and community members may help a student prepare a scholarship application (Luna & Martinez, 2013), they also assist in helping the students know that they are not alone (Yosso, 2005). In a study of Latina/o college graduates who were continuing their education in graduate school, some students reported that a significant presence of Latinas/os on campus made a university more appealing to attend (Ramirez, 2013). When Latinas/os graduate from college, they connect the pride they feel with their pride for their community (Borrero, 2011). After Latina/o students have graduated, this sense of pride and cultural belonging to one's community may influence students to come back to the community in order to give back (Borrero, 2011).

Familial Capital

Familial capital is another theme that was identified from the literature of Latinas/os and their education. It is one form of capital that comes from community cultural wealth. Yosso (2005) used CRT and LatCrit to develop the idea of community cultural wealth (Araujo, 2011). Yosso wrote that community cultural wealth is the collection of assets used by minorities to resist oppression, and that the wealth is valuable and should be shared with all. "Community cultural wealth shifts the view from a deficit perspective to the assets that communities of color acquire" (Luna & Martinez, 2013, p. 2). This is a needed change because "Current education policies…continue to place Latina/o students at an educational disadvantage and view students and their families as intellectually and culturally inferior" (Luna & Martinez, 2013, p. 2). Many of the skills and abilities that are celebrated in the community cultural wealth model usually are not acknowledged (Luna & Martinez, 2013).

Community cultural wealth. There are six forms of capital that comprise community cultural wealth: aspirational capital, navigational capital, social capital, linguistic capital, familial capital, and resistant capital (Yosso, 2005). Even though each form of capital is unique, there is overlap between all six (Araujo, 2011; Oropeza et al., 2010; Valdez & Lugg, 2010). The following are brief definitions of each form of capital as defined by Yosso (2005). Aspirational capital is "the ability to hold onto hope" (p. 77) in the face of discrimination and usually without the resources to reach one's dreams. This could be called resiliency. Yosso noted that aspirational capital overlaps with all the other forms of capital, as it is developed in the social and familial capital through storytelling, which helps the student navigate and resist discrimination and stigmatization. Linguistic capital includes the abilities that students have to communicate in various ways, including multiple languages, storytelling, music, art, and others.

Familial capital is the cultural knowledge that one gains through the family, including history, culture, and values. Social capital is the networks of people and resources in the community. Navigational capital is the ability to move through the social institutions that were not created for students of. Resistant capital "refers to those knowledges and skills fostered through oppositional behavior that challenges inequality" (p. 80).

Relevant community cultural wealth studies. Luna and Martinez (2013) conducted a qualitative study in which focus groups of Latina/o students who had graduated from high school and were enrolled in college answered a series of open-ended questions to determine factors that the students perceived contributed to their educational success. The researchers then used the community cultural wealth model to categorize the results. The research by Luna and Martinez is relevant to the current study for several reasons. First, the participants in the Luna and Martinez study were Latina/o students who had been successful in their education by enrolling in college, and the participants in the current study were the parents of Latina/o students who had been successful in their education by graduating from college. Second, Luna and Martinez employed a qualitative design, and thecurrent study also employed a qualitative design. Third, Luna and Martinez used community cultural wealth to determine which factors helped the students be successful, and the current study focused on one type of community cultural wealth, familial capital, to determine which factors helped the students be successful. Fourth, the date of the Luna and Martinez study (2013) increased its relevance.

Luna and Martinez (2013) narrowed their findings to those factors that were aspirational, familial, social, and navigational. Participants shared that their parents had high aspirations for them and stressed the importance of education, even though none of the parents had gone to college. Participants mentioned mothers, fathers, sisters, brothers, grandmothers, and other

family members as "strong transmitters of educational aspirations and moral lessons, as well as direct providers of support in school in learning life lessons" (p. 6). Even though one participant was scared to go away to college, he felt he had to because his parents expected him to, so he went to a college in his hometown. Luna and Martinez reported that other participants recognized that other Latina/o peers in school were part of their support system, including helping them understand how to enroll in college and secure financial aid. The participants also discussed that they wanted to come back after graduation to help their community. Luna and Martinez concluded, "Latino parents largely shape their children's academic aspirations" (p. 12), but that the majority of parents could not help their students pay for college or help them navigate the application process.

In another study, Oropeza et al. (2010) studied four linguistic minority students to determine what effects these six forms of capital had on their ability to overcome the labels that students of color are given. They found that all four students believed aspirational capital was important to obtain their degree and connected it to their familial capital. The students also gained social capital through their family. However, their navigational capital, resistant capital, and linguistic capital were accessed or were not accessed in different ways.

This study examined familial capital to specifically discover what it contains and how it is transferred from Latina/o parents to students who have graduated form a four-year college or university. Familial capital is "the knowledge and understanding that are nurtured and passed on through relationships with networks of family and friends, respectively" (Larrotta & Yamamura, 2011, p. 76). Yosso (2005) defined familial capital as "those cultural knowledges nurtured among *familia* that carry a sense of community history, memory and cultural intuition" (p. 79). Familial capital assumes that parents are the local cultural experts—especially as it relates to

stories of immigration and their lives before immigration (Larrotta & Yamamura, 2011). It consists of the stories, traditions, narratives, prayers, and values that family members (Valdez, 2010) want to pass along to the children. The concept of family here is broadened to include immediate family as well as grandparents, uncles, aunts, and close friends (Yosso, 2005). The *familia* models how we live and act in all situations and circumstances (Yosso, 2005). Pérez Huber (2009a) found that history and memory of immigration stories can spur Latina/o students to education attainment.

Passing down familial capital. *Consejos* means nurturing advice in Spanish (Campa, 2010). Some Latina/o parents find it hard to translate into English, and say that "nurturing advice" does not adequately express the meaning (Lopez & Vazquez, 2006). It can be better thought of as the means by which familial capital is transferred through stories (Campa, 2010). Perhaps this is what Ceja (2004) was referring to: "Despite their lower levels of education and income, Mexican parents manage to find alternative ways of conveying the importance of a college education to their children" (p. 341). The parents do, however, consider it a form of involvement in their child's education. *Testimonios* are the life histories of people of color (Delgado Bernal, 2002). *Cuentos* are folk tales that are passed on orally. *Refránes* can be thought of as Spanish proverbs. *Consejos, testimonios, cuentos,* and *refránes* are all words that are used in the literature to describe various ways oral stories and values can be shared by Latinas/os.

Familial Factors in Latina/o Education

It is well documented that Latino families have an important role to play in their child's education—from elementary school to college (Araujo, 2012; Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Campa, 2010; Cavazos et al., 2010; Gloria, et al., 2005; Lopez & Vazquez, 2006; Morales, 2008; Ojeda,

Navarro, & Morales, 2010; Pérez et al., 2009; Reynoso, 2008; Shah, 2009; Zalaquett, 2005). Teachers also acknowledge that the responsibility for a child's education begins at home (Yamamura, Martinez, & Saenz, 2010). High levels of parental involvement are positively correlated with students' academic achievement (Davidson & Cardemil, 2009), and are also considered an important factor in overall school reform (Jasis & Ordoñez-Jasis, 2012).

Previous education of parents. There are several studies that positively link the education of Latina/o parents to that of their children (Baum & Flores, 2011). Crisp and Nora (2010) identified a positive relationship between parents who attended college and the collegial success of their child. McWhirter et al. (2007) showed that students with parents who had a higher educational attainment were more likely to attend a four-year college or university, while students with parents who had less educational attainment were more likely to attend a two-year college. Consequently, because there are more Latina/o parents with less education, their children are more likely to enter a two-year college if they enroll.

Siblings and extended family. When older siblings go to college, it helps the parents and the younger students better understand the college choice process (Ceja, 2006). It also begins the expectation that other siblings will go to college (Ceja, 2006). When parents cannot be the primary source of information regarding the college-going process, older siblings who have attended are able to fill the role (Ceja, 2006).

When Latinas/os are accepted to college, it is not an individual accomplishment, but a family one (Borrero, 2011). When one considers the support of a Latino family, one should not neglect the importance of the extended family and the role that they play. The extended family is important in Latino homes (Block, 2012; Ojeda et al., 2012). This is true in education as well (Ceja, 2006; Zalaquett, 2005). Siblings, aunts, uncles, grandparents, and others provide valuable

support for Latinas/os who have attended college (Rodriguez, Mira, Myers, Morris, & Cardoza, 2003; Yamamura et al., 2010). When students go to college, some of them are anxious about doing so because they are so close to their family (Borrero, 2011; Gloria & Castellanos, 2012). The closeness of the Latino family is often referred to as *familismo*. Saenz and Ponjuan (2009) defined *familismo* as "strong feelings of loyalty, responsibility, and solidarity within the Latino family unit" (p. 62). The students may feel anxious because they do not want to leave their family (Borrero, 2011), but *familismo* is also a form of familial capital that can be used to provide support for educational achievement. Luna and Martinez (2013) concluded that without family support, some Latina/o students may not have decided to go to college. Understanding the importance of the Latino family unit, teachers should gather information and knowledge about Latino family and culture so that they can best help Latina/o students in the classroom (Gregg, Rugg, & Stoneman, 2012).

Immigration Status

Student immigration status is another factor that must be examined when considering factors contributing to Latino/a college success. A person's immigration status can be classified as U.S. citizen, permanent resident, work permit, student visa, or undocumented (Passel, Capps, & Fix, 2004; Urrutia-Rojas, Marshall, Trevino, Sue, & Minguia-Bayona, 2006). A person may become a U.S. citizen either at birth or after birth (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2013a). To become a U.S. citizen at birth, a person must have been born in the United States or territories, or had a parent who was a U.S. citizen at the time of the person's birth (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2013a). To become a U.S. citizen after birth, a person must apply for derived or acquired citizenship through parents, or apply for naturalization (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2013a).

A permanent resident is "someone who has been granted authorization to live and work in the Unites States on a permanent basis" (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2011, p. 1). The U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2011) refer to this as "green card" status. To become a permanent resident, a person can be sponsored by a family member or employer in the United States, or through refugee status (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2011). A work permit and visa are issued to a person who is seeking to work in the United States for a temporary amount of time. Individuals who are granted a work permit "are restricted to the activity or reason for which their nonimmigrant visa was issued" (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2013b, p. 1). There are two categories of student visas: those for full-time academics (known as the "F" category) and those for vocational students (known as the "M" category;U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2015).

The final category of immigration status is the undocumented status. Undocumented individuals are immigrants who have not acquired U.S. Citizenship, are not permanent residents, and do not have work permits or student or other visas (Passel, Capps, & Fix, 2004; Passel & Cohn, 2010). Estimates of the number of undocumented immigrants vary slightly, but are close enough to get an approximation. Two studies released in 2011 estimated that there were 11 million (Passel, 2011) and 11.5 million (Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011) undocumented immigrants living in the United States. Those numbers are down slightly from the 12 million estimated in 2007 (Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011; Passel & Cohn, 2011). Hoefer, Rytina, and Baker (2011) reported this decrease is due to "relatively high U.S. unemployment, improved economic conditions in Mexico, record low numbers of apprehensions of unauthorized immigrants at U.S. borders, and greater levels of border enforcement" (p. 1). The countries with the highest number of the 11.5 million undocumented immigrants in the United States are

Mexico (6.8 million), El Salvador (660,000), Guatemala (520,000) and Honduras (380,000;Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011). Together, those four countries from Central America comprised 73% of all undocumented immigrants living in the United States as of 2011 (Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011). Twelve percent (1.3 million) of all undocumented immigrants were under the age of 18, and another 14% (1.6 million) were between the ages of 18 and 24 (Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011).

Undocumented or illegal. Because undocumented immigrants lack the proper authorization to enter or live in the United States, they may be referred to as illegal immigrants or illegal aliens in everyday speech (Ackerman, 2014). In scholarly articles, there are several delineations to describe these immigrants. There are studies that refer to individuals without legal paperwork to live in the United States as undocumented immigrants (Baum & Flores, 2011; Bozick & Miller, 2011; Flores & Oseguera, 2009; Greenman & Hall, 2013; Kim & Diaz, 2013; Nienhusser, 2013, 2014; Pérez Huber, 2009, 2010; Pérez, Cortés, Ramos, & Coronado, 2010; Teranishi, Suárez-Orozco, & Suárez-Orozco, 2011; Zarate & Burciaga, 2010). Some studies acknowledge that some parents and/or children entered the United States illegally (Bozick & Miller, 2011; Greenman & Hall, 2013). Some studies refer to individuals without paperwork to live in the United States as illegal immigrants, but were also referred to as undocumented immigrants (Kim & Diaz, 2013; Suárez-Orozco & Suárez-Orozco, 2011). However, I could not find any studies that referred to individuals without paperwork to live in the United States as illegal aliens. The United States Department of Homeland Security officially refers to individuals without legal paperwork to live in the United States as unauthorized resident immigrants (Hoefer, Rytina, & Baker, 2011).

Some studies note the difference between using the terms illegal and undocumented. At least one professor wants academia to not use the phrase "illegal immigrants" (Ackerman, 2014). Ackerman noted that the term "illegal" is not a legal term in the same way that alien is. An alien, as defined by the Unites States, is "any person not a citizen or national of the United States" (Ackerman, 2014, p. 567). Ackerman continued that there are various immigration laws that one can break, but the term illegal alien from a legal perspective, does not refer to all persons who break any immigration laws. One of Ackerman's contentions is that the term illegal "is able to tap into notions of criminality, and is used as a code masking a racist subtext" (p. 563). The term illegal in reference to immigrants, is also a social construct, and therefore, cannot be strictly defined (Ackerman, 2014). Ackerman agreed that "illegal" is an important term concerning immigration, but that the effects of using the term illegal alien need to be analyzed more thoroughly.

Laws and policies regarding immigration status and secondary education. To understand the effects that immigration status has on Latina/o college success, it is necessary to understand the policies currently in place regarding immigration status and education at all levels. I will start with federal educational policies regarding immigration status, then discuss specific, current policies that are in place for various states. Throughout the discussion of the policies, I will include research available that discusses the effects that these policies are having on Latina/o college success. Frum (2007) and then Kim and Díaz (2013) both presented a detailed work on undocumented students and their access to higher education, which is the basis for much of this section.

The Supreme Court ruled in *Plyler v. Doe* (1982) that Texas could not deny students free K-12 public education based on their immigration status (Frum, 2007). This right to free public

education, however, does not extend beyond high school. The Higher Education Act of 1965 is "the first piece of federal legislation to affect undocumented students' access to postsecondary education" (Kim & Díaz, 2013, p. 80). Under this act, undocumented students are not allowed to apply for federal grants or loans for college. Kim and Díaz noted that since 39% of undocumented students live below the poverty line (Frum, 2007), the Higher Education Act of 1965 limits these students' access to college.

In 1996, Congress passed, and President Bill Clinton signed into law the Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act (IIRIRA) and the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act (PRWORA). Both were significant laws that affected immigrant students' access to higher education (Frum, 2007; Kim & Díaz, 2013). Section 505 of the IIRIRA noted, in part, that if someone is in the United States unlawfully, that person should not be eligible based on their state residency for any postsecondary education benefit unless a United States citizen or national is eligible for the same benefit (8 U.S.C. § 1623). The IIRIRA continued that a state may provide state or local benefits for people who are not lawfully present in the United States by passing their own state law (8 U.S.C. § 1621). The PRWORA noted that "an alien who is not a qualified alien is not eligible for any Federal public benefit" (8 U.S.C. §1611).

The vagueness of both of these codes (Frum, 2007; Kim & Díaz, 2013) has resulted in states interpreting them to various measures. These differences include whether states allow admission of undocumented students to public postsecondary institutions, and for states that do, if they grant in-state tuition rates to undocumented students (Kim & Díaz, 2013). State policies continue to change. The following are the current state policies: (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2015).

- Two states prohibit undocumented students from enrolling in public postsecondary institutions: Alabama and South Carolina (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2014).
- Three states prohibit undocumented students from receiving in-state tuition rates: Arizona, Georgia, and Indiana (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2015).
- North Carolina has changed its law for undocumented students and postsecondary education five times since 2001. Currently, North Carolina allows undocumented students to attend community colleges if the students graduate from a North Carolina high school, and can pay out-of-state tuition rates (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2014).
- Two states allow undocumented students to pay in-state tuition rates through Board of Regents decisions: Oklahoma, and Rhode Island (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2015).
- Sixteen states allow undocumented students to pay in-state tuition rates through state legislation: California, Colorado, Connecticut, Florida, Illinois, Kansas, Maryland, Minnesota, Nebraska, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Oregon, Texas, Utah, and Washington (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2015).
- Five states allow undocumented students to receive state financial aid: California, Minnesota, New Mexico, Texas, and Washington (National Conference of State Legislatures, 2015).

The DREAM Act and DACA. The Development, Relief, and Education for Alien Minors Act, or DREAM Act, is a bill that was first introduced in the Senate and House of Representatives in 2001 (American Immigration Council, 2011). The DREAM Act would

provide a pathway for undocumented high school graduates and GED recipients to become United States citizens either through college or the armed services (American Immigration Council, 2011). Under this Act, undocumented students would be able to apply for conditional lawful permanent resident status if they have lived in the United States for at least five years and were under the age of 16 when they first came to the United States (American Immigration Council, 2011; Kim & Díaz, 2013). The conditional status would be removed if the student completed either two years in a program for a bachelor's degree or served two years in the armed services (American Immigration Council, 2011), or by proving good moral character and continuous residency (Kim & Díaz, 2013). Students would not be eligible for federal education grants, but would be eligible for work study and federal student loans (American Immigration Council, 2011).

Proponents have noted that if the DREAM Act were to pass, some 2.1 million people would have qualified for conditional immigrant status (Batalova & McHugh, 2010). The American Immigration Council (2011) contended that for those students who are not at fault for their resident status, "The DREAM Act would provide an opportunity for them to live up to their full potential and make greater contributions to U.S. economy and society" (p. 3). The DREAM Act has had different sponsors and variations since 2001 (American Immigration Council, 2011; Kim & Díaz, 2013). It has been introduced as a stand-alone bill and as an amendment to the comprehensive immigration reform bill (S. 2611). While the DREAM Act has garnered support from both Democrats and Republicans, it has failed to ever receive enough votes to become law (American Immigration Council, 2011; Kim & Díaz, 2013), including its most recent introduction to the Senate in 2017.

In 2012, the Obama administration announced the executive order called the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program. This "executive order…stops the deportation of young undocumented immigrants and provides them with work permits…, but does not grant a path to permanent legal status" (Kim & Díaz, 2013, p. 83). U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2015a) describes DACA this way:

> On June 15, 2012, the Secretary of Homeland Security announced that certain people who came to the United States as children and meet several guidelines may request consideration of deferred action for a period of two years, subject to renewal. They are also eligible for work authorization. Deferred action is a use of prosecutorial discretion to defer removal action against an individual for a certain period of time. Deferred action does not provide lawful status. (para. 4)

The certain people that the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2015a) referred to must meet the following requirements:

- Were under the age of 31 when the executive order was announced;
- Came to the United States before turning age 16;
- Continuously resided in the United States since June 15, 2007 up to the present time;
- Were physically present in the United States when applying for DACA;
- Had no lawful status on June 15, 2012;
- Were currently in school, have graduated, or received a GED certificate;
- Have never been convicted of a felony, significant misdemeanor, or three other misdemeanors, or pose a threat to national or public safety (p. 3).

In November 2014, the Obama administration announced that the United States Department of Homeland Security "would not deport certain undocumented parents of U.S.

citizens and parents of lawful permanent residents" (National Immigration Law Center, 2015, p. 1). This order was called the "Deferred Action for Parents of Americans and Lawful Permanent Residents" program. It is referred to as DAPA (National Immigration Law Center, 2015). Along with this order, President Obama announced an expansion of the DACA program to include anyone who has lived in the United States since January 1, 2010 regardless of their age, and increased the work authorization from two to three years (National Immigration Law Center, 2015). On February 16, 2016, a federal court in Texas issued a temporary injunction against DAPA and the extended DACA (National Immigration Law Center, 2015; U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2015a). On June 23, 2016, the Supreme Court deadlocked in a vote of 4-4, which affirmed the appeals court ruling. The DACA policy was rescinded on September 5, 2017, but federal court orders on January 9, 2018 and February 13, 2018 have placed the DACA policy back to its state before it was rescinded (U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2018).

Summary

This review explored the theoretical frameworks of critical race theory and Latino critical theory by discussing their originations, major theorists, and their implications on education and the current study. Four major themes were identified from the literature concerning Latinas/os and education:Latina/o academic resiliency, family factors towards education, familial capital, and the undocumented status of students. The educational success stories of Latinas/os are missing in the literature (Borerro, 2011; Cabrera & Padilla, 2004), especially from the perspective of the parents (Luna & Martinez, 2013). This study sought to fill that gap by discovering the common family values that Latina/o parents instill in their children that enables them to complete a degree from a four-year college or university.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODS

Overview

The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. I begin this chapter with a description and rationale for the study design and restating the research question and sub-questions. I detail the setting for the study and describe the participants of the study, including how they were chosen as well as the overall procedures of the study. Next, I describe my role as the researcher. After that, I discuss the data collection process, including details regarding interviews, the interview questions I asked, field notes, and document collection, along with the steps I took to analyze the data. I also discuss the trustworthiness of this study, including its credibility, dependability and confirmability, and transferability. I conclude this chapter with a discussion of the ethical considerations for this study.

Design

This multi-case study was qualitative in nature because it deals with a specific phenomenon— how Latino family values impact student decisions to persist to college degree completion. This is a complex phenomenon with some qualities that cannot be examined with quantitative instruments, such as persistence to graduation and the transferring of cultural values. I could best explore the phenomenon by inserting myself into the context and talking to the people that it involves (Creswell, 2007). A qualitative approach is also helpful to understand theories (Creswell, 2007). Researchers have used the LatCrit theory to explore the voices of Latina/o students (Cavazos et al., 2010; Delgado Bernal, 2002; Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001; Solórzano, 2005; Solórzano, Villalpando, & Oseguera, 2005); however, there is limited

published research that uses LatCrit theory to tell the stories of the parents of Latina/o college graduates.

The multi-case study design allowed the researcher to enter the lives of the participants. Stake (2005) refers to the participants as actors, which is reflective of Goffman's dramaturgical theory that the theater is a metaphor for life and social interactions (Goffman, 1956). Entering the lives of the participants also allows the researcher to understand the complexity of their stories (Stake, 2005). The complexity of the phenomenon lends itself to multiple data sources, which can be directed by a case study. The multi-case study design was chosen over the single-case design because multiple cases provide more reliability than a single case (Yin, 2009). Using literal replication, each case was chosen because of the assumption that the results would be similar. Yin (2009) suggested this be either two or three cases. Yin noted that if two cases provide validity, then three cases would provide even more. For added validity, I used 12 participants in this study. Understanding family values can be a complex issue, but a rigorous multi-case design can help unpack the context of the phenomenon.

Research Questions

The following research question guided this study: How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?

Sub-Questions

1. What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?
2. How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child?

Setting

The setting for this study was the homes of the participants in Chicago, Illinois. Chicago has a Latino population of 28.9% (U. S. Census Bureau, 2010). The phenomenon is how Latino family values impact student decisions to persist to college degree completion. The best setting to find out what they were taught is to go where these values were taught: in the home. This is the natural context of the phenomenon, so if I want to best understand the context, I need to be in the participants' homes (Creswell, 2013).

Participants

Different from other qualitative designs, multi-case designs use replication logic instead of a sampling logic (Yin, 2009). This is because the case study cannot adequately address both the phenomenon and its context and because many topics covered by case studies cannot logistically use a sampling logic (Yin, 2009). The LatCrit theory is straightforward and the phenomenon does not require certainty, so two or three cases are sufficient (Yin, 2009). However, if I increase the number of cases in this study, the confidence or certainty in the findings also increases (Yin, 2009). I chose to use 12 participants for this case study for added validity. Because I would be interviewing parents of college graduates, there may have been either one or two parents in each family. For this reason, the number of cases (families) used in this study would be between 6 and 12 in order to ensure that there would be 12 total participants.

To select the 12 participants, I used a snowball sampling by asking colleagues if they would participate or if they could refer someone to participate. All participants were Latina/o. Each participant had at least one child that was a graduate from a four-year college or university. All participants were fluent in English.

Procedures

Before seeking IRB approval, I sought out Latino educators to ensure that the interview questions were legitimate and unbiased. My principal and other colleagues are Latina/o, and have worked in Chicago Public Schools for at least 15 years. They were able to act as a panel of experts in shaping culturally relevant questions.

After the proposal was approved and defended, I submited the IRB paperwork for approval. After IRB approval, I scheduled interviews with the participants and began the research. In order to locate eligible participants, I sought out participants through referrals and personal relationships I have with colleagues in Chicago Public Schools.

Data were gathered via interviews, field notes, and document collection. Participants were informed through signed consent that each interview would be recorded on a digital recorder. For field notes, I recorded both factual data and ideas or questions. I wrote these down during the interview, recalling each room and the details that I noticed. This type of direct observation is also called field notes. For documents, I took notes about the context of the item, such as how long the parent(s) kept it, why the parent(s) kept it, and the perceived significance. Following the study, all information will remain secured on the digital file that is password protected. The file and computer each had different passwords. The information will be kept on digital file for five years, then destroyed by deleting all files.

The Researcher's Role

I was the human instrument for this study. Lincoln and Guba (1985) first introduced the concept of the researcher as a human instrument in qualitative studies. This concept was meant to stress the uniqueness of the researcher's role in a study (Peredaryenko & Krauss, 2013). This includes one's "predispositions, assumptions and beliefs, which may align or diverge from those

of his or her study participants" (Peredaryenko & Krauss, 2013, p. 1). My relationship to the participants classifies me as an observer. I assumed that the parents in the study would have strong familial ties and bonds. I also went into this study of Latino families as a Caucasian. For my initial meeting with the participants, it was important for the contact person to also be present so that the family would be more comfortable. This phenomenon and case study lends itself to a biographical feel, at least in part. Because of that, I did my best to show the complexities of the families and not assume a stereotype or create a caricature of the participants (Stake, 2005).

Data Collection

This multi-case study employed three sources of evidence from 12 participants: interviews, field notes, and documents. The interviews were the main source of evidence (Stake, 2005), but the field notes and documents added triangulation, which served to give validity to each interview (Yin, 2009). After I was introduced to the participant, I began the data collection with the field notes, which began as soon as I entered the participant's residence. After introductory remarks, I began the interview. After the interview, I asked the participants to provide documents that they believed to be relevant to the study.

Interviews

The interview is one of the most important sources of data for a case study (Stake, 2005; Yin, 2009). I used focused one-on-one interviews, which need to be structured but should not lead the participant (Yin, 2009). Focused interviews occur only once for each participant and can vary in length. These interviews were scheduled for two hours each, but many took less time, since the questions were open-ended (Yin, 2009). Creswell (2007) noted that there should be approximately five open-ended questions for these types of interviews. I used structured interviews, in which questions are created prior to the interview, participants are asked the same

questions in the same order, and the ordering and phrasing of the questions were consistent (Cohen & Crabtree, 2006). I used 11 standardized open-ended questions with eight corresponding follow-up questions so that enough data could be retrieved to code and analyze thoroughly. The interview questions are a narrowing of the research questions (Creswell, 2007). As there is no available measure specific to this study, I generated the interview questions by narrowing the research questions and corresponding them to the theoretical framework of LatCrit (interview questions 6 through 11).

Standardized Open-Ended Interview Questions

1. Please tell me: What are some values you believed were important for you to teach your child(ren)?

   Probe: Why were these values important to you?
2. How did you teach your son/daughter these values?

   Probe: Can you give me a specific example?
3. When you were teaching your son/daughter these values, can you tell me what ways worked and what ways did not work?
4. Can you please tell me about a time when you successfully taught your son/daughter an important value?

   Probe 1: How did s/he show you that they displayed it?

   Probe 2: How did you feel afterward?
5. Can you please tell me about a time when you struggled to teach your son/daughter an important value?

   Probe 1: How did s/he show you that they did not display it?

   Probe 2: How did you feel afterward?

6. Can you tell me about a time your family faced a hardship that you felt affected your child's education?
7. How did you and your child respond to the hardship?
8. If there were any other times you faced hardship that you felt affected your child's education, can you tell me about those?
9. Was there ever a time that you felt your child had trouble or problems in school because s/he is Latina/o (or Hispanic)?

   Probe: Why did you think the trouble was because s/he is Latina/o (or Hispanic)?
10. How do you think the values you told me about earlier helped your son/daughter when they faced problems in school?
11. Can you tell me about a specific example of when your son/daughter use a value you taught them to overcome a problem they faced in school?

    Probe: Are there any other times you can remember that you would like to tell me about?

Interview questions one, four, and five deal specifically with the values that the families see as important and ask for specific instances when they believed they were successful at teaching these values or when they struggled at teaching these values. These family values can be seen as familial capital (Li, 2007; Valdez, 2010; Williams & Dawson, 2011), which is an important component of LatCrit theory (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Liou, Antron-Gonzalez, & Cooper, 2009; Valdez & Lugg, 2010). Research shows that Latina/o college students believe their parents were influential in their academic resilience (Cavazos et al., 2010; Ceja, 2004; Crisp & Nora, 2010; Lopez & Vazquez, 2006; Pérez et al., 2009; Perry & Calhoun-Butts, 2012), but I had not found any studies in the literature that asked the parents what values they sought to instill in their children or how they did it. Questions two, three, four, and five sought to discover how

the parents taught these values to their children. Interview questions four and five asked for specific examples of when the parents believed they had been successful or unsuccessful at teaching one of these values. In some instances, these answers provided evidence of a specific value (which would answer research question one) and provided evidence of how they taught that value (which would answer research sub-question one).

Interview questions 6 through 11 answered research sub-question two by unpacking any adversity the family faced in the student's education and any role that the values the parents taught them had in helping the students overcome the adversity. One specific form of adversity that arose is discrimination. Research has shown that Latinas/os face discrimination in education (De Luca & Escoto, 2012; Pérez Huber et al., 2008; Pérez Huber, 2010; Gonzalez et al., 2012; Próspero et al., 2012; Yosso et al., 2009). Standing against racial discrimination is an important tenet of CRT and LatCrit (Davila & de Bradley, 2010; Pérez Huber et al., 2008; Pérez Huber, 2010; Solórzano et al., 2005; Villalpando, 2004; Yosso, 2005). These *testimonios* from the parents are important to understanding how to encourage other Latina/o parents in their children's education.

Field Notes

Field notes are descriptive information that can be observed as well as reflective information in which I record my thoughts, ideas, and questions (Schwandt, 2015). They are meant to be used as evidence to produce meaning and an understanding of the social situation being studied (Schwandt, 2015). The University of Southern California Libraries (2016) produced research guidelines and suggests five characteristics of field notes: (a) be accurate, (b) be organized, (c) be descriptive, (d) focus on the research problem, and (e) record insight and thoughts. Using these as a guideline, I handwrote notes as I entered the participants' home,

during the informal conversations, while looking at documents provided, and during the formal interview. Immediately after leaving the participants' home, I wrote out notes that were taken and made notes about questions and ideas I may have had. These field notes helped answer the research questions, in that the context of the home, including the people who were in the home and how they treated each other, as well as what was hanging on the walls, showed what the participants valued.

Documents

Documents are the third piece of evidence I collected from the participants. "Documentary information is likely to be relevant to every case study topic" (Yin, 2009, p. 101). I asked the parents to be ready to show me items from years past, such as, but not limited to, diaries, calendars, letters, graded class work or projects, and old report cards. These documents allowed me to corroborate evidence from the interviews (Yin, 2009), but also provided data that helped answer the research questions in that the documents that the participants had kept suggested that the participants value what the documents represent. Some participants provided multiple documents such as graduation diplomas, family pictures, and mementos from their child's schooling. Other participants did not provide any documents. I discuss this in the results section of this study.

Data Analysis

It is important to carefully articulate data analysis procedures in a case study, as this is one of the most difficult parts of the study (Yin, 2009). Stake (2005) noted that "[t]here is no particular moment when data analysis begins" (p. 71). In addition, there is no standard formula for analyzing case studies (Stake, 2005; Yin, 2009), but rather techniques. Stake noted categorical aggregation, direct interpretation, correspondence, patterns, and naturalistic

generalization. Yin noted pattern matching, explanation building, time-series analysis, logic models, and cross-case synthesis. At first glance, the cross-case synthesis seemed to be a good choice, but it is preferred for multiple single-case designs rather than a multi-case design, although it is possible. Instead, I used a pattern finding approach. The following steps are a portion of the specific steps of the pattern finding approach that Creswell (2007) suggested and were applied during the data analysis.

- Memoing. Memoing is recording my thoughts on a digital recorder after each interview. It allows me to reflect while the content and context is fresh in my mind.
- Note taking. I used my field notes to supplement the interviews and document collection.
- Transcribing. I transcribed the interviews verbatim (Yin, 2009). I submitted the digital recordings to the website oTranscribe.com, which is a secure site. I then downloaded the transcription of each interview and compared it to the audio recording. Many sections of the transcriptions were flawed, so I transcribed each one by listening to a small portion of the interview, pausing it, and then typing what was spoken.
- Rereading. I reread the field notes and reviewed the provided documents, and reread the transcripts from the interviews.
- Coding. I underlined the short answers to interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10. I also underlined all key words in each answer. These codes were descriptive in nature and acted as labels (Punch, 2009).
- Establishing patterns. After the data were coded, I established patterns through a second level of coding. While the first level of coding was descriptive, the second

level of coding was more inferential (Punch, 2009). From the key words and phrases, I grouped data into smaller units (Punch, 2009), making allowances for variances in word forms. Patterns give internal validity to the study (Creswell, 2007; Yin, 2009). If patterns emerged from the data, the findings were written to represent the most common patterns. If the data showed common family values, I indicated what they were. If the data did not show common family values, I indicated the differences between the participants in the findings.

Trustworthiness

To ensure that the research had high standards of trustworthiness, I addressed its credibility, dependability, confirmability, and transferability (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Credibility

Lincoln and Guba (1985) noted that to establish trustworthiness, one of the most important issues to address is to ensure credibility. I established credibility by using member checks, which Guba and Lincoln (1989) noted "is the single most crucial technique for establishing credibility" (p. 239). Member checks are the testing and checking of the patterns and themes with the participants. A second way I established credibility was by triangulating the data within each case. The interviews are the main source of data and are supported by field notes and documents (Lincoln and Guba, 1985; Yin, 2009). I established credibility by using an expert panel of Latina/o reviewers to determine the validity of the interview questions (Yin, 2009).

Dependability and Confirmability

To ensure dependability, I used a spreadsheet to track all changes that may have occurred during the research, as well as the logic behind the decision (Guba & Lincoln, 1989; Yin, 2009).

To ensure confirmability, I kept a record of the chain of evidence through each step in the data collection process (Guba & Lincoln, 1989; Yin, 2009). Together, these steps helped create an audit trail, which is recording the path and keeping evidence of the research steps (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Transferability

When considering transferability, it is important to note that the researcher is not the one who chooses if a case study is applicable, but the reader (Merriam, 2009; Stake, 2005; Yin, 2009). I used thick, descriptive text to describe the context of the case, which helped to ensure transferability. This enables the reader to more accurately understand the complexities of the case and apply the results as they see fit (Yin, 2009). The conditions between cases may change, so I described in detail the time, culture, place, and context of each case (Guba & Lincoln, 1989) through my field notes so that the reader would have as much of the context as possible.

Ethical Considerations

Qualitative studies lend themselves to a personal relationship between the researcher and the participants, which makes it important to be transparent with procedures. All data collected was saved on a digital file that was password protected on a computer that was password protected. To protect the data, it was additionally stored on a password protected external drive. To protect confidentiality, all participants were given pseudonyms and any names of schools were changed.

Because I sought participants from colleagues, in some instances, I was a colleague with either the college graduate or the participant. The close relationship between the participants' children is one that had the potential to create bias.

Summary

In this chapter, I discussed the qualitative design of this study—specifically, that I used a multi-case study design—and gave the research that supports that decision. I included the research question and sub-questions for reference. I discussed the qualifications for the participants, and the approach to recruit the participants. The setting was the participants' homes in order to best understand the context of the interviews. The procedures included gaining IRB approval and how I collected data. My role as the researcher was that of a human instrument, which stresses the uniqueness of doing research in a qualitative study. Data were collected via interviews, field notes, and document collection. I included the interview questions with rationale to connect the interview questions to the research questions. I gave specific details regarding how I used field notes and document collection to support the interviews. After the data were collected, I analyzed the data using memoing, note taking, transcribing, rereading, coding, and establishing patterns. I ended this chapter by addressing how I ensured trustworthiness and noted ethical considerations.

CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS

Overview

There have been several studies that have examined factors that contribute to student resiliency in general and Latinos persistence to graduate from a four-year college specifically. To date, I have not found any studies that have examined the parents' perceptions as to why Latinos persist to graduate from a four-year college or university. The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. Chapter Four presents the results of this data analysis. I begin the chapter with a brief portrait of the participants. It is important to present the participants individually because to understand their stories, it is helpful to understand their background. At the same time, the portraits cannot be too descriptive so as to protect their confidentiality. After I present the participants, I share the process and results of how the themes developed from the data. The process is explained clearly through narrative and tables that explain the coding process. I then share the themes in narrative form with rich, descriptive text from the participants themselves, which are supported by the date from the field notes and documents provided by the participants. After I share the themes that developed, I present the research questions and answer them from the themes of the data analysis.

Participants

There were 12 participants for this study. Eight participants are Puerto Rican, three are Mexican, and one is Peruvian. Five of the 12 participants have one child who graduated from a four-year college or university. Seven of the 12 participants have two or more children who graduated from a four-year college or university. Seven of the 12 participants are married to the other parent of the student(s) that graduated from college. Five of the 12 participants are not

married to the other parent of the student(s) that graduated from college. There are two pairs of participants that are married to each other, though they were interviewed separately and privately. Altogether, the 12 participants represent nine families. All participants live in the city of Chicago and represent eight different neighborhoods in the northwest, west, and south sides of the city. The participants' careers include teacher, principal, judge, factory worker, security guard, and clerk. All participants have been given a pseudonym and any identifying details such as children's names and school names have been changed. The nature of this study is personal, so I have taken extra caution to ensure confidentiality. For this study, the participants will be called Josue, Allan, Erica, Samantha, Saul, Kimberly, Lisa, Roberto, Isaiah, Anna, David, and Maria. The participant descriptions that follow were gathered through my field notes.

Josue

Josue's parents immigrated from Puerto Rico to the mainland. Josue is a father of two adult children, both of whom graduated from college. He is also a stepfather of two adult children who graduated from college. He is a college graduate, and is a retired public servant. One of his children helps him run his business, but he sees all of his children on a regular basis. He currently lives with his wife on the west side of Chicago. When I met with Josue to conduct the interview, he asked me to meet him at his bar. I arrived in the morning to see two men playing pool and a few other men sitting on some stools talking about the baseball game from the night before. I introduced myself and asked for Josue. He was playing pool and said he would be with me when he finished beating the other man at pool. Afterward, he took me upstairs to a private space for the interview. Josue was very warm and welcoming to me throughout my time with him. He came across as someone very passionate about his public service to the city of Chicago but also very proud of what his children were accomplishing in their lives. Josue did

not provide any documents, pictures, or diplomas. But as we spoke, he began to cry. He told me that the stories he shared with me stirred up in him memories and emotions that he had not felt in a long time.

Allan

Allan has three children, one of whom has graduated from college, one who is currently in college, and one who is in grade school. He supports his family by working on staff at a school and also helps with sports in his community. Allan's highest degree in education is a high school diploma. He is originally from Puerto Rico. His two oldest children are from a previous relationship, and he now lives with his wife and youngest child. Allan only sees his oldest child on occasion as she moved out of state with her husband, but he enjoys spending time with his son when he visits from college. I met with Allan at his two-flat in the west side of Chicago. Allan asked me to tell him when I arrived, and was waiting for me at the gate in his front yard. As I entered the home, Allan spoke of how long his family had lived in that home, but also spoke with regret with regards to the neighborhood. He said he wished he could let his youngest son outside to play, but that he did not feel it was safe anymore. When I entered, I noticed a mirror at the entryway. Allan told me it is there to reflect the evil, so it does not enter the home. He walked me to the dining room, which was adjoined to the living room. A back door led to the kitchen, and Allan's wife brought out some coffee for both of us. The apartment was clean. I could smell lemon disinfectant when I sat down at the table. As we spoke, I could hear music coming from the kitchen. Allan showed me pictures, which were hanging on the walls, of his children in caps and gowns. There were also pictures on each wall of his children together. Directly across from the dining room table, there was a framed artwork on the wall that read, "Pray more, worry less." Allan also showed me their "90 Days of Purpose Lifestyle Plan,"

which is a weight management plan. As I asked him about his children and their education, Allan spoke with excitement, passion, and a hope for the future.

Erica

Erica is a mother of four adult children, three of whom are college graduates. She is also a grandmother, and is proud of not only her children, but also her grandchildren. When I arrived at her home, her daughter (whom I had never met) welcomed me at the door and introduced me to Erica, who was seated at her dining room table. Erica provided several documents and items to show off her children. On the table was a book that featured her son's work as a principal. She also showed me a juvenile code revision project that her daughter, who is a lawyer, authored. There were pictures as well, including pictures of two of her children receiving their doctorate degree, pictures of all college graduations for her children, and several pictures of her grandchildren's graduations. During the middle of the interview, one of Erica's grandsons arrived with his girlfriend. Erica asked to stop the interview and kissed her grandson and his girlfriend. She spoke to them for a few minutes and then ushered them to the kitchen, so they could get something to eat.I sensed that Erica is a strong, but quiet woman. She spoke slowly, as if intentionally choosing each word in order to convey the exact message. She immigrated from Peru with her children more than 20 years ago and raised her children as a single mother. Erica did not go to college herself, but made sacrifices so that her children could. She currently lives with one of her children in a house on the northwest side of Chicago. Erica's children and grandchildren take turns coming by the house to visit and help her in any way they can.

Samantha and Saul

Samantha and Saul have been married for almost 35 years. They are both Puerto Rican and are the parents of three adult children who are all college graduates, even though neither

Samantha nor Saul graduated from college themselves. Together, Saul and Samantha live in a small home on the very outskirts of the northwest side of Chicago, where they welcome their children and grandchildren on a regular basis for a Sunday afternoon meal. As I set up my interviews with them, I requested that I interview them separately, but if they were both at home, it could just be a single visit. Samantha and Saul both work blue collar jobs, but they have different shifts. We eventually worked out a time during which Saul had already come home for the day and Samantha was on her lunch break. When I arrived, they welcomed me to their home and offered me coffee and refreshments. The home was neat and clean. Saul invited me to sit down at the dining room table for the interview. Both he and Samantha offered me something to drink before we started. A Bible was open on the table. Saul told me that he had just finished his study for Sunday School that week. He and Samantha showed me several pictures of the family, including one collage of their three children's college graduation pictures, and another collage of their grandchildren's most recent portraits. There were several Bible verses posted on the walls in both the living room and kitchen. As we introduced ourselves, I noticed from the gentleness of their speech that they treated not only me, but each other with respect and love. I interviewed them separately, and as Saul's interview progressed, he spoke with a sorrow in his voice as he recalled a financially difficult part of their life, but also with gratefulness for how their children and grandchildren were living now. Samantha is a quiet woman, who was more reserved in her answers than Saul. She began to open up more, however, as she began to reflect on how her children had overcome obstacles in their lives.

Kimberly

Kimberly immigrated from Puerto Rico to Chicago and eventually became an English teacher. She is now a retired public school teacher who still refers passionately about the need to

celebrate languages, cultures, and education. Kimberly raised her two children as a single mother, both of whom graduated from college and are now married with children of their own. Kimberly's son and grandson welcomed me to Kimberly's home as I arrived. She lives in a one-story, single family home on the northwest side of Chicago. She welcomed me with a hug and kiss, as is culturally expected, and asked me to come through the living room and to the kitchen in the back of the house. The home was neat and clean. There was a round table with four chairs where she invited me to sit. She had prepared for me a number of snacks and also insisted that I have some tea. Her son and grandson were watching a baseball game in the living room as we sat in the dining room for the interview. On the table, Kimberly's Spanish Bible was opened to the book of Jeremias. Kimberly still keeps guest rooms for her children and grandchildren to come and visit, and she sees them often, as they both live relatively close to her in the city.

Lisa

Lisa is Puerto Rican, and a mother of two grown children who are both college graduates. She was divorced when her children were school-age and she never remarried. She is a retired public school principal who speaks plainly and succinctly. Lisa lives in an apartment inside a large two-flat on the northwest side of Chicago. A woman who helps to cook and clean for her welcomed me at the door and walked me back to the kitchen to meet Lisa. We sat at a table in her kitchen surrounded by the smells of a meal just prepared. The walls throughout the apartment, including the kitchen, were covered in art work, mostly modern. As we spoke, Lisa was fidgeting with a pencil on the table, lining it up with the placemat. It was clear that Lisa kept her place neat and orderly. She provided to me some pictures of her daughters when they were in school. From the pictures, the daughters were smiling and appeared happy. Lisa did not provide any other documents besides the pictures, but she noted that her daughters had their

diplomas and such. As we talked, she spoke of her children's education as an educator. She knew their strengths and weaknesses and used educational terms to discuss their progress. As we continued to speak of challenges in her children's lives, she spoke not as an educator, but as a mother. She expressed fears she had years ago and misgivings with which she still wrestles regarding how she raised her children. She still sees both of her children regularly, as they also live in the city.

Roberto

Roberto is Puerto Rican and a father of four adult children, three of whom graduated from college. He retired from the police force and then worked in his church. He lives with his wife in a house on the northwest side of the city. It was raining when I arrived, and he welcomed me to come in and dry off. When I entered the home, the first thing I noticed were that there were no less than 15 plants in the front room. The lights were off, and it was raining outside, so it was dark inside. The living room was in the front of the house and the dining room was adjacent to it. Roberto led me into the living room, where we sat across from each other on couches. He offered me something to drink. As noted, there were several plants and there were also several pieces of furniture, but the room was clean. During the interview, one of Roberto's sons arrived. He said, "Hey, dad" and went to the back of the house. Roberto showed me several photos of him and his sons. In most of the photos, the men were in their police uniforms. Roberto also showed me his Bible, which he said changed his life as a young man. There were several books laying around as well, which were spiritual by title. As we spoke, I noticed that Roberto was soft-spoken and thoughtful when it came to answering questions about his children. He mentioned several times how important his family values were to him. When he spoke about his children and their success, he smiled and laughed with joy. When he spoke about what he

could have done differently as a father, his tone was serious and reflective. Overall, Roberto spoke of his children as his legacy and showed emotion throughout the interview. Even though his children are grown, they come home often and stay with Roberto and his wife from time to time.

Isaiah and Anna

Isaiah and Anna are Mexican, have been married for almost 30 years, and are the parents of three children. Their oldest child graduated from college and lives out of state. Their two youngest children live at home and are in high school. Together, they live in a house on the south side of Chicago. Their house, and almost every other house on their block, is gated at the sidewalk. Anna welcomed me to their home with a smile. She introduced me to her two children who still live at home with her and her husband. I was also greeted by two small dogs. The living room was at the front of the home, which had an open floor plan. The dining room and kitchen were in plain sight and there was a staircase on the left side of the home. There were several pieces of furniture, including couches and chairs, as well as the dining room table and chairs, and several small tables and lamps. The house was clean and smelled like coffee. Anna introduced me to Isaiah and took the dogs out of the room. I interviewed Isaiah and then Anna, both separately. They showed me pictures of their son's college graduation and many other pictures of their children as they were growing up. I also noted that there were several items on the refrigerator and throughout the first floor that showed their children's schoolwork. I first interviewed Isaiah at the kitchen table and Anna stepped out of the room. Isaiah works a blue collar job and is a simple man. For some of the interview questions, Isaiah said he either did not know or could not think of anything. He expressed that he goes to work, comes home to eat and sleep, and then does the same thing the next day. Isaiah expects people to do what they are

supposed to do, whether that means going to work, doing your work in school, or taking care of your family. Anna works as an administrative assistant in a public school. She also answered the interview questions without much elaboration. Anna goes to work each day and when she gets home, she prepares dinner for her family. Like her husband, she expects people, including her children, to do what they consider is the right thing. Together, they live a relatively simple life that mainly consists of working, taking care of their home and children, and going to church.

David

David has four grown children, three of whom graduated from college. He and his wife live in a house on the west side of Chicago. When I arrived, I noticed that there were several empty lots on the surrounding blocks, and that most of the houses had bars on the windows. He welcomed me into his home and introduced me to his daughter-in-law and grandson, who were visiting at the time. David took me downstairs to the basement for the interview. It was a smaller space that had a couch, a couple of chairs, a television, and a small kitchen. David noted that it was a space that mostly only he used. There were books on almost every shelf of every wall. There were also paintings on each wall, some of them displaying their heritage. Beside David's chair, on a small table, was a Bible. As we spoke, David articulated his opinions and experiences with intentionality. He expressed his deep concern for what he believes is a downward trend in public edcuation. He is retired, and enjoys spending time with his grandchildren, who visit him often. David is very passionate about his role as a father and grandfather, is proud of his Puerto Rican heritage, and is proud of all his children have accomplished.

Maria

Maria is a mother of two children and works as a part-time aide for the public elementary

school that her children attended. Her oldest child graduated from college and her youngest child is currently attending college. Both of her children were able to attend college with academic scholarships. She lives with her husband in an apartment on the west side of Chicago. When I pulled up to Maria's home, I noticed several men standing at the corners of the street. I know from my experiences in Chicago that these are generally "lookouts" for gangs. I approached the two-flat building, and Maria came to the door and welcomed me with a smile and a handshake. She took me upstairs to the second floor apartment. The apartment had several plants in each room and was clean. It smelled of food that Maria had been preparing. She invited me through the living room into the dining room towards the rear of the apartment. There she had prepared no less than six different foods along with several drinks. Maria had pulled documents and pictures from elementary school to college for her daughters. She showed me a picture book from her daughter's elementary graduation, including the graduation dinner, her favorite teachers, and her promotion letter to high school. Maria also provided me her daughter's high school diploma, a picture book of the clubs she was in, and her salutatorian medal she received at graduation. From college, Maria showed her daughter's diploma, honors certificates, and pictures from her overseas studies. Maria spoke quickly and with emotion. As she spoke of a particularly difficult time in their lives, she was moved to tears on several occasions. Maria is from Central America and is thankful for and proud of her culture and heritage. She loves to tell stories, especially about her children and their accomplishments. Maria is a proud mom who is grateful to all of her daughters' teachers from grade school all the way through college.

Results

The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. I collected data from interviews, field notes, and documents, and analyzed the data using steps from Creswell's pattern finding approach (2007). In this section, I discuss the data analysis process as well as the answers to the research questions.

Theme Development

One of the most difficult parts of qualitative research is the data analysis process (Yin, 2009). In order to answer the research questions, I analyzed the information from the participant interviews, the field notes during the time immediately surrounding the interviews, and from any documents the participants provided. Following is the process I used to develop the themes as well as a discussion of the themes.

Interviews. Before the interviews, I reviewed the interview questions with several colleagues who are Latina/o to check that the questions would elicit appropriate responses but also to ensure that each question was culturally appropriate. Each interview was face-to-face and one-on-one. Eleven of the 12 interviews were conducted in the participants' homes, and one participant asked for the interview to be conducted at his place of business. Most of the interviews lasted approximately 30-45 minutes. Throughout the interviews, many participants said that the interview questions were questions that either they had not considered before or that the questions brought up memories that they had not recalled in some time. I recorded each interview on a digital audio recorder.

There were a total of 11 original interview questions. Some of the interview questions were follow-up questions that asked for specific examples in order to generate rich descriptions.

In some instances, participants provided answers, examples, or stories that eliminated the need to ask specific follow-up questions. For example, interview question number six asked the participants if they could tell me about a hardship that they believed affected their child's education. If the participant answered that they could not think of a time of hardship, then interview question number seven, which asked how the child responded to the hardship, became unnecessary. Interview question number eight, "If there were any other times you faced hardship that you felt affected your child's education, can you tell me about those?" was eliminated altogether, sinceafter reviewing it with the panel, I concluded that it provided no real substance.

Field notes. In addition to my audio recorder, I had a yellow legal pad on which I took my field notes. I began these notes immediately upon arrival at the participant's home. The field notes consisted of a description of the physical setting of both the neighborhood and the participant's home, including the size, the layout, items displayed on the walls, the smells in the home, and other noticeable features of the home that would help provide context for both the participant and the responses to the interview questions. During the interview, I continued taking notes, which mainly focused on the demeanor of the participants, but also included other contextual items such as if people came into the room, or if the participant asked for a break.

Documents. When I scheduled each interview, I requested that participants provide any documents that showed their children's accomplishments, especially as they related to their education. Some participants had pulled some items out of storage and others had items already displayed on their walls or on their shelves. These items included photo albums, certificates, graduation programs, and even books that their children had either written or participated. To describe these documents, I made notes on my legal pad for each participant.

Pattern finding approach. There is no standard formula for analyzing case studies

(Stake, 2005; Yin, 2009). I chose to use steps of the pattern finding approach from Creswell (2007). After the interviews, each digital recording was transcribed using an online transcription service called oTranscribe. Originally, I had planned on using a transcription software named ATLAS.TI. However, because I am not trained with that software, I decided to submit the digital recordings to the website oTranscribe.com, which is a secure site. I then downloaded the transcription of each interview and compared it to the audio recording. Many sections of the transcriptions were flawed, so I transcribed each one by listening to a small portion of the interview, pausing it, and then typing what was spoken. I continued this process until all 12 interviews were transcribed verbatim. After I transcribed each interview, I printed them out and read them and re-read them. Upon the second reading, I marked key words in the answers to the questions that were asked. I also marked short answers to interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10. This was the first coding. For instance in the question, "What were some values you believed were important to teach your children?", I marked all the words or phrases that could be considered values. In each instance for each question, participants shared a specific answer, but also shared a story to explain each answer. After the first coding, I looked at each set of printed interviews and wrote down each word or phrase that I had marked, and then sorted them by interview question. This was the pattern-finding step of the data analysis, which is more inferential than descriptive (Punch, 2009). For instance, for the first interview question of "What were some values you believed were important to teach your children?", I wrote each word or phrase that could be considered an answer to the question in a table.

I looked at the individual interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10, which elicited key words or phrases that could be coded. From these I created a table of all the answers to each of these interview questions and tallied the answers that were the same or similar, based on the context of

their answers. From these tables and tally marks, answers to each interview question were identified. Interview questions 4, 5, 6, 7, and 11 asked for specific examples and generated rich descriptions to support the answers generated in the other interview questions. Tables for the answers to interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10 are described as follows.

In Table 1, I synthesized the full answers from interview question one into terms and phrases that are written under each participant's pseudonym. The full answers from each participant were necessary because they provided the overall context, while the terms and phrases in the table were helpful because they provided a summary of the answers. In Table 2, I tallied the answers from Table 1 to create a snapshot of the frequency of the answers. For Table 2, some common answers have been combined.

Table 1

Interview Question #1: Please tell me: What are some values you believed were important for you to teach your child(ren)?

Josue	**Allan**	**Erica**	**Samantha**
When you start something, finish it. Do the right thing.	Respect Have faith Education	Politics Reading Respect	Know the Lord Respect Family
Saul	**Kimberly**	**Lisa**	**Roberto**
Family Respect Love God and Jesus	Family-oriented Jesus Culture	Education Kindness Respect High expectations	Know the Lord Work hard
Isaiah	**Anna**	**David**	**Maria**
Honesty Respect	Family	Faith in Jesus Bible	Honesty Humble Happy for others

Table 2

Tallied Answers for Interview Question #1

Common Words and Phrases	Occurrences
Faith / Jesus / God	6
Respect	6
Family	4
Education / Reading	3
Honesty	2

Tables 3 and 4 provide a snapshot of the answers to interview question two. As with the tables that correspond to interview question one, I synthesized the full answers into terms and phrases for Table 3. The terms and phrases under each partcipant's name represent the main idea or main ideas of their answer. Table 4 is a tally of the answers from Table 3 to show frequency of the answers. In Table 4, I combined like terms and phrases.

Table 3

Interview Question #2: How did you teach your son/daughter these values?

Josue	**Allan**	**Erica**	**Samantha**
Example Communicating	Communication Example	Encourage activities	In the way we lived Talk with them Take them to church
Saul	**Kimberly**	**Lisa**	**Roberto**
Spend time with them	Modeled behavior Take them to church	Example	Example Communication
Isaiah	**Anna**	**David**	**Maria**
Example	Be there for them	Go to church	Example Persistence

	Different activities	Share Jesus with them Put them in Christian school	Fair

Table 4

Tallied Answers for Interview Question #2

Common words and phrases	Occurrences
Example / Modeled / Way we lived	8
Communication / Talk to them	3
Take them to church	3
Activities	2
Spend time with them	2

Tables 5 and 6 provide a snapshot for the answers for interview question three. It should be noted that Kimberly and Anna's responses to the question were not included, as their responses were not on subject to the question asked. In Table 6, I provide the frequency of the participants' answers.

Table 5

Interview Question #3: When you were teaching your son/daughter these values, can you tell me what ways worked and what did not work?

Josue	**Allan**	**Erica**	**Samantha**
Example worked	Yelling didn't work Talk and listen to them	Children are different Spank or punish	Don't know Implement the consequences
Saul	**Kimberly**	**Lisa**	**Roberto**
Not hit them Say "you're punished"		Children are different Repetition and reinforcement Appropriate punishment	Knowing I'm there to listen I could have communicated better
Isaiah	**Anna**	**David**	**Maria**
Didn't think about it		All different based on the child Example Reason	Harsh Hard

Table 6

Tallied Answers for Interview Question #3

Common words and phrases	Occurrences
Consequences / punishment	5
Children are different	3
Example	2
Communicate / listen	2
Don't know / didn't think about it	2

As with the first three interview questions, I provide the synthesized answer to interview question nine in Table 7. Readers should note that Maria's answer of "a few times" was counted as "yes" for the table. Table 8 provides the frequency of each answer.

Table 7

Interview Question #9: Was there ever a time that you felt your child had trouble or problems in school because s/he is Latina/o (or Hispanic)?

Josue	**Allan**	**Erica**	**Samantha**
Absolutely	No one mentioned it to me	Yes	Yes
Saul	**Kimberly**	**Lisa**	**Roberto**
Yes	Yes	No They didn't express it to me	I think so
Isaiah	**Anna**	**David**	**Maria**
I never heard that from them	No I don't think so	I don't know	A few times

Table 8

Tallied Answers for Interview Question #9

Common words and phrases	Occurrences
Yes	6
No / I don't know	5

In Table 9, I provide a synthesis of the participants' answers to interview question 10. These answers could not be simplified into just terms, but the entire phrasing is provided. Some participants provided more than one answer. In that case, all answers s/he gave are listed. The reader should note that Anna and Maria had no response to interview question 10. Table 10

provides the frequency of the most common answers. Even though the question was open-ended, there were still three common responses from the participants.

Table 9

Interview Question #10: How do you think the values you told me about earlier helped your son/daughter when they faced problems in school?

Josue	**Allan**	**Erica**	**Samantha**
To not give up Deal with discrimination and move on	They take time to think and not overreact	Succeed no matter what	Staying away from the wrong crowd Gravitate to kids with the same values
Saul	**Kimberly**	**Lisa**	**Roberto**
Stay away from trouble and gangbangers	Know who you are Be proud of what you believe and your values	Don't remember any problems or complaints	Know who they are Do the best you can
Isaiah	**Anna**	**David**	**Maria**
Be respectful and good things will happen	No answer	Know that you know Know you have faith	No answer

Table 10

Tallied Answers for Interview Question #10

Common words and phrases	Occurrences
Know who you are	3
Don't give up / do your best	3
Stay away from trouble	2

Themes

From the codes that were identified from interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10, I created an enumeration table and included in the count the occurrences of the words and phrases in the entirety of the interview transcripts. After using coding and a pattern-finding approach, several themes were identified from the data.

Table 11

Enumeration Table

Open Codes	Enumeration of open code appearances	Themes
Faith/Jesus/God	73	Common family values
Respect	25	
Family	46	
Education/reading	45	
Honesty/telling the truth	14	
Example/modeled/way we lived	21	How values were taught
Communication/talk to them	27	
Take them to church	25	
Activities	14	
Spend time with them	7	
Consequences/punishment	17	Strategies that worked to teach values
Children are different	7	
Race/racism/racist	3	Discrimination
Discrimination	8	

Because Hispanic/Latino	12	
Proud/Know who you are	17	How students persevered
Don't give up/don't quit/do your best	17	
Stay away from trouble	7	

I have included all themes from interview questions 1, 2, 3, 9, and 10 that were mentioned by at least three of the participants. In some instances, the participants provided descriptive answers to these questions, and in some instances, the participants provided descriptive answers to questions 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, and 11, which asked for specific examples. The themes that were most prevalent among participants' responses are listed first.

Common family values. There were four family values that at least three participants mentioned they believed were important to teach their children. Half of the participants (six) said that faith or religion was important to teach their children. Half of the participants (six) also said that respect was a value that they taught their children. Four of the participants said that family was an important value to teach their children. Three of the participants said that education was an important value. Select participant quotes are provided for each value listed.

Faith or Religion. I labeled the first value as faith or religion to generalize the participants' specific answers of faith, loving God, loving Jesus, and following the Lord. Allan said, "If all else fails, have faith, you know. There's only one person you have to answer to and that's God. He's got all the answers for us, you know." Allan said that his faith is lived out by how he works for intervention programs, coaching as a volunteer, and even paying for other children to join sports programs. He has seen this evident in his grown children as well. "And

it's weird seeing my older kids—their careers are with kids. My daughter is a counselor. She went to Virginia. My son graduates next month as a teacher for children. So it's weird how that value went to them."

Samantha shared how important faith was for them. "Well my husband and I both came to know the Lord you know, after the second [child] was born, so that really became important for us to teach our children about the Lord." She reiterated that "We wanted to make sure the Lord was the center of it, so we wanted to make sure they went to church and church programs, and as they got older more participated in church programs." Samantha shared that she and her husband would have prayer time with their children. She said, "I don't know when they were growing up if we had major Bible study with them, but it was more on a casual basis where I just talked. You know we talked about what happened in the day and we prayed."

Saul said that the most important thing they taught their children is to love God. "Most important, we taught them how to love God. We taught them about Jesus is the most important person in the world and he's the main focus of all time you know. Always think about the good things he did for us and it should go into your life." Saul said that it was important for his children to know Jesus because he did not really experience that as a child.

> I grew up with seven brothers and five sisters and my mom and dad, we weren't very, very super close, but as we grew up, I saw how I should have been growing up closer to a Christian family instead, we were going to church, but to a Catholic church and you just go there to present yourselves. In and out. The value I showed my children was they need to stay focused at all time no matter what the situation was with Jesus, you know. And as I grew up I saw that I didn't have that focus with Jesus growing up, I just thought that going to church will get you to heaven, and I didn't want that to reflect on my kids. I

> wanted them to show their love. My father wasn't there for me 100%, but I wanted to be there for them 100%. The more they grew closer to the Lord, the more they grew closer to me.

Kimberly said she wanted to teach her children about her faith. "I could remember I accepted Jesus when I was like nine months pregnant and that day I went to church and accepted Jesus as my savior and I was 26 years old then. And after I accepted Jesus as my savior I realized that I needed to show them [my children] who Jesus was."

Roberto said that teaching his children about God was a priority. He shared a story from when he was a teenager and said that he became a Christian and it changed his relationship with his wife and affected how they decided to raise their children. "So I would say that early on we wanted our kids to know God, to fear the Lord, and to come to a saving knowledge of Jesus. And the main thing we also wanted them to work hard at everything that they were given to do. Work hard and do it unto the Lord because you represent God." David said, "We would bring up our children in that standard of faith which would be the Bible, the word of God, and all those things involved accordingly as he revealed it to us through his Word or in our experience of life."

Respect. Respect was the other key value that the participants mentioned as being important for their children to learn. Allan said it plainly: "The key value is respect." Allan specifically said that he wants his children to respect themselves and their families, especially their mother and father. Erica also said that respect was important, and noted that respect for others, in her opinion, is really for oneself.

> Respect to others. Respect to my mother. To have respect and to have a goal in life. No, it's not for me, it's not for your father, it's not for your grandfather, it's for you. You are the one that will reap the benefits when you grow up. You have to be a professional.

> You have to be good at whatever you want to do. They tell me now, thanks mom because you pushed us, but I think it's them. I just planted the seed for them to be aware that they didn't come to this life to be living for others.

Saul also said that he wanted to teach his children to have respect towards each other and other people. Lisa said that when she was a child, she learned to be respectful toward teachers and adults, in part, so she could avoid the punishment. "I had to be respectful towards teachers because my parents gave the teachers the right to spank me if they saw fit. That was in Puerto Rico a long time ago, so I had to make sure that I show respect and that I always did as I was told." Isaiah said that respect is two-way street. "So that should work for everybody. If you respect people, you show respect and they show respect back. Feel like it works with anybody."

Family. When asked what values were important to teach their children, Anna, Samantha, Saul, and Kimberly said that they wanted to make sure that their children knew that family is important. The term family can certainly mean a unit of people that are biologically or otherwise related, but in the context of the participants' answers, family seems to have a deeper meaning than a list of people. Samantha said that she wanted her children to know what a family does. "That was really important for me to make it a life oriented around our family—to make the siblings understand the importance of each other and playing together and just having certain times together, meal times together." Saul said that the most important value he wanted to teach his children is how to stay united as one as a family. "I told them that your parents, your mom and dad, are always there for you and not only that, we have brothers and sisters and that is your focus. You should be close to them at all times at all costs." Kimberly noted that she wanted her children to appreciate her family's culture and heritage.

> I wanted everyone to know who their family was so they can have access to see my mom at least every year so we would go to Puerto Rico a lot even though they were raised here in the United States so they know that they are from Hispanic, that they are Latin. I want to show them my culture.

Education. Education was the fourth most mentioned value. Three of the 12 participants noted that it was important to teach their children. Allan said that his children have more access to education than he did and that his emphasis on education has impacted their decisions. "The education is there for them. And it's weird seeing my older kids—their careers are with kids. My daughter is a counselor. She went to Virginia. My son graduates next month as a teacher for children." Lisa said that the value of education was instilled in her as she was growing up and that "It was important to know that as part of the household they had some responsibilities and they have to understand that both me and my husband valued education highly and that we had higher expectations for them." Erica told how she made sure her children spent time focusing on their education. She said how she tried to give her children as many books as she could, but she was not allowed to borrow books from the library in Lima during that time. "When they were little there was no such a thing. Here you can borrow 20 books or whatever, and so I bought the books and I had to sacrifice myself to buy the books and newspapers and make them read." Erica continued:

> We never let one day go without sitting around the table after dinner, reading and discussing, because for me it was very important for my children to learn at a very young age that they have to get as much information not just reading books for children, but also about our social status in our country, about politics, and about art.

How to teach family values. There were three common methods to teach family values that at least three participants mentioned. Two-thirds of the participants (eight) said that they taught the family values to their children by example. Three participants said they taught their children by talking to them or by communicating. Three participants said that how they taught family values to their children was by taking them to church.

By example. Eight participants said that they taught their children important values by their own example. Josue said, "By example. Let them see what you do. What you say. You cannot preach behind a wall. You have to be in front of them, and you have to let them see the things that you do, and that's what we did." Samantha said that she never made a point to sit her children down and tell them what values were important, "but more in the way we lived, in the things we did." Samantha shared that she and her husband would have prayer time with their children. She said, "I don't know when they were growing up if we had major Bible study with them, but it was more on a casual basis where I just talked. You know we talked about what happened in the day and we prayed." Samantha said that they used those times to talk about their children's friends and to see how they were feeling. Kimberly said that she modeled the values she wanted to instill in her children. "By them seeing me putting my family first and going to Puerto Rico every year and telling them that we were going to this town where I was born where I first started teaching, I was teaching them life values."

Lisa said that she mostly taught her children by example. "It's one thing if you say something and do something else, but the impact is if they don't know which one of their behaviors they should act out. Should I go with what you say or what you do." She mentioned that most of the time she was raising her children, she was in school herself. Her children would see her studying or reading papers and know that they should do the same. She also said that she

modeled respect for her children.

> And also, I was always very respect full to the adults around me. I was extremely respectful to the parents of my husband. They were right even though they were wrong you know. I had to instill in my kids, but they were to be kind and respectful and obedient. Any kind of disrespect or any kind of defiance was not going to work.

Roberto noted that he thinks the most important way he taught his children important values was by example. "Sometimes parents today in general, they say do is I say, not as I do. The most important thing is to teach them by example." Isaiah also said he taught his children, "By example. By them seeing how I treat them and treat other people. For example, my wife or my brothers and my sisters and my parents." Roberto credits his faith for influencing that approach to teaching values. He also said he learned from the example of his own father, who was not a Christian, but when he had children he stopped drinking and smoking. Isaiah credits not having arguments with his wife in front of his kids as influential in teaching them respect. "I think there's a lot of respect in that we never really had any problems or arguments or anything negative that they would see. What they see is the best example for them in our daily lives like getting up for work every day." Maria said she had to be the example for her children. "First of all you have to be an example and you need to not preach it but walk the walk." Maria shared that if she tells her daughters to act a certain way, then she also should act that way. "If I tell my daughter to be honest I have to be honest."

By talking to them. Four participants noted that communication is how they taught their children important values. Josue said that he communicated that graduating from college was expected from his children. Josue shared a story of how one of his daughters had planned and dreamed of going to a college in Chicago. She was eventually accepted to Harvard, he said, but

she went to the college she had planned on since she was a little girl. He shared that she was accepted to one of the top high schools in the country, but decided to attend one closer to home to make sure she would arrive on time. Josue told me why school was important for him and what the expectation was for his children:

> I was the first one to go to college in my family—5 of us and 12 cousins. I was the first one to graduate from college, but my brother as well and my sister went as well. It was never a second thought. Can you imagine them saying that they're not going to finish high school? It was inconceivable. It was inconceivable for them to say they wouldn't go to college.

Allan shared a story of how his son learned that Allan had previously been in a gang:

> A friend of my son, his father grew up with me and knows me, mentioned something to him that I was uncomfortable with. So my son approached me one day and he's like dad, I heard you were in a gang. And I said what are you talking about, and I said you know what, let me tell you something. I'm not even going to question you about who you heard this from, but what you need to worry about is what I'm doing now. My past is my business. I left that behind me. I'm moving forward. If I never put you guys in that lifestyle or showed it to you, you don't have to worry about it. I said that's why I do what I do. That's why I work two or three jobs and that's why I help out with kids. Because I see it out there, and I don't want it for you.

Samantha said, "It was more on a casual basis where I just talked. You know we talked about what happened in the day and we prayed." Samantha said that they used those times to talk about their children's friends and to see how they were feeling.

Roberto said that it was important to communicate well with his children because his

father did not do that well.

> My dad didn't do a good job of doing that. Maybe there was a language barrier, but I think it's part of human nature my father was an introvert and he showed love by his actions he wasn't good with his words. I know that affected our family and I wanted to do a better job communicating with my children. Not just telling them what to do but why.

Roberto shared a story that influenced him in this regard. He was a police officer on a case where a young woman committed suicide. She had jumped into the river and Roberto found her suicide note in her journal. "After going to that case I remember thinking that my kids when they're going through turmoil they need to be able to talk to me. I also learned that you have to constantly have that conversation."

By taking them to church. Three of the participants who said faith was an important value to teach their children said that they showed their children that by taking them to church. Samantha said, "We wanted to make sure the Lord was the center of it, so we wanted to make sure they went to church and church programs, and as they got older more participated in church programs." Kimberly said that the way she showed them faith was important was by taking them to church every Sunday. She said she would read the Bible with both of her children every night before bed. "And I think all of those kinds of things that I took them started to form them to the good citizens they are today." David shared that "The first thing was we went to church. We raised them in a protestant setting which included Sunday school and Sunday school lessons." He included that he was sure to not let the school educate his children about faith, but that he and his wife looked for opportunities to share what the Bible is about.

Strategies that worked in teaching family values. There were two common strategies that at least three participants said were effective for teaching family values. Five participants said that using appropriate consequences worked in teaching family values. Three participants said that they learned to treat each child differently in order to teach them.

Appropriate consequences. Erica said that she would reward her children, but would also punish them for not finishing their jobs. She mentioned that in Peru, you can spank and punish children. Erica said that she would reward her children, but would also punish them for not finishing their jobs. Regarding that approach, she noted, "I always got the results that I wanted." However, she also recognized that once the children become older, she changed her approach, but still had high expectations for her children to complete their school work and additional learning she assigned.

> Teenagers start getting just like other kids. They didn't like when they got home from school they had to do homework and then after dinner they had to work with me. Mom it's too much work, they said. We don't want to do too much. Okay, so we'll do it tomorrow.

Samantha said that her consistency in implementing consequences was the reason why her children behaved.

> I was always scared they would get into trouble, so I had them kinda close to me, to make sure they didn't go beyond and as they got older I let them go more. They had a curfew time. I always wanted to make sure I knew where they were at, who they were with.

She noted that there were times that her children tried to get away with some things, but that it did not work because she was consistent in implementing consequences. Samantha said that overall, though, her children did not test her in that way very much. "I've been blessed because

my kids were really good kids, so they never really tried me, or I never went through those hard years that parents have with teenagers. They were all good teenagers."

Saul told me that he and his wife would punish the children, but only by saying "you're punished."

> They would tell us that was the worst thing in the world. Just to mention the word punish. We never did punish them, you know. You're punished, and they would just run away, Oh, I'm punished. So, we taught them that hitting, that fighting, was not part of our life.

Lisa said that her children required constant repetition and reinforcement, and that the "punishment that is appropriate to their age too and that's appropriate to their personality, like taking things away from them that they care for, or depriving them of TV or game times and things like that. And reinforcing those things when it was necessary."

Maria shared, "I was a little bit harsh, maybe a little bit hard, but that's what I think made a difference." As an example, Maria gave a brief glimpse at her expectations for her daughters.

> If I told them maybe you don't have to do your homework right now, or maybe I'm tired so I'm not going to help you right now. We can't do that as parents. We have to be on top of the game and they have to know that you're going to be the biggest supporter. It's one step at a time—preschool, eighth grade, high school, and college. You have to establish a way that will work for you. I was very firm and didn't give my daughters a break. I didn't let them say I can't do it or I'm tired. Yes you can. Encourage them.

Remember that each child is different. Erica noted that "Children are different, just like in [a] classroom. Some are a challenge. Some will follow me. Everything I say they will do. Some of them will not do it." She said she learned to change her approach regarding consequences as her children got older.

Lisa noted that in her experience, what works in teaching children is different depending on the child. "Well I would say that children are different in that with one daughter almost everything worked, and with the other one it required constant reinforcement because she's a different personality." Lisa candidly shared that one of her daughters has bipolar disorder and required constant repetition and reinforcement. Her rewards and punishments were tailored to meet her needs.

> And punishment that is appropriate to their age too and that's appropriate to their personality, like taking things away from them that they care for, or depriving them of TV or game times and things like that. And reinforcing those things when it was necessary.

David shared his experience in raising several children. "You know they're all different. So the way that works for one child is always different for another. And recognizing that alone is a great discovery because then you can share according to their experience." David gave an example of two of his sons. One son was hands-on and needed to be shown by example. The other son was technically minded and had a more scholarly approach to learning. This was a difference in teaching his sons for David in that he related more to the first son because David himself learned better by example as well. David shared that his daughter was different than either son he mentioned.

> My daughter was defiant. You had to show her everything. She wasn't a trusting soul. But in the end, if she trusted you she believed everything you said. So once you reach that level of trust obviously you have to be careful, but in terms of making sure that you talk right and you live rightly. But they were all different.

Discrimination. Half of the participants (six) said that yes, their children had faced discrimination in school. Of the six participants who said their child(ren) had faced discrimination, four participants added that the setting of that discrimination was a mostly White population. Five of the participants said either their child(ren) did not face discrimination or that they did not know if their children faced discrimination in school. Of the five participants who said their child(ren) did not face discrimination, four of the participants added that the school setting was either diverse or interracial.

Six participants said that their children faced discrimination either growing up or in school. As the only Hispanic in her class, Josue's daughter faced discrimination.

> At one time she came home to say how come we're dark. And she was first or second grade. And we explained it to her, and she said, "Oh the other girls they tell me about my color." We knew what she was experiencing. She experienced it over here at the Catholic school that was predominantly White. That was a little bit tough for us to deal with. Teachers were pretty good, but you know they had to deal with a lot of that. So that's kind of tough on the kids. It was tough for me too.

When I asked Erica if her children faced discrimination, she said, "Yes, oh my god, yes." She said that when they first moved to Chicago her son did not speak any English. He was in high school and the school counselor told Erica that her son was failing all the tests. When she asked which test, the counselor told her it was the same test they give to all the students.

> I said my son doesn't speak English, he is Spanish speaking person. He said, "Well we don't have to deal with that. I think if he puts more of an effort to understand the language he can do better. I think he's retarded. And you know what, he doesn't have to finish two years of high school here because he went three years in [another country]."

Erica shared that she wanted him to stay in school to learn the language, but that the principal told her that they would just graduate him "because he's not going to do anything." She said that he did not receive the bilingual assistance he needed and once he was out of high school, he immediately enlisted in the Air Force. Erica noted that he passed their test in Spanish, and once he was out, he went to college. She recounted: "But to tell me that he was retarded. I didn't have the tools nor the means to tell this man that you're discriminating my son and get mad at him and go to a lawyer." Erica said her daughter also suffered discrimination in school. "She had very long black hair and she has like native American features, and one day she came home and told me that they were teasing her that she was an Indian and I said yeah, tell them you're a Peruvian Indian and she said no ma, they are insulting me." One day the students made a circle around her and were pulling her hair. Erica went to see the principal about that incident. Now, "She's the one that's a translator. She's very intelligent and a very happy person in spite of everything."

Samantha said that her oldest son was picked on by the kids because the neighborhood he grew up in was a mostly White neighborhood. She said he seemed secure enough to be able to answer the other children. There was at least one incident that caused her to visit the school. "They bullied him a little bit, but I did go and talk to the principal. I did make sure that was addressed though."

Saul said that his oldest son had problems every day at school because there were "a lot of White people" and "The principal was very racist. He was." He said that, "Every time he had problems, he was punished. Not the other person." Saul said this continued until his wife "went in there and yelled at the principal." He said she had kept it from him because she did not want him to go in there.

> She was telling them the discrimination against my son has to stop and all of that. Punishing him all the time and suspending him for something that could be his fault could be someone else, but he is the only one getting punished, he struggled a long time with that school. She went in there and took care of that problem, and the principal realized he was wrong and things did change.

Kimberly said that when her son was in preschool, his teacher told her that her son did not understand her. "I said, that's because he deals with two languages. He's a bilingual student. There's nothing wrong with my son. Maybe he said something to Spanish in you. And you don't understand language, so you said there's something wrong with my son but there's nothing wrong with my son." Kimberly noted that there were not too many Hispanic students in the private school her children attended. She said that it was mostly White students, but she enrolled them in that school because it was close to the school where she taught. With her daughter, the school never gave her the lead in the school play. "You know she's a pretty girl. They never gave her the main character. They always put an apron on her and she was serving. 'Because I am Hispanic, mommy.' She always told me that."

Maria shared that in some of her daughter's classes, people would ask her where she was from and that would bother her. She also shared that her daughter's college classmates would tell her that she only received a scholarship because she was Hispanic. Maria said the students would tell her, "You're taking a scholarship away because you are Hispanic. Why can't your parents pay for it?" She said her daughter would respond, "I'm proud to be Hispanic and I bet you had more opportunities than me. Why did I get this scholarship? Because I worked hard. Nothing has stopped me, that's why."

Five of the participants said either that their children did not face discrimination or that they did not know if their children faced discrimination. Allan said his children never told him that they experienced any discrimination because they were Hispanic. He also said, "I know when they picked the schools they picked, [my daughter] stayed local, because she didn't want to go far. My son chose where he's at because the school at the time was drawing in Hispanics." Lisa said her children did not really experience discrimination in school because most of the children in the school were minority children. "So they were not in a predominately White situation. So I don't think they suffered any problems because of that. Isaiah said that he used to get chased by the White kids in the neighborhood and that the kids would call him names. But he said, "I don't know if it happened to them because they never complain to me about it. I just remember my experiences." Anna stated that her children did not face discrimination "because the school that they went was diverse and they never had problems that I was aware or that they brought to my attention." David said that he did not know if his children ever felt discrimination, but expanded on why:

> I think that by my own philosophy and how I brought them up that they were American first of Latin heritage and they needed to be proud of that heritage. But they needed to know first the American experience. And at home we would teach them the Latin experience. Now they went to interracial schools. They were part of a mixture of students, so I don't think they ever felt segregated or as Puerto Rican Latins I taught my children that we come from a mixture of races. So that we have Indian, Black, White—we're all of that. Because they know that they don't have any kind of exclusivity about a race. And I like that my wife and I were able to give them that.

How students used family values to succeed in school. Participants had a wide range of answers when asked how their children used their family values to succeed in school. However, there were two common answers that three participants mentioned. Three participants said that their children knew who they were in the context of their culture and heritage. Three participants also said that their children did not give up, but kept giving their best, and all participants put that in the context of facing discrimination.

Know who you are. Kimberly expressed that she always wanted her children to be proud of who they are.

> I always tell them that when I came from Puerto Rico I didn't speak any English at all and now look at me I'm teaching English. It doesn't matter if you have an accent or come from a Ranchito in Mexico you need to be proud of who you are.

Kimberly also shared that her children see in her a "person who has values and a person who stands for what she believes. For me, I just want to please Jesus. By teaching them those values and then practicing those values you need to teach them through practice." She wanted to teach her children to love God and that when you have a strong self-esteem, you can overcome. "By me helping them in teaching those values it developed a good self-esteem that help them become who they are today."

Roberto said, "I think the values that we instilled in them allowed them to know who they are and not go by what other people think about them and to not let that affect them." As noted previously, David said it was important for him and his wife to teach their children that they were American first, but of Latin heritage.

Don't give up. Josue shared that he taught his children that if they faced discrimination or hardships, that they need to keep going. He said he would compare their challenges to his and use that to encourage them to not give up.

> I would tell them stories about what happened to me, which was far worse than what they had experienced, because I came up in a time when it was really bad. Even in law school it was really bad for me. In law school, it was horrible. There was a professor, I walked up to him and I said "I need some help preparing for tests. "Can you give me some pointers?" And he said after a brief pause, "Maybe you should choose a different profession." That happened to me, so I would tell my kids look what happened to me, so you need to go on because that was tough. I cried all the way over to the car. And I said to hell with this guy, there's no way I'm going to get through this. This is what I faced so you have to go on. You have to be stronger than that. You can overcome this. Compare what I went through to what you're going through and see the difference. So this is nothing compared I had all kinds of instances. Anyway, my kids knew they had to go on with whatever issues they had in the classroom. Discrimination, you deal with it and go on. You do not let that stop you. That was very important.

Erica said that her children, "had in mind that they had to succeed no matter what." Erica would share with her children that if she made the sacrifices to bring them to the United States, then they needed to overcome the discrimination they faced. She shared another story:

> We had another discrimination with a young man with a chain and a motorcycle in front of our house. And he was like you Mexican, go back to your country. And my son he knew him, and he said man what are you doing, don't you recognize me from the soccer team. This is my family. And the kid came back to his senses and said oh I'm sorry, but

> you know from Mexico they are coming up and taking our jobs. And my son saved us from being hit. It was pretty scary.

Erica recognized that her children had problems, including drinking alcohol with their friends, but they overcame that. "I guess they had to succeed. It was like the life they live in Peru there were so many sacrifices we had. The poverty and what we had to overcome, the sense of accomplishment." She said that her children give her all the credit for their successes: "The children always said to me, 'Mom because of you.'"

Roberto said that he wants his children to do the best they can do, no matter what the expectations are. "It doesn't matter what the expectation is or what their prejudices are. Just keep being the best you can be. I think that was something they may have felt."

Difficulty teaching family values. One final theme that was identified is that participants noted that teaching family values was not always successful. There were several examples of when participants believed they were unsuccessful in teaching a value to their child. When asked about a time that they struggled to teach a value to their child, participants responded with powerful stories.

> *Lisa.* They went to Catholic school and she would get into all kinds of trouble over there. One time for her birthday she went and bought a bottle of cheap wine and she brought it to school and she put it in her book bag on the floor and the thing slipped out and the nun caught it and so they called me. She must have been in seventh grade. I had to leave my work and go over there, and I told the nuns that I will take care of this when I go home, but in the meantime the things that she does here I want you to take those privileges away. I don't want her in the choir anymore. She can no longer be the president of her class. She is brilliant. She has a very high IQ, and so she had all these things that she

was doing over there, and I said those have to be taken away and they said no. Because she really does well and you're not going to take those privileges away. And I said if you're not going to take those privileges away and the next time she does something do me a favor and do not call me. Do not call me if you're not going to comply with my request. So they did and when she came here I told her that's what's going to happen over there, so you're grounded. I don't want you calling your friends. She had a lot of restrictions placed on her. But she managed. She would ask me, "Mom, can I go to the store around the corner to get some chewing gum?" And she would have her friends meeting her there and I would tell her what took you so long? Oh there was a lot of people. No there are not that many people there. And then I would finally get it out of her that she was meeting her friends there. All these friends that she hung around. It was hard with her. My son was never a problem. He was always very compliant. And my other daughter too. But this one I had to struggle.

Anna. We struggled with our son. He went to Michigan. We were happy because he wanted to go there, but I don't know what happened and he didn't want to go there anymore. He stopped going for a year and then he moved, and I was very sad because he didn't want to be home. He wanted to go and live there. But now I'm happy because he went back to school and he's happy. At that point I didn't see if we struggled or sometimes I felt like maybe we did something wrong somewhere, but now I think maybe he needed that time. Maybe he needed to be by himself and say okay, now it's time for me to go back to school.

Roberto. I wish I would've done a better job. I'm doing a lot better now for sure. But I wish I would've done a better job showing them how to resolve conflicts without yelling.

How to attack the problem and not the person; those kinds of conflict resolution things. And we do that a lot better now. I think what made up for that was telling them that's not how you do this. And this is how I did it wrong. Also my father had a horrible temper and he would lose control that would lead to a lot of abuse. And I didn't want to be like that. I don't want to lose control like that. But I have had where I feel like I went too far in my discipline or was out-of-control. But when I made that mistake I made it right. One time when my boys were wrestling around and started getting serious. But they were like 18 or 19. They were men already. They were in the kitchen and my wife said honey, these guys are fighting over here. They had a hold of each other, so I said hey stop or something like that. And they didn't stop right away. And that's real disrespectful in the Latino home. But that was a big offense, but they kept fighting. So I raise my voice and told him to stop again. And as they were separating, my son ended up getting the last hit and I told him what are you doing. And he said I'm not gonna let him get the last hit. And I said who do you think you're talking to, and I grabbed him and put him against the wall to firmly tell him not to disrespect me like that. But when I did that I was very angry, and I grabbed his neck and held him like that. I feel like I lost control. And it affects me even right now. An hour later I went looking for him and let him know that I was out of control.

David. My third son, I struggled with him more than I struggled with anyone. Because I don't think I'll ever discover the actual reason because I love them all equally, but he was the most defiant of the bunch. He didn't go on to higher education until he was an adult. He's in school now. He's forty now. And I was always in school with him because the principal would call me, and he was cutting class, or he was tardy. I didn't have as much

> of a problem teaching him to his face his values and his standard to believe in the Word and what God is about and what God expects on the issue of grace. All my children accepted before regular grammar school and they were taught those values. But in terms of academics, I realized that I had to learn that not all of my children would go on to higher education as much as I thought that was necessary. One son never went on to college. I had a rule that after high school they would have to do something. They would have to go into higher education, into [military] service, but they couldn't just bum around or go to work. Now my four children all went on to college. Dennis went to college, but while he was growing up he worked at a logistics firm. And he went on to college and in seminary. But after almost two years he decided it wasn't for him. He went back to work where he's basically grown. He started working when he was 13 and he's still working there now. He's into sales and he does very, very well. But it wasn't for him in terms of the higher education. And so be it. He's enjoying the fruits of his labor and he tried.

Research Question Responses

In this section, I provide narratives to each of the research questions for this study from the themes that were identified. I also provide select participant quotes to support the answers. There is intentional overlap but a narrowing between the raw data that was provided from each interview question to the themes that were identified to the answers to the research questions.

Research question one. "How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?" It must be noted that the results of this research question are based on the participants' (parents') perceptions of what they believed was influential in helping their child be successful to complete a four-year college

degree. I asked each participant two specific questions regarding what they thought helped their child. The first question was, how do you think the values you told me about earlier helped your son/daughter when they faced problems in school? The second question was, can you tell me about a specific example of when your son/daughter used a value you taught them to overcome a problem they faced in school? The first question was intended to elicit general answers, and the second question was intended to elicit rich descriptions of examples.

One specific value that three participants mentioned that they believed helped their children when they faced problems in schools is that they taught them to not give up, but to keep going. Each of those participants also shared that they taught this to their children in the context of the trials, hardships, and discrimination that they themselves had faced. Some participants also shared that they could see the values that they taught their children evidenced in their lives now as adults, and some participants also said that their children have thanked them for teaching them the values.

> Kimberly shared a story of when her daughter was in college and became pregnant. That was my first child she was a straight A student from high school to college, and you're not expecting that when they're 20. I struggled a lot with that because she was my first child and I was so embarrassed to talk to my friends. I kept it quiet. I didn't tell people that my daughter was expecting a child. I was so embarrassed.

Kimberly shared that she asked her daughter, "What about school?" Her daughter replied that she would finish school, but she needed to stay with mom. Eventually both of her children finished college, and Kimberly believes it was because she instilled in them a value that they must finish. "They both had those values so strong that they both finish school. I taught them those values. I tried to be a role model and example for them.

Josue shared stories of when he was told by professors to pick another major in college, and also how his own father had worked hard to provide opportunities for him. He said that he shared his own challenges with his children and told them to compare what they were going through with what he went through. Through that, he encouraged his children to not give up. As an example, he shared a story of how his son encountered an issue with another student at school, and he took the initiative to seek out the principal and resolve the conflict on his own.

Allan shared a time when he was going to college and was distracted by work and sports and eventually dropped out. He compared that to a time when his son decided to quit the sports teams at college in order to focus on his job which was paying for school. Specifically, his son told him that he learned from what Allan did and wanted to be sure he finished his degree. Allan said he was proud of his son for making that decision.

Erica shared several stories of the sacrifices she made to bring her children to the United States. She also shared several stories of discrimination that her children faced once in the United States. This included a time when the principal told her that her son was retarded because he was struggling with the language, and another time when some young men came by the house with chains claiming that they had taken their jobs. Through that, Erica said she taught her children that if she could make sacrifices to bring them to the United States, then they needed to overcome the discrimination they faced. Erica said that her children "thank her all the time for teaching them to be honest and to work hard."

Other participants noted how they see that the values they taught their children helped them succeed. Samantha said that because she taught her children to love the Lord, they stayed away from the wrong crowd at school. "Even with my daughter knowing some girls that were just not doing the right thing, just feeling like yeah, I don't really want to be a part of that." She

said her sons also gravitated to other boys with the same values as them. Her oldest, she said, knew the right and wrong thing to do, because those are the values that they taught them growing up. Saul's son told him that he "he felt that what kept him focused was he remembered what's right and wrong and I always taught him to run away." Kimberly said she wanted to teach her children to love God and that when you have a strong self-esteem, you can overcome. "By me helping them in teaching those values it developed a good self-esteem that helped them become who they are today." She pointed to the fact that both of her children as adults are actively involved in church, which was one of the values she wanted to instill in them. Isaiah said that his children always behaved well and all but one graduated from a four-year college. He said that he did not know if he was strict or not, but that the values he taught his children anchored them in reasoning in their ability. Isaiah said he wanted his children to succeed and they did and continue to succeed.

Testimonios. The following accounts are some of the rich, descriptive stories of the participants telling how their children used family values to overcome problems in school.

Allan. Allan shared a story of when his son chose a job over sports in college.

> My son, freshman year. We're big into sports. He tried out in college. I always wanted that kid that played college ball, and I felt bad. He said you know I got school and work, dad. Baseball season came in and he made it on second team. I got excited and was bragging to my friends. I even drove to a couple of his games. He lived out there, so he worked in the cafeteria. The pressure overwhelmed him. And he came to visit, and he was just sitting there and I'm like what's wrong with you. He said, "I want to tell you, but I don't know how to tell you. But I'm going to tell you because you always told me to be honest. You know how you always wanted to play this and play that, but you

couldn't because you worked so much?" And I'm like, "What happened, you got kicked off?" And he's like, "No, I quit." And I said, "You quit the team?" And he started tearing up and I'm like, "What happened?" He said, "I know you're going to be upset." And I said, "I bet you quit the team because of work." And he said yeah. And I said, "That's fine. I'd rather you bring me a degree than bring me a highlight or your stats." He told me that he remembered a time when I actually signed up for school at [college]. I wanted to go and they had a community baseball team. I wanted to play and I wanted to go to school, but I was always the work. I just wasted time. And he told me that's the thing he thought of. He didn't want to get to the place where he played a sport but he messed all that other stuff up and he didn't want to be that jock struggling. I'm fine with it, just bring me a degree. It's an accomplishment. He thought he was going to hurt me, and I said you're not hurting me. You'll hurt me if you decide you don't want to go to school no more and go work at Walmart as a manager or something.

Josue. One of my kids was having a problem with the teacher at the Catholic school. And he was having a problem there where there were these kids that knew that his father was a judge, and he had some hesitancy going to school, and finally he told his mother that as he was walking home that there were some kids bullying him saying that they are judge killers. They actually said that, and it was loud enough for him to hear it. So you know he didn't want to go to school anymore and after his mother told me, I said, "Let him figure out what he's going to do now." And I don't know if he got from his mother or someone else, but he actually went to the principal and they did a big thing up and they called me up at work. But he took the initiative to go ahead and deal with it. He went to the principal himself and then they called me to find out you know that his mother had

already told, and I was thinking of what to do and he took the initiative and that's what I thought was important. Just deal with it right there. He graduated from there. So that was my instance with one of my sons.

Saul. Saul told about when his oldest son went to college and he could not afford to help him pay for it. He went to school and got a job as a dishwasher to help pay. Eventually he attained a scholarship from an organization that helps Latinos go to college. This was important because Saul said his son was ready to leave college before he got the scholarship. "Yeah my son struggled in that college for the first year. He wanted to drop out, but I wanted him to keep going you know. Some good Christian person donated money to that organization and my son got that and that was very good."

Sub-question one. "What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?" As noted in the themes that were identified, there were two distinct family values that six participants each reported that they had taught their children. Those family values are faith and respect. Faith is a general label that includes answers of faith, loving God and Jesus, and knowing the Lord. Data from the field notes and documents also provided evidence that these two values are important to the participants. From the field notes, participants who said that faith was an important value had Bible passages either directly on their walls or hanging in frames as art, and at least two of the participants had crosses hanging in their homes. Also, the field notes show that participants spoke to other people in their home in a respectful manner. From the documents provided, the values of family and education were evident from family pictures, diplomas, and other keepsakes the participants provided.

Allan and David both said that they wanted to bring up their children in faith. Allan said

that there is only person to answer to, and that person is God. He said that God has all the answers and that "if all else fails, have faith." David explained what it means to teach his children faith. He said that includes teaching them the Bible and all the things that God reveals in the Bible or in life's experiences. Saul said to teach his children to love God was the most important thing he taught them. He said he wanted his children to know that "Jesus is the most important person in the world" and that his children should live their lives in a way that shows what Jesus does for them. Kimberly shared of when she "accepted Jesus as my savior" and that when she did that, she knew she needed to show her children who Jesus was. Samantha and Roberto both shared how important it was for their children to know the Lord, referring to God. Samantha shared that when she "came to know the Lord" it became really important for her to teach her children about God. Roberto also shared about when he became a Christian and how that influenced what he and his wife wanted to teach his children. "Early on we wanted our kids to know God, to fear the Lord, and to come to a saving knowledge of Jesus."

Respect is a value that participants explained as respect for oneself, respect for one's family and heritage, and respect for others. Allan said that he wants his children to not only respect themselves, but also to respect their family, especially mother and father. Erica also wanted her children to have respect for others including the family members, but she said to have respect is not for the person you are respecting, but for yourself. "No, it's not for me, it's not for your father, it's not for your grandfather. It's for you." Both Saul and Samantha said they wanted their children to have respect for each other as siblings and then for others outside of the family. Lisa said that respect was important to teach her children because she had learned how to be respectful. Isaiah also said that respect was important, and that once it is given, it will be

given back. "If you respect people, you show respect and they show respect back. Feel like it works with anybody."

Sub-question two. "How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child?" To answer this question, participants were asked how they taught their family values to their children and they were also asked what strategies worked when they were teaching these values. Both of these questions provided insight to how the participants taught their family values. Eight of the 12 participants said that they taught their children values by example. They did this by generally living out the family values they were teaching. They also taught by recognizing teachable moments and providing an example for their children to follow.

Josue noted that you need to be in front of your children so they can see you lead and how you act. "You have to be in front of them, and you have to let them see the things that you do." Allan shared how his children do what he does more than they do what he says. Samantha said that she never made a point to sit her children down and tell them what values were important, "but more in the way we lived, in the things we did." Kimberly said she modeled the values she wanted to see in her children. She wanted them to know that family was important, so she took them to Puerto Rico every year to see her family. Lisa said that as a parent you cannot say one thing and do something else. She said this would impact the children's behavior. "They don't know which one of their behaviors they should act out. Should I go with what you say or what you do." One example she gave of this was that to encourage her children to read, she made sure they saw her reading. Roberto said the most important way to teach your children is by example, because, "Sometimes parents today in general, they say do is I say, not as I do." Isaiah said one key way he taught his children respect is by how he treated people, specifically

not arguing with his wife in front of the children. He added, "What they see is the best example for them in our daily lives." Maria said that as the parent, you do not need to preach, but instead, "walk the walk." Honesty is important to Maria and she noted that, "If I tell my daughter to be honest I have to be honest."

Five of the participants said that they used appropriate consequences to ensure that their children lived out those family values. These consequences could be either positive or negative. Erica said she used both positive and negative consequences for her children, especially as it related to getting their daily chores finished. She said, "I always got the results that I wanted." Lisa also said she used positive and negative consequences by reinforcing behaviors but by also taking things away from her children, such as television or games, but used "punishment that is appropriate to their age too and that's appropriate to their personality." Samantha said that her children behaved well because she was consistent in implementing consequences. Saul said that he would tell his children they were punished, and that served as their punishment. Maria said she was harsh with her children, but believed it made a difference in them learning the values she taught them.

Testimonios. The previous discussion was a synthesis of how Latino parents teach values to their children; however, it is culturally and contextually important to give specific *testimonios* of how parents taught these values.

> *Josue.* My son was 14, and this guy from Maplewood and North avenue sold him a bike for 20 dollars. I said where'd you get that bike. Oh, so and so sold it to me. For how much? I'm sorry. Fifty bucks. I said well that bike looks like it's worth about one hundred fifty or two hundred dollars. That bike is stolen. But oh no, I didn't steal it. Okay. You didn't steal it. But I can guarantee you that the guy that sold it to you stole it,

because you don't sell a bike like this for that kind of money, so you're going to take the bike back, forget about your fifty dollars, and bring the bike back to him. Oh, I'm not doing that. Oh, well, you're not doing it, I'm calling 911. I called 911. The police came. It was important for him to see that I followed through. The police came and said Mr. Josue, we can't arrest him and you know that. But I wanted him to hear you say that this bike was stolen and that he has to do whatever your dad says you have to do. My son to this day still remembers it. I can't believe that you called the police on me. He remembers that to today. We're at a family gathering and he'll say, hey tell the story of when you called the police on me. He took the bike back and he lost his fifty bucks. And that's the way it is.

Lisa. Well I remember that one time when I was the principal at a school, there was this family, they were from the Middle East and they were poor, and so one time I was talking to one of the little girls, and she told me—it was past Christmas—and she had told me that she very much wanted a little camera. But that she couldn't get it because her parents couldn't afford it. So I went and bought a camera for that little girl and my daughter found out. She was very upset, and she said how come I bought that little girl a camera. She's not related to me and I didn't have to buy her a camera. And I said it was because I bought her other things and that little girl really needs it, really wants it. And her parents cannot afford it for her and I can afford it and if that's what you want, you never said you wanted a camera. She said she wanted other things. And I don't ever want you to question my judgment, because what you have to do what you do when you grow up and help people yourself. You have no business if you only think about yourself. You have to think about other people, so let's not even mention that camera anymore. Okay, I'm

sorry. But she didn't think I should be giving things to other people.

Allan. I think it would be my oldest daughter, with her situation when she was going through the whole boy craze thing, and a certain young man that we felt she shouldn't be with and she thought she did. And she got into a disagreement with him one time and the first thing I told her was like is it worth it. That little disagreement, you're upset, but listen, do you think you can go all day like this? All week? A month? Coming home to this? Wondering when he's going to come home and what he's going to do? And that's when my daughter got more into the church. Reading more. And it was just overnight. About a month later, she told me I'm not worried about him, Dad. The funny part was that I have the men that I want in my life already. She mentioned myself and her stepfather. And that's when she realized that no matter what people will come and go out of your life, and I told her that I got your back no matter what. If I've never touched you, I'm not going to let anybody else touch you. But you're the first one there so you have to be sure you don't let that happen. And I think it was that key thing when I told her is that what you want to go through. You seen what I been through in my relationships. And now like I said, the guy she's married to, it took a lot for her to even open up to him. So I know it worked out.

Summary

In Chapter fFour I introduced the 12 participants in this case study from my field notes and the documents they provided. I then presented the theme development using steps of the Creswell's (2007) pattern finding approach. Common family values that were identitifed were faith or religion, respect, family, and education. Participants noted that how they taught those family values was by example, by talking to their children, and by taking them to church. The

strategies that worked to teach family values were by using appropriate consequences and by treating each child differently. Half of the participants said that their children faced discrimination in school, but said that they overcame this discrimination by knowing who they were in the context of their culture and by not giving up.

The common family values identified the specific values that Latino parents taught their children and answered the first sub-question of "What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?" The ways that Latino parents taught these family values and the strategies they used answered the second sub-question of "How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child?" The theme of discrimination helped explain the context of why Latino students need resiliency, and how the parents believed the students used the family values to perservere answered the research question, "How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?"

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION

Overview

The purpose of this multi-case study was to discover the impact of family values on Latina/o student persistence to college graduation. In this chapter I present the research questions and a brief summary of the findings. Then I discuss the findings in the context of the literature review. Next, I discuss the theoretical, empirical, and practical implications of the findings. I then set forth the delimitations and limitations of the study. Lastly, I propose my recommendations for future research.

Summary of Findings

This study employed 12 participant interviews, field notes, and supporting documents to examine if there are common family values that Latino parents have taught their children that they believed were important in helping their children be successful and graduate from college. Mostly through the participant interviews, but supported by the field notes and documents, several themes were identified from the research. Those themes include: common family values, how to teach family values. strategies that worked in teaching family values. racial discrimination, and how students overcame problems in school.

The main research question driving the study was: How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university? This was supported by two sub-questions: What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university? and How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child? One must know the answers to the sub-questions before the answer to the main research question can be ascertained. To answer the first sub-question, two common

values were each mentioned most frequently (by six participants). Those common values are faith and respect. The value of faith encompassed not just the word faith, but also teaching their children about God or Jesus. The value of respect mostly included respect for oneself and one's family, but also for others in general. It is worth noting that while six participants each said faith and respect were important, it was not the same six participants who said those two values were important. To answer the second sub-question, three-fourths (eight) of the participants said that how they taught values to their children was that they modeled by example the values they wanted their children to learn. Five of the participants said they used either positive or negative consequences as a means of teaching their children values. The five participants who said they used consequences were not all included with the participants who said they modeled the values they wanted taught. Those answers laid the foundation for the answer to the main research question of how family values affected student resiliency. While there were several different answers as to *how* these values helped students overcome problems in school, the results of this study showed that nine of the 12 participants believed that the values they instilled in their children taught them to persevere in the face of any hardships and discrimination they faced in school.

Table 12 provides a snapshot of the main findings to the research questions.

Table 12

Summary of Findings

Research Question	Results
How do family values impact the resiliency of the Latina/o student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?	Know who you are Don't give up / Do your best
What, if any, are the family values that Latina/o parents have taught to a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university?	Faith or Religion Respect
How do Latina/o parents of a student who has graduated from a four-year college or university teach family values to their child?	By example

Discussion

This section discusses the findings of this study as they relate to the empirical and theoretical literature presented in Chapter Two, specifically if the study confirms previous research, how the study adds to previous research, and what new ideas the study brings to the topic of the educational success of Latinas/os.

Theoretical Discussion

The theoretical framework of this study is based on critical race theory (CRT) generally, and Latino critical race theory (LatCrit) specifically. One of the main tenets of CRT and LatCrit is the centrality and intersectionality of race and racism, with CRT focused on African-Americans (Davila & de Bradley, 2010) and LatCrit focused on Latinas/os (Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Villapando, 2004). This lens allows researchers to examine how race and racism affect every area of education (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Pérez Huber, 2010; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001).

Six of the 12 participants said that their children faced discrimination. This overall finding supports research that racism not only happens in various levels of education, but is ingrained in the overall educational structure (Davila & de Bradley, 2010; Delgado Bernal, 2002; Lynn & Parker, 2006; Solórzano & Ornelas, 2004; Solórzano & Yosso, 2001; Taylor, 2006; Villapando, 2004). This is also supported by the fact that four participants who said that their child faced discrimination at school also mentioned that the school was comprised of a majority of White students. In addition, four of the participants who said their child did not experience discrimination mentioned that the school was either diverse or did not have a large White population.

There are specific examples of discrimination that participants provided that highlight previous research. In one story, a participant was told by her son's principal that her son was retarded and should probably be held back in school because he needed to learn English. This is an example of how students' education can be influenced by discouraging bilingualism (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Fernández, 2002; Irizarry, 2012). Critical race theory and LatCrit are platforms for researchers to see that this particular student's success is not due to his motivation, but instead to an inequity (Irizarry, 2012). Other stories from this study include a Latina who was always cast as the servant in the school play; a Latino who was the only one of his friends to get in trouble; a young Latino whose teacher thought there was a problem with his speech but he was speaking in Spanish; a Latina who was pushed around in the middle of a circle because her skin was brown; and a Latino who was told by his professor that he should consider a different major and profession other than law.

The CRT and LatCrit framework allow more minority voices to be heard and for their experiences to be shared. This study contributes to that framework by allowing Latino parents to

share what they believe they taught their children that helped them to be successful in order to graduate from a four-year college. This study also used storytelling and narratives, which can help others begin to see the experiences of Latinas/os in education (Stovall, 2005; Taylor, 2006).

Empirical Discussion

This study showed that there were family values that Latino parents of college graduates had taught their children. Each participant in this study was able to state the family values that they believed were important to teach their children. This supports findings from a study conducted by Luna and Martinez (2013) of Latina/o college student perceptions of their educational success. Their study showed that family members of Latina/o college students are "strong transmitters of educational aspirations and moral lessons, as well as direct providers of support in school in learning life lessons" (p. 6). This also supports research that family values are a subset of the familial capital of one's community cultural wealth (Li, 2007; Valdez, 2010; Williams & Dawson, 2011).

The current study also examined which family values the parents believed were important to pass down to their children and found that faith and respect were each listed as important values for half of the participants. As noted in the summary of the findings, it was not the same six participants that chose faith and respect as the important family values. It seems that those two values are not necessarily dependent on each other and can be mutually exclusive. This, along with the fact that the participants listed different ways to teach these values suggests that while these values and methods are important, it may be just as important that values are taught, indeterminant of what the values are and the method used.

There has been previous research regarding familial capital and its effect on student resilience and academic motivation, but until the current study there has not been research that

examined which family values the parents believed were important to pass down to their children. Stories from the parents who were involved in Latina/o success in education were previously unaccounted for (Luna & Martinez, 2013). The current study helps to fill the gap in the literature by providing a voice for the parents of those students.

Participants in this study believed that their children were able to graduate from a four-year college in part because of the family values that they taught them. The participants provided evidence of this by sharing stories of how their child(ren) had used the values they had taught them to overcome problems that affected their schooling. Nine of the 12 participants connected the values they had taught their children with their child's ability to overcome difficulties with discrimination or other problems in school. This supports another finding from the Luna and Martinez (2013) study in which they concluded that "Latino parents largely shape their children's academic aspirations" (p. 12). This also supports a study by Oropeza et al. (2010) in which the researchers found that familial capital is connected to the aspirational capital of a student of color and that capital is important for a student to obtain a college degree.

Another finding of the current study is that four of the participants considered family to be a value that they needed to teach their children. I considered this to be an interesting finding in that the participants considered family as not just a unit of people, but used the word to describe how the family should support, love, and respect each other. This supports research that familial support from not just the mother and father, but from siblings and the extended family, is the most common factor of students who are resilient (Cabrera & Padilla, 2004; Campa, 2010; Cavazos et al., 2010; Morales, 2008; Pérez et al., 2009; Reynoso, 2008).

I did not specifically ask questions regarding siblings of the college graduates in this study, but 9 of the 12 participants had more than one child who had graduated from college.

This supports research from Alfaro and Umaña-Taylor (2010), who found that sibling support in academics was "a significant predictor" (p. 549) for academic motivation. In addition, Ojeda et al. (2012) found that academic support needs to come from siblingsas well as parents. Two of the participant families have additional children that are either still in elementary or high school. It will be interesting to see if these younger siblings follow in their older brother/sister's footsteps and graduate from college.

This study found that half (six) of the participants said their child had faced discrimination because they are Latina/o. Three of the participants specifically referenced that the discrimination was because their child was speaking Spanish or because Spanish was their first language. This is in agreement with research that Latina/o students face racial microaggressions, including but not limited to, not being allowed to speak Spanish in school (Irizarry, 2011), and that those microaggressions can leave feelings of rejection (Yosso et al., 2009).

Implications

There are several implications that come from this study. Theoretical implications include how this study impacts CRT and LatCrit. Some empirical implications that I address are how this study adds to the current literature of college persistence for Latinas/os. Lastly, I discuss practical implications for both parents and educators of Latina/o students.

Theoretical Implications

The tenet shared by CRT and LatCrit of the centrality and intersectionality of race and racism was reinforced by the results of this study, as the participants shared that their children had experienced discrimination. In addition, there may be a deeper level of expected racism in the Latino community as it relates to education. This is based on those participants who

mentioned their children had faced discrimination, but also described the setting where the discrimination occurred, which mostly in a White setting. I did not ask any follow-up questions about the setting of the discrimination. Instead, four of the six participants included the context of the setting on their own. Likewise, four of the five participants who said their children did not experience discrimination or they did not know if they experienced discrimination also included the context of the setting, mentioning either that the school was diverse or that it did not have a large White population. That eight of the 12 participants mentioned this causes me to wonder if racism is not only experienced in Latino education, but if discrimination is also expected to some degree based on if the context is White or non-White. There are several other tenets of CRT and LatCrit that this study did not specifically use as a lens or address in the research. However, this study does contribute another set of minority stories to the tenet of the centrality and intersectionality of race and racism.

Empirical Implications

This study adds significantly to the current research regarding the role that familial capital plays in resiliency as it relates to Latinas/os persisting to graduate from a four-year college. Familial capital is a form of cultural wealth that has not been fully explored or recognized, but it is needed in order to bring student capital into the classroom (Yosso, 2005). Luna and Martinez (2013) noted that much more research needed to be conducted with Latina/o college students, especially research targeting parental involvement. This study examined one specific component of familial capital—family values—and explored their significance in helping Latina/o students graduate from college. This study found that there are many family values that parents wanted to teach their children, and that all participants were able to espouse the family values that they wanted to pass down to their children. This study found that there

were two specific values that were each mentioned by half of the participants:faith and respect. Although faith and respect are general terms that need to be examined more closely, they do add specificity to the overall area of Latino familial values.

This study also examined how Latino parents teach their children values, and found that most of the participants taught these values by setting an example for their children and modeling the behavior they wanted to see. This supports research that suggests that parents teach their faith, in part, by modeling it (Bunnell, Yocum, Koyzis, & Strohmyer, 2018). Most of the participants (eight of 12) believe that teaching by example is the best way to pass on family values. Only three of the 12 participants said that the primary way they taught their children values is by communicating. This seems to be in contradiction to other research that Latinos share their oral histories and values through storytelling in general and *consejos, testimonios, cuentos,* and *refránes* specifically (Campa, 2010; Ceja, 2004; Delgado Bernal, 2002).

Practical Implications

In 2014, only 14.4% of Latinas/os 25 years or older in the United States had earned a bachelor's degree or higher (Stepler & Brown, 2016). For this study, I interviewed 12 Latina/o participants who had at least one child who graduated from a four-year college. Their stories of success need to be heard and shared with parents and educators alike so that we can learn from their experiences. These parents shared that faith and respect were important values that they taught their children. This was a multi-case study and did not examine if there is a correlation between the values that were taught and the college graduation rate of Latinas/os, and there is no evidence from this study that these values are predictors of success. However, it is worth considering encouraging Latino parents to continue to instill their personal family values. I am not suggesting that families should take on the values in this study, only that they should keep

instilling their own family values. This study, which supports other research by Luna and Martinez (2013), seems to suggest that family values help to strengthen the resiliency of Latina/o students. This is based on the participants sharing stories of their students' successes in school and the perception that those family values played a role in that success. Also, parents may not see immediate results of teaching these values, as accounted by some participants, who mentioned that they had difficulty at one point or another teaching their family values. The practical implication for Latino parents isto keep teaching your family values to their children, whether by example or through stories.

There are implications for educators and schools as well. Educators should self-reflect to determine if there are any racial biases or microaggressions towards Latinas/os, either personal or institutional. Educators need to recognize that Latino students bring value to the classroom through their culture, heritage, and language, and should provide space for Latino students to tell their stories. Schools should celebrate Latino heritage and culture, understanding that there are several sub-cultures within the Latino culture. Lastly, educators and schools should know their families well enough to know the family values that are important to the families, and should support the parents to continue to teach those values.

Delimitations and Limitations

This study has several delimitations based on the boundaries of the study. This study is qualitative in nature and employed a multi-case study design. Storytelling is the main methodology of LatCrit (Espinoza & Harris, 1997; Lynn & Parker, 2006), and counterstories, *testimonios*, *consejos*, narrative, and oral histories are important tools for understanding the experiential knowledge of Latinas/os (Delgado Bernal, 2002; Pérez Huber, 2009b; Solórzano, 1997), thus a qualitative study is most appropriate. *Testimonios* are one form of narrative that

began in Latin America and are used to denounce an injustice (Pérez Huber, 2010). It is important to gather the *testimonios* of Latino families who have successfully navigated through the college experience so that any injustices or difficulties they encountered can be documented.

Another reason to use a qualitative design is because the quantitative literature concerning Latina/o students is already quite extensive (Cavazos et al., 2010; Flores, & O'Brien, 2002; McWhirter, et al., 2007; Navarro, et al., 2007; Perry & Calhoun-Butts, 2012). A case study was an appropriate qualitative design because it examined the real-life phenomenon of Latinas/os who graduate from college in an important context—their families (Yin, 2009). A case study is also appropriate for employing multiple sources of data (Yin, 2009). The setting for this study was Chicago, Illinois, in the homes of the participants. The participants were 12 Latino parents who live in Chicago, Illinois. Each parent has at least one child who has graduated from a four-year college or university. Because the research targeted the families of Latino/a college graduates, the family's ethnicity needed to be Latino. The family's structure could vary; as long as there was at least one college graduate and one parent who had raised the college graduate. Because each participant had at least one child who had graduated from college, the participant ages were at least 35 years old. Throughout the study, the term Latinas/os was used because it refers to a more inclusive group of people than the term Hispanics and also because Latinas/os is a common term used in the literature to include both males (Latinos) and females (Latinas). If the participants or sources clearly delineated between Hispanic and Latina/o, that was noted.

The limitation most often associated with case studies is that of generalizability. It has been noted that cases studies cannot be applied to other scenarios because they are bound by location and time (Merriam, 2009). This study was bound to Chicago, Illinois, so the results may

not be representative of Latino families that live in another city. Another limitation is transferability. When considering transferability, it is important to note that the researcher is not the one who chooses if a case study is applicable, but the reader (Merriam, 2009; Stake, 2005; Yin, 2009). Another limitation is the depth, and thus large scale, that case studies require (Merriam, 2009). Specific to this case study, a limitation rests in the participants and I accurately understanding each other due to any possible language and cultural barriers. Any language barrier was eliminated by choosing participants who were proficient in English. A final limitation is that I selected participants by asking people in my sphere if they knew someone who would be willing to participate. Because most of the people I know have an education background or a religious background, this could have limited the range of the participants' backgrounds and interview responses. However, referring back to the participant section of this study, there was a broad range of socioeconomic, religious, educational, and cultural backgrounds amongst the participants.

Recommendations for Future Research

I have several recommendations for future research. I believe it would further the research to replicate this study with Latinos while also determining if they identify as religious or non-religious. The results of such a study would provide implications for both religious and non-religious Latino parents. It would also enrich the research on this topic to replicate the study outside of Chicago. Family values may or may not vary depending on the context of the participant's location. For instance, are there common family values for Latinos who live in Los Angeles compared to Latinos who live in Chicago? Another example would be to examine if there are common family values for Latinos who live in urban settings compared to Latinos who live in rural settings. Another study that could further this research is to study and compare both

the parent and the student who graduated from college to see if common family values could be identified. Another recommendation for future research is to use a questionnaire or survey instead of interview questions. This would allow the researcher to potentially increase the generalizability and transferability of the study by having many more participants. It would also have the potential to allow the participants to remain completely anonymous, which may or may not encourage more candidness.

Summary

This study found that there were two common family values that Latino parents believed were important to teach their children: faith and respect. This study also showed that Latino parents teach their children these values by example. Latino parents also believe that these values have been influential in enabling their children to graduate from college and to be overall successful. The participants in this study shared their family values and how they taught them by sharing stories of when they were both successful and not successful in teaching their children. They shared hardships that they went through and challenges and obstacles that their children faced. Half of the participants shared that their children encountered discrimination and racism in school because of their Latino background or because they spoke Spanish. Yet, the students persevered to not only graduate from college, but to go into professions such as lawyer, social worker, teacher, principal, and psychologist.

REFERENCES

Ackerman, E. F. (2014). The "illegal alien" as a category of analysis. *Journal of Language and Politics, 13*(3), 563-579. doi: 10.1075/jlp.13.3.09ack

Aguirre, A. (2010). Diversity as interest-convergence in academia: A critical race theory story. *Social Identities, 16*(6), 763-774. doi:10.1080/13504630.2010.524782

Alfaro, E. C., & Umaña-Taylor, A. J. (2010). Latino adolescents' academic motivation: The role of siblings. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 3)*(4), 549-570. doi: 10.1177/0739986310383165

American Immigration Council, Immigration Policy Center. (2011, May 18). *The DREAM Act: Creating opportunities for immigrant students and supporting the U.S. Economy.* Retrieved from http://www.immigrationpolicy.org/sites/default/files/docs/Dream_Act_updated_051811.pdf

Aoki, K., & Johnson, K. R. (2008). An assessment of LatCrit theory ten years after. *Indiana Law Journal, 83*(4), 1151-1195.

Araujo, B. E. (2011). The college assistance migrant program: A valuable resource for migrant farmworker students. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 10*(3), 252-265. doi:10.1177/1538192711406282

Araujo, B. E. (2012). Knowledge from the fields: A migrant farmworker student's community cultural wealth. *Diaspora, Indigenous, and Minority Education, 6*(2), 85-98.

Batalova, J., & McHugh, M. (2010, July 8). DREAM vs. reality: An analysis of potential DREAM Act beneficiaries. *National Center on Immigrant Policy, Migration Policy*

Institute. Retrieved from http://www.migrationpolicy.org/pubs/DREAM-Insight-July2010.pdf

Baum, S., & Flores, S. M. (2011). Higher education and children in immigrant families. *Future of Children, 21*(1), 171-193.

Benard, B. (1991). Fostering resiliency in kids: Protective factors in the family, school and community. Western Regional Center for Drug-Free Schools. Department of Education, Washington, D.C.

Bender, S. W., & Valdés, F. (2011). LatCrit XV symposium afterword—at and beyond fifteen: Mapping LatCrit theory, community, and praxis. *Harvard Latino Law Review, 143*(14), 97-445.

Block, N. C. (2012). Perceived impact of two-way dual immersion programs on Latino students' relationships in their families and communities. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism, 15*(2), 235-257. doi:10.1080/13670050.2011.620079

Boden, K. (2011). Perceived academic preparedness of first-generation Latino college students. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 10*(2), 96-106. doi:10.1177/1538192711402211

Bordes-Edgar, V., Arredondo, P., Kurpius, S., & Rund, J. (2011). A longitudinal analysis of Latina/o students' academic persistence. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 10*(4), 358-368.

Borrero, N. (2011). Shared success: Voices of first-generation college-bound Latino/as. *Multicultural Education, 18*(4), 24-30.

Bozick, R., & Miller, T. (2014). In-state college tuition policies for undocumented immigrants: Implications for high school enrollment among non-citizen Mexican youth. *Population Research & Policy Review, 33*(1), 13-30. doi:10.1007/s11113-013-9307-4

Brod, M., Tesler, L. E., & Christensen, T. L. (2009). Qualitative research and content validity: Developing best practices based on science and experience. *Quality of Life Research, 18*, 1263-1278. doi:10.1007/s11136-009-9540-9

Bunnell, P. W., Yocum, R., Koyzis, A., & Strohmyer, K. (2018). Parent involvement in elementary children's religious education: A phenomenological inquiry. *Journal of Research on Christian Education, 27*(1), 1-19. doi:10.1080/10656219.2018.1442269

Cabrera, N. L., & Padilla, A. M. (2004). Entering and succeeding in the "culture of college": The story of two Mexican heritage students. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 26*(2), 152-170.

Campa, B. (2010). Critical resilience, schooling processes, and the academic success of Mexican Americans in a community college. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 32*(3), 429-455. doi:10.1177/0739986310369322

Cavazos, J., Johnson, M. B., Fielding, C., Cavazos, A. G., Castro, V., & Vela, L. (2010). A qualitative study of resilient Latina/o college students. *Journal of Latinos & Education, 9*(3), 172-188. doi:10.1080/15348431003761166

Ceja, M. (2004). Chicana college aspirations and the role of parents: Developing educational resiliency. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 3*(4), 338-362.

Ceja, M. (2006). Understanding the role of parents and siblings as information sources in the college choice process of Chicana students. *Journal of College Student Development, 47*(1), 87-104.

Close, W., & Solberg, S. (2008). Predicting achievement, distress, and retention among lower-income Latino youth. *Journal of Vocational Behavior, 72*, 31-42. doi: 10.1016/j.jvb.2007.08.007

Closson, R. B. (2010). Critical race theory and adult education. *Adult Education Quarterly, 60*(3), 261-283. doi:10.1177/0741713609358445

Cohen, D., & Crabtree, B. (2006, July). Qualitative research guidelines project. Retrieved from http://www.qualres.org/HomeStru-3628.html

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Creswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2011). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Creswell, J. W. & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into Practice, 39*(3), 124-130.

Crisp, G., & Nora, A. (2010). Hispanic student success: Factors influencing the persistence and transfer decisions of Latino community college students enrolled in developmental education. *Research in Higher Education, 51*(2), 175-194. doi:10.1007/s11162-009-9151-x

Davidson, T. M., & Cardemil, E. V. (2009). Parent-child communication and parental involvement in Latino adolescents. *The Journal of Early Adolescence, 29*(1), 99-121. doi:10.1177/0272431608324480

Davila, E. R., & de Bradley, A. (2010). Examining education for Latinas/os in Chicago: A CRT/LatCrit approach. *Educational Foundations, 24*(1-2), 39-58.

De Luca, S. M., & Escoto, E. R. (2012). The recruitment and support of Latino faculty for tenure and promotion. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(1), 29-40. doi: 10.1177/1538192711435552

Delgado Bernal, D. (2001). Learning and living pedagogies of the home: The mestiza consciousness of Chicana students. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 14*(5), 623-629.

Delgado Bernal, D. (2002). Critical race theory, Latino critical theory, and critical raced-gendered epistemologies: Recognizing students of color as holders and creators of knowledge. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*(1), 105-126.

Delgado, R. (2009). Liberal McCarthyism and the origins of critical race theory. *Iowa Law Review, 94*(5), 1505-1543.

Delgado, R. (Ed.). (1995). *Critical race theory: The cutting edge*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Downs, A., Martin, J., Fossum, M., Martinez, S., Solorio, M., & Martinez, H. (2008). Parents teaching parents: A career and college knowledge program for Latino families. *Journal of Latinos And Education, 7*(3), 227-240.

Espinoza, L., & Harris, A. P. (1997). Afterword: Embracing the tar-baby—LatCrit theory and the sticky mess of race. *California Law Review, 85*(5), 499.

Federal Student Aid. (2015, August). *Questions and answers: Financial aid and undocumented students.* Retrieved from https://studentaid.ed.gov/sa/sites/default/files/financial-aid-and-undocumented-students.pdf

Fernández, L. (2002). Telling stories about school: Using critical race and Latino critical theories to document Latina/Latino education and resistance. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*(1), 45-65. doi: 10.1177/107780040200800104

Flores, J., & Garcia, S. (2009). Latina testimonios: A reflexive, critical analysis of a 'Latina space' at a predominantly White campus. *Race, Ethnicity, & Education, 12*(2), 155-172. doi:10.1080/13613320902995434

Flores, L. Y., & O'Brien, K. M. (2002). The career development of Mexican American adolescent women: A test of social cognitive career theory. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 49*(1), 14-27.

Flores, S. M., & Oseguera, L. (2009). The community college and undocumented immigrant students across state contexts: Localism and public policy. *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, 108*(1), 63-85. doi:10.1111/j.1744-7984.2009.01155.x

Frum, J. L. (2007). Postsecondary educational access for undocumented students: Opportunities and constraints. *American Academic, 3*, 81-108.

Fry, R. (2005). *The higher dropout rates of foreign-born teens: The role of schooling abroad.* Washington, DC: Pew Hispanic Center.

Gillborn, D. (2006). Critical race theory and education: Racism and anti-racism in educational theory and praxis. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education, 27*(1), 11-32. doi:10.1080/01596300500510229

Gloria, A. M., & Castellanos, J. (2012). "Desafios y bendiciones": A multiperspective examination of the educational experiences and coping responses of first-generation college Latina students. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(1), 82-99.

Gloria, A., Castellanos, J., Lopez, A. G., & Rosales, R. (2005). An examination of academic nonpersistence decisions of Latino undergraduates. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 27*, 202-223.

Goffman, E. (1959). *The presentation of self in everyday life.* New York, NY: Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group.

Gonzalez, L. M. (2012). College-level choice of Latino high school students: A social-cognitive approach. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 40*, 144-155.

Gonzalez, L., Stein, G., & Huq, N. (2013). The influence of cultural identity and perceived barriers on college-going beliefs and aspirations of Latino youth in emerging immigrant communities. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences 35*(1), 103-120. doi: 10.1177/0739986312463002

Gravetter, F. J., & Forzano, L. B. (2012). *Research methods for the behavioral sciences* (4th ed.) Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Greenman, E., & Hall, M. (2013). Legal status and educational transitions for Mexican and Central American immigrant youth. *Social Forces, 91*(4), 1475-1498.

Gregg, K., Rugg, M., & Stoneman, Z. (2012). Building on the hopes and dreams of Latino families with young children: Findings from family member focus groups. *Early Childhood Education Journal, 40*(2), 87-96. doi:10.1007/s10643-011-0498-1

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1989). *Fourth generation evaluation.* Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Hernández, C., & González, M. (2011). LatCrit XV symposium foreword: Fifteen years of reconstructing the world. *Harvard Latino Law Review, 142*, 43-255.

Hernandez-Truyol, B., Harris, A., & Valdés, F. (2006). Beyond the first decade: A forward-looking history of LatCrit theory, community and praxis. *Berkeley La Raza Law Journal, 17*(1), 169-216.

Hoefer, M., Rytina, N., & Baker, B. C. (2011). Estimates of the unauthorized immigrant population residing in the United States: January 2011. *Population Estimates, Office of Immigration Statistics, Department of Homeland Security*, 4.

Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996, H.R. 3610, 104th Cong.

Irizarry, J. G. (2011). Buscando la libertad: Latino youths in search of freedom in school. *Democracy & Education, 19*(1), 1-10.

Irizarry, J. G. (2012). Los caminos: Latino/a youth forging pathways in pursuit of higher education. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(3), 291-309. doi: 10.1177/1538192712446322

Jasis, P. M., & Ordoñez-Jasis, R. (2012). Latino parent involvement: Examining commitment and empowerment in schools. *Urban Education, 47*(1), 65-89. doi: 10.1177/0042085911416013

Jimenez-Castellanos, O., & Gonzalez, G. (2012). Understanding the impact of micro-aggressions on the engagement of undocumented Latino immigrant fathers: Debunking deficit thinking. *Journal of Latinos & Education, 11*(4), 204-217. doi:10.1080/15348431.2012.715492

Kim, E., & Díaz., J. (2013). Undocumented students and higher education. *ASHE Higher Education Report, 38*(6), 77-90.

Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. (1995). Toward a critical race theory of education. *Teachers College Record, 97*(1), 47-68.

Larrotta, C., & Yamamura, E. K. (2011). A community cultural wealth approach to Latina/Latino parent involvement: The promise of family literacy. *Adult Basic Education and Literacy Journal, 5*(2), 74-83.

Lee, J. C., & Klugman, J. (2013). Latino school concentration and academic performance among Latino children. *Social Science Quarterly, 94*(4), 977-1015. doi:10.1111/j.1540-6237.2012.00935.x

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry.* Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Loera, G., Rueda, R., & Nakamoto J. (2011). The association between parental involvement in reading and schooling and children's reading engagement in Latino families. *Literacy Research and Instruction, 50*, 133-155. doi:10.1080/19388071003731554

Lopez, G. R., & Vazquez, V. A. (2006). Parental involvement in Latina/Latino-impacted schools in the Midwest: Recognizing the role and function of home-based knowledge and practices. *Journal of School Public Relations, 27*(4), 365-396.

Lopez, M. H. (2009). *Latinos and education: Explaining the attainment gap.* Washington, DC: Pew Research Center.

Luna, N. A., & Martinez, M. (2013). A qualitative study using community cultural wealth to understand the educational experiences of Latino college students. *Journal of Praxis in Multicultural Education, 7*(1), doi: 10.9741/2161-2978.1045

Lynn, M., & Parker, L. (2006). Critical race studies in education: Examining a decade of research on U.S. schools. *Urban Review: Issues and Ideas in Public Education, 38*(4), 257-290.

Martinez, S., & Cervera, Y. L. (2012). Fulfilling educational aspirations: Latino students' college information seeking patterns. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(4), 388-402. doi: 10.1177/1538192711435560

Masten, A. S., Best, K. M., & Garmezy, N. (1990). Resilience and development: Contributions from the study of children who overcome adversity. *Development and Psychopathology, 2,* 425-444. doi:10.1017/S0954579400005812

McWhirter, E. H., Torres, D. M., Salgado, S., & Valdez, M. (2007). Perceived barriers and post-secondary plans in Mexican American and White adolescents. *Journal of Career Assessment*, *15*, 119-138.

Mena, J. A. (2011). Latino parent home-based practices that bolster student academic persistence. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 33*(4), 490-506. doi: 10.1177/0739986311422897

Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Monaghan, P. (1993, June 23). "Critical race theory" questions role of legal doctrine in racial inequity. *The Chronicle of Higher Education, 39*(42), A6-A9.

Montoya, M. E., & Valdés, F. (2008). "Latinas/os" and the politics of knowledge production: LatCrit scholarship and academic activism as social justice action. *Indiana Law Journal, 83*(4), 1197-1233.

Morales, E. E. (2008). Academic resilience in retrospect: Following up a decade later. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 7*(3), 228-248.

National Conference of State Legislatures. (2011, May). *Undocumented student tuition: Federal action*. Retrieved from http://www.ncsl.org/research/education/undocumented-student-tuition-federal-action.aspx

National Conference of State Legislatures. (2014, June 12). *Undocumented student tuition: State action.* Retrieved from http://www.ncsl.org/research/education/undocumented-student-tuition-state-action.aspx

National Conference of State Legislatures. (2015, October 29). *Undocumented student tuition: Overview*. Retrieved from http://www.ncsl.org/research/education/undocumented-student-tuition-overview.aspx

National Immigration Law Center. (2015, March 2). *Frequently asked questions: The Obama administration's DAPA and expanded DACA programs.* Retrieved from https://www.nilc.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/DAPA-DACA-FAQ-2015-03-02.pdf

National Science Foundation, Division of Science, Resources Statistics. (2009). *Doctorate recipients from U.S. universities: Summary report 2007-08* (Special Report No. NSF 10-309). Retrieved from http://www.nsf.gov/statistics/nsf10309/

Navarro, R. L., Flores, L. Y., & Worthington, R. L. (2007). Mexican American middle school students' goal intentions in mathematics and science: A test of social cognitive career theory. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 54*(3), 320-335.

Niehaus, K., Rudasill, K. M., & Adelson, J. L. (2012). Self-efficacy, intrinsic motivation, and academic outcomes among Latino middle school students participating in an after-school program. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 34*(1), 118-136. doi: 10.1177/0739986311424275

Nienhusser, H. K. (2013). Role of high schools in undocumented students' college choice. *Education Policy Analysis Archives, 21*(85), 1-29.

Nienhusser, H. K. (2014). Role of community colleges in the implementation of postsecondary education enrollment policies for undocumented students. *Community College Review, 42*(1), 3-22. doi:10.1177/0091552113509837

Nuñez, A., & Kim, D. (2011). Building a multicontextual model of Latino college enrollment: Student, school, and state-level effects. *Review of Higher Education, 35*(2), 237-263.

Ojeda, L., Navarro, R. L., & Morales, A. (2010). The role of *la familia* on Mexican American men's college persistence intentions. *Psychology of Men & Masculinity.* doi:10.1037/a0020091

Ojeda, L., Piña-Watson, B., Castillo, L. G., Castillo, R., Khan, N., & Leigh, J. (2012). Acculturation, enculturation, ethnic identity, and conscientiousness as predictors of Latino boys' and girls' career decision self-efficacy. *Journal of Career Development, 39*(2), 208-228. doi:10.1177/0894845311405321

Oropeza, M. V., Varghese, M. M., & Kanno, Y. (2010). Linguistic minority students in higher education: Using, resisting, and negotiating multiple labels. *Equity & Excellence in Education, 43*(2), 216-231. doi:10.1080/10665681003666304

Pappamihiel, N. E., & Moreno, M. (2011). Retaining Latino students: Culturally responsive instruction in colleges and universities. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 10*(4), 331-344. doi:10.1177/1538192711410602

Passel, J. (2011). Demography of immigrant youth: Past, present, and future." *The Future of Children*, *21*, 19-41.

Passel, J. S., Capps, R., & Fix, M. (2004). *Undocumented immigrants: Facts and figures.* Retrieved from http://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/alfresco/publication-pdfs/1000587-Undocumented-Immigrants-Facts-and-Figures.PDF

Passel, J., & Cohn, D. (2010). *U.S. unauthorized immigration flows are down sharply since mid-decade*. Retrieved from Pew Hispanic Center http://www.pewhispanic.org/files/reports/126.pdf

Peredaryenko, M. S., & Krauss, S. E. (2013). Calibrating the human instrument: Understanding the interviewing experience of novice qualitative researchers. *The Qualitative Report, 18*(85), 1-17.

Pérez Huber, L. (2009a). Challenging racist nativist framing: Acknowledging the community cultural wealth of undocumented Chicana college students to reframe the immigration debate. *Harvard Educational Review, 79*(4), 704-729.

Pérez Huber, L. (2009b). Disrupting apartheid of knowledge: Testimonio as methodology in Latina/o critical race research in education. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education (QSE), 22*(6), 639-654. doi:10.1080/09518390903333863

Pérez Huber, L. (2010). Using Latina/o critical race theory (LatCrit) and racist nativism to explore intersectionality in the educational experiences of undocumented Chicana college students. *Educational Foundations, 24*(1/2), 77-96.

Pérez Huber, L., Lopez, C. B., Malagon, M. C., Velez, V., & Solórzano, D. G. (2008). Getting beyond the 'symptom,' acknowledging the 'disease': Theorizing racist nativism. *Contemporary Justice Review, 11*(1), 39-51. doi:10.1080/10282580701850397

Pérez, P. A. (2010). College choice process of Latino undocumented students: Implication for recruitment and retention. *Journal of College Admission, 206,* 21-25.

Pérez, W. (2010). Not just a Latino issue. *Journal of College Admission, 206*, 29-31.

Pérez, W., Cortés, R. D., Ramos, K., & Coronado, H. (2010). 'Cursed and blessed': Examining the socioemotional and academic experiences of undocumented Latina and Latino college students. *New Directions for Student Services, 131*, 35-51. doi:10.1002/ss.366

Pérez, W., Espinoza, R., Ramos, K., Coronado, H. M., & Cortes, R. (2009). Academic resilience among undocumented Latino students. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 31*(2), 149-181.

Perry, J. C., & Calhoun-Butts, C. (2012). A qualitative study of urban Hispanic youth in an after-school program: Career, cultural, and educational development. *Counseling Psychologist, 40*(4), 477-519.

Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996, H.R. 3734, 104th Cong.

Pew Hispanic Center. (2012). *Hispanic student enrollments reach new highs in 2011.* Washington, DC: Author.

Pierce, C. M. (1995). Stress analogs of racism and sexism: Terrorism, torture, and disaster. In C. V. Willie, P. P. Rieker, B. M. Kramer, & B. S. Brown (Eds.), *Mental health, racism, and sexism* (pp. 277-293). Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Plyler v. Doe, 457 U.S. 202, 1982.

Próspero, M., Russell, A. C., & Vohra-Gupta, S. (2012). Effects of motivation on educational attainment: Ethnic and developmental differences among first-generation students. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(1), 100-119. doi: 10.1177/1538192711435556

Punch, K. F. (2009). *Introduction to research methods in education.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Ramirez, E. (2011). “No one taught me the steps”: Latinos’ experiences applying to graduate school. *Journal of Latinos and Education, 10*(3), 204-222. doi: 10.1080/15348431.2011.581105

Ramirez, E. (2013). Examining Latinos/as’ graduate school choice process: An intersectionality perspective. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 12*(1), 23-36. doi: 10.1177/1538192712452147

Reynoso, N. A. (2008). Academic resiliency among Dominican English-language learners. *Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 32*(4-6), 391-434.

Rodriguez, N., Mira, C. B., Myers, H. F., Morris, J. K., & Cardoza, D. (2003). Family or friends: Who plays a greater supportive role for Latino college students? *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 8,* 236-250.

Ruiz, Y. (2009). Predictors of academic achievement for Latino middle schoolers. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment, 19*, 419-433. doi: 10.1080/10911350902869409

Saenz, V. B., & Ponjuan L. (2009). The vanishing Latino male in higher education. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 8*(1), 54-89. doi:10.1177/1538192808326995

Schwandt, T. A. (2015). *The SAGE dictionary of qualitative inquiry* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Shah, P. (2009). Motivating participation: The symbolic effects of Latino representation on parent school involvement. *Social Science Quarterly, 90*(1), 212-230. doi:10.1111/j.1540-6237.2009.00612.x

Solórzano, D. G. (1997). Images and words that wound: Critical race theory, racial stereotyping, and teacher education. *Teacher Education Quarterly, 24*(3), 5-19.

Solórzano, D. G. (1998). Critical race theory, race and gender microaggressions, and the experience of Chicana and Chicano scholars. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 11,* 121-136.

Solórzano, D. G., & Delgado Bernal, D. (2001). Examining transformational resistance through a critical race and LatCrit theory framework: Chicana and Chicano students in an urban context. *Urban Education, 36*(3), 308-42.

Solórzano, D. G., & Ornelas, A. (2004). A critical race analysis of Latina/o and African American advanced placement enrollment in public high schools. *High School Journal, 87*(3), 15-26.

Solórzano, D., Villalpando, O., & Oseguera, L. (2005). Educational inequities and Latina/o undergraduate students in the United States: A critical race analysis of their educational progress. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 4*(3), 272-294.

Solórzano, D. G. & Yosso, T. J. (2002). Critical race methodology: Counter-storytelling as an analytical framework for education research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*, 23-44.

Solórzano, D. G., & Yosso, T. J. (2001). Critical race and LatCrit theory and method: Counter-storytelling. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education (QSE), 14*(4), 471-495. doi:10.1080/09518390110063365

Stake, R. E. (2005). *The art of case study research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Stepler, R. (2016, February 26). *Hispanic, Black parents see college degree as key for children's success.* Retrieved from http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2016/02/24/hispanic-black-parents-see-college-degree-as-key-for-childrens-success/

Stepler, R. & Brown, A. (2016, April 19). *Statistical portrait of Hispanics in the United States.* Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/2016/04/19/statistical-portrait-of-hispanics-in-the-united-states/

Stovall, D. (2005). A challenge to traditional theory: Critical race theory, African-American community organizers, and education. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education, 26*(1), 95-108. doi:10.1080/01596300500040912

Taylor, E. (2006). A critical race analysis of the achievement gap in the United States: Politics, reality, and hope. *Leadership & Policy in Schools, 5*(1), 71-87. doi:10.1080/15700760500499025

Taylor, E. (2008). A primer on critical race theory. *The Journal of Blacks in Higher Education, 19*, 122-124.

Teranishi, R. T., Suárez-Orozco, C., & Suárez-Orozco, M. (2011). Immigrants in community colleges. *Future of Children, 21*(1), 153-169.

University of Southern California, Research Libraries. (2016, July). *Organizing your social sciences research paper: Writing field notes*. Retrieved from http://libguides.usc.edu/writingguide/fieldnotes

U.S. Census Bureau. (2010). *American fact finder*. Retrieved from http://factfinder2.census.gov/faces/tableservices/jsf/pages/productview.xhtml?pid=DEC_10_DP_DPDP1

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2011, May 13). *Green card*. Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/greencard

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2013, January 17). *U.S. citizenship.* Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/us-citizenship

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2013, September 11). *Working in the U.S.* Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/working-united-states/working-us

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2015, August 3). *Consideration of deferred action for childhood arrivals.* Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/consideration-deferred-action-childhood-arrivals-daca

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2015, October 26). *Students and exchange visitors.* Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/working-united-states/students-and-exchange-visitors

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2018, February 14). *Deferred action for childhood arrivals: Response to January 2018 preliminary injunction.* Retrieved from https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/deferred-action-childhood-arrivals-response-january-2018-preliminary-injunction

Urrutia-Rojas, X., Marshall, K., Trevino, E., Sue, G. L., & Minguia-Bayona, G. (2006). Disparities in access to health care and health status between documented and undocumented Mexican immigrants in North Texas. *Hispanic Health Care International, 4*(1), 5-14.

Valdés, F. (1996). Foreword: Latina/o ethnicities, critical race theory, and post-identity politics in postmodern legal culture: From practices to possibilities. *La Raza Law Journal, 9,* 1-31.

Valdés, F. (1997). Foreword: Under construction—LatCrit consciousness, community, and theory. *California Law Review, 85*(5), 1087-1141.

Valdés, F. (2000). Race, ethnicity, and Hispanismo in a triangular perspective: The 'Essential Latina/o' and LatCrit theory. *UCLA Law Review, 48*(2), 305.

Valdez, T. M., & Lugg, C. (2010). Community cultural wealth and Chicano/Latino students. *Journal of School Public Relations, 31*(3), 224-237.

Vela-Gude, L., Cavazos Jr., J., Johnson, M. S., Fielding, C., Cavazos, A. G., Campos, L., & Rodriguez, I. (2009). "My counselors were never there": Perceptions from Latino college students. *Professional School Counseling, 12*(4), 272-279.

Villalpando, O. (2004). Practical considerations of critical race theory and Latino critical theory for Latino college students. *New Directions for Student Services, 105,* 41-50.

Waxman, H. C., Padrón, Y. N., Jee-Young, S., & Rivera, H. H. (2008). Closing the achievement gap within reading and mathematics classrooms by fostering Hispanic students' educational resilience. *International Journal of Social Sciences, 3*(1), 24-34.

Yamamura, E. K., Martinez, M. A., & Saenz, V. B. (2010). Moving beyond high school expectations: Examining stakeholders' responsibility for increasing Latina/o students' college readiness. *High School Journal, 93*(3), 126-148.

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Designs and methods.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Yosso, T. J. (2005). Whose culture has capital? A critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. *Race, Ethnicity, & Education, 8*(1), 69-91.

Yosso, T. J. (2006). *Critical race counterstories along the Chicana/Chicano educational pipeline.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Zalaquett, C. P. (2005). Study of successful Latina/o students. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education*, *5*, 35-47.

Zarate, M. E., & Burciaga, R. (2010). Latinos and college access: Trends and future directions. *Journal of College Admission, 209*, 24-29.

Zhou, M. (2009). How neighbourhoods matter for immigrant children: The formation of educational resources in Chinatown, Koreatown and Pico Union, Los Angeles. *Journal of Ethnic and Migrations Studies, 35*, 1153-1179.

APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Interview Protocol: Values that Latina/o parents teach their children

Time of Interview:

Date:

Place:

Interviewer:

Interviewee:

Questions

Say: *I am going to ask you a few questions about what you thought was important to teach your child while they were growing up. Please share with me as much as you feel comfortable. Remember, that your name and specific details will be changed to protect your identity.*

1. Please tell me: What are some values you believed were important for you to teach your children?

   Probe 1: Why were these values important to you?

2. How did you teach your son/daughter these values?

   Probe 1: Can you give me a specific example?

3. When you were teaching your son/daughter these values, can you tell me what ways worked and what ways did not work?

4. Can you please tell me about a time when you successfully taught your son/daughter an important value?

Probe 1: How did s/he show you that they displayed it?

Probe 2: How did you feel afterward?

5. Can you please tell me about a time when you struggled to teach your son/daughter an important value?

   Probe 1: How did s/he show you that they did not display it?

   Probe 2: How did you feel afterward?

Say: *Now I am going to ask you about any difficult times you and your child faced during their education. Please share with me as much as you feel comfortable. Remember, that your name and specific details will be changed to protect your identity.*

6. Can you tell me about a time your family faced a hardship that you felt affected your child's education?
7. How did you and your child respond to the hardship?
8. If there were any other times you faced hardship that you felt affected your child's education, can you tell me about those?
9. Was there ever a time that you felt your child had trouble or problems in school because s/he is Latina/o (or Hispanic)?

   Probe: Why did you think the trouble was because s/he is Latina/o (or Hispanic)?

10. How do you think the values you told me about earlier helped your son/daughter when they faced problems in school?
11. Can you tell me about a specific example of when your son/daughter used a value you taught them to overcome a problem they face in school?

    Probe: Are there any other times you can remember that you would like to tell me about?

12. Is there anything else you would like to add or say that these questions have caused you to think about?

Say: *Thank you for your stories and for your time. I appreciate what you've told me. I will share the results with you before they are published so you can let me know if I've accurately described what you told me. Thank you again.*

APPENDIX B: IRB APPROVAL

LIBERTY UNIVERSITY.
INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD

March 24, 2017

Jeremiah Riggs
IRB Approval 2789.032417: How Latina/O Family Values Impact Student Persistence to College Graduation: A Multi-Case Study

Dear Jeremiah Riggs,

We are pleased to inform you that your study has been approved by the Liberty University IRB. This approval is extended to you for one year from the date provided above with your protocol number. If data collection proceeds past one year, or if you make changes in the methodology as it pertains to human subjects, you must submit an appropriate update form to the IRB. The forms for these cases were attached to your approval email.

Thank you for your cooperation with the IRB, and we wish you well with your research project.

Sincerely,

[redacted]

Administrative Chair of Institutional Research
The Graduate School

LIBERTY
UNIVERSITY.
Liberty University | Training Champions for Christ since 1971

APPENDIX C: ENGLISH CONSENT

Consent Form

HOW LATINA/O FAMILY VALUES IMPACT STUDENT PERSISTENCE TO COLLEGE GRADUATION: A MULTI-CASE STUDY

Jeremiah R. Riggs
Liberty University
School of Education

You are invited to be in a research study of the values that Latino parents instill in their children. You were selected as a possible participant because you have at least one child that has graduated from college. I ask that you read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to be in the study.

This study is being conducted by Jeremiah Riggs from the School of Education at Liberty University.

Background Information:

The purpose of this study is to examine the common values that Latinos instill in their children that they believe helped their child be successful to graduate college.

Procedures:

If you agree to be in this study, I would ask you to do the following things:
I will come over to your home to visit you and to interview you. During this visit, please provide any papers, books, or other things that you would like to share from your child's school experience. This could be books they used to read, old report cards, pictures from childhood, or any other item you would like to share.
I will be taking notes and taking pictures of the items you provide. I will not keep them or take them with me.
Afterward, I will interview you for approximately 45 minutes. The interview questions will allow you the opportunity to provide details about any experiences that you believe were important to your child's educational success. The interview will audio recorded.

Risks and Benefits of being in the Study:

The study has limited risks: The risks involved with this study are minimal. They are no more than you would encounter in everyday life. You may become emotional as you recall events from your daughter's childhood. Should you need to take a break or need to pause the interview, please ask and we will do so.

The benefits to participation are that we can determine common values that Latinos pass on to their children that help them be successful to obtain a college degree. Educators can encourage other Latino families to instill the same values in their children.

Compensation:

You will not receive payment for your participation in this study.

Confidentiality:

The records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report I might publish, I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely and only the researcher will have access to the records. The data recorded will be stored on a password-protected SD card that will locked away in a filing cabinet. After three years, the data will be permanently deleted.

Voluntary Nature of the Study:

Participation in this study is voluntary. Your decision whether or not to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Liberty University. If you decide to participate, you are free to not answer any question or withdraw at any time without affecting those relationships.

Contacts and Questions:

The researcher conducting this study is Jeremiah Riggs. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact him at XXX-XXX-XXXX.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and would like to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd, Suite 1837, Lynchburg, VA 24502 or email at irb@liberty.edu.

You will be given a copy of this information to keep for your records.

Statement of Consent:

I have read and understood the above information. I have asked questions and have received answers. I consent to participate in the study.

☐ I agree to allow Jeremiah Riggs to audio record my interview.

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Signature of Investigator:_____ Date: _____

IRB Code Numbers: 2789.032417

IRB Expiration Date: March 24, 2018

APPENDIX D: SPANISH CONSENT

Formulario del Consentimiento

CÓMO LOS VALORES DE LA FAMILIA LATINA / O IMPACTAN LA PERSISTENCIA DEL ESTUDIANTE A LA GRADUACIÓN DE UNIVERSIDAD: UN ESTUDIO MULTI-CASO

Jeremiah R. Riggs
Liberty University
Escuela de Educación

Esta invitado a participar en un estudio investigativo sobre los valores que los padres latinos les inculcan a sus hijos. Usted fue elegido como un participante posible porque usted tiene por lo menos un hijo/a que se ha graduado del colegio. Se le pide a usted que lea este formulario y que haga cualquier pregunta o duda que pueda tener antes de afirmar estar de acuerdo con participar en el estudio.

Este estudio está siendo realizado por Jeremiah Riggs de la escuela de Liberty del programa de Educación.

Información del Trasfondo:

El propósito de este estudio es para examinar los valores comunes que los latinos les inculcan a sus hijos y que ellos creen que les han ayudado a ser exitosos y graduar del colegio.

Procedimientos:

Si usted decide y afirma estar de acuerdo con participar en este estudio, nos gustaría pedirle que haga las siguientes cosas:
Yo iré a su casa a visitar y entrevistarlos. Durante esta visita por favor de mostrar cualquier libro, o trabajos de sus hijos que guste enseñar. Esto puede ser libros que han leído, calificaciones, fotografías, o cualquier otra cosa.
Yo voy a tomar notas y tomar fotos de lo que me enseñen. No me quedare con ellos ni me las llevare. Después, los entrevistare por aproximadamente 45 minutos. Las preguntas les dará la oportunidad de dar detalles de las experiencias que usted cree que fueron importantes en la educación de su hijo/hija. La entrevista será audio grabado.

Riesgos y Beneficios de Participar en el Estudio:

Los riesgos de este estudio son mínimos. No serán mas de lo encontraría en la vida diaria. Puede ser un poco emocional cuando recuerden los eventos de la vida de sus hijos. Si necesitan tomar una pausa durante la entrevista por favor de preguntar me y lo haremos.

Los beneficios de participar son que podemos establecer valores comunes que los latinos les inculcan a sus hijos que les ayudan a ser exitosos y a obtener colegiatura. Educadores pueden animar a otras familias latinas a inculcar los mismos valores en sus hijos.

Compensación:

Usted no recibirá ningún pago por su participación.

Privacidad:

La información sobre este estudio se mantendrá privada. En cualquier tipo de informe que se pueda publicar sobre el estudio, no se incluirá ningún tipo de información que pueda hacer posible la identificación del sujeto. La información de la investigación se guardará de manera segura y sólo los investigadores tendrán acceso a ella. La información grabada será guardada en una tarjeta protegida con clave que será guardada en un gabinete con candado. Después de tres años la información será borrada para siempre.

Carácter voluntario del estudio:

Participación en este estudio es voluntaria. Si usted decide no participar no va ser afectado con su relación o futuro con la Universidad Liberty. Si usted decide participar, está libre de no responder a cualquier pregunta o retirar en cualquier momento sin afectar las relaciones con la Universidad.

El investigador que está realizando este estudio es Jeremiah Riggs. Usted puede hacer cualquier pregunta que tenga ahora. Si usted tiene preguntas más tarde, **se le anima** a que se comunique con él al XXX-XXX-XXXX.

Si usted tiene preguntas o dudas sobre este estudio y si desearía hablar con alguien que no sea el investigador (o los investigadores), **se le anima** a que se comunique con la Institutional Review Board (la Junta de Revisión Institucional), 1971 University Blvd, Suite 1837, Lynchburg, VA 24502 o mandar un correo electrónico a irb@liberty.edu.

Se le entregará a usted una copia de esta información para guardar en sus propios archivos.

Declaración de Consentimiento:

He leído y he entendido la información arriba. He hecho preguntas y he recibido respuestas. Consiento participar en el estudio.

☐ Estoy de acuerdo en permitirle a Jeremiah Riggs para grabar mi entrevista.

Firma: _____ Fecha: _____

Firma del investigador:_____ Fecha: _____

Números de Códigos de la IRB: 2789.032417

Fecha de Vencimiento del Estudio Asignada por la IRB: March 24, 2018