

**HOW POLICY TRAVELS:
THE COURSE AND EFFECTS OF SCHOOL
FUNDING POLICY ON EQUITY AT DIFFERENT
LEVELS OF THE EDUCATION SYSTEM**

by

ITUMELENG SAMUEL MOLALE

2004

**HOW POLICY TRAVELS:
THE COURSE AND EFFECTS OF
SCHOOL FUNDING POLICY ON EQUITY AT
DIFFERENT LEVELS OF THE EDUCATION SYSTEM**

by

ITUMELENG SAMUEL MOLALE

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree:

PHILOSOPHIAE DOCTOR

Department of Education Management, Law and Policy
Faculty of Education
UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

PROMOTER:
Prof. Dr. Jonathan D. Jansen

PRETORIA
2004

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The motivation, encouragement, support, co-operation, assistance and critical advice of several people and organizations were immensely helpful in the completion of this study.

First among these people is my promoter, *Professor J.D. Jansen*, who provided me with motivation, appropriate skills and expertise, determination for success and critical commentary. Indeed, I am greatly indebted to him for his wisdom, patience and untiring guidance.

A special word of gratitude goes to *Professor S.A. Anduetyey* for his personal interest and motivation in my academic studies. The same goes to the library staff of the *University of Pretoria*, in particular, *Mr van Wyk* for assistance with inter-loan books; staff of the *University of North West* for allowing me access to their facilities and *Mr Marumo* for help with statistical analysis of the data collected.

Both *Mrs Elison* and *Mr E.N. Molale* who provided linguistic and technical assistance to me equally deserve my thanks. Special thanks also to my colleagues in the Chief Directorate of Quality Assurance who were willing to serve especially, *Dr Teu*, *Messrs T. Tholo* and *J.Badimo*.

My personal sentiment and thankfulness also goes to Education Policy Analysts, *Dr M. Chakane* of WITS Education Policy Unit, *Mr S. Vally* the leader of the Education Rights Organisation, *Mr Russell Wildeman* of the Institute of Democracy of South Africa (IDASA), *Mr Pillay* of the Education Foundation who were willing to share their precious time by being ready to share their insights in the semi-structured interview. The same is extended to both *Dr Visser* and *Advocate Boshoff* of the National Department of Education (NDoE) for being prepared to participate in this research study.

My sense of appreciation and thankfulness is also directed to *Mr A. Seakamela*, the Deputy Director General of the North West Education Department for both granting me permission to have direct access to schools, regions and head office for interview purposes. This also refers to the motivation for the *National Research Foundation (NRF)* which inspired me greatly. The role of *Mr F. Conradie*, the Chief Financial Office of the North West Education Department for availing financial documents to me, is acknowledged and appreciated.

The research study could not have been successfully completed without the active participation of the following: *regional officials, principals of the five selected schools, all educators in the said schools and representatives of the National Association of Professional Teachers Association (NAPTOSA) and Suid Afrikaanse Onderwys Unie (SAOU)*. I am very thankful to all of you.

A word of appreciation also goes to the two secretaries *Miss K. Masetloa* and *L. Monkwe* for assistance with the bulk typing and retyping.

Most importantly a special word of appreciation goes to my wife *Thomelo Barbara* and my children *Lesego* and *Tshegofatso* who showed tremendous support, understanding and patience for me in the pursuit of this study. Their sustainable endurance of my regular absence from home, spending long hours in the library and travelling between Mafikeng and the University of Pretoria remained unshakable. This thesis is dedicated to them.

Finally all thanks go to the *Almighty God* who gave me sufficient strength and good health to see this study to the end.

Of significance is the personal contribution of both my fellow PhD colleagues *Mr Dan More* and *Ms M. Mokoena* who kept encouraging me to persevere.

Of critical importance to my study, is the financial assistance I received from the National Research Foundation (NRF). This enabled me to acquire assistance for the transcription of the recorded interviews and the purchasing of the necessary books and materials.

May God bless you all

---oOo---

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I, Itumeleng Samuel Molale, declare that this doctoral thesis on

**How Policy Travels: The Course and Effects of New School Funding Policy
on Equity at the different levels of the Education System**

and submitted to the University of Pretoria is my own work in design and execution.

All sources cited or quoted have been duly acknowledged. I have not previously submitted this thesis for a degree at any university. And I did not and will not allow anyone to copy my work with the intention of presenting it as his or her own work.

Signature: _____

Date: _____

---oOo---

ABSTRACT

Successful implementation of equity driven policies has proven to be a difficult and vexing issue especially in developing countries. As a result, many educational reforms were found in practice to be at variance with their founding objectives. The purpose of this exploratory and descriptive study therefore was to trace the implementation pathway traveled by the National Norms and Standards for School Funding (NNSSF) Policy from the center (National Department of Education) to the periphery (school level). This was informed by the necessity to explain where, how and why the discrepancy developed between the policy intentions and educational outcomes (i.e. effects). The NNSSF policy aimed at the fundamental transformation of the schools since it requires the following things to happen : the delegation of financial management and authority to the School Governing Body (SGB), the day-to-day management of curriculum delivery, the generation of additional funds, and the improvement and maintenance of school infrastructure. The allocation and management of these functions constitute in what is called “self-managing schools”, thus freeing such schools from the bureaucratic processes associated with centralization.

This (research) investigation is guided by two research questions:

1. How was the new School Funding Policy (SFP) implemented within and through the different levels of the education system?
2. What were the effects of the National Norms and Standards For School Funding (NNSSF) policy on equity at school level?

In essence, this research explains how different education stakeholders understand the new funding policy, and with what effects. In tracing the course of the NNSSF policy, I paid special attention to policy breakdown by comparing and contrasting the views and estimations of various implementers across the four levels of the education system namely: national, provincial, regional and school levels. This research on the understandings of policy was not restricted to formal definitions of policy, but went further to seek

understanding on the practical unfolding of the funding policy separately, and in relation to other policies.

Data was collected over a period of seventeen (17) months. In this regard, I used multiple methods of data collection including profiling, semi-structured interviews, critical observations of the setting, document analysis, photographic records and structured questionnaires. The main findings of the study include the following :

- ◆ The National officials showed a legalistic and formal understanding of the NNSSF policy, but such understanding lacked a holistic, coherent and integrated approach to equity.
- ◆ The understanding of the policy varied among the provincial officials. But such understanding again demonstrated a bureaucratic or functionalist-oriented approach to the implementation of the NNSSF policy. This suggests that much emphasis was placed on observing protocol and official communication of the new policy..
- ◆ The regional policy implementers demonstrated a limited understanding of the policy. Such an understanding could be characterised as a disengaging approach to policy and a sense of despair on how the implementation unfolded.
- ◆ The effects of the NNSSF policy on equity differed across the five case study schools. For example, previously advantaged schools (like Siege) experienced negative effects due to inadequate state allocation. This had ripple effects in the form of exorbitant school fees and the issuing of a lawsuit against a parent who was not able to pay such high fees.
- ◆ The previously disadvantaged schools were able to do their own planning which led to the timeous acquisition of resources as a result of the financial allocation to the school level.

The key findings as well as the implications of this research only make this study unique, but also offer critical insights into policy implementation in developing contexts. The fact

that the research involved the collection of data at four levels of the education system over a period of seventeen months generated extensive data sets for policy analysis. The collection of both qualitative (contextual) and quantitative data contributed to strengthening the validity and reliability of the study as a whole. Most importantly, the knowledge gained from this study not only offers policy lessons for the North-West province, but it yields important insights for policy implementers across the education system.

---oOo---

KEYWORDS

Accountability

Education for all

Equity-driven policy

Grounded theory

Inequalities

Legislative/policy intentions

Policy implementation

School level effects

Self-managing schools

Teacher-development

---oOo---

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AEN	Additional Education Needs
ANC	African National Congress
BOP	Bophuthatswana
CED	Cape Education Department
CEM	Council of Education Ministers
CM	Circuit Manager
CMLC	Change Management Learning Centre
COSAS	Congress of South Africa
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CR	Central Region\
DANIDA	Danish Internal Development Agency
DAS	Developmental Appraisal System
DI	Depth Interview
DMC	Departmental Management Committee
DoE	Department of Education
DOF	Department of Finance
EDP	Equity Driven Program
EEA	Employment of Educator's Act, 1998
EF	Education Foundation
EFA	Education for All
ELRC	Education Labour Relations Council
EMD	Education Management Development
EMIS	Education Management Information System
EPU-WITS	Education Policy Units of Witswatersrand University
ERA	Education Reform Act
ERP	Education Rights Project
ESEA	Elementary & Secondary Education Act
ESG	Education Support Grant
ESR	Effective School Research
ET	Education & Training
EU	Educators' Unions
FAI	Free Attitude Interview
FET	Further Education & Training

FPE	Free Primary Education
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEAR	Growth Employment and Redistribution
GER	Gross Enrolment Ratio
GMS	Grant Maintain Schools
GNU	Government of National Unity
HEDCOM	Heads of Education Department Committee
HED	House of Delegates
HODs	Heads of Departments
HSRC	Human Science Research Council
IDASA	Institute of Democracy of South Africa
IDRA	Intercultural Development Research Association
IQMS	Integrated Quality Management System
IRP	Independent Review Panel
JET	Joint Education Trust
LEA	Local Education Authority Training Grants
LEATG	Local Education Authority Training Grants
LDCE	Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English
LLD	Learners with Learning Disabilities
LMS	Local Management at Schools
MEC	Member of Executive Council
MLA	Monitoring Learning Achievement
MSTP	Management of School Training Programme
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NAPTOSA	National Association of Professional Teachers Organisation of South Africa
NCE	National Commission in Education
NDoE	National Department of Education
NEM	National Education Ministry
NEPA	National Education Policy Act
NMEC	Namibia Ministry of Education and Culture
NNSSF	National Norms and Standard for School Funding
NQAF	National Quality Assurance Framework
NRC	National Research Commission
NWED	North West Education Department
NWP	North West Province
OBE	Outcome-Based Education
OED	Oxford English Dictionary

PAC	Pan Africanist Congress
PAM	Public Administration Measures
PASO	Pan Africanist Student Organisation
PED	Provincial Education Department
PEO	Provincial Education Office
PI	Participatory Interview
PPM	Post Provisioning Model
PSNP	Primary School Nutrition Programme
PTR	Pupil Teachers Ratio
QLP	Quality Learning Project
QMS	Quality Management System
RDP	Reconstruction and Development Programme
RP	Review Panel
R&R	Rationalisation and Redeployment Policy
RSA	Republic of South Africa
RTL	Resource Targeting List
RTT	Resource Target Table
S 21	Section 21 Schools
SADTU	South African Democratic Teachers Union
SAOU	Suid Afrikaanse Onderwyser Unie
SE	Systemic Evaluation
SFP	School Funding Policy
SGB	School Governing Body
SASA 1996	South African Schools Act (1996)
SDP	School Development Plan
SMT	Senior Management Team
SRN	School Register of Needs
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Funds
USA	United States of America
WSE	Whole School Evaluation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CHAPTER ONE	
STAGE SETTING: AN EXPEDITION IN SEARCH OF EQUITY	
INTRODUCTION	1
PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY	2
PROBLEM STATEMENT AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY	3
RATIONALE	8
THE POLICY CONTEXT FOR NSSF	13
APPROACH TO THE STUDY	18
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	21
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	23
ORGANIZATION OF THE CHAPTERS	24
1.10 THE CENTRAL REGION IN CONTEXT	28
1.11 ORGANISATION OF THE CHAPTERS	29
1.12 CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	30

CHAPTER TWO
POLICY STUMBLES ON REALITY: A CRITICAL EXAMINATION OF
STUDIES ON POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

INTRODUCTION	31
THE CONCEPTUALIZATION OF KEY TERMS CENTRAL TO THE INVESTIGATION	34
What, then, is implementation?	35
KEY STRATEGIES EMPLOYED TO PURSUE EQUITY IN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES	44
Taxation	46
Funding formula which promised too much but deliveries little	53
Performance indicators	56
THE FAILURE TO ACHIEVE EQUITY IN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES	64
The elusiveness of policy implementation	67
STRATEGIES TO PURSUE EQUITY: LESSONS LEARNED	69
AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE	71
2.6.1 Systemic school change	73
2.6.2 A theoretical perspective on policy implementation	75
2.6.3 Flexible approaches to policy implementation	78
2.6.4 The politics of policy implementation	79
A CRITICAL REVIEW OF THE EFFORTS TO ACHIEVE EQUITY IN SOUTH AFRICA	80
LOCATING SCHOOL FINANCE POLICY IN A MACRO- ECONOMIC FRAMEWORK	81

	Page
THE STRATEGIES ADOPTED TO FACILITATE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NNSSF POLICY	85
IS EQUITY BEING ACHIEVED WHERE IT MATTERS MOST?	86
THE CARRY-THROUGH EFFECTS OF INADEQUATE BUDGET	88
2.12 LACK OF CAPACITY ACROSS THE SYSTEM	95
2.13 EXAMINATION OF “GAPS” IN THE LITERATURE ON POLICY EFFECTS	95
2.14 CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	96

CHAPTER THREE
THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

INTRODUCTION	98
DEVELOPMENT OF A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	100
CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	107

---oOo---

CHAPTER FOUR
RESEARCH DESIGN: HOW POLICY TRAVELS FROM THE CENTRE TO THE
PERIPHERY

INTRODUCTION	108
NATIONAL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT LEVEL	109
Provincial education department level	110
Regional education level	111
The school levels	114
Stakeholders and experts	121
BASIC APPROACH TO DATA COLLECTION	123
Semi-structured interview	126
Data processing, analysis and coding	129
QUESTIONNAIRE DEVELOPMENT	137
ENSURING VALIDITY	139
LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY	141
CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	142

CHAPTER FIVE
EXPLORING UNDERSTANDINGS OF THE EDUCATION POLICY AT
FOUR LEVELS OF THE EDUCATION SYSTEM

INTRODUCTION	143
FINDINGS	144
National education departmental level	144
Provincial level (Officials)	149
Regional level (Officials)	154
School level: Where policy hits the ground	157
Tshwene Primary School: Case study #1	157
Siege Primary School: Case study #2	159
Banogeng Primary School: Case study #3	164
Bogosing Secondary School: Case study #4	168
Mosima Secondary School: Case study #5	169
5.2.5 Policy experts/education stakeholders	172
CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	176

CHAPTER SIX
POLICY GOALS AND SCHOOL LEVEL EFFECTS ON EQUITY:
“INTENTIONS AND TENSIONS”

INTRODUCTION	177
FINDINGS AT FIVE CASE STUDY SCHOOL	178
Tshwene Primary School: Case Study #1	178
Siege Primary School: Case Study #2	188
Banogeng Primary School: Case Study #3	193
Bogosing Secondary School: Case Study #4	197
Mosima Secondary School: Case Study #5	198
CROSS-CASE COMPARISON	200
CHAPTER SYNTHESIS	203

---oOo---

CHAPTER SEVEN
THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN POLICY AND PRACTICE: THEORISING
IMPLEMENTATION

INTRODUCTION	204
POLICY, THEORY AND PRACTICE	205
7.3 RATIONAL THEORY AND RESEARCH FINDINGS	216
7.4 ANALYSIS OF THE EFFECTS OF FISCAL EQUITY	221
7.5 CONCLUSION	223

---oOo---

REFERENCE 228

APPENDICES 243

---oOo---

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 2.1: An Implementation Framework for Management of Change	63
Figure 2.2: Dimension of policy affecting implementation	76
Figure 3.1: The Pathways along which policy is assumed to be traveling in an education system	99
Figure 3.2: The conceptual Framework	103
Figure 4.1: The fictitious (pseudonyms) names of the case study schools	113
Figure 5.1: How teachers first became aware of the NNSF policy	167
figure 7.2: Factors influencing school capacity and student achievement	225

LIST OF GRAPHS

	Page
Graph 3.1: National and Provincial Comparison of Grade 12 results	27
Graph 3.2: Grade 12 pass rate between 2001 and 2003 per region	28
Graph 5: The responses of teachers according to rank	162

---oOo---

LIST OF TABLES

		Pages
Table 1.1:	Resource targeting list for financial allocation	15
Table 2.1:	Personnel expenditure as a percentage of the education budget per province	91
Table 2.2:	Non-personnel expenditure as a percentage in PED	92
Table 2.3:	Allocation per Quintile	93
Table 4.1:	The interviews transcript with observer's comments	130
Table 4.2:	The transcript with inferential codes	131
Table 4.3:	Example of the coding system for the identification of institutions and respondents	133
Table 4.4:	Example of a coding system with major and minor themes	135
Table 5.1:	The responses of teachers on what stimulated the NNSSF policy	159
Table 6(a):	The positive effects of the policy	181
Table 6(b):	The history of school fees and state allocation.	202
Table 7.1:	Grade 12 Results	213

LIST OF MAP

	Page
Map 3.1: Educational regions in the North West Province	26

---oOo---

LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS/VISUAL TEXTS

		Page
Photograph #1:	Case Study #1 Tshwene Primary School	115
Photograph #2:	Case Study #2 Siege Primary School	116
Photograph #3:	Case Study #3 Banogeng Primary School	117
Photograph #4:	Case Study #4 Bogosing Secondary School	118
Photograph #5:	Case Study#5 Mosima Secondary School	120
Photograph 6(a):	Conditions in a principal's office	183
Photograph 6(b):	A classroom turned into staff room	184
Photograph 6(c):	The state of the school library	191

---oooOooo---