

International Courts and Environmental Protection

Tim Stephens
University of Sydney



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>page</i> <i>xiii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xvi</i>
<i>List of tables</i>	<i>xviii</i>
<i>List of figures</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	<i>xx</i>
<i>Table of cases</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Table of treaties and other international instruments</i>	<i>xxxiii</i>
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Development of international environmental law	2
1.2 International environmental governance through courts and tribunals	7
1.3 Role and relevance of international courts	10
1.4 Judicial development of international environmental law	12
1.5 Future challenges for international environmental litigation	16
Part I International courts and environmental governance	19
2 The patchwork of jurisdictions	21
2.1 Adjudicating international environmental cases	21
2.1.1 The expanding jurisdictional patchwork	21
2.2 The proliferation of international adjudicative bodies	27
2.2.1 Ad hoc and institutional arbitration	28
2.2.2 ICJ	36
2.2.3 ITLOS and part XV of the LOS Convention	40

2.2.4	WTO	47
2.2.5	Court of Justice of the European Communities	51
2.2.6	Human rights courts and other bodies	53
2.2.7	International Criminal Court (ICC)	54
2.3	Adding a new patch: an International Court for the Environment?	56
2.3.1	ICE project	58
2.3.2	Critique of the ICE project	59
2.4	Conclusion	61
3	Institutions of international environmental governance	63
3.1	Traditional approaches to compliance control	65
3.1.1	State responsibility	65
3.1.2	Breach of treaty	70
3.1.3	Inter-state dispute settlement	71
3.2	New approaches to compliance control	78
3.2.1	Domestic courts	78
3.2.2	Compliance procedures	81
3.3	Conclusion	89
4	International courts and environmental governance	91
4.1	International courts and environmental governance	92
4.2	Adjudication as a method of dispute settlement	93
4.2.1	Challenges of multiparty litigation	93
4.2.2	Polycentricity of environmental disputes	95
4.3	Adjudication as a method of compliance control	102
4.3.1	Managerialist critique	103
4.3.2	New institutionalist perspectives	105
4.4	Conclusion	115
	Part II Judicial development	119
5	Transboundary environmental damage	121
5.1	Jurisprudence	122
5.1.1	Origins	122
5.1.2	<i>Trail Smelter</i> case	123
5.1.3	<i>Nuclear Tests</i> litigation	137

5.1.4	Transboundary harm and international watercourses	150
5.2	Impact of the case law	151
5.2.1	Principle 21 of the Stockholm Declaration	151
5.2.2	Treaty transformation	153
5.2.3	Work of the ILC	155
5.3	Conclusion	161
6	Freshwater resources and ecosystems	163
6.1	Jurisprudence	164
6.1.1	<i>Lake Lanoux</i> case	166
6.1.2	<i>River Oder</i> case	171
6.1.3	<i>Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project</i> case	173
6.1.4	<i>Pulp Mills</i> case	187
6.2	Impact of the case law	190
6.3	Conclusion	194
7	Marine wildlife and ecosystems	196
7.1	Marine wildlife and ecosystems	197
7.1.1	Limits of coastal state jurisdiction	200
7.1.2	Disputes under the LOS Convention	214
7.2	Pollution or alteration of marine environments	229
7.2.1	French nuclear testing in the Pacific	230
7.2.2	<i>MOX Plant</i> dispute	232
7.2.3	<i>Straits of Johor</i> case	240
7.3	Conclusion	243
	Part III Contemporary challenges	245
8	Public interest proceedings	247
8.1	Public participation in international environmental law	248
8.1.1	Domestic environmental governance	249
8.1.2	International environmental governance	251
8.2	Public participation in international environmental litigation	252
8.2.1	Civil society in international environmental litigation	252

8.2.2	Existing opportunities for public interest proceedings	253
8.3	Reconceptualising international public interest litigation	264
8.4	Conclusion	269
9	Jurisdictional coordination	271
9.1	Gaps and overlaps	272
9.1.1	Jurisdictional competition	272
9.1.2	Typology of competition	273
9.2	Resultant difficulties	275
9.2.1	Forum shopping	275
9.2.2	Simultaneous proceedings	279
9.2.3	Successive proceedings	285
9.3	Jurisdictional coordination	286
9.3.1	Applying jurisdiction-regulating rules	287
9.4	Conclusion	302
10	Fragmentation of international environmental law	304
10.1	Fragmentation of international law	304
10.1.1	International courts and fragmentation	305
10.1.2	Institutional imbalances	307
10.2	International environmental law in specialised courts and tribunals	310
10.2.1	Human rights bodies	310
10.3	WTO	321
10.3.1	Trade law and environmental protection	321
10.3.2	Environmental jurisprudence	323
10.3.3	Cases concerning GATT environmental exemptions	324
10.3.4	<i>Tuna-Dolphin</i> cases	325
10.3.5	<i>Shrimp-Turtle</i> cases	326
10.3.6	Sanitary and phytosanitary measures	331
10.3.7	Evaluation	340
10.4	Conclusion	342
11	The future of international environmental litigation	345
11.1	The flourishing of international environmental litigation	345

11.2	Judicial development of international environmental law	348
11.2.1	Origins and development	348
11.2.2	New fields for judicial development	353
11.2.3	Assessment	356
11.3	International courts and international environmental governance	359
11.3.1	General adjudicative machinery	359
11.3.2	Distinctive approach of international environmental law	362
11.4	Conclusion	365
	<i>Bibliography</i>	366
	<i>Index</i>	398