

INTRODUCTION TO COMPUTABLE GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM MODELS

Computable general equilibrium (CGE) models are widely used by governmental organizations and academic institutions to analyze the economywide effects of events such as climate change, tax policies, and immigration. This book is a practical, how-to guide to CGE models that is suitable for use at the undergraduate college level. Its introductory level distinguishes it from other available books and articles on CGE models. The book provides intuitive and graphical explanations of the economic theory that underlies a CGE model and includes many examples and hands-on model exercises. It may be used in courses on economic principles, microeconomics, macroeconomics, public finance, environmental economics, and international trade and finance, because it shows students the role of theory in a realistic model of an economy. The book is also suitable for courses on general equilibrium models and research methods, and for professionals interested in learning how to use CGE models.

Mary E. Burfisher is a Distinguished Visiting Professor at the United States Naval Academy, Annapolis, Maryland. She has also served as a senior economist for the Economic Research Service of the U.S. Department of Agriculture in Washington, D.C. Dr. Burfisher is a consultant on computable general equilibrium models and agricultural policy for U.S. governmental agencies and international organizations. She is the author or editor of numerous monographs, books, and articles on international agricultural and trade policies. Dr. Burfisher was a Fellow of the Global Trade Analysis Project (GTAP) at Purdue University from 2003 to 2010 and received the Quality of Communication Award from the American Agricultural Economics Association. She earned her Ph.D. in economics from the University of Maryland.



INTRODUCTION TO COMPUTABLE GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM MODELS

MARY E. BURFISHER

United States Naval Academy, Annapolis, Maryland





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

 $www. cambridge.org\\ Information on this title: www. cambridge.org/9780521139779$

© Mary E. Burfisher 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Burfisher, Mary E., 1955– Introduction to Computable General Equilibrium Models / Mary E. Burfisher. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76696-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-13977-9 (paperback)
1. Equilibrium (Economics) – Econometric models. I. Title.

HB145.B86 2011

339.501'5195-dc22 2010050361

ISBN 978-0-521-76696-8 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-13977-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my family



Contents

Text Boxes	<i>page</i> xi
About This Book	xiii
Objectives	xiii
Organization	XV
Resources for New CGE Modelers	xvi
For the Instructor	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
1. Introduction to Computable General Equilibrium Models	1
Economic Models, Economists' Toys	1
What Is a Computable General Equilibrium Model?	3
A Standard CGE Model	8
CGE Model Structure	9
CGE Model Database	9
CGE Model Applications	10
Summary	11
Key Terms	12
Practice and Review	12
2. Elements of a Computable General Equilibrium Model	16
Sets	17
Endogenous Variables	17
Exogenous Variables	18
Model Closure	19
Exogenous Parameters	19
Model Calibration	27
Equations	29
Macroclosure	31
Normalizing Prices	32
Price Linkages	34
Numeraire	37



vii	i Contents	
	Structure of a CGE Model	39
	Summary	41
	Key Terms	41
	Practice and Review	42
3.	The CGE Model Database: A Social Accounting Matrix	44
	Introduction to the Social Accounting Matrix	44
	Accounts in a SAM	46
	Microeconomic Data in a SAM	54
	Macroeconomic Data in a SAM	54
	Structure Table	58
	Tax Data in a SAM	65
	The SAM and Economic Models	66
	Summary	68
	Key Terms	69
	Practice and Review	69
4.	Final Demand in a CGE Model	71
	Final Demand Data in a SAM	72
	Income Data in a SAM	73
	Two-Stage Domestic Final Demand	74
	Utility-Maximizing Private Households	77
	Demand Response to Income Changes	80
	Demand Response to Relative Price Changes	81
	Comparing Utility Functions Used in CGE Models	84
	Import Demand	90
	Export Demand	93
	Consumer Welfare	95
	Summary	100
	Key Terms	101
	Practice and Review	102
	Technical Appendix 4.1: Elasticity Parameters in Utility	102
	Functions	103
5.	Supply in a CGE Model	105
	Production Data in a SAM	106
	Input-Output Coefficients	107
	Producer Behavior in a CGE Model	110
	Technology Tree and Nested Production Functions	110
	Intermediate Input Demand	112
	Factor (Value-Added) Demand	115
	Combining Intermediate Inputs and Factors	119
	Input Prices and Level of Output	120



	Contents	ix
	Export Supply Summary Key Terms Practice and Review Technical Appendix 5.1: Inputs as Substitutes or	123 125 126 127
	Complements – Energy Nesting in Climate Models	128
6.	Factors of Production in a CGE Model Factors of Production Data in a SAM Factor Mobility Factor Endowment Change Factors as Complements and Substitutes Factor Productivity Change Factor Unemployment Factors and Structural Change Summary Key Terms Practice and Review	132 133 134 137 138 140 144 145 148 148
7.	Trade in a CGE Model Trade Data in a SAM Exchange Rates Terms of Trade Trade Theory in CGE Models Factor Endowment Changes, Trade, and Terms of Trade World Price Changes and Factor Income Distribution Booming Sector, Dutch Disease Trade and Transportation Margins in International Trade Summary Key Terms Practice and Review	150 151 152 155 158 159 163 167 169 171 172
8.	Taxes in a CGE Model Trade Taxes Production Taxes Sales (and Intermediate Input) Taxes Factor Use Taxes Income Taxes Second-Best Efficiency Effects Marginal Welfare Burden of a Tax Summary Key Terms Practice and Review	174 178 185 188 191 195 198 199 204 204



X	Contents	
	Technical Appendix 8.1: Compensated Demand and Welfare Effects	205
9.	Conclusion: Frontiers in CGE Modeling	208
M	odel Exercises	215
	Introduction	215
	Model Exercise 1: Set Up the GTAP Model and Database	218
	Model Exercise 2: Explore the GTAP Model and Database	228
	Model Exercise 3: Run the GTAP Model	235
	Model Exercise 4: Soaring Food Prices and the U.S. Economy	251
	Model Exercise 5: Food Fight: Agricultural Production Subsidies	257
	Model Exercise 6: How Immigration Can Raise Wages	265
	Model Exercise 7: The Doha Development Agenda	271
	Model Exercise 8: The Marginal Welfare Burden of the U.S. Tax	279
	System Model Exercise 9: Successful Quitters – The Economic Effects	219
	of Growing Antismoking Attitudes	287
1	ppendix: Social Accounting Matrix for the United States, 2004	207
71,	\$US Billions	297
G	lossary	301
	ractice and Review Answer Key	313
1 /	Chapter 1	313
	Chapter 2	313
	Chapter 3	315
	Chapter 4	316
	Chapter 5	317
	Chapter 6	318
	Chapter 7	319
	Chapter 8	319
M	odel Exercise Answer Key	320
	Model Exercise 2	320
	Model Exercise 3	321
	Model Exercise 4	322
	Model Exercise 5	323
	Model Exercise 6	325
	Model Exercise 7	326
	Model Exercise 8	328
	Model Exercise 9	329
R	eferences	333
A	uthor Index	341
Si	ibiect Index	343



Text Boxes

1.1	The GTAP Global Database	page 10
2.1	Math Refresher – Working with Percent Changes	18
2.2	The Small Share Problem and the Armington Import	
	Aggregation Function	30
2.3	Macroclosure and Structural Adjustment in Costa Rica	33
2.4	The Numeraire and Walras' Law	38
3.1	Key Features of a SAM	45
3.2	Disaggregated Production Regions and Households in a SAM	
	for Morocco	49
3.3	Macroeconomic Projections in a CGE Model of China	55
3.4	Distributing National Effects to the State Level in a CGE	
	Model of the United States	57
4.1	Consumer Aversion to GM Foods	76
4.2	A Macro-Micro CGE Model of Indonesia	79
4.3	Consumer Fear and Avian Flu in Ghana	87
5.1	Climate Change, Emissions Taxes, and Trade in the	
	CIM-EARTH Model	113
5.2	Climate Variability and Productivity in Ethiopia	119
6.1	The Economic Impacts of Global Labor Migration	135
6.2	HIV/AIDS – Disease and Labor Productivity in Mozambique	142
7.1	Rybczynski Effects in a Global CGE Model of East Asia	161
7.2	Stolper-Samuelson vs. Migration Effects in NAFTA	165
7.3	"Dutch Disease" in Cameroon	167
8.1	Welfare Decomposition in the GTAP Model	177
8.2	U.S. Tax Reform in a Dynamic Overlapping-Generations CGE	
	Model	196
8.3	Marginal Welfare Burden of Taxes in Developing Countries	201
	An Intertemporal Dynamic CGE Model of the United States	210
9.2	A Stochastic CGE Model: Caloric Intake in Bangladesh	212



About This Book

Objectives

This book will introduce you to computable general equilibrium (CGE) models. A CGE model is a powerful analytical tool that can help you to gain a better understanding of real-world economic issues. CGE models are a class of economic model that over the past twenty-five years has gained widespread use in the economics profession, particularly in government. Economists today are using these models to systematically analyze some of the most important policy challenges and economic "shocks" of the twenty-first century, including global climate change, the spread of human diseases, and international labor migration.

Since the early 1990s, prominent CGE models have been built and maintained at the U.S. International Trade Commission, the Economic Research Service of the U.S. Department of Agriculture, the World Bank, and other national agencies and international organizations to provide ongoing economic analytical capability. These models have come to play an important part worldwide in government policy decisions. For example, the models' predictions about prices, wages, and incomes factored heavily in the debate about the terms of the North American Free Trade Agreement, the Kyoto Protocol, and China's entrance into the World Trade Organization. CGE-based analyses have also helped the United States and other governments anticipate and design responses to substantial changes in the availability of key resources, ranging from petroleum to people.

CGE models are comprehensive because – whether they are detailed or very simplified – they describe all parts of an economy simultaneously and how these parts interact with each other. The models describe the efficiency-maximizing behavior of firms and the utility-maximizing behavior of consumers. Their decisions add up to the macroeconomic behavior of an economy, such as changes in gross domestic product (GDP), government tax revenue and spending, aggregate savings and investment, and the balance of



xiv About This Book

Prologue Table 1. Modeling and Data Resources Used in This Book

Resource	Source
RunGTAP CGE model	Download from GTAP.org
GTAPAgg7-global database	Download from GTAP.org
aggregation utility U.S. 3x3 database	Create using GTAPAgg7
U.S. 5x5 database	Create using GTAPAgg/

trade. As might be expected, such models can require large databases and they contain sophisticated model code. Yet despite their complexity, continuing advances in modeling software and database development are making CGE models increasingly accessible and intuitive. Minimizing the technical entry barriers to CGE modeling has freed economists to focus on the models' economic behavior and the economic insights that can be derived from their results. These innovations have also made CGE models an ideal laboratory in which economics students can learn to manipulate, observe, and deepen their knowledge of economic behavior.

This book is designed to provide a hands-on introduction to CGE models. You will draw on theory from microeconomics, macroeconomics, international trade and finance, public finance, and other areas of economics, as you observe how producers and consumers in the CGE model respond to various changes in market conditions that we refer to as "model experiments." The guided model exercises will show you how to build and use a demonstration CGE model to assess the economywide effects of such economic shocks as the elimination of agricultural subsidies, global elimination of trade barriers, labor immigration, and changes in a tax system. By the end of the book, you will have begun to develop your skills as both a producer and a consumer of professional CGE-based economic analysis.

The book introduces the CGE models and databases that are used by professional economists. We will study the key features of "standard" CGE models, which are static (single period), single- and multicountry models, with fixed national endowments of factors of production. Most textbook examples and model exercises use RunGTAP, a user-friendly, menu-driven interface (Horridge, 2001) of the GTAP (Global Trade Analysis Project) CGE model. RunGTAP may be downloaded at no charge from the GTAP Web site (Prologue Table 1). The GTAP CGE model is an open model developed by Hertel and Tsigas (1997) and is written in the GEMPACK software.

The GTAP project also maintains a global database that CGE modelers rely on as a data source for many types of CGE models. The database is built on data contributions from CGE modelers around the world, which GTAP then organizes and balances into a consistent, global database. The 7.0



About This Book

xv

version of the database, used in this book, describes 113 countries or regions and 57 industries in 2004. Modelers may use GTAPAgg, a freeware program developed by Horridge (2008b) and available from the GTAP project, to aggregate the global database into smaller sets of regions and industries that are relevant for their research. In this book and in the model exercises, most examples use a small-dimension, two-region aggregation of the database that describes the United States and an aggregate rest-of-world region.

Organization

This book covers eight topics beginning with an introduction to CGE models (Chapter 1), their elements and structure (Chapter 2), and the data that underlie them (Chapter 3). Chapters 4–6 focus on the microeconomic underpinnings of CGE models. Chapter 4 describes final demand by households, government, and investors and the demand for imports and exports. Chapter 5 describes supply, focusing on the technology tree and the producer's cost-minimizing demand for intermediate and factor inputs. Chapter 6 covers additional aspects of factor markets, including factor mobility, factor endowment and productivity growth, factor substitutability, and factor employment assumptions. Trade topics, including theorems on the effects of endowment changes and world prices, are covered in Chapter 7. Chapter 8 explores public finance topics related to trade and domestic taxes.

Chapters 1–8 adhere to a common template, consisting of:

- Chapter text (e.g., "Introduction to Computable General Equilibrium Models")
- Text boxes
- Chapter summary
- Key terms (e.g., "stock" and "flow")
- Practice and review exercises
- · Model exercise

Text boxes introduce examples of classic, innovative, and influential CGE-based economic analyses that relate to chapter topics. These summarized articles offer practical examples of how the concepts that you are learning about in the chapter are operationalized in CGE models. Practice and review exercises review and reinforce the central themes of the chapter.

Model exercises linked to each chapter provide step-by-step direction and guidance to help you to develop your modeling skills (Prologue Table 2). The modeling problems are general enough to be suitable for use with almost any standard CGE model, but their detailed instructions are compatible with RunGTAP. The first three model exercises guide you in creating a database, setting up your CGE model, and learning core modeling skills. You may use the demonstration model developed in the first model exercise



xvi About This Book

Prologue Table 2. Chapters and Related Model Exercises

Chapter	Model Exercise
1. Introduction to CGE Models	Set up the GTAP Model and Database
2. Elements of a CGE Model	Explore the GTAP Model and Database
3. The CGE Model Database: A Social Accounting Matrix	Run the GTAP Model
4. Final Demand in a CGE Model	Soaring Food Prices and the U.S. Economy
5. Supply in a CGE Model	Food Fight – Agricultural Production Subsidies
6. Factors of Production in a CGE Model	How Immigration Can Raise Wages
7. Trade in a CGE Model	The Doha Development Agenda
8. Taxes in a CGE Model	The Marginal Welfare Burden of the U.S. Tax System
	Challenge: Successful Quitters: The Economic Effects of Growing Antismoking Attitudes

to replicate almost all results reported in the tables in Chapters 1–8 of the book. Exercises 4–8 are case studies that begin with a discussion of a timely topic or influential CGE analysis such as labor immigration and U.S. tax policies. They demonstrate how to design model experiments and how to use economic theory to select and interpret model results. A ninth "challenge exercise" introduces advanced students to macroprojections and uncertainty about economic shocks.

Resources for New CGE Modelers

We recommend that beginning modelers start by reading articles and monographs, both current and classic, that provide general introductions to, or critiques of, CGE models. Particularly recommended as introductory treatments are Piermartini and Teh (2005), McDaniel et al. (2008), Shoven and Whalley (1984), Bandara (1991), Francois and Reinert (1997), Robinson et al. (1999), Devarajan et al. (1990, 1997), and Borges (1986). Breisinger, Thomas, and Thurlow (2009); Reinert and Roland-Holst (1992); and King (1985) provide introductions to social accounting matrices, which are the databases that underlie CGE models.

As your skills progress, we recommend that you read the intermediate-level treatments in Kehoe and Kehoe's (1994) primer on CGE models and Dervis, de Melo, and Robinson's (1982) introduction to open economy CGE models. Hosoe, Gasawa, and Hashimoto (2010) introduce students at



About This Book

yvii

an intermediate level to CGE models, focusing on models coded in General Algebraic Modeling Software (GAMS). Some books and articles that describe specific CGE models are also useful for new modelers, who will recognize many of the same features in those models as in the standard CGE model that we study in this book. Hertel and Tsigas (1997) provide an overview of the GTAP model. Lofgren, Harris, and Robinson (2002) describe the International Food Policy Research Institute's (IFPRI) standard single-country CGE model and database. De Melo and Tarr (1992) describe the structure and behavior of their CGE model of the United States. For more advanced students, Shoven and Whalley (1992) provide a practical introduction to CGE models, and Scarf and Shoven (2008) present a collected volume of case studies that describe different aspects of CGE models.

Because CGE modeling is a dynamic field of research, the best way to keep abreast of developments in CGE modeling and in the applications of CGE models is to review working papers and conference papers, in addition to economic journals. The GTAP Web site, at www.gtap.org is a useful source for up-to-date information on CGE-based research papers, CGE model databases, and research tools and utilities related to the GTAP model and data. All papers presented at annual GTAP conferences are posted online, providing students with access to unpublished papers and work in progress by many leading CGE modelers, using many types of CGE models. Perusing recent conference papers can give you ideas for timely research topics and experiment designs for your own research projects.

The International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), which developed the "IFPRI standard" CGE model, has published many studies based on variations of that model as well as papers about model databases and database construction. These publications are available from the IFPRI Web site at www.ifpri.org.

Many international organizations, such as the World Bank, and national government agencies, such as the U.S. Department of Agriculture, also produce and post CGE-based working papers and research products. In addition, the GAMS Web site, at www.gams.org maintains a library of simple CGE models that can be downloaded and run using the free demonstration versions of GAMS. Also, the United States Naval Academy hosts the Tools for Undergraduates "TUG-CGE" model (Thierfelder, 2009), a GAMS-based CGE model designed for undergraduate use.

For the Instructor

The book is designed for use in a one-semester class that is spent primarily doing hands-on model exercises and independent research, with the book used as background reading. The exercises are all fully portable. They are



xviii About This Book

Prologue Table 3. Recommended Sequences for Courses of Different Lengths

Chapter	One Semester Course	6-Week Course	1-Week Course
1. Introduction to CGE Models	0.5 weeks	0.5 weeks	Omit
2. Elements of a CGE Model	1 week	0.5 weeks	0.25 day
3. CGE Model Data: Social	1 week	1 week	0.5 day
Accounting Matrix			
4. Demand in a CGE Model	1.5 weeks	0.5 weeks	0.5 day
5. Supply in a CGE Model	1.5 weeks	0.5 weeks	0.5 day
6. Factors of Production in a	1 week	Optional	Omit
CGE Model		-	
7. Trade in a CGE Model	1.0 weeks	0.5 weeks	0.5 day
8. Taxes in a CGE Model	1.5 weeks	0.5 weeks	0.75 day
Independent Research	6 weeks	2 weeks	2 days

designed to use free materials downloaded from the Internet so they are suitable for students to carry out in computer labs or on their personal computers. The ideal classroom setting is one that promotes student teamwork and ongoing discussion among students and teachers while students carry out model exercises.

The book can also be used in condensed courses, with our recommendations for selecting and paring materials described in Prologue Table 3. For courses of all lengths, we recommend a generous allotment of time for model exercises and independent research because students will then learn by doing. If the book is used as a supplementary hands-on resource for economic theory courses, such as macroeconomics or international trade, we suggest that the teacher cover Chapters 1–3 and their related model exercises and then assign only the chapter and exercise that is relevant to the course. Most teachers are likely to find that some or all of Chapter 8 on taxes is relevant because taxes are a policy lever that governments use to address many economic problems.



Acknowledgments

This book was made possible by the support of three institutions. I am most grateful to the National Science Foundation and especially to Dr. Myles G. Boylan, Program Director in the Course, Curriculum and Laboratory Improvement Program of the Division of Undergraduate Education, who encouraged this project from its inception. I deeply appreciate the support provided to me by the United States Naval Academy, where I was privileged to be a Distinguished Visiting Professor while writing this book. The Global Trade Analysis Project (GTAP), particularly Thomas Hertel and Terrie Walmsley, have been tremendously generous in their encouragement and support of this project. I am also deeply grateful to Karen Thierfelder, a longtime friend and colleague, and to Sherman Robinson, who has been a generous teacher and friend. I have learned much about models and policy analysis from our long and rewarding collaboration. Victoria Greenfield, Kurtis Swope, and Katherine Smith - my colleagues at the Academy - acted as beta testers and reviewers and provided insightful critiques and many helpful suggestions and edits on earlier drafts of the book. I owe a special thanks to my students at the Naval Academy, who over the course of four years uncovered many errors and oversights, and who often provided fresh takes on CGE models and economic theory. My editor, Scott Parris, and Adam Levine and Tilak Raj at Cambridge University Press facilitated this project in every way possible while guiding it through to publication. I also thank Roger Betancourt, Cheryl Christensen, Neil Conklin, Praveen Dixit, Aziz Elbehri, Cheryl Flax-Davidson, Rae Jean Goodman, Kenneth Hanson, Barry Krissoff, Gene Mathia, Sara Pastor, Alan Pocinki, Ken Reinert, David Skully, Agapi Somwaru, and Deborah Tanno, each of whom, in different ways, helped to bring this project to fruition. Channing Arndt, Rob McDougall, Jeffrey Round, Marcelle Thomas, Marinos Tsigas, Dominique van der Mensbruggh, Frank van Tongeren, and three anonymous reviewers provided many helpful ideas, corrections, and suggestions.



 $\mathbf{X}\mathbf{X}$

Acknowledgments

All remaining errors are my own responsibility, and I encourage readers to contact me about them or to offer their comments or suggestions on the book.

This material is based upon activities supported by the National Science Foundation under Agreement No. DUE-0632836. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.