(ONLINE) SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

ISIS and heritage destruction: a sentiment analysis

Emma Cunliffe¹ and Luigi Curini²

OSM 1. Original Arabic text of Tweets used in text

"The lions of the Islamic State are blowing up the temple (Temple of Baalshamin) in the city of Palmyra, and eventually by God's will they will blow up the pyramids and the Sphinx"

(Original text: بريف تدمر مدينة في (شمين بعل) مع بديفجرون الإسلامية الدولة ليوث عاجل)

(الهول وأبو الأهرامات الله وبإذن.. الشرقي حمص

"Daesh organization have targeted Shia's mosques and have also targeted Sunni's mosques in Abha. So their goal and target is not Sunni or Shia, but rather to destabilize and dismantle the unity of this country."

ال قديح # في الشيعة # مساجد استهدف داعش # تنظيم :Original text: RT @fdeet_alnssr) وحدة وتفكيك زعزعة بل. شيعة اوسنه ليس هذه اإذن ايضا ابها # في السنة مساجد واستهدف (البلاد هذه

"Daesh are the enemy of mosques, even if they blew up in thousands in every mosque, we swear to God that we will never stop worshiping, they are mistaken if they think that we afraid of death."

و الله بالآلا ف مسجد كل في فجّروا لم و الم ساجد عدو داعش # :Original text: RT @amoool20105) و الله بالآلا ف مسجد كل في فجّروا لم و الم سجد ياطيبها بنْخاف الموت من إنّا لايد حسر بون ع بادة " مسجد كل له نملا

Translations by VOICES from the Blogs coders.

OSM 3. Site type definitions

Site type	Definition
Archaeological /	Ancient sites with no modern religious connotations, including
historic sites	Palmyra, Nimrud, Ninevah, Bab Harran, and Qaalat al-Rahbah.
Graves/Cemeteries	Cemeteries and other grouped outdoor locations of internment.
Shrines/Temples	A single burial in a larger tomb, perhaps with dedicated buildings
	around it.
Mosques	Mosques, jamis, and mosques that contain shrines. The distinction
	between a mosque and a shrine here is often largely based on name.
Churches	Christian religious buildings, including monasteries.
Other	Sculpture (x1), museum (x1), madrasa (x1).

Categorisations are largely derived from the site name or description used in tweets. We do, however, acknowledge that many overlap, but feel the distinction still aids analysis.

OSM 4.

Rationale for event inclusion

The availability of Twitter data determined the date range of the overall dataset, however, the period also witnessed some of the worst ISIS heritage destruction, creating a significant temporal period for analysis.

Twitter database:

In the Twitter dataset, two native Arabic speakers conducted our training set coding. Intercoder reliability was 0.80 according to Cohen's Kappa. Compared to hand-coded documents in the training set, the root mean square error of the estimates is 1.9%, confirming the accuracy of the results.

Heritage events database:

In this dataset, event date, and date of first major propaganda release were recorded (although the media may follow stories for some time). Data collection was conducted in English: an Arabic speaker checked identified events to confirm when they became public.

The following events were included:

- deliberate attacks on heritage (i.e. ancient and religious) sites;
- suicide attacks (if they occurred in a heritage building);
- the use of heritage destruction as criminal punishment;
- the re-purposing of religious sites (for example, for munitions storage, police headquarters and a gymnasium);
- rumoured attacks were included, as a rumour can affect sentiment at the time of circulation, even if the rumour is later demonstrated to be false;
- although *Dabiq* is published in English, its impact meant it was included.

Many events included in the sample focus on people rather than buildings—for example, suicide bombers targeted communities and their religious buildings together at Friday prayers. Although this may seem a reason to exclude such attacks from the analysis, Bevan (2016) demonstrated numerous examples of the links between attacks on communities and their architecture, as well as the indivisibility of the two.

Damage resulting from conflict was excluded, as were car bombs outside mosques, as they targeted people, not buildings. The authors acknowledge that several suicide attacks at mosques were targeting the associated community rather than the building, and some may have been targeting security forces present in the building (for example, the attack on the mosque in Abha, Saudia Arabia on 6 August 2015), highlighting the indivisibility of the people and the places. Each event was individually assessed for inclusion.

Events which did not have a major news release (e.g. website updates) cannot be considered to have reached wider public consciousness, and were excluded from the Twitter analysis, as were events where no Arabic media release could be confirmed. In this last respect, a mistake was made, regarding the Shrine of al-Imam 'Ali al-Hadi. This site was excluded as no media release could be identified, but Doménovič Domén of Monuments of Mosul in Danger recently informed us of a news release regarding the site's destruction. Palmyra museum destruction occurred during the study period, but the video release occurred after: it is excluded.

A large number of shrines were destroyed during the study period. It has not been possible to identify them all: however, many had no media release and so can be assumed to have had minimal impact on sentiment. It has not been possible to take account of any effect that the aggregated destruction of multiple unnamed shrines may have had; for example, articles such as *Yezidis rebuild 50 percent of shrines destroyed by ISIS* (The Baghdad Post, 2017) indicate that the true number of destroyed sites is much higher, but individual sites cannot be located or assessed.

Information was collected on 121 events: 85 were attributed to ISIS, including three rumours, leaving 82 actual events. Of the 85 events attributed to ISIS, 60 had at least one media release, including the rumoured events, which impacted sentiment. These formed the final study set. Of these, 3 were rumours; 15 had photos which could not be confirmed as the stated site¹; and 16 could not be confirmed at all. Only 31 events appear to have actually been claimed by ISIS, including 4 photos with an unclear origin which is thought to be ISIS.

¹ Dr Sam Hardy has compiled numerous examples of media use of photos that are not of the site in question, so each event must be checked by experts - see the Conflict Antiquities Blog (https://conflictantiquities.wordpress.com/)

** An unnamed Church in Al-Shaddadi, which was turned into a gym for ISIS members, was accidentally excluded from the sentiment analysis, as was Mart Maryam Armenian Orthodox Church. However, they are included in the event counts for completeness.

References

BEVAN, R. 2016. *The Destruction of Memory. Architecture at War*. London: Reaktion Books.

The Baghdad Post. 2017. *Yezidis rebuild 50 percent of shrines destroyed by ISIS*. The Baghdad Post, 10 June 2017. Available at:

http://www.thebaghdadpost.com/en/story/11896/Yezidis-rebuild-50-percent-of-shrines-destroyed-by-ISIS [Accessed 25 July 2017]

OSM 5.

Search query employed to recover data from Twitter:

و قارعلا عف قىمالسالا قلودلا")) ال شام " RO "منظمه ال توحيد و الجهاد " " OR "يروشلا سلجمل نيدهاجم" OR ثىل" ابو مسعد الزرقاوى " RO " ةىملاع داهج مكرح " الخورى " RO " يدادغبال ركب وبا مفيلخ " OR اعدة الانفصاليين عن الة " OR "خليفه" العدة الانفصاليين عن القالم العدة الانفصاليين عن القالم العدة العلم العدة ال "الدوله الاسلامية" OR " في العراق و سوريا "الدولة الإسلامية " OR "القاعده" " OR ISIS OR ISIL OR "شعاد" الدولة الإسلامية " RO "الدولة " OR " ية في العراق والشامالا سدلام الدولة الإسلامية في العراق " OR "داعش OR "Abu " باقية وتتمدد" OR "والشام Bakr al-Baghdadi" OR "al-Baghdadi" OR "أبو بكر البغدادي OR "أبو بكر البغدادي ىدادغبلا ركب وبأ" OR "ءاعد وبأ" الحسيني الهاشمي القرشي" RO OR "يدادغبل التق "OR "قفي لخلا" "البغدادي-لتق" AND "البغدادي-لتق" قبور OR قبر OR حرم OR مقدس OR والي) مقبرة OR مدفن OR مقامات OR مقام OR "شَاهِدُ القَبْر" OR مقابر OR مدافن OR مدف ن" RO مقبرة قبر RO "قبور OR قينيس ح OR رباقم OR نفادم OR م سجد RO جامع RO م ساجد RO جو امع رايدا OR ريد OR تاران مOR قران مOR OR باتك OR تاعلق OR ةعلق OR ک تب RO مک تب RO مک تبات RO م تحف RO م تاحف RO نه صب RO ت مثال RO نه صوب RO تماث بل RO نحت RO بوابة RO بوابات RO قصر OR نوصح OR روصق OR نصح OR

"Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham" OR "organization Tawhid and Jihad" OR "the Mujahideen Shura Council" OR "Abu Massad Al-Zarqawi" OR "Laith al-Khouri" OR "movement Jihad global" OR "Khalifa Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi" OR "Khalifa "OR" separatists for al-Qaida in Iraq and Syria, "OR" Islamic state "OR" rule "OR" Islamic state."

OR "Daesh" OR ISIS OR ISIL OR "Islamic state" OR "Islamic state in Iraq and the Levant" OR "Daesh" OR "Islamic state in Iraq and the Levant" OR "lingering expands with" OR "Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi" OR "al -Baghdadi "OR" Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi, "OR" Abu Duaa "OR" Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi al-Husseini al-Qurashi al-Hashemi "OR" Caliph "OR" the killing of al-Baghdadi, "OR" kill-Baghdadi "OR" the base ") AND (Wali OR sacred OR campus OR tomb OR graves OR shrine OR shrines OR cemetery OR OR cemetery burials OR graves OR "tombstone" OR tomb OR "graves cemetery" OR cemetery OR landfills OR graves OR Hussienieh OR mosque OR mosque OR mosques OR mosques OR beacon OR beacons OR monastery OR monasteries OR Castle OR Qlat OR book OR books OR OR Library OR museum libraries OR OR museums monument OR statue OR rectifying OR statues OR carving OR gate OR OR Palace gates OR Fort OR palaces OR forts OR wall OR wall OR palace OR palaces OR held OR OR arc "archaeological site" OR "archaeological sites" OR "cultural heritage" OR Heritage OR effects last OR OR culture OR history OR Nimrod OR "role Sharukin" OR urban OR destroy

جدار RO جدران RO ق صر RO ق صور " يرثأ عقوم" OR سروق OR دقع OR " يرثأ عقوم" OR سروق OR دقع OR "التراث الثقافي" OR الأثار OR التراث OR الماضي OR الأثار OR التراث OR المرود OR التاريخ OR الثقافة OR تدمر OR الحضر OR "شروكين OR "مَادَّةٌ مُتَقَجِّرَة" OR قُنْبُلة OR نينوى OR تخريب OR جَرًافَةً

OR Assyria OR Nineveh OR bomb OR "explosive material "OR bulldozer OR OR sabotage theft