

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-69998-3 - Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly  
Norman Daniels  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Just Health

In this new book by the award-winning author of *Just Health Care*, Norman Daniels develops a comprehensive theory of justice for health that answers three key questions: What is the special moral importance of health? When are health inequalities unjust? How can we meet health needs fairly when we cannot meet them all? The theory has implications for national and global health policy: Can we meet health needs fairly in aging societies? Or protect health in the workplace while respecting individual liberty? Or meet professional obligations and obligations of justice without conflict? When is health reform or the selection of patients for treatment for HIV or coverage for catastrophic health benefits fair? When is an effort to reduce health disparities or to set priorities in realizing a human right to health fair? What do richer, healthier societies owe poorer, sicker societies? *Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly* explores the many ways that social justice is good for the health of populations in developed and developing countries.

Norman Daniels is Mary B. Saltonstall Professor and Professor of Ethics and Populations Health at Harvard School of Public Health. A member of the Institute of Medicine, a Fellow of the Hastings Center, a Founding Member of the National Academy of Social Insurance and of the International Society for Equity in Health, he has consulted for organizations, commissions, and governments, including the United Nations, WHO, and the President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine, on issues of justice and health policy. Dr. Daniels is the author of numerous books. He has received fellowships and grants from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the National Science Foundation, and the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, and he has held a Robert Wood Johnson Investigator's Award as well as a Rockefeller Foundation grant for the international adaptation of the Benchmarks of Fairness for health reform.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-69998-3 - Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly

Norman Daniels

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*For Anne*

*My constant guide*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-69998-3 - Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly  
Norman Daniels  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

Just Health  
*Meeting Health Needs Fairly*

NORMAN DANIELS  
*Harvard School of Public Health*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-69998-3 - Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly  
 Norman Daniels  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press  
 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA  
[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521876322](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521876322)

© Norman Daniels 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Daniels, Norman, 1942–  
 Just health : meeting health needs fairly / Norman Daniels.  
 p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87632-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-69998-3 (pbk.)  
 1. Medical policy – Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Health services accessibility.  
 3. Right to health care. 4. Equality – Health aspects. 5. Justice (Philosophy)  
 6. Medical ethics. I. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Health Services Accessibility. 2. Health Policy. 3. Social Justice.

4. World Health. w 76 D186j 2008]

RA394.D27 2008

362.1–dc22 2007011711

ISBN 978-0-521-87632-2 hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-69998-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

|  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>   | <i>page vii</i> |
| Introduction   | 1               |
| PART I A THEORY OF JUSTICE AND HEALTH  |                 |
| 1 Three Questions of Justice   | 11              |
| 2 What Is the Special Moral Importance of Health?  | 29              |
| 3 When Are Health Inequalities Unjust? The Social Determinants of Health   | 79              |
| 4 How Can We Meet Health Needs Fairly When We Can't Meet Them All? Accountability for Reasonable Resource Allocation | 103             |
| 5 What Do We Owe Each Other? Implications of an Integrated Theory of Justice and Health                              | 140             |
| PART II CHALLENGES   |                 |
| 6 Global Aging and Intergenerational Equity  | 161             |
| 7 Consent to Workplace Risk and Health Protection  | 191             |
| 8 Medical Professionalism and the Care We Should Get   | 218             |
| PART III USES  |                 |
| 9 Fairness in Health Sector Reform   | 243             |
| 10 Accountability for Reasonableness in Developing Countries: Two Applications                                       | 274             |
| 11 Reducing Health Disparities: No Simple Matter   | 297             |
| 12 Priority Setting and Human Rights   | 313             |

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-69998-3 - Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly  
Norman Daniels  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

vi

*Contents*

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| 13 | International Health Inequalities and Global Justice: A<br>Concluding Challenge | 333 |
|    | <i>References</i>   | 357 |
|    | <i>Index</i>  | 377 |

## Acknowledgments

When I was writing my Ph.D. dissertation, my advisor, Hilary Putnam, gave me career-altering advice. He cautioned me that I should do my best in writing my thesis, but that I should understand that knowledge is more a community product than an individual one. He was wisely urging me not to keep my research to myself until I thought it was perfect but to subject it to scrutiny by the philosophical and broader intellectual community, for the critical response to work is as essential to the generation of knowledge as is the care that authors take with their work. I have also learned over my career what people outside philosophy learn early on: that authors' contributions are themselves often a community effort. That is indeed true about this book, for it and the work it reports on would not have been possible without the help of many institutions and many individuals from various disciplines.

My philosophical debts are many. I especially want to acknowledge the many hours of discussion I had in the 1980s and 1990s with John Rawls about justice as fairness and political liberalism and their bearing on health and my approach to it. Joshua Cohen and Dan Brock have been my most generous sounding boards and constructive critics over many years on many of the issues discussed in this book. I also am indebted to others for their help and encouragement on specific issues: Dan Wikler initially encouraged me to address the problems of age and opportunity and gave me constructive criticism about my earlier work in *Just Health Care*; Dan Callahan helped steer me to key issues, including aging and limit setting, over the years; Allan Buchanan forced me to think about the connection of my work to other issues in contemporary work on distributive justice; Ezekial Emanuel broadened my thinking about fair process; Ron Bayer pushed me to reflect on issues of paternalism in occupational health; Frances Kamm's work on various distributive problems has been an inspiration. To acknowledge some of my other philosophical debts, I wish to thank my former Tufts colleagues, Hugo Bedau, Dan Dennett, Erin Kelly, George Smith, and Stephen White, and many others whose comments and conversations have deepened my

understanding of relevant normative issues, among them Sudhir Anand, Fabienne Peters, Ole Norheim, Tom Pogge, Matthias Risse, Tim Scanlon, Dennis Thompson, and Amartya Sen.

My greatest debt is owed to the various collaborators who have worked closely with me to develop key ideas that are central to this book. Foremost among them is Jim Sabin, a collaborator for nearly twenty years, who is co-developer of the work on fair process (accountability for reasonableness) that is described in Chapter 4 and that plays a key role in several later chapters. Ichiro Kawachi and Bruce Kennedy worked with me to think through the approach to the social determinants of health and their bearing on health inequalities that is described in Chapter 3. The work of developing the Benchmarks of Fairness in its original form would never have happened without Don Light, whose idea it was, and Ron Caplan. The Benchmarks would never have been adapted for use in developing countries without the key assistance of my collaborators, Jack Bryant and Walter Flores. In addition, many others played important roles in that adaptation: Julio Frenk, who first proposed the adaptation to me, Octavio Gomez-Dantes, Ramon Castano-Yepes, Supasit Pannarunothai, and Kausar Khan. Tim Evans supported the idea with funding from the Rockefeller Foundation. Many others have helped with adaptations in specific countries, especially Peter Ndumbe, T.J. Ngulube, and Yuankun Wang. Sofia Gruskin helped me to develop the approach to priority setting and human rights described in Chapter 12. The work on fair process in Mexico (see Chapter 10) would never have developed without the assistance of Julio Frenk, Octavio Gomez-Dantes, Mercedes Juan, Eduardo Gonzalez-Pier, Cristina Guttierrez, and Jason Lakin, among others. I received considerable help on the application of accountability for reasonableness to the WHO 3 by 5 program from Alex Capron and Andreas Reis. I also wish to thank Doug Martin and his crew of researchers at the University of Toronto, who have kept me abreast of work on accountability for reasonableness in Canada and elsewhere. A similar thanks to Ole Norheim at the University of Bergen. Others who have helped me understand relevant issues about the determinants of health or other issues of health policy include Angus Deaton, Chris Ham, Michael Marmot, Marthe Gold, and many of my colleagues at Harvard: Barry Bloom, David Bloom, Tom Bossert, Richard Cash, Nir Eyal, Bill Hsiao, Yuanli Liu, Michael Reich, Joe Newhouse, and Marc Roberts.

I am grateful to many institutions for their support, including Tufts University and Harvard University, for direct and indirect support of my research. Key advances in my thinking on several of the topics were made with the support of a Robert Wood Johnson Special Investigator's Award. I particularly thank the Rockefeller Foundation for multiyear support of the work on adaptation of the Benchmarks of Fairness for developing-country use. The David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies and the University of Toronto Global Priority Setting Network have given me support



*Acknowledgments*

ix

for the work on fair process in Mexico. The work on priority setting has had many sponsors: the Greenwall Foundation, the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, the National Science Foundation, and the Retirement Research Foundation. My early work on justice and health care was supported by the National Endowment for the Humanities, the National Institutes of Health, and the National Library of Medicine.

I wish to thank as well those who have given me editorial and research assistance with the preparation of this book: Sarah Madsen Hardy, Marin Levy, Danielle Blanch, Linh O, and my wife, Anne. Many students and, more recently, members of the seminar sponsored by the Harvard Program on Ethics and Health have endured earlier versions of this material and have raised questions and provided comments that have gradually improved it. I particularly want to thank Greg Bogner, Eric Cavillierro, Glenn Cohen, Iwao Hirose, Sam Kerstein, Ole Norheim, Diane Paul, and Shlomi Segall for their verbal or written comments on drafts of parts of the manuscript.

I also wish to thank various coauthors, journals, and publishers for permission to draw on some previously published material in drafting some of the chapters in this book:

- Daniels, N. 1991. Duty to treat or right to refuse? *Hastings Center Report* 21: 2:36–46.
- Daniels, N. 2001. Justice, health and health care. *American Journal of Bioethics* 1: 2:3–15.
- Daniels, N. 2003. *Chevron v. Echazabal*: Protection, opportunity, and paternalism. *American Journal of Public Health* 93 4:545–49.
- Daniels, N. 2005. Fair process in patient selection for antiretroviral treatment in WHO's goal of "3 by 5." *Lancet* 366: 169–71.
- Daniels, N. 2006. Toward ethical review of health system transformations. *American Journal of Public Health* 96: 3:447–51.
- Daniels, N. 2006. Equity and population health: Toward a broader bioethics agenda. *Hastings Center Report* 36(4): 22–35.
- Daniels, N., Bryant, J., Castano, R. A., Dantes, O.G., Khan, K.S., and Pannarunothai, S. 2000. Benchmarks of fairness for health care reform: A policy tool for developing countries. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 78(6):740–50.
- Daniels, N., Flores, W., Ndumbe, P., Pannarunothai, S., Bryant, J., Ngulube, T. J., and Wang Y. 2005. An evidence-based approach to benchmarking the fairness of health sector reform in developing countries. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 83: 534–40.
- Daniels, N., Kennedy, B., and Kawachi, I. 1999. Why justice is good for our health: The social determinants of health inequalities. *Daedalus* 128(4): 215–51.
- Daniels, N., and Sabin, J. 1998. Last-chance therapies and managed care: Pluralism, fair procedures, and legitimacy. *Hastings Center Report* 28(2): 27–41.
- Daniels, N., and Sabin, J. 1997. Limits to health care: Fair procedures, democratic deliberation, and the legitimacy problem for insurers. *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 26(4): 303–50.