

# The Labor Market for Health Workers in Africa

*A New Look at the Crisis*

Agnes Soucat, Richard Scheffler, with Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus,  
*Editors*



**THE WORLD BANK**  
Washington, D.C.

# Contents

<i>Foreword</i>		<i>xix</i>
<i>Preface</i>		<i>xxi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		<i>xxiii</i>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	<b>Labor Market Analysis of Human Resources for Health</b>	<b>1</b>
	<i>Agnes Soucat and Richard Scheffler</i>	
	The Health Labor Market Framework	3
	Structural Overview	4
	Conclusion	8
	References	12
<b>Part 1</b>	<b>Tools for Health Workforce Analysis</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>Needs-Based Estimates for the Health Workforce</b>	<b>15</b>
	<i>Richard M. Scheffler and Brent D. Fulton</i>	
	A Conceptual Needs-Based Approach to Estimating Health Workforce Requirements	15
	Applying the Needs-Based Approach	17

	Relationship between Health Workers and Health Measures	19
	Limitations of—and Potential Improvements in—Needs-Based Analyses	22
	Annex 2A Supplemental Information on Data, Methods, and Results	24
	Notes	30
	References	31
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>A Labor Market Approach</b>	<b>33</b>
	<i>Mabel Andalón and Gary Fields</i>	
	Five Challenges Associated with the Health Worker Crisis in Africa	33
	Conclusion	43
	Annex 3A Key Concepts from Labor Market Economics	43
	Notes	45
	References	45
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>Productivity of Health Workers: Tanzania</b>	<b>49</b>
	<i>Ottar Mæstad and Aziza Mwisongo</i>	
	High Workloads for Tanzanian Health Workers	49
	Basic Concepts in Productivity Analysis	51
	Time and Motion Studies	52
	Total Factor Productivity and Unit Cost Analysis	54
	Data Envelopment Analysis	57
	Stochastic Frontier Analysis	60
	Conclusion	63
	Acknowledgment	64
	Notes	64
	References	64
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>Health Worker Performance</b>	<b>67</b>
	<i>J. Michelle Brock, Kenneth L. Leonard, Melkiory C. Masatu, and Pieter Sermeels</i>	
	Overview of Health Worker Performance	67
	A Framework for Health Worker Performance	76

	A Model of Health Worker Performance	79
	Conclusion	90
	Notes	90
	References	91
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>Fiscal Issues in Scaling Up the Health Workforce</b>	<b>93</b>
	<i>Agnes Soucat, Marko Vujicic, Aly. Sy, and Claude Sekabaraga</i>	
	The Links between Fiscal Policy and the Health Workforce	95
	Policy Experiences in Sub-Saharan Africa	100
	Conclusion	105
	References	108
<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>Politics and Governance in Human Resources for Health</b>	<b>109</b>
	<i>Andrew Mitchell and Thomas J. Bossert</i>	
	Regime Characteristics	110
	Health Sector Governance	114
	Stakeholder Influence	121
	Conclusion	124
	Notes	124
	References	125
<b>Part 2</b>	<b>Distribution of Health Workforce</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>How Many Health Workers?</b>	<b>131</b>
	<i>Adam Ahmat, Nejmudin Bilal, Christopher H. Herbst, and Stephanie E. Weber</i>	
	What Do Comparisons to International Benchmarks Tell Us?	132
	Human Resources for Health Dynamics That We Need to Capture Better	137
	Conclusion	142

	Annex 8A Density of Physicians, Nurses, and Midwives by Country and Ratio of Nurses and Midwives to Physicians, 2005–09	143
	Note	144
	References	144
<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>Rural-Urban Imbalance of Health Workers in Sub-Saharan Africa</b>	<b>147</b>
	<i>Christophe Lemière, Christopher H. Herbst, Carmen Dolea, Pascal Zurn, and Agnes Soucat</i>	
	Geographic Maldistribution of Health Workers within Countries	148
	Wide Variation in Geographic Distribution across Countries	149
	Variation in Geographic Distribution across Cadres, Education, and Gender	151
	Labor Market Dynamics of the Rural-Urban Imbalance	153
	Policies Addressing Rural-Urban Imbalances in Sub-Saharan Africa	161
	Conclusion	163
	Notes	164
	References	165
<b>Chapter 10</b>	<b>Migration and Attrition</b>	<b>169</b>
	<i>Çağlar Özden and Mirvat Sewadeh</i>	
	Health Worker Mobility	169
	Emigration Patterns of African Physicians	171
	OECD Destinations for Migrant Physicians	173
	Where Do the Migrant Physicians Come From?	174
	What Drives the Migration of Physicians?	176
	Why Ghanaian Doctors Emigrate	178
	The Exodus of African Doctors—How Bad Is It?	185
	Conclusion	186
	References	188

<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>Public and Private Practice of Health Workers</b>	<b>191</b>
	<i>Tim Ensor, Pieter Serneels, and Tomas Lievens</i>	
	Health Sector Options in Sub-Saharan Africa	191
	Distribution of the Health Workforce across Sectors: Empirical Evidence	193
	Choosing between Public and Private Sector Jobs	196
	Moving from Public to the Private Sector Over Time	199
	Simultaneous Links between Sectors: Dual Practice	203
	Individual Characteristics and Intrinsic Motivation	208
	Conclusion	210
	Notes	213
	References	214
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>The Equity Perspective</b>	<b>219</b>
	<i>Davidson R. Gwatkin and Alex Ergo</i>	
	Concepts and Definitions	220
	Implications	220
	The Economic and Geographic Dimensions of Health Equity	221
	Availability of Health Workers to the Poor	225
	Use of Health Workers by the Poor	227
	Conclusion	230
	Notes	232
	References	233
<b>Part 3</b>	<b>Performance of the Health Workforce</b>	<b>235</b>
<b>Chapter 13</b>	<b>Incentives for Provider Performance</b>	<b>237</b>
	<i>Agnes Soucat, Paul Gertler, Paulin Basinga, Jennifer Sturdy, Christel Vermeersch, and Claude Sekabaraga</i>	
	Why Pay for Performance in Sub-Saharan Africa?	237
	How Pay for Performance Improves Health Worker Outcomes	238

	Global Experience of Pay for Performance	238
	A Country Example: Rwanda's Performance-Based Financing	241
	Impact Evaluation in Rwanda	245
	Impact on Health Worker Funding, Numbers, and Distribution	246
	Impact on Performance: The Quantity and Quality Effects	248
	Conclusion	251
	Notes	252
	References	252
<b>Chapter 14</b>	<b>Intrinsic Motivation</b>	<b>255</b>
	<i>Kenneth L. Leonard, Pieter Serneels, and J. Michelle Brock</i>	
	Insights from Economic Theory	258
	Intrinsic Motivation and Health Care: A Framework for Analysis	261
	Empirical Evidence	267
	Conclusion	276
	Notes	277
	References	278
<b>Chapter 15</b>	<b>Facility-Level Human Resource Management</b>	<b>285</b>
	<i>Christophe Lemière, Christine Mahoney, and Jennifer Nyoni</i>	
	What Is Effective Human Resource Management?	285
	Improving Health Worker Performance through Human Resource Management	286
	Why Is Good Human Resource Management so Rare in Africa?	291
	Conclusion	293
	Notes	293
	References	296

<b>Part 4</b>	<b>Education and Training of Health Workers</b>	<b>299</b>
Chapter 16	<b>Health Worker Education and Training</b> <i>Kate Tulenko, Emmanuel Gasakure, and Andre-Jacques Neusy</i>	<b>301</b>
	How Preservice Education Leads to the Low Stock	302
	How Preservice Education Does Not Lead to Good Performance	310
	How Preservice Education Leads to Distributional Imbalances	313
	Conclusion	315
	References	315
Chapter 17	<b>Becoming a Health Worker Student</b> <i>Petra Righetti, Roger Strasser, Peter Materu, and Christopher H. Herbst</i>	<b>319</b>
	Health Science Education in Context	319
	Enrollment Patterns in Health Science	321
	Constraints on the Supply of Health Worker Students	322
	Capacity and Financial Constraints on Enrollment	327
	Promising Government and Institutional Interventions	330
	Conclusion	332
	Notes	333
	References	333
Chapter 18	<b>Paying for Higher Education Reform in Health</b> <i>Alexander Preker, Hortenzia Beciu, Paul Jacob Robyn, Seth Ayettey, and James Antwi</i>	<b>337</b>
	The Cost of Training Health Workers	338
	Primary Financing Sources for Health Worker Education	344



Getting Better Value for Money	351
Scenarios for Financing Health Worker	
Education	352
Conclusion	354
Acknowledgments	354
Notes	354
References	355

## Boxes

2.1	Service Delivery and Health Worker Productivity	21
2.2	Population Distribution and Human Resources for Health Requirements, Chad	23
3.1	Labor Market Outcomes in Africa and Other Regions	38
3.2	Choice of Performance Levels: Economists' Views and Policies	42
4.1	Comparing Methods for Measuring Productivity	62
5.1	Measuring Provider Quality in Developing Countries	74
5.2	The Hawthorne Effect as Evidence of Untapped Motivation	89
6.1	Wage Bill Ceilings	94
6.2	Rwanda's Performance-Based Financing Reform	103
6.3	Malawi Emergency Human Resources Programme, 2005–2009	106
6.4	Aligning Donors with Government Processes and Priorities in Kenya	106
7.1	Political Entrenchment and Health Sector Reforms	115
7.2	A Stakeholder Account of Salary Consolidation in Ghana	120
8.1	Quality of Data Is a Major Issue	134
9.1	Overview of Methods for Measuring Geographic Imbalances of Health Workers	149
9.2	Unequal Distribution of Health Workers and Reduced Health Care Access	154
9.3	Incentives for Recruiting Private Rural Doctors in Mali	162
11.1	Dual Practice in Ethiopia	206
12.1	How Good Is Antenatal Care for Poor Women?	231
12.2	Traditional Practitioners and the Poor	232
13.1	Health Worker Performance	239
13.2	Rwanda, a Story of Successful Reforms	242
14.1	Intrinsic Motivation in the Words of Health Workers	256
14.2	Generosity, Workplace Norms, and Protocol Adherence	271