



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Living through becoming

An ethnographic study of women-loving women's subjectivity in the 2010s in mainland China

Wang, Y.

Publication date

2019

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Wang, Y. (2019). *Living through becoming: An ethnographic study of women-loving women's subjectivity in the 2010s in mainland China*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

LIVING THROUGH BECOMING:
An Ethnographic Study of Women-Loving
Women's Subjectivity in the 2010s in
Mainland China

Yiran Wang



Living Through Becoming:
An Ethnographic Study of Women-Loving Women's Subjectivity
in the 2010s in Mainland China

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op woensdag 25 september 2019, te 10.00 uur
door Yiran Wang
geboren te Zhejiang

Promotiecommissie

Promotor: prof. dr. S.E. Wieringa Universiteit van Amsterdam

Copromotor(es):

Overige leden: prof. dr. H.M.W. Bos Universiteit van Amsterdam
 prof. dr. ir. B.J. de Kloet Universiteit van Amsterdam
 prof. dr. R. Braidotti Universiteit Utrecht
 prof. dr. S.A.E. Bracke Universiteit van Amsterdam
 prof. dr. A. Chao Tunghai University Taiwan
 dr. M.P.C. Janssen Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragwetenschappen

Cover Design & Layout by

Printed by

Cover photo by

Sanne Kassenberg, persoonlijkproefschrift.nl

Ipskamp Printing, proefschriften.net

Yiran Wang

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	vii
Chapter 1 Introduction: Grasping “Subjectivity” in Chinese Women-Loving Women’s Experiences	1
A Personal Starting Point	2
Approaching “Subjectivity”	5
Encountering Rosi Braidotti’s “Nomadic Subjects”	9
Research Themes: Picturing the Chinese Women-Loving Women’s Subjectivity	13
Globalisation	14
Heteronormativity	16
Sexual Orientations and Gender Expressions	18
Love and Sex	21
Coming Out of the Closet	23
Methodology: An Ethnographer at Work in the 2010s in Mainland China	26
Fieldwork Period and Locations	26
Sampling and the Informants	28
Data Collection and Analyses	31
Learning Ethico-Onto-Epistem-Ology	33
Chapter 2 Studying Globalisation and Subjectivity as “Entanglements”: Time, Space, Imagination and Reality	37
McDonald’s and Nostalgia: A Glance at Globalisation	38
The Missing Colour on the Rainbow Flag: Encountering Globalised LGBT Symbols in China	40
“Have You Ever Tasted Authentic Russian Borscht?” Meeting Globalised Subjects in the Field	45
“Never-Land”: Trapped Nomads Yearning for Home and the Deterritorialised Selves in “The Chinese Dream”	51
Chapter 3 More than “Just Normal”: The Passionate Aesthetics of Being Different from Banality, Superior to Ordinary, and Away from Stigmas	57
“Despicable Me”: An Epitome of Conditional and Precarious “Loveliness”	58
The Art of Walking a Fine Line Through Paradoxes: Analysing Heteronormativity by Analysing “Passionate Aesthetics”	62
“Different Normativities” or “Different Differences”: Different Forms of Marriage Carry Nuanced Meanings Other than “Normalcy”	71
The Passion in “Extra-Marital Affairs”: Revising the Dominant Aesthetic Standards Outside Marriage-Centred Discourses	83

Chapter 4 Not “Purely” Rehearsed: The <i>T-P</i> Dance Duet	89
Centring <i>T-P</i> Relationships on the Stage of SOGIE (Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity and Expression)	90
“My (Ex-)Girlfriend is Straight”: “Pureness” as Superiority	96
Impossible “Pure <i>P</i> ” and Legendary “Iron <i>T</i> ”: “Pureness” as Stigma	104
Emerging “Masculine <i>Ps</i> ” and “Feminine <i>Ts</i> ”: The Revolutions and Limitations of “Impure” Women	111
Chapter 5 Recreating (in) Love and Sex: Becoming Vulnerable Translators, Becoming Powerful Translations	121
Facing a Multi-Fold Lack of Academic Vocabularies when Studying “Love” and “Sex”	122
First Love Without Articulation	126
Translating “Romantic” and “Passionate”, Transcending Heteronormative “Love”	131
Having Sex: Penetrating the Body and the Soul	139
Chapter 6 Revisiting the “Closet”, Coming Out of “Home”: Some Perspectives for Analysing Coming Out/<i>Chugui</i>	149
“New” Stories Emerging from Old Tasks	150
Filial Piety or Otherization: The Parents of Our-“Selves” in Coming Out Journeys	153
The Next Metaphor Rather Than the Canonical Original: Setting “Coming Out” Free From its Western Root	161
De-centring “Coming Out” From a (Hetero)normative Familial Relationship: Beyond the Common Imaginations About “Home”	167
Chapter 7 Conclusion: A Retrospective Summary and A (or another) Growing Part of My Study	175
Further than Six Years and Three Days	176
Review(ing) as Another Approach	179
A Different Way Home	191
Bibliography	195
Articles and Books	195
Other Internet Sources Included in Footnotes	201
Appendix	203
Summary	204
Samenvatting	208

Acknowledgements

The past ten years was an unforgettable journey for me. During this period, I developed my MA thesis and then my PhD dissertation with extended ethnographic explorations on the sexuality, subjectivity and everyday experiences of same-sex attracted women in contemporary urban China. Meanwhile, I have grown from a young woman, who did not know how to express herself, to a young scholar telling the life stories of a variety of women as well as those of her own. About many challenging moments in this journey, when I faced difficulties or when I was trapped in frustration, I have discussed in detail in the main contents of my dissertation; here, however, I would like to thank the people who generously helped me, greatly inspired me and/or kindly supported me all the way.

I owe a tremendous debt of gratitude to Prof. Saskia E. Wieringa, my promoter in Amsterdam Institute for Social Science Research (AISSR), University of Amsterdam, who has been supervising my PhD research project since the September of 2012. Without her professional skills and profound insights, her open-minded attitude towards different sources of knowledge, and her strict training and constant patience, my dissertation would not have been accomplished. Her persistent striving for a better world with less injustice, inequality and violence gives me continuous courage to make my own contribution—however small it seems—to the same career.

I am deeply grateful to the members who participated, together with me, in a series of seminars organised by Prof. Wieringa: Tu Anh Hoang, Yu Qi, Jingshu Zhu, Agrar Sudrajat, Fotarisman Zaluchu, Wanda Klein, and Iman Al-Ghafari. Coming from different parts of the world, having different personal backgrounds, and researching different topics with methods of different disciplines, we got along in harmony and criticised one another's study in a sharp yet constructive way. Although the unique memories related to each member in this group mean equal preciousness to me, here I should thank Jingshu Zhu, who attended a short course given by Prof. Rosi Braidotti and shared with us what she had learned in the course; this saved my time when I was searching for materials about Braidotti's theory of "nomadic subjectivity". I should thank Yu Qi as well; she excellently used her knowledge of physics to explain to us the key concepts constituting Karen Barad's book *Meeting the Universe Halfway*, which helped me to refer to Barad's theory in my dissertation.

Many thanks go to the lovely people I met in the University of Amsterdam, who actively shared with me their ideas about doing research in the contexts of rapid globalisation, and gave feedbacks to my ongoing study. I appreciate the colleagues in the anthropological programme group of "Health, Care and the Body", AISSR, who organised "pre-field" and "post-field" sessions, from where I collected many friendly critics and supports. It is

especially worth mentioning my colleague and good friend Hanna Henao, with whom I have had exciting adventures as well as wonderful conversations and email correspondences, since the first day I stepped into the University of Amsterdam.

In the aspect of everyday life in Amsterdam, my warm-hearted friends Topi Xi Yang and Yuting Pan often went out of their way to do me this and that favour. I also received huge help from my colleague Agrar Sudrajat and his family. I lived with the Sudrajats for about one year, and they made me feel at home. My deep gratitude goes to Atik, Agrar's wife, who is an impressive chef and a strong woman; she has wisdom of life and a free spirit. Agrar's eldest son, Yusuf, accompanied me on some occasions when and where I was worried about potential danger; his other two sons were also very kind to me.

From applying to be a PhD candidate to preparing for my PhD defence, I have benefited a lot from the practical help, information and advice provided by Mr. Janus Oomen in AISSR, whose sincere and patient responses for many times made me relieved. In the stage of finalising my dissertation, I encountered some problems when I tried to perfect my in-text citations and bibliography; thanks to Shuaishuai Wang and Jiling Duan, those problems were solved. I also thank Junhui Wu, who gave me helpful tips about various procedures

I am thankful to Steve Russell, who proofread and edited my dissertation; his professional work had largely refined my English writing. I appreciate the stunning book layout designed by Sanne Kassenberg, who turned my dissertation from a plain Microsoft Word file into a piece of true artistic work. Additionally, I am honoured that my good friend Wanda Klein helped me translate the dissertation summary into Dutch.

Besides what I have mentioned above, the pleasant moments I had together with Li Jiao, Jana Zarges, Maria Laura Ferioli, Jessica Spadacini, Fedelico Ciocca, Yiya Chen, Jing Qian, Siyu Tang, Yi Hong, Anlieka Kursiani Marconi, Lijing Yang, Doreen Chen, Astor Huang, Carla F. Rodrigues, Willemijn Krebbekx, Xiaodan Guo, Fran Martin, Shengnan Wang, and Weihua Zhang, have sprinkled the adventures/routines in my PhD period outside China with warm and amusing memories. I made friends with Emilia (Hanna's daughter), Emma (Wanda's daughter), Gabby (Agrar's granddaughter), and Min Anh (Tu Anh's daughter); their vitality and creativity have been reminding me of the infinite potentials of all girls. I would like to express special admiration to Ms. Nursyahbani Katjasungkana, who, in my eyes, represents a perfect combination of softness and strength, and of flexibility and persistence; it is always amazing to meet with or hear from her.

In China, I would like to thank dr. Xiying Wang, dr. Suowei Xiao, dr. Zhihong Sa and dr. Pierre Miège, who once gave me big support when I was a post-graduate student in Beijing. Thanks also go to Wenyi Wang, and Rong Zhao (who is living in the U.S. now),

my old schoolmates in Beijing Normal University; their admirable qualities brought me courage when I was doubting my academic aspirations. Of course, some other friends whose interest and talent are not located in academia deserve my equal appreciation. I would like to especially thank one of them, Wen Jiang; without the interesting stories and genuine care from her, my PhD period would have been less colourful.

On a personal note, I would like to thank my parents, who always encourage me to follow my heart and believe in myself, to read books and travel far, and to observe the world and think independently. I am grateful to my late grandmother on father's side; although she had passed away before I got the admission of the University of Amsterdam, her huge love for me kept giving me strength when I was far away from home. Her life stories have also become my private materials for thinking and imagining about women's lives and feminism. I also owe my gratitude to my late grandfather on mother's side, who passed away when I was in Amsterdam. This versatile man had taught himself English, and was my first English teacher. Many thanks to my lover's parents as well, with whom I have had a lot of happy moments. I owe the greatest debt of gratitude to my lover, Laurence J. Tang. Meeting her was like a natural reunion with a companion who had already accompanied me for many past lives; having her by my side is like an infinitely unfolding symphony composed by deep passion and love. I would like to dedicate my dissertation to her.

What should be stressed is that my studies would have never been possibly done without my informants' participation. Although I mentioned them anonymously in my writing, my biggest thanks to them have not been weakened at all. My informants narrated beautiful stories and contributed bright ideas, which not only constituted rich data for analysis but also taught me important lessons about life and love. Additionally, I also thank the people who provided practical help to me in various ways during my fieldwork.

Last but not least, my thanks go to the financial support from China Scholarship Council (CSC), and from AISSR, which made my life and work during the PhD period more secure.

Shanghai, China

July 25, 2019