

LLOYD'S
INTRODUCTION
TO
JURISPRUDENCE

SIXTH EDITION

by

M.D.A. FREEMAN, LL.M.

*Professor of English Law
in the University of London*

LONDON
SWEET & MAXWELL LTD.
1994

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|--------|
| <i>Preface to the Sixth Edition</i> | page v |
| <i>From the Preface to the First Edition</i> | ix |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xv |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> | xxxiii |
| <i>Table of Statutes</i> | xxxvii |

| | |
|--|----|
| 1. NATURE OF JURISPRUDENCE | 1 |
| What is Jurisprudence? | 1 |
| The Relevance of Jurisprudence | 2 |
| Acquiring Social Knowledge | 6 |
| Normative Character of Law | 11 |
| “Ought” and “Is” | 12 |
| Form (or Structure) and Content | 14 |
| Philosophy of Law? | 14 |
| The Need for a Comprehensive Jurisprudence | 15 |
| Jurisprudence Today | 16 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|--------------|--|----|
| J. Austin | <i>The Uses of the Study of Jurisprudence</i> | 20 |
| W.L. Twining | <i>Some Jobs for Jurisprudence</i> | 23 |
| J. Shklar | <i>Legalism</i> | 26 |
| T. Eagleton | <i>Ideology</i> | 30 |
| D. Hume | <i>A Treatise of Human Nature</i> | 34 |
| K. Popper | <i>The Poverty of Historicism</i> | 35 |
| T.S. Kuhn | <i>The Structure of Scientific Revolutions</i> | 38 |
| T. Campbell | <i>Seven Theories of Human Society</i> | 43 |

| | |
|----------------------------|----|
| 2. MEANING OF LAW | 47 |
| The Nature of Definitions | 47 |
| “Naming a Thing” | 47 |
| “Essentialism” | 48 |
| Analysis of Words or Fact | 50 |
| Are Definitions Necessary? | 51 |
| Ideological Factors | 51 |
| Criterion of Validity | 52 |
| Law and Regularity | 55 |
| Law and Morals | 56 |
| Morals as Part of Law | 58 |
| Law and Value Judgments | 59 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| L.L. Fuller | <i>The Case of the Speluncean Explorers</i> | 60 |
| G. Williams | <i>International Law and the Controversy Concerning the Word "Law"</i> | 73 |
| H.L.A. Hart | <i>Definition and Theory in Jurisprudence</i> | 74 |
| R. Wollheim | <i>The Nature of Law</i> | 77 |
| | | |
| 3. NATURAL LAW | | 79 |
| What is Natural Law? | | 79 |
| The Attractions of Natural Law | | 86 |
| Greek Origins | | 93 |
| Jus Gentium | | 94 |
| Medieval Period | | 95 |
| Renaissance, Reformation and Counter-Reformation | | 97 |
| Grotius and International Law | | 100 |
| Natural Law and the Social Contract | | 101 |
| Kant and Human Freedom | | 108 |
| The Eighteenth Century | | 110 |
| Nineteenth Century | | 113 |
| Fuller and the Morality of Law | | 114 |
| Hart on Natural Law | | 119 |
| Finnis and the Restatement of Natural Law | | 122 |
| Conclusion | | 129 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|---|---|-----|
| Aristotle | <i>Nicomachean Ethics</i> | 130 |
| Cicero | <i>De Re Publica</i> | 130 |
| Justinian | <i>Institutes</i> | 131 |
| Aquinas | <i>Summa Theologica</i> | 132 |
| T. Hobbes | <i>Leviathan</i> | 137 |
| Locke | <i>Two Treatises of Government</i> | 139 |
| J.J. Rousseau | <i>The Social Contract</i> | 141 |
| J. Maritain | <i>Man and the State</i> | 145 |
| M. MacDonald | <i>Natural Rights</i> | 147 |
| L.L. Fuller | <i>The Morality of Law</i> | 149 |
| J.M. Finnis | <i>Natural Law and Natural Rights</i> | 163 |
| Margaret Mead | <i>Some Anthropological Considerations Concerning Natural Law</i> | 185 |
| A. Gewirth | <i>The Epistemology of Human Rights</i> | 187 |
| | | |
| 4. BENTHAM, AUSTIN AND CLASSICAL POSITIVISM | | 205 |
| Sovereignty and its Origins | | 205 |
| Bentham and the Utilitarians | | 206 |
| Bentham's "Of Laws in General" | | 209 |
| Austin | | 213 |

| | |
|------------|-----|
| Conclusion | 227 |
|------------|-----|

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| J. Bentham | <i>A Fragment on Government</i> | 229 |
| J. Bentham | <i>An Introduction to the Principles of Morals and Legislation</i> | 229 |
| J. Bentham | <i>Of Laws in General</i> | 233 |
| J. Austin | <i>The Province of Jurisprudence Determined</i> | 251 |
| W.J. Rees | <i>The Theory of Sovereignty Re-stated</i> | 264 |
| | | |
| 5. | PURE THEORY OF LAW | 271 |
| | Normativism | 272 |
| | The Pure Science of Law | 273 |
| | Norms and the Basic Norm | 274 |
| | Hierarchy of Norms and Law-making Process | 276 |
| | Sanctions | 277 |
| | Kelsen and Austin | 280 |
| | Norm and Command | 280 |
| | Sanctions | 280 |
| | Legal Dynamics | 281 |
| | Basic Norm | 281 |
| | Critique | 281 |
| | The Basic Norm | 282 |
| | International Law | 288 |
| | Law and Fact | 289 |
| | Non-legal Norms | 290 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-----------|---|-----|
| H. Kelsen | <i>The Pure Theory of Law</i> | 291 |
| H. Kelsen | <i>General Theory of Law and State</i> | 297 |
| H. Kelsen | <i>Causality and Imputation</i> | 304 |
| H. Kelsen | <i>Professor Stone and the Pure Theory of Law</i> | 307 |
| H. Kelsen | <i>The Pure Theory of Law</i> | 309 |
| H. Kelsen | <i>The Function of a Constitution</i> | 321 |
| J. Raz | <i>The Purity of the Pure Theory</i> | 327 |
| | | |
| 6. | MODERN TRENDS IN ANALYTICAL AND NORMATIVE JURISPRUDENCE | 339 |
| | Hart's Concept of Law | 344 |
| | An Outline of Hart's Jurisprudence | 345 |
| | The "Internal Aspect" of Law | 348 |
| | The Rule of Recognition | 350 |
| | Is Law A System of Rules? | 354 |
| | Rawls and Distributive Justice | 356 |
| | Nozick and the Minimal State | 367 |

| | |
|------------------------------|-----|
| The Economic Analysis of Law | 374 |
| Rights | 379 |
| The Nature of Rights | 387 |
| Hohfeld's Analysis of Rights | 390 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-------------------|--|-----|
| H.L.A. Hart | <i>Positivism and the Separation of Law and Morals</i> | 393 |
| L.L. Fuller | <i>Positivism and Fidelity to Law – a Reply to Professor Hart</i> | 396 |
| H.L.A. Hart | <i>Definition and Theory in Jurisprudence</i> | 400 |
| N. MacCormick | <i>Contemporary Legal Philosophy: the Rediscovery of Practical Reason</i> | 405 |
| J. Raz | <i>The Problem about the Nature of Law</i> | 419 |
| J. Raz | <i>Practical Reason and Norms</i> | 430 |
| Ronald Dworkin | <i>A Trump Over Utility</i> | 434 |
| H.L.A. Hart | <i>Between Utility and Rights</i> | 444 |
| Ronald Dworkin | <i>Is Wealth a Value?</i> | 454 |
| Richard A. Posner | <i>Dworkin's Critique of Wealth Maximisation</i> | 459 |
| R.S. Markovits | <i>Second-Best Theory and the Standard Analysis of Monopoly Rent Seeking</i> | 463 |
| J. Rawls | <i>A Theory of Justice</i> | 466 |
| J. Rawls | <i>Political Liberalism</i> | 477 |
| J. Rawls | <i>The Law of Peoples</i> | 485 |
| R. Nozick | <i>Anarchy, State and Utopia</i> | 491 |
| W.N. Hohfeld | <i>Fundamental Legal Conceptions as Applied in Judicial Reasoning</i> | 494 |
| N. MacCormick | <i>The Ethics of Legalism</i> | 500 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 7. SOCIOLOGICAL JURISPRUDENCE AND THE SOCIOLOGY OF LAW | 509 |
| Introduction | 509 |
| Comte and Sociology | 510 |
| Laissez Faire and Herbert Spencer | 511 |
| Jhering (1818–1892) | 514 |
| Max Weber (1864–1920) | 514 |
| Emile Durkheim (1858–1917) | 518 |
| Eugen Ehrlich (1862–1922) | 522 |
| Roscoe Pound (1870–1964) | 524 |
| Social Engineering | 525 |
| Values | 528 |
| A Consensus Model Society | 529 |
| Sociological Jurisprudence since Pound | 531 |
| Lasswell and McDougal | 533 |
| Talcott Parsons | 534 |
| Selznick | 536 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| From Sociological Jurisprudence – Towards a Sociology of Law | 537 |
| Unger and the Development of Modern Law | 542 |
| Critical Empiricism | 544 |
| Autopoiesis and Law | 547 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|----------------------|---|-----|
| R. von Jhering | <i>Law as Means to an End</i> | 550 |
| M. Weber | <i>Economy and Society</i> | 552 |
| E. Durkheim | <i>The Division of Labour in Society</i> | 562 |
| Ehrlich | <i>Principles of the Sociology of Law</i> | 565 |
| R. Pound | <i>Philosophy of Law</i> | 570 |
| R. Pound | <i>Outlines of Jurisprudence</i> | 572 |
| R. Pound | <i>Contemporary Juristic Theory</i> | 573 |
| R. Pound | <i>Social Control Through Law</i> | 578 |
| Harry C. Bredemeier | <i>Law as an Integrative Mechanism</i> | 579 |
| P. Selznick | <i>The Sociology of Law</i> | 584 |
| R.M. Unger | <i>Law in Modern Society</i> | 589 |
| A. Hunt | <i>Dichotomy and Contradiction in the Sociology of Law</i> | 594 |
| R. Cotterrell | <i>The Sociological Concept of Law</i> | 602 |
| D.M. Trubek | <i>Back to the Future: The Short Happy Life of the Law and Society Movement</i> | 613 |
| S. Silbey & A. Sarat | <i>Critical Traditions in Law and Society Research</i> | 622 |
| N. Luhmann | <i>Operational Closure and Structural Coupling: The Differentiation of the Legal System</i> | 627 |
| G. Teubner | <i>How the Law Thinks</i> | 636 |
| | | |
| 8. | AMERICAN REALISM | 655 |
| | The “Revolt against Formalism” | 655 |
| | Mr Justice Holmes | 656 |
| | The American Legal System | 658 |
| | The “Realist” Movement in Law | 658 |
| | Fact-skeptics and Rule-skeptics | 659 |
| | Llewellyn on Institutions and “Law-Jobs” | 661 |
| | The Common Law Tradition | 662 |
| | Scientific and Normative Laws | 666 |
| | Realism: An Assessment | 667 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-------------|--------------------------------|-----|
| O.W. Holmes | <i>The Path of the Law</i> | 670 |
| W. Twining | <i>The Bad Man Revisited</i> | 671 |
| J. Dewey | <i>Logical Method and Law</i> | 677 |
| J. Frank | <i>Law and the Modern Mind</i> | 679 |
| J. Frank | <i>Courts on Trial</i> | 683 |

| | | |
|--------------|--|-----|
| K. Llewellyn | <i>Some Realism about Realism</i> | 686 |
| K. Llewellyn | <i>Using the New Jurisprudence</i> | 691 |
| K. Llewellyn | <i>The Common Law Tradition</i> | 694 |
| K. Llewellyn | <i>My Philosophy of Law</i> | 703 |
| K. Llewellyn | <i>The Normative, The Legal and the Law-Jobs: The Problem of Juristic Method</i> | 709 |
| W. Twining | <i>The Significance of Realism</i> | 723 |
| | | |
| 9. | THE SCANDINAVIAN REALISTS | 731 |
| | Axel Hägerström (1868–1939) | 731 |
| | Law as Fact | 734 |
| | Ross's Theory of Law | 737 |
| | "Valid Law" | |
| | The "Verifiability" Principle | 740 |
| | Origin of Law | 742 |
| | "Reductionism" and Legal Concepts | 743 |
| | Features of Law | 744 |
| | Law and Morals | 745 |
| | Legal Ideology – the Method of Justice v. Social Welfare | 747 |
| | Scandinavian and American Realism | 749 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-----------------|--|-----|
| Axel Hägerström | <i>Inquiries into the Nature of Law and Morals</i> | 750 |
| K. Olivecrona | <i>Law as Fact</i> | 755 |
| K. Olivecrona | <i>Legal Language and Reality</i> | 764 |
| A.V. Lundstedt | <i>Legal Thinking Revised</i> | 766 |
| A. Ross | <i>On Law and Justice</i> | 769 |
| A. Ross | <i>Directives and Norms</i> | 772 |
| A. Ross | <i>Tü-tü</i> | 778 |
| F. Castberg | <i>Problems of Legal Philosophy</i> | 781 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 10. | HISTORICAL AND ANTHROPOLOGICAL JURISPRUDENCE | 783 |
| | The Romantic Reaction | 783 |
| | Herder and Hegel | 783 |
| | The German Historical School | 785 |
| | F.K. von Savigny (1779–1861) | 785 |
| | The <i>Volkgeist</i> – Some Problems | 786 |
| | Legislation and <i>Juristenrecht</i> | 787 |
| | Sir Henry Maine (1822–1888) | 789 |
| | Law and Anthropology | 790 |
| | Dispute Processes | 797 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|------------------|-----------------------------------|-----|
| F.K. von Savigny | <i>System of Modern Roman Law</i> | 799 |
| Sir Henry Maine | <i>Ancient Law</i> | 804 |

| | | |
|--|---|-----|
| E.A. Hoebel | <i>The Law of Primitive Man</i> | 807 |
| M. Gluckman | <i>Judicial Process among the Barotse</i> | 813 |
| L.L. Fuller | <i>Human Interaction and the Law</i> | 819 |
| Paul Bohannan | <i>The Differing Realms of the Law</i> | 829 |
| S. Diamond | <i>The Rule of Law versus the Order of Custom</i> | 832 |
| | | |
| 11. MARXIST THEORIES OF LAW AND STATE | | 837 |
| Dialectics, Hegel and Marx | | 838 |
| Marx and Hegel's Political Philosophy | | 839 |
| Materialist Conception | | 840 |
| Base and Superstructure | | 842 |
| The Question of Class | | 848 |
| Marx and Ideology | | 850 |
| The State and Law | | 853 |
| Marx and Justice, Morality and Human Rights | | 857 |
| The "Withering Away" of the State | | 862 |
| Other Marxisms | | 864 |
| Karl Renner | | 864 |
| Antonio Gramsci | | 866 |
| The Frankfurt School | | 866 |
| Pashukanis | | 867 |
| Marxist Theories of Law and State – a Critique | | 871 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-----------------------|---|-----|
| F. Hegel | <i>Philosophy of Right</i> | 876 |
| K. Marx | <i>Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right</i> | 877 |
| K. Marx | <i>Preface to Contribution to Critique of Political Economy</i> | 877 |
| K. Marx and F. Engels | <i>The German Ideology</i> | 878 |
| F. Engels | <i>The Housing Question</i> | 879 |
| G.A. Cohen | <i>Karl Marx's Theory of History</i> | 880 |
| S. Lukes | <i>Can the Base be Distinguished from the Superstructure?</i> | 885 |
| K. Marx and F. Engels | <i>The German Ideology</i> | 890 |
| M. Foucault | <i>Two Lectures</i> | 891 |
| K. Marx | <i>Preface to The Critique of Political Economy</i> | 897 |
| K. Marx | <i>Capital</i> | 898 |
| K. Marx and F. Engels | <i>The German Ideology</i> | 905 |
| E.P. Thompson | <i>Whigs and Hunters</i> | 906 |
| K. Marx | <i>The Civil War in France</i> | 912 |
| K. Marx | <i>Critique of the Gotha Programme</i> | 912 |
| F. Engels | <i>Anti-Dühring</i> | 914 |
| V. Lenin | <i>State and Revolution</i> | 915 |
| K. Renner | <i>The Institutions of Private Law and their Social Functions</i> | 916 |
| E. Pashukanis | <i>Law and Marxism</i> | 924 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 12. THE CRITICAL LEGAL STUDIES MOVEMENT | 935 |
| Critical Legal Studies and Liberalism's Contradictions | 936 |
| Rules and Reasoning | 942 |
| Critical Legal Studies and Legal Practice | 944 |
| Legal Theory and Social Theory | 947 |
| Conclusion | 949 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|--------------|--|------|
| R. W. Gordon | <i>Law and Ideology</i> | 950 |
| R. W. Gordon | <i>New Developments in Legal Theory</i> | 959 |
| D. Kennedy | <i>The Structure of Blackstone's Commentaries</i> | 966 |
| P. Gabel | <i>Reification in Legal Reasoning</i> | 972 |
| M. Kelman | <i>Interpretive Construction in the Substantive Criminal Law</i> | 987 |
| C. Dalton | <i>An Essay in the Deconstruction of Contract Doctrine</i> | 1001 |
| G. Peller | <i>The Metaphysics of American Law</i> | 1012 |
| D. Kennedy | <i>The Ideological Content of Legal Education</i> | 1019 |

| | |
|---|------|
| 13. FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE | 1025 |
| Origins | 1025 |
| The Inquiries of Feminist Jurisprudence | 1028 |
| Equality and Difference | 1030 |
| Feminist Legal Methods | 1033 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|----------------|---|------|
| D.L. Rhode | <i>Feminist Critical Theories</i> | 1036 |
| A.C. Scales | <i>The Emergence of Feminist Jurisprudence: An essay</i> | 1048 |
| R. West | <i>Jurisprudence and Gender</i> | 1062 |
| C.A. MacKinnon | <i>Difference and Dominance: On Sex Discrimination</i> | 1081 |
| C.A. Littleton | <i>Reconstructing Sexual Equality</i> | 1091 |
| P.A. Cain | <i>Feminism and the Limits of Equality</i> | 1106 |
| K.T. Bartlett | <i>Feminist Legal Methods</i> | 1115 |
| L.M. Finley | <i>Breaking Women's Silence in Law: The Dilemma of the Gendered Nature of Legal Reasoning</i> | 1135 |

| | |
|------------------------------------|------|
| 14. POSTMODERNIST JURISPRUDENCE | 1147 |
| Postmodernism and Modernism | 1147 |
| The Death of the Subject | 1148 |
| The "Subject" and the Legal System | 1149 |
| A Political Agenda | 1151 |
| Postmodern Law: Postmodern State | 1153 |
| Semiotics and Legal Theory | 1155 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|--|------|
| J.F. Lyotard | <i>Answering the Question: What is Postmodernism?</i> | 1159 |
| J. Wicke | <i>Postmodern Identity and the Legal Subject</i> | 1166 |
| P. Schlag | <i>Normativity and the Politics of Form</i> | 1179 |
| J.M. Balkin | <i>Understanding Legal Understanding: The Legal Subject and the Problem of Legal Coherence</i> | 1189 |
| B. de Sousa Santos | <i>The Postmodern Transition: Law and Politics</i> | 1206 |
| M.J. Frug | <i>Rescuing Impossibility Doctrine: A Postmodern Feminist Analysis of Contract Law</i> | 1214 |
| K. Crenshaw | <i>Race, Reform and Retrenchment: Transformation and Legitimation in Anti-Discrimination Law</i> | 1222 |
| C. Douzinas and R. Warrington | <i>"A Well-Founded Fear of Justice": Law and Ethics in Postmodernity</i> | 1237 |
| B. Jackson | <i>On Scholarly Developments in Legal Semiotics</i> | 1246 |
| 15. THEORIES OF ADJUDICATION 1255 | | |
| | The Nature of Legal Sources | 1255 |
| | The Institution of Adjudication | 1257 |
| | Stare Decisis | 1260 |
| | Judges and Discretion | 1268 |
| | Dworkin and "hard cases" | 1270 |
| | Dworkin and Discretion | 1272 |
| | Dworkin and Interpretation | 1273 |
| | Law as Integrity | 1275 |
| | One Right Answer? | 1277 |
| | Integrity and Legitimacy | 1279 |
| | Right Answers and Wrong Answers | 1281 |
| | Judge-Made Law | 1283 |
| | Judicial Reasoning | 1285 |
| | Statutory Construction | 1289 |
| | Statutory Construction and Democracy | 1299 |

EXTRACTS

| | | |
|-----------------|---|------|
| J. Austin | <i>Lectures on Jurisprudence</i> | 1301 |
| H.L.A. Hart | <i>Problems of the Philosophy of Law</i> | 1302 |
| R. Dworkin | <i>Taking Rights Seriously</i> | 1308 |
| R. Dworkin | <i>Law as Interpretation</i> | 1319 |
| R. Dworkin | <i>Law's Empire</i> | 1326 |
| Cardozo | <i>Nature of the Judicial Process</i> | 1346 |
| G. Williams | <i>Language and the Law</i> | 1350 |
| J. Wisdom | <i>Gods</i> | 1353 |
| D.N. MacCormick | <i>Formal Justice and the Form of Legal Arguments</i> | 1354 |

| | | |
|-----------------------------|---|----------|
| F. Castberg | <i>Problems of Legal Philosophy</i> | 1358 |
| E.H. Levi | <i>An Introduction to Legal Reasoning</i> | 1362 |
| R. Sartorius | <i>Social Policy and Judicial Legislation</i> | 1365 |
| <i>Index of Authors</i> | | 1369 |
| <i>Index of Subjects</i> | | 1379 |