University of Wollongong

Research Online

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection 1954-2016

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

2004

Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray

University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Bunker-Murray, Deborah J, Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management, PhD thesis, School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, 2004. http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

University of Wollongong Thesis Collections

University of Wollongong Thesis Collection

University of Wollongong *Year* 2004

Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray
University of Wollongong

Bunker-Murray, Deborah J, Management of open information technology and systems (ITS) architectures in the Australian federal government: development of a perspectival model for information systems management, PhD thesis, School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, 2004. http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844

This paper is posted at Research Online.

http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/844

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

MANAGEMENT OF OPEN INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND SYSTEMS (ITS) ARCHITECTURES IN THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

Development of a Perspectival Model for Information Systems Management.

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

From

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

VOLUME I

by

DEBORAH J. BUNKER-MURRAY, BA 1980, MCom (Hons) 1991, UNSW

SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND INFORMATION SYSTEMS

2004

CERTIFICATION

I, Deborah J. Bunker-Murray, declare that this thesis, submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Economics and Information Systems, University of Wollongong, is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced of acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Deborah J. Bunker-Murray

22 June 2004

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A PhD can often be a long and lonely journey. On this journey, however, you can meet many wise, interesting and helpful people. I would like to thank all of my family, friends and colleagues for their words (and actions) of advice, encouragement and support.

Thanks must also go to DMR Group Australia Pty. Ltd. for their funding of this research as well as access to their expertise and industry contacts.

Special thanks go to Graham Winley, who supervised the early stages of this thesis and to Helen Hasan who gave me critical advice and supervision at the end of the thesis process.

Finally a very heartfelt thankyou, to my partner Bill Murray, whose unshakable confidence and support for what I was doing, kept me moving forward.

For Bill...

...and also for Eric (my father), Jim, Peg, Len and Rosemary who I will see once more at the end of a greater journey.

ABSTRACT

This thesis looks at the limitations of current ITS management objective (normative) theory and develops a new Perspectival ITS Management Model so as to supplement this theory and overcome some of its limitations. The proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model is an approach to reconciliation/integration of object/subject from a phenomenological viewpoint. The development of the Perspectival ITS Management Model has been heavily influenced by the work of John Haynes (2001a).

In order to investigate the applicability of the Perspectival ITS Management Model a constructionist epistemological stance is taken in the thesis, which describes an overview of current objective ITS management theory, that is analysed and focussed through a normative ITS Management Model (developed by the candidate in the early stages of the thesis). The thesis goes on to develop the objective theoretical view of the management of open systems architectures and uses this to investigate the subjective case study accounts of the management of open systems architectures from 1993–1996 in the Australian federal government. These cases are used to highlight how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can be utilised to enhance, extend and transform our understanding of ITS Management in ways that the current body of theory does not.

A postscript has also been developed to illustrate how the Perspectival ITS Management Model can also be applied to the ITS management landscape (whole-of-government ITS outsourcing) of the Australian federal government (1996 – 2001) after the initial open systems case study period (1993-1996).

INDEX WORDS: ITS Management, ITS Architecture, Perspectival Thinking, Phenomenology, Australian federal government.

PUBLICATIONS RELATING TO THIS THESIS

Bunker, D.J. & Winley, G.K. (1993) "Position statement: management of open systems architectures", IFIP, Conference on Diffusion, Transfer and Implementation of Information Technology, Champion, Pennsylvania, October 10-13.

Fowler, P. (Scribe & Ed), Bihari, T., Bunker, D., Chung, W., Damsgaard, J., Glasson, B., Lien, L. (Facilitator), McOwen, P., Montealegre, R., Radic, Z. & Varner, M. (1993) "Working session 1: Critical issues in first to third world transfer of software and information technology", IFIP, Conference on Diffusion, Transfer and Implementation of Information Technology, Champion, Pennsylvania, October 10-13.

Bunker, D.J. (1994) "Research in progress: management of open systems architectures - a case study", Australian Unix and Open Systems User Group, Annual Conference, Melbourne, September 6-9: 145-155.

Bunker, D.J. (1995) "Management of open systems architectures - an Australian government perspective", Australian Unix and Open Systems User Group, Annual Conference, Sydney, September 19-21: 10-15.

Bunker, D.J & Winley, G.K. (1995) "Management of Open Architectures" Association for Information Systems Proceedings of the First Americas Conference on Information Systems August 25-27 1995 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania USA: 378-380.

Bunker, D.J. & Dean, R.G.. (1996) "Toward an Information Systems Paradigmatic Framework", Association for Information Systems Proceedings of the Americas Conference on Information Systems, Phoenix, Arizona, August: 596-598.

Bunker, D.J., Larsen, T. & Vlissidis, P. (1997) "Technology transfer: does the context of the creation of IS technology inhibit its transfer? An international perspective", IFIP TC8 WG8.6 International Working Conference on Diffusion, Adoption and Implementation of Information Technology, 25th-27th June, 1997, Ambleside, Cumbria, UK: 375-376.

Bunker, D.J. & Dean, R.G. (1998) "Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) As Tools: the Cultural Context of Tool Creation and Use and Its Effect on the Technology Transfer Process", the electronic journal Philosophical and Conceptual Foundations of Information Systems, http://www.cba.uh.edu/~parks/fis/bunker.htm

Bunker, D.J. (1998) "Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) As Tools: Cultural Bias and the Implications for International Technology Transfer (ITT) ?" Proceedings of the Association of Information Systems Conference, Baltimore, August: 818-820.

Bunker, D.J. (1998) "A Philosophy of Information Technology and Systems (IT&S) as Tools: Tool Development Context, Associated Skills and the Global Technology Transfer (GTT) Process" in MIS-shaped or misshaped ? Emerging issues in the new global arena. Proceedings of IFIP WG8.7 Working Conference, Helsinki, Finland: 199-214.

Bunker, D.J. (2000) "Comments on the "information" concept in FRISCO compared to empirical studies of information in decision making", ISCO-4 (IFIP8.1) Proceedings, Information Systems Concepts: An integrated discipline emerging, Lorentz Center, Leiden, The Netherlands, 20-22 September: 295-297.

Bunker, D.J. (2000) "Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) System Tools: The Context of their Creation and Use Within the Technology Transfer Process" in Proceedings of the Americas Conference on Information Systems AMCIS 2000, (ed H.Michael Chung) August 10-13, Long Beach California: 1533-1536.

Bunker, D.J. (2001) "A Philosophy of Information Technology and Systems (IT & S) as Tools: Tool Development Context, Associated Skills and the Global Technical Transfer (GTT) Process", Information Systems Frontiers 3:2: 185-197.

Bunker, D.J., Wilson, D. & Elliot, S. (eds) (2002) The Adoption and Diffusion of IT in an Environment of Critical Change Proceedings of IFIP WC8.6, Sydney, Australia, August 1-3.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 1

CHAPTER 1 - THESIS OVERVIEW, RESEARCH PROBLEM AND QUESTIONS 1

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 Current Management Context and Research Questions 2

1.3 The Research Problem (chapter 1) 9

1.4 Literature Review: An Objective ITS Management Model (chapter 2) 10

1.5 Research Design for Data Collection and Analysis (chapter 3) 11

1.6 Background to the Objective Theory of the Management of Open ITS Architectures as it Applies to the Australian Federal Government (chapter 4) 12

1.7 Data Analysis: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Management of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective (chapter 5) 13

1.8 Discussion and Conclusion (chapter 6) 14

1.9 POSTSCRIPT: Australian Federal Government Management of ITS (Outsourcing 1996-2001) (chapter 7) 14

1.10 Summary of Research Findings, Contributions, Limitations and Opportunities (chapter 8) 15

CHAPTER 2 - LITERATURE REVIEW: An Objective ITS Management Model 16

Chapter Overview 16

2.1 Introduction 18

2.2 Literature Discussion Using the ITS Management Model (figure 2.1) as a Framework 24
2.2.1 Derivation of an Organisation's General Business Requirements 25
2.2.2 Derivation of an Organisation's ITS Business Unit Requirements 32
2.2.3 ITS Architecture and Infrastructure Requirements 35
2.2.4 The User Requirements of ITS 42
2.2.5 The Organisational Context (Boundary) and Its Effect on ITS Management 45
2.2.6 The External Environment to the Organisation and Its Effect on ITS Requirements 54
2.2.7 ITS Planning Cycles in a Typical Organisation 56

2.3 The Objective ITS Management Model and Its Relationship to the Galliers and Sutherland (1991) Revised Stages of Growth Model 74

2.4 Conclusion and Areas of Inquiry 95

CHAPTER 3 - RESEARCH DESIGN FOR DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS 105

Chapter Overview 105

3.1 Research Framework 107

3.2 Epistemology 109

3.3 Research Investigation and Resulting Research Problem, Question and Approaches 113

3.4 Research Methods - Including Steps for Data Collection and Analysis 118

3.5 Research Instrument 123

3.6 Justification of the Research Sites 125

3.7 Research Stages 127

3.8 Reconciliation of Object and Subject 129

3.9 Challenging Methodological Issues 140

3.10 Conclusions 142

CHAPTER 4 - BACKGROUND TO THE OBJECTIVE THEORY OF MANAGEMENT OF OPEN ITS ARCHITECTURES AS IT APPLIES TO THE AUSTRALIAN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT 144

Chapter Overview 144

4.1 Introduction 144

4.2 Objective Theory of Open ITS Architectures 145

4.3 Objective Theory of the Management of Open Systems Architectures - Galliers & Sutherland (1991) Revised Stages of Growth Model 152

4.4 Australian Federal Government Policy on Management of Open ITS Architectures 166

4.5 Australian Federal Government Use of Open Systems Architectures 169

4.6 Conclusions 171

CHAPTER 5 - DATA ANALYSIS: Australian Federal Government Case Interpretations of Open ITS Architectures from a Subjective Perspective 173

Chapter Overview 173

5.1 Introduction 174

5.2 Organisational Contextual Factors - Mutual Contingency of Skills and Tools 178
5.2.1 Case Organisation Contextual Interpretation 181
5.2.2 Case Organisation Interpretation - Obvious Contextual Factors Influencing Management of Open Systems Architectures 183
5.2.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Emerging Contextual Factors Influencing the Management of Open Systems Architectures 185

5.3 Case Organisation Interpretation - Subjective Case Account Data (Explanation Sketches) 187
5.3.1 Case Organisation 1 189
5.3.2 Case Organisation 2 192
5.3.3 Case Organisation 3 196
5.3.4 Case Organisation 4 198
5.3.5 Case Organisation 5 203
5.3.6 Case Organisation 6 206

5.4 Discussion 209

5.5 Limitations of Objective Views of Open Systems Architecture Management - (Tool Based Model of the IS Discipline) 213

5.6 Conclusions 217

CHAPTER 6 - DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION 218

Chapter Overview 218

6.1 Research Problem, Questions and Approach 219

6.2 Reconciliation of Object and Subject 221

6.3 Proposed Perspectival ITS Management Model 225

6.4 Conclusions 239

CHAPTER 7 - POSTSCRIPT: Australian Federal Government Management of ITS Architectures (Outsourcing 1996 - 2001) 243

Chapter Overview 243

7.1 Introduction 243

7.2 Objective Theory of Outsourcing ITS Architectures 244

7.3 Objective Theory of Outsourcing ITS Architectures - Australian Federal Government Policy (1996 - 2001) 252

7.4 Outsourcing Findings - Subjective Accounts of Outsourcing ITS Architectures - Australian Federal Government 255

7.5 Conclusions 262

CHAPTER 8 - SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS, CONTRIBUTIONS, LIMITATIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES 268

8.1 Introduction 268

8.2 Summary of Research Findings 268

8.3 Research Contributions 270

8.4 Research Limitations 272

8.5 Future Research Opportunities 273

BIBLIOGRAPHY 275

APPENDIX A - CASE ORGANISATION SURVEY INSTRUMENT VOLUME 2

APPENDIX B - CASE ORGANISATION CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION VOLUME 2

APPENDIX C – CASE ORGANISATION RESPONDENT SUBJECTIVE CHARACTERISTICS TABLES VOLUME 2

APPENDIX D – CASE ORGANISATION INDIVIDUAL SUBJECTIVE ACCOUNTS VOLUME 2

APPENDIX E – FORMAL STANDARDS GROUPS & DEFINITIONS VOLUME 2

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Figure 2.1 – ITS Management Model (modified from Bunker 1994) – pg 152 17

Table 2.1 - Basic Tasks at Different Levels of MIS Planning – from Goa & Oppelland (1994) – pg 287 32

Figure 2.2 – The Elements of IT Infrastructure – from Weill et al. (1996) – pg 6 38

Table 2.2 – Key Issues of EUC (N=74) – from McLean et al. (1993) – pg 86 43

Table 2.3 – Possible Stakeholders in MIS Planning within an Organisation - from Goa & Oppelland (1994) - 288 57

Figure 2.3 – The New Age – from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79 63

Figure 2.4 - Managing the New Age - from Hirschheim et al. (1988) – pg 79 63

Table 2.4 – Five Approaches Summarised – from Earl (1993) – pg 12 66

Figure 2.5 – A Contingency Framework for Choosing an Appropriate SISP Approach Based on Stakeholder Motivations (amended from Galliers 1987f p 344) – from Galliers (1991) – pg 63 67

Table 2.5 - A revised "stages of growth" model – (Sutherland & Galliers, 1989, p23 reproduced in Galliers, 1991, pp 61-62) 69

Figure 2.6 - Research Model – from Prekumar & King (1994) – pg 81 71

Exhibit 2.1 – A Model of IS Leadership Roles – from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 15 77

Exhibit 2.2 – Four Forms of IS Partnering - from Brown et al. (1996) – pg 16 78

Figure 2.7 – Four 'Faces', or Tasks, of the Emerging IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 6 84

Figure 2.8 – Nine Capabilities for the IS Function – from Wilcocks (1996) – pg 7 85

Table 2.6 – Research Agenda – from Clark (1994) – pg 49 92

Table 2.7 – The predictions for the next decade – from Benjamin & Blunt (1994) –pg 55 93

Figure 2.9 – Putting the business back into IT – from Earl (1992) – pg 79 94

Figure 2.10 – IS Complexity Framework – Hackney et al. (2000) – pg 16 98

Figure 3.1 – Research Framework for Data Collection and Analysis 108

Figure 3.2 – Steps for Data Collection and Analysis 118

Table 4.1 Open Systems Architecture (OSA) revised "stages of growth" model – adapted from Sutherland & Galliers (1989) – pg 23 146

Table 4.2 – Strategy Objective Characteristics 154

Table 4.3 – Structure Objective Characteristics 155

Table 4.4 – Systems Objective Characteristics 157

Table 4.5 – Staff Objective Characteristics 159

Table 4.6 – Style Objective Characteristics 160

Table 4.7 – Skills Objective Characteristics 162

Table 4.8 – Superordinate Goals Objective Characteristics 164

Table 4.9 – Personal Computing Operating Systems Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites) 169

Table 4.10 – Mainframe Operating Systems Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites) 170

Table 4.11 – Databases Used by the Australian Government (% of local sites) 171

Table 5.1 Case Organisation Characteristics 183

Table 5.2 Factors Affecting Level of Agreement with Objective Literature NOW - by Organisation Number 188

Table 5.3 Factors Affecting Level of Agreement with Objective Literature FUTURE - by Organisation Number 188

Figure 5.1 The Disciplinary Model – adapted from Bunker & Dean (1997) – pg 4 214

Figure 5.2 – The Effect of Time With Regard to Object/Subject Reconciliation/Integration 216

Figure 6.1 – The McKinsey 7s Framework – originally proposed by Pascale & Athos (1981) (source Waterman et al. 1980 – pg 7 from Plant 2000 – pg 72) 223

Table 6.1 – Obvious and Emerging Contextual Factors – Organisation 1 229

Figure 6.2 – Perspectival ITS Management Model (Integration/Reconciliation of the Subject -Object) 233

Table 7.1 – Comparison of a sample of LAs and PSOs via the 4 conceptual frameworks – from Hancox & Hackney (2000) – pg 232 248

Table 7.2 – Objective Considerations for the Outsourcing of ITS (based on ACS 1997, Seddon 2001, Hancox & Hackney 2000, Kern & Willcocks 2000) 251

Table 7.3 – Differences Between Outsourcing Objective and Subjective Views 264