

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

The U.S.-Mexico War (1846–8) brought two centuries of dramatic territorial expansionism to a close, seemingly fulfilling America's Manifest Destiny. Or did it? As politicians schemed to annex new lands in Latin America and the Pacific, some Americans took expansionism into their own hands. Between 1848 and 1860, there was an epidemic of unsanctioned attacks by private American mercenaries (known as filibusters) throughout the Western Hemisphere. This book documents the potency of Manifest Destiny in the antebellum era and situates imperial lust in the context of social and economic transformations that were changing the meaning of manhood and womanhood in the United States. Easy victory over Mexico in 1848 led many American men to embrace both an aggressive vision of expansionism and an equally martial vision of manhood. Debates about the propriety of aggression abroad polarized the public at home, shaping antebellum presidential elections, foreign policies, gender relations, and, ultimately, the failure of sectional compromise before the Civil War.

Amy S. Greenberg is Associate Professor of History and Women's Studies at the Pennsylvania State University. She is also the author of *Cause for Alarm: The Volunteer Fire Department in the Nineteenth-Century City* (1998).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

AMY S. GREENBERG

The Pennsylvania State University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521600804

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Greenberg, Amy S., 1968–

Manifest manhood and the antebellum American empire / Amy S. Greenberg.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-84096-1 (hardback) – ISBN 0-521-60080-4 (pbk.)

1. United States – Territorial expansion. 2. Filibusters. 3. United States – History – 1849–1877. 4. Men – United States – History – 19th century. 5. Masculinity – United States – History – 19th century. I. Title.

E179.5.G79 2005

973.6–dc22 2004020453

ISBN 978-0-521-84096-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-60080-4 Paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2010

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For Rich and Jackson

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The reputations of the nineteenth century will one day be quoted, to prove its barbarism.

– Ralph Waldo Emerson, 1850

Time will decide whether they were pirates and cutthroats, or heroes and patriots.

– Cora Montgomery, 1851

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations Used in the Notes</i>	xv
Introduction	I
1 The “New Frontier” as Safety Valve: The Political and Social Context of Manifest Destiny, 1800–1860	18
<i>Enter the Filibusters</i>	27
<i>Political Repercussions and Responses in the Second Party System</i>	33
<i>Section, Class, and Race: The Horizontal Comradeship of Manifest Destiny</i>	40
<i>Filibustering as Seduction: Two Interpretations</i>	47
2 An American Central America: Boosters, Travelers, and the Persistence of Manifest Destiny	54
<i>Natural versus National Borders: Redrawing the Map</i>	59
<i>Manifest Destiny and the Traveler’s Encounter with Central America</i>	78
3 American Men Abroad: Sex and Violence in the Latin American Travelogue	88
<i>Race and Manifest Destiny</i>	91
<i>Looking at the Latin American Man</i>	96
<i>The Manly American</i>	106
<i>Looking at Latin American Women</i>	112
<i>The Irresistible American</i>	123
4 William Walker and the Regeneration of Martial Manhood	135
<i>Substance versus Trappings in the Construction of Manly Character</i>	139
<i>The Promise of Regeneration</i>	147
	vii

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contents

	<i>Restraint as a Virtue: Walker Condemned</i>	151
	<i>The Heroic Viking of Our Time: Walker Celebrated</i>	158
	<i>The Gray-Eyed Man Has Come</i>	165
5	The Irresistible Pirate: Narciso López and the Public Meeting	170
	<i>Martial Manhood Comes Home</i>	178
6	American Women Abroad	197
	<i>Manifest Domesticity in Latin America</i>	200
	<i>Removing White American Women from Latin America</i>	215
	<i>Female Filibusters? Lucy Holcombe and Cora Montgomery</i>	221
7	Manifest Destiny and Manly Missionaries: Expansionism in the Pacific	231
	<i>The Game Cock</i>	232
	<i>Health and Hula: Annexationists Consider Hawaii</i>	243
	<i>Missionary Work as (Anti) Expansionism: Restrained Manhood in Hawaii</i>	254
	<i>“Inevitable Consequences”: The Perry Expedition to Japan, 1852–1854</i>	261
	Conclusion: American Manhood and War, 1860 to the Present	269
	<i>Bibliography</i>	283
	<i>Index</i>	307

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Illustrations

0.1	<i>American Progress</i>	page 2
1.1	Virtuous Harry	24
1.2	<i>Flight of the Mexican Army</i>	27
1.3	A War President	35
1.4	The “Ostend Doctrine”	37
1.5	A Serviceable Garment	39
2.1	Map of the United States and Central America	72
3.1	Market Place, Acapulco	104
3.2	The Way They Wait for “The Steamer”	108
3.3	“And I took deliberate aim. . . .”	110
3.4	Indian Girl of Subtiaba	120
3.5	Mother of the Tigers	121
3.6	Nicaraguan Convent	126
3.7	Bathing and Washing Corn	130
3.8	Nicaraguan Meat Market	132
4.1	William Walker Etching	144
4.2	Retreat from Massaya	153
4.3	Filibusters Reposing after Battle	155
4.4	Walker Portrait	168
5.1	Buccaneers’ Rendezvous	176
5.2	Great Navel Blockade	182
5.3	Narciso López	184
5.4	The Place Where López Landed	186
6.1	Mary Jane Megquier and Family	199
6.2	The Way They Cross the Isthmus	210
6.3	Bloomers and Cigars	213
6.4	Entrance to a Coffee Estate in Cuba	217
7.1	The Hula-Hula	247

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Illustrations

7.2	The Hawaiian Man: 1772	250
7.3	The Hawaiian Man: 1852	251
7.4	Paddle Wheel Steamers and Sumo Wrestlers	266
8.1	U.S. Commercial and Geographical Relations, 1868	276

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Without the support of some very generous institutions and individuals, this project would never have gotten off the ground. At the Pennsylvania State University, the Department of History, the Institute for Arts and Humanities, and the Office for Research and Graduate Studies provided release time and research funds over the many years of this book's gestation. At a critical moment, the Richards Civil War Era Center at Penn State kindly bankrolled the services of a competent research assistant, Leah Vincent. The Huntington Library has been an enthusiastic supporter of my work, providing me with both Mellon and W. M. Keck fellowships. Thanks also to the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library at Yale for an Archibald Hanna, Jr., Fellowship. Librarians at the Huntington and Beinecke libraries, the Bancroft Library at the University of California at Berkeley, the Howard Tilton Memorial Library at Tulane University, the Hawaii State Archives Historical Records Branch, and the Library of Congress also deserve thanks for accommodating my ongoing and sometimes vague research demands. Eric Novotny at Penn State gets special acknowledgment for his library expertise and assistance over the course of many years.

A number of scholars have engaged with this project, and in the process have broadened my intellectual horizons, encouraged my ambition, and corrected a truly embarrassing number of factual and conceptual errors. Tyler Anbinder, Thomas Augst, Gail Bederman, Iver Bernstein, Patricia Cline Cohen, Bruce Dorsey, Richard Doyle, Alice Fahs, Gary Gallagher, the late William Gienapp, Paul Gilje, David Henkin, Nancy Isenberg, Philip Jenkins, Richard John, Patrick Kelly, Stephanie McCurry, Mark Neely, Jr., Adam Rome, Mary Ryan, Gregory Smits, and Amy Gilman Srebnick each read part or all of this manuscript and provided valuable feedback. Robert Lockhart was an enthusiastic booster of this project from an early date who helped convince me of the project's importance. Two generous colleagues who also are experts in fields closely related to this study, Anne C. Rose and Mrinilini Sinha, provided detailed comments on an early draft and went to

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

great lengths to save me from myself. I feel remarkably fortunate for their assistance.

To review a manuscript well takes a good deal of work, and to convince a stubborn writer to change her ways takes an equally notable degree of diplomacy. Three scholars in particular deserve special credit for their achievements in these areas. Alexis McCrossen encouraged this project from its earliest stages, read the entire first draft of this manuscript within two weeks of its completion, and provided a generous and smart critique of each and every aspect of the argument. Through her daily emails she has continued to shape this project in a profound manner. Without her encouragement, suggestions for improvement, and unflagging optimism this book might never have been written. Kristin Hoganson also put a great amount of time and energy into making this book stonger. She provided me with the kind of reader's report that every writer dreams of – engaged, generous, insightful, and tough where it needed to be. She not only noted flaws in the manuscript but suggested ways I might fix problems about which I hadn't even been aware. She has continued to provide answers to my many questions with an unbeatable combination of enthusiasm and expertise in the intersection of gender and foreign relations. Robert E. May gets a special note of thanks. Bob, the dean of filibustering studies, has aided and assisted this project for about six years. He has proofread lengthy sections, pointed out countless errors of fact and interpretation, and put up with my no doubt infuriatingly scatterbrained approach to research and writing with a warmth and generosity that I certainly haven't deserved. I also have been blessed by a conscientious group of anonymous readers. Each of them carefully evaluated the strengths and weaknesses of this project, and all have strengthened this book through their suggestions and criticism. Any remaining errors of fact or interpretation are, of course, my own.

Portions of this project have been presented as papers and talks at Penn State, the University of California at Irvine, the University of California at Santa Barbara, and the University of Texas at San Antonio, as well as at meetings of the American Studies Association, the Organization of American Historians, the Social Science History Association, the Society for Historians of the Early American Republic, and the Southern Historical Association. I thank audience members and fellow panelists for their challenging questions and helpful suggestions. I also must acknowledge the great Lew Bateman and the remarkably professional staff at Cambridge University Press.

My cheerful and engaged colleagues at Penn State have provided intellectual stimulation and a nurturing work environment. Special thanks to William Blair, Karen Ebeling, Lori Ginzberg, Deryck Holdsworth, Joan Landes, Sally McMurry, Mark Neely, Jr., William Pencak, Robert Proctor, A. Gregg Roeber, Guido Ruggiero, Londa Schiebinger, Susan Squier, and Nan Woodruff for their good humor and ongoing encouragement. Thanks also to the *Journal of the Early Republic* for allowing me to reprint portions of

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

my previously published article, “A Gray-eyed Man: Character, Appearance, and Filibustering” (vol. 20, winter 2000).

Family members know how much I rely on them. Jane Lee Greenberg and Kenneth S. Greenberg have provided me with an intellectual upbringing, encouragement for my work, and, most recently, a fine collection of rare nineteenth-century expansionist travelogues. My wonderful siblings, Mike and Ken Greenberg, Barbara Walker, and Suzann and Lowell Ball, can always be counted on to help me put my work into perspective. Alexis McCrossen, Kathy Newman, and Claudia Swan are closer to family members than to colleagues. I here gratefully acknowledge their hospitality and emotional support.

My greatest thanks, finally, goes to my partner in crime, Richard Doyle, without whom I would be far less imaginative in my scholarship and joyous in my life. Rich’s work ethic is a constant inspiration. As a model for the necessity of passion in both the public and private sphere, he is without parallel. This book is dedicated to him, and to our lovely son Jackson, whose curiosity and engagement with the world bring me pleasure every day.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations Used in the Notes

AH	Hawaii State Archives
AHR	<i>American Historical Review</i>
BL	Bancroft Library, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA
DBR	<i>De Bow's Review</i>
HL	Manuscripts Collection, Huntington Library, San Marino, CA
HNMM	<i>Harper's New Monthly Magazine</i>
JAH	<i>Journal of American History</i>
LOC	Library of Congress, Washington, DC
NEYR	<i>New Englander and Yale Review</i>
NYH	<i>New York Herald</i>
NYT	<i>New York Tribune</i>
PMM	<i>Putnam's Monthly Magazine</i>
SLM	<i>Southern Literary Messenger</i>
SQR	<i>Southern Quarterly Review</i>
USDR	<i>United States Magazine and Democratic Review</i>
WWP	Callender I. Fayssoux Collection of William Walker Papers, Latin American Collection, Howard Tilton Memorial Library, Tulane University, New Orleans, LA

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-60080-4 - Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire

Amy S. Greenberg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Manifest Manhood and the Antebellum American Empire