

Name **Dr Scott Lyall**

Title **Lecturer in Modern Literature**

Affiliation **Edinburgh Napier University**

Email **s.lyall@napier.ac.uk**

Essay title **Minor Modernisms: The Scottish Renaissance and the Translation of
German-language Modernism**

Minor Modernisms: The Scottish Renaissance and the Translation of German-language Modernism

Abstract:

Germany has been epitomised in the twentieth century as Britain's main rival and adversary. Yet Scottish modernists were influenced by Germany and German-language modernism to think more internationally about their nation and work, a cultural encounter that took place largely in and through translation. Willa and Edwin Muir, who in the early 1920s stayed at educational modernist A. S. Neill's experimental school in Germany, translated German-language modernists such as Kafka and Broch. Hugh MacDiarmid utilised translations of Nietzsche to inform his call for a renascent Scotland. Lewis Grassie Gibbon would write *Sunset Song* after reading Gustav Frenssen's regional novel *Jörn Uhl*. Behind this lies the contention that the breakup of world empires, such as the British and Austro-Hungarian, occasioned minor modernisms (to adapt Deleuze and Guattari) such as that in Scotland, and that translation was central to the emergence, impact, and transnationality of the Scottish renaissance movement.

Keywords: Scottish modernism; 'minor' literature; translation; Germany; Edwin Muir; Willa Muir; Hugh MacDiarmid; Lewis Grassie Gibbon; Nietzsche; Franz Kafka; Hermann Broch

Introduction

The term 'minor literature' is advanced most fully by Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari in *Kafka: Pour une littérature mineure* (1975). For Deleuze and Guattari, minor literature evolves from the breakdown of imperial centralisation, which produces linguistic deterritorialisation. Franz Kafka, a Czech Jew, wrote in German, but, according to Deleuze and Guattari, he did so in a manner that stretched the language to its limits, to 'take flight on a line of escape' from formal standardisation.¹ Working in the interwar period, Kafka's first German to English translators

were the Scots Willa and Edwin Muir. They too, like Kafka, emerged from the setting of a minor literature. As the collapse of the Habsburg Empire informed Kafka's contexts, so the Muirs's work, along with other Scottish modernists, the poet Hugh MacDiarmid, the novelist Lewis Grassie Gibbon, and the educationalist and writer A. S. Neill, was produced against the backdrop of the post-First-World-War decline of the British Empire. These authors were amongst those who fashioned the Scottish renaissance, a modernist movement seeking the Europeanisation of Scottish cultural forms, and they found in Germany and German-language modernism stimulus to imagination, national revival, and internationalism. As a minor modernism, Scottish modernism was especially indebted to works in translation as sources of inspiration, and German-language modernism played an important role in this regard.

The Scottish renaissance was an interwar movement in all of the arts, with literature as its focal point. The local and vernacular impulses of Scottish and other minor writing in the modernist era, what Robert Crawford calls 'provincial Modernism',² are at critical odds with what has been seen traditionally as the largely metropolitan geography of canonical modernism.³ In 1919 T. S. Eliot, worried that English precedence in Europe would be undermined by the assertion of cultural diversity in the constituent British nations, cast doubt on Scottish literature's existence, claiming in centrist vein that 'The basis for one literature is one language'.⁴ Actually, Scottish modernism, formed of different languages (English, Gaelic, and Scots) and by the influence of translated works, can be situated most productively in relation to other European modernisms in a period that witnessed the proliferation of minor modernisms. One of the 'principal aims' of the Scottish renaissance, announced in 'The Chapbook Programme' of *The Scottish Chapbook*, a little magazine launched and edited by MacDiarmid, which ran monthly from August 1922 until December 1923, was 'To bring Scottish Literature into closer touch with

current European tendencies in technique and ideation'.⁵ MacDiarmid's 'Chapbook Programme' was an early manifesto for Scottish modernism. Other goals included: 'To insist upon truer evaluations of the work of Scottish writers than are usually given in the present over-Anglicised condition of British literary journalism, and, in criticism, elucidate, apply, and develop the distinctively Scottish range of values'.⁶ For MacDiarmid, these particular objectives – challenging Anglicisation, promoting Scottish culture, and linking Scottish literature to European ideas – were markedly linked. As a self-consciously European movement, the influence and inspiration of Germany and German-language modernism was significant to the protagonists of Scottish modernism examined here, MacDiarmid, the Muirs, Gibbon, and Neill. What emerged from this cultural encounter for these Scottish writers was an explicit internationalism with manifold aims, such as energising Scottish literary culture through an injection of experimental Europeanism, and, especially for MacDiarmid, side-stepping the metropolitanism of London and Anglo-British culture. Vital, too, was the use of European standards and cultural practices to expose the perceived limitations and degeneration of Scottish and British life and letters in the period, and in some cases, such as the Muirs and Neill, this grew from the experience of living in Germany, for Modris Eksteins, 'the modernist nation *par excellence* of our [– the twentieth –] century'.⁷ Mostly, what was at stake was the modernisation of Scottish cultural life through recourse to German-language literary exemplars.⁸ The Scottish renaissance was decidedly a modernist European revival.

Definitions: Translation and the Minor

Two key terms need to be defined. Firstly, translation. Translation means here both textual and free translation, as well as forms of cultural interchange that are also enhanced by translation,

and will be examined solely from the Scottish perspective. Whether in self-imposed European exile or based in Scotland, the Scottish modernists discussed here translated their experiences of Germany and German-language cultures into their respective critiques of Scotland and Britain, as well as a renewed internationalism and creativity. Central to this was the translation of texts from German to English, engaged in most influentially by the Muirs; MacDiarmid's transformation of ideas from German thinkers he had read in translation, such as Friedrich Nietzsche, into a Scottish context; and key intertextual transcultural correspondences that emerged most fully in translation, such as that between Gibbon's *Sunset Song* and Gustav Frenssen's German regional novel *Jörn Uhl*. Significantly, the translation of German-language modernism in this Scottish context not only informs the Scottish renaissance, but also reconfigures our understanding of British-German cultural exchange away from a conflictual model typical of twentieth century political relations between the nations towards a more hospitable transnational encounter. Fredric Jameson has argued that modernist interwar texts are characterised formally by a kind of representational displacement, in which imperial competition masks colonial subjugation. This imperial rivalry obscures not only what Jameson calls the true 'axis of otherness' in the so-called Third World, but also what he does not point to: positive cultural exchanges between economically competing First World countries.⁹ Especially pertinent is the case of non-metropolitan nations of world empires such as Scotland, wedded to the economic centre, but culturally different and politically marginal. While Germany was coming to be seen as Britain's arch-enemy in the early twentieth century, Scottish writers gained significantly in inspiration from German-language modernist literatures.

The second term to consider is 'minor'. Deleuze and Guattari's concept of minor literature can be applied to important aspects of Scottish modernist experience. They argue that

the breakup of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and the Habsburg monarchy after the First World War contributed to the proliferation of ‘minor literature’, defined as ‘that which a minority constructs within a major language’.¹⁰ There are a range of different registers in the writers examined here: the Muirs wrote in English and translated mainly from German, most importantly Franz Kafka and the Austrian novelist Hermann Broch; MacDiarmid wrote in often dense Scots, while freely translating and reinterpreting German-language, and other, writers in his own work; Gibbon developed a Scoto-English dialect mimicking the lilt of Kincardineshire speech. While the contexts of Deleuze and Guattari’s idiosyncratic analysis of Kafka – the collapse of the Habsburg Empire and Kafka’s interest in Yiddish – are not directly germane to Scotland, Scottish modernism nevertheless illustrates Deleuze and Guattari’s contention that minor literature is political in content and characteristics ‘because national consciousness, uncertain or oppressed, necessarily exists by means of literature’.¹¹ MacDiarmid’s programme for the Scottish renaissance is almost certainly one of reterritorialisation for a nation long wedded to the British Empire and the multi-national British state. Yet Deleuze and Guattari would regard such reterritorialisation as reactionary, the radical nature of the minor existing for them only within the contexts of a major language. As Chana Kronfeld, David Lloyd, and others in the ‘postcolonial decade’ of the 1990s argued, this is problematic in evacuating minor, non-metropolitan literatures of their importance, difference, and specificity – significantly, Deleuze and Guattari use the singular ‘literature’ when discussing the minor.¹² Adapting their terms, but wary of their aims, I advocate a non-hierarchical pluralism of minor modernisms.

The Scottish renaissance movement is a minor modernism, that is, one whose participants, whatever their particular politics, – the Muirs and Gibbon did not share MacDiarmid’s explicit nationalism, for instance – are writing out of the experience of the

collapse of the centre, the fragmentation of totality, that unquestionably defines modernism *per se*. For minor modernisms, the waning of empire is particularly significant to this condition, something Deleuze and Guattari were acute enough to see. Whereas most major literatures have a native link to language, minor literature is deterritorialised, a factor Scots writing in English arguably shares with Austrian German. Where do Scotland and Austria fit culturally in wider British and German links and confrontations between the two world wars? Asking such a question implies a multifaceted view of modernism that not only modulates Jameson's stand-off of imperial powers but recognises diverse local, national, and cross-border constellations that can only be fully appreciated in their transnational significance through translation. Translation is necessary for the emergence of minor modernisms, and for modernisms to exist in relation and dialogue with each other. As such, the minor and translation are intimately linked. Examining a particular example of this association between the minor and translation, as we do here in the case of Scottish and German-language modernisms, can help us to better understand the international nature of modernism, but also to see the ways in which translation facilitated the revival of minor modernisms such as that in Scotland. Minor is not, in the present analysis, a term applied dismissively to the non-canonical; rather, modernism, with its roots in the crisis of the centre, *is* minor. Thinking of modernism in this way gives new meaning to Deleuze and Guattari's claim that 'There is nothing that is major or revolutionary except the minor'.¹³

Translating the Minor: Willa and Edwin Muir

Husband and wife Edwin and Willa Muir travelled extensively in Europe in the interwar period, living in Germany in the early 1920s. At Hellerau, just outside Dresden, the Muirs stayed with A. S. Neill. Born in Forfar, Scotland, in 1883, Neill was a radical educationalist and founder in 1924

of Summerhill in England, a school run by the pupils on self-determining principles. In 1921, disillusioned by what he perceived as the restrictions of British education, Neill helped to set up an *Internationale Schule*, an experimental school at Hellerau where Willa taught German during the Muirs's residency there. Neill claimed that 'Living in Germany gave me much that living at home could not give me. For one thing I lived for nearly three years in an atmosphere of rhythm and dance, of great opera and orchestral music' in what 'was the most exciting period of my life'.¹⁴ Neill's account of the founding and running of Hellerau is captured in the autobiographical fiction *A Dominie Abroad* (1923), but the book is really about Neill's comparative observations of Germany and England, by which, in the denationalised language of the time, Neill probably means Britain. Neill found the Germans lacking in a sense of humour, but he was impressed by the seriousness and internationalism of German theatre and newspapers in comparison to the parochialism and sensationalism of English art and news coverage: 'I suggest that Germany won the war. Her values to-day are to me better values than England's values'.¹⁵ Culture was central to life in Germany, where the nation's literary greats were accessible to the masses. Neill was struck by the fact that Goethe and Lessing could be bought at German railway stations, where one would not find Shakespeare or Shelley in England.¹⁶ While in his autobiography, written towards the end of his life, Neill says that 'My period in Hellerau gave me a *Weltanschauung* [...] and in a way it killed any tendency I had towards nationalism', in *A Dominie Abroad* he claims: 'We cannot be international unless we are first national. Why, I am much more of a Scot in Dresden than I am in Edinburgh, and for the first time in my life I think seriously of wearing a kilt'.¹⁷ For Neill, inspired by his experience of Germany to recover his sense of Scottishness, 'Internationalism and nationalism are not contradictory terms' but complementary factors indispensable to a broad-minded worldview.¹⁸

Internationalism characterised Edwin and Willa's experiences in Dresden and Hellerau from 1922 to 1923. Willa writes of Hellerau:

The atmosphere was genuinely international. No racial, political or national prejudices interfered with the many new friendships now formed. [...] No one country had a preponderance in numbers and each young student was met and treated as an individual person, not as a Finn or a Czech or a Belgian.¹⁹

Edwin was 'very glad' to have left Britain for the continent in 1922 and to escape 'the constant atmosphere of calamity and anxiety which there is in London and Glasgow'; in contrast, he found the Germans very cheerful and Germany 'the most clean, neat, orderly and efficient nation that one could imagine'.²⁰ While 'ideas were so scarce' in Glasgow, where he lived upon suffering dislocation from Orkney in his teens, Edwin describes living at Hellerau

in a climate of 'new ideas', [where we] looked forward to a 'new life' which would be brought about by the simple exercise of freedom, a freedom such as had never been formulated in any terms, since it too was new. We were, or thought we were, without 'prejudices'.²¹

Edwin started to write poetry during this time of 'mild enchantment' fostered by the German landscape and the reading of German poetry.²² This took him back to childhood memories of Orkney, a place he connected to Edenic visions. In 'Childhood' he is 'To his father's house below securely bound' and always within earshot of his mother's call, as 'In thought he saw the

still light on the sand, / The shallow water clear in tranquil air, / And walked through it in joy from strand to strand'.²³ This poetic reconnection to family, home, security, and natural simplicity, 'imaginative forms [...] which touched the ideas of innocence and reconciliation' evoking not merely Edwin's childhood but the beginning of *Life and Time*, was sparked by the atmosphere and community at Hellerau: 'My image of Eden was associated with these naturally good and charming people'.²⁴ Edwin's positive descriptions of Dresden and Hellerau suggest that it is no coincidence that his imagination awoke 'after a long sleep' while the Muirs were in Germany, returning to 'distant memories' of Orkney and stimulating him to write poetry.²⁵

Back in England in the late 1920s, after translating Kafka's *Das Schloss*,²⁶ Edwin worked on his second novel *The Three Brothers* (1931) while Willa was writing *Imagined Corners* (1931), a significant text of the Scottish movement and one that contemplates – as in their own distinctive key do Kafka's novels – what it means to live within, and try to escape from, the minor as a cultural and personal condition. Working solo under the pseudonym Agnes Neill Scott, a quintessentially Scottish version of the anonymous placeholder name A. N. Other, Willa was also at this time translating the German novelist and poet Hans Carossa. *Imagined Corners* is critical of Scotland, particularly the constriction of female identity in small-town provincial Scottish life, something Willa would also explore in her novel *Mrs Ritchie* (1933) and the cultural essay *Mrs Grundy in Scotland* (1936). *Imagined Corners* is set in the fictional town of Calderwick, a thinly-disguised depiction of Willa's Montrose birthplace on Scotland's northeast coast that was in the 1920s the centre of Scottish modernism. MacDiarmid lived and worked in the town for much of that time, writing most of his best poetry there. The Muirs, composer F. G. Scott, novelists Fionn MacColla, Compton Mackenzie, and Neil Gunn, sculptor and poet James Pittendrigh Macgillivray, poet Violet Jacob, sculptor William Lamb, and artist Edward Baird, all

had Montrose connections and congregated in the town during this period.²⁷ However, the Calderwick of *Imagined Corners* is far from being a cultural hub; in 1912, when the novel is set, it is a narrow, respectable, middle-class, and patriarchal town, ‘a dead-alive hole’, in which the young Elizabeth Ramsay feels trapped in her marriage to Hector Shand.²⁸

Elizabeth and Calderwick are awoken from their provincial slumber by the arrival from the continent of Hector’s sister, also named Elizabeth, who twenty years previously had escaped the town and its perceived limitations, the imagined corners of the title, to marry the German author Doktor Karl Mütze; on his death, she has returned to visit Calderwick: ‘To go back to Scotland was the right thing to do’, thinks Elise, as she has styled herself since living in Europe; ‘One should have a standard by which to measure one’s growth’.²⁹ Shand means shame or disgrace in German (*Schande*): Elise believes that by running away to marry and exiling herself on the continent she has disgraced herself in her family’s eyes. Yet it is her return to Calderwick that precipitates change, especially in the frustrated Elizabeth who ‘was looking for her other self’, and, on meeting Elise, ‘fell in love with her at first sight’.³⁰ Elizabeth does not understand herself fully, lives by nature, and believes in her body, love, and emotion. Elise, on the other hand, brings artfulness, intelligence, experience, and civilisation to Calderwick; she is, in stereotypical terms, the ‘masculine’ to Elizabeth’s ‘feminine’, yet by catalysing each other they transcend such traditional and restrictive gender binaries. As Elise comments, ‘You and I, Elizabeth, would make one damned fine woman between us’.³¹ Elise sees that Elizabeth must escape, and it is she who frees Elizabeth to envision a different style of life. While the mature Elise somewhat comes to terms with her roots in Calderwick, the novel ends with Elise and Elizabeth, two halves of one whole, running off together for continental Europe and a life of greater freedom. Elizabeth, hitherto exiled from her full potential, becomes more truly herself

through the influence of Elise, and it is Elise's liberating experience of Europe with her German husband that allows her to perceive the bourgeois limits and hypocrisies of provincial Scotland.

European cultural experience was vital to Willa and Edwin. Important contributors to the minor modernism of Scotland, they were also the key English translators of German-language modernism working in the interwar period. Willa was the better translator,³² but Edwin was very well versed in German literature. Ritchie Robertson observes that Edwin's 'knowledge of German literature was at least as good as Lawrence's and better than any other twentieth-century British writer except Auden'.³³ Hölderlin was a key influence.³⁴ In the narrative poem 'Hölderlin's Journey', Edwin imagines the poet 'Dragging in pain a broken mind / And giving thanks to God and men'.³⁵ He was especially struck by Hölderlin's *Patmos*, which begins: 'Near is / And difficult to grasp, the God'. (*Nah ist / Und schwer zu fassen der Gott*).³⁶ In an essay on *Patmos*, Edwin says that 'while Wordsworth found God in nature, Hölderlin found Him in history, in time'.³⁷ This focus on temporality as a painful exile from the eternal was a key thematic concern of Edwin's own poetry. He planned in the mid-1930s to translate Hölderlin with Stephen Spender, but the project was abandoned due to Edwin's less than consummate German and Hölderlin's opacity when rendered into English.³⁸ The increasingly broken syntax of Hölderlin's poetry as his mental state collapsed – 'His utterance is like that of a man accounting to himself for things which he cannot tell to others', according to Edwin³⁹ – illustrates not only the visionary strain of a work such as *Patmos*, but an untranslatable proto-modernist aesthetic inhabited by what one critic calls 'trans-rational soul codes'.⁴⁰ Michael Hamburger draws parallels between Hölderlin's late work and Symbolism, Imagism, Surrealism, and Pound's *Cantos*.⁴¹ Edwin was reading the Romantic Hölderlin as 'a contemporary figure',⁴²

a point confirmed by Muir in 1956 when he called Hölderlin ‘the great modern representative figure’, particularly during ‘his half-mad prophetic phase’.⁴³

Edwin quickly recognised the importance of German-language modernism, while displaying considerable scepticism as to the merits of much English-language modernism.⁴⁴ MacDiarmid said of Edwin in 1925 that he ‘is known in Germany [...] as a thoroughly qualified international interpreter of German literature’, as well as being ‘a Pan-European intervening in the world-debate on its highest plane’.⁴⁵ Edwin early on saw the significance of Rainer Maria Rilke, although he remained ambivalent about his poetry,⁴⁶ and he consistently championed Broch and Kafka, whom he and Willa were the first to translate into English. Willa and Edwin translated many writers from German into English from 1921 to 1940, when their translation work dried up due to the war. Leaving aside Kafka and Broch, listing some of those they translated – Gerhart Hauptmann, Lion Feuchtwanger, Ernst Glaeser, Ludwig Renn, E. A. Rheinhardt, Kurt Heuser, Ernst Lothar, Sholem Asch, Heinrich Mann, Erik von Kuehnelt-Leddihn, Robert Neumann, Zsolt Harsányi, Carl Jacob Burckhardt – confirms Edwin’s comment that he and Willa were a ‘translation factory’.⁴⁷

In *On Translation* (1959), Edwin and Willa each give their thoughts on ‘Translating from the German’. While for Edwin ‘Translation is obviously a difficult art’, it is decidedly ‘a secondary art, and at best can strive for but never reach a final perfection’.⁴⁸ He believes verse translations require greater creative freedom, but that ‘A prose translation rendered back into its own language should be quite recognizable as a cousin of its original’.⁴⁹ Willa’s comments on translation are altogether more negative than Edwin’s. For her translation is ‘like breaking stones’, which may imply her greater work load as well as confirming that the Muirs took up translating to earn a living.⁵⁰ She goes on to link the German language to perceived national

character – ‘I have the feeling that the shape of the German language affects the thought of those who use it and disposes them to overvalue authoritative statement, will power, and purposive drive’ – before suggesting that German somehow determined the barbarism and lust for imperial power of National Socialism:

A language which emphasizes control and rigid subordination must tend to shape what we call *Macht-Menschen* [literally: power people]. The drive, the straight purposive drive, of Latin, for instance, is remarkably like the straight purposive drive of the Roman roads. One might hazard a guess that from the use of *ut* with the subjunctive one could deduce the Roman Empire. Could one then deduce Hitler’s Reich from the less ruthless shape of the German sentence? I think one could, and I think that is why I have come to dislike it.⁵¹

This reflects Elise’s notion in the interwar novel *Imagined Corners* that ‘a nation must be held guilty of its language’.⁵² Willa’s thoughts are farfetched, but she was clearly keen to distance herself from Germany after the Second World War. That the Muirs’s translation work, predominantly German to English, was, as Sherry Simon puts it, ‘closely tied to their commitment to “Europeanize” the British world of letters’ must have brought a sense of disillusionment after the experience of Nazism and the war, expressed here most severely by Willa.⁵³ Yet in one aspect of German-language translation Willa was more sanguine: that of Austrian German. According to her, ‘Austrians use the German language quite differently [to Germans]. They write a less rigid, less clotted, more supple German which I, for one, find much easier to translate into good English, and I am not prejudiced against it’.⁵⁴ This might seem ironic

given Hitler's Austrian origins. But, notably, of the writers Willa and Edwin translated together, several were Austrian or from Austria-Hungary, such as Broch, Kuehnelt-Leddihn, Lothar, Rheinhardt, and Neumann. Indeed, P. H. Gaskill notes an 'Austrian bias' to Edwin's reading in the 1920s, with enthusiasms including Hugo von Hofmannsthal, Arthur Schnitzler, Georg Trakl, and Richard Beer-Hofmann.⁵⁵

The two most significant writers to be translated by the Muirs were Kafka, like Rilke, born in Prague, then part of the Austro-Hungarian Empire, and Broch, who was born into a Viennese Jewish family, and who came to stay with the Muirs in St Andrews in 1938 after fleeing the *Anschluss*. Attentive to the metaphysical and dream-like aspects of his work,⁵⁶ the Muirs have received criticism for their translations of Kafka.⁵⁷ In contrast, Broch, for Edwin 'the greatest man there is',⁵⁸ thought the Muirs's 1932 translation of *The Sleepwalkers* 'magnificent';⁵⁹ George Steiner would comment that the Muirs 'excelled even their own standards' with this work.⁶⁰ Broch would in turn translate Edwin's work.⁶¹ Ritchie Robertson calls Broch's *The Sleepwalkers* and Robert Musil's *The Man Without Qualities* – another Austrian epic novel the Muirs considered translating⁶² – 'novels of totality', and states that 'Broch developed the "polyhistorischer Roman" (polymathic novel)', blending fiction and philosophical reflection, as in 'The Disintegration of Values' section in *Huguenau*, the third part of *The Sleepwalkers*.⁶³ Set over the period 1888 to 1918, *The Sleepwalkers* is an 'historical novel', summarised by Hannah Arendt as 'the story of the Romantic who believes in honor, of the Anarchist who seeks a new faith, and of the Realist who destroys them both'.⁶⁴ 'The Disintegration of Values' can be read in traditional moral or radical Nietzschean terms, as 'an extended metaphor of translation [...] between classic values and modern chaos', according to Steiner.⁶⁵ Edwin Muir, equating the 'dissociation' of modern sensibility with the Industrial

Revolution, refers to *The Sleepwalkers* and Broch's idea of 'the breakdown of the medieval synthesis', a fragmentation pertinent to modernist crisis.⁶⁶

The totality under threat of loss can also be read, however, in more recent historico-political terms: the liminal disorder after the *ancien régime* falls. As Stephen D. Dowden argues, for all that 'Broch believed the physical world to be the broken reflection of the greater supersensible realm of Platonic ideas that exist beyond time and death', an idea reflective of Edwin's religious view of Kafka's work,⁶⁷ theories of history and temporality replace the divine in modernist work such as Broch's novel.⁶⁸ *The Sleepwalkers*, published as *Die Schlafwandler* in 1931, is ostensibly a German novel, with the disintegration of values that finds its personification in the figure of Huguenau, the murderous 'triumph of the irrational', leading ultimately to the failed empire of the Third Reich.⁶⁹ Even so, writing the novel in Vienna between 1928 and 1931, Broch's more immediate national context, following the First World War and the loss of the Austrian Empire, was the crisis of Austrian finance, and the short-lived Austrian Republic, soon-to-be annexed by Hitler. Marjorie Perloff terms what emerges from this period 'Austro-Modernism'.⁷⁰ For Deleuze and Guattari, minor literature is characterised by 'the deterritorialization of language', as well as 'the connection of the individual to a political immediacy'.⁷¹ This is encouraged by the collapse of empire, which 'increases the crisis, accentuates everywhere movements of deterritorialization, and invites all sorts of complex reterritorializations', a situation defining the modernist condition.⁷² The collapse of political totality, of historical empires, such as the Austro-Hungarian, is central to European modernism and to the experience of 'becoming-minor', an experience that must ever be translated.⁷³

The Muirs's translation work played a vital part in European modernism, and in the international recognition of figures such as Kafka and Broch. Their attraction to writing

emerging from the Austro-Hungarian Empire can be connected to the Muirs's own cultural contexts. In the twentieth century, as Kohl and Robertson argue, 'Austrian literature was caught up in political tensions between the assertion of Austrian difference and potential assimilation to Germany. Austria has repeatedly had to reconfigure its identity since the loss of the Austro-Hungarian Empire in 1918'.⁷⁴ This is historically comparable to Scotland's position in a United Kingdom dominated by Anglocentric cultural and political values, yet, as T. M. Devine puts it, 'at the very cutting edge of British global expansion' as partners with England in the British Empire.⁷⁵ The post-Second-World-War period saw the real haemorrhaging of British imperial control, but decentralisation began following the Great War. The 1920s witnessed the establishment of the Irish Free State (1922) after the 1916 Easter Rising, the formal independence of Egypt (1922), and the founding of nationalist parties in Wales (Plaid Cymru, 1925) and Scotland (National Party of Scotland, 1928). In Scotland the modernist renaissance informed political agitation and, as a minor movement, was a cultural manifestation of British imperial decline. In the use of Scots in the early poetry of MacDiarmid, and the mythic terrain of Neil Gunn's novels, we see, in Deleuze and Guattari's terms, a bid for cultural and linguistic reterritorialisation. Dana Polan, English translator of Deleuze and Guattari's *Kafka*, used the Muirs's Kafka translations, with their 'territorializing voice' and 'bleak univocality', as an antagonistic example of what Deleuze and Guattari oppose in their theory of deterritorialisation.⁷⁶ Still, Willa claimed that she and Edwin 'loved the sinuous flexibility of Kafka's style – very unlike classical German',⁷⁷ while, for Edwin, Kafka's dialogue, comparable to Joyce, was 'untranslatable'.⁷⁸ Edwin argues in *Scott and Scotland* (1936) that, since the Reformation, 'Scottish literature has been a literature without a language'.⁷⁹ This identifies the deterritorialised nature of Scotland's minor status. However, contra to MacDiarmid's nationalist

programme, and somewhat under Eliot's influence, Edwin's solution was union with the English tradition. The Muirs's respective backgrounds – Orcadian Edwin and Willa's Shetlandic heritage⁸⁰ – and their experience of living in Europe complicate their position in relation to Scotland and MacDiarmid's nationalism, and may have made them even more sensitive to the case for translation of the minor literature arising from the former Austro-Hungary.

'To be yersel's': Hugh MacDiarmid's Nietzschean Renaissance

MacDiarmid was a nationalist, but he believed a national revival required the cultural influence of other nations. The Russian Dostoevsky, '*This Christ o' the neist thoosand years*', is one of the principal agents of internationalisation in *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle* (1926), but German-language work is also central.⁸¹ The poem is an extended engagement with the thought of Nietzsche, an enduring influence on MacDiarmid. The Scot read Nietzsche through the work of A. R. Orage, in volumes such as Orage's *Nietzsche in Outline and Aphorism* (1907), and Orage's journal *The New Age*, to which Edwin Muir and MacDiarmid contributed. Throughout 1924, MacDiarmid wrote a weekly column under the German title 'Mannigfaltig' for *The New Age*, expounding upon diverse avant-garde developments in world literature. Nietzsche was an early influence on Edwin too, and he wrote his first book, *We Moderns* (1918), after studying Nietzsche in English translations edited by Oscar Levy.⁸² Edwin would later reject Nietzsche, calling the pseudonymous *We Moderns* 'immature'.⁸³ Yet in Nietzschean aphorisms such as 'all artists are unconsciously aristocratic', Edwin reflected not only a growing sense of the autonomous power of art, but the widening intellectual and cultural influence of Nietzsche's work in the early modernist period.⁸⁴ Nietzsche's thought remained essential to MacDiarmid's bid in the 1920s for Scottish modernity within a European context. Nietzsche's philosophy of

individual self-realisation is appropriated by MacDiarmid to mean also national self-realisation, national *becoming*. Addressing his fellow Scots, and doing so significantly in Scots, the drunk man declares:

And let the lesson be – to be yersel’s,
Ye needna fash gin it’s to be ocht else. [trouble yourself]
To be yersel’s – and to mak’ that worth bein’.
Nae harder job to mortals has been gi’en.⁸⁵

The drunk man’s advice may seem somewhat inconsistent, as for large parts of the poem he excoriates Scotland for its sterility: Scotland is the epitome of Eliot’s waste land, a ‘*barren fig*’ in which ‘*Sic transit Gloria Scotiae*’, all the glories of Scotland have passed away, leaving a timid, provincial culture.⁸⁶ Yet to be yourself is a call for Scots to re-find their true characteristics that, for MacDiarmid, had been repressed in the Anglo-British dispensation of the early twentieth century.

MacDiarmid saw the hope of ‘a new order’ in Oswald Spengler’s *Der Untergang des Abendlandes*,⁸⁷ and he would exploit Spenglerian ideas in impenetrable German passages from *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*:

Type o’ the Wissenschaftsfeindlichkeit, [hostility to scientific knowledge]
Begriffsmüdigkeit that has gar’t [weariness with ideas]
Men try Morphologies der Weltgeschichte, [morphologies of world history]
And mad Expressionismus syne in Art.⁸⁸ [Expressionism]

‘Morphologies of world history’ shows MacDiarmid’s awareness of *Decline of the West* – at least from Carl Dyrssen’s *Bergson Und Die Deutsche Romantik* (1922), the source of these terms.⁸⁹ Influenced by Nietzsche,⁹⁰ Spengler was popular among modernists. But while for many Spengler’s idea that the current Faustian phase of Western civilisation was ending was a cause of anxiety, MacDiarmid found in Spengler’s cyclical history a means to suggest a new beginning for Scottish culture once it was released from the linearity of Whig progressivism and British imperial universalism. A Scottish renaissance implies national rebirth in the wake of British imperial decline. MacDiarmid advocated that ‘the slogan of a Scottish literary revival must be the Nietzschean “Become what you are”’.⁹¹

Not everyone saw Nietzsche as a liberator. William Archer, Scottish critic, playwright, and translator of Ibsen, and who joined the British War Propaganda Bureau in 1914, wrote *Fighting a Philosophy* at the beginning of the First World War to warn against Nietzsche’s increasingly fashionable thought, which Archer connected with German imperial militarism.⁹² In the 1920s MacDiarmid claimed Archer’s support for his little magazine *The Scottish Nation*,⁹³ and cited him as one of the few true moderns in W. M. Parker’s *Modern Scots Writers*.⁹⁴ Yet in the 1932 essay ‘Nietzsche in Scotland’, MacDiarmid claimed not to ‘know any Scotsman of intellectual consequence or creative power who is not immeasurably indebted to Nietzsche’.⁹⁵ While he mentions the Scot Thomas Common as ‘one of the most important forerunners of all that is valuable in the new Scottish Literary Movement’ for his translations of Nietzsche,⁹⁶ MacDiarmid was beholden to Jethro Bithell’s *Contemporary German Poetry* (1909) for his knowledge of the likes of Rilke, Carl Spitteler, and German Expressionist poet Else Lasker-Schüler.⁹⁷ MacDiarmid cites Nietzsche’s hostile reception in certain Scottish cultural outlets as

evidence of Scotland's over-Anglicisation, while comparing in 'Scotland and Europe' (1934) 'the relative Europeanism of the Scottish as against the insularity and extra-European Imperialism of the English'.⁹⁸ Nietzsche and Europe are used by MacDiarmid to attack the English *and* the Scots. The translation work of Scott Moncrieff (Proust's *Remembrance of Things Past*), the Muirs, Common, and John Linton (Rilke's *The Notebooks of Malte Laurids Brigge*) MacDiarmid regards as illustrating the outstanding Scottish 'knowledge of *weltliteratur*'.⁹⁹

Rilke, who 'Made a single reality [...] / O' his love and pity and fear', is cast as the type of the perfect poet in MacDiarmid's 'The Seamless Garment'.¹⁰⁰ In a 1934 essay on the poet, he deploys a metaphor of deterritorialisation to call Rilke 'a lone scout far away in No Man's Land, whither willy-nilly mankind must follow him, or abandon the extension of human consciousness'.¹⁰¹ MacDiarmid points to Rilke's 'untranslatable usage of German', which, he argues, is 'in line with advanced literary artists in all European languages today'.¹⁰² What MacDiarmid discerns as the untranslatability of modernism-as-minor is also central to the dense Scots lexis of his own poetry in the mid-1920s, in collections such as *Sangschaw* and *Penny Wheep*, which Roderick Watson calls the 'Expressionist lyrics'.¹⁰³ MacDiarmid revelled in the untranslatable nature of his Scots lyrics – 'No words exist for them in English' – which, by way of Nietzsche and Spengler, he saw as emerging from the repressed Dionysian national unconscious.¹⁰⁴ His work exemplifies the markedly national quality of minor modernisms arising from the fracturing of centralising imperial cultures. Not only is his own Scots language usage hard for non-Scots and many Scots to understand, in *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle* he freely translates difficult, avant-garde, and often similarly minor European writers, such as Lasker-Schüler, into his own language. This exposes the gaps and explores the similarities between

cultures, but is also, as William Calin maintains, ‘a focus in Scotland for European modernity’.¹⁰⁵

Translating German Regionalism: Lewis Grassie Gibbon’s *Sunset Song*

MacDiarmid’s Nietzscheanism drove his Europhile Scots modernism, while also sharpening his tendency to totalitarian ‘Great Man’ politics of left and right.¹⁰⁶ Equating it with fascist racial exclusivity, Lewis Grassie Gibbon opposed the nationalism of the Scottish renaissance,¹⁰⁷ while in *A Scots Quair*, a great work of European modernism, charting the political and cultural adversities Scotland met with in the early twentieth century, such as the First World War and the Depression. *Sunset Song* (1932), the first novel in the Quair trilogy, faces the linguistic challenge of MacDiarmid’s Scots revolution by deploying a hybrid language that is both native in tone and German in influence.

Sunset Song was stimulated in its regionalism and depiction of the rural peasantry by Gustav Frenssen’s *Jörn Uhl*, a *Heimatroman*, or regional novel, first published in German in 1902. The resemblance is so strong that in 1962 the Scottish writer Oliver Brown accused the deceased Gibbon of plagiarism: ‘*Jorn* [sic] *Uhl* as the German *Sunset Song* and *Sunset Song* as the Scottish *Jorn Uhl*’ are ‘inextricably locked in a fantastic bilingual jigsaw puzzle’.¹⁰⁸ Gibbon did not have enough competence in German to read the original, but an English translation by F. S. Delmer was published in 1905, which Gibbon ‘almost certainly used’.¹⁰⁹ While there are distinct similarities in theme and plot between *Sunset Song* and *Jörn Uhl* – the importance of the land and the seasons to the peasant farmers, the emotional growth of the main character, the intrusion of war on the community – the most startling correspondence is in language use.

Gibbon's novel skilfully employs a Scots-English lexicon and the rhythms of the language of Scotland's rural northeast, a method he explains in the prefatory note to *Sunset Song*:

If the great Dutch language disappeared from literary usage and a Dutchman wrote in German a story of the Lekside peasants, one may hazard he would ask and receive a certain latitude and forbearance in his usage of German. He might import into his pages some score or so untranslatable words and idioms – untranslatable except in their context and setting; he might mould in some fashion his German to the rhythms and cadence of the kindred speech that his peasants speak. Beyond that, in fairness to his hosts, he hardly could go: to seek effect by a spray of apostrophes would be both impertinence and mis-translation.

The courtesy that the hypothetical Dutchman might receive from German a Scot may invoke from the great English tongue.¹¹⁰

Sunset Song not only concerns the death of the peasant community, 'the last of the Old Scots folk', killed in the First World War, it is also about the demise of their culture and language.¹¹¹ When Chris Guthrie sings the traditional lament 'The Flowers of the Forest' at her wedding, she is not only portending the death of her husband and other local farmers in the war, she is also, by singing in Scots, memorialising the very language that is in retreat. That Chris is caught between two possible selves, 'two Chrisses', with the Scottish Chris being drawn in her essential self to 'the Scottish land and skies' while the superficially English Chris is more pragmatically immersed in her school studies and the hope of becoming a teacher, is indicative of gender, social, and existential divisions following from the historical, political, and cultural

trajectories taken by Scotland within the wider polity of Great Britain and the British Empire.¹¹² These divisions are discerned most acutely through language: while Scots is associated with community and egalitarianism, Standard English, often perceived as snobbish, is a tool of individual advancement and social progress. As Douglas Young points out, this linguistic duality is also present in *Jörn Uhl*: ‘the Holstein peasants speak in Low German in their everyday lives, but look on High German as the polite or correct language’.¹¹³ Significantly, the translator of the first English edition of *Jörn Uhl* writes:

Although the Low German dialect is used very sparsely in the original, the Doric note being chiefly felt in the general style [...] the translator has nevertheless taken the liberty of employing Scotch expressions here and there to suggest the provincial and rustic atmosphere of the story.¹¹⁴

It is the Doric – the language of peasant Scots of the northeast, and also a central plank of the Scottish renaissance – that is used in the English translation of *Jörn Uhl* to suggest rural German speech. Gibbon, having learned from MacDiarmid’s failure to reach a wide readership with his Scots work, uses in *Sunset Song* a hybridised Scoto-English to translate Scots to a broader audience than would ordinarily understand the language. *Sunset Song* is, amongst other themes, about the disappearance of Scots. Yet, ironically, in order to highlight the deteriorating position of the language, Gibbon draws from an English translation of a German novel, one which itself uses Scots because that language is more alive to class and regional nuances than Standard English.

The oddness of this is borne out in a scene from the English translation of *Jörn Uhl* in which the schoolboy Jörn is translating a passage from English:

So we find Jörn Uhl, with his short-cropped, stiff, fair hair, sitting by old Dominie Peters on the sofa. His deep-set eyes peered like foxes from their holes into the English book in front of him, eagerly devouring the wisdom they found there. For it was Dominie Peters's creed that an acquaintance with English is the stepping-stone to all knowledge and to every high distinction in life.¹¹⁵

Jörn is studying English in order to improve himself, just as Standard English is used in school and employed by certain characters for similar reasons in *Sunset Song*. The Scots word for teacher, 'dominie', is used, which, along with other Scots words and phrases throughout the novel, such as 'yon' (that), 'hold your whist!' (be quiet), and 'laddie' (boy), gives the text the air of a Scottish kailyard novel.¹¹⁶ Jörn is, of course, German, but the language of translation suggests he is Scottish. This illustrates some of the linguistic similarities between Scots and German, sympathies that emerge in other ways in *Sunset Song*, as many of the more politically independent and astute characters doubt the truth of the anti-German propaganda disseminated by Whitehall during the First World War.¹¹⁷ Through the English translation, Frenssen's German regional novel influenced a text central to the minor modernism of Scotland.

The comparison between these novels, and the other work examined here, highlights the ways in which textual translation played a central part in the revival of local, regional, and minor national cultures in the modernist period. Delmer describes *Jörn Uhl* as Germany's greatest 'claim to autochthonous art in her modern literature',¹¹⁸ while, according to Warren Washburn

Florer, introducing the 1914 American edition of the novel, ‘many consider Frenssen to be the typical representative of German life’.¹¹⁹ Equally, *Sunset Song* is often viewed as being emblematically Scottish, and has been twice voted the nation’s favourite novel.¹²⁰ Yet Delmer’s translation of *Jörn Uhl*, with its Scots vernacular usages and kailyard-like regional resonances, and Gibbon’s *Sunset Song*, with its cultural translation of Delmer’s textual translation, illustrate the intertextual and international nature of modernism, along with the awareness that translation brings to light common human experiences across borders.

Minor modernisms, such as that emerging from Scotland, signalled the beginning of the end of the old imperial order in early twentieth century Europe. The influence of German-language modernism on Scottish modernism illustrates that national renaissance can only be imagined through the translated experience of internationalism and the internationalist act of translation.

Notes

¹ Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature*, trans. by Dana Polan (Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1986), p. 26.

² Robert Crawford, *Devolving English Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992), pp. 216-70.

³ See *Scottish and International Modernisms: Relationships and Reconfigurations*, ed. by Emma Dymock and Margery Palmer McCulloch (Glasgow: ASLS, 2011).

⁴ T. S. Eliot, ‘Was There a Scottish Literature?’, *The Athenaeum*, 1 August 1919, pp. 680-1.

⁵ ‘The Chapbook Programme’, in *Modernism and Nationalism: Literature and Society in Scotland, 1918–1939. Source Documents for the Scottish Renaissance*, ed. by Margery Palmer McCulloch (Glasgow: ASLS, 2004), p. xii.

⁶ ‘The Chapbook Programme’, p. xii.

⁷ Modris Eksteins, *Rites of Spring: The Great War and the Birth of the Modern Age* (Boston and New York: Mariner Books, 2000), p. xvi.

⁸ On similar themes relating English modernism and Germany, see Petra Rau, *English Modernism, National Identity and the Germans, 1890–1950* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009).

⁹ Fredric Jameson, *Nationalism, Colonialism and Literature: Modernism and Imperialism*. A Field Day Pamphlet, Number 14 (Derry: Field Day Theatre Company Limited, 1988), p. 9.

¹⁰ *Kafka*, p. 16.

¹¹ *Kafka*, p. 16.

¹² Chana Kronfeld, *On the Margins of Modernism: Decentering Literary Dynamics* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press, 1996), pp. 1-20; David Lloyd, *Nationalism and Minor Literature: James Clarence Mangan and the Emergence of Irish Cultural Nationalism* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press, 1992); ‘postcolonial decade’ is from Elleke Boehmer and Alex Tickell, ‘The 1990s: An Increasingly Postcolonial Decade’, *Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, 50.3 (2014), 315-52.

¹³ *Kafka*, p. 26.

¹⁴ A. S. Neill, ‘Neill! Neill! Orange Peel!’: *A Personal View of Ninety Years* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1973), p. 116. The German life Neill describes is similar to that of Gudrun in Lawrence’s *Women in Love* (1920): ‘At least, in Dresden, one will have one’s back to it all. And there will be amusing things to do. It will be amusing to go to these eurythmic displays, and the German opera, the German theatre. It *will* be amusing to take part in German Bohemian life.’ D. H. Lawrence, *Women in Love* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 2000), p. 464 (emphasis in original).

¹⁵ A. S. Neill, *A Dominion Abroad* (London: Herbert Jenkins, 1923), p. 58.

-
- ¹⁶ *A Dominie Abroad*, p. 57.
- ¹⁷ *A Dominie Abroad*, p. 67.
- ¹⁸ *A Dominie Abroad*, p. 69.
- ¹⁹ Willa Muir, *Belonging: A Memoir* (London: The Hogarth Press, 1968), pp. 74-5.
- ²⁰ Edwin Muir, letter to Elizabeth and George Thorburn, 8 February 1922, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, ed. by P. H. Butter (London: The Hogarth Press, 1974), pp. 22, 23.
- ²¹ Edwin Muir, *An Autobiography* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1993), pp. 194-5.
- ²² *An Autobiography*, p. 197.
- ²³ Edwin Muir, *Collected Poems* (London: Faber and Faber, 1984), p. 19.
- ²⁴ *An Autobiography*, p. 196.
- ²⁵ *An Autobiography*, pp. 196, 203.
- ²⁶ First published in German in 1926, the Muirs's English translation of *The Castle* appeared in 1930. Scottish artist James Nigel McIsaac would paint Edinburgh Castle as *Das Schloss (The Castle)*, 1936, after reading the Muirs's translation; he would subsequently paint Willa's portrait.
- ²⁷ See Tom Normand, *The Modern Scot: Modernism and Nationalism in Scottish Art, 1928–1955* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2000), and Scott Lyall, *Hugh MacDiarmid's Poetry and Politics of Place: Imagining a Scottish Republic* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006), pp. 81-115.
- ²⁸ Willa Muir, *Imagined Corners*, in *Imagined Selves*, ed. by Kirsty Allen (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1996), p. 225.
- ²⁹ *Imagined Corners*, p. 147.
- ³⁰ *Imagined Corners*, p. 165.
- ³¹ *Imagined Corners*, p. 246.

-
- ³² See the section on Willa Muir in Michelle Woods, *Kafka Translated: How Translators Have Shaped Our Reading of Kafka* (New York and London: Bloomsbury, 2014), pp. 44-78.
- ³³ Ritchie Robertson, 'Edwin Muir as European Poet', in *Edwin Muir: Centenary Assessments*, ed. by C. J. M. MacLachlan and D. S. Robb (Aberdeen: ASLS, 1990), pp. 102-18 (p. 104).
- ³⁴ See Margery McCulloch, *Edwin Muir: Poet, Critic and Novelist* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1993), p. ix.
- ³⁵ Edwin Muir, *Collected Poems*, p. 68.
- ³⁶ Friedrich Hölderlin, *Patmos*, in *Selected Poems and Fragments*, trans. by Michael Hamburger (London: Penguin, 1998), p. 231.
- ³⁷ Edwin Muir, 'Hölderlin's Patmos', in *Essays on Literature and Society*, Enlarged and Revised Edition (London: Hogarth Press, 1965), pp. 92-103 (p. 93).
- ³⁸ 'I have read the prophetic poems again and again for the last twelve years and I have got used to them in German, but when I try to catch them in English they seem to melt away'. Letter to Stephen Spender, 16 October 1935, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 85.
- ³⁹ *Essays on Literature and Society*, p. 94.
- ⁴⁰ John Bramble, *Modernism and the Occult* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), p. 53.
- ⁴¹ Michael Hamburger, Hölderlin, *Selected Poems and Fragments*, pp. xxxii, xxxiii.
- ⁴² P. H. Gaskill, 'Edwin Muir as Critic of Hölderlin', *Forum for Modern Language Studies*, Vol. 14, No. 4 (Oct., 1978), 345-64 (p. 346).
- ⁴³ Letter to Janet Adam Smith, 26 September 1956, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, pp. 187-8.
- ⁴⁴ See in particular Edwin Muir, *Transition: Essays on Contemporary Literature* (London: The Hogarth Press, 1926).

⁴⁵ Hugh MacDiarmid, 'Edwin Muir', in *Contemporary Scottish Studies*, ed. by Alan Riach (Manchester: Carcanet, 1995), p. 93.

⁴⁶ 'Rilke's poetry I really don't much care for, subtle and supremely skilful as it is'. Letter to Stephen Hudson, 8 July 1929, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 67.

⁴⁷ *An Autobiography*, p. 217.

⁴⁸ Edwin Muir and Willa Muir, 'Translating from the German', in *On Translation*, ed. by Reuben A. Brower (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1959), p. 93.

⁴⁹ Edwin Muir, 'Translating from the German', p. 94.

⁵⁰ Willa Muir, 'Translating from the German', p. 94.

⁵¹ Willa Muir, 'Translating from the German', p. 95.

⁵² *Imagined Corners*, p. 169.

⁵³ Sherry Simon, *Gender in Translation: Cultural Identity and the Politics of Transmission* (London: Routledge, 1996), p. 77.

⁵⁴ Willa Muir, 'Translating from the German', p. 96.

⁵⁵ Gaskill, 'Edwin Muir as Critic of Hölderlin', p. 348.

⁵⁶ See *Belonging*, p. 150.

⁵⁷ See George Steiner, 'Introduction', Franz Kafka, *The Trial*, trans. by Willa and Edwin Muir (London: Everyman, 1992), p. xi; Karl Leydecker, 'Franz Kafka: Fiction: Nineteenth and Twentieth Century', in *The Oxford Guide to Literature in English Translation*, ed. by Peter France (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 331-6 (p. 332); and Aileen Christianson, *Moving in Circles: Willa Muir's Writings* (Edinburgh: Word Power Books, 2007), p. 136. For a response to critics of the Muirs's translations, see Margery Palmer McCulloch, 'Translating for a Living: The Muirs and German-Language Literature', in *Scottish Culture: Dialogue and Self-*

Expression, ed. by Aniela Korzeniowska and Izabela Szymańska (Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Semper, 2016), pp. 148-60.

⁵⁸ Letter to George and Elizabeth Thorburn, 29 September 1932, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 78.

⁵⁹ Hermann Broch, quoted in Elizabeth Huberman, 'Translating Broch's *The Sleepwalkers* – Ordeal and Reward', in *Edwin Muir: Centenary Assessments*, pp. 47-57 (p. 55).

⁶⁰ George Steiner, *After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation* (London: Oxford University Press, 1975), p. 319.

⁶¹ Christianson, *Moving in Circles*, p. 134.

⁶² See letter to Herbert Read, 25 October 1936, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 111. Marjorie Perloff points out that Musil's novel is seen as the 'classic "German" dissection' of the breakup of the Habsburg Empire, *Edge of Irony: Modernism in the Shadow of the Habsburg Empire* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016), p. 3.

⁶³ Ritchie Robertson, 'Austrian Prose Fiction, 1918–45', in *A History of Austrian Literature 1918–2000*, ed. by Katrin Kohl and Ritchie Robertson (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2006), pp. 53-74 (pp. 55-62, 58).

⁶⁴ Hannah Arendt, 'The Achievement of Hermann Broch', *The Kenyon Review*, Vol. 11, No. 3 (Summer, 1949), 476-83 (pp. 477, 480).

⁶⁵ Steiner, *After Babel*, p. 319.

⁶⁶ Edwin Muir, *The Present Age from 1914*, *Introductions to English Literature, Volume V*, ed. by Bonamy Dobrée (London: The Cresset Press, 1939), p. 28.

⁶⁷ See Edwin Muir, 'Franz Kafka', *Essays on Literature and Society*, p. 121, and 'Introductory Note', Franz Kafka, *The Castle*, trans. by Willa and Edwin Muir (London: Martin Secker, 1930), pp. vii-viii.

⁶⁸ Stephen D. Dowden, *Sympathy for the Abyss: A Study in the Novel of German Modernism: Kafka, Broch, Musil, and Thomas Mann* (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1986), p. 29.

⁶⁹ Michael Tanner, 'Introduction', Hermann Broch, *The Sleepwalkers*, trans. by Willa and Edwin Muir (London: Quartet Encounters, 1986), p. 6. For the Nietzschean/irrational element in *The Sleepwalkers*: 'Every system of values springs from irrational impulses, and to transform those irrational, ethically invalid contacts with the world into something absolutely rational becomes the aim of every super-personal system of values', p. 626.

⁷⁰ See Perloff, *Edge of Irony*, pp. 1-18, although her book contains little on Broch specifically.

⁷¹ *Kafka*, p. 18.

⁷² *Kafka*, p. 24.

⁷³ *Kafka*, p. 27.

⁷⁴ Katrin Kohl and Ritchie Robertson, 'Introduction', *A History of Austrian Literature 1918–2000*, pp. 1-20 (pp. 1-2). Kohl and Robertson tell us that a 1936 survey of Austrian literature opens with the question: 'Is there such a thing as Austrian literature?', reminiscent of T. S. Eliot's question in *The Athenaeum*, 'Was There a Scottish Literature?'

⁷⁵ T. M. Devine, *Scotland's Empire 1600–1815* (London: Penguin, 2004), p. 360.

⁷⁶ 'Translator's Introduction', *Kafka*, p. xxviii.

⁷⁷ *Belonging*, p. 150.

⁷⁸ Edwin Muir, 'Introductory Note', *The Castle*, p. xii.

⁷⁹ Edwin Muir, *Scott and Scotland: The Predicament of the Scottish Writer* (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1982), p. 6.

⁸⁰ See *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 64 and *Belonging*, p. 19 for the Muirs's identification with their Scandinavian inheritance.

⁸¹ Hugh MacDiarmid, *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, ed. by Kenneth Buthlay (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1987), p. 132 (emphasis in original). For Dostoevsky's influence, see Peter McCarey, *Hugh MacDiarmid and the Russians* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1987), pp. 17-36.

⁸² See *An Autobiography*, p. 118.

⁸³ Letter to Stephen Hudson, 7 May 1924, *Selected Letters of Edwin Muir*, p. 35.

⁸⁴ Edward Moore, *We Moderns* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1918), p. 149.

⁸⁵ *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, p. 62.

⁸⁶ *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, pp. 58, 6 (emphasis in original).

⁸⁷ Hugh MacDiarmid, 'A Theory of Scots Letters' (1923), in *Selected Prose*, ed. by Alan Riach (Manchester: Carcanet, 1992), pp. 16-33 (p. 26).

⁸⁸ *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, p. 94.

⁸⁹ See Buthlay's Annotated Edition of *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, p. 31. The English translations are Buthlay's.

⁹⁰ See Oswald Spengler, *The Decline of the West. An Abridged Version*, trans. by Charles Francis Atkinson (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), p. 38n.

⁹¹ 'A Theory of Scots Letters', p. 28.

⁹² William Archer, *Fighting a Philosophy. Oxford Pamphlets 1914-1915* (London: Oxford University Press, n.d. [1915]). See also Nicholas Martin, 'Fighting a Philosophy: The Figure of

Nietzsche in British Propaganda of the First World War', *Modern Language Review*, 98 (2003), 367-80.

⁹³ C. M. Grieve, letter to Neil M. Gunn, 6 February 1924, in *The Letters of Hugh MacDiarmid*, ed. by Alan Bold (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1984), p. 198.

⁹⁴ Hugh MacDiarmid, 'John Buchan', in *Contemporary Scottish Studies*, pp. 8-13 (p. 9).

⁹⁵ C. M. Grieve, 'Nietzsche in Scotland', in *The Raucle Tongue*, Vol. 2, pp. 392-4 (p. 393).

⁹⁶ 'Nietzsche in Scotland', p. 393.

⁹⁷ See Alan Bold, *MacDiarmid, Christopher Murray Grieve: A Critical Biography* (London: John Murray, 1988), p. 51.

⁹⁸ James Maclaren [Hugh MacDiarmid], 'Scotland and Europe', in *The Raucle Tongue*, Vol. 2, pp. 367-72 (p. 370).

⁹⁹ 'Scotland and Europe', p. 369.

¹⁰⁰ Hugh MacDiarmid, 'The Seamless Garment', *Complete Poems*, Vol. 1, ed. by Michael Grieve and W. R. Aitken (Manchester: Carcanet, 1993), p. 312.

¹⁰¹ MacDiarmid, 'Rainer Maria Rilke', *The Raucle Tongue*, Vol. 2, pp. 519-21 (p. 521).

¹⁰² 'Rainer Maria Rilke', p. 521.

¹⁰³ Roderick Watson, 'MacDiarmid and International Modernism', in *The Edinburgh Companion to Hugh MacDiarmid*, ed. by Scott Lyall and Margery Palmer McCulloch (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011), pp. 6-22 (p. 11).

¹⁰⁴ 'A Theory of Scots Letters', p. 24.

¹⁰⁵ William Calin, *Minority Literatures and Modernism: Scots, Breton, and Occitan, 1920-1990* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), p. 27.

¹⁰⁶ See Lyall, *Hugh MacDiarmid's Poetry and Politics of Place*, pp. 128-34, 154-72, and Alex Thomson, 'The Asymmetry of British Modernism: Hugh MacDiarmid and Wyndham Lewis', *Modernist Cultures*, 8.2 (2013), 252-71.

¹⁰⁷ See, for instance, the essay 'Glasgow', in Lewis Grassie Gibbon and Hugh MacDiarmid, *Scottish Scene, or The Intelligent Man's Guide to Albyn* (London and Melbourne: Hutchison, n.d. [1934]), pp. 114-25, esp. p. 118.

¹⁰⁸ Oliver Brown, *New Saltire* (December 1962), quoted in Douglas F. Young, *Beyond the Sunset: A Study of James Leslie Mitchell (Lewis Grassie Gibbon)* (Aberdeen: Impulse Books, 1973), p. 150. See Young's reply to the charge of plagiarism in *Beyond the Sunset*, Appendix Two: *Sunset Song* and *Jörn [sic] Uhl*, pp. 146-53.

¹⁰⁹ *Beyond the Sunset*, p. 84.

¹¹⁰ Lewis Grassie Gibbon, *Sunset Song*, in *A Scots Quair* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995), p. xiii.

¹¹¹ *Sunset Song*, p. 256 (emphasis in original).

¹¹² *Sunset Song*, p. 32.

¹¹³ *Beyond the Sunset*, p. 83.

¹¹⁴ Gustav Frenssen, *Jörn Uhl*, trans. by F. S. Delmer (London: Archibald and Co., 1905), p. vii.

¹¹⁵ *Jörn Uhl*, p. 63.

¹¹⁶ *Jörn Uhl*, p. 312.

¹¹⁷ *Sunset Song*, p. 191-9.

¹¹⁸ *Jörn Uhl*, p. vi.

¹¹⁹ Warren Washburn Florer, 'Introduction', Gustav Frenssen, *Jörn Uhl* (Boston, New York, Chicago: D. C. Heath, 1914), p. iii.

¹²⁰ In 2005: *100 Best Scottish Books of All Time*, ed. by Willy Maley and Brian Donaldson (Edinburgh: The List, 2005), and 2016: ‘*Sunset Song* voted Scotland’s favourite book’, BBC News, 17 October 2016, <www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-37677187> [accessed 25 October 2017].