# Note Concerning our Paper
# "On the Nature of Turbulence"

D. Ruelle and F. Takens

After the paper referred to in the title was published, references to the relevant Russian literature were made available to us by Ya. G. Sinai and V. I. Arnold. From these it appears that much of the work on bifurcation described in our paper duplicates results already published by Russian authors. On the other hand the mathematical interpretation which we give of turbulence seems to remain our own responsability!

We thank Sinai and Arnold for informing us of the Russian references. The following list has been compiled from their indications.

Brušlinskaja, N. N.: Qualitative integration of a system of $n$ differential equations in a region containing a singular point and a limit cycle. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **139** N1, 9—12 (1961); — Soviet Math. Dokl. **2**, 845—848 (1961). MR 26, No. 5212; Errata MR 30, p. 1203.
— Limit cycles for equations of motion of a rigid body and Galerkin's equations for hydrodynamics. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **157**, N 5, 1017—1020 (1964); — Soviet Math. Dokl. **5**, 1051—1054 (1964). MR 29, No. 6133.
— The behavior of solutions of the equations of hydrodynamics when the Reynolds number passes through a critical value. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **162** N 4, 731—734 (1965); — Soviet Math. Dokl. **6**, 724—728 (1965). MR 31, No. 6460.
— On the generation of periodic flows and tori from laminar flows, p. 57—79 in *Nekotorje voprosy mehaniki gornych porod* (some problems of mechanics of minerals), Trudy gornogo instituta, Moscow, 1968.
Gurtovnik, A. S., Neĭmark, Ju. I.: On the question of the stability of quasi-periodic motions. Diff. Uravn. **5** N 5, 824—832 (1969).
Neĭmark, Ju. I.: On some cases of dependence of periodic solutions on parameters. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **129** N 4, 736—739 (1959).
— Motions close to doubly-asymptotic motion. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **172** N 5, 1021—1024 (1967); — Soviet Math. Dokl. **8**, 228—231 (1967). MR 38, No. 669.
— Izv. Vysš. Učebn. Zav., Radiofizika **1** N 5—6 (1958); **2** N 3 (1959); **8** N 3 (1965); **10** N 3 (1967).
Judovič, V. I.: An example of the generation of a secondary or periodic flow due to the loss of stability of a laminar flow of a viscous incompressible fluid. Prikl. Mat. Meh. **29** N 3, 453—467 (1965); — J. Appl. Math. Mech. **29**, 527—544 (1965).
— On the bifurcation of rotationary flows of fluids. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **169** N 2, 306—309 (1966).

Judovič, V. I.: An example of loss of stability and generation of a secondary flow in a closed volume. Mat. Sbornik **74** (116) N 4, 565—579 (1967).
— Generation of secondary stationary and periodic solutions by destabilization of a stable stationary flow of fluid. Abstracts of short scientific communications, Sec. 12. Internat. Congress of Math. (Moscow, 1966). Mir, Moscow, 1968.
— Questions of the mathematical theory of stability of flows of fluids. Vsesojusnyi siesd po teoretičeskoi i prikladnoi mehanike. Moscow: Annotacii Dokladov 1968.
— On the stability of forced oscillations of fluid. Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR **195** N2, 292—295 (1970); — Soviet Math. Dokl. **11**, 1473—1477 (1970).
— Appearance of self-oscillations in fluids, I. Prikl. Mat. Meh., 1971.

D. Ruelle                                  F. Takens
Institut des Hautes Etudes                 Dept. of Mathematics
Scientifiques                              University of Groningen
F-91 Bures-sur Yvette, France              Groningen. The Netherlands