

# On the WDVV-equation in quantum K-theory

Alexander Givental

UC Berkeley and Caltech

**0. Introduction.** Quantum cohomology theory can be described in general words as intersection theory in spaces of holomorphic curves in a given Kähler or almost Kähler manifold  $X$ . By quantum  $K$ -theory we may similarly understand a study of complex vector bundles over the spaces of holomorphic curves in  $X$ . In these notes, we will introduce a  $K$ -theoretic version of the Witten-Dijkgraaf-Verlinde-Verlinde equation which expresses the associativity constraint of the “quantum multiplication” operation on  $K^*(X)$ .

Intersection indices of cohomology theory,

$$\int_{[\text{space of curves}]} \omega_1 \wedge \dots \wedge \omega_k$$

obtained by evaluation on the fundamental cycle of cup-products of cohomology classes, are to be replaced in  $K$ -theory by Euler characteristics

$$\chi(\text{space of curves} ; V_1 \otimes \dots \otimes V_k)$$

of tensor products of vector bundles. The hypotheses needed in the definitions of the intersection indices and Euler characteristics — that the spaces of curves are compact and non-singular, or that the bundles are holomorphic — are rarely satisfied. We handle this foundational problem by restricting ourselves throughout the notes to the setting where the problem disappears. Namely, we will deal with the so called *moduli spaces  $X_{n,d}$  of degree  $d$  genus 0 stable maps to  $X$  with  $n$  marked points* **assuming that  $X$  is a homogeneous Kähler space**. Under the hypothesis, the moduli spaces  $X_{n,d}$  (we will review their definition and properties when needed) are known to be compact complex orbifolds (see [9, 1]). We use their fundamental cycle  $[X_{n,d}]$ ,

well-defined over  $\mathbb{Q}$ , in the definition of intersection indices, and we use sheaf cohomology in the definition of the Euler characteristic of a holomorphic *orbi-bundle*  $V$ :

$$\chi(X_{n,d}; V) := \sum (-1)^k \dim H^k(X_{n,d}; \Gamma(V)).$$

**1. Correlators.** The WDVV-equation is usually formulated in terms of the following generating function for *correlators*:

$$F(t, Q) = \sum_d \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{Q^d}{n!} (t, \dots, t)_{n,d}.$$

Here  $d \in H_2(X, \mathbb{Z})$  runs the Mori cone of *degrees*, that is homology classes represented by fundamental cycles of rational holomorphic curves in  $X$ , and the correlators  $(\phi_1, \dots, \phi_n)_{n,d}$  are defined using the *evaluation maps* at the marked points:

$$\text{ev}_1 \times \dots \times \text{ev}_n : X_{n,d} \rightarrow X \times \dots \times X.$$

In cohomology theory, we pull-back to the moduli space  $X_{n,d}$  the  $n$  cohomology classes  $\phi_1, \dots, \phi_n \in H^*(X, \mathbb{Q})$  of  $X$  and define the correlator among them by

$$(\phi_1, \dots, \phi_n)_{n,d} := \int_{[X_{n,d}]} \text{ev}_1^*(\phi_1) \wedge \dots \wedge \text{ev}_n^*(\phi_n).$$

In K-theory, we pull-back  $n$  elements  $\phi_1, \dots, \phi_n \in K^*(X)$  (representable under our restriction on  $X$  by holomorphic vector bundles or their formal differences) and put

$$(\phi_1, \dots, \phi_n)_{n,d} := \chi(X_{n,d}; \text{ev}_1^*(\phi_1) \otimes \dots \otimes \text{ev}_n^*(\phi_n)).$$

We will treat the series  $F$  as a formal function of  $t \in H$  depending on formal parameters  $Q = (Q_1, \dots, Q_{\text{Betti}_2(X)})$ , where  $H = H^*(X, \mathbb{Q})$  or  $H = K^*(X)$ .

Let  $\{\phi_\alpha\}$  be a graded basis in  $H^*(X, \mathbb{Q})$ , and

$$g_{\alpha\beta} := \langle \phi_\alpha, \phi_\beta \rangle = \int_{[X]} \phi_\alpha \wedge \phi_\beta$$

denote the intersection matrix. Let  $(g^{\alpha\beta}) = (g_{\alpha\beta})^{-1}$  be the inverse matrix (so that  $\sum (\phi_\alpha \otimes 1) g^{\alpha\beta} (1 \otimes \phi_\beta)$  is Poincare-dual to the diagonal in  $X \times X$ ).

In quantum cohomology theory, one defines the *quantum cup-product*  $\bullet$  on the tangent space  $T_t H$  by

$$\langle \phi_\alpha \bullet \phi_\beta, \phi_\gamma \rangle := F_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(t)$$

(where the subscripts on the RHS mean partial derivatives in the basis  $\{\phi_\alpha\}$ ). In the above notation the associativity of the quantum cup-product is equivalent to the WDVV-identity:

$$\sum_{\varepsilon, \varepsilon'} F_{\alpha\beta\varepsilon} g^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} F_{\varepsilon'\gamma\delta} \text{ is totally symmetric in } \alpha, \beta, \gamma, \delta.$$

**2. Stable maps, gluing and contraction.** In order to explain the proof of the WDVV-identity we have to discuss some properties of the moduli spaces  $X_{n,d}$  (see [9, 1, 4] for more details).

We consider prestable marked curves  $(C, \mathbf{z})$ , that is compact connected complex curves  $C$  with at most double singular points and with  $n$  marked points  $\mathbf{z} = (z_1, \dots, z_n)$  which are non-singular and distinct. Two holomorphic maps,  $f : (C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$  and  $f' : (C', \mathbf{z}') \rightarrow X$ , are called *equivalent* if they are identified by an isomorphism  $(C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow (C', \mathbf{z}')$  of the curves. This definition induces the concept of *automorphism* of a map  $f : (C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$ , and one calls  $f$  *stable* if it has no non-trivial infinitesimal automorphisms. The moduli spaces  $X_{n,d}$  consist of equivalence classes of stable maps with fixed number  $n$  of marked points, degree  $d$  and arithmetical genus 0 (it is defined as  $g = \dim H^1(C, \mathcal{O}_C)$ ).

In plain words, the space of degree  $d$  holomorphic spheres in  $X$  with  $n$  marked points is compactified by prestable curves which are trees of  $\mathbb{C}P^1$ 's and satisfy the stability condition: each irreducible component  $\mathbb{C}P^1$  mapped to a point in  $X$  must carry at least 3 marked or singular points. Under the hypothesis that  $X$  is a homogeneous Kähler space, the moduli space  $X_{n,d}$  has the structure of a compact complex orbifold of dimension  $\dim_{\mathbb{C}} X + \int_d c_1(T_X) + n - 3$ .

In the case when  $X$  is a point the moduli spaces coincide with the Deligne-Mumford compactifications  $\bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,n}$  of moduli spaces of configurations of marked points on  $\mathbb{C}P^1$ . For instance,  $\mathcal{M}_{0,4}$  is the set  $\mathbb{C}P^1 - \{0, 1, \infty\}$  of legitimate values of the cross-ratio of 4 marked points on  $\mathbb{C}P^1$ . The compactification  $\bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,4} = \mathbb{C}P^1$  fills-in the forbidden values of the cross-ratio by equivalence classes of the reducible curves  $\mathbb{C}P^1 \cup \mathbb{C}P^1$  with one double point and two marked point on each irreducible component.

For  $n \geq 3$ , there is a natural *contraction* map  $X_{n,d} \rightarrow \bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,n}$  defined by composing the map  $f : (C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$  with  $X \rightarrow pt$  (so that the components of  $C$  carrying  $< 3$  special points become unstable) and contracting the unstable components. Similarly, one can define the *forgetting* maps  $ft_i : X_{n+1,d} \rightarrow X_{n,d}$  by disregarding the  $i$ -th marked point and contracting the component if it has become unstable.

In particular, we will make use of the contraction map

$$ct : X_{n+4,d} \rightarrow \bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,4}$$

defined by forgetting the map  $f : (C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$  and all the marked points except the first four. A legitimate value  $\lambda = ct[f]$  of the cross-ratio means the following: the curve  $C$  has a component  $C_0 = \mathbb{C}P^1$  carrying 4 special points with the cross-ratio  $\lambda$ , and the first 4 marked point are situated on the branches of the tree connected to  $C_0$  at those 4 special points. A forbidden value  $ct[f] = 0, 1$  or  $\infty$  means that  $C$  containing a *chain*  $C_0, \dots, C_k$  of  $k > 0$  of  $\mathbb{C}P^1$ 's such that 2 of the 4 branches of the tree carrying the marked points are connected to the chain via  $C_0$ , and the other two — via  $C_k$ . Such stable maps form a stratum of codimension  $k$  in the moduli space  $X_{n,d}$ . We will refer to them as strata (or stable maps) *of depth*  $k$ .

A stable map of depth 1 is glued from 2 stable maps obtained by disconnecting  $C_0$  from  $C_1$ . This gives rise to the *gluing map*

$$X_{n_0+3,d_0} \times_{\Delta} X_{n_1+3,d_1} \rightarrow X_{n_0+n_1+4,d_0+d_1}$$

as follows. Consider the map from  $X_{n_0+3,d_0} \times X_{n_1+3,d_1}$  to  $X \times X$  defined by evaluation at the 3-rd marked points. The source of the gluing map is the preimage of the diagonal  $\Delta \subset X \times X$ .<sup>1</sup> It consists of pairs of stable maps which have the same image of the third marked point and which therefore can be glued at this point into a single stable map of degree  $d_0 + d_1$  with  $n_0 + 2 + n_1 + 2$  marked points.

Similarly, gluing stable maps of depth  $k$  from  $k + 1$  stable maps subject to  $k$  diagonal constraints at the double points of the chain  $C_0, \dots, C_k$  defines appropriate gluing maps parameterizing the strata of depth  $k$ .

**3. Proof of the WDVV-identity.** All points in  $\bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,4}$  represent the same (co)homology class. Thus the analytic fundamental cycles of the fibers

---

<sup>1</sup>Note that for a homogeneous Kähler  $X$ , the evaluation map is conveniently transverse to the diagonal in  $X \times X$ .

$\text{ct}^{-1}(\lambda)$  are homologous in  $X_{n+4,d}$ . The cohomological WDVV-identity follows from the fact that for  $\lambda = 0, 1$  or  $\infty$  the fiber  $\text{ct}^{-1}(\lambda)$  consists of strata of depth  $> 0$ , and moreover — the corresponding gluing maps (for all splittings  $d = d_0 + d_1$  of the degree and all splittings of the  $n = n_0 + n_1$  marked points), being isomorphisms at generic points, identify the analytic fundamental cycle of the fiber with the sum of the fundamental cycles of  $X_{n_0+3,d_1} \times_{\Delta} X_{n_1+3,d_2}$ . This allows one to equate 3 quadratic expressions of the correlators which differ by the order of the indices  $\alpha, \beta, \gamma, \delta$  associated with the first 4 marked points.

We leave the reader to work out some standard combinatorial details which are needed in order to translate this argument into the WDVV-identity for the generating function  $F$  and note only that the contraction with the intersection tensor  $(g^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'})$  in the WDVV-equation takes care of the diagonal constraint  $\Delta \subset X \times X$  for the evaluation maps.

In K-theory, similarly, the push-forward to  $X \times X$  of the structural sheaf  $\mathcal{O}_{\Delta}$  of the diagonal is expressed as

$$\sum (\phi_{\varepsilon} \otimes 1) g^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} (1 \otimes \phi_{\varepsilon'})$$

via  $(g^{\varepsilon,\varepsilon'})$  inverse to the “intersection matrix”

$$g_{\alpha\beta} := \langle \phi_{\alpha}, \phi_{\beta} \rangle = \chi(X; \phi_{\alpha} \otimes \phi_{\beta}).$$

The argument justifying the WDVV-equation fails, however, since the above gluing map to  $\text{ct}^{-1}(\lambda)$  is one-to-one only at the points of depth 1 and does not identify the corresponding structural sheaves. Indeed, a stable map of depth  $k$  can be glued from two stable maps in  $k$  different ways and thus belongs to the  $k$ -fold self-intersection in the image of the gluing map.

Let us examine the variety  $\text{ct}^{-1}(\lambda)$  at a point of depth  $k > 1$ . One of the properties of Kontsevich’s compactifications  $X_{m,d}$  is that *after passing to the local non-singular covers* (defined by the orbifold structure of the moduli spaces) *the compactifying strata form a divisor with normal crossings* [9, 1]. Moreover, analyzing (inductively in  $k$ ) the local structure of the contraction map  $\text{ct} : X_{n+4,d} \rightarrow \mathcal{M}_{0,4}$  near a depth- $k$  point, one easily finds the local model  $\lambda(x_1, \dots, x_k, \dots) = x_1 \dots x_k$  for the map  $\text{ct}$  in a suitable local coordinate system. In this model, the components  $x_1 = 0, \dots, x_k = 0$  of the divisor with normal crossings represent the strata of depth 1, their intersections  $x_{i_1} = x_{i_2} = 0$  — the strata of depth 2, etc. Denote by  $\mathcal{O}$  the algebra of functions on our local

chart, so that  $\mathcal{O}/(x_{i_1}, \dots, x_{i_l})$ ,  $i_1 < \dots < i_l$ , are the algebras of functions on the depth- $l$  strata. We have the following exact sequence of  $\mathcal{O}$ -modules:

$$0 \rightarrow \mathcal{O}/(x_1 \dots x_k) \rightarrow \oplus \mathcal{O}/(x_i) \rightarrow \oplus \mathcal{O}/(x_{i_1}, x_{i_2}) \rightarrow \oplus \mathcal{O}/(x_{i_1}, x_{i_2}, x_{i_3}) \rightarrow \dots$$

Notice that the  $\oplus$ -terms in the sequence are the algebras of functions on the normalized strata of depth 1, depth 2, etc. Translating this local formula to a global K-theoretic statement about gluing maps, we conclude that in the Grothendieck group of orbi-sheaves on  $X_{n+4,d}$ , the element represented by the structural sheaf of  $ct^{-1}(\lambda)$  for  $\lambda = 0, 1$  or  $\infty$  is identified with the structural sheaf of the corresponding alternated disjoint sum over positive depth strata:

$$\sum X_{n_0+3,d_0} \times_{\Delta} X_{n_1+3,d_1} - \sum X_{n_0+3,d_0} \times_{\Delta} X_{n_1+2,d_1} \times_{\Delta} X_{n_2+3,d_2} + \dots$$

**4. Formulation and consequences.** Now we can apply the above K-theoretic statement about the moduli spaces to our generating functions.

Introduce

$$G(t, Q) := \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha, \beta} g_{\alpha\beta} t_{\alpha} t_{\beta} + F(t, Q).$$

Let  $(G^{\alpha\beta})$  be the matrix inverse to  $(G_{\alpha\beta}) = (\partial_{\alpha} \partial_{\beta} G)$ .

**Theorem.**

$$\sum_{\varepsilon, \varepsilon'} G_{\alpha\beta\varepsilon} G^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} G_{\varepsilon'\gamma\delta} \text{ is totally symmetric in } \alpha, \beta, \gamma, \delta.$$

*Proof.* We have rewritten

$$F_{\alpha\beta\varepsilon} g^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} F_{\varepsilon'\gamma\delta} - F_{\alpha\beta\varepsilon} g^{\varepsilon\mu} F_{\mu\mu'} g^{\mu'\varepsilon'} F_{\varepsilon'\gamma\delta} + \dots$$

using the famous matrix identity  $1 - F + F^2 - \dots = (1 + F)^{-1}$ .  $\square$

Introduce the *quantum tensor product* on  $T_t H$  (with  $H = K^*(X)$ ) by

$$(\phi_{\alpha} \bullet \phi_{\beta}, \phi_{\gamma}) := G_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(t),$$

and the metric  $(,)$  on  $TH$  is defined by  $(\phi_{\mu}, \phi_{\nu}) := G_{\mu\nu}(t)$ .

**Corollary 1.** *The operations  $(,)$  and  $\bullet$  define on the tangent bundle the structure of a formal commutative associative Frobenius algebra with the unity 1.*<sup>2</sup>

*Proof.* As in the cohomology theory, it is a formal corollary of the Theorem, except that the statement about the unity 1 means that  $G_{\alpha,1,\beta} = G_{\alpha\beta}$  and follows from the simplest instance of the *string equation* in the K-theory:  $(1, t, \dots, t)_{n+1,d} = (t, \dots, t)_{n,d}$ . The last equality is obvious. Indeed, the push-forward of the constant sheaf 1 along the map  $\text{ft} : X_{n+1,d} \rightarrow X_{n,d}$  forgetting the first marked point is the constant sheaf 1 on  $X_{n,d}$  since the fibers are curves  $C$  of zero arithmetic genus,  $g = \dim H^1(C, \mathcal{O}_C) = 0$ , while  $H^0(C, \mathcal{O}_C) = \mathbb{C}$  by Liouville's theorem.  $\square$

We introduce on  $T^*H$  the 1-parametric family of connection operators

$$\nabla_q := (1 - q)d - \sum_{\alpha} (\phi_{\alpha} \bullet)^* dt_{\alpha} \wedge .$$

**Corollary 2.** *The connections  $\nabla_q$  are flat for any  $q \neq 1$ .*

*Proof.* This follows from  $\phi_{\alpha} \bullet \phi_{\beta} = \phi_{\beta} \bullet \phi_{\alpha}$ ,  $d^2 = 0$ , and  $\partial_{\alpha}(\phi_{\beta} \bullet) = \partial_{\beta}(\phi_{\alpha} \bullet)$ :

$$\partial_{\alpha}(\phi_{\beta} \bullet)_{\mu}^{\nu} = G_{\mu\alpha\beta\varepsilon} G^{\varepsilon\nu} - G_{\mu\beta\varepsilon} G^{\varepsilon\alpha'} G_{\varepsilon'\alpha\varepsilon''} G^{\varepsilon''\nu}$$

is symmetric with respect to  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  due to the WDVV-identity.  $\square$

**Proposition.** *The operator  $\nabla_{-1}$  is twice the Levi-Civita connection of the metric  $(G^{\alpha\beta})$  on  $T^*H$ .*

*Proof.* For a metric of the form  $G_{\alpha\beta} = \partial_{\alpha}\partial_{\beta}G$  the famous explicit formulas for the Christoffel symbols yield

$$2\Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^{\gamma} = [G_{\alpha\varepsilon,\beta} + G_{\beta\varepsilon,\alpha} - G_{\alpha\beta,\varepsilon}]G^{\varepsilon\gamma} = G_{\alpha\beta\varepsilon}G^{\varepsilon\gamma} = (\phi_{\beta} \bullet)_{\alpha}^{\gamma}.$$

**Corollary 3.** *The metric  $(,)$  on  $TH$  is flat.*

We complete this section with a description of flat sections of the connection operator  $\nabla_q$  in terms of K-theoretic “gravitational descendants”. Let us introduce the generating functions

$$S_{\alpha\beta}(t, Q) := g_{\alpha\beta} + \sum_{n,d} \frac{Q^d}{n!} (\phi_{\alpha}, t, \dots, t, \frac{\phi_{\beta}}{1 - qL})_{n+2,d},$$

---

<sup>2</sup>At  $t = 0, Q = 0$  it turns into the usual multiplicative structure on  $K^*(X)$ .

where the correlators are defined by

$$(\psi_1, \dots, \psi_n L^k)_{m,d} := \chi(X_{m,d}; \text{ev}_1^*(\psi_1) \otimes \dots \otimes \text{ev}_m^*(\psi_m) \otimes L^{\otimes k}).$$

Here  $L$  is the line *orbibundle* over the moduli space  $X_{m,d}$  of stable maps  $(C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$  formed by the cotangent lines to  $C$  at the *last* marked point (as specified by the position of the geometrical series  $1 + qL + q^2L^2 + \dots = (1 - qL)^{-1}$  in the correlator).

**Theorem.** *The matrix  $S := (S_{\mu\nu})$  is a fundamental solution to the linear PDE system:*

$$(1 - q)\partial_\alpha S = (\phi_\alpha \bullet) S .$$

*Proof.* Taking  $\phi_\mu, \phi_\alpha, \phi_\beta$  and  $\phi_\nu/(1 - qL)$  for the content of the four distinguished marked points in the proof of the WDVV-identity, we obtain its generalization in the form:

$$G_{\mu\alpha\varepsilon} G^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} \partial_\beta S_{\varepsilon'\nu} = G_{\mu\beta\varepsilon} G^{\varepsilon\varepsilon'} \partial_\alpha S_{\varepsilon'\nu},$$

or  $(\phi_\alpha \bullet)\partial_\beta S = (\phi_\beta \bullet)\partial_\alpha S$ . Now it remains to put  $\phi_\beta = 1$  and use  $(1 - q)\partial_1 S = S$ , which is another instance of the string equation:

$$(1, t, \dots, t, \phi L^k)_{n+2,d} = (t, \dots, t, \phi(1 + L + \dots + L^k))_{n+1,d}.$$

The last relation is obtained by computing the push forward of  $L^{\otimes k}$  along  $\text{ft}_1 : X_{n+2,d} \rightarrow X_{n+1,d}$ .<sup>3</sup>

## 5. Some open questions.

(a) *Definitions.* It is natural to expect that the above results extend from the case of homogeneous Kähler spaces  $X$  to general compact Kähler and, even more generally, almost Kähler target manifolds.

In the Kähler case, the moduli of stable degree  $d$  genus  $g$  maps with  $n$  marked points form compact complex orbi-spaces  $X_{g,n,d}$  equipped with the

---

<sup>3</sup>Some details can be found in [15, 14, 11, 5]. Briefly, one identifies the fibers of  $\text{ft}_1$  with the curves underlying the stable maps  $f : (C, \mathbf{z}) \rightarrow X$  with  $n + 1$  marked points. It is important to realize that the pull-back  $L' := \text{ft}_1^*(L)$  of the line bundle named  $L$  on  $X_{n+1,d}$  differs from the line bundle named  $L$  on  $X_{n+2,d}$ . In fact, there is a holomorphic section of  $\text{Hom}(L', L)$  with the divisor  $D$  defined by the last marked point  $z_{n+1} \in C$ , and the bundle  $L$  restricted to  $D$  is trivial (while  $L'|_D$  is therefore conormal to  $D$ ). Since  $L'$  is trivial along the fibers  $C$ , we find that  $H^1(C, L^k) = 0$  and  $H^0(C, L^k) = (L')^k \otimes H^0(C, \mathcal{O}_C(kD)) \simeq (L')^k(1 + (L')^{-1} + \dots + (L')^{-k})$ .



*intrinsic normal cone* [13]. The cone gives rise [3] to an element in K-group of  $X_{g,n,d}$  which should be used in the definition of  $K$ -theoretic correlators in the same manner as the virtual fundamental cycle  $[X_{g,n,d}]$  is used in quantum cohomology theory.

The moduli space  $X_{g,n,d}$  can be also described as the zero locus of a section of a bundle  $E \rightarrow B$  over a non-singular space. Due to the famous “deformation to the normal cone” [3], the virtual fundamental cycle represents the Euler class of the bundle. This description survives in the almost Kähler case and yields a topological definition and symplectic invariance of the cohomological correlators. In  $K$ -theory, there exists a topological construction of the push forward from  $B$  to the point based on Whitney embedding theorem and Thom isomorphisms. We don’t know however how to adjust the construction to our actual setting where  $B$  is non-singular only in the *orbifold* sense.

One (somewhat awkward) option is to define  $K$ -theoretic correlators topologically by the RHS of the Kawasaki-Riemann-Roch-Hirzebruch formula [8] for orbi-bundles over  $B$ . This proposal deserves further study even in the Kähler case since it may lead to a “quantum Riemann-Roch formula”.

(b) *Frobenius-like structures*. Our results in Section 4 show that  $K$ -theoretic Gromov-Witten invariants of genus 0 define on the space  $H = K^*(X)$  a geometrical structure very similar to the *Frobenius structure* [2] of cohomology theory, but not identical to it.

One of the lessons is that the metric tensor on  $H$ , which can be in both cases described as  $F_{\alpha,1,\beta}$ , is constant in cohomology theory and equal to  $g_{\alpha\beta}$  only by an “accident”, but remains flat in  $K$ -theory even though it is not constant anymore.

The translation  $t \mapsto t + \tau 1$  in the direction of  $1 \in H$  leaves the structure invariant in cohomology theory, but causes multiplication by  $e^\tau$  in  $K$ -theory — because of a new form of the string equation. Also, the  $\mathbb{Z}$ -grading missing in  $K$ -theory makes an important difference. It would be interesting to study the axiomatic structure that emerges here and to compare it with the structure implicitly encoded by  $K$ -theory on Deligne-Mumford spaces.

(c) *Deligne-Mumford spaces*. When the target space  $X$  is the point, the moduli spaces  $X_{g,n,0}$  are Deligne-Mumford compactifications of the moduli spaces of genus  $g$  Riemann surfaces with  $n$  marked points. The parallel between cohomology and  $K$ -theory suggest several problems.

Holomorphic Euler characteristics of universal cotangent line bundles and

their tensor products satisfy the string and dilation equations.<sup>4</sup>  $K$ -theoretic generalization of the rest of Witten – Kontsevich intersection theory [15, 10] is unclear.

The case of genus 0 and 1 has been studied in [14, 11] and [12]. The formula

$$\chi(\bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,n}; \frac{1}{(1 - q_1 L_1) \dots (1 - q_n L_n)}) = \frac{(1 + q_1/(1 - q_1) + \dots + q_n/(1 - q_n))^{n-3}}{(1 - q_1) \dots (1 - q_n)}$$

found by Y.-P. Lee [11] is analogous to the famous intersection theory result [15, 9]

$$\int_{[\bar{\mathcal{M}}_{0,n}]} \frac{1}{(1 - x_1 c_1(L_1)) \dots (1 - x_n c_1(L_n))} = (x_1 + \dots + x_n)^{n-3}.$$

The latter formula is a basis for fixed point computations [9, 5] in equivariant cohomology of the moduli spaces  $X_{n,d}$  for toric  $X$ . As it was noticed by Y.-P. Lee, the former formula is not sufficient for similar fixed point computation in  $K$ -theory: it requires Euler characteristics accountable for *invariants with respect to permutations of the marked points*. Finding an  $S_n$ -equivariant version of Lee’s formula is an important open problem.

(d) *Computations.* The quantum  $K$ -ring is unknown even for  $X = \mathbb{C}P^1$ . It turns out that the WDVV-equation is not powerful enough in the absence of grading constraints and *divisor equation* (see, for instance, [5]).

On the other hand, for  $X = \mathbb{C}P^n$ , it is not hard to compute the generating functions  $G(t, Q)$  and even  $S_{\alpha\beta}(t, Q, q)$  at  $t = 0$  (see [12]). In cohomology theory, this would determine the *small* quantum cohomology ring due to the divisor equation which, roughly speaking, identifies the  $Q$ -deformation at  $t = 0$  with the  $t$ -deformation at  $Q = 1$  along the subspace  $H^2(X, \mathbb{Q}) \subset H$ . No replacement for the divisor equation seems to be possible in  $K$ -theory.

At the same time, the heuristic study [6] of  $S^1$ -equivariant geometry on the loop space  $LX$  suggests that the generating functions  $S = S_{1,\beta}(0, Q, q)$  should satisfy certain linear  $q$ -difference equations (instead of similar linear

---

<sup>4</sup>The same is true not only for  $X = pt$  (see [12]). By the way, the push forward  $ft_*(L)$  along  $ft : X_{g,n+1,d} \rightarrow X_{g,n,d}$ , described by the dilation equation, equals  $\mathcal{H} + \mathcal{H}^* - 2 + n$ . Here  $\mathcal{H}$  is the  $g$ -dimensional *Hodge bundle* with the fiber  $H^1(C, \mathcal{O}_C)$ . This answer replaces a similar factor  $2g - 2 + n$  in the cohomological dilation equation, but also shows that tensor powers of  $\mathcal{H}$  must be included to close up the list of “observables”.

differential equations of quantum cohomology theory). This expectation is supported by the example of  $X = \mathbb{C}P^n$ : Y.-P. Lee [12] finds that the generating functions are solutions to the  $q$ -difference equation  $D^{n+1}S = QS$  (where  $(DS)(Q) := S(Q) - S(qQ)$ ).

In the case of the flag manifold  $X$  the generating functions  $S$  have been identified with the so called *Whittaker functions* — common eigen-functions of commuting operators of the  $q$ -difference Toda system. This result and its conjectural generalization [7] to the flag manifolds  $X = G/B$  of complex simple Lie algebras links quantum K-theory to representation theory and quantum groups. Originally this conjecture served as a motivation for developing the basics of quantum K-theory.

The author is thankful to Yuan-Pin Lee and Rahul Pandharipande for useful discussions, and to the National Science Foundation for supporting this research.

## References

- [1] K. Behrend, Yu. Manin. *Stacks of stable maps and Gromov – Witten invariants*. Duke Math. J. **85**, 1996, 1 – 60.
- [2] B. Dubrovin. *The geometry of 2D topological field theories*. Lecture Notes in Math. **1620**, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1996, 120-348.
- [3] W. Fulton. *Intersection theory*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1984.
- [4] W. Fulton, R. Pandharipande. *Notes on stable maps and quantum cohomology*. Preprint, 52 pp. alg-geom/9608011.
- [5] A. Givental. *The mirror formula for quintic threefolds*. Amer. Math. Soc. Transl. (2), **196**, 1999, 49 – 62.
- [6] A. Givental. Homological geometry I. Projective hypersurfaces. Selecta Math. (N. S.) **1**, 1995, 325 – 345.
- [7] A. Givental, Y.-P. Lee. *Quantum K-theory on flag manifolds, finite-difference Toda lattices and quantum groups*. Preprint, 1998, 25 pp., preliminary version.

- [8] T. Kawasaki. *The signature formula for V-manifolds*. Topology **17**, 1978, No. 1, 75 – 83.
- [9] M. Kontsevich. *Enumeration of rational curves via tori actions*. In: The Moduli Space of Curves. (R. Dijkgraaf et al., eds.), Progress in Math. **129**, Birkhäuser, Boston, 1995, 335 – 368.
- [10] M. Kontsevich. *Intersection theory on the moduli space of curves and the matrix Airy function*.
- [11] Y.-P. Lee. *A formula for Euler characteristics of tautological line bundles on the Deligne-Mumford moduli spaces*. IMRN, 1997, No. 8, 393 – 400.
- [12] Y.-P. Lee. *Quantum K-theory*. PhD thesis, UC Berkeley, 1999.
- [13] J. Li, G. Tian. *Virtual moduli cycles and Gromov – Witten invariants of algebraic varieties*. J. Amer. Math. Soc. **11**, 1998, 119 – 179.
- [14] R. Pandharipande. *The symmetric function  $h^0(\bar{M}_{0,n}, L_1^{x_1} \otimes \dots \otimes L_n^{x_n})$* . Preprint, 11 pp., alg-geom/9604021.
- [15] E. Witten. *Two-dimensional gravity and intersection theory on moduli space*. Surveys in Diff. Geom. **1**, 1991, 243 – 310.