



Australian
National
University

THESES SIS/LIBRARY
R.G. MENZIES LIBRARY BUILDING NO:2
THE AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY
CANBERRA ACT 0200 AUSTRALIA

TELEPHONE: +61 2 6125 4631
FACSIMILE: +61 2 6125 4063
EMAIL: library.theses@anu.edu.au

USE OF THESES

This copy is supplied for purposes
of private study and research only.
Passages from the thesis may not be
copied or closely paraphrased without the
written consent of the author.

**PAPAL POLICY TOWARDS CONFLICT
IN THE AUSTRALIAN CATHOLIC MISSIONS:
THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN
JOHN BEDE POLDING, O.S.B.,
ARCHBISHOP OF SYDNEY,
AND THE
SACRED CONGREGATION
DE PROPAGANDA FIDE,
1842 - 1874.**

Christopher Paul Dowd, M.A.

July, 1994



A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of
the Australian National University,
Canberra

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statement	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	ix
Abbreviations	xi
List of illustrations	xv
Introduction	1
Chapter I: Ultramontaniam and Conflict in Colonial Australian Catholicism.	8
Chapter II: The Sacred Congregation <i>de Propaganda Fide</i> and Australia in the Mid-Nineteenth Century	43
Chapter III: The Roman Rise and Fall of John Bede Polding, 1842-1855	87
Chapter IV: The Campaign of the <i>Freeman's Journal</i> , 1856-1860	143
Chapter V: The Fall of Abbot Henry Gregory Gregory, 1859-1866	165
Chapter VI: The Division of the Archdiocese of Sydney, 1858-1865	206
Chapter VII: Polding's <i>ad limina</i> Visit, 1865-1867	248
Chapter VIII: The Sheehy Affair, 1866-1868	273
Chapter IX: The Despondency of Polding, 1867-1870	296
Chapter X: The Quest for a Coadjutor and the Final Triumph of Polding, 1842-1874	315
Epilogue: The End of an Era, 1874	355
Conclusion	358
Bibliography	375

This thesis is entirely my own original work.

Christopher Paul Dowd

Christopher Paul Dowd



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The making of this thesis has been possible only with the assistance and co-operation of a large number of people and institutions.

I should like to express my gratitude to the following prelates and ecclesiastical and religious superiors of the Catholic Church for granting me access to the archives under their jurisdictions: His Eminence Cardinal Josef Tomko, Prefect of the Congregation for the Evangelization of Peoples, Rome; His Eminence Cardinal Edward Clancy, Archbishop of Sydney; His Eminence Cardinal Basil Hume, OSB, Archbishop of Westminster; His Grace the Archbishop of Adelaide, Most Rev. Leonard Faulkner; His Grace the Archbishop of Birmingham, Most Rev. Maurice Couve de Murville; His Grace the former Archbishop of Brisbane, Most Rev. Francis Rush; His Grace the Archbishop of Canberra and Goulburn, Most Rev. Francis Carroll; His Grace the Archbishop of Cardiff, Most Rev. John Ward, OFM Cap; His Grace the Archbishop of Dublin, Most Rev. Desmond Connell; His Grace the Archbishop of Melbourne, Most Rev. Francis Little; His Grace the Archbishop of Perth, Most Rev. Barry Hickey; His Lordship the former Bishop of Armidale, Most Rev. Henry Kennedy; His Lordship the Bishop of Bathurst, Most Rev. Patrick Dougherty; His Lordship the Bishop of Maitland, Most Rev. Leo Clarke; the Abbot President of the Subiaco Benedictine Congregation, Rome, Dom Gilbert Jones, OSB; the Abbot of San Paolo Fuori le Mura, Rome, Dom Luca Collino, OSB; the Abbot of Downside, Dom Charles Fitzgerald-Lombard, OSB; the Prior Administrator of Holy Trinity Abbey, New Norcia, Very Rev. Fr. Placid Spearritt, OSB; the Rector of the Venerable English College, Rome, Mgr. John Kennedy; the Rector of the Irish College, Rome, Mgr. Sean Brady; and the Prioress of St. Dominic's Priory, Stone, Sr. M. Rupert Fitzpatrick, OP.

I am also grateful to the following archivists and archival assistants: Mgr. Sarkis Tabar, Archivist of the Congregation for the Evangelization of Peoples, Rome, and his assistants, Sig. Giovanni Fosci and Sr. Mary Joachim Fernandez,

CRR; Rev. Fr. Josef Metzler, OMI, Prefect of the Secret Vatican Archive, Rome; Dom Mayeul de Breulle, OSB, Archivist General of the Subiaco Benedictine Congregation, Rome; Dom Stefano Baiocchi, OSB, Archivist of the Abbey of San Paolo fuori le Mura, Rome; Rev. Fr. Ferdinando Rojo, OSA, Archivist General of the Augustinian Order, Rome; Rev. Fr. Enrique Bernel, CP, Archivist General of the Passionist Congregation, Rome; Rev. Fr. Theo Kok, SM, Archivist General of the Marist Fathers, Rome; Br. Peter Fogarty, CFC, Archivist General of the Christian Brothers, Rome; Mgr. John Hanly, Archivist of the Irish College, Rome; Mr. Wyn Thomas, Archivist of the Venerable English College, Rome; Rev. Fr. Ian Dickie, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Westminster; the staff of the Public Record Office, London; Rev. Fr. Joseph Boardman, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Cardiff; Rev. Fr. Petroc Howell and Rev. Fr. Peter Dennison of the Archives of the Archdiocese of Birmingham; Dom Phillip Jebb, OSB, Archivist of Downside Abbey; Sr. M. Crispin Mitchell, OP, Archivist of St. Dominic's Priory, Stone, and her assistant, Sr. M. Hugh Shayler, OP; Mr. David Sheehy, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Dublin; Rev. Fr. Christopher O'Dwyer, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Cashel; Rev. Fr. Kevin Rafferty, CM, Archivist of All Hallows' College, Dublin; Sr. Francis Brigid Flannery, RSC, Archivist General of the Irish Sisters of Charity, Dublin; Mr. John Cummins, the Archivist of the Archdiocese of Sydney, his successor, Br. Alex Hall, CFC, and Ms. Chantal Celjan, the Historical Records Archivist; Sr. Marie Gerard McGlynn, SGS, and Sr. Ursula Trower, SGS, of the General Archives of the Sisters of the Good Samaritan, Glebe; Sr. Genevieve Campbell, Archivist General of the Australian Sisters of Charity, Potts Point; Rev. Fr. Denis Martin, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Brisbane, and Mrs. Doss Gilmour, the Archives Secretary; Sr. M. Raphael Coady, RSM, Acting Archivist of the Archdiocese of Perth, and her assistant, Sr. M. Theresa Quinlivan, RSM; Mrs. Wendy Pearce, Archivist of the Holy Trinity Abbey, New Norcia; Mrs. Tess Schmulde, Secretary to the

Bishop of Armidale; Mrs. Rosemary Dusselaar, Archivist of the Diocese of Bathurst; Mr. Michael Sternbeck, Archivist of the Diocese of Maitland; Fr. John Kearney, Chairman of the Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission, his successor, Rev. Fr. Ian Waters, and the museum attendant, Mr. Les McCarthy; Sr. Marie Therese Foale, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Adelaide; and Fr. Brian Maher, Archivist of the Archdiocese of Canberra and Goulburn.

Further co-operation was received from the following librarians and libraries: Rev. Fr. Willi Henkel, OMI, Librarian of the Pontifical Urban University *de Propaganda Fide*, Rome; Rev. Fr. Ignatius Fennesy, OFM, Librarian of the Franciscan Studies Centre, Dublin; Mr. Hans Arns, Librarian of St. Patrick's College, Manly; Mr. Paul Brunton, Manuscripts Librarian of the Mitchell Library, Sydney; the staffs of the National Library of Ireland, Dublin, the library of the Pontifical University of St. Thomas, Rome, the National Library of Australia, Canberra, the Chifley and Menzies Libraries at the Australian National University, Canberra, the Fisher Library of the University of Sydney and the library of the Columban Missiology Institute, Turrumurra.

The following individuals helped me by suggesting and arranging access to archival collections, giving advice on procedural matters, discussing historical and other issues arising from my thesis topic or obtaining information about archival and bibliographical references: His Excellency the Apostolic Pro-Nuncio in Australia, Archbishop Franco Brambilla; the late Prof. Eugene Kamenka, Head of the History of Ideas Unit of the Research School of Social Sciences at the Australian National University, Canberra; Mr. Anthony Cahill, Senior Lecturer in History at the University of Sydney; Sr. M. Xavier Compton, SGS, of the Archives of the Archdiocese of Sydney; Sr. Mary Shanahan, RSCJ, Principal of Sancta Sophia College at the University of Sydney; Br. Terence Kavenagh, OSB, of the Benedictine Monastery at Arcadia; Rev. Dr. Neil Byrne, Professor of Ecclesiastical History at the Pius XII Provincial Seminary, Banyo; Rev. Dr. Thomas Boland, Historian of the

Archdiocese of Brisbane; the staff of the Secretary's Office of the Department of History at the University of New South Wales; Rev. Prof. Michael Tavuzzi, OP, of the Faculty of Philosophy at the Pontifical University of St. Thomas, Rome; Rev. Dr. Carlo Longo, OP, Secretary of the Dominican Historical Institute, Rome; Rev. Fr. Ralph Wiltgen, SVD, of the Generalate of the Divine Word Missionaries, Rome; Br. Cyril Coonahan, OSA, of the Generalate of the Augustinian Order, Rome; Rev. Fr. Francis Xavier Martin, OSA, of the Augustinian Friars, Dublin; Rev. Fr. Hugh Fenning, OP, Historian of the Irish Dominican Province; and Rev. Fr. Vincent Leahy, OP, of St. Saviour's Priory, Dublin.

Most of the translations from original Latin, Italian and French documents used in this study were prepared by me but it was occasionally a welcome relief to find that this work had already been done. I am therefore grateful to the following translators: Sr. M. Xavier Compton, SGS; Sr. M. Peter Damian McKinley, SGS; Sr. Philomena Gallagher, SGS; Mgr. Vincent Tiggeman and Rev. Fr. Brian McBride. Thanks are also due to Rev. Fr. David Barry, OSB, of Holy Trinity Abbey, New Norcia, for Spanish translation and Ms. Micaela Vincent of the German Department of the Australian National University, Canberra, for German.

Thanks are due to Mrs Renata Stinziani and Mrs. Lisa Dalmolin of the Thesis Photocopying Service at the Australian National University, Mr. Phillip Gee of the Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, and Mr. Jozef Zawartko, Director of Photo-Pol Pty. Ltd., Canberra, for advice about copying and illustrations, and to Mr. Paul Harker, an undergraduate Arts student at the Australian National University, for his assistance with proof reading, collating and other matters relating to final production.

I am grateful for much forbearance and assistance received from the staff of the Division of Historical Studies within the Research School of Social Sciences at the Australian National University, the Heads of the Division

during the years of my candidature, Prof. Ken Inglis, and his successor, Prof. Paul Bourke, and the Divisional Administrator, Mrs. Beverley Gallina. Ms. Janice Aldridge, Mrs. Anthea Bundock and Ms. Helen McNabb supplied invaluable advice about word processing, as did Miss Norma Chin of the School Services, Research Schools of Social Sciences and Pacific Studies.

I acknowledge accommodation afforded during field trips by St. Patrick's College, Manly; the Blessed Sacrament Fathers, Sydney; Benedictine communities at New Norcia, London and Downside; Dominican communities at Rome, Oxford, Dublin, Sydney, Brisbane, Armidale, Maitland, Melbourne and Perth; and by Rev. Fr. Bernard McCumiskey, Parish Priest of Dalton-Kingsland, London. I am grateful for support received from the Priors Provincial of the Australasian Dominicans during the years in which I have been engaged on this project, Very Rev. Fr. Nicholas Punch, OP, Very Rev. Dr. David Halstead, OP, and Very Rev. Dr. Mark O'Brien, OP, from the Rector of Studies at the time of its commencement, Rev. Dr. Denis Minns, OP, and from the superiors and communities of the Dominican houses in Canberra in which I have resided during its progress, Blackfriars Priory, Watson, and John XXIII College at the Australian National University.

Finally, I should like to thank my adviser, Prof. Oliver MacDonagh, formerly of the Division of Historical Studies within the Research School of Social Sciences at the Australian National University, for his advice about readings on Irish religious history and his comments on chapters of my thesis. I am conscious of a big debt of gratitude to my supervisors, Prof. Barry Smith and Rev. Dr. John Eddy, SJ, of the Division of Historical Studies, and Prof. John Molony, of the History Department of the Arts Faculty at the Australian National University. Prof. Smith has been a never-failing source of constructive criticism, advice and encouragement throughout almost the entire period of my candidature.

Any errors of fact or interpretation that might be found in this thesis are entirely my responsibility.

ABSTRACT

The centralizing trend in the government of the Catholic Church in the nineteenth century ensured that the deeply-divided Catholics of colonial Australia turned to Rome for a verdict on their many disagreements. At the centre of much of this conflict were the English Benedictine monk, the Archbishop of Sydney, John Bede Polding, and his ambitious scheme for a distinctively Australian, socially integrated Catholicism unified by a monastic administrative framework and elevated by monastic spiritual culture. This scheme collided with certain realities of Catholic life in the Australian colonies: rapid growth, a correspondingly urgent need for basic, flexible pastoral structures and a pronounced, increasingly self-conscious Irish complexion.

If Polding's vision were to be implemented, the approval of the arm of the papal bureaucracy responsible for the mission territories, the Sacred Congregation *de Propaganda Fide*, was vital. Polding came closest to this goal in 1842 when the Congregation accepted his proposals for a general re-organization of the Australian Church, including making St. Mary's cathedral, Sydney, a monastic cathedral. At this stage Polding enjoyed considerable prestige at Rome because of his pioneering work.

However, his doctrinaire pursuit of the total monastery-centred approach after his return to Australia generated continual friction. He alienated non-Benedictine religious orders and had to face rebellion among his own monks and fierce opposition to his policies from elements of the clergy and laity, often fired by a sense of Irish grievance.

As the Sydney Benedictine establishment disintegrated through insufficient recruiting, defections, squabbling and scandal and as complaints and alternative suggestions for the development of the Australian Church mounted up in the *Propaganda* Congregation, Roman officials became

increasingly sceptical about Polding's plans. Apart from occasional minor successes, all of the official decisions made by the Congregation about Australian affairs in the 1850s and 1860s went against Polding's recommendations. Most significantly, Rome rejected his submission that the Archdiocese of Sydney be committed permanently to Benedictine rule and assigned the new bishoprics carved out of the Archdiocese from 1859 onwards to assertive, independent Irishmen totally opposed to Polding's vision of the Australian Church and who, relying on the supreme influence at Rome of their mentor, Cardinal Cullen of Dublin, were able to prevail repeatedly over Polding in competition for Roman favour.

At the personal level, the difficulties that Polding encountered in his dealings with Rome were magnified by his strained relationship with Pope Pius IX and the head of the *Propaganda* Congregation, Cardinal Barnabò. Frustrated by continual, painful disappointments and upset by often unfair and rough *Propaganda* judgements, Polding steadily lost confidence in the Roman system and had become utterly embittered by the late 1860s.

Unexpectedly, by the time of his retirement in 1874 Polding won a notable final victory at Rome by securing the successor of his choice, his fellow English Benedictine, Roger Bede Vaughan. Motivated by an appreciation of the now septuagenarian Polding's pressing need for assistance and worried about domination of the Australian episcopate by the militant Cullenite Irish, Roman policy shifted towards a new balance.

ABBREVIATIONS

AAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Adelaide
ACAP	Archives of the Archdiocese of Perth
ACR	<i>Australasian Catholic Record</i>
<i>Acta</i>	<i>Acta Sacrae Congregationis de Propaganda Fide</i> (CEPA fondo)
ADA	Archives of the Diocese of Armidale
ADB	<i>Australian Dictionary of Biography</i> . D.Pike <i>et al.</i> (gen. eds.), Melbourne, 13 Vols. 1966-1993
AHCA	Archives of All Hallows' College, Dublin
AHR	<i>American Historical Review</i>
APM	<i>Archivio dei Padri Maristi</i> , Rome (Archives of the Generalate of the Marist Fathers)
ASV	<i>Archivio Segreto Vaticano</i>
BAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Brisbane
BDA	Archives of the Diocese of Bathurst
BirmAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Birmingham
BL	Battye Library, Perth
CAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Cardiff
CBA	Archives of the Generalate of the Christian Brothers, Rome
CEPA	Archives of the Congregation for the Evangelization of Peoples, Rome
CC	Contemporary copy
CE	<i>Catholic Encyclopedia</i> . C.Herbertmann <i>et al.</i> (eds.), New York, 15 vols., 1907-1912
CGAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Canberra and Goulburn
CH	<i>Church History</i>

- CHR *Catholic Historical Review*
- Compendio *Compendio di Storia della Sacra Congregazione per l'Evangelizzazione dei Popoli o 'De Propaganda Fide' 1622-1972: 350 Anni al Servizio delle Missioni, Rome, 1973*
- CPA Archives of the Generalate of the Passionist Congregation, Rome
- DAA Archives of the Archdiocese of Dublin
- DBI *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani. Rome, 42 volumes thus far, 1960-1973*
- DC *Dictionnaire des Cardinaux. J.-P.Migne (ed.), Paris, 1857*
- DE *Dizionario Ecclesiastico. A.Mercati et al. (eds.), Turin, 3 vols., 1953-1958*
- DESE *Dizionario di Erudizione Storico-Ecclesiastico. S.Moroni, (comp.), Venice, 53 vols. 1840-1851*
- DNB *Dictionary of National Biography. L.Stephen & S.Lee (eds.), London, 22 vols., 1908-1909*
- Documents *Documents in Australian Catholic History. P.O'Farrell (ed.), London, 2 vols., 1969*
- DownAA Archives of Downside Abbey
- EC *Enciclopedia Cattolica. G.Pizzardo et al. (eds.), Rome, 12 vols., 1949-1954*
- FJ *Freeman's Journal*
- GSSA Archives of the Generalate of the Good Samaritan Sisters, Sydney
- HS *Historical Studies*
- HSANZ *Historical Studies Australia and New Zealand*
- ICA Archives of the Irish College, Rome
- JACHS *Journal of the Australian Catholic Historical Society*
- JEH *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*

LDB	<i>Lettere e Decreti della Sacra Congregazione e Biglietti di Monsignor Segretario (CEPA fondo)</i>
LDJH	<i>Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman. S.Dessain et al., (eds.), London, 31 vols., 1961-1984</i>
MDA	Archives of the Diocese of Maitland
MDHC	Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission
<i>Memoria Rerum</i>	<i>Sacrae Congregationis de Propaganda Fide Memoria Rerum 1622-1972. J.Metzler (ed.), Rome, 3 vols. 1975</i>
MF	Microfilm
ML	Mitchell Library, Sydney
NCE	<i>New Catholic Encyclopedia. W.J.McDonald (ed.-in-chief), New York, 17 Vols., 1967-1979</i>
nd	no date
nf(f)	no folio number(s)
NLA	National Library of Australia, Canberra
NNA	Archives of New Norcia Abbey
np(p)	no page number(s)
ny	no year
PC	Photocopy
PRO	Public Record Office, London
RC	Religious Clergy (SAA section)
RSCDA	Archives of the Generalate of the Irish Religious Sisters of Charity, Dublin
SAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Sydney
SAWA	State Archives of Western Australia
<i>SC-Oceania</i>	<i>Scritture originali riferite nei Congressi-Oceania (CEPA fondo)</i>

SOCG	<i>Scritture Originali riferite nelle Congregazioni Generali (CEPA fondo)</i>
SPFLMA	Archives of the Monastery of <i>San Paolo fuori le Mura</i> , Rome
SPM	Library of St. Patrick's College, Manly
SPM-DownAA/MF	Microfilm of material from the Archives of Downside Abbey in the library of St. Patrick's College, Manly
TC	Typescript copy
<i>Udienze</i>	<i>Udienze del Nostro Signore (CEPA fondo)</i>
WAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Westminster

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<u>Caption</u>	<u>Following page</u>
Pope Pius IX, reigned 1846-1878.	14
John Bede Polding, OSB, Bishop of Hiero-Caesarea-in-Lydia and Vicar Apostolic of New Holland and Van Diemen's Land, 1834-1842, Archbishop of Sydney, 1842-1877.	24
St. Mary's Cathedral, Sydney.	26
The palace of the Sacred Congregation <i>de Propaganda Fide</i> , Rome, headquarters of papal direction of the mission churches.	47
Alessandro Barnabò. He was the Cardinal Prefect General of the Sacred Congregation <i>de Propaganda Fide</i> from 1856 to 1874.	57
Cardinal Charles Acton, Polding's agent in Rome	67
Thomas Grant as Bishop of Southwark. He was formerly Rector of the English College, Rome, and Polding's agent after the death of Cardinal Acton.	67
Mgr. Tobias Kirby, Rector of the Irish College in Rome, and agent of the Cullenite Irish Australian bishops.	68
Pope Pius IX with his <i>Anticamera segreta</i> . Mgr. George Talbot is standing immediately to the Pope's left and behind the chair.	75
A circular letter of the <i>Propaganda</i> Congregation of 1868 directing missionary bishops to communicate with Rome only in Latin or Italian or, if necessary, French.	78
The younger John Bede Polding, around 1840.	87
Cardinal Castruccio Castracane degli Antelminelli, who often acted as <i>ponente</i> for Australian affairs in the 1840s.	89
Pope Gregory XVI, reigned 1830-1846. This Benedictine Pope encouraged Polding's monastic plans for the Australian Church.	91
Cardinal Giacomo Fransoni, Prefect General of the Sacred Congregation <i>de Propaganda Fide</i> , 1834-1856.	98
Fransoni's letter to Polding of 5 May 1844 asking him to allow the Marists to establish a supply depot in Sydney.	106

	xvi
First page of Debreul's memorandum to Cardinal Fransoni criticizing Polding's treatment of the Sydney Marists.	109
Jean-Claude Colin, founder and first superior general of the Marists.	111
Henry Gregory states the reasons for assigning the Archdiocese of Sydney to the perpetual care of the Benedictines.	117
Archdeacon John McEncroe. This senior Sydney priest wrote to the Pope to urge that the only way of saving the faith of Irish Australian Catholics was the immediate division of the Archdiocese of Sydney and the importation of Irish bishops and priests.	119
The title page of Cardinal Patrizi's 1852 <i>ponenza</i> which ended Polding's hope for papal endorsement for his plan for the Australian Church.	121
John Brady, first Bishop of Perth. Only a personal confrontation with Polding persuaded Brady to submit to papal authority.	130
Pope Pius IX around 1854.	139
Cardinal Costantino Patrizi, <i>ponente</i> at the cardinals' assemblies of 10 May 1852 which decided against a perpetual Benedictine succession in Sydney and 2 April 1855 which approved experimental statutes for St. Mary's monastery.	141
Through articles and letters in the <i>Freeman's Journal</i> , William Augustine Duncan blamed the Benedictines for the problems of the Church in Sydney.	144
First page of Polding's letter to Cardinal Barnabò, dated 10 June 1858, asking for a papal condemnation of the <i>Freeman's Journal</i> .	148
The first Bishop of Melbourne, James Alipius Goold, OSA	152
Opening of the lay appeal to Pope Pius IX, dated 13 April 1859.	158
Writing to Polding, Cardinal Barnabò sidesteps the lay appeal by pointing out that it does not follow the correct form.	161
Abbot Henry Gregory Gregory, OSB, Prior of St. Mary's Monastery and Vicar General of the Archdiocese of Sydney.	166
Paul Cullen, Archbishop of Dublin, 1852-1878, and a cardinal from 1866. He became increasingly involved in Australian affairs in the 1850s and 1860s. His opinions carried great weight in Rome.	168
Robert Willson, Bishop of Hobart. He disliked Gregory intensely and helped to destroy Roman confidence in him.	171

- William Bernard Ullathorne. Because of his previous Australian experience, Cardinal Barnabò asked the Bishop of Birmingham to analyse the state of the Church in Sydney at the end of the 1850s. Ullathorne recommended the recall of Gregory. 174
- The first page of Ullathorne's report of 16 December 1859 176
- Barnabò writes to Polding to explain the decision to remove Gregory. 186
- Patrick Bermingham. In Rome and Dublin this Irish Australian missionary priest, a pioneer in the Yass district, was severely critical of Benedictine rule. Polding tried to neutralize his influence. 188
- Thomas Brown, Bishop of Newport and Menevia. This English Benedictine co-ordinated the European end of the campaign to rehabilitate Gregory. 191
- John Kenny and Richard Walsh. These two Irish Australian priests placed submissions before the *Propaganda* Congregation in defence of Gregory. 194
- Mgr. George Talbot de Malahide, a member of the papal household and confidant of Pius IX. He intervened in Australian affairs. He was made a consultor of the *Propaganda* Congregation in 1866. 198
- The Bishop of Adelaide, Patrick Bonaventure Geoghegan, OSF, failed in his Roman mission on behalf of Gregory. 200
- Pope Pius IX with snuff box. A photograph taken in the mid-1860s. 203
- The first page of Bishop Goold's submission on the division of the Archdiocese of Sydney. The Roman officials followed Goold's advice closely. 214
- Cardinal Ludovico Altieri, responsible for the presentation of the 1859 report on the creation of new dioceses in Australia. 217
- The title page of the 1859 *ponenza*. It resulted in recommendations on the appointment of new bishops in Australia which tried to strike a balance, but this was overturned by the Pope. 219
- James Quinn, appointed to the newly-established Diocese of Brisbane in 1859, was the first of the Cullenite Irish bishops to be sent to Australia. His appointment was a major setback for Polding, showing that Rome was being guided by others. 223

- Barnabò rebukes Polding in September 1863 for appointing the 'Englishmen', Austin Sheehy and James Hanly, as administrators of the predominantly Irish dioceses of Armidale and Goulburn. 228
- Polding explains that Sheehy and Hanly are Irish. 230
- Dr. John Forrest, Rector of St. John's College at the University of Sydney and a leading critic of the Benedictine regime. 235
- Cardinal Karl August von Reisach. 238
- Von Reisach's *ponenza* of May 1865 contained devastating criticisms of the state of the Australian Catholic Church. 242
- Dean James Hanly. As reported to Rome by his enemies, Hanly's alleged defects, including an addiction to kangaroo hunting, cost him the Diocese of Goulburn. 244
- Pope Pius IX dispenses Polding from the obligation of his *ad limina* visit, due around 1865. Polding went anyway, hoping to exercise more influence on the appointment of bishops to the sees carved out of the Archdiocese of Sydney 251
- Annibale Capalti, Secretary General of the *Propaganda* Congregation, 1861-1868. 256
- The *Propaganda* decree, *Quum ad catholicae Ecclesiae utilitatem* of 19 May 1866, applies the American norms for the nomination of bishops to the Australian Church, weakening Polding's role. 258
- The papal Secretary of State, Cardinal Giacomo Antonelli, invited Polding to dinner on Holy Thursday evening, 1866. 260
- William Lanigan, Bishop of Goulburn, 1867-1900. Recommended by Polding, he turned out to be a strong opponent of the Archbishop's policies. 270
- The first page of Barnabò's letter to Polding, dated 30 April 1867, detailing the allegations against Bishop-elect Austin Sheehy. 274
- Austin Sheehy, OSB, Vicar General of the Archdiocese of Sydney. His consecration as Bishop of Bethsaida *in partibus infidelium* was cancelled as a result of a campaign in which the prime mover was James, Murray, Bishop of Maitland. 278

- James Murray, Bishop of Maitland, the main conduit for gossip about Sheehy to Rome and entrusted by Barnabò with the principal investigation into the affair. 278
- The clergy of the Archdiocese of Sydney petition the Pope not to accept Sheehy's resignation. 282
- Vincenzo Colletti, private secretary and chaplain to Polding. 286
- Matthew Quinn, first Bishop of Bathurst. His exuberant rejoicing over the papal victory at Mentana in November 1867, as conveyed to the *Propaganda* Congregation by Kirby, was meant to contrast with Barsanti's alleged sympathy for Garibaldi. 288
- James Murray's report to Rome on the Sheehy affair, 24 March 1868. 292
- Barnabò directs Polding in April 1868 to convene a provincial council as soon as possible. 298
- Archbishop Giovanni Simeoni, Secretary General of the *Propaganda* Congregation, 1868-1875. One of his first acts was to present to the Pope in September 1869 the Congregation's recommendation that Timothy O'Mahony be appointed Bishop of Armidale. This portrait shows Simeoni a few years later when he had been made a cardinal and Prefect of the Congregation. 304
- Cardinal Luigi Bilio praised an harassed Polding for his efforts in organizing the 1869 second Australian provincial council in Melbourne. 307
- Archdeacon John Rigney. His overseas trip in 1870 provoked an outbreak of paranoia among the Australian Cullenite bishops. 309
- Archbishop John Bede Polding in old age. 313
- Charles Henry Davis, OSB, first Bishop of Maitland and first coadjutor to the Archbishop of Sydney. 317
- On 28 July 1866 Polding wrote to Barnabò from London requesting Roger Bede Vaughan as his coadjutor. 322
- Talbot writes to Capalti opposing the removal of Vaughan from England and warning against allowing the Australian Church to become either a Benedictine or an Irish preserve. 324
- Henry Gregory presents arguments to Barnabò for assigning Vaughan to Australia. 332
- Archbishop (later Cardinal) Henry Edward Manning of Westminster. He fought hard to keep Roger Bede Vaughan in England. 334

- Cardinal Jean-Baptiste Pitra, patristics scholar and a member of the *Propaganda* Congregation. 335
- The title page of the 1873 *ponenza* which recommended the appointment of Roger Bede Vaughan as Coadjutor Archbishop of Sydney with right of succession. 336
- Polding expresses his gratitude to the Pope, Barnabò and the *Propaganda* cardinals for the Vaughan appointment. 339
- First page of the Australian Cullenite bishops' May 1873 protest to the *Propaganda* Congregation against the appointment of Vaughan. 342
- Roger Bede Vaughan, OSB, titular Archbishop of Nazianzen *in partibus infidelium* and Coadjutor Archbishop of Sydney, 1873-1877. He became Archbishop in his own right on Polding's death in 1877. He himself died in 1883. 350
- Converted by Vaughan's negative judgement against the Sydney Benedictines, Murray promises Barnabò that he will co-operate with the Coadjutor. 353
- Cardinal Alessandro Barnabò died on 24 February 1874. He had played a decisive part in the shaping of Australian Catholicism. 356
- The Irish College, Rome. 367
- The palace of the Sacred Congregation *de Propaganda Fide*. This illustration shows the entrance to the seminary for students from missionary countries run by the Congregation, the Urban College *de Propaganda Fide*, facing on to the Piazza di Spagna. 371

INTRODUCTION

The aim of this thesis is to cast further light on the nineteenth-century origins of the Australian Catholic Church.

The factors which have shaped Catholicism in this country can be grouped into three categories. Firstly, the domestic category pertains to how Catholic migrants coped with the physical and cultural uncertainty of their adopted land and preserved and adapted their religious values. The second collection of causal factors is the British-Isles connection. Catholic Christianity in Australia was a direct import, mainly from Ireland and England, the people being largely Irish while the ecclesiastical leadership was English, at least in the upper echelons of the foundation church in Sydney for the first generation. The third category of influence revolves around the fact that the Catholic Church in Australia was the regional branch of an international religious organization with headquarters in Rome and presided over by the bishop of that city, the Pope.

This thesis is concerned with the third category. The first category, the domestic, has been well served by the upsurge of writing about Australian Catholic history over the last 30 years or so which has concentrated on national, regional, local and biographical issues, looking at more or less self-contained, internal themes. The second category, Ireland and England as the principal human and cultural sources for colonial Catholicism in this country, has been less adequately dealt with, although there has been useful work done on Irish migration and transplanted Irish culture and on the English Benedictines in Australia.

Our understanding of the Roman factor as the third level of influence on the Australian Church is slight. Because this factor was at least as important as the other two and because it has not attracted the attention of historians of religion it deserves, this thesis addresses itself to the deficiency and seeks to

contribute to filling in a gap in Australian historiography: the formulation of papal policy towards the Catholic missions in colonial times.

I investigate how Catholicism in Australia fitted into the wider, international Catholic scene, how the evolution of the Australian Church was shaped by developments in its European heartland from where it sprang and was sustained during its infancy. Australian Catholicism grew up in a century that saw a shift in the polity of the Catholic Church generally, involving a new understanding of the exercise of authority. There was an increasing centralization on Rome. The Church in Australia was drawn centripetally into the ultramontane vortex and was totally dependent on Rome as the locus of power and decision-making in all but minor local matters (and sometimes even there, too). The earliest decisions about administrative arrangements for the pastoral care of Catholics transported to the penal colony of New South Wales were made by officials at the papal court and their successors throughout the nineteenth century retained control over all subsequent significant developments.

John Molony in his *The Roman Mould of the Australian Catholic Church* (1969) showed how the embryonic Australian Catholic consciousness was thoroughly Romanized by its sympathy for Pope Pius IX in his struggles with European liberalism and Italian nationalism and by the advance of the ultramontane mentality through the Church at large. He argued that, among the Irish Australian bishops, Romanism was more significant in the long run than the Hibernian factor. The question that this thesis examines is different from Molony's focus. I analyse the processes of decision-making that were carried on at Rome itself and their dynamic interplay with developments in Australia. To put the distinction between Molony's concern and mine simply: his concern was Australian attitudes towards Rome whereas I am interested in Roman attitudes towards Australia. Of course, there was a dynamic connection between these two levels in that the Romanization of the

outlook of Australian Catholics made them receptive to Roman direction. At the same time, I provide evidence to support the counter-thesis of Patrick O'Farrell in his *The Catholic Church and Community in Australia: A History* (1977) that the Hibernianism of Irish bishops in Australia was well to the foreground in their thinking and drew them into severe criticisms, at least in private, of Roman policy when it contradicted their goals.

The purpose of this work is to describe and explain how Roman centralism operated in the ecclesiastical government of Australia. Knowledge of this phenomenon is required if we are to better understand the historical development and social influence of the Australian branch of centralized and sometimes authoritarian institution like the modern Catholic Church with its concentration of decision-making operations in the topmost level of government.

Historians working in Australian Catholic studies are, of course, aware of the chain of command that existed within the Church but have tended to assume it as background rather than to examine it as an issue in its own right. Many previous studies have referred to Roman intervention in Australian affairs, but usually only in passing. A few have looked at particular episodes in some detail, such as Margaret Pawsey's *The Demon of Discord* (1982) on Patrick Dunne's appeal to Rome in 1858 against his bishop, James Goold of Melbourne, and Mary Shanahan's *Out of Time, Out of Place* (1970) on Rome's recall of Archbishop Polding's Vicar General, Henry Gregory, in 1860. We also have Ralph Wiltgen's magisterial *The Foundation of the Roman Catholic Church in Oceania 1825-1850* (1979) on the establishment of ecclesiastical structures in the South-west Pacific and Australia. My aim is to provide a systematic account of the formulation of Roman attitudes, policies and decisions towards the Catholic community in Australia over an extended period of time.

As a study in the relationship between the centre and the periphery in nineteenth-century Catholic history, my thesis will not be concerned with all types of Roman decisions about Australia in the same proportion in which they were actually made. Such an exercise would be tedious because the bulk of these decisions was about relatively routine and mundane matters. Instead, I elucidate my question by looking at the role papal authority played when *conflict* occurred among Australia's Catholics. Conflict throws authority into sharp relief and poses challenges to styles of government and the creation of policies. It makes people acutely conscious of where power is located and makes them desirous of acquiring the support of authority figures. It is important to keep in mind that a major role of the Roman Church within the Catholic community, then as now, was to function as a court of appeal. A remarkably disputatious people, Australian Catholics availed themselves freely of this court in the nineteenth century. In a frontier society there was wide scope for disagreement because the structures, character and identity of the national Church were still being formed.

This thesis investigates a number of disputes that broke out among colonial Catholics and were sufficiently serious to be appealed to Rome. Originally, I planned to deal with the entire Australian Church during practically the whole of the Benedictine period, from Archbishop Polding's appointment as Vicar Apostolic of New Holland in 1834 to the death of Archbishop Vaughan, in 1883. However, it proved impossible to press this immense topic into the confines of a doctoral thesis. A series of geographical and chronological modifications has reduced the scope to the relationship between Rome and the Archdiocese of Sydney from 1842 until 1874 although, since the Archbishop of Sydney was the leading churchman as Metropolitan of the Australian Province in that period, wider issues and other dioceses also enter the picture. The year 1842 is significant because it saw the foundation of the regular Catholic ecclesiastical hierarchy in Australia. Before that year

Rome's role was largely one of establishing administrative structures, which topic has already been fully treated in Dr. Wiltgen's study referred to earlier and in Dr. Ian Burns' canon law thesis, 'The Foundation of the Hierarchy in Australia 1804-1854' (1954). 1874 provides a convenient cut-off point because it was the year both of Polding's retirement from public life and the termination of the metropolitan monopoly of Sydney with the creation of a new province centred on Melbourne. The focus of my study is the business dealings that conflict required Archbishop Polding to enter into with the Roman authorities. Several kinds of conflict were involved, but principally the titanic clash between, on the one hand, Polding's idealistic vision of a cosmopolitan Church formed by monastic culture and, on the other, Irish pragmatism and nationalism.

Within the papal curia decision-making about Australia was located in a bureau known as the Sacred Congregation *de Propaganda Fide*, one of a series of congregations whose function it was to advise the Pope on the various areas of the life of the Church, more or less equivalent to the ministries in a modern secular government. The Congregation was responsible for co-ordinating the Catholic missionary effort and for supervising the churches in those countries where ordinary ecclesiastical structures were not yet in existence or only in their infancy. Officially classified as a mission territory, Australia was under the jurisdiction of this organization throughout the period covered by this thesis. The Congregation was equipped with extensive powers. All Australian Catholics were literally at the mercy of this organization, from the meanest Irish convict to His Grace the Archbishop Metropolitan himself, as the latter was to be reminded repeatedly to his chagrin. This thesis is basically an investigation into decision-making about the Australian Church within the Congregation *de Propaganda Fide*.

Because the Congregation was essentially a bureaucratic institution, a sub-theme will be how bureaucracies behave in concrete historical contexts. On the

ecclesiastical plane, Australia's Catholics were in a kind of metropolitan-colonial relationship with Rome parallel to that of Australian colonial societies generally on the civil plane with London. At the ecclesiastical no less than at the civil levels, that relationship was expressed through subordination to administrative machinery and control.

I have also tried to throw light on the men who comprised the staff of the Congregation and who were responsible for making decisions about the shape and future of the Australian Church. The *Propaganda* cardinals during the period covered by this study were all Europeans, most of them Italians, and many of them members of aristocratic families, such as the Altieri, Barberini, Patrizi and Riario-Sforza. The officials, all of them Italians, are often shadowy figures (in true bureaucratic fashion), the more so the lower the position they occupied on the administrative ladder. The most important of them was Cardinal Alessandro Barnabò, the head of the Congregation for most of the period covered by this thesis. His death in 1874 is another reason for making that year the terminus of this study. Unfortunately there is no biography of this influential nineteenth-century churchman who was a member of Pope Pius IX's inner circle of friends and confidants, second in favour only to the Secretary of State, Cardinal Giacomo Antonelli. Barnabò was probably the single most significant individual determiner of papal policy towards the Australian missions and Polding's tortured relationship with him is a major connecting theme in my thesis. I also show how Pius IX himself was involved directly in the affairs of Australia.

The raw material for this study is correspondence between the Congregation *de Propaganda Fide* and Polding and other Australian bishops, priests, religious and lay people and others in England, Ireland and Europe who were concerned with Australian matters. The key repository is the vast but as yet virtually unquarried archive in Rome of the Congregation for the Evangelization of Peoples, as the Congregation *de Propaganda Fide* is now

called. Part of this collection, the incoming letters up to 1878, is on microfilm in the National Library of Australia in Canberra and the Mitchell Library in Sydney.

The Irish and English parties in Australia and their supporters in Ireland and England lobbied the Congregation through the Irish and English Colleges in Rome. The archive of the Irish College contains a large collection of material, mainly letters from Cullenite Australian bishops to the Rector, Tobias Kirby. The Benedictine monastery of San Paolo fuori le Mura has the papers of Bernard Smith who was Polding's main Roman agent. The archives of the Roman generalates of religious orders active in Australia in the nineteenth century have also supplied useful information, the Benedictines, Augustinians, Passionists, Marists and Christian Brothers. The Secret Vatican Archive holds official documentation relating to the establishment of dioceses and the appointment of bishops in Australia.

English and Irish ecclesiastics also participated in debates about Australia and there are important records in dioceses, seminaries and religious houses in Britain and Ireland, the dioceses of Westminster, Birmingham, Cardiff, Dublin and Cashel, Downside Abbey near Bath and All Hallows' College and the Religious Sisters of Charity and the Franciscan Friars in Dublin. There is a small quantity of material in the Public Record Office, London.

In Australia the richest sources are the archives of dioceses founded before 1874, Sydney, Melbourne, Adelaide, Brisbane, Canberra, Perth, Maitland, Bathurst and Armidale. Other useful collections are the archives of the Benedictine Abbey of New Norcia and of the Good Samaritan Sisters and Sisters of Charity in Sydney, the Mitchell Library, Sydney, the library of St. Patrick's College, Manly, and the manuscript collection at the National Library, Canberra.