### Power Politics and State Formation in the Twentieth Century

The Dynamics of Recognition

From Kurdistan to Somaliland, Xinjiang to South Yemen, all secessionist movements hope to secure newly independent states of their own. Most will not prevail. The existing scholarly wisdom provides one explanation for success, based on authority and control within the nascent states. With the aid of an expansive new dataset and detailed case studies, this book provides an alternative account. It argues that the strongest members of the international community have a decisive influence over whether today's secessionists become countries tomorrow and that, most often, their support is conditioned on parochial political considerations.

**Bridget Coggins** is an International Affairs Fellow at the Council on Foreign Relations, sponsored by The Asan Institute for Policy Studies. Her research examines the intersections of domestic conflict, international security, and international order. Her work has appeared in journals including *International Organization*, *Journal of Peace Research*, *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, and *Foreign Policy* magazine, as well as in several scholarly edited volumes. She is a graduate of the University of Minnesota, where she received her BA in international relations, and of Ohio State University, where she received a PhD in political science. Previously, Coggins taught in the government department at Dartmouth College.

# Power Politics and State Formation in the Twentieth Century

The Dynamics of Recognition

**BRIDGET COGGINS** 

Council on Foreign Relations and The Asan Institute for Policy Studies



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107047358

© Bridget Coggins 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Coggins, Bridget.

Power politics and state formation in the twentieth century : the dynamics of recognition / Bridget Coggins.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-04735-8 (hardback)

Secession – History – 20th century.
Separatist movements – History – 20th century.
Nation-state – History – 20th century.
Legitimacy of governments – History – 20th century.
Nationalism – History – 20th century.
Yugoslavia – History – Autonomy and independence movements.
Soviet Union – History – Autonomy and independence movements.
World politics – 20th century.
Title.
JC311.C6145 2014
2013044582

ISBN 978-1-107-04735-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

### Contents

List of Maps, Figures, and Tables Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vi vii
2	Statehood in Theory and Practice	14
3	Research Design and Methodology	44
4	Quantitative Analyses	57
5	International Responses to Secession in Yugoslavia, 1989–2011	83
6	International Responses to the Wars of Soviet Succession	143
7	Conclusions and Substantive Interpretations	215
Appendix A Project Codebook		225
Appendix B Unique Case I.D.		235
References		243
Index		263

## List of Maps, Figures, and Tables

#### MAPS

1.1	Ongoing Secessionist Movements, 2000	page 4
5.1	Yugoslavia Secessions	84
6.1	Post-Soviet Secessions	144
FIG	URES	
1.1	State Emergence Dynamics (1931–2002)	6
1.2	State Emergence (1931–2002)	7
2.1	System Members (1816–2002)	15
2.2	New States (1816–2002)	16
2.3	Two Models of State Emergence	29
2.4	External Sovereignty	37
3.1	War Outcomes and Secessionism (1931–2000)	53
4.1	Internal and External Sovereignty	63
TAB	LES	
4.1	Domestic Determinants of State Emergence	
	(1945–2000)	70
4.2	Determinants of Formal Recognition	73
4.3	Determinants of Formal Recognition by Individual Power	74
4.4	Variation in Domestic Sovereignty by Case Cluster	81
5.1	Great Power Recognition	86
5.2	Independence Demands and Plebiscites	95
5.3	Yugoslavia Conflict Statistics	99
5.4	Yugoslavia Ethnic Demographics (1991)	108
6.1	Soviet Successor Ethnic Demographics (1989)	153
6.2	Soviet Successor Conflict Statistics	166

vi

### Acknowledgements

I have many people to thank. This project began with my dissertation at Ohio State University with the support of a thoughtful and engaged committee: Rick Herrmann, Ted Hopf, and Alex Thompson. During that time, I was also fortunate to receive funding from the Mershon Center for International Security Studies and from the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences.

I was revising the manuscript at Dartmouth College when Kosovo formally declared independence for the second time in 2008 and when, later that same year, renewed conflict in South Ossetia sparked the Russo-Georgian war. And although it was not great timing for my project, I was not surprised that the apparent stalemates did not endure.

At Dartmouth, I would particularly like to thank Ambassador Ken Yalowitz and Christianne Wohlforth at the Dickey Center for International Understanding, both for hosting a book manuscript workshop and for their individual encouragement. I would also like to thank Charles King, Steve Saideman, and the workshop participants, whose insights and constructive feedback touched the book at a pivotal time.

I completed editing and preparing the manuscript for publication while serving as an International Affairs Fellow at the Council on Foreign Relations in residence at The Asan Institute for Policy Studies in Seoul, Korea. The Asan Institute provided a near ideal environment for finalizing the revisions. I was surrounded by interesting people doing interesting work. And Seoul is an amazing city.

The project also received valuable input along the way from audiences at "Secession as an International Phenomenon," sponsored by the Association for Research on Ethnicity and Nationalism in the Americas (ARENA), Columbia University's International Politics Seminar, and "Secession Redux: Lessons for the EU," sponsored by the EU Center for Excellence at the LBJ School of Public Affairs. I would also like to thank the countless individuals at archives and

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-04735-8 - Power Politics and State Formation in the Twentieth Century: The Dynamics of Recognition Bridget Coggins Frontmatter More information

viii

Acknowledgements

government agencies and within secessionist movements who generously shared their expertise for this research. Ishita Kala and Alannah Linkhorn served, respectively, as my research assistant and map designer in the final stages of the project. Without them, the book would certainly be less polished.

Two portions of the manuscript in Chapters 1 and 3 have previously appeared in print. I acknowledge and appreciate the permission to republish them here. Some of the basic descriptive statistics regarding secessionist movements and statehood can be found in "The History of Secession: An Overview" in Peter Radan and Aleksandar Pavkovic (Eds.). (2011). *The Ashgate Research Companion to Secession.* Surrey, UK: Ashgate Publishers, Ltd., 23–43 (Chapter 2). Additionally, some of the quantitative analysis appeared in "Friends in High Places: International Politics and the Emergence of States from Secessionism." *International Organization* 65:3 (July 2011), 433–467.

At various points when I needed advice or perspective, I was fortunate to have a group of level-headed friends and sharp colleagues. Though there are certainly more than I can list here, I am particularly thankful to Ellie Beaver, Sonu Bedi, Eileen Braman, John Carey, Jong Kun Choi, Tanisha Fazal, Cindy Frey, Paul Fritz, Yoav Gortzak, Dave and Michelle Kang, Doug Lemke, Randy Schweller, Kevin Sweeney, Srdjan Vucetic, and Bill Wohlforth. My family, Cathy Coggins, Jerry Coggins, and my brother Ted, were also important sources of moral support.

Finally, my husband Brent Strathman is an amazing person without whom I could not have completed this project. I am lucky to have him by my side.

Bridget Coggins December 2013 Seoul, Korea