- Katafuchi R, Ninomiya T, Nagata M *et al*. Validation study of oxford classification of IgA nephropathy: the significance of extracapillary proliferation. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2011; 6: 2806–2813
- Alamartine E, Sauron C, Laurent B *et al.* The use of the oxford classification of IgA nephropathy to predict renal survival. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2011; 6: 2384–2388
- Shi SF, Wang SX, Jiang L *et al.* Pathologic predictors of renal outcome and therapeutic efficacy in IgA nephropathy: validation of the oxford classification. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2011; 6: 2175–2184
- Yau T, Korbet SM, Schwartz MM et al. The Oxford classification of IgA nephropathy: a retrospective analysis. Am J Nephrol 2011; 34: 435–444
- Edstrom Halling S, Soderberg MP, Berg UB. Predictors of outcome in paediatric IgA nephropathy with regard to clinical and histopathological variables (Oxford classification). Nephrol Dial Transplant 2012; 27: 715–722
- Zeng CH, Le W, Ni Z *et al.* A multicenter application and evaluation of the oxford classification of IgA nephropathy in adult chinese patients. Am J Kidney Dis 2012; 60: 812–820
- Levey AS, Stevens LA, Schmid CH et al. A new equation to estimate glomerular filtration rate. Ann Intern Med 2009; 150: 604–612
- Berden AE, Ferrario F, Hagen EC et al. Histopathologic classification of ANCA-associated glomerulonephritis. J Am Soc Nephrol 2010; 21: 1628–1636

- Coppo R, D'Amico G. Factors predicting progression of IgA nephropathies. J Nephrol 2005; 18: 503–512
- Goto M, Kawamura T, Wakai K *et al.* Risk stratification for progression of IgA nephropathy using a decision tree induction algorithm. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2009; 24: 1242–1247
- 32. Bartosik LP, Lajoie G, Sugar L *et al.* Predicting progression in IgA nephropathy. Am J Kidney Dis 2001; 38: 728–735
- Geddes CC, Rauta V, Gronhagen-Riska C *et al.* A tricontinental view of IgA nephropathy. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2003; 18: 1541–1548
- Tang Z, Zhou H, Yao X *et al.* Hu W, Leishi L. Effects of methylprednisolone and cyclophosphamide pulse therapy on renal infiltrating cells in patients with crescentic glomerulonephritis. Chin Med J (Engl) 1997; 110: 206–209
- Pankhurst T, Lepenies J, Nightingale P *et al*. Vasculitic IgA nephropathy: prognosis and outcome. Nephron Clin Pract 2009; 112: c16–c24
- Radhakrishnan J, Cattran DC. The KDIGO practice guideline on glomerulonephritis: reading between the (guide)lines-application to the individual patient. Kidney Int 2012; 82: 840–856

Received for publication: 16.4.2013; Accepted in revised form: 18.8.2013

Nephrol Dial Transplant (2014) 29: 364–375 doi: 10.1093/ndt/gft401 Advance Access publication 29 September 2013

Prevalence and severity of oral disease in adults with chronic kidney disease: a systematic review of observational studies

Marinella Ruospo¹, Suetonia C. Palmer², Jonathan C. Craig³, Giorgio Gentile¹, David W. Johnson⁴, Pauline J. Ford⁵, Marcello Tonelli⁶, Massimo Petruzzi⁷, Michele De Benedittis⁷ and Giovanni F.M. Strippoli^{8,9,10,11}

¹Diaverum Medical Scientific Office, Bari, Italy, ²Department of Medicine, University of Otago Christchurch, Christchurch, New Zealand, ³School of Public Health, Sydney Medical School, The University of Sydney, NSW, Australia, ⁴Department of Nephrology, University of Queensland at Princess Alexandra Hospital, Brisbane, QLD, Australia, ⁵The University of Queensland, School of Dentistry, Brisbane, Australia, ⁶Department of Medicine, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada, ⁷Department of Medicine and Surgery, University of Bari, Bari, Italy, ⁸Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Epidemiology, Consorzio Mario Negri Sud, S. Maria Imbaro, Italy, ⁹Diaverum Scientific Office, Lund, Sweden, ¹⁰School of Public Health, University of Sydney, Australia and ¹¹Department of Emergency and Organ Transplantation, University of Bari, Bari, Italy

Correspondence and offprint requests to: Giovanni F.M. Strippoli; E-mail: strippoli@negrisud.it

ABSTRACT

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Background. Oral disease may be increased in people with chronic kidney disease (CKD) and, due to associations with inflammation and malnutrition, represents a potential modifiable risk factor for cardiovascular disease and mortality. We summarized the prevalence of oral disease in adults with

CKD and explored any association between oral disease and mortality.

Methods. We used systematic review of observational studies evaluating oral health in adults with CKD identified in MEDLINE (through September 2012) without language restriction. We summarized prevalence and associations with all-cause and cardiovascular mortality using random-effects meta-analysis. We explored for sources of heterogeneity between studies using meta-regression.

Results. Eighty-eight studies in 125 populations comprising 11 340 adults were eligible. Edentulism affected one in five adults with CKD Stage 5D (dialysis) {20.6% [95% confidence interval (CI), 16.4–25.6]}. Periodontitis was more common in CKD Stage 5D [56.8% (CI, 39.3–72.8)] than less severe CKD [31.6% (CI, 19.0–47.6)], although data linking periodontitis with premature death were scant. One-quarter of patients with CKD Stage 5D reported never brushing their teeth [25.6% (CI, 10.2–51.1)] and a minority used dental floss [11.4% (CI, 6.2–19.8)]; oral pain was reported by one-sixth [18.7% (CI, 8.8–35.4)], while half of patients experienced a dry mouth [48.4% (CI, 37.5–59.5)]. Data for kidney transplant recipients and CKD Stages 1–5 were limited.

Conclusions. Oral disease is common in adults with CKD, potentially reflects low use of preventative dental services, and may be an important determinant of health in this clinical setting.

Keywords: chronic kidney disease, epidemiology, meta-analysis, oral health, periodontitis

INTRODUCTION

Chronic kidney disease (CKD) is present in disadvantaged populations disproportionately, exacerbating health disparities and creating a financial burden for health systems [1, 2]. People who have moderate-severe CKD experience rates of premature death at least two to three times that of the general population, due to excess cardiovascular and infectious disease [3–5]. Interventions that modify risk factors for mortality in people with CKD generally do not improve clinical outcomes, particularly those with CKD Stage 5D or transplantation [6–11]. Novel and modifiable determinants of adverse outcomes and disability in people with CKD warrant evaluation.

Oral disease represents a potential and preventable cause of poor health outcomes in people with CKD. It is highly prevalent globally and is the fourth most expensive disease to treat in most developed countries [12, 13]. In low-income countries, almost all tooth decay is untreated [14] and, despite effective prevention and treatment strategies, poor oral health affects disadvantaged groups disproportionately and impairs quality of life and social functioning [15]. As people with chronic disease generally have an increased unmet need for oral healthcare and use dental services less [16], the burden of low oral health may be increased in people with CKD. Dental visits in the public healthcare setting in the USA are low, particularly for those who have CKD [17]. The overlap between CKD and poverty increases the potential for neglected oral health in this large population [18]. In addition, poor oral health is associated with inflammation and malnutrition (including the protein-energy wasting syndrome) [19, 20], which affect CKD patients disproportionately and are risk factors for accelerated cardiovascular disease and mortality in this population [21]. Accordingly, oral health status is a potential modifiable risk factor for adverse patient-relevant outcomes in the setting of CKD that warrants further study.

The aims of our study were to evaluate oral health and oral hygiene habits in adults with CKD and to estimate the excess risk conferred by poor oral health on mortality in this population.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

We did a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines [22]. We searched MEDLINE to Week 3, September 2012, without language restriction (Supplementary Table S1). We included in the systematic review observational studies in which oral health was evaluated in adults who had CKD [abnormal urine tests or renal imaging studies with or without reduced estimated glomerular filtration rate (below 60 mL/min/1.73 m²)] [23]. Two authors independently evaluated retrieved citations by title and abstract and reviewed in full text all studies that appeared potentially eligible. They also independently extracted study characteristics, prevalence, severity and outcomes of oral health, and risk of bias according to previously published criteria [24]. The primary outcomes of interest were: (i) prevalence and severity of oral disease including dental, periodontal, mucosal and salivary conditions; (ii) oral hygiene habits; (iii) oral symptoms including dysgeusia (distorted sense of taste) and xerostomia and (iv) all-cause or cardiovascular mortality associated with any feature of oral health. Using keywords from the search strategy, we also searched for, and tabulated estimates of, the prevalence and characteristics of oral health in the general population that were available in published studies or reports (Supplementary Table S2).

Statistical analysis

We extracted the prevalence for oral health characteristics when the number or proportion of patients affected and the number at risk were both provided. When continuous scales were used [e.g. the decayed missing filled teeth (DMFT) index], we extracted the reported mean, standard deviation and sample size. Whenever available, we extracted the adjusted risk ratio and its 95% confidence interval (CI) for the risk of all-cause or cardiovascular mortality in adults with CKD who had oral disease compared with those without oral disease (reference category). Where a study reported data for more than one separate study population (e.g. several stages of CKD), we extracted data for each population separately.

We used random-effects meta-analysis to summarize data for the predefined outcomes and report prevalence and 95% CI for dichotomous variables and mean (95% CI) for continuous variables. We tested for between-study heterogeneity in summary estimates using the Cochran Q and I^2 statistics [25] and did prespecified random-effects subgroup and metaregression analyses to explore the effects of age, gender, time on dialysis or geographical region on estimates of prevalence or disease severity for edentulism, DMFT index, periodontitis, gingival index, plaque index, oral pain and candidiasis. Insufficient extractable data were available to conduct metaregression analyses to control for the proportion of participants

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ndt/article/29/2/364/1912745 by guest on 21 August 2022

with diabetes mellitus in individual studies. We did analyses using Comprehensive Meta-analysis (Biostat, Englewood, NJ, Version 2, 2005).

RESULTS

Description of studies

We retrieved 2230 citations from MEDLINE and identified five additional studies from reference lists (Supplementary Table S1). Eighty-eight studies in 125 populations (11 340 adults) met inclusion criteria (summarized in Table 1 and described in Supplementary Table S3) [26-113]. Most studies focused on adults with CKD Stage 5D (90 populations; n =6171) [26-29, 31, 32, 34-38, 41-57, 59-64, 66, 67, 69, 71-75, 77, 78, 80, 82, 83, 85, 86-90, 94-98, 100-107, 110-113], with a smaller number evaluating oral health in those with CKD Stages 1–5 (14 populations; *n* = 3384) [33, 41, 64, 65, 68, 76, 98, 102, 103, 105, 106, 109, 110] or kidney transplant recipients (16 populations, *n* = 1345) [27, 30, 39, 40, 52, 60, 70, 79, 84, 89, 93, 94, 99, 108, 110, 112]. The remainder evaluated multiple stages of CKD or did not detail the stage of CKD (5 populations, n =440) [58, 81, 91, 92]. Studies were generally small [median sample size, 44 (range 8-2303)]; all but three studies evaluated fewer than 500 participants [65, 76, 90]. The duration of dialysis varied between 0 and 125 months and time with a kidney transplant varied between 13 and 116 months. Most study populations were from Europe and the Americas, with the remainder from the Western Pacific and the Eastern Mediterranean and one from South-East Asia; none originated from Africa (Supplementary Figure S1). The risk of bias in available studies was generally high (Supplementary Figure S2).

Summary analyses

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Data for summary estimates in adults with CKD Stage 5D are provided in Table 2.

Dental disease

Two studies reported edentulism in 42% of 617 adults and 6.4% of 2303 adults with CKD Stages 1–5 [65, 76]. In 10 studies of 1516 patients with CKD Stage 5D, edentulism affected 20.6% (CI, 16.4–25.6%) and was not modified by age, gender, time on dialysis or geographical region (Figure 1) [43, 45, 46, 50, 56, 72, 80, 88, 90, 113].

The DMFT index is the sum of decayed, missing or filled permanent teeth. The mean DMFT index in adults with CKD Stages 1–5 was moderate to high (range, 11.3 and 24.9) in three studies (n = 111, mean population age 45 years) [68, 98, 110] and was between 6.6 and 26 in adult patients with CKD Stage 5D [28 populations; n = 1345, mean population age 50 (CI 47–54) years] (Supplementary Figure S3) [29, 35, 38, 42, 44, 46, 49, 50, 53, 54, 59, 69, 78, 95, 98, 110, 113]. In one kidney transplant population (n = 9; mean population age 51 years), the mean DFMT index was 25.7 [110]. In summary analyses, DMFT indices were similarly high in adults with CKD Stage 5D [18.7 (CI, 10.5–27.0)] and those with CKD Stage 5D [14.5 (CI, 12.7–16.3)] (P for subgroup difference = 0.29). The mean DMFT index in adults with CKD Stage 5D

increased with age (meta-regression P = 0.001), but was not associated with gender or dialysis duration. The DMFT index in adults with CKD Stage 5D also varied by geographical region, with studies in the Eastern Mediterranean reporting the lowest DMFT index [9.0 (CI 8.2–9.8)], with an increasing index in studies from Europe [14.2 (CI, 13.8–14.7)], the Western Pacific [16.5 (CI, 14.9–18.0)] and America [17.9 (CI 17.2–18.6)] (P < 0.001 for subgroup difference).

The mean number of decayed permanent teeth in 17 populations treated with CKD Stage 5D was 2.6 [CI, 2.0–3.2, n = 855, mean population age 50 (CI, 45–55) years] [29, 35, 38, 42, 44, 53, 59, 95, 98, 113] and was 2.9 (CI, 1.9–4.0) in four populations [n = 251, mean population age 50 (CI, 43–57)] with CKD Stages 1–5 [68, 98, 109]. The mean number of filled teeth in 16 populations with CKD Stage 5D [n = 839, mean population age 50 (CI, 45–55) years] was 3.8 (CI 2.8–4.9) [29, 35, 38, 42, 44, 53, 59, 95, 98, 113] and 2.6 and 4.0 in two populations with CKD Stages 1–5 (n = 102, mean population age 45 years) [68, 98].

Periodontal and gingival disease

Periodontal disease is a spectrum of disease involving inflammation of gingival tissues caused by plaque accumulation, ranging from gingivitis alone to substantial inflammatory destruction of supporting periodontal tissues (periodontitis). Definitions of periodontitis in the contributing studies varied widely (Supplementary Table S4). Periodontitis affected 31.6% (CI, 19.0-47.6) of adults with CKD Stages 1-5 (5 populations; *n* = 2961) [65, 76, 102, 109] and 56.8% (CI 39.3–72.8) of adults with CKD Stage 5D (Figure 1) [45-48, 51, 54-56, 66, 71, 82, 97, 102] (P = 0.04 for subgroup difference). The prevalence of periodontitis in CKD Stage 5D was unaffected by age, but increased as the proportion of women and duration of dialysis increased (meta-regression P < 0.001). In addition, prevalence varied by global region {America [27.1% (CI, 12.9-48.2)], South-East Asia [63.3% (CI, 45.1-78.4)], Europe [67.7% (CI 42.5–85.6)], Eastern Mediterranean [73.8% (CI, 58.6-84.9)] and Western Pacific [77.5% (67.5-85.1)]} (P < 0.001 for subgroup difference).

The mean periodontal probing depth (PPD) is also a measure of periodontal health and describes the deepening of the gingival sulcus along which dental plaque biofilm can migrate along the root surface. In CKD populations, the mean PPD was 2.3 mm (26 populations, CI, 2.0–2.6) in CKD Stage 5D (n = 726) [29, 37, 38, 46, 49, 50, 55, 67, 73, 77, 85, 95, 107, 112], 0.7 and 2.4 mm in two populations with CKD Stages 1–5 (n = 101) [68, 105] and 2.0 and 2.6 mm in two transplant populations (n = 74) [94, 112]. The clinical attachment loss (CAL) is the extent of periodontal support that has been destroyed around teeth. In data limited to populations treated with dialysis, the mean CAL was 3.5 mm (CI, 2.99–4.16) in 10 populations (n = 331) [41, 49, 50, 67, 69].

The gingival index assesses the severity of gingivitis. In adults with CKD Stage 5D (33 populations; n = 1399), gingival indices were of mild–moderate severity [mean 1.5 (CI, 1.3–1.6)] [29, 31, 37, 38, 45, 48–51, 55, 67, 68, 73, 75, 77, 85, 89, 94, 95, 102, 107, 112] and increased with age, proportion of men and duration on dialysis (meta-regression P <

Stage of CKD ^a	Overall no. of populations (no. of participants)	Cohort description; number of populations (no. of participants)	No. of participants [median (range)]	WHO region; no. of populations (no. of participants)	Weighted mean age (range) (no. of populations with data)	Weighted proportion men (range) (no. of populations with data)	Weighted time treated with dialysis or with transplant, estimated glomerular filtration rate, mL/min/1.73 m ² (range) (no. of populations with data) ^b	Weighted proportion with diabetes (range) (no. of populations with data)
CKD Stages 1–5	14 (3384)	CKD; 12 (3235) CKD; diabetic nephropathy; 1 (96) CKD; non-diabetic kidney disease; 1 (53)	44 (21–2303)	Africa; 0 (0) America; 2 (2920) Eastern Mediterranean; 0 (0) Europe; 11 (371) South-East Asia; 0 (0) Western Pacific; 1 (40)	48.7 years (44.5–51.0) (7)	53.6% (38.3– 71.6%) (6)	— (20.2–80.4 mL/min/ 1.73 m ²) (3)	35.2% (0-100%) (5)
CKD Stage 5D	90 (6171)	Haemodialysis; 74 (4279) Peritoneal dialysis; 7 (364) Haemodialysis + peritoneal dialysis; 8 (812) Dialysis (type unspecified); 1 (716)	44 (8–716)	Africa; 0 (0) America; 17 (1720) Eastern Mediterranean; 13 (775) Europe; 50 (2424) South-East Asia; 1 (30) Western Pacific; 9 (1222)	49.5 years (31.6–66) (70)	52.7% (30-100%) (60)	44.9 months (0–125) (30)	30.2% (0-100%) (35)
Kidney transplant	16 (1345)	Kidney transplant recipients; 16 (1345)	42 (9-453)	Africa; 0 (0) America; 2 (53) Eastern Mediterranean; 2 (228) Europe; 12 (1064) South-East Asia; 0 (0) Western Pacific; 0 (0)	37.2 years (31.5–43.5) (8)	59.8% (39.4–88.9%) (10)	— (61.7–103) (2)	— (0-44%) (2)

Table 1. Summary characteristics of included studies according to stages of CKD

^aSummary data for studies with multiple stages of CKD that could not be disaggregated are not included. ^bWeighted means calculated across all populations for which sufficient data were provided.

CKD, chronic kidney disease.

Oral health in CKD

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Table 2. Meta-analytical prevalence or severity of oral diseases in adults with CKD Stage 5D

Variable	No. of study populations (no. of participants)	Random effects prevalence or mean (95% CI)	Heterogeneity in summary estimate	
			I ² (%)	P-value
Dental disease				
Edentulous (%)	10 (1516)	20.6 (16.4-25.6)	73	< 0.001
Decayed missing filled teeth (DMFT)	28 (1345)	14.5 (12.7–16.3)	97	< 0.001
Number of decayed permanent teeth (n)	17 (855)	2.6 (2.0-3.2)	95	< 0.001
Number of filled permanent teeth (n)	16 (839)	3.8 (2.8-4.9)	97	< 0.001
Periodontal disease				
Periodontitis (%)	13 (1117)	56.8 (39.3-72.8)	96	< 0.001
Periodontal probing depth (PPD) (mm)	26 (726)	2.3 (2.0-2.6)	99	< 0.001
Clinical attachment loss (CAL) (mm)	10 (331)	3.5 (2.99-4.16)	98	< 0.001
Gingival index (mm)	33 (1399)	1.5 (1.3–1.6)	99	< 0.001
Oral hygiene and symptoms				
Plaque index	41 (1826)	1.9 (1.7–2.0)	96	< 0.001
Brushing (%)				
Never	4 (326)	25.6 (10.2-51.1)	94	< 0.001
Once a day	4 (326)	26.8 (17.2-39.4)	78	0.003
Twice a day or more	4 (326)	24.0 (13.3–39.5)	85	< 0.001
Floss (%)	9 (898)	11.4 (6.2–19.8)	88	< 0.001
Mouth wash (%)	4 (522)	27.4 (9.0-59.0)	96	< 0.001
Oral pain (%)	8 (582)	18.7 (8.8–35.4)	92	< 0.001
Dysgeusia (%)	6 (424)	40.5 (20.1-64.7)	94	< 0.001
Mucosal disease				
Ulceration (%)	11 (832)	8.6 (2.7-24.2)	92	< 0.001
Oral candidiasis (%)	6 (404)	19.6 (12.1-30.1)	77	0.001
Oral cancer (%)	_	_	_	_
Salivary disease				
Xerostomia (%)	11 (898)	48.4 (37.5–59.5)	89	< 0.001
Salivary flow rate pre-dialysis, stimulated (mL/min)	12 (579)	0.86 (0.73-0.99)	90	< 0.001
Salivary flow rate pre-dialysis, unstimulated (mL/min)	12 (621)	0.22 (0.19-0.25)	85	< 0.001

0.001 for all). The gingival index in patients with CKD Stage 5D also showed regional variation [increasing severity: America 0.90 (CI, 0.7–1.1), Europe 1.4 (CI, 1.1–1.7), Western Pacific 1.5 (CI, 1.3–1.6), Eastern Mediterranean 1.9 (CI, 1.3–2.5)] (P < 0.001 for subgroup differences). Gingival indices were 0.89 and 1.18 in two studies comprising 120 adults with CKD Stages 1–5 [68, 102].

Oral hygiene and symptoms

Oral hygiene practices were only reported in adults treated with CKD Stage 5D. In four studies reporting the brushing habits of 326 adults [31, 66, 72, 73], 25.6% (CI, 10.2–51.1) reported never brushing teeth, 26.8% (CI, 17.2–39.4) reported brushing once a day and 24.0% (CI, 13.3–39.5) reported brushing at least twice a day. In nine populations of 898 participants [31, 54, 61, 72, 73, 80, 95, 113], 11.4% (CI, 6.2–19.8) reported using dental floss and in four studies comprising 522 participants, 27.4% (CI, 9.0–59.0) reported using mouthwash [54, 61, 80, 113].

The plaque index is used to assess the thickness of plaque on tooth surfaces closest to the gum and is a measure of oral hygiene. The mean plaque indices were 1.14 and 1.62 in two populations with CKD Stages 1–5 (n = 73) [33, 102] and 2.19 in 54 kidney transplant recipients [94]. The mean plaque index in 41 populations with CKD Stage 5D (n = 1826) was 1.9 (CI 1.7–2.0) and increased with age but was not influenced

by gender or time treated with dialysis [29, 31, 37, 38, 41, 47–51, 59, 67, 69, 73, 75, 77, 85, 89, 94, 102, 112]. The plaque index varied between regions [in increasing order of severity; America 1.4 (CI, 1.1–1.6), Western Pacific 1.7 (0.8–2.6); Eastern Mediterranean 1.8 (1.7–2.0); Europe 2.1 (1.9–2.2); South-East Asia 2.1 (1.8–2.5); P for subgroup difference < 0.001].

Oral pain or burning was reported in 18.7% (CI, 8.8–35.4) of eight populations with CKD Stage 5D (n = 582) [44, 50, 57, 60, 62, 73, 80] (Figure 1) and in 0% and 4.1% of kidney transplant recipients [60, 99]. The prevalence of oral pain increased with dialysis duration (meta-regression P < 0.001) but was unrelated to age, gender or region. In two populations with CKD Stage 5D, 4 of 126 (3.2%) and 30 of 47 (63.8%) reported trouble biting or chewing [44, 73]. Dysgeusia, an abnormal sense of taste, was reported by 40.5% (CI, 20.1–64.7) of six populations of adults with CKD Stage 5D (n = 424) (Figure 2) [44, 56, 57, 62, 73].

Mucosal disease

Mucosal ulceration affected 8.6% (CI, 2.7–24.2) of 11 populations treated with CKD Stage 5D (n = 832) [28, 44, 53, 57, 62, 69, 72, 74, 80] and 6 of 453 (1.3%) transplant recipients [84]. Oral candidiasis affected 2 of 9 (22.2%) adults with CKD Stages 1–5 [110], 19.6% of adults with CKD Stage 5D (CI 12.1–30.1; 6 populations; n = 404) [47, 52, 57, 60, 69, 104]

Study	Number of participants	Prevalence, % Random effects (95% Cl)	Prevalence, % Random effects (95% Cl)
Edentulism			
Buhlin et al., 2007	51	9.8 (4.1 to 21.5)	-
Bouattar et al., 2011	42	11.9 (5.0 to 25.6)	
Gurkan et al., 2008	42 145	13.1 (8.5 to 19.6)	
Pergener et al., 1995	716	19.0 (16.3 to 22.0)	
Chamani et al., 2009	68	20.6 (12.6 to 31.8)	-
Ziebolz et al., 2012	54	22.2 (13.1 to 35.2)	
De la Rosa Garcia et al, 2008	103	23.3 (16.1 to 32.4)	
Bots et al., 2004	94	23.4 (15.9 to 33.0)	
Montagnac et al., 2004	96	24.0 (16.5 to 33.5)	
Klassen et al., 2002			
	147	36.1 (28.7 to 44.1)	
Combined	1516	20.6 (16.4 to 25.6)	\sim
Heterogeneity X_{9}^{2} =33; l ² = 72.7, P<0	.001		
Periodontitis			
Cuhna et al. 2007	160	8.8 (5.3 to 14.2)	
Kshirsagar et al., 2009	154	22.7 (16.8 to 30.0)	
Dag et al., 2010	43	34.9 (22.2 to 50.1)	
Franek et al., 2006	44	38.6 (25.6 to 53.6)	_ _ _
de la Rosa Garcia et al., 2008	103	43.7 (34.5 to 53.4)	
Goncalves et al., 2011	34	47.1 (31.2 to 63.5)	
Siribanrungwong et al., 2012	30	63.3 (45.1 to 78.4)	
Takeuchi et al., 2007	41	70.7 (55.2 to 82.6)	
Bublin et al., 2007	51	72.5 (58.8 to 83.0)	
Bouattar et al., 2011	42	73.8 (58.6 to 84.9)	
Chen et al., 2006	253	80.6 (75.3 to 85.0)	
	110		
Cengiz et al., 2007	52	81.8 (73.5 to 88.0)	
Castillo et al., 2007		92.3 (81.2 to 97.1)	
Combined	1117	56.8 (39.3 to 72.8)	\sim
Heterogeneity X ² ₁₂ =278; I ² = 95.6, P4	0.001		
Oral pain			
Dirschnabel et al., 2011	46	1.1 (0.1 to 14.9)	-
Bots et al., 2006	27	4.8 (2.2 to 10.2)	
Eltas et al., 2012 (no diabetes)	126	11.1 (3.6 to 29.3)	_
de la Rosa Garcia et al., 2006	22	13.1 (7.8 to 21.3)	-
Klassen et al., 2002	99	19.0 (13.5 to 26.2)	
Chamani et al., 2009	68	22.1 (13.8 to 33.4)	-
Eltas et al., 2012 (diabetes)	147	40.9 (22.8 to 61.8)	
Guzeldemir et al., 2009	47	72.3 (58.0 to 83.2)	
Combined	582	18.7 (8.8 to 35.4)	\diamond –
Heterogeneity X ² ₇ =80; I ² = 91.3, P<0	.001		
Oral candidiasis			_
Gavalda et al., 1999		5.8 (2.6 to 12.3)	▪_
de la Rosa Garcia et al., 2006		17.2 (11.0 to 25.9)	
Dirschnabel et al., 2011		17.4 (8.9 to 31.1)	
Castillo et al., 2007		26.9 (16.6 to 40.5)	
Chomicz et al., 2002		30.0 (10.0 to 62.4)	<u> </u>
Thorman et al., 2009		32.3 (23.6 to 42.4)	
Combined		19.6 (12.1 to 30.1)	\diamond
Heterogeneity X ² ₅ =22; I ² = 77.0, P=0	.001		
		Г 0	50 100
		0	Prevalence, %

FIGURE 1: Prevalence of edentulism, periodontitis, oral pain and candidiasis in adults with CKD Stage 5D.

(Figure 1) and 13.3% (CI, 3.9–37.0) of four kidney transplant populations (n = 230) [52, 60, 79, 110]. The prevalence of oral candidiasis in patients with CKD Stage 5D increased with age (meta-regression P < 0.01), but not gender, time on dialysis or region. Oral herpetic lesions were reported in between 2.0 and 2.9% of adults with CKD Stage 5D (n = 246) [57, 60, 74]. The prevalence of oral cancer was not extractable from available studies.

Salivary abnormalities and thirst

Xerostomia is the subjective complaint of a dry mouth. In 11 populations with CKD Stage 5D (n = 898), xerostomia was reported by 48.4% (CI, 37.5–59.5) (Figure 2) [43, 45, 50, 54, 56, 57, 60, 62, 80, 100]. Sixty-five of 94 (69%) adults with CKD Stage 5D reported thirst [43] and 31.9 and 57.4% of adults with CKD Stage 5D in two populations (n = 141) reported difficulty swallowing [43, 73].

The major cause of xerostomia is salivary gland hypofunction, often as a side effect of medication [114]. On average, unstimulated flow rates are 0.3 mL/min and stimulated flow can reach a maximum of 7 mL/min [115]. The mean stimulated predialysis salivary flow rates reported in 12 populations with CKD Stage 5D (n = 579) was 0.86 mL/min (CI, 0.73–0.99) [34, 35, 38, 42, 43, 64, 86, 102, 103]. whereas the mean unstimulated salivary flow rates in the period before dialysis was 0.22 mL/min (CI, 0.19–0.25) in 12 populations, comprising 621 adults [26, 42, 43, 62, 64, 100, 101, 103, 106].

All-cause and cardiovascular mortality

Two studies focusing on long-term haemodialysis therapy reported risks of all-cause and cardiovascular mortality associated with moderate to severe periodontitis. These studies, which were at generally lower risk of bias, showed a consistently increased adjusted risk of mortality and cardiovascular mortality in participants with moderate to severe periodontitis compared with those with no or mild periodontitis (Figure 3), although reported risk estimates were generally imprecise and included the possibility of no association [51, 82]. Metaanalysis was not possible as three independent populations were not available. Risks of mortality associated with other features of oral health were not extractable.

DISCUSSION

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

This systematic review finds that poor oral health is highly prevalent and frequently severe for adults with CKD worldwide. In adults with CKD Stage 5D, approximately one in five are edentulous. The DMFT index in adults with CKD Stage 5D, which summarizes overall dental status, suggests dental health is poor as measured by WHO criteria for this population. The number of filled teeth is lower than the general US population, which may reflect lower use of dental services, while the number of permanent teeth is lower and the number of decayed teeth is higher [17]. Periodontitis affects over half of adults with CKD Stage 5D and PPDs, indicative of destructive periodontal disease, are increased, although estimates in those with earlier stages of kidney disease are less certain. One-quarter of adults with CKD Stage 5D never brush their teeth and a small minority use dental floss or mouth wash. Mucosal disease in all populations with CKD has been infrequently reported, especially oral cancerous lesions. Dry mouth is reported by approximately half of adults with CKD Stage 5D, although evidence for systematic salivary gland hypofunction is inconclusive. Periodontitis may increase risks of allcause and cardiovascular mortality in adults with CKD, but associations are imprecise and additional data are required. Wide variation in estimates of oral disease are present with differences based in part on global region, patient age and duration of dialysis treatment, limiting confidence in the results. Data for oral health are particularly sparse for kidney transplant recipients.

Our finding that poor oral health is common and severe for adults who have CKD is relevant to new research prioritization in the field of kidney disease. Oral health, and particularly destructive periodontitis, is associated with poor prognostic factors in CKD patients including malnutrition, the proteinenergy wasting syndrome and inflammation [51, 82, 116] and may predict progressive kidney disease [117]. It is biologically plausible that poor oral health causes adverse outcomes in CKD mediated via endothelial dysfunction [118], atherosclerosis [119], thrombosis [120], vascular injury and endotoxinaemia [121] and chronic inflammation [120, 122, 123].

Despite potential direct pathways explaining the link between oral health and clinical outcomes, it is also possible that oral health and cardiovascular disease share common causal pathways that explain their association. Such factors include age, health behaviours, nutrition, smoking and socioeconomic status pathways, although observational analyses controlling for some or all of these potentially explanatory variables still detect an association between oral health and mortality [122, 124]. Although periodontitis is associated with atherosclerotic disease in the general population, periodontal disease and cardiovascular disease share common risk factors such as tobacco use, diabetes and age, and the link with adverse outcomes is potentially confounded [125]. Randomized data are not available to show that treating periodontal inflammation reduces either systemic inflammation or cardiovascular events, although research indicates improved endothelial function following intensive periodontal treatment [126].

While extensive information about oral disease as a determinant of health is available in general populations, data exploring the link between oral health and mortality in CKD are based on few studies with imprecise but generally consistent risk estimates and are limited to periodontal disease. Additional prospective data in larger CKD populations would assist in greater understanding of the association between oral health and clinical outcomes in this population that may justify additional research targeted at treating dental disease and periodontitis. In addition, the prevalence and importance of quality-of-life indicators for oral disease (discomfort, selfassessment of oral health and appearance, avoidance of laughing or smiling, or being unable to chew) are largely uncertain in people with CKD and additional research would be valuable. Additional data suggesting a link between oral health and clinical outcomes in CKD would suggest the need to test

Study	Number of participants	Prevalence, % Random effects (95% Cl)	Prevalence, % Random effects (95% CI)
Study	participants	(33% CI)	
Xerostomia			
Eltas et al., 2012 (no diabetes)	27	11.1 (3.6 to 29.3) –	⊢
Bouattar et al., 2011	42	21.4 (11.5 to 36.3) -	
Dirschnabel et al., 2011	46	28.3 (17.2 to 42.8)	
Cuhna et al., 2007	22	40.0 (32.7 to 47.8)	
de la Rosa Garcia. et al, 2008	99	43.7 (34.5 to 53.4)	
de la Rosa Garcia et al., 2006	103	44.4 (35.0 to 54.3)	
Eltas et al., 2012 (diabetes)	68	59.1 (38.2 to 77.2)	
Klassen et al., 2002	90	65.3 (57.3 to 72.6)	-
Chamani et al., 2009	160	67.6 (55.7 to 77.7)	
Sung et al., 2005	94	68.9 (58.6 to 77.6)	
Bots et al., 2004	147	74.5 (64.7 to 82.3)	
Combined	898	48.4 (37.5 to 59.5)	\diamond
Heterogeneity X ² ₁₀ =94; I ² = 89.4, P<0	0.001		
Dysgeusia			
Eltas et al., 2012 (no diabetes)		7.4 (1.9 to 25.2)	_
Bots et al., 2006		10.3 (6.1 to 17.0)	
de la Rosa Garcia et al., 2006		45.5 (35.9 to 55.3)	
de la Rosa Garcia. et al, 2008		45.6 (36.3 to 55.3)	
Eltas et al., 2012 (diabetes)		54.5 (34.1 to 73.5)	
Guzeldemir et al., 2009		91.5 (79.4 to 96.8)	
Combined		40.5 (20.1 to 64.7)	$\langle \rangle$
Heterogeneity X ² ₅ =77 I ² = 93.5, P<0.0	001		
		0	50 100
			Prevalence, %

FIGURE 2: Prevalence or xerostomia and dysgeusia in adults with CKD Stage 5D.

Adjusted risk estimate Adjusted risk estimate Random effects Severity of **Random effects** (95% CI) periodontitis (95% CI) Study All-cause mortality Chen et al., 2006 Moderate 1.39 (0.83 to 2.34) Kshirsagar et al., 2009 Moderate-severe 1.8 (0.7 to 4.5) Chen et al., 2006 1.83 (1.04 to 3.24) Severe Cardiovascular mortality Chen et al., 2006 Moderate 1.06 (0.50 to 2.45) Kshirsagar et al., 2009 5.0 (1.2 to 19.1) Moderate-severe Chen et al., 2006 Severe 1.83 (1.04 to 3.24) 0.1 1 10 **Decreased mortality Increased mortality** with periodontitis with periodontitis

FIGURE 3: Risk of all-cause and cardiovascular mortality associated with moderate to severe periodontitis compared with no or mild periodontitis in adults with CKD Stage 5D. Summary estimates are not calculated as three or more separate study populations were not available for each outcome. population-wide and individual-based strategies [127] to reduce dental and oral disease in populations with CKD. In addition, exploring CKD patient preferences and priorities for dental care could guide additional research and practice interventions. Regional variations in oral disease, as seen in the global population, indicate strategies for interventions should be locally developed and evaluated.

The global determinants of oral health are complex and include individual behaviour, such as oral hygiene and use of preventive and curative dental care services, as well as factors related to the health system and oral health services, including actual and perceived barriers to care, and broader political and environmental issues such as sanitation, nutrition and fluoridation [128]. International experience suggests that strong socioeconomic and ethnic gradients determine adult oral health even in the presence of childhood public oral health care programmes, and which are also likely to be relevant for people with CKD [128]. Across countries and oral health systems, better dental health controlled for socioeconomic factors is found in adults with preventive dental care habits and regular dental flossing [128]. These data, together with studies in this review, suggest that the risk factors for oral disease in people with coexisting CKD may be complex and likely to be contributed to by ethnic and socioeconomic factors that may require broad political and health system responses. Only about 1 in 10 adults who had CKD visited a dentist in 1 year in a US public healthcare system [17], which is consistent with our finding that people with CKD may have more decayed and missing teeth and fewer filled teeth, suggesting lower uptake of preventive and curative dental care.

We suggest some caution in the interpretation of our results. First, we have used a general population from the USA for comparisons with CKD populations, which may not be valid given the geographical variation in oral disease globally and between studies in our review. Secondly, our metaanalyses demonstrated high levels of between-study heterogeneity (differences in the estimates between studies that occurred beyond the level of chance) which were incompletely explained by meta-regression controlling for study-level variables and known determinants of oral health. Thirdly, while substantial data were available for adults with CKD in largely industrialized regions, we can shed little insight into the burden of oral disease in adults with earlier stages of CKD and in Asian and African regions, which represent a large proportion of the global population with chronic disease. Additional larger studies in these areas would be informative. Finally, data for the other aspects of oral diseases on clinical outcomes including quality of life are largely absent and we did not explore the link between periodontitis and risks of CKD progression, although studies suggest an association [65].

In conclusion, oral disease may be an important health burden in populations who have CKD. Additional research is needed to evaluate the patient-level impact of oral health in this population as well as patient perspectives and priorities for care and the cost-effectiveness of strategies to improve oral health. Periodontitis is a potential risk factor for mortality in CKD, but additional larger studies are required before intervention strategies can be tested.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

M.R. assisted with designing the study methodology, located references, extracted data, assessed study quality and provided feedback on primary and subsequent drafts; S.C.P. designed the methodology, assisted with reference location, checked data extraction, assessed study quality, ran analyses and interpreted results, and drafted and submitted the primary report; J.C.C. helped to design the methodology, interpreted results and provided feedback on the primary and subsequent drafts; G.G. assisted with designing the study methodology, located references, extracted data, assessed study quality and provided feedback on primary and subsequent drafts; D.W.J. was consulted on methodology, helped interpret results and provided feedback on the primary and subsequent drafts; P.J.F. was consulted on methodology, helped interpret results and provided feedback on the primary and subsequent drafts; M.T. helped interpret results and provided feedback on primary and subsequent drafts; M.P. was consulted on methodology, helped interpret results and provided feedback on the primary and subsequent drafts; M.D.B. helped interpret results and provided feedback on primary and subsequent drafts; G.F.M.S. initiated the review, helped to design the methodology, assisted with drafting of the manuscript and helped interpret results. All authors had full access to all of the data (including statistical reports and tables) in the study and can take responsibility for the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis. All authors helped to interpret the findings and write the final report. G.F.M.S. is the guarantor.

SUPPLEMENTARY DATA

Supplementary data are available online at http://ndt.oxford-journals.org.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We wish to acknowledge the specialist support from the Cochrane Renal Group. Ruth Mitchell, specialist information manager designed and ran the electronic database searches. Narelle Willis, Coordinating Editor, provided administrative support. We also wish to thank Michela Sciancalepore for administrative support.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

This review was part funded by Diaverum and LCO (Le Cliniche Odontoiatriche). The funding agencies played no role in the study design or conduct, had no involvement in data collection, analysis or interpretation and were not involved in drafting or revision of the manuscript or the decision to submit the manuscript for publication. D.W.J. is a current recipient of a Queensland Government Health Research Fellowship; S.C.P. receives an unrestricted research grant from

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Amgen Dompé administered by the Consorzio Mario Negri Sud and a 2012 L'Oreal-UNESCO for Women in Science Australia–New Zealand Fellowship. The results presented in this paper have not been published previously in whole or part, except in abstract form.

REFERENCES

- 1. Powe NR. To have and have not: health and health care disparities in chronic kidney disease. Kidney Int 2003; 64: 763–772
- 2. Hall YN, Choi AI, Chertow GM *et al*. Chronic kidney disease in the urban poor. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2010; 5: 828–835
- Go AS, Chertow GM, Fan D *et al.* Chronic kidney disease and the risks of death, cardiovascular events, and hospitalization. N Engl J Med 2004; 351: 1296–1305
- Hemmelgarn BR, Manns BJ, Lloyd A et al. Relation between kidney function, proteinuria, and adverse outcomes. JAMA 2010; 303: 423–429
- Dalrymple LS, Go AS. Epidemiology of acute infections among patients with chronic kidney disease. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2008; 3: 1487–1493
- Palmer SC, Di Micco L, Razavian M et al. Effects of antiplatelet therapy on mortality and cardiovascular and bleeding outcomes in persons with chronic kidney disease: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Ann Intern Med 2012; 156: 445–459
- Palmer SC, McGregor DO, Macaskill P et al. Meta-analysis: vitamin D compounds in chronic kidney disease. Ann Intern Med 2007; 147: 840–853
- Palmer SC, Navaneethan SD, Craig JC *et al.* Meta-analysis: erythropoiesis-stimulating agents in patients with chronic kidney disease. Ann Intern Med 2010; 153: 23–33
- Strippoli GF, Tong A, Palmer SC *et al.* Calcimimetics for secondary hyperparathyroidism in chronic kidney disease patients. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2006: CD006254
- Eknoyan G, Beck GJ, Cheung AK et al. Effect of dialysis dose and membrane flux in maintenance hemodialysis. N Engl J Med 2002; 347: 2010–2019
- 11. Strippoli GF, Navaneethan SD, Johnson DW *et al.* Effects of statins in patients with chronic kidney disease: meta-analysis and meta-regression of randomised controlled trials. BMJ 2008; 336: 645–651
- Dye BA, Tan S, Smith V *et al.* Trends in oral health status: United States, 1988–1994 and 1999–2004. National Center for Health Statistics. Vital Health Stat 2007
- Petersen PE, Bourgeois D, Ogawa H et al. The global burden of oral diseases and risks to oral health. Bull World Health Org 2005; 83: 661–669
- Beaglehole R, Benzian H, Crail J *et al.* The Oral Health Atlas: Mapping a Neglected Global Health Issue. Geneva & Brighton: FDI World Dental Education Ltd & Myriad Editions, 2009
- Sanders AE, Slade GD, Lim S *et al.* Impact of oral disease on quality of life in the US and Australian populations. Community Dent Oral Epidemiol 2009; 37: 171–181
- Griffin SO, Barker LK, Griffin PM *et al.* Oral health needs among adults in the United States with chronic diseases. J Am Dent Assoc 2009; 140: 1266–1274
- Grubbs V, Plantinga LC, Tuot DS *et al.* Chronic kidney disease and use of dental services in a United States public healthcare system: a retrospective cohort study. BMC Nephrol 2012; 13: 16
- Geneau R, Stuckler D, Stachenko S *et al.* Raising the priority of preventing chronic diseases: a political process. Lancet 2010; 376: 1689–1698
- Moynihan P, Petersen PE. Diet, nutrition and the prevention of dental diseases. Public Health Nutr 2004; 7: 201–226
- Akar H, Akar GC, Carrero JJ *et al.* Systemic consequences of poor oral health in chronic kidney disease patients. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2011; 6: 218–226
- Liu Y, Coresh J, Eustace JA *et al.* Association between cholesterol level and mortality in dialysis patients: role of inflammation and malnutrition. JAMA 2004; 291: 451–459

- Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J *et al.* Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. Ann Intern Med 2009; 151: 264–269, W64
- K/DOQI clinical practice guidelines for chronic kidney disease: evaluation, classification, and stratification. Am J Kidney Dis 2002; 39: S1–S266
- Hayden JA, Cote P, Bombardier C. Evaluation of the quality of prognosis studies in systematic reviews. Ann Intern Med 2006; 144: 427–437
- 25. Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ et al. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. BMJ 2003; 327: 557–560
- Afanas'ev VV, Vavilova TP, Osokin MV et al. Salivary glands secretory activity in patients with terminal chronic renal insufficiency on programmed dialysis [Russian]. Stomatologiia 2006; 85: 29–31
- Ahmadieh A, Baharvand M, Fallah F et al. Oral microflora in patients on hemodialysis and kidney transplant recipients. Iran J Kidney Dis 2010; 4: 227–231
- Akpolat T, Diri B, Oguz Y *et al.* Behcet's disease and renal failure. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2003; 18: 888–891
- Al Wahadni A, Al Omari MA. Dental diseases in a Jordanian population on renal dialysis. Quintessence Int 2003; 34: 343–347
- Asceric M, Avdic S, Nukic S *et al.* Intensive observation of toxic side effects after several-year of cyclosporin treatment in kidney transplant patient. Bosn J Basic Med Sci 2007; 7: 132–135
- Atassi F, Almas K. Oral hygiene profile of subjects on renal dialysis. Indian J Dent Res 2001; 12: 71–76
- Attia EAS, Hassan SI, Youssef NM. Cutaneous disorders in uremic patients on hemodialysis: an Egyptian case-controlled study. Int J Dermatol 2010; 49: 1024–1030
- Barer GM, Pankova SN, Volozhin AI. Characteristics of the course of periodontitis in kidney pathology [Russian]. Stomatologiia 1989; 68: 34–37
- Bayraktar G, Kazancioglu R, Bozfakioglu S et al. Stimulated salivary flow rate in chronic hemodialysis patients. Nephron 2002; 91: 210–214
- Bayraktar G, Kazancioglu R, Bozfakioglu S et al. Evaluation of salivary parameters and dental status in adult hemodialysis patients. Clin Nephrol 2004; 62: 380–383
- Bayraktar G, Kurtulus I, Duraduryan A *et al.* Dental and periodontal findings in hemodialysis patients. Oral Dis 2007; 13: 393–397
- Bayraktar G, Kurtulus I, Kazancioglu R *et al.* Evaluation of periodontal parameters in patients undergoing peritoneal dialysis or hemodialysis. Oral Dis 2008; 14: 185–189
- Bayraktar G, Kurtulus I, Kazancioglu R *et al.* Oral health and inflammation in patients with end-stage renal failure. Perit Dial Int 2009; 29: 472–479
- Benderli Y, Erdilek D, Koray F *et al.* The relation between salivary IgA and caries in renal transplant patients. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2000; 89: 588–593
- Boratynska M, Radwan-Oczko M, Falkiewicz K et al. Gingival overgrowth in kidney transplant recipients treated with cyclosporine and its relationship with chronic graft nephropathy. Transplant Proc 2003; 35: 2238–2240
- Borawski J, Wilczynska-Borawska M, Stokowska W et al. The periodontal status of pre-dialysis chronic kidney disease and maintenance dialysis patients. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2007; 22: 457–464
- 42. Bots CP, Brand HS, Poorterman JH *et al.* Oral and salivary changes in patients with end stage renal disease (ESRD): a two year follow-up study. Br Dent J 2007; 202: E3
- Bots CP, Brand HS, Veerman EC *et al.* Interdialytic weight gain in patients on hemodialysis is associated with dry mouth and thirst. Kidney Int 2004; 66: 1662–1668
- Bots CP, Poorterman JH, Brand HS *et al.* The oral health status of dentate patients with chronic renal failure undergoing dialysis therapy. Oral Dis 2006; 12: 176–180
- Bouattar T, Chbicheb S, Benamar L *et al*. Dental status in 42 chronically hemodialyzed patients. Rev Stomatol Chir Maxillofac 2011; 112: 1–5
- Buhlin K, Barany P, Heimburger O et al. Oral health and pro-inflammatory status in end-stage renal disease patients. Oral Health Prev Dent 2007; 5: 235–244

- Castillo A, Mesa F, Liebana J *et al.* Periodontal and oral microbiological status of an adult population undergoing haemodialysis: a cross-sectional study. Oral Dis 2007; 13: 198–205
- Cengiz MI, Bal S, Gokcay S *et al.* Does periodontal disease reflect atherosclerosis in continuous ambulatory peritoneal dialysis patients? J Periodontol 2007; 78: 1926–1934
- Cengiz MI, Sumer P, Cengiz S *et al*. The effect of the duration of the dialysis in hemodialysis patients on dental and periodontal findings. Oral Dis 2009; 15: 336–341
- 50. Chamani G, Zarei MR, Radvar M *et al.* Oral health status of dialysis patients based on their renal dialysis history in Kerman, Iran. Oral Health Prev Dent 2009; 7: 269–275
- Chen LP, Chiang CK, Chan CP *et al.* Does periodontitis reflect inflammation and malnutrition status in hemodialysis patients? Am J Kidney Dis 2006; 47: 815–822
- 52. Chomicz L, Piekarczyk J, Fiedor P *et al.* Screening evaluation of oral cavity microorganisms in dialyzed and kidney allograft recipients under chronic immunosuppression. Transplant Proc 2002; 34: 675–676
- Chuang SF, Sung JM, Kuo SC *et al.* Oral and dental manifestations in diabetic and nondiabetic uremic patients receiving hemodialysis. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2005; 99: 689–695
- 54. Cunha FL, Tagliaferro EP, Pereira AC *et al.* Oral health of a Brazilian population on renal dialysis. Spec Care Dentist 2007; 27: 227–231
- 55. Dag A, Firat ET, Kadiroglu AK *et al.* Significance of elevated gingival crevicular fluid tumor necrosis factor-alpha and interleukin-8 levels in chronic hemodialysis patients with periodontal disease. J Periodontal Res 2010; 45: 445–450
- de la Rosa E, Cruz S, Mondragon A. Tooth loss in diabetic patients with and without chronic kidney disease and dialysis [Spanish]. Nefrologia 2008; 28: 645–648
- 57. de la Rosa GE, Mondragon PA, Aranda RS *et al.* Oral mucosa symptoms, signs and lesions, in end stage renal disease and non-end stage renal disease diabetic patients. Med Oral Patol Oral Cir Bucal 2006; 11: E467–EE73
- De Souza CM, Braosi AP, Luczyszyn SM et al. Oral health in Brazilian patients with chronic renal disease. Rev Med Chil 2008; 136: 741–746
- De Souza CM, Sa TC, Pereira AL *et al.* Evaluation of oral condition of patients with chronic renal failure submitted to hemodialysis [Portuguese]. Rev Assoc Med Bras 2007; 53: 510–514
- Dirschnabel A, Martins A, Dantas S *et al.* Clinical oral findings in dialysis and kidney-transplant patients. Quintessence Int 2011; 42: 127–133
- Dumitrescu AL, Garneata L, Guzun O. Anxiety, stress, depression, oral health status and behaviours in Romanian hemodialysis patients. Rom J Intern Med 2009; 47: 161–168
- Eltas A, Tozoglu U, Keles M *et al.* Assessment of oral health in peritoneal dialysis patients with and without diabetes mellitus. Perit Dial Int 2012; 32: 81–85
- Epstein SR, Mandel I, Scopp IW. Salivary composition and calculus formation in patients undergoing hemodialysis. J Periodontol 1980; 51: 336–338
- 64. Ersson C, Thorman R, Rodhe Y *et al.* DNA damage in salivary gland tissue in patients with chronic kidney disease, measured by the comet assay. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2011; 112: 209–215
- 65. Fisher MA, Taylor GW, Shelton BJ *et al.* Periodontal disease and other nontraditional risk factors for CKD. Am J Kidney Dis 2008; 51: 45–52
- Franek E, Blaschyk R, Kolonko A *et al.* Oral hygiene in haemodialyzed patients with chronic renal failure [Polish]. Wiad Lek 2006; 59: 184–188
- Frankenthal S, Nakhoul F, Machtei EE *et al.* The effect of secondary hyperparathyroidism and hemodialysis therapy on alveolar bone and periodontium. J Clin Periodontol 2002; 29: 479–483
- Garcez J, Limeres PJ, Carmona IT *et al.* Oral health status of patients with a mild decrease in glomerular filtration rate. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2009; 107: 224–228
- Gavalda C, Bagan J, Scully C *et al.* Renal hemodialysis patients: oral, salivary, dental and periodontal findings in 105 adult cases. Oral Dis 1999; 5: 299–302
- Genctoy G, Ozbek M, Avcu N *et al.* Gingival health status in renal transplant recipients: relationship between systemic inflammation and atherosclerosis. Int J Clin Pract 2007; 61: 577–582

- Goncalves EM, Lima DLF, Albuquerque SHCd *et al.* Evaluation of dental insertion loss in patients with chronic kidney disease. J Bras Nefrol 2011; 33: 291–294
- Gurkan A, Kose T, Atilla G. Oral health status and oral hygiene habits of an adult Turkish population on dialysis. Oral Health Prev Dent 2008; 6: 37–43
- Guzeldemir E, Toygar HU, Tasdelen B *et al.* Oral health-related quality of life and periodontal health status in patients undergoing hemodialysis. J Am Dent Assoc 2009; 140: 1283–1293
- Hajheydari Z, Makhlough A. Cutaneous and mucosal manifestations in patients on maintenance hemodialysis: a study of 101 patients in Sari, Iran. Iran J Kidney Dis 2008; 2: 86–90
- 75. Hamissi J, Porsamimi J, Naseh MR *et al.* Oral hygiene and periodontal status of hemodialyzed patients with chronic renal failure in Qazvin, Iran. East Afr J Public Health 2009; 6: 108–111
- Ioannidou E, Swede H, Dongari-Bagtzoglou A. Periodontitis predicts elevated C-reactive protein levels in chronic kidney disease. J Dent Res 2011; 90: 1411–1415
- Kadiroglu AK, Kadiroglu ET, Sit D *et al.* Periodontitis is an important and occult source of inflammation in hemodialysis patients. Blood Purif 2006; 24: 400–404
- Keles M, Tozoglu U, Uyanik A *et al.* Does peritoneal dialysis affect halitosis in patients with end-stage renal disease? Perit Dial Int 2011; 31: 168–172
- Khosravi M, Golchai J, Mokhtari G. Muco-cutaneous manifestations in 178 renal transplant recipients. Clin Transplant 2011; 25: 395–400
- Klassen JT, Krasko BM. The dental health status of dialysis patients. J Can Dent Assoc 2002; 68: 34–38
- Knoll R, Reinel D, Bothe C *et al.* Fungal involvement of the tongue and feces in dialysis-dependent patients [German]. Z Hautkr 1990; 65: 476–480
- 82. Kshirsagar AV, Craig RG, Beck JD *et al.* Severe periodontitis is associated with low serum albumin among patients on maintenance hemodialysis therapy. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2007; 2: 239–244
- Locsey L, Alberth M, Mauks G. Dental management of chronic haemodialysis patients. Int Urol Nephrol 1986; 18: 211–213
- Lopez-Pintor RM, Hernandez G, de Arriba L *et al*. Oral ulcers during the course of cytomegalovirus infection in renal transplant recipients. Transplant Proc 2009; 41: 2419–2421
- Marakoglu I, Gursoy UK, Demirer S et al. Periodontal status of chronic renal failure patients receiving hemodialysis. Yonsei Med J 2003; 44: 648–652
- Martins C, Siqueira WL, de Oliveira E *et al.* Salivary analysis of patients with chronic renal failure undergoing hemodialysis. Spec Care Dentist 2006; 26: 205–208
- Matsuo K, Nakamoto M, Yasunaga C et al. Dialysis-related amyloidosis of the tongue in long-term hemodialysis patients. Kidney Int 1997; 52: 832–838
- Montagnac R, Delagne JM, Schillinger D et al. Dental problems and their management in uraemic patients [French]. Nephrol Ther 2006; 2: 436–441
- 89. Oshrain HI, Mender S, Mandel ID. Periodontal status of patients with reduced immunocapacity. J Periodontol 1979; 50: 185–188
- Perneger TV, Whelton PK, Klag MJ. Race and end-stage renal disease. Socioeconomic status and access to health care as mediating factors. Arch Intern Med 1995; 155: 1201–1208
- Pernu HE, Pernu LM, Knuuttila ML et al. Gingival overgrowth among renal transplant recipients and uraemic patients. Nephrol Dial Transplant 1993; 8: 1254–1258
- Piekarczyk J, Fiedor P, Chomicz L *et al.* Oral cavity as a potential source of infections in recipients with diabetes mellitus. Transplant Proc 2003; 35: 2207–2208
- Radwan-Oczko M, Boratynska M, Zietek M. Clinical evaluation of marginal parodontium condition in patients after kidney graft treated with calcineurine inhibitors and calcium channel blockers. Bull Group Int Rech Sci Stomatol Odontol 2004; 46: 46–51
- Rahman MM, Caglayan F, Rahman B. Periodontal health parameters in patients with chronic renal failure and renal transplants receiving immunosuppressive therapy. J Nihon Univ Sch Dent 1992; 34: 265–272

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

- Sekiguchi RT, Pannuti CM, Silva HT, Jr *et al.* Decrease in oral health may be associated with length of time since beginning dialysis. Spec Care Dentist 2012; 32: 6–10
- Shouda J, Nakamoto H, Sugahara S *et al.* Incidence of gingival hyperplasia caused by calcium antagonists in continuous ambulatory peritoneal dialysis patients. Adv Perit Dial 1999; 15: 153–155
- Siribamrungwong M, Puangpanngam K. Treatment of periodontal diseases reduces chronic systemic inflammation in maintenance hemodialysis patients. Ren Fail 2012; 34: 171–175
- Sobrado Marinho JS, Tomas CI, Loureiro A *et al*. Oral health status in patients with moderate-severe and terminal renal failure. Med Oral Patol Oral Cir Bucal 2007; 12: E305–E310
- 99. Spratt H, Boomer S, Irwin CR *et al.* Cyclosporin associated gingival overgrowth in renal transplant recipients. Oral Dis 1999; 5: 27–31
- 100. Sung JM, Kuo SC, Guo HR et al. Decreased salivary flow rate as a dipsogenic factor in hemodialysis patients: evidence from an observational study and a pilocarpine clinical trial. J Am Soc Nephrol 2005; 16: 3418–3429
- 101. Sung JM, Kuo SC, Guo HR et al. The role of oral dryness in interdialytic weight gain by diabetic and non-diabetic haemodialysis patients. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2006; 21: 2521–2528
- 102. Takeuchi Y, Ishikawa H, Inada M et al. Study of the oral microbial flora in patients with renal disease. Nephrology 2007; 12: 182–190
- 103. Thorman R, Lundahl J, Yucel-Lindberg T *et al.* Inflammatory cytokines in saliva: early signs of metabolic disorders in chronic kidney disease. A controlled cross-sectional study. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2010; 110: 597–604
- 104. Thorman R, Neovius M, Hylander B. Clinical findings in oral health during progression of chronic kidney disease to end-stage renal disease in a Swedish population. Scand J Urol Nephrol 2009; 43: 154–159
- 105. Tollefsen T, Johansen JR. The periodontal status of prospective and renal transplant patients. Comparison with systemically healthy subjects. J Periodontal Res 1985; 20: 220–226
- 106. Tomas I, Marinho JS, Limeres J *et al.* Changes in salivary composition in patients with renal failure. Arch Oral Biol 2008; 53: 528–532
- 107. Torres SA, Rosa OPdS, Hayacibara MF *et al.* Periodontal parameters and BANA test in patients with chronic renal failure undergoing hemodialysis. J Appl Oral Sci 2010; 18: 297–302
- 108. Turco G, Ferrari PS, Sacco M et al. Hypertrophic gingivitis caused by cyclosporin A. 30 months' clinical experience in the use of cyclosporin A in patients undergoing cadaver kidney transplantation, with special attention to the proven side effects at the gingival level [Italian]. Minerva Stomatol 1988; 37: 1043–1050
- Vesterinen M, Ruokonen H, Furuholm J *et al.* Oral health in predialysis patients with emphasis on diabetic nephropathy. Clin Oral Investig 2011; 15: 99–104
- 110. Vesterinen M, Ruokonen H, Leivo T *et al.* Oral health and dental treatment of patients with renal disease. Quintessence Int 2007; 38: 211–219
- Wilczynska-Borawska M, Borawski J, Stokowska W. Risk factors of tooth loss in maintenance hemodialysis patients. Dent Med Probl 2004; 41: 751–756

- 112. Yamalik N, Delilbasi L, Gulay H *et al.* The histological investigation of gingiva from patients with chronic renal failure, renal transplants, and periodontitis: a light and electron microscopic study. J Periodontol 1991; 62: 737–744
- 113. Ziebolz D, Fischer P, Hornecker E *et al.* Oral health of hemodialysis patients: a cross-sectional study at two German dialysis centers. Hemodialysis 2012; 16: 69–75
- 114. Navazesh M, Kumar SK. Measuring salivary flow: challenges and opportunities. J Am Dent Assoc 2008; 139(Suppl): 35S–40S
- Edgar WM. Saliva and dental health. Clinical implications of saliva: report of a consensus meeting. Br Dent J 1990; 169: 96–98
- 116. Linden GJ, McClean K, Young I et al. Persistently raised C-reactive protein levels are associated with advanced periodontal disease. J Clin Periodontol 2008; 35: 741–747
- 117. Shultis WA, Weil EJ, Looker HC *et al*. Effect of periodontitis on overt nephropathy and end-stage renal disease in type 2 diabetes. Diabetes Care 2007; 30: 306–311
- Seinost G, Wimmer G, Skerget M *et al.* Periodontal treatment improves endothelial dysfunction in patients with severe periodontitis. Am Heart J 2005; 149: 1050–1054
- 119. Lalla E, Lamster IB, Hofmann MA et al. Oral infection with a periodontal pathogen accelerates early atherosclerosis in apolipoprotein E-null mice. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol 2003; 23: 1405–1411
- Kowolik MJ, Dowsett SA, Rodriguez J et al. Systemic neutrophil response resulting from dental plaque accumulation. J Periodontol 2001; 72: 146–151
- 121. Geerts SO, Nys M, De MP *et al.* Systemic release of endotoxins induced by gentle mastication: association with periodontitis severity. J Periodontol 2002; 73: 73–78
- 122. Beck JD, Eke P, Heiss G *et al.* Periodontal disease and coronary heart disease: a reappraisal of the exposure. Circulation 2005; 112: 19–24
- 123. Slade GD, Ghezzi EM, Heiss G *et al.* Relationship between periodontal disease and C-reactive protein among adults in the Atherosclerosis Risk in Communities study. Arch Intern Med 2003; 163: 1172–1179
- 124. DeStefano F, Anda RF, Kahn HS *et al.* Dental disease and risk of coronary heart disease and mortality. BMJ 1993; 306: 688–691
- 125. Lockhart PB, Bolger AF, Papapanou PN *et al*. Periodontal disease and atherosclerotic vascular disease: does the evidence support an independent association? Circulation 2012; 125: 2520–2544
- 126. Tonetti MS, D'Aiuto F, Nibali L *et al.* Treatment of periodontitis and endothelial function. N Engl J Med 2007; 356: 911–920
- 127. Petersen PE. The World Oral Health Report 2003: continuous improvement of oral health in the 21st century—the approach of the WHO Global Oral Health Programme. Community Dent Oral Epidemiol 2003; 31(Suppl. 1): 3–23
- Petersen PE. Sociobehavioural risk factors in dental caries—international perspectives. Community Dent Oral Epidemiol 2005; 33: 274–279

Received for publication: 5.6.2013; Accepted in revised form: 14.8.2013