

### Principles of International Environmental Law

The third edition of this classic textbook offers comprehensive and critical commentary on international environmental law. It fully covers the key topics of the course and is clearly structured to include the history and framework in which international environmental law exists, key areas of regulation and implementation, links to other areas of law and future developments. It has been updated to incorporate all the latest developments in treaty and case law. Extensive feedback on previous editions results in a re-structuring of material, including a new part focused on linkage to other areas of international law including human rights, international trade and foreign investment. There is also a new chapter on future developments charting the directions in which the subject is moving. Specialist authors writing on oceans, seas and fisheries and biodiversity add to the expertise of the two principal authors for an authoritative overview of the subject.

Philippe Sands is Professor of Law and Director of the Centre on International Courts and Tribunals in the UCL Faculty of Laws. He is also a practising barrister, with extensive experience litigating cases before the International Court of Justice, the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea, the International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes, and the European Court of Justice.

Jacqueline Peel is an Associate Professor at the Melbourne Law School, with a background in environmental science and law. She has taught many courses in environmental law, international environmental law and climate change law, and has published widely in the field.





# Principles of International Environmental Law

THIRD EDITION

Philippe Sands
Jacqueline Peel
with
Adriana Fabra
Ruth MacKenzie





### **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521769594

© Philippe Sands, Jacqueline Peel, Adriana Fabra and Ruth MacKenzie 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published by Manchester University Press 1995 Second edition published by Cambridge University Press 2003 Third edition Cambridge University Press 2012 5th printing 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by T. J. International Ltd, Padstow

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-76959-4 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-14093-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

Foreword xxi Preface and acknowledgments to the first edition xxv Preface and acknowledgments to the second edition xxix Preface and acknowledgments to the third edition xxxi Table of cases xxxiii Table of treaties and other international instruments xxxvii List of abbreviations | | | | | | | | | |

#### PART I THE LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

1 The environment and international society: issues, concepts and definitions 3

```
The basis for decision-making: science, economics and other values 5
  Science 6
  Economics 7
  Other social objectives 8
  Sustainable development 9
The international legal order 10
  The functions of international law 10
  Sovereignty and territory 11
  International actors 13
```

The environmental challenge 3

The environment and international law: defining terms 13 Challenges for international environmental law 15

Environmental economics and development 20

Further reading 16

```
International environmental law: texts, articles and history 16
Sources of international environmental law 18
  Primary materials 18
  International environmental jurisprudence 18
Journals 19
  International law generally 19
  International environmental law 19
  International environmental co-operation and policy 19
  Science and the state of the environment 20
```

Websites 21



### vi Contents

```
2 History
   Introduction 22
   From early fisheries conventions to the creation of the United Nations
   From the creation of the United Nations to Stockholm: 1945–72
     UNCCUR 27
     The 1972 United Nations Conference on the Human Environment 30
     Stockholm follow-up 33
   From Stockholm to Rio: 1972-92 34
     Post-Stockholm: treaties and other international acts 34
        1978 UNEP draft Principles 36
        1981 Montevideo Programme 37
       1982 World Charter for Nature 37
       1980 World Conservation Strategy/1991 'Caring for the Earth' Strategy
       The Brundtland Report and the Report of the Legal Experts Group 39
     Conclusions 40
   UNCED 40
     The Rio Declaration 42
     Agenda 21 44
   Beyond UNCED: trends and directions 45
     World Summit on Sustainable Development 47
   Conclusions 49
3 Governance: states, international organisations and non-state actors 50
   Introduction 50
   States 51
   International organisations 52
     Introduction 52
       History of international organisational arrangements 53
       UNCED 53
       The function and role of international organisations 55
     Global organisations 56
       United Nations (www.un.org) 56
     UN General Assembly 58
       UN Environment Programme (www.unep.org)
       UN Development Programme (www.undp.org) 62
       International Law Commission (www.un.org/law/ilc) 63
       UN Commission on Sustainable Development (www.un.org/esa/dsd/csd/csd_index.shtml) 63
     Other subsidiary bodies established by the General Assembly 65
       Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) 67
       Security Council 69
       Trusteeship Council 69
       International Court of Justice (www.icj-cij.org) 70
     United Nations specialised agencies and related organisations 70
       Food and Agriculture Organization (www.fao.org) 70
       United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (www.unesco.org) 72
       International Maritime Organization (www.imo.org) 72
       International Labour Organization (www.ilo.org) 73
       World Meteorological Organization (www.wmo.int) 73
       International Civil Aviation Organization (www.icao.int) 74
```



### vii Contents

UN Industrial Development Organization (www.unido.org) 74 World Health Organization (www.who.int) 74 International Atomic Energy Agency (www.iaea.org) 75 World Bank, International Monetary Fund, and World Trade Organization 76 Co-operative arrangements 76 Other global institutions 77 Regional and sub-regional organisations 77 Europe and the OECD 77 Africa 81 Americas and the Caribbean 82 Asia Pacific 82 Organisations established by environmental treaties 83 Non-state actors 86 Scientific community 87 Environmental, health and developmental organisations 88 Legal groups 88 Corporate sector 89 Individuals and indigenous communities 90 The media 91 Conclusions 92

### 4 International law-making and regulation 94

Introduction 94 Treaties 96 Environmental treaties 98 The treaty-making process 98 The 1969 Vienna Convention and legal issues relating to treaties 99 Interpretation 100 Entry into force 102 Reservations and interpretative declarations 103 Relations between international agreements 105 Amendment 107 Other international acts 108 Acts of international organisations 108 Conference declarations and other acts 110 Customary international law 111 State practice 112 Opinio juris 114 Treaties and custom 115 Persistent objector 116 Regional custom 117 General principles of international law 117 Equity 119 Subsidiary sources 120 Introduction to regulatory approaches 121 Direct regulation 122 Environmental quality standards 122

Product standards 123 Emissions standards 123



### viii Contents

Process standards 123

Economic instruments 124 Charges and taxes 126 Joint implementation and tradeable permits 127 Deposit-refund systems 128 Subsidies 128 Enforcement incentives 129 Liability and compensation for damage 129 Trade measures 129 Investment incentives 130 Environmental agreements 130 Consumer information incentives 131 Integrated pollution control and integrated environmental management 131 Conclusions 133 5 Compliance: implementation, enforcement, dispute settlement Introduction 135 Implementation 138 National law 138 National compliance 139 Reporting 143 International enforcement 144 Enforcement by states 144 Damage to a state's own environment 145 Damage to the environment of another state 146 Damage to the environment in areas beyond national jurisdiction 146 Enforcement by international organisations 151 Enforcement by non-state actors 155 Enforcement in the national courts 155 International enforcement 157 International conflict resolution (settlement of disputes) 159 Introduction 159 Diplomatic means of dispute settlement 159 Negotiation and consultation 159 Mediation, conciliation, fact-finding and international institutions 161 Non-compliance procedures 163 Inspection procedures of multilateral development banks 167 NAFTA Commission on Environmental Cooperation 168 Legal means of dispute settlement 169 Arbitration 169 International courts 171 International Court of Justice 171 Contentious cases 172 Advisory opinions 174 Interim measures of protection 174 UNCLOS and ITLOS 175

WTO Dispute Settlement Body 177

Human rights courts 180

Conclusions 181

European Court of Justice and Court of First Instance 179



ix Contents

### PART II PRINCIPLES AND RULES ESTABLISHING STANDARDS

### 6 General principles and rules 187

Introduction 187

Principles and rules 188

Sovereignty over natural resources and the responsibility not to cause damage to the environment of other states or to areas beyond national jurisdiction 190

Sovereign rights over natural resources 191

Sovereignty and extra-territoriality 192

Responsibility not to cause environmental damage 195

Conclusion 200

Principle of preventive action 200

Co-operation 203

Sustainable development 206

Introduction 206

Future generations 209

Sustainable use of natural resources 210

Equitable use of natural resources 213

Integration of environment and development 215

Conclusion 217

Precautionary principle 217

Polluter pays principle 228

OECD 230

European Union 231

Principle of common but differentiated responsibility 233

Common responsibility 234

Differentiated responsibility 234

Conclusions 236

### 7 Atmospheric protection and climate change 238

Introduction 238

Milestones in the development of atmospheric regulation 239

Trail Smelter case 239

Nuclear testing 240

Customary law 242

UNCED and WSSD 243

### Urban and transboundary air pollution 245

1979 UNECE Convention on Long Range Transboundary Air Pollution and its Protocols 246

1979 LRTAP Convention 247

1984 Monitoring and Evaluation Protocol 248

1985 Sulphur Protocol 248

1988 NO<sub>x</sub> Protocol 249

1991 Volatile Organic Compounds Protocol 251

1994 Sulphur Protocol 253

1998 Aarhus Protocol on Heavy Metals 254

1998 Aarhus Protocol on Persistent Organic Pollutants 255

1999 Gothenburg Protocol to Abate Acidification, Eutrophication and Ground-Level Ozone 255

1991 Canada-US Air Quality Agreement 257

Sulphur dioxide 257

Nitrogen oxides 258



### x Contents

Ozone 258 Assessment, information and institutions 258 2002 ASEAN Agreement on Transboundary Haze Pollution 259 Aircraft emissions: ICAO Convention 260 Emissions from international shipping 261 Ozone depletion 262 1985 Vienna Convention 264 The 1987 Montreal Protocol: Adjustments and Amendments 265 Controlled substances 266 Control measures: consumption and production 267 Control measures: trade in controlled substances Developing countries 272 Technical, financial and other assistance 272 Reporting and compliance 273 Institutional arrangements 274 Climate change 274 1992 Climate Change Convention 276 Preamble, definition, objective and principles 277 General commitments 278 Reporting 279 Specific commitments: sources and sinks 279 Commitments: financial resources and technology transfer 281 Institutional arrangements 282 Implementation and dispute settlement 283 The 1997 Kyoto Protocol 283 Emission reduction targets and timetable 285 Policies and measures 287 Flexibility mechanisms: emissions trading, joint implementation and the CDM 287 Sinks 291 Developing countries 292 Reporting and compliance 292 Subsequent developments: Copenhagen, Cancún and beyond 293 Copenhagen conference (COP 15) 294 Cancún conference (COP 16) 296 Ongoing negotiations 298 Outer space 299 1967 Outer Space Treaty 1979 Moon Treaty 300 Outer Space Principles 301 Conclusions 301

#### 8 Freshwater resources

Introduction 303 Customary law 305 Lac Lanoux arbitration 307 ILA: 1966 Helsinki Rules and beyond 308 ILC: 1997 Watercourses Convention 310 ILC 2008: Articles on Transboundary Aquifers 312 Case Concerning the Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project 313 Regional rules 319 Europe 319 Rhine 320



### xi Contents

1992 Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes 322 Americas 326 1909 Boundary Waters Treaty 326 Gut Dam arbitration 327 1978 Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement 328 The 1975 Statute of the River Uruguay 329 The Case Concerning the Pulp Mills on the River Uruguay 330 Africa 333 Niger basin 334 Southern Africa, including the Zambezi River 335 Mekong River Basin 336 Subcontinental Asia 337 Israel-Jordan Peace Treaty 339 Conclusions 340

### Oceans, seas and marine living resources

Introduction 342 Ecosystem approach 345 Protection of the marine environment 346 Introduction 346 Development of standards of international law 347 UNCLOS 349 Regional arrangements 352 UNEP Regional Seas Programme 352 Northeast Atlantic (1992 OSPAR Convention) and the North Sea 360 Baltic Sea: the 1992 Helsinki Convention 362 Caspian Sea: the 2003 Tehran Convention 364 Pollution by dumping 365 UNCLOS: general principles 366 1972 London Convention and 1996 Protocol 366 Regional agreements 370 Pollution from land-based sources including through the atmosphere 372 UNCLOS 373 1995 Global Programme of Action 374 Regional agreements 375 Atmospheric pollution 378 Pollution from vessels 378 UNCLOS 380 MARPOL 73/78 381 Other agreements on pollution from ships 385 Safety agreements 386 Pollution from seabed activities 387 UNCLOS 387 Regional agreements 389 Other agreements 390 Environmental emergencies 391 1969 Intervention Convention and 1973 Intervention Protocol 391 1989 Salvage Convention 392 1990 OPRC Convention and 2000 HNS Protocol 393 1969 and 1983 Bonn Agreements 394



### xii Contents

UNEP Regional Seas Protocols 394 Liability and compensation 395 Conservation of marine living resources 396 Introduction 396 Milestones in the development of fisheries law 399 Pacific Fur Seal arbitration 399 Food and Agriculture Organization 400 The First UN Conference on the Law of the Sea (1958) 401 Fisheries Jurisdiction case 402 The 1972 Stockholm Conference on the Human Environment 402 UNCLOS 403 Territorial waters, archipelagic waters and the continental shelf 404 Exclusive economic zone 404 High seas 405 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement and other global arrangements 407 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement 408 1993 Compliance Agreement 410 1995 Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries 411 Regional fishery arrangements 411 Fisheries case law 418 Estai case (Canada v. Spain) 418 Southern Bluefin Tuna cases (New Zealand v. Japan, Australia v. Japan) 420 Swordfish case (Chile v. EU) 421 Marine mammals 423 International Whaling Commission 425 1992 ASCOBANS 428 1992 NAMMCO 428 Marine birds 429 Destructive fishing practices 429 Driftnet fishing 430 Bottom trawling 431 Illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing 432 2009 Agreement on Port State Measures 433 Conservation of marine biodiversity 434 The international legal framework 435 UNCLOS and the 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement 435 Convention on Biological Diversity 435 Agenda 21 and the Johannesburg Plan of Implementation 436 Resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly 437 Regional arrangements 437 Protection of deep-sea ecosystems 439 UNCLOS and the 1995 Fish Stocks Agreement 440 Resolutions of the UN General Assembly 440 Food and Agriculture Organization 441 Convention on Biological Diversity 442 Marine protected areas 442 Marine protected areas within the EEZ 444 MPAs in areas beyond national jurisdiction 445 Conclusions 447

### 10 Biological diversity 449

Introduction 449



### xiii Contents

```
International law 451
Convention on Biological Diversity 453
  Preamble and jurisdictional scope 454
  Conservation and sustainable use 454
  Access to genetic resources and benefit sharing 457
  Biotechnology and living modified organisms 460
  Financial resources and mechanism 460
  Institutions and other mechanisms 460
  Evolution of the Biodiversity Convention 461
  2010 Nagoya Protocol 464
Global instruments addressing specific threats to biodiversity 466
  Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety 466
  Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species 472
    Institutions 472
    Preamble and definitions 473
    Appendices I, II and III and international trade 473
    Amendments to Appendices 474
    Reservations 476
    Exemptions and special provisions 476
    Introduction from the sea under CITES 478
    Enforcement 478
General instruments of regional and sub-regional application 479
  Africa 480
    1968 African Nature Convention 480
    2003 Revised African Nature Convention 481
    1994 Lusaka Agreement 483
  The Americas and the Caribbean 484
    1940 Western Hemisphere Convention 484
    1978 Treaty for Amazonian Cooperation 485
  Pacific islands region 486
  Europe 487
    1979 Berne Convention 487
    1982 Benelux Convention 489
    1991 Alpine Convention 489
    2003 Carpathians Convention 490
  Asia 490
Regulation of particular habitats or species 492
  Wetlands 492
  Forests 495
    1994 International Tropical Timber Agreement 495
    International Tropical Timber Agreement 2006 496
    1992 Forest Principles 497
    UN Forum on Forests 497
    2007 Non-Legally Binding Instrument on All Types of Forests 498
  Land, soil and desertification 499
    1994 Convention to Combat Desertification 500
  Migratory species 502
    1979 Bonn Convention on Migratory Species 502
  Birds 505
    1950 Birds Convention 505
    1970 Benelux Convention 505
  Other animal species 506
```



### xiv Contents

1973 Polar Bear Agreement 506
1979 Vicuna Convention 506
Plants and plant genetic resources 507
Cultural and natural heritage and landscape 509
1972 World Heritage Convention 510
Conclusions 511

#### 11 Hazardous substances and activities 514

Introduction 514

Definition of hazardous substances 516

Accident prevention, preparedness and response 516

1996 EU Seveso Directive 518

1992 Industrial Accidents Convention 519

Chemicals, pesticides and other dangerous substances 521

Registration and classification (including labelling and packaging) 522

Production and use 523

2001 POPs Convention 52

International trade 526

1985 FAO Code of Conduct 528

1987 UNEP London Guidelines 529

1998 Chemicals Convention 530

Transport 532

The working environment 532

### Nuclear activities and radioactive substances 536

Nuclear safety 537

1994 Nuclear Safety Convention 538

1997 Joint Safety Convention 539

Transport 540

Protection of workers and the public 541

Border area co-operation 541

Emergencies 542

Nuclear weapons and testing, and nuclear-free zones 543

### Other hazardous activities 546

Energy 547

Mining 548

Agriculture 550

Transportation 551

Tourism 551

Conclusions 552

### **12 Waste** 554

Introduction 554

### Defining and treating waste 557

Municipal waste 557

Hazardous and toxic wastes (industrial, agricultural and mining waste and sewage sludge) 558

Radioactive waste 560

Prevention and treatment 560

Disposal 562

Disposal at sea 563



### xv Contents

Disposal into rivers and lakes by other land-based sources 564
Incineration 564
Landfill and other land disposal and storage 566
Recycling and re-use 566
International movement (including trade) in waste 567
The 1989 Basel Convention 568
1991 Bamako Convention 571
1995 Waigani Convention 572
North America 574
1990 IAEA Code of Conduct on Radioactive Waste and 1997 Joint Convention on Spent Fuel and Radioactive Waste Management 574
Conclusions 575

### 13 The polar regions: Antarctica and the Arctic 577

Introduction 577

The Antarctic 578

The Antarctic Treaty regime 579
1959 Antarctic Treaty 579
1972 Antarctic Seals Convention 580
1980 CCAMLR 580
1988 CRAMRA 582
1991 Environment Protocol 586
Other treaty provisions 591

The Arctic 591
The Arctic Council 593

Arctic Council 593

Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Programme 594

Arctic Council Action Plan to Eliminate Pollution of the Arctic 594

Protection of the Arctic Marine Environment Working Group 595

Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna Working Group 595

Emergency Prevention, Preparedness, and Response Working Group 596

Sustainable Development Working Group 596

Conclusions 596

### PART III TECHNIQUES FOR IMPLEMENTING INTERNATIONAL PRINCIPLES AND RULES

### 14 Environmental impact assessment 601

Introduction 601

Non-binding instruments 602

UNCED and the WSSD 604

ILC draft Articles on Prevention of Transboundary Harm 605

Treaties and other binding instruments 605

1982 UNCLOS 607

1986 Noumea Convention 609

1991 Espoo Convention 610

2003 Strategic Environmental Assessment Protocol 613

1991 Antarctic Environment Protocol 614

1992 Biodiversity Convention 615

Risk assessment procedures 616



### xvi Contents

World Bank and other multilateral lending institutions 617 International cases 619 Conclusions 622

### 15 Environmental information 624

Introduction 624

Information exchange 626

Reporting and provision of information 629

Reports by organisations 630

Reports under treaties or other agreements 630

Reports of events other than emergencies 633

Information to and from non-state organisations 635

Consultation 636

Prior informed consent 638

Notification of emergency situations 639

Nuclear accidents 641

1986 Notification Convention 643

Monitoring and other information gathering 644

Treaty arrangements 646

Access to environmental information and public participation 648

1992 OSPAR Convention 650

1993 Lugano Civil Liability Convention 651

1998 Aarhus Convention 652

2003 Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers 655

Public education and awareness 657

Eco-labelling 658

Eco-auditing and accounting 659

Environmental accounting 660

Environmental auditing 662

Conclusions 662

### 16 Financial resources, technology transfer and intellectual property 665

Introduction 665

Financial resources and mechanisms 666

Overseas development assistance 667

Multilateral development banks 668

World Bank 669

Regional and sub-regional development banks 671

Environment funds 674

UNEP Environment Fund 674

World Heritage Fund 675

Wetland Conservation Fund 675

Montreal Protocol Multilateral Fund 675

Global Environment Facility 676

### Technology transfer and technical assistance 679

Treaty provisions 681

The ozone regime 682



### xvii Contents

Biodiversity Convention 683
2010 Nagoya Protocol 684
Climate Change Convention and Kyoto Protocol 685
Intellectual property 686
Technology transfer 687
Patents and other rights 690
Traditional knowledge 695
Conclusions 697

### 17 Liability for environmental damage 700

Introduction 700 State liability 702 Introduction 702 General international law 705 Defining environmental damage 706 Threshold at which environmental damage entails liability 708 Standard of care 711 Reparation 714 State practice 717 UN Compensation Commission 720 International crimes 725 Treaties 727 1972 Space Liability Convention 727 1979 LRTAP Convention 729 1982 UNCLOS 729 1988 CRAMRA and 1991 Antarctic Environmental Protocol 733 1992 Climate Change Convention 734 The work of the International Law Commission 734 Civil liability for environmental damage under international law 737 Nuclear installations 738 1960 Paris Convention 739 1963 Vienna Convention 742 1988 Joint Protocol 745 Oil pollution 745 1992 Civil Liability Convention 746 The 1992 Fund Convention 748 2001 Bunker Oil Convention 755 Private compensation schemes 755 Marine environment 756 Waste 757 Transport 759 Antarctic 760 1988 CRAMRA 760 1991 Antarctic Environment Protocol 761 Biodiversity 764 General instruments relating to dangerous goods or activities 766 Council of Europe 766 UNECE 770

Conclusions 771



xviii Contents

### PART IV LINKAGE OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND OTHER AREAS OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

### 18 Human rights and armed conflict 775

International human rights 775

Introduction 775

Development of international human rights law 777

Environmental protection and human rights 777

Economic and social rights 780

Civil and political rights 787

#### War and armed conflict 789

Introduction 789

International environmental law during war and armed conflict 790

International law of war and armed conflict: general rules of environmental protection 792

International law of war and armed conflict: special rules of environmental protection 794

Conclusions 797

### 19 International trade and competition 799

Introduction 799

Trade measures in international environmental agreements 801

Unilateral environmental measures and international trade 806

WTO/GATT 808

Technical barriers to trade 810

Committee on Trade and the Environment 811

WTO/GATT dispute settlement 812

Reformulated Gasoline case (1996) 815

Shrimp/Turtle cases (1998 and 2001) 818

Asbestos case (2000) 824

Brazil Retreaded Tyres case (2007) 827

Assessment 829

Measures for health and safety protection 830

Beef Hormones 832

Australia Salmon 838

Japan Varietals 840

Japan Apples 841

Australia Apples 842

EC - Biotech 844

Assessment 846

European Union 847

Trade restrictions on environmental grounds: the role of the European Court of Justice 848

Canada-United States Free Trade Agreement 852

North American Free Trade Agreement 854

Agricultural, sanitary and phytosanitary measures 855

Non-technical barriers to trade 856

Competition 858

Institutions and dispute settlement 858

North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation 859

Border Environment Cooperation Commission, and North American Development Bank 860

African Economic Community 860



### xix Contents

Competition and subsidies 861
Subsidies 862
Anti-competitive agreements 865
Anti-dumping 866
Conclusions 866

### 20 Foreign investment 869

Introduction 869
Investment treaties 870
Substantive rules 871
Dispute settlement 874
Global rules 874
Case law 876
Insurance 885
Conclusions 886

### 21 Future developments 888

Introduction 888
Governance challenges 891
Implementation and enforcement challenges 893
Future regulatory development 895
Conclusion 897

Index 898





### Foreword

It is with pleasure that I write a foreword to this timely exposition and analysis of the system of environmental law as a whole, and as it stands after the Rio Conference. If it seems a little bold to call environmental law a 'system', it is assuredly not so bold as it would have been before the publication of Philippe Sands' important work. A main purpose of academic writing should be to perceive and portray patterns and relations in a body of legal rules so as to make it manageable, teachable, comprehensible and usable. The present work succeeds in doing this to a remarkable degree.

The author's statement that environmental law has a 'longer history than some might suggest' might be thought to border on understatement. When something is taken up as a modish 'concern', there is often a strong temptation to think of it as a discovery by a newly enlightened generation. It is, therefore, a useful antidote to be reminded that, of the two pioneering decisions, both still leading and much-cited cases, one was the *Bering Sea* arbitration, of a century ago, and the other, the *Trail Smelter* arbitration, of half a century ago. Nevertheless, the present-day need for law to protect the environment and to preserve resources is of a scale and urgency far beyond the imagining of the early pioneers.

Seeing these questions, however, in a proper historical perspective does help to warn against the dangers of treating environmental law as a specialisation, which can be made a separate study; or, on the other hand, of regarding environmental law – and here I borrow Philippe's words – as a 'marginal part of the existing legal order'. A perusal of this book will readily reveal to the reader the fallacy of both of these attitudes. Part I of the book - which is entitled 'The legal and institutional framework' - comprises illuminating treatments of such basic subjects of international law as the legal nature of states, international organisations, non-governmental organisations, treaties and other international acts such as resolutions of the General Assembly and other international bodies, EC regulations and directives, the nature and uses of customary law, the general principles of law, and general problems of compliance, implementation and enforcement, and dispute settlement. These pages amply demonstrate that the environmental lawyer has to be equipped with a good basic knowledge of general international law before he can even get properly started on the study of environmental law. Likewise, the general student of international law will, in these pages, find illumination in plenty on these basic questions of general public international law; and indeed also of EC law. He will also find, in the later pages, valuable light upon such difficult questions as 'sovereignty over natural resources', the actio popularis, 'standards' and 'soft law'; techniques to encourage compliance, such as reporting;

xxi



### xxii Foreword

the position in war and armed conflict; general principles of liability and reparation, as well as specifically environmental notions such as the so-called 'polluter pays' principle.

It is in Part II of the book that the author broaches the immense task of setting out, and analysing in some detail, the developing substantive law for the protection of the environment and for the conservation of resources, and of biological diversity. Here, again, when it comes to classifying the areas for purposes of exposition, some of the general headings are familiar to every international lawyer: the atmosphere and outer space; oceans and seas; freshwater resources; hazardous substances and activities; waste; the polar regions; and European Community environmental law. It is in itself a valuable lesson to be able thus to see the shape and dimensions of environmental law as a whole. To establish the boundaries of a subject is an important step towards its intellectual comprehension.

It is a trite observation that environmental problems, though they closely affect municipal laws, are essentially international; and that the main structure of control can therefore be no other than that of international law. Yet one result of this study of environmental law as a whole is to show that the environmental factor has already so infiltrated so many of the traditional areas of public international law that it is no longer possible adequately to study many of the main headings of public international law without taking cognisance of the modifying influence in that particular respect of the principles, laws and regulations of environmental law. There are many instances; one that might not be the first possibility that comes to mind is the law concerning foreign investment. Many readers will remember the controversies of the 1960s and 1970s over the efforts to strike some sort of balance between the principle of national sovereignty over a nation's natural resources, and the competing principles limiting the sovereign rights of expropriation without proper compensation for the foreign investment in those resources. At the present time, this is an area of the law which can no longer be appreciated without adding the considerable factor of the need to protect the environment and therefore the need to limit certain kinds of exploitation, whether foreign or domestic, which cause international waste and harm. The problem of the destruction of tropical rainforests is probably the most dramatic and best known example of a national resource itself becoming an international problem.

Another matter that needs to be thought about is how to make the law of the environment more efficient. The existing principles, laws, case law, regulations, standards, resolutions and so on, already constitute a vast and complicated apparatus of paper and of powers conferred upon certain bodies or persons. When it is considered that the existing law is, however, also seemingly quite inadequate to the problem and that much more may be needed, one is bound to ask questions about how much of the world's resources, wealth, energy and intellect is to be spent on this task of regulation and control. Pollution resulting from an excess of the complication and sheer number of laws, regulations and officials is by no means the least of the threats to our living environment. This book is an important first step towards rationalisation, for it does, by its very able and effective exposition, enable one to see the dimensions of the problem and to get some sort of conspectus of the existing legal apparatus.

Another matter of concern is the need to keep laws and regulations in this area reasonably flexible and open when necessary to changes of direction. Good laws on the environment are driven, or should be driven, by the lessons to be learned from the natural sciences and from technology. But scientists are not by any means always in agreement. It is reasonable to assume, moreover, that the enormous sums spent upon further scientific and technological



### xxiii Foreword

research imply that the scene of scientific 'fact' is liable to change importantly and even suddenly; for, if not, it is difficult to see what this expensive endeavour is about. For an example of this kind of effect, it is necessary only to mention how new scientific knowledge of the dangers from dioxins have put into a wholly new perspective erstwhile schemes for conserving non-renewable sources of energy using instead the combustion of mixed wastes. We need, therefore, a law of the environment that can change with the changes in the scientific world; otherwise it will quickly and most damagingly be enforcing outmoded science. But to achieve change in international regulations, without thereby merely adding more layers of regulation, is technically by no means an easy task or even always a possible one.

But the matter goes deeper than these preoccupations, important as they are. Humanity is faced with a multifaceted dilemma. There seems to be an urgent need for more and more complex regulation and official intervention; yet this is, in our present system of international law and relations, extremely difficult to bring about in a timely and efficient manner. The fact of the matter surely is that these difficulties reflect the increasingly evident inadequacy of the traditional view of international relations as composed of pluralistic separate sovereignties, existing in a world where pressures of many kinds, not least of scientific and technological skills, almost daily make those separate so-called sovereignties, in practical terms, less independent and more and more interdependent. What is urgently needed is a more general realisation that, in the conditions of the contemporary global situation, the need to create a true international society must be faced. It needs in fact a new vision of international relations and law. This is a matter that takes us beyond the scope of this book. But those who doubt the need for radical changes in our views of, and uses of, international law should read Philippe Sands' book and then tell us how else some of these problems can be solved. After all, this is not just a question of ameliorating the problems of our civilisation but of our survival.

Sir Robert Jennings QC

Former Judge and President of the International Court of Justice; sometime Whewell Professor of International Law in the University of Cambridge; Honorary Bencher of Lincoln's Inn; former President of the Institut de Droit International





# Preface and acknowledgments to the first edition

Principles of International Environmental Law marks the culmination of that aspect of my professional activities which was triggered by the accident at the Chernobyl nuclear power plant, on 26 April 1986. At that time I was a research fellow at the Research Centre for International Law at Cambridge University, working on international legal aspects of contracts between states and non-state actors, and not involved in environmental issues. With the active support of the Research Centre's Director, Eli Lauterpacht, I began to examine the international legal implications of the Chernobyl accident, which indicated that the legal aspects of international environmental issues were of intellectual and political interest, and still in an early phase of development. This led to several research papers, a book and various matters involving the provision of legal advice on international environmental issues. My interest having been aroused, the implications of environmental issues for public international law provided a rich seam which has sustained me for several years, and resulted in my founding, with James Cameron, what is now the Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development (FIELD). That, in turn, has provided me with the fortunate opportunity to participate in a number of international negotiations, most notably those preparatory to UNCED and the Climate Change Convention, and to develop an international legal practice which is varied, unpredictable, entertaining, often challenging and occasionally frustrating.

This book, together with the accompanying volumes of international documents (Volumes IIA and IIB) and EC documents (Volume III), is intended to provide a comprehensive overview of those rules of public international law which have as their object the protection of the environment. I hope that it will be of some use to lawyer and non-lawyer alike, whether working for government, international organisations, non-governmental organisations and the private sector, or having an academic or other perspective. Its structure and approach reflect my belief that international environmental efforts will remain marginal unless they are addressed in an integrated manner with those international economic endeavours which retain a primary role in international law-making and institutional arrangements, and unless the range of actors participating in the development and application of international environmental law continues to expand. In that regard, it is quite clear that international environmental law remains, as a branch of general public international law, at an early stage of practical development, in spite of the large body of instruments and a burgeoning literature. Over the past decade the

XXV



### xxvi Preface and acknowledgments to the first edition

body of law has increased dramatically, and only the best equipped researchers will be able to keep up with all developments as they occur. I have sought to state the law as it was on 1 January 1993, although the diligent reader will note that on some aspects more recent developments have also been treated.

Principles of International Environmental Law therefore marks the culmination of an initial phase of my endeavours as an academic and practitioner. Its roots run deep and wide, and it is impossible to acknowledge here all the sources of input and generous support which I have received over the past several years. It seems to me to be quite appropriate, however, to acknowledge those teachers, colleagues and friends who have exercised particular influence, directly or indirectly.

The fact that I became interested in international law at all is largely due to my first teacher of international law, Robbie Jennings, then in his final year at Cambridge before moving to The Hague: I am hugely grateful for his inspiring encouragement and support ever since, particularly for taking the view that the environment was, even several years ago, properly a subject for consideration in its international legal aspect. Eli Lauterpacht gave me my first professional 'break' and taught me, in particular, the value of a practical approach and the importance of rigour. Even at a distance, Philip Allott constantly reminds me of the need to think about the bigger picture. And lest I should slip, David Kennedy has been a critical inspiration in reminding me that there is another way.

Colleagues at London University (particularly Ian Kennedy at King's College and Peter Slinn at the School of Oriental and African Studies) have provided great support in allowing me the flexibility to combine teaching with practical efforts. I would also like to record my debt to Tom Franck for introducing me to New York University Law School, and to Dean John Sexton for giving me a more regular perch from which to base my forays to the United Nations.

I am tremendously indebted to all my colleagues at FIELD. I would like to thank the Board of Trustees, and especially John Jopling, the Chairman, for allowing me to devote considerable time to this project, as well as Marian Bloom, Frances Connelly, Rona Udall and Roger Wilson for their administrative support. Many FIELD interns provided long hours of patient assistance, and I want especially to thank Carolyn d'Agincourt, Mary Beth Basile and Kiran Kamboj for going way beyond the call of duty during their extended internships, and Joanna Jenkyn-Jones, Hugo Jolliffe and Penny Simpson for helping me to get over the final hurdles more easily. But it is to FIELD's lawyers that I extend especially warm thanks for helping me to fulfil my other obligations and for always being available to provide information and critical insights on those areas in which they are expert. James Cameron is an inspirational friend, colleague and co-founder of FIELD, and I feel fortunate to have found a working partner who is able to provide me with the space and support to get on with my own efforts whilst reminding me that I also have, in all senses, broader responsibilities. Greg Rose (now at the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade), Jake Werksman and Farhana Yamin have been outstanding colleagues and friends. Richard Tarasofsky and Mary Weiss, my collaborators on Volumes II and III, assisted also in the preparation of this volume. FIELD's many supporters have also contributed, indirectly but significantly, to the production of this book, and I would like to thank, in particular, Janet Maughan (Ford Foundation), Mike Northrop (Rockefeller Brothers Fund), Ruth Hennig (John Merck Fund) and Marianne Lais Ginsburg (German Marshall Fund) for



### xxvii Preface and acknowledgments to the first edition

supporting FIELD's efforts and enabling me to participate in some of the important international legal developments since 1989. At my chambers, I want to thank Ailsa Wall for her magnificent typing efforts, and Paul Cooklin for his accommodation of my rather peripatetic needs.

For their efforts on a day-to-day basis my deepest gratitude, however, is reserved for two individuals without whose support it is unimaginable that this book could have been completed. Louise Rands has run my office for the past two and a half years with the greatest efficiency, effectiveness and humour anyone could hope to benefit from, maintaining order (and priorities) in the maelstrom of activities and obligations that frequently engulf FIELD's offices. Natalia Schiffrin has been absolutely fabulous in putting up with the demands that the book placed on our daily routine, and reminding me of what is important in life and what isn't.

I must also acknowledge the assistance of numerous other individuals, who enabled me to obtain access to information or to participate in various meetings, in particular: Andronico Adede (Office of Legal Affairs, United Nations); Raymondo Arnaudo and Genevieve Ball (United States Department of State); Dr John Ashe (Permanent Mission of Antigua and Barbuda to the United Nations); Cath Baker, A. M. Forryan and Susan Halls (UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office); Germaine Barikako (OAU); William Berenson (OAS); Giselle Bird (Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Australia); Celine Blais (External Affairs and International Trade, Canada); Dan Bodansky (University of Washington School of Law); Laurence Boisson de Chazournes (Institut des Hautes Etudes, Geneva); M. Borel (Departement Federal des Affaires Etrangeres, Switzerland); Jo Butler and Michael Zammit-Cutajar (Climate Change Convention Interim Secretariat); G. de Proost (Ministere des Affaires Etrangeres, Belgium); Juan-Manuel Dias-Pache Pumareda (Ministerio de Asuntes Exteriores, Spain); Dr Emonds (Bundesministerium fur Umwelt, Naturschutz und Reaktorsicherheit, Germany); Philip Evans (Council of the European Communities); Denis Fada (FAO); Dr Antonio Fernandez (International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas); Dr Charles Flemming (Permanent Representative of St Lucia to the United Nations); Nigel Fyfe and Paul Keating (New Zealand Ministry of External Affairs and Trade); Dr R. Gambell (International Whaling Commission); John Gavitt (CITES Secretariat); Professor Gunther Handl (Editor, Yearbook of International Environmental Law); Beatrice Larre (OECD); Howard Mann (Environment Canada); Norma Munguia (Mexican Embassy, Washington); Lincoln Myers (formerly Minister of Environment, Trinidad and Tobago); Boldiszar Nagy (Associate Professor, Eotvos Lorand University); Bernard Noble (Deputy Registrar, International Court of Justice); Manoel Pereyra (ICAO); Amelia Porges (GATT); Marie-Louise Quere-Messing (United Nations); N. Raja Chandran (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Malaysia); Patrick Reyners (OECD-NEA); Keith Richmond (FAO); Stan Sadowski (Paris/ Oslo Commissions); Candice Stevens (OECD); Wouter Sturms (IAEA); Patrick Szell (UK Department of Environment); Dr Alexandre Timoshenko (UNEP); Eduardo Valencia Ospina (Registrar, International Court of Justice); Robert van Lierop (formerly Permanent Representative of Vanuatu to the United Nations); Makareta Waqavonova (South Pacific Forum); and Linda Young (IMO).

Finally, I would like to thank Vaughan Lowe for encouraging me to write this textbook (and the supporting volumes of documents), for providing clear intellectual guidance and support, and for introducing me to Manchester University Press. At the Press, Richard Purslow has been as patient and supportive an editor as one could possibly hope to find,



### xxviii Preface and acknowledgments to the first edition

and his colleagues Jane Hammond Foster, Elaine White and Celia Ashcroft have provided enormous assistance. Needless to say, such errors or omissions as might have crept in remain my full responsibility.

Philippe Sands London 1 November 1994



# Preface and acknowledgments to the second edition

The second edition of *Principles of International Environmental Law* indicates that the legal aspects of international environmental issues are of growing intellectual and political interest, and that they have moved beyond the situation I described nearly ten years ago as reflecting 'an early phase of development'. It is apparent from the new material which this edition treats – new conventions, new secondary instruments, new (or newly recognised) norms of customary law, and a raft of new judicial decisions – that international environmental law is now well established and is a central part of the international legal order. It is also clear that international environmental law has reached new levels of complexity, in particular as it has become increasingly integrated into other social objectives and subject areas, particularly in the economic field. The burgeoning case law, and the increased involvement of practitioners, suggests that it can no longer be said that international environmental law is, as a branch of general public international law, at an early stage of practical development.

Like the first edition, this edition (together with the accompanying volume of international documents for students) is intended to provide a comprehensive overview of those rules of public international law which have as their object the protection of the environment. Those rules have become more numerous and complex, but also more accessible: the advent of the Internet often means that material which was previously difficult to track down – for example, information as to the status, signature and ratification of treaties, and acts and decisions of Conferences of the Parties and subsidiary bodies - is now relatively easy to obtain. But the Internet also increases the danger of becoming overwhelmed by the sheer quantity of material that is now available, a risk which is exacerbated by the very extensive (and growing) secondary literature which is produced every year, only a small proportion of which may really be said to indicate real insights into new developments. This background necessarily means that what is gained on breadth may be lost - at least in some areas - on depth. This comprehensive account cannot address all of the details that now dominate specific areas - trade, fisheries and climate change spring immediately to mind - and the reader will need to refer to more detailed accounts of particular sectors, and the websites of various conventions, to obtain many of the details. Over the past decade, the body of law has again increased dramatically; I have sought to state the law as it was on 1 January 2003.

This second edition has largely been inspired by my endeavours as an academic and practitioner over the last eight years, in particular contact with my academic colleagues at London and New York Universities and professional contact in connection with the various

xxix



### xxx Preface and acknowledgments to the second edition

international cases I have been fortunate to be involved in. Again, it is impossible to acknowledge here all the sources of input and generous support received since 1995. It is appropriate, however, to acknowledge those colleagues and friends who have exercised particular influence, directly or indirectly. At London University, Matt Craven and Michael Anderson have provided great support, as have many other colleagues at SOAS, together with Richard McCrory, Jane Holder and Jeffrey Jowell at my new home at University College London, with help too from Ray Purdue and Helen Ghosh. At New York University, I could not have wished for greater collegiality and friendship than that offered by Dick Stewart, together with the support offered over many years by Tom Franck, Andy Lowenfeld, Eleanor Fox, Iqbal Ishar, Norman Dorsen, Ben Kingsbury, Radu Popa, Vicki Been and Ricky Revesz, as well as Jane Stewart, and for heaps of administrative support from Jennifer Larmour. At the Project on International Courts and Tribunals, Shep Forman, Ruth Mackenzie, Cesare Romano, Thordis Ingadottir and Noemi Byrd have also provided unstinting support. My former colleagues at FIELD have continued to provide support and assistance, including Jake Werksman, Farhana Yamin, Jurgen Lefevre, Alice Palmer and Beatrice Chaytor.

Many of my students and former students at London and New York Universities have provided long hours of patient assistance. Two colleagues have provided particular support, to whom I extend special thanks and appreciation: Jacqueline Peel, now at the Melbourne University Faculty of Law, who has expended great efforts in assisting with research and in drafting of the highest quality and who, I hope, might become the co-author of this book in its third edition; and Paolo Galizzi, now at Imperial College London, who is co-authoring the student edition of basic documents to accompany this volume. Thanks also go to Valeria Angelini, Lauren Godshall, Ed Grutzmacher, Victoria Hallum, Miles Imwalle, Jimmy Kirby, Lawrence Lee, Bruce Monnington, Lillian Pinzon, Katarina Kompari, Denise Ryan, Anna-Lena Sjolund, Eva Stevens-Boenders and Mimi Yang. Thanks also go to Tim Walsh for electronic wizardry, and – once again – to Louise Rands in deepest Devon for helping to bring the manuscript in on time.

In other places – courts and tribunals and conferences – I have benefited inestimably from the learning and experience offered to me by James Crawford and Pierre-Marie Dupuy, and from Boldizsar Nagy, Vaughan Lowe, Chris Thomas, Laurence Boisson de Chazournes and Adriana Fabra. My colleagues at Matrix Chambers have created an environment which encourages ideas to be generated and tested, supportive of both the environmental law and the international law elements which make up this book and the experience it reflects.

Finally, I would like to thank Finola O'Sullivan and Jennie Rubio at Cambridge University Press. Needless to say, such errors or omissions as might have crept in remain my full responsibility.

For her efforts on a day-to-day basis – and every day – my greatest thanks are to Natalia Schiffrin, for all her help, and for continuing to remind me of what is important in life and what isn't. And of course this time she has had a little help from Leo, Lara and Katya, each of whom has contributed uniquely over the last eight years.

Philippe Sands
1 June 2003
Faculty of Laws
University College London
Bentham House
London WC1H 0EG