

# PURPOSIVE INTERPRETATION IN LAW

---

*Aharon Barak*

*Translated from the Hebrew by Sari Bashi*

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

PRINCETON AND OXFORD

---

## *Contents*

---

<i>Introduction</i>	xi
<b>PART ONE INTERPRETATION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Chapter One</b>	
What Is Legal Interpretation?	3
1. <i>Definition of Legal Interpretation</i>	3
2. <i>The Limits of Interpretation</i>	16
3. <i>Basic Problems in Interpretation</i>	26
4. <i>Systems of Interpretation in Law</i>	30
5. <i>Advantages and Disadvantages of Interpretive Rules</i>	38
6. <i>The Status and Sources of Interpretive Rules</i>	47
7. <i>Laws of Interpretation, Jurisprudence,         and General Hermeneutics</i>	54
<b>Chapter Two</b>	
Non-Interpretive Doctrines	61
1. <i>The Essence of Non-Interpretive Doctrines</i>	61
2. <i>Filling in a Gap in a Legal Text</i>	66
3. <i>Resolving Contradictions Normatively</i>	74
4. <i>Correcting Mistakes in the Language of a Text</i>	77
5. <i>Deviating from the Language of the Text to Avoid Absurdity</i>	80
6. <i>Cy Pres Performance</i>	80
7. <i>From Interpretive Theory to Purposive Interpretation</i>	82
<b>PART TWO PURPOSIVE INTERPRETATION</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>Chapter Three</b>	
The Essence of Purposive Interpretation	85
1. <i>"Purposive Interpretation": Terminology</i>	85
2. <i>Fundamentals of Purposive Interpretation</i>	88
<b>Chapter Four</b>	
The Semantic Component of Purposive Interpretation	97
1. <i>Interpretive Theory and Semantic Theory</i>	97
2. <i>Types of Language</i>	103
3. <i>Canons of Interpretation</i>	107

**Chapter Five**

The Purposive Component of Purposive Interpretation 110

1. *The Essence of Purpose* 1102. *Multiple Purposes* 113**Chapter Six**

Subjective Purpose: Authorial Intent 120

1. *The Essence of Subjective Purpose* 1202. *Abstract Purpose and Concrete Purpose* 1263. *Subjective Purpose and the Problem of Multiple Authors* 1294. *Sources of Subjective Purpose* 1355. *Subjective Purpose as a Presumption about the Text's Purpose* 145**Chapter Seven**Objective Purpose: Intent of the Reasonable Author;  
Intent of the System 1481. *The Essence of Objective Purpose* 1482. *Sources of Objective Purpose: Internal and External* 1573. *Presumptions of Objective Purpose* 1704. *Contradictions between Purposive Presumptions* 176**Chapter Eight**

The Purposive Component: Ultimate Purpose 182

1. *The Weight of Subjective and Objective Purpose  
in Determining Ultimate Purpose* 1822. *Type of Text: Will, Contract, Statute, and Constitution* 1853. *Type of Text: The Effect of a Text's Age  
on Its Ultimate Purpose* 1914. *Type of Text: Distinguishing Texts by Scope of Issues Regulated* 1935. *Type of Text: Changes in Regime Character and Society's  
Fundamental Assumptions* 1956. *Type of Text: Texts Based on Rules and Texts Based  
on Standards* 1977. *Type of Text: Content of the Provision* 2008. *The Effect of Type of Text on Ultimate Purpose* 2039. *Formulating Ultimate Purpose* 205**Chapter Nine**

Discretion as a Component in Purposive Interpretation 207

1. *The Essence of Judicial Discretion* 2072. *Situations of Judicial Discretion* 214

## Chapter Ten

The Theoretical Basis for Purposive Interpretation	218
1. <i>The Need to Justify a System of Interpretation</i>	218
2. <i>Social Support for Purposive Interpretation</i>	221
3. <i>Jurisprudential Support for Purposive Interpretation</i>	224
4. <i>Hermeneutic Considerations in Favor of Purposive Interpretation</i>	230
5. <i>Constitutional Considerations in Favor of Purposive Interpretation</i>	233

## Chapter Eleven

Purposive Interpretation and Its Critique of Other Systems of Interpretation	260
1. <i>Purposive Interpretation and Subjective Systems of Interpretation</i>	260
2. <i>Purposive Interpretation and Objective Systems of Interpretation: Textualism, "Old" and "New"</i>	269
3. <i>Purposive Interpretation and Pragmatism</i>	286
4. <i>Purposive Interpretation and Dworkin's System of Interpretation</i>	290
5. <i>Purposive Interpretation and Free Interpretation</i>	297
6. <i>Critique of Purposive Interpretation and Some Responses</i>	301

## PART THREE INTERPRETATION IN LAW 305

### Chapter Twelve

The Interpretation of Wills	307
1. <i>The Uniqueness of a Will and How It Affects Interpretation</i>	307
2. <i>The Language of a Will</i>	309
3. <i>The Purpose of a Will</i>	309

### Chapter Thirteen

The Interpretation of Contracts	318
1. <i>The Uniqueness of a Contract and How It Affects Interpretation</i>	318
2. <i>Contract Theory and Contractual Interpretation</i>	321
3. <i>The Purpose of a Contract</i>	325
4. <i>The Subjective Purpose of a Contract</i>	326
5. <i>Sources of Subjective Purpose</i>	329
6. <i>The Objective Purpose of a Contract</i>	332

## X CONTENTS

<i>7. Presumptions for Identifying Objective Purpose</i>	334
<i>8. The Ultimate Purpose of a Contract</i>	336
<b>Chapter Fourteen</b>	
Statutory Interpretation	339
<i>1. The Uniqueness of a Statute and How It Affects Interpretation</i>	339
<i>2. The Subjective Purpose of a Statute</i>	341
<i>3. Subjective Purpose Learned from the Language of a Statute</i>	342
<i>4. Subjective Purpose Learned from Sources External to the Statute: Legislative History</i>	344
<i>5. The Objective Purpose of a Statute</i>	350
<i>6. Sources of Objective Purpose</i>	352
<i>7. Presumptions of Objective Purpose</i>	358
<i>8. The Ultimate Purpose of a Statute</i>	363
<b>Chapter Fifteen</b>	
Constitutional Interpretation	370
<i>1. The Uniqueness of a Constitution and How It Affects Interpretation</i>	370
<i>2. The Language of a Constitution</i>	372
<i>3. The Subjective Purpose of a Constitution</i>	375
<i>4. The Objective Purpose of a Constitution</i>	377
<i>5. Sources of Objective Purpose</i>	377
<i>6. The Ultimate Purpose of a Constitution</i>	384
<i>Appendix 1 The Structure of Legal Interpretation</i>	395
<i>Appendix 2 Purposive Interpretation</i>	396
<i>Appendix 3 Weighting Subjective and Objective Purposes</i>	397
<i>Index</i>	399