We have developed a novel "real time" quantitative PCR method. The method measures PCR product accumulation through a dual-labeled fluorogenic probe (i.e., TaqMan Probe). This method provides very accurate and reproducible quantitation of gene copies. Unlike other quantitative PCR methods, real-time PCR does not require post-PCR sample handling, preventing potential PCR product carry-over contamination and resulting in much faster and higher throughput assays. The real-time PCR method has a very large dynamic range of starting target molecule determination (at least five orders of magnitude). Real-time quantitative PCR is extremely accurate and less labor-intensive than current quantitative PCR methods.

Quantitative nucleic acid sequence analysis has had an important role in many fields of biological research. Measurement of gene expression (RNA) has been used extensively in monitoring biological responses to various stimuli (Tan et al. 1994; Huang et al. 1995a,b; Prud’homme et al. 1995). Quantitative gene analysis (DNA) has been used to determine the genome quantity of a particular gene, as in the case of the human HER2 gene, which is amplified in ~30% of breast tumors (Slamon et al. 1987). Gene and genome quantitation (DNA and RNA) also have been used for analysis of human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) burden demonstrating changes in the levels of virus throughout the different phases of the disease (Connor et al. 1993; Piatak et al. 1993b; Furtado et al. 1995).

Many methods have been described for the quantitative analysis of nucleic acid sequences (both for RNA and DNA; Southern 1975; Sharp et al. 1980; Thomas 1980). Recently, PCR has proven to be a powerful tool for quantitative nucleic acid analysis. PCR and reverse transcriptase (RT)–PCR have permitted the analysis of minimal starting quantities of nucleic acid (as little as one cell equivalent). This has made possible many experiments that could not have been performed with traditional methods. Although PCR has provided a powerful tool, it is imperative that it be used properly for quantitation (Raeymaekers 1995). Many early reports of quantitative PCR and RT–PCR described quantitation of the PCR product but did not measure the initial target sequence quantity. It is essential to design proper controls for the quantitation of the initial target sequences (Ferre 1992; Clementi et al. 1993).

Researchers have developed several methods of quantitative PCR and RT–PCR. One approach measures PCR product quantity in the log phase of the reaction before the plateau (Kellogg et al. 1990; Pang et al. 1990). This method requires that each sample has equal input amounts of nucleic acid and that each sample under analysis amplifies with identical efficiency up to the point of quantitative analysis. A gene sequence (contained in all samples at relatively constant quantities, such as β-actin) can be used for sample amplification efficiency normalization. Using conventional methods of PCR detection and quantitation (gel electrophoresis or plate capture hybridization), it is extremely laborious to assure that all samples are analyzed during the log phase of the reaction (for both the target gene and the normalization gene). Another method, quantitative competitive (QC)–PCR, has been developed and is used widely for PCR quantitation. QC–PCR relies on the inclusion of an internal control competitor in each reaction (Becker-Andre 1991; Piatak et al. 1993a,b). The efficiency of each reaction is normalized to the internal competitor. A known amount of internal competitor can be
added to each sample. To obtain relative quantitation, the unknown target PCR product is compared with the known competitor PCR product. Success of a quantitative competitive PCR assay relies on developing an internal control that amplifies with the same efficiency as the target molecule. The design of the competitor and the validation of amplification efficiencies require a dedicated effort. However, because QC–PCR does not require that PCR products be analyzed during the log phase of the amplification, it is the easier of the two methods to use.

Several detection systems are used for quantitative PCR and RT-PCR analysis: (1) agarose gels, (2) fluorescent labeling of PCR products and detection with laser-induced fluorescence using capillary electrophoresis (Fasco et al. 1995; Williams et al. 1996) or acrylamide gels, and (3) plate capture and sandwich probe hybridization (Mulder et al. 1994). Although these methods proved successful, each method requires post-PCR manipulations that add time to the analysis and may lead to laboratory contamination. The sample throughput of these methods is limited (with the exception of the plate capture approach), and, therefore, these methods are not well suited for uses demanding high sample throughput (i.e., screening of large numbers of biomolecules or analyzing samples for diagnostics or clinical trials).

Here we report the development of a novel assay for quantitative DNA analysis. The assay is based on the use of the 5' nuclease assay first described by Holland et al. (1991). The method uses the 5' nuclease activity of Taq polymerase to cleave a nonextendible hybridization probe during the extension phase of PCR. The approach uses dual-labeled fluorogenic hybridization probes (Lee et al. 1993; Bassler et al. 1995; Livak et al. 1995a,b). One fluorescent dye serves as a reporter [FAM (i.e., 6-carboxyfluorescein)] and its emission spectra is quenched by the second fluorescent dye, TAMRA (i.e., 6-carboxy-tetramethylrhodamine). The nuclease degradation of the hybridization probe releases the quenching of the FAM fluorescent emission, resulting in an increase in peak fluorescent emission at 518 nm. The use of a sequence detector (ABI Prism) allows measurement of fluorescent spectra of all 96 wells of the thermal cycler continuously during the PCR amplification. Therefore, the reactions are monitored in real time. The output data is described and quantitative analysis of input target DNA sequences is discussed below.

RESULTS

PCR Product Detection in Real Time

The goal was to develop a high-throughput, sensitive, and accurate gene quantitation assay for use in monitoring lipid-mediated therapeutic gene delivery. A plasmid-encoding human factor VIII gene sequence, pF8TM (see Methods), was used as a model therapeutic gene. The assay uses fluorescent Taqman methodology and an instrument capable of measuring fluorescence in real time (ABI Prism 7700 Sequence Detector). The Taqman reaction requires a hybridization probe labeled with two different fluorescent dyes. One dye is a reporter dye (FAM), the other is a quenching dye (TAMRA). When the probe is intact, fluorescent energy transfer occurs and the reporter dye fluorescent emission is absorbed by the quenching dye (TAMRA). During the extension phase of the PCR cycle, the fluorescent hybridization probe is cleaved by the 5'-3' nucleolytic activity of the DNA polymerase. On cleavage of the probe, the reporter dye emission is no longer transferred efficiently to the quenching dye, resulting in an increase of the reporter dye fluorescent emission spectra. PCR primers and probes were designed for the human factor VIII sequence and human β-actin gene (as described in Methods). Optimization reactions were performed to choose the appropriate probe and magnesium concentrations yielding the highest intensity of reporter fluorescent signal without sacrificing specificity. The instrument uses a charge-coupled device (i.e., CCD camera) for measuring the fluorescent emission spectra from 500 to 650 nm. Each PCR tube was monitored sequentially for 25 msec with continuous monitoring throughout the amplification. Each tube was re-examined every 8.5 sec. Computer software was designed to examine the fluorescent intensity of both the reporter dye (FAM) and the quenching dye (TAMRA). The fluorescent intensity of the quenching dye, TAMRA, changes very little over the course of the PCR amplification (data not shown). Therefore, the intensity of TAMRA dye emission serves as an internal standard with which to normalize the reporter dye (FAM) emission variations. The software calculates a value termed ΔRn (or ΔRQ) using the following equation: ΔRn = (Rn+)/−(Rn−), where Rn+ = emission intensity of reporter/emission intensity of quencher at any given time in a reaction tube, and Rn− = emission intensity of re-
porter/emission intensity of quencher measured prior to PCR amplification in that same reaction tube. For the purpose of quantitation, the last three data points (ΔRns) collected during the extension step for each PCR cycle were analyzed. The nucleolytic degradation of the hybridization probe occurs during the extension phase of PCR, and, therefore, reporter fluorescent emission increases during this time. The three data points were averaged for each PCR cycle and the mean value for each was plotted in an “amplification plot” shown in Figure 1A. The ΔRn mean value is plotted on the y-axis, and time, represented by cycle number, is plotted on the x-axis. During the early cycles of the PCR amplification, the ΔRn value remains at base line. When sufficient hybridization probe has been cleaved by the Taq polymerase nuclease activity, the intensity of reporter fluorescent emission increases. Most PCR amplifications reach a plateau phase of reporter fluorescent emission if the reaction is carried out to high cycle numbers. The amplification plot is examined early in the reaction, at a point that represents the log phase of product accumulation. This is done by assigning an arbitrary threshold that is based on the variability of the base-line data. In Figure 1A, the threshold was set at 10 standard deviations above the mean of base-line emission calculated from cycles 1 to 15. Once the threshold is chosen, the point at which

Figure 1  PCR product detection in real time. (A) The Model 7700 software will construct amplification plots from the extension phase fluorescent emission data collected during the PCR amplification. The standard deviation is determined from the data points collected from the base line of the amplification plot. Ct values are calculated by determining the point at which the fluorescence exceeds a threshold limit (usually 10 times the standard deviation of the base line). (B) Overlay of amplification plots of serially (1:2) diluted human genomic DNA samples amplified with β-actin primers. (C) Input DNA concentration of the samples plotted versus Ct. All points represent the mean of triplicate PCR amplifications, and error bars are shown (but not always visible).
the amplification plot crosses the threshold is defined as \( C_T \). \( C_T \) is reported as the cycle number at this point. As will be demonstrated, the \( C_T \) value is predictive of the quantity of input target.

**CT Values Provide a Quantitative Measurement of Input Target Sequences**

Figure 1B shows amplification plots of 15 different PCR amplifications overlaid. The amplifications were performed on a 1:2 serial dilution of human genomic DNA. The amplified target was human \( \beta \)-actin. The amplification plots shift to the right (to higher threshold cycles) as the input target quantity is reduced. This is expected because reactions with fewer starting copies of the target molecule require greater amplification to degrade enough probe to attain the threshold fluorescence. An arbitrary threshold of 10 standard deviations above the baseline was used to determine the \( C_T \) values. Figure 1C represents the \( C_T \) values plotted versus the sample dilution value. Each dilution was amplified in triplicate PCR amplifications and plotted as mean values with error bars representing one standard deviation. The \( C_T \) values decrease linearly with increasing target quantity. Thus, \( C_T \) values can be used as a quantitative measurement of the input target number. It should be noted that the amplification plot for the 15.6-ng sample shown in Figure 1B does not reflect the same fluorescent rate of increase exhibited by most of the other samples. The 15.6-ng sample also achieves endpoint plateau at a lower fluorescent value than would be expected based on the input DNA. This phenomenon has been observed occasionally with other samples (data not shown) and may be attributable to late cycle inhibition; this hypothesis is still under investigation. It is important to note that the flattened slope and early plateau do not impact significantly the calculated \( C_T \) value as demonstrated by the fit on the line shown in Figure 1C. All triplicate amplifications resulted in very similar \( C_T \) values—the standard deviation did not exceed 0.5 for any dilution. This experiment contains a \( >100,000 \)-fold range of input target molecules. Using \( C_T \) values for quantitation permits a much larger assay range than directly using total fluorescent emission intensity for quantitation. The linear range of fluorescent intensity measurement of the ABI Prism 7700 Sequence Detector only spans three logs, resulting in only a 1000-fold dynamic range of input molecules. Thus, \( C_T \) values provide accurate measurements over a very large range of relative starting target quantities.

**Sample Preparation Validation**

Several parameters influence the efficiency of PCR amplification: magnesium and salt concentrations, reaction conditions (i.e., time and temperature), PCR target size and composition, primer sequences, and sample purity. All of the above factors are common to a single PCR assay, except sample to sample purity. In an effort to validate the method of sample preparation for the factor VIII assay, PCR amplification reproducibility and efficiency of 10 replicate sample preparations were examined. After genomic DNA was prepared from the 10 replicate samples, the DNA was quantitated by ultraviolet spectroscopy. Amplifications were performed analyzing \( \beta \)-actin gene content in 100 and 25 ng of total genomic DNA. Each PCR amplification was performed in triplicate. Comparison of \( C_T \) values for each triplicate sample show minimal variation based on standard deviation and coefficient of variance (Table 1). Therefore, each of the triplicate PCR amplifications was highly reproducible, demonstrating that real time PCR using this instrumentation introduces minimal variation into the quantitative PCR analysis. Comparison of the mean \( C_T \) values of the 10 replicate sample preparations also showed minimal variability, indicating that each sample preparation yielded similar results for \( \beta \)-actin gene quantity. The highest \( C_T \) difference between any of the samples was 0.85 and 0.71 for the 100 and 25 ng samples, respectively. Additionally, the amplification of each sample exhibited an equivalent rate of fluorescent emission intensity change per amount of DNA target analyzed as indicated by similar slopes derived from the sample dilutions (Fig. 2). Any sample containing an excess of a PCR inhibitor would exhibit a greater measured \( \beta \)-actin \( C_T \) value for a given quantity of DNA. In addition, the inhibitor would be diluted along with the sample in the dilution analysis (Fig. 2), altering the expected \( C_T \) value change. Each sample amplification yielded a similar result in the analysis, demonstrating that this method of sample preparation is highly reproducible with regard to sample purity.

**Quantitative Analysis of a Plasmid After Transient Transfection**

293 cells were transiently transfected with a vec-
Table 1. Reproducibility of Sample Preparation Method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample no.</th>
<th>100 ng</th>
<th>25 ng</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C&lt;sub&gt;T&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>18.24</td>
<td>18.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>18.33</td>
<td>18.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>18.15</td>
<td>18.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>18.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>18.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>18.28</td>
<td>18.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>18.45</td>
<td>18.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>18.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>18.42</td>
<td>18.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>18.42</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A series of transfections was set up using a decreasing amount of the plasmid (40, 4, 0.5, and 0.1 μg). Twenty-four hours post-transfection, total DNA was purified from each flask of cells. β-Actin gene quantity was chosen as a value for normalization of genomic DNA concentration from each sample. In this experiment, β-actin gene content should remain constant relative to total genomic DNA. Figure 3 shows the result of the β-actin DNA measurement (100 ng total DNA determined by ultraviolet spectroscopy) of each sample. Each sample was analyzed in triplicate and the mean β-actin C<sub>T</sub> values of the triplicates were plotted (error bars represent one standard deviation). The highest difference between any two sample means was 0.95 C<sub>T</sub>. Ten nanograms of total DNA of each sample were also examined for β-actin. The results again showed that very similar amounts of genomic DNA were present; the maximum mean β-actin C<sub>T</sub> value difference was 1.0. As Figure 3 shows, the rate of β-actin C<sub>T</sub> change between the 100- and 10-ng samples was similar (slope values range between −3.56 and −3.45). This verifies again that the method of sample preparation yields samples of identical PCR integrity (i.e., no sample contained an excessive amount of a PCR inhibitor). However, these results indicate that each sample contained slight differences in the actual amount of genomic DNA analyzed. Determination of actual genomic DNA concentration was accomplished.
Figure 2  Sample preparation purity. The replicate samples shown in Table 1 were also amplified in triplicate using 25 ng of each DNA sample. The figure shows the input DNA concentration (100 and 25 ng) vs. C_T. In the figure, the 100 and 25 ng points for each sample are connected by a line.

by plotting the mean β-actin C_T value obtained for each 100-ng sample on a β-actin standard curve (shown in Fig. 4C). The actual genomic DNA concentration of each sample, a, was obtained by extrapolation to the x-axis.

Figure 4A shows the measured (i.e., non-normalized) quantities of factor VIII plasmid DNA (pF8TM) from each of the four transient cell transfections. Each reaction contained 100 ng of total sample DNA (as determined by UV spectroscopy). Each sample was analyzed in triplicate PCR amplifications. As shown, pF8TM purified from the 293 cells decreases (mean C_T values increase) with decreasing amounts of plasmid transfected. The mean C_T values obtained for pF8TM in Figure 4A were plotted on a standard curve comprised of serially diluted pF8TM, shown in Figure 4B. The quantity of pF8TM, b, found in each of the four transfections was determined by extrapolation to the x-axis of the standard curve in Figure 4B. These uncorrected values, b, for pF8TM were normalized to determine the actual amount of pF8TM found per 100 ng of genomic DNA by using the equation:

\[
\frac{b \times 100 \text{ ng}}{a} = \text{actual pF8TM copies per 100 ng of genomic DNA}
\]

where a = actual genomic DNA in a sample and b = pF8TM copies from the standard curve. The normalized quantity of pF8TM per 100 ng of genomic DNA for each of the four transfections is shown in Figure 4D. These results show that the quantity of factor VIII plasmid associated with the 293 cells, 24 hr after transfection, decreases with decreasing plasmid concentration used in the transfection. The quantity of pF8TM associated with 293 cells, after transfection with 40 μg of plasmid, was 35 pg per 100 ng genomic DNA. This results in ~520 plasmid copies per cell.

DISCUSSION

We have described a new method for quantitating gene copy numbers using real-time analysis of PCR amplifications. Real-time PCR is compatible with either of the two PCR (RT-PCR) approaches: (1) quantitative competitive where an internal competitor for each target sequence is used for normalization (data not shown) or (2) quantitative comparative PCR using a normalization gene contained within the sample (i.e., β-actin) or a “housekeeping” gene for RT-PCR. If equal amounts of nucleic acid are analyzed for each sample and if the amplification efficiency before quantitative analysis is identical for each sample, the internal control (normalization gene or competitor) should give equal signals for all samples.

The real-time PCR method offers several advantages over the other two methods currently employed (see the introduction). First, the real-time PCR method is performed in a closed-tube system and requires no post-PCR manipulation
of sample. Therefore, the potential for PCR contamination in the laboratory is reduced because amplified products can be analyzed and disposed of without opening the reaction tubes. Second, this method supports the use of a normalization gene (i.e., β-actin) for quantitative PCR or housekeeping genes for quantitative RT-PCR controls. Analysis is performed in real time during the log phase of product accumulation. Analysis during log phase permits many different genes (over a wide input target range) to be analyzed simultaneously, without concern of reaching reaction plateau at different cycles. This will make multigene analysis assays much easier to develop, because individual internal competitors will not be needed for each gene under analysis. Third, sample throughput will increase dramatically with the new method because there is no post-PCR processing time. Additionally, working in a 96-well format is highly compatible with automation technology.

The real-time PCR method is highly reproducible. Replicate amplifications can be analyzed for each sample minimizing potential error. The system allows for a very large assay dynamic range (approaching 1,000,000-fold starting target). Using a standard curve for the target of interest, relative copy number values can be determined for any unknown sample. Fluorescent threshold values, CT, correlate linearly with relative DNA copy numbers. Real time quantitative RT-PCR methodology (Gibson et al., this issue) has also been developed. Finally, real time quantitative PCR methodology can be used to develop high-throughput screening assays for a variety of applications [quantitative gene expression (RT-PCR), gene copy assays (Her2, HIV, etc.), genotyping (knockout mouse analysis), and immuno-PCR].

Real-time PCR may also be performed using intercalating dyes (Higuchi et al. 1992) such as ethidium bromide. The fluorogenic probe method offers a major advantage over intercalating dyes—greater specificity (i.e., primer dimers and nonspecific PCR products are not detected).
METHODS

Generation of a Plasmid Containing a Partial cDNA for Human Factor VIII

Total RNA was harvested (RNAzol B from Tel-Test, Inc., Friendswood, TX) from cells transfected with a factor VIII expression vector, pCIS2.8c25D (Eaton et al. 1986; Gorman et al. 1990). A factor VIII partial cDNA sequence was generated by RT-PCR [GeneAmp EZ Tth RNA PCR Kit (part N808-0179, PE Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA)] using the PCR primers F8for and F8rev (primer sequences are shown below). The amplicon was reamplified using modified F8for and F8rev primers (appended with BamHI and HindIII restriction site sequences at the 5' end) and cloned into pGem-3Z (Promega Corp., Madison, WI). The resulting clone, pF8TM, was used for transient transfection of 293 cells.

Amplification of Target DNA and Detection of Amplificon Factor VIII Plasmid DNA

(pF8TM) was amplified with the primers F8for 5'-CCC-GTGGCAAGAGTGACGGTGTC-3' and F8rev 5'-AAAACTTCAACCTGGATTGAGG-3'. The reaction produced a 422-bp PCR product. The forward primer was designed to recognize a unique sequence found in the 5' untranslated region of the parent pCIS2.8c25D plasmid and therefore does not recognize and amplify the human factor VIII gene. Primers were chosen with the assistance of the computer program Oligo 4.0 (National Biosciences, Inc., Plymouth, MN). The human β-actin gene was amplified with the primers β-actin forward primer 5'-TCACCCACACTGCTGTCAC-3' and β-actin reverse primer 5'-CAGCGGAACCGCTACATTGCCCATGG-3'. The reaction produced a 295-bp PCR product.

Amplification reactions (50 μl) contained a DNA sample, 10× PCR Buffer II (5 μl), 200 μM dATP, dCTP, dGTP, and 400 μM dUTP, 4 mM MgCl2, 1.25 Units AmpliTaq DNA polymerase, 0.5 unit AmpErase uracil N-glycosylase (UNG), 50 pmole of each factor VIII primer, and 15 pmole of each β-actin primer. The reactions also contained one of the following detection probes (100 nm each): F8probe 5'-(FAM)AGCTCTCCACGTAGTCTTGTC-3' and β-actin probe 5'-(FAM)ATGCCCGTATTGCCATGGCAT-3' where p indicates phosphorylation and X indicates a linker arm nucleotide. Reaction tubes were MicroAmp Optical Tubes (part number N801-0933, Perkin Elmer) that were frosted (at Perkin Elmer) to prevent light from reflecting. Tube caps were similar to MicroAmp Caps but specially designed to prevent light scattering. All of the PCR consumables were supplied by PE Applied Biosystems (Foster City, CA) except for the factor VIII primers, which were synthesized at Genentech, Inc. (South San Francisco, CA). Probes were designed using the Oligo 4.0 software, following guidelines suggested in the Model 7700 Sequence Detector instrument manual. Briefly, probe Tm should be at least 5°C higher than the annealing temperature used during thermal cycling; primers should not form stable duplexes with the probe.

The thermal cycling conditions included 2 min at 50°C and 10 min at 95°C. Thermal cycling proceeded with 40 cycles of 95°C for 0.5 min and 60°C for 2 min. All reactions were performed in the Model 7700 Sequence Detector (PE Applied Biosystems), which contains a GeneAmp PCR System 9600. Reaction conditions were programmed on a Power Macintosh 7100 (Apple Computer, Santa Clara, CA) linked directly to the Model 7700 Sequence Detector. Analysis of data was also performed on the Macintosh computer. Collection and analysis software was developed at PE Applied Biosystems.

Transfection of Cells with Factor VIII Construct

Four T175 flasks of 293 cells (ATCC CRL 1573), a human fetal kidney suspension cell line, were grown to 80% confluency and transfected pF8TM. Cells were grown in the following media: 50% HAM'S F12 without GHT, 50% low glucose Dulbecco's modified Eagle medium (DMEM) without glycine with sodium bicarbonate, 10% fetal bovine serum, 2 mM l-glutamine, and 1% penicillin-streptomycin. The media was changed 30 min before the transfection. pF8TM DNA amounts of 40, 4, 0.5, and 0.1 μg were added to 1.5 ml of a solution containing 0.125 mM CaCl2 and 1× HEPES. The four mixtures were left at room temperature for 10 min and then added dropwise to the cells. The flasks were incubated at 37°C and 5% CO2 for 24 hr, washed with PBS, and resuspended in PBS. The resuspended cells were divided into aliquots and DNA was extracted immediately using the QIAamp Blood Kit (Qiagen, Chatsworth, CA). DNA was eluted into 200 μl of 20 mM Tris-HCl at pH 8.0.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Genentech's DNA Synthesis Group for primer synthesis and Genentech's Graphics Group for assistance with the figures.

The publication costs of this article were defrayed in part by payment of page charges. This article must therefore be hereby marked "advertisement" in accordance with 18 USC section 1734 solely to indicate this fact.

REFERENCES


Received June 3, 1996; accepted in revised form July 29, 1996.