

Western Kentucky University

From the Selected Works of James W. Barker

Winter 2014

Reconstruction of Kaige-Quinta Zechariah 9,9

James W Barker



Available at: https://works.bepress.com/james_barker/2/

Mitteilungen

James W. Barker

The Reconstruction of *Kaige/Quinta* Zechariah 9,9*

James W. Barker: Rhodes College, Memphis, Tennessee, 38112 USA; james.w.barker@gmx.com

In 1952 Bedouin discovered the Greek Minor Prophets Scroll from Naḥal Ḥever (8ḤevXIIgr).¹ Dominique Barthélemy designated the text as *kaige*,² given its tendency (e. g., Zach 9,2) to translate תּוּם («also») as καίτε («even», «at least»). He identified the *kaige* of the Dodekapropheton as the source of Justin Martyr's non-LXX quotations in *Dialogue with Trypho*. Barthélemy also posited the equivalence of the *kaige* and Origen's *Quinta*, the «fifth» translation – besides the LXX, Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion – occasionally preserved in the Hexapla. Although this position gained initial acceptance,³ subsequent scholars rejected it because Justin's quotation of Zach 9,9 in *Dial.* 53,3 does not match the *Quinta* of Zach 9,9 in Origen's commentary on Matthew.⁴ The present note resolves the issue by demonstrating that in *Dial.* 53,3 Justin conflated the Old Greek (henceforth: OG) and the *kaige* recension of the Dodekapropheton. This reconstruction establishes the equivalence of the *kaige* and the *Quinta* in Zach 9,9.

Based on Justin's agreements with 8ḤevXIIgr against the OG, Barthélemy identified the *kaige* as Justin's source for the quotation of Mic 4,1–7 in *Dial.* 109,2–3.⁵ When Mic 4,3ba (cf. Isa 2,4ba) speaks of beating swords into ploughshares and beating spears into pruning knives, Justin and the *kaige* use μάχαира («short sword», «dagger») rather than ῥομφαία («long sword») to translate חרב («sword»);⁶ also, Justin and the *kaige* use ζιβύνη/σιβύνη («spear») rather than δόρυ («spear») for חנית («spear».⁷ Barthélemy generalized that other of Justin's non-LXX readings – including Zach 9,9 in *Dial.* 53,3 – come from the *kaige*.⁸

* I thank L. J. Greenspoon for comments on an earlier draft.

1 E. Tov, *The Greek Minor Prophets Scroll from Naḥal Ḥever* (8ḤevXIIgr), DJD 8, 1990.

2 D. Barthélemy, *Redécouverte d'un chaînon manquant de l'histoire de la Septante*, RB 60 (1953), 18–29; idem, *Les Devanciers d'Aquila*, 1963.

3 R. A. Kraft, review of D. Barthélemy, *Les Devanciers d'Aquila*, *Gnomon* 37 (1965), 474–483, 477.

4 G. Howard, *The Quinta of the Minor Prophets: A First Century Septuagint Text?* Bib 55 (1974), 15–22, 21–22; N. F. Marcos, *The Septuagint in Context: Introduction to the Greek Versions of the Bible*, 2000, 157–158.

5 Barthélemy, *Redécouverte*, 20–21; idem, *Devanciers*, 210–211.

6 For חרב the LXX uses μάχαира 150+ times and ῥομφαία 250+ times.

7 In the LXX, σιβύνη stands for חנית only twice (Isa 2,4; Jer 6,23), yet there are more than thirty instances of δόρυ for חנית.

8 Barthélemy, *Devanciers*, 211; see p. 221 for the qualification that in *Dial.* 53,3 Justin took πῶλον ὄνου from John 12,15.

Barthélemy further argued for the equivalence in the Dodekapropheton of the *kaige* and the *Quinta*.⁹ Jerome interspersed *Quinta* readings in his commentaries on the Minor Prophets,¹⁰ yet only his citations of Mic 5,5; Hab 2,15; 3,13 can be checked against 8ḤevXIIgr. There Barthélemy found that the *kaige* scroll and Jerome's *Quinta* align against the OG, Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion. The main obstacle for Barthélemy's equation of the *kaige* and the *Quinta* comes from Origen's only extant witness to the *Quinta* in the Minor Prophets. Origen transcribes the second half of Zach 9,9 in his commentary on the Gospel of Matthew (16,16, 180–193), but his quotation does not agree with Justin's. Therefore George Howard concluded that Barthélemy had demonstrated mere kinship between the *kaige* and the *Quinta*.¹¹ These versions of Zach 9,9 appear below.¹²

MT	גלי מאד בת-ציון הריעי בת ירושלם
OG	χαῖρε σφόδρα θύγατερ Σιων· κήρυσσε θύγατερ Ἱερουσαλημ
<i>Dial.</i> 53,3	χαῖρε σφόδρα θύγατερ Σιων· ἀλλάλαξον κήρυσσε θύγατερ Ἱερουσαλημ
MT	הנה מלכך יבוא לך צדיק ונושע הוא
OG	ἰδοὺ ὁ βασιλεὺς σου ἔρχεται σοι δίκαιος καὶ σῶζων αὐτόν
<i>Dial.</i> 53,3	ἰδοὺ ὁ βασιλεὺς σου ἦξει σοι δίκαιος καὶ σῶζων αὐτόν
MT	עני ורכב על-חמור ועל-עיר בך-אתננת
OG	πραῦς καὶ ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὑποζύγιον καὶ πῶλον νέον
Aquila	πραῦς καὶ ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὄνου καὶ πῶλου υἱοῦ ὀνάδων
Symmachus	πτωχός καὶ ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὄνον καὶ πῶλον υἱὸν ὀνάδος
Theodotion	ἐπακούων καὶ ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὄνον καὶ πῶλον υἱὸν ὄνου
<i>Quinta</i>	πτωχός καὶ ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὑποζύγιον καὶ πῶλον υἱὸν ὄνων
<i>Dial.</i> 53,3	καὶ πραῦς καὶ πτωχός ἐπιβεβηκῶς ἐπὶ ὑποζύγιον καὶ πῶλον ὄνου

Whether the *kaige* and the *Quinta* are to be equated for all the Dodekapropheton lies beyond the scope of this note. The ensuing reconstruction does show that Justin's *kaige* and Origen's *Quinta* would be identical in Zach 9,9. Moreover, the differences between their quotations result from Justin's own redactions. This recognition overturns the prevailing assumption that Justin exactly reproduced the *kaige* when quoting Zach 9,9 in *Dial.* 53,3.¹³ Justin's differences from the

⁹ Barthélemy, *Redécouverte*, 27–28; idem, *Devanciers*, 213–227.

¹⁰ Jerome does not include *Quinta* variants for Jonah, Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi. On the *Quinta* of Amos, see J. M. Dines, Jerome and the Hexapla: The Witness of the Commentary on Amos, in A. Salvesen (ed.): *Origen's Hexapla and Fragments*, TSAJ 58, 1998, 421–436, 432 n. 34.

¹¹ Howard, *Quinta*, 21–22; 8ḤevXIIgr breaks off at the beginning of Zach 9,5.

¹² Editions: BHS (MT); J. Ziegler, *Göttingen Septuaginta* 13 (OG); E. Kfostermann, *Matthäuserklärung* I, GCS 40, 1935 (Origen's Hexapla); M. Marcovich, *Iustini Martyris Dialogus cum Tryphone*, PTS 47, 1997 (*Dial.* 53,3).

¹³ E. g., P. Prigent, *Justin et l'Ancien Testament: l'argumentation scripturaire du traité de Justin contre toutes les hérésies comme source principale du Dialogue avec Tryphon et de la première Apologie*, 1964, 284; O. Skarsaune, *The Proof from Prophecy: A Study in Justin Martyr's Proof-Text Tradition*, 1987, 76.

OG are as follows: (1) ἥξει («he will have come») rather than ἔρχεται («he comes»); (2) the »doublets« ἀλαλάξω («shout») and κηρύσσω («proclaim») as well as πραῦς («humble») and πτωχός («poor»); (3) πῶλον ὄνου («a colt of an ass») rather than πῶλον νέον («a young colt»).

Justin's first difference is putting ἥξει in place of ἔρχεται. Morphologically ἦκω is in the present tense («I am here»), but the sense is that of a perfect («I have come»). In effect, Justin's use of ἥξει has Zechariah predict that the king »will have come«. Although Hebrew cannot represent it, such prophetic future perfects appear in the LXX. In a passage Justin quotes elsewhere, Isaiah says that »the Lord himself will have come into judgment« (Isa 3,13–14a; *Dial.* 133,3b); there ἥξει represents יָבֹא («he comes», »he will come«).

The question is whether Justin encountered ἥξει in his *kaige* text of Zach 9,9. The LXX even translates יָבֹא as ἔρχομαι and as ἦκω throughout the Dodekapropheton,¹⁴ and 8ḤevXIIgr nowhere appears to have changed ἔρχομαι to ἦκω. The only verifiable evidence are the scroll's two occurrences of ἥξει.¹⁵ In the OG and in 8ḤevXIIgr, ἥξει stands for יָבֹא to denote the impending arrival of the Chaldeans in Hab 1,9. Then in Hab 2,3, where the MT uses an emphatic infinitive absolute to say that a vision »will surely come« (בָּא יָבֹא), the OG and 8ḤevXIIgr say that »a coming (vision) will have come« (ἐρχόμενος ἥξει). Since 8ḤevXIIgr maintains the OG's juxtaposition of ἔρχομαι and ἦκω in Hab 2,3, the probability is that the *kaige* left ἔρχεται unchanged from the OG in Zach 9,9.

There is also positive evidence to suggest that Justin altered ἔρχεται to ἥξει in the quotation of Zach 9,9. Elsewhere in *Dialogue with Trypho* (49,3) Justin described John the Baptist as a prophet who cried out that one stronger than he »will have come« (ἥξει). Justin's *Vorlage*(n) would have said either that someone »comes« (ἔρχεται; Mk 1,7b; Luk 3,16c) or »is coming« (ἐρχόμενος; Mt 3,11a; Joh 1,27). I infer that ἥξει in *Dial.* 53,3 represents Justin's redactional preference for the prophetic future perfect.

Justin's second difference from the OG concerns what Barthélemy calls doublets.¹⁶ These are quintessential text-critical confections. I posit that Justin encountered the imperatives »proclaim« (κηρύσσε) in the OG and »shout« (ἀλάλαξον) in the *kaige* and that Justin incorporated both. Likewise »meek« (πραῦς) would come from the OG and »poor« (πτωχός) from the *kaige*.

The *kaige* would have contained no confections, for it represents the earliest known revision of the OG.¹⁷ In other words, there was no *Vorlage* to provide a variant (vis-à-vis the OG) for the *kaige* to incorporate. The *kaige* instead conformed the OG to the Hebrew. For example, whereas the OG translates יהוה צבאות («Lord of hosts/armies») as κύριος παντοκράτωρ («Lord almighty»), without exception 8ḤevXIIgr prints the Tetragrammaton in paleo-Hebrew followed by τῶν δυνάμεων («of the forces/troops»). The *kaige* was even concerned to match the word

14 Cf. twenty occurrences of ἔρχομαι and twenty-two of ἦκω.

15 A third instance in 8ḤevXIIgr presumably stood in Mic 4,8 as in the OG.

16 Barthélemy, *Devanciers*, 211, 221; see also H. Köster, *Septuaginta und Synoptischer Erzählungsstoff im Schriftbeweis Justins des Märtyrers*, Habilitationsschrift, Heidelberg, 1956, 93 n. 6.

17 Kraft (review, 477) initially questioned whether the *kaige* would show systematic dependence on the OG, but Tov (8ḤevXIIgr, 99–158, esp. 102–106, 145–153) has settled the question. Some renderings would be impossible were the *kaige* an independent translation: Nah 3,12 MT compares fortresses to »a fig tree with first fruits« (תַּאֲנִים עִם־בְּכוֹרִים), which the OG translates as »fig trees for watchmen« (συκάϊ σκοποῦς); the *kaige* scroll reads ... σκοπ ... (Tov, 8ḤevXIIgr, 104).

count of its proto-Masoretic *Vorlage*. In Zach 1,3 MT יהוה צבאות appears three times. The OG writes κύριος παντοκράτωρ in the first instance, omits the second phrase altogether, and abbreviates the third as κύριος. By contrast 8HēvXIIgr writes יהוה דון דנאמאון all three times. Such concern for accuracy further diminishes the likelihood of conflations in the *kaige*.

Indeed no conflations occur in 8HēvXIIgr. For example, its rendition of Mic 4,3 replaced long swords (ῥομφαία) with short swords (μάχαρα); a conflation would have included both. Corresponding to Origen's presentation of the *Quinta*, then, the *kaige* must have preferred πτωχός («poor») to πραῦς («humble») for עני («poor», «humble») in Zach 9,9.¹⁸ Thus Justin would have read «humble and mounted» in the OG, as compared with «poor and mounted» in the *kaige*. Justin's awkwardly worded «and humble and poor, mounted» likely indicates his use of separate source texts. The most probable conclusion is that Justin conflated two *Vorlagen*.

Justin's final divergence from the OG concerns faunal terminology.¹⁹ According to the MT, Zach 9,9 placed the king upon «a he-ass» (חמור) and «a male ass, an offspring of she-asses» (ער בן-אמה), which the OG translated loosely as «a yoke animal and a young colt» (ὑποζύγιον καὶ πῶλον νέον). Later renditions by the Evangelist Matthew as well as Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion changed ὑποζύγιον to ὄνος («ass»); however, the *Quinta* maintained ὑποζύγιον for חמור. Finding no disagreement between the OG and the *Quinta* in this instance, Justin wrote ὑποζύγιον.²⁰

The final words πῶλον ὄνου («a colt of an ass») match neither the OG nor the *Quinta*, but the words do match the paraphrase of Zach 9,9 in Joh 12,15. Barthélemy concluded that Justin copied John's Gospel directly.²¹ Although Justin's use of John remains debated, of all known renditions of Zach 9,9 down to Origen's era, the final phrase «a colt of an ass» (πῶλον ὄνου) appears only in Joh 12,15 and Justin's writings.²² Also, the Fourth Gospel's influence – whether direct or indirect – is less complicated than Justin and John independently adapting the anarthrous πῶλον ὄνου from τὸν πῶλον τῆς ὄνου in Gen 49,11.²³

In summary, the simplest explanation of the Zach 9,9 quotation in *Dial.* 53,3 is that Justin combined the OG and the *kaige* and that the Fourth Gospel influenced Justin. These conclusions yield the following reconstruction of *kaige* Zach 9,9:

¹⁸ Hab 3,14 uses πτωχός for עני in 8HēvXIIgr and the OG; the other verses containing עני in the Dodekapropheton (Zeph 3,12; Zach 7,10; 9,9; 11,7,11) are not in 8HēvXIIgr, so it is indeterminable whether the *kaige* consistently translated עני as πτωχός.

¹⁹ F. Albrecht's recent work on Zach 9,9 is limited to these animal terms (F. Albrecht, *Das Zwölfprophetenbuch und seine Rezeption im frühen Christentum am Beispiel Justins des Märtyrers*, in: J. de Vries/M. Karrer [eds.], *Textual History and the Reception of Scripture in Early Christianity*, SCS 60, 2013, 349–357, 354).

²⁰ Justin's agreement with the *Quinta* against Aquila nullifies the supposition that later scribes conformed Justin's text to Aquila's recension; *pace* P. Katz, Justin's Old Testament quotations and the Greek Dodekapropheton Scroll, in *Studia patristica*, vol. 1, pt. 1, 1957, 343–353, 348.

²¹ Barthélemy, *Devanciers*, 221.

²² The phrase πῶλον ὄνου also appears in Justin's only other quotation of Zach 9,9 (*1 Apol.* 35,11), which shows no influence of the *kaige*.

²³ *Pace* M. J. J. Menken, *Old Testament Quotations in the Fourth Gospel: Studies in Textual Form*, CBET 15, 1996, 95 n. 58.

»χαῖρε σφόδρα, θύγατερ Σιων· ἀλάλαξον, θύγατερ Ἰερουσαλημ· ἰδοὺ ὁ βασιλεὺς σου ἔρχεται σοι, δίκαιος καὶ σώζων αὐτόν, πτωχὸς καὶ ἐπιβεβηκὼς ἐπὶ ὑποζύγιον καὶ πῶλον υἱὸν ὄνων.«
 »Rejoice greatly, daughter Zion! Shout, daughter Jerusalem! Look, your king comes to you: righteous and salvific is he, poor and mounted upon a yoke animal and a colt, an offspring of asses.«

This reconstruction reveals Justin's scribal role in the transmission of Zach 9,9. In *Dial.* 53,3 Justin changed »comes« (ἔρχεται) to »will have come« (ἦξει) to emphasize the certainty of Zechariah's prediction; the prophetic future perfect is a redactional *Tendenz* that Justin shows elsewhere (e. g., *Dial.* 49,3). Utilizing the OG and the *kaige*, Justin then conflated »shout« and »proclaim« (ἀλάλαξον, κήρυσσε) as well as »poor« and »humble« (πτωχὸς καὶ πραΰς); the *kaige* would have contained no such conflation. Last, Justin's phrase »a colt of an ass« (πῶλον ὄνου) was influenced by John 12,15. In conclusion, the idiosyncrasies of the quotation of Zach 9,9 in *Dial.* 53,3 result from Justin's careful redaction of multiple, extant biblical texts – hardly from his »characteristic carelessness« when quoting Scripture.²⁴ Most importantly, the differences between Origen's and Justin's quotations of Zach 9,9 do not entail that the *kaige* and the *Quinta* represent altogether different revisions of the OG.²⁵

Abstract: Some of the non-LXX quotations from the Dodekapropheton in Justin Martyr's Dialogue with Trypho match the *kaige* recension exactly. On that basis, the *kaige* has long been presumed to be the source behind Justin's quotation of Zach 9,9 in *Dial.* 53,3. This short note clarifies that in *Dial.* 53,3 Justin was actually conflating the Old Greek and the *kaige*. When Justin's redactions are removed, it can be seen that the reconstructed *kaige* of Zach 9,9 is identical to Origen's *Quinta*.

Résumé: Certaines des citations non-LXX du *Dodécaprophétion* dans le »Dialogue avec Tryphon« de Justin Martyr correspondent exactement à la Recension *kaigè*. Pour cette raison, la Recension *kaigè* a longtemps été considérée comme la source de la citation par Justin de Zach. 9,9, en *Dialogue*, 53,3. Cette brève note établit qu'en réalité les recensions *Old Greek* et *kaige* sont ici mélangées. Si l'on écarte la rédaction de Justin, la citation *kaige* reconstituée de Zach. 9,9 est identique à la *Quinta* d'Origène.

Zusammenfassung: Einige derjenigen Zitate des Dodekaprophetons in Justins Dialog mit Tryphon, die nicht der LXX entnommen sind, entsprechen genau der *kaige*-Rezension. Deshalb wurde lange vermutet, dass *kaige* die Quelle für Justins Zitat (*Dial.* 53,3) von Sach 9,9 ist. Diese Mitteilung verdeutlicht, dass Justin an dieser Stelle in Wirklichkeit *Old Greek* und *kaige* vermischt hat. Wenn man Justins Redaktion entfernt, entspricht das rekonstruierte *kaige*-Zitat von Sach 9,9 der *Quinta* des Origenes.

²⁴ Pace B. Lindars, *New Testament Apologetic: The Doctrinal Significance of the Old Testament Quotations*, 1961, 115 n. 1.

²⁵ Pace Howard, *Quinta*, 22.



Copyright and Use:

As an ATLAS user, you may print, download, or send articles for individual use according to fair use as defined by U.S. and international copyright law and as otherwise authorized under your respective ATLAS subscriber agreement.

No content may be copied or emailed to multiple sites or publicly posted without the copyright holder(s)' express written permission. Any use, decompiling, reproduction, or distribution of this journal in excess of fair use provisions may be a violation of copyright law.

This journal is made available to you through the ATLAS collection with permission from the copyright holder(s). The copyright holder for an entire issue of a journal typically is the journal owner, who also may own the copyright in each article. However, for certain articles, the author of the article may maintain the copyright in the article. Please contact the copyright holder(s) to request permission to use an article or specific work for any use not covered by the fair use provisions of the copyright laws or covered by your respective ATLAS subscriber agreement. For information regarding the copyright holder(s), please refer to the copyright information in the journal, if available, or contact ATLA to request contact information for the copyright holder(s).

About ATLAS:

The ATLA Serials (ATLAS®) collection contains electronic versions of previously published religion and theology journals reproduced with permission. The ATLAS collection is owned and managed by the American Theological Library Association (ATLA) and received initial funding from Lilly Endowment Inc.

The design and final form of this electronic document is the property of the American Theological Library Association.