

---

# **Rule-Based Expert Systems**

---

## **The Addison-Wesley Series in Artificial Intelligence**

- Buchanan and Shortliffe (eds.): *Rule-Based Expert Systems: The MYCIN Experiments of the Stanford Heuristic Programming Project*. (1984)
- Clancey and Shortliffe (eds.): *Readings in Medical Artificial Intelligence: The First Decade*. (1984)
- Pearl: *Heuristics: Intelligent Search Strategies for Computer Problem Solving*. (1984)
- Sager: *Natural Language Information Processing: A Computer Grammar of English and Its Applications*. (1981)
- Wilensky: *Planning and Understanding: A Computational Approach to Human Reasoning*. (1983)
- Winograd: *Language as a Cognitive Process Vol. I: Syntax*. (1983)
- Winston: *Artificial Intelligence*, Second Edition. (1984)
- Winston and Horn: *LISP*, Second Edition. (1984)

---

# **Rule-Based Expert Systems**

## **The MYCIN Experiments of the Stanford Heuristic Programming Project**

*Edited by*

**Bruce G. Buchanan**

Department of Computer Science  
Stanford University

**Edward H. Shortliffe**

Department of Medicine  
Stanford University School of Medicine



**Addison-Wesley Publishing Company**

Reading, Massachusetts • Menlo Park, California  
London • Amsterdam • Don Mills, Ontario • Sydney

**This book is in The Addison-Wesley Series in Artificial Intelligence.**

**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data**

Main entry under title:

Rule-based expert systems.

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Expert systems (Computer science) 2. MYCIN (Computer system) I. Buchanan, Bruce G. II. Shortliffe, Edward Hance.

QA76.9.E96R84 1984 001.53'5 83-15822

ISBN 0-201-10172-6

*Reprinted with corrections, October 1984*

Copyright © 1984 by Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher. Printed in the United States of America. Published simultaneously in Canada.

BCDEFGHIJ-MA-8987654

**For Sally and Linda**

---

# Contents

Contributors		ix
Foreword <i>by Allen Newell</i>		xi
Preface		xvii
<hr/>		
<b>PART ONE</b>	<b>Background</b>	
Chapter 1	The Context of the MYCIN Experiments	3
Chapter 2	The Origin of Rule-Based Systems in AI <i>Randall Davis and Jonathan J. King</i>	20
<hr/>		
<b>PART TWO</b>	<b>Using Rules</b>	
Chapter 3	The Evolution of MYCIN's Rule Form	55
Chapter 4	The Structure of the MYCIN System <i>William van Melle</i>	67
Chapter 5	Details of the Consultation System <i>Edward H. Shortliffe</i>	78
Chapter 6	Details of the Revised Therapy Algorithm <i>William J. Clancey</i>	133
<hr/>		
<b>PART THREE</b>	<b>Building a Knowledge Base</b>	
Chapter 7	Knowledge Engineering	149
Chapter 8	Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based System <i>Motoi Suwa, A. Carlisle Scott, and Edward H. Shortliffe</i>	159
Chapter 9	Interactive Transfer of Expertise <i>Randall Davis</i>	171
<hr/>		
<b>PART FOUR</b>	<b>Reasoning Under Uncertainty</b>	
Chapter 10	Uncertainty and Evidential Support	209
Chapter 11	A Model of Inexact Reasoning in Medicine <i>Edward H. Shortliffe and Bruce G. Buchanan</i>	233
Chapter 12	Probabilistic Reasoning and Certainty Factors <i>J. Barclay Adams</i>	263

Chapter 13	The Dempster-Shafer Theory of Evidence <i>Jean Gordon and Edward H. Shortliffe</i>	272
------------	---	-----

**PART FIVE Generalizing MYCIN**

---

Chapter 14	Use of the MYCIN Inference Engine	295
Chapter 15	EMYCIN: A Knowledge Engineer's Tool for Constructing Rule-Based Expert Systems <i>William van Melle, Edward H. Shortliffe, and Bruce G. Buchanan</i>	302
Chapter 16	Experience Using EMYCIN <i>James S. Bennett and Robert S. Engelmores</i>	314

**PART SIX Explaining the Reasoning**

---

Chapter 17	Explanation as a Topic of AI Research	331
Chapter 18	Methods for Generating Explanations <i>A. Carlisle Scott, William J. Clancey, Randall Davis, and Edward H. Shortliffe</i>	338
Chapter 19	Specialized Explanations for Dosage Selection <i>Sharon Wraith Bennett and A. Carlisle Scott</i>	363
Chapter 20	Customized Explanations Using Causal Knowledge <i>Jerold W. Wallis and Edward H. Shortliffe</i>	371

**PART SEVEN Using Other Representations**

---

Chapter 21	Other Representation Frameworks	391
Chapter 22	Extensions to the Rule-Based Formalism for a Monitoring Task <i>Lawrence M. Fagan, John C. Kunz, Edward A. Feigenbaum, and John J. Osborn</i>	397
Chapter 23	A Representation Scheme Using Both Frames and Rules <i>Janice S. Aikins</i>	424
Chapter 24	Another Look at Frames <i>David E. Smith and Jan E. Clayton</i>	441

**PART EIGHT Tutoring**

---

Chapter 25	Intelligent Computer-Aided Instruction	455
Chapter 26	Use of MYCIN's Rules for Tutoring <i>William J. Clancey</i>	464

<b>PART NINE</b>		<b>Augmenting the Rules</b>	
Chapter 27	Additional Knowledge Structures		493
Chapter 28	Meta-Level Knowledge <i>Randall Davis and Bruce G. Buchanan</i>		507
Chapter 29	Extensions to Rules for Explanation and Tutoring <i>William J. Clancey</i>		531
<b>PART TEN</b>		<b>Evaluating Performance</b>	
Chapter 30	The Problem of Evaluation		571
Chapter 31	An Evaluation of MYCIN's Advice <i>Victor L. Yu, Lawrence M. Fagan, Sharon Wraith Bennett, William J. Clancey, A. Carlisle Scott, John F. Hannigan, Robert L. Blum, Bruce G. Buchanan, and Stanley N. Cohen</i>		589
<b>PART ELEVEN</b>		<b>Designing for Human Use</b>	
Chapter 32	Human Engineering of Medical Expert Systems		599
Chapter 33	Strategies for Understanding Structured English <i>Alain Bonnet</i>		613
Chapter 34	An Analysis of Physicians' Attitudes <i>Randy L. Teach and Edward H. Shortliffe</i>		635
Chapter 35	An Expert System for Oncology Protocol Management <i>Edward H. Shortliffe, A. Carlisle Scott, Miriam B. Bischoff, A. Bruce Campbell, William van Melle, and Charlotte D. Jacobs</i>		653
<b>PART TWELVE</b>		<b>Conclusions</b>	
Chapter 36	Major Lessons from This Work		669
	Epilog		703
	Appendix		705
	References		717
	Name Index		739
	Subject Index		742