



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Secrecy and oversight in the European Union: The law and practice of classified information

Abazi, V.

**Publication date**

2015

**Document Version**

Final published version

[Link to publication](#)

**Citation for published version (APA):**

Abazi, V. (2015). *Secrecy and oversight in the European Union: The law and practice of classified information*.

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Ms Vigilencia Abazi

Email: [REDACTED]

Ref. [REDACTED]

Request made on: 14.04.2015

Registered on: 15.04.2015

Deadline extension: 07.05.2015

Dear Ms Abazi,

Following our letter of [REDACTED], we can inform you that the General Secretariat [REDACTED] has finished the examination of your request.<sup>1</sup>

Please find attached the following requested documents:

ST [REDACTED]	ST 7756 2013 INIT	ST 6230 2013 INIT
ST 11395 2012 INIT	ST [REDACTED]	ST 15104 2010 INIT
ST 12737 2010 INIT	ST 13885 2009 INIT	ST 13646 2009 INIT
ST 9518 2009 ADD 1		
ST 6770 2000 INIT		

You will also [REDACTED]

ST 8111 2014 INIT
ST 18734 2011 IN

I regret to inform [REDACTED] applying

<sup>1</sup> On the b  
[REDACTED]  
31.5.20  
the Co  
Article

<sup>2</sup>

Rue de la Loi 17  
Tel. +32 (0)2 2

Vigjilencia Abazi

# SECRECY AND OVERSIGHT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

The Law and Practice of Classified Information

---

# SECRECY AND OVERSIGHT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

*The Law and Practice of Classified Information*

---

Vigjilenca Abazi

---

---

SECURITY AND OVERSIGHT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

*The Law and Practice of Classified Information*

---

---

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

*ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor*

*aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam*

*op gezag van de Rector Magnificus*

*prof. dr. D.C. van den Boom*

*ten overstaan van een door het college voor promoties ingestelde*

*commissie,*

*in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel*

*op vrijdag 11 december 2015, te 10.00 uur*

door

Vigjilenca Abazi

*geboren te Zagreb, Kroatië*

---

## PROMOTIECOMMISSIE

---

### PROMOTOR

Prof. dr. D.M. Curtin

*Universiteit van Amsterdam*

### CO-PROMOTOR

dr. Ch. Eckes

*Universiteit van Amsterdam*

---

### OVERIGE LEDEN

Prof. dr. S.F. Blockman

*Universiteit van Amsterdam*

Prof. dr. D. Chalmers

*London School of Economics and Political Science*

Prof. dr. M. Cremona

*European University Institute*

Prof. de. M. de Goede

*Universiteit van Amsterdam*

Prof. dr. S. Vanhoonacker

*Maastricht University*

Prof. dr. M. de Wilde

*Universiteit van Amsterdam*

---

*Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid*



---

*Familjes time*

---





# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	11
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES.....	12
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION.....	13
1. THE RELEVANCE OF SECRECY IN THE EUROPEAN UNION .....	16
2. RESEARCH RATIONALE, QUESTION AND PERSPECTIVE.....	20
3. METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS .....	22
4. CONTRIBUTION TO THE LITERATURE .....	29
5. OUTLINE OF THE THESIS.....	34
PART I .....	37
CHAPTER 2 DEMOCRATIC CONSTRAINTS ON SECRECY.....	39
INTRODUCTION .....	41
2.1 INTRODUCING SECRECY.....	42
2.1.1 The Concept of Secrecy .....	42
2.1.2 Secrecy and Institutional Relations .....	44
<i>A. Secrecy Types and Institutional Interplays</i> .....	45
<i>B. Power, Protection and Confidentiality</i> .....	47
2.2 DEMOCRACY AND OPENNESS .....	52
2.2.2 Democratic Foundations and Processes .....	53
2.2.3 Applying Openness: Actors, Scope and Time .....	55
2.3 TOWARDS DEMOCRATIC CONSTRAINTS ON SECRECY .....	59
2.3.1 Determining Legitimate Claims to Secrecy .....	60
<i>A. The Necessity of Secrecy</i> .....	61
<i>B. Who Decides?</i> .....	63
2.3.2 Oversight and Public Deliberation .....	65
CONCLUSIONS .....	68
CHAPTER 3 THE EU EXECUTIVE POWERS, OVERSIGHT AND INSTITUTIONAL WORKINGS.....	71
INTRODUCTION .....	73
3.1 EXECUTIVE POWER IN THE EU .....	74

3.1.1 Growing Powers in Security .....	74
3.1.2 Plurality of Executive Actors .....	79
A. Core Actors: European Council, Council and Commission .....	79
B. Multitude of Agencies, Bodies and Other Actors .....	82
3.2 EU OVERSIGHT .....	84
3.2.1 The European Parliament .....	85
3.2.2 The Court of Justice of the European Union.....	88
3.2.3 The European Ombudsman .....	89
3.2.4 Interplays in Information: Oversight and Executive Actors.....	90
3.3 INSTITUTIONAL WORKINGS .....	91
CONCLUSIONS .....	94
CHAPTER 4 THE EU REGULATION OF SECRECY .....	97
INTRODUCTION .....	99
4.1 THE LEGAL REGIME OF EUROPEAN UNION CLASSIFIED INFORMATION .....	100
4.1.1 Secrecy and EU Primary Law .....	101
4.1.2 Institutional Turf Battles for Legislation on Secrecy .....	104
4.1.3 Executive Engineering of the EUCI Rules .....	108
4.1.4 EUCI Rules and Oversight Institutions .....	112
4.2 REVISIONS AND RIGIDITY OF OFFICIAL SECRETS .....	116
4.2.1 From NATO ‘Cosmic Top Secret’ to ‘EU Top Secret’?.....	118
4.2.2 Originator Control: From ‘Soft’ to ‘Hard’ Gatekeeping of Secrecy .....	122
4.3 EUCI RULES: IMPLICATIONS FOR OPENNESS AND SECURITY .....	125
4.3.1 Openness and EU Secrecy Regulation .....	125
4.3.2 EUCI Rules and Security Cooperation .....	128
CONCLUSIONS .....	130
CHAPTER 5 BEHIND THE SCENES OF THE EU PRACTICES ON SECRECY .....	133
INTRODUCTION .....	135
5.1 THE DISCRETION TO CREATE SECRETS .....	136
5.1.1 EU Officials with Power to Classify Documents .....	139
5.1.2 Justifying Secrecy: Reasons for Classifying Documents .....	142
5.1.3 Is Openness Missing in the EUCI Practices? .....	145
5.2 RESTRICTIONS ON INTERNAL ACCESS TO EUCI .....	149
5.2.1 Institutional Structure and Organisation .....	149
5.2.2 National Rules and the EUCI system .....	151
5.2.3 Security Clearance .....	153
5.2.4 The Need-To-Know Principle .....	155
5.3 ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE OF SECRECY? .....	158
5.3.1 Lack of Internal Oversight Perspective.....	159
5.3.2 Differences and Similarities in the EUCI Practices .....	160
CONCLUSIONS .....	161

PART III .....	165
CHAPTER 6 EU OVERSIGHT OF SECRECY .....	167
INTRODUCTION.....	169
6.1 REVIEWING EXECUTIVE SECRECY .....	170
6.1.1 The Courts and Fundamental Rights .....	170
A. <i>Scope of Review: Wide Margin of Executive Discretion?</i> .....	172
B. <i>Extent of Nondisclosure: Justified ‘Deep Secrecy’?</i> .....	175
C. Duty to State Reasons: A Sufficient Safeguard? .....	177
6.1.2 Parliamentary Review and Disclosure of Secrets .....	179
6.1.3 EU Secrecy under Administrative Review .....	182
6.2 ACCESS TO OFFICIAL SECRETS .....	184
6.2.1 Privileged Access to EU CI.....	185
A. <i>Scope and Time of Privileged Access</i> .....	186
B. <i>Insiders of Oversight Institutions</i> .....	190
6.2.2 Limited Access: The Biggest Challenge.....	193
6.2.3 Creating an ‘Executive Privilege’ in the EU?.....	195
CONCLUSIONS .....	198
CHAPTER 7 THE PRACTICE OF EU OVERSIGHT: SECRECY IMPLICATIONS .....	201
INTRODUCTION .....	203
7.1 OVERSIGHT BEYOND SECRECY LIMITATIONS .....	204
7.1.1 European Parliament and Unveiled Secrecy in Practice .....	206
A. <i>The Press and Unauthorised Disclosure of Secrecy</i> .....	207
B. <i>Parliamentary Inquiries Shedding Light on Secrets</i> .....	212
7.1.2 Ensuring Fundamental Rights Despite Secrecy .....	214
7.2 OVERSIGHT BEHIND CLOSED DOORS.....	217
7.2.1 Missing Public Deliberation .....	218
7.2.2 Secret Evidence .....	221
CONCLUSIONS .....	223
CHAPTER 8 CONCLUSION .....	225
8.1 ASSESSING SECRECY IN THE EU .....	227
8.2 FINDINGS.....	229
8.2.1 Legitimate and Necessary Secrecy.....	229
8.2.2 Oversight and Access to Official Secrets.....	233
8.2.3 Public Deliberation Boundaries To Secrecy .....	234
8.3 IMPLICATIONS .....	236
8.3.1 Constitutional Shifts: Peer-to-Peer Accountability.....	236
8.3.3 Security and Relations with Member States .....	238

8.4 THEORETICAL INSIGHTS .....	239
8.5 EU PRACTICES OF OFFICIAL SECRETS: TOWARDS OPENNESS .....	240
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	243
LIST OF CASES AND ADVOCATE GENERAL OPINIONS .....	261
LIST OF OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS AND REPORTS .....	263
LIST OF RESPONDENTS .....	271
SAMENVATTING.....	273
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	281

## ABBREVIATIONS

<b>AFSJ</b>	Area of Freedom, Security and Justice
<b>CFA</b>	Committee on Foreign Affairs
<b>CFSP</b>	Common Foreign and Security Policy
<b>CJEU</b>	Court of Justice of the European Union
<b>EEAS</b>	European External Action Service
<b>EP</b>	European Parliament
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>EUCI</b>	European Union Classified Information
<b>EULEX</b>	EU Rule of Law Mission
<b>Europol</b>	European Police Office
<b>INTCEN</b>	EU Intelligence Analysis Centre
<b>LIBE</b>	Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs
<b>MEP</b>	Member of the European Parliament
<b>NATO</b>	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
<b>OCTA</b>	Organised Crime Threat Assessment
<b>SG</b>	Secretary General
<b>SWIFT</b>	Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication
<b>TEU</b>	Treaty on European Union
<b>TFEU</b>	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
<b>TFTP</b>	Terrorist Finance Tracking Programme

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

### *Tables*

- |     |  |
|-----|--|
| 46  | 2.1 The Position of the Outside Institution (OI) due to Types of Secrets |
| 51  | 2.1 Secrecy Functions and Institutional Relations                        |
| 58  | 2.3 Openness with Accountability and Deliberation                        |
| 115 | 4.1 Comparative overview of the European Ombudsman's provisions on EUCI  |

### *Figure*

- |     |  |
|-----|--|
| 139 | 5.1 The Council's Number of Classified Documents |
|-----|--|