

HHS Public Access

Author manuscript *Hum Genet.* Author manuscript; available in PMC 2020 May 01.

Published in final edited form as:

Hum Genet. 2019 March ; 138(3): 271–285. doi:10.1007/s00439-019-01988-9.

Shared genetic architecture between metabolic traits and Alzheimer's disease: A large scale genome-wide cross-trait analysis

Zhaozhong Zhu^{1,2}, Yifei Lin¹, Xihao Li³, Jane A. Driver^{4,5,*}, Liming Liang^{1,3,*}

¹Program in Genetic Epidemiology and Statistical Genetics, Department of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

²Department of Environmental Health, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

³Department of Biostatistics, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

⁴Geriatric Research Education and Clinical Center and Massachusetts Veterans Epidemiology Research and Information Center, VA Medical Center, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

⁵Division of Aging, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

Abstract

A growing number of studies clearly demonstrate a substantial link between metabolic dysfunction and the risk of Alzheimer's disease (AD), especially glucose related dysfunction; one hypothesis for this comorbidity is the presence of a common genetic etiology. We conducted a large-scale cross-trait GWAS to investigate the genetic overlap between AD and 10 metabolic traits. Among all the metabolic traits, fasting glucose, fasting insulin and HDL were found to be genetically associated with AD. Local genetic covariance analysis found 19q13 region had strong local genetic correlation between AD and T2D ($P=6.78\times10^{-22}$), LDL ($P=1.74\times10^{-253}$) and HDL ($P=7.94\times10^{-18}$). Cross-trait meta-analysis identified 4 loci that were associated with AD and fasting glucose, 3 loci that were associated with AD and fasting insulin, and 20 loci that were associated with AD and HDL ($P_{meta} < 1.6\times10^{-8}$, single trait P < 0.05). Functional analysis revealed that the shared genes are enriched in amyloid metabolic process, lipoprotein remodeling and other related pathways; pancreas, liver, blood and other tissues. Our work identifies common genetic

Corresponding authors: Liming Liang, Departments of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts, USA. (Iliang@hsph.harvard.edu; Tel: 617-432-5896; Fax: 617-432-1722).

*These authors contribute equally

Conflict of Interest statement

All authors declare no competing interest.

Authors' contributions

ZZ, JAD, LL designed the study.

ZZ, XL performed the statistical analysis.

ZZ, YL, JAD, LL wrote the manuscript.

All authors helped interpret the data, reviewed and edited the final paper, and approved the submission.

architectures shared between AD and fasting glucose, fasting insulin and HDL, and sheds light on molecular mechanisms underlying the association between metabolic dysregulation and AD.

INTRODUCTION

Alzheimer's disease (AD) is a progressive and devastating neurodegenerative disorder characterized by impairments of memory, cognitive function, language and behavior (Craft 2009; Vemuri et al. 2017). In 2016, over 44 million people worldwide were estimated to be affected, (Alzheimers.net 2016) and by 2050, the prevalence will nearly triple. (Brookmeyer et al. 2007) While aging is the major risk factor for the vast majority of cases, susceptibility is also influenced by genetics. During the last decade, 19 loci have been identified for AD, a number of which are related to metabolism. The link between metabolic dysregulation and impaired cognition has recently become clearer, leading some to consider late-onset AD a "metabolic" disease (Craft 2009; Demetrius and Driver 2013; Fabbri et al. 2015; Leoni et al. 2010). Diabetes mellitus, both type 1 (T1D) and type 2 (T2D), increases the risk of AD fourfold. The metabolic syndrome, a clinical entity including abdominal obesity, hypertension, low HDL, hyperglycemia and hypertriglyceridemia (Milionis et al. 2008; Pasinetti and Eberstein 2008) is associated with cognitive decline and structural brain changes such as cortical thinning(Schwarz et al. 2018).

One hypothesis to account for the link between metabolism and AD is a common genetic etiology. Metabolic traits and AD may have similar clinical or epidemiological risk factors, and these risk factors can be originated from the same genetic variants. Specifically, our initial hypothesis was that AD is associated with glucose-related traits, represented by T2D, fasting glucose and fasting insulin. The sharing of multiple risk factors for two complex diseases could be due to an overlap in causal genes and pathways. Thus, grouping the genetic variants common to multiple diseases or traits could provide insight into specific biological processes underlying their comorbidity; in addition, except for population stratification bias which were usually accounted for using principal components of genomewide association studies (GWAS) data, these shared genetic variants are not likely affected by confounding factors at the phenotypic level, such as diet and other environmental factors. For example, we recently identified 38 loci that shared by asthma and allergic diseases and these loci were found to be enriched in epithelium and immune related biological process (Zhu et al. 2018b); and we also found 11 loci shared by AD and 5 common cancers (Feng et al. 2017). Genetic factors play a significant role in AD, as evidenced by twin data indicating heritability varying between 58% and 79%, even after accounting for shared environmental influences(Gatz et al. 2006; Pedersen 2010). The co-occurrence of metabolic disorders and AD in the same individual suggests the potential of pleiotropic effects, which may have a substantial genetic contribution. A recent study assessed the genetic causality between AD and metabolic traits (Østergaard et al. 2015). However, no genome-wide study has been conducted to identify the shared genetic loci between AD and metabolic traits and provide biological interpretation of the shared loci. We therefore conducted a large-scale cross-trait GWAS analysis to investigate the shared heritability between AD and 10 metabolic traits, at both globally whole-genome level and individual variant level.

METHODS

Study design, data summary and quality control (QC)

The overall study design is shown in Supplementary Figure 1. We retrieved summary statistics from publically available GWAS studies, including AD from the International Genomics of Alzheimer's Project (IGAP) consortium (N = 54,162), body mass index (BMI) (Locke et al. 2015) (N= 236,231) and waist-to-hip ratio (WHR) (Shungin et al. 2015) (N= 142,762) from the GIANT Consortium, T2D from the DIAGRAM Consortium (Scott et al. 2017) (N= 159,208), fasting glucose (N= 58,047) and fasting insulin (N=51750) from the MAGIC Consortium (Dupuis et al. 2010), and blood lipids (HDL-C [N= 60,812], LDL-C [N= 58,381], TC [N= 60,027], and TG [N= 62,166]) from ENGAGE Consortium (Surakka et al. 2015). Details of each of the datasets can be found in supplementary table 1.

We applied standardization of GWAS summary data to minimize potential biases due to the different array platforms and QC procedures. First, we used the LiftOver (http://genome.sph.umich.edu/wiki/LiftOver) tool to convert any GWAS summary data that have reference genome NCBI36/hg18 to GRCh37/hg19. We further filtered out variants with a minor allele frequency (MAF) <1%. In this study, we restricted our analysis to autosomal chromosomes.

LD score regression analysis

We conducted post-GWAS genome-wide genetic correlation analysis by LD score regression (LDSC) using all SNPs after merging with HapMap3 SNP excluding the HLA region. LDSC estimates genetic correlation between the true causal effects of two traits (ranging from -1 to 1) from summary statistics using the fact that the GWAS effect size estimate for each SNP represents the effects of all SNPs in linkage disequilibrium with that SNP. SNPs in a high linkage disequilibrium region would have higher $\chi 2$ statistics than SNPs in a low linkage disequilibrium region, and a similar relationship is observed when single-study test statistics are replaced with the product of the z-scores from two studies of traits with some correlation (Bulik-Sullivan et al. 2015a). LDSC applied a self-estimated intercept during the analysis to account for shared subjects between studies (Bulik-Sullivan et al. 2015b).

Partitioned genetic correlation analysis

To characterize the genetic overlap at the level of functional categories, we estimated genetic correlation between AD and 3 metabolic traits in 11 large genomic functional annotation using partitioned LDSC, where each annotation contains more than 200,000 SNPs that are in common with our GWAS data. These annotations included transcribed region, transcription factor binding sites (TFBS), Super Enhancer, intron, DNaseI digital genomic footprinting (DGF) region, DNase I hypersensitivity sites (DHSs), fetalDHS and histone marks H3K9ac, H3K4me1, H3K4me3, H3K27ac (Finucane et al. 2015). For each annotation, we recalculated LD scores for SNPs assigned to that particular category and then used the annotation-specific LD scores for estimating the AD-metabolic trait genetic correlation for each partition separately.

Local genetic covariance analysis

To investigate whether there is local genetic correlations between AD and metabolic traits, we performed ρ -HESS (Shi et al. 2017), a method to estimate the local genetic correlation between a pair of traits at each LD independent region in the genome. Approximately independent LD blocks with average 1.5Mb long were used for the calculation of each local genetic heritability and genetic covariance. The traits were included in this nalysis based on 2 criteria: the genome-wide genetic correlation estimate from LDSC analysis is greater than 10%, the summary statistic data is based on 1000 genome imputation to ensure non-zero number of variants in each local region in ρ -HESS, thus three traits pairs were included in this analysis, AD and T2D, AD and LDL, AD and HDL.

Meta-analysis of fasting glucose and fasting insulin (FG-FINS meta-analysis)

The fasting glucose and fasting insulin GWAS summary statistics were derived from the MAGIC consortium, with a sample size of 58,047 and 51,750 respectively. All participants were adults with European ancestry. Both traits were measured from whole blood, plasma or serum with standard and used for GWAS linear regression model. However, the power of each GWAS trait was limited by their sample size in terms of their genetic correlation with AD. Thus in order to boost the power of GWAS for glucose metabolism phenotype, we used inverse-variance-weighted meta-analysis from METAL (Willer et al. 2010) to combine the GWAS summary statistics from fasting glucose and fasting insulin. We flipped the sign of effect estimates of fasting insulin before the meta-analysis in order to incorporate the known negative biological relationship between insulin and glucose. To account for the genomic inflation due to shared samples where the two GWAS summary statistics were calculated, Z-score output from METAL meta-analysis summary statistics (Bulik-Sullivan et al. 2015b). *P*-values were re-calculated based on adjusted Z-scores. Thus, the adjusted genomic inflation factor for fasting glucose and fasting insulin meta-analysis result is 1.061.

Cross-trait meta-analysis

After assessing genetic correlations among all traits, we applied cross-trait GWAS metaanalysis by using the R package Cross Phenotype Association (CPASSOC) to combine the association evidence for AD with fasting glucose, fasting insulin and HDL respectively at individual variants as exploratory post-hoc analysis based on the criteria of both Rg>10% and P<0.05 from LDSC(Zhu et al. 2015). This method combines effect estimate and standard error of the GWAS summary statistics to test hypothesis of association between the SNP with both traits, for example AD and fasting glucose, or AD and fasting insulin, or AD and HDL. A heterogeneous version of CPASSOC (SHet) was used in this study.

SHet is a cross phenotype meta-analysis method based on fixed effect model. It can be viewed as the maximum of weighted sum of trait-specific test statistics, which is closely related to a gamma distribution. It is more powerful when there is heterogeneous effect present between studies, which is common in meta-analysis of different phenotypes(Lee et al. 2019; Zhu et al. 2015; Zhu et al. 2018a). SHet uses the sample size for a trait as a weight instead of variance. It can also account correlation due to overlapping or related subjects within and among different studies or cohorts.

We applied PLINK clumping function (parameters: --clump-p1 1.6e-8 --clump-p2 1e-5 -clump-r2 0.2 --clump-kb 500) to determine top loci that are independent to each other, i.e. variants with *P*-value less than 1×10^{-5} , has r2 more than 0.2 and less than 500 kb away from the peak will be assigned to that peak's clump. We identified all genes falling within each clump region. A P-value of 1.6×10^{-8} ($5 \times 10^{-8}/3$) was used as genome-wide significance level for cross-trait meta-analysis to account of 3 meta-analysis testing.

Pathway analysis, tissue enrichment analysis and transcriptome-wide association analysis (TWAS)

In order to understand the biological insights of the shared genes between 3 trait pairs, AD and fasting glucose, AD and fasting insulin, AD and HDL, we have performed multiple post-GWAS functional analyses using shared genes identified from cross-trait meta-analysis. We used the WebGestalt tool (Zhang et al. 2005) to assess overrepresented enrichment of the identified shared gene set between AD and 3 metabolic traits in the Gene Ontology (GO) biological process functional categories. The Benjamini-Hochberg procedure was used for correcting multiple testing in pathway analysis. The GTEx tissue (Consortium et al. 2017) enrichment analysis was performed based on 30 general tissue types(Watanabe et al. 2017). Integrative transcriptome-wide association analyses was performed using FUSION package based on 44 post-mortal GTEx (version 6) tissues(Consortium et al. 2017) expression weights. In order to identify association between AD and metabolic traits with gene expressions in specific tissues, we conducted a TWAS using FUSION software package based on 44 post-mortal GTEx (version 6) tissues expression weights(Gusev et al. 2016). Bonferroni correction was applied for each trait's all gene-tissue pairs on TWAS *P*-values to account for multiple testing.

Prioritization of candidate genes

We used 2 methods to prioritize the genes to be discussed among the candidates within the region boundaries from cross-trait meta-analysis. First, we prioritized the genes that are overlap with TWAS functional analysis. When there is not overlapped genes with TWAS, we review the literature for all genes within the boundaries, and then discuss genes/gene families with the most biologically relevance to our traits.

Mendelian Randomization (MR) analysis

We performed MR analysis using MR-PRESSO(Verbanck et al. 2018) between 2 types of continuous traits (fasting glucose and HDL) and AD in since they are genetically correlated. We built the MR instruments based on LD-independent SNPs. We did not include fasting insulin trait because no genome-wide significant SNPs was presented.

RESULTS

Genetic correlation between AD and metabolic traits

We evaluated the genetic correlation of AD and 10 metabolic traits using cross-trait LD score regression from both GWASs to estimate their genetic relationship. Fasting glucose and fasting insulin both have substantial magnitude of genetic correlation with AD, though statistical significance were marginal (Rg = 0.169, P= 0.081 for fasting glucose; Rg =

-0.196, P=0.087 for fasting insulin). Their genetic correlations with AD were in opposite direction with similar magnitude. We did not observe substantial genetic correlation between AD and obesity traits (BMI and WHR, both Rg<0.05 and P>0.3), T2D (Rg=0.106, P>0.2) and other lipid traits (LDL, TC and TG, Rg= 0.104, -0.076, 0.022, respectively, all P>0.17) (Table 1). Considering the well-known inverse direct relationship between glucose and insulin, we carried out cross-trait meta-analysis between FG and FINS to boost GWAS power for glucose regulation effect. This meta-analysis would increase the power to detect genetic effects that increase glucose level via reduction of insulin secretion. We observed that FG-FINS meta-analysis effect have an even greater magnitude of genetic correlation with AD and is statistically significant (Rg = 0.254, P=0.016). We also observed that HDL had a significant genetic correlation with AD (Rg = -0.137, P=0.0436).

Analysis of partitioned genetic correlation by functional category

In partitioned LDSC analysis, we evaluated the genetic correlation between AD and 3 metabolic traits by 11 functional annotations to pin down specific regions on the genome that may explain more of the genetic effect sharing than others. In this analysis, we found AD and metabolic traits to have a similar genetic correlation pattern.

The genetic correlation suggested various signals but with similar trends in all the regions. Notably, the Rg estimate was negatively correlated between AD and fasting insulin, AD and HDL, among all partitioned categories. We identified intron had the highest level of genetic correlation between AD and fasting insulin (Rg= -0.366) (Figure 1 and Supplementary Table 2), which does not involved in coding of mRNA but might harboring genetic variants related to alternative splicing. In addition, the transcribed region was found to have the highest level of genetic correlation between AD and HDL (Rg= -0.1471), where this region can transcribe DNA sequence to mRNA.

On the contrary, positive genetic correlations were observed among fasting glucose and the FG-FINS meta-analysis in almost all the functional categories for AD. Specifically, we identified intron had the highest level of genetic correlation between AD and FG-FINS meta-analysis (Rg= 0.1946) (Figure 1 and Supplementary Table 2).

Local genetic correlation between AD and metabolic traits

Although the genome-wide genetic correlation between AD and some metabolic traits was not significant, we additionally performed ρ -HESS to investigate whether a specific region of genome can be genetically correlated between them. In the analysis among 3 trait pairs (AD-T2D, AD-LDL, AD-HDL), we identified 1 region (chromosome 19: 44744108–46102697) that showed a strong local genetic correlation between each of the 2 traits (*P*=6.78×10⁻²² for AD-T2D, 1.74×10⁻²⁵³ for AD-LDL, 7.94×10⁻¹⁸ for AD-HDL) (Figure 2 and Supplementary Table 3–5). This region is known for the *APOE* gene, who serves as a modulator between AD and T2D.

Cross-trait meta-analysis between AD and metabolic traits

We used CPASSOC to perform genome-wide meta-analysis to identify genetic loci that were associated with both AD and metabolic traits (meta-analysis $P \le 5 \times 10^{-8}$, and trait-specific $P \le 0.05$).

AD and fasting glucose

After pruning, we found 4 loci that were associated with both AD and fasting glucose at the genome wide significance level in the cross-trait meta-analysis (Table 2). The first locus (index SNP: rs10501320, P_{meta} =2.80×10⁻¹⁶), was in close proximity to genes *MADD*, *ACP2* and *AGBL2*, which was found to play roles in insulin sensitivity (Wagner et al. 2011), lysosome and cerebellar function (van de Bunt et al. 2015) and immune complexes (Zhang et al. 2014). The second loci (index SNP: rs12805422, P_{meta} =1.57×10⁻¹³) was mapped to the genes *C110rf94* and *CRY2* which encode for a flavin adenine dinucleotide-binding protein involved in regulating the circadian clock. The third loci (index SNP rs1483121 P_{meta} =6.10×10⁻¹⁰) was in close proximity to an intergenic region closest to the *OR4S1* gene, which is related to G-protein coupled receptor activity and transmembrane signaling receptor activity. In addition, we found that genetic loci represented by rs17747324 (P_{meta} =4.52×10⁻⁹) on *TCF7L2* is associated with both AD and fasting glucose after meta-analysis. Notably, *TCF7L2* is a well-known risk gene for diabetes, which exerts a strong inhibitory effect on glucose-induced insulin secretion (Gloyn et al. 2009).

AD and Fasting insulin

A total of 3 loci were identified after meta-analysis of AD and fasting insulin (Table 3). The first one (index SNP: rs2279590, P_{meta} =1.14×10⁻¹⁷) was mapped on *CLU*, a gene that encodes a secreted chaperone protein involved in basic biological events such as cell death, tumor progression, and neurodegenerative disorders. The second locus represented by rs6656401 (P_{meta} =3.71×10⁻¹⁵) was mapped on *CR1* and *CR2*, genes encoding for membrane protein. The third locus (index SNP: rs4803750, P_{meta} =6.54×10⁻¹³) located in close proximity to *BCL3*, which encodes the apolipoprotein J/clusterin, whose polymorphisms have been related to AD susceptibility in published GWAS (Lancaster et al. 2015).

AD and HDL

The cross phenotype meta-analysis between AD and HDL identified 20 genome-wide significant loci (Supplementary Table 6). The most significant locus is characterized by the *APOE/APOC1* gene (index SNP rs157595, P_{meta} =1.21×10⁻⁹⁷). We noticed that this locus was not only significant after meta-analysis, but also reached genome-wide significance in both single trait GWAS of AD (P=3.76×10⁻¹⁰¹) and HDL (P=1.92×10⁻⁸). Among 20 independent loci, eight of them were from 19q13.32 region, which is known for the *APOE/APOC1/APOC2* gene cluster. In addition, *BIN1* on 2q14.3 (index SNP rs6733839, P_{meta} =3.19×10⁻²⁵) and *CCDC116* on 22q11.21 (index SNP rs5754166, P_{meta} =3.61×10⁻¹²) showed moderately strong association with both AD and HDL, which drove the overall significance of the meta-analysis.

Overlap between cross-trait meta-analysis results and genotype-protein associations (pQTL)

For assisting in further functional annotation, we checked our cross-trait meta-analysis for the 3 pairs with recent published study pQTL study (Sun et al. 2018). We compared the genomic position of our significant SNP clumps with the pQTL genomic regions for overlap checking (Table 2–3 and Supplementary Table 6–8). A total of 23 loci are overlap with pQTL regions. Notably, we identified 19q13.32 (known for *APOE*) and 19q13.42 (known for *LILRA3*) regions were associated with many correlated proteins.

Biological pathway, tissue enrichment and TWAS

Pathway analyses were performed to identify biological pathways enriched of shared loci $(P_{meta} < 1.6 \times 10^{-8})$ related to AD and metabolic traits. We found that AD shared amyloid metabolic process pathways with both fasting glucose trait and fasting insulin trait (*FDR*<0.01), and shared protein lipid remodeling reverse cholesterol transport and sensory perception related pathways with HDL trait (*FDR*<0.01) (Supplementary Table 9–11).

The GTEx enrichment analysis identified five independent tissues expression that were significantly enriched (after Benjamin-Hochberg correction) for expression of cross-trait associated genes for each of the 3 trait pairs, including blood, heart, liver, muscle and pancreas for AD and fasting glucose; blood, liver, pancreas, small intestine and spleen for AD and fasting insulin; blood esophagus, heart, liver and pancreas for AD and HDL (Figure 3). Among them, the most strongly enriched tissue was part of the hormone and enzyme producing system (pancreas).

In order to identify association between AD and metabolic traits with gene expressions in specific tissues, we conducted a TWAS in 44 GTEx tissues (Supplementary Table 12–14). We used the Bonferroni correction for each trait's all gene-tissue pairs on TWAS *P*-values to account for multiple testing. A total of 33 gene-tissue pairs were significantly associated with AD, 66 gene-tissue pairs with fasting glucose, and 37 gene-tissue pairs with fasting insulin. Specifically, *MADD*, a gene expressed in multiple tissues, such as pituitary, artery and esophagus, was shared by AD ($P_{TWAS}=2.49\times10^{-8}$) and fasting glucose trait ($P_{TWAS}=4.5\times10^{-10}$). Interestingly, *MADD* was also found to be genome-wide significant in AD and fasting glucose cross-trait meta-analysis ($P_{meta}=2.80\times10^{-16}$).

DISCUSSION

To our knowledge, this is the first study to identify genome-wide genetic correlation and shared genetic variants between AD and metabolic traits. Specifically, we found a genetic correlation between AD and fasting glucose, fasting insulin and HDL. In the LDSC analysis between AD and metabolic traits (Table 1), only **FG-FINS meta-analysis** and HDL had a statistically significant genetic correlation with AD.

These findings are consistent with the known association between higher glucose levels and cognitive impairment, including AD (Carantoni et al. 2000; Craft et al. 1999; Crane et al. 2013). Previous studies also found HDL is negatively correlated with AD (Atzmon et al. 2002; Carantoni et al. 2000; Merched et al. 2000). Our findings suggest that the phenotypic

correlation between AD and metabolic traits were due to a common genetic predisposition base. However, we did not observe genetic correlation between AD and obesity traits, which suggests that the phenotypic association between AD and BMI may due to environmental factors, such as lifestyle (Kivipelto et al. 2018). In the analysis of partitioned co-heritability by functional categories, we observed positive genetic correlation between AD and fasting glucose or **FG-FINS meta-analysis**, and negative genetic correlation between AD and fasting insulin or HDL in different functional categories. We found the genetic correlation estimates were significant in super enhancer, H3K9ac, H3K27ac and DGF for AD-sugar traits pairs (Figure 1a); and genetic correlation estimates were significant in transcribed, TFBS, super enhancer, H3K4me1, H3K27ac and DGF in AD-HDL trait pair (Figure 1b). This indicates the possible role of genetic correlation with respect to these functional categories in the shared genetic etiology of AD and these traits.

With regard to fasting glucose, we found 6 significant loci related to AD, including the genes *MADD*, *CRY2 and OR4S1*. *MADD* has been shown to play a critical role in glucose-induced insulin release as well as AD (Cornes et al. 2014; Huyghe et al. 2013; Lambert et al. 2013; Li et al. 2014). The reduced expression of *MADD* was found to link with declined long-term neuronal viability in late-onset AD (Lambert et al. 2013). With regard to fasting insulin, our results indicated 3 significant loci related to AD. The top locus is *CLU*, which induces the differentiation of pancreatic duct cells into insulin-secreting cells (Kim et al. 2006). *CLU* has also been found to be increased in affected cortical areas in AD and is present in amyloid plaques and in the cerebrospinal fluid of patients with ADs. (Harold et al. 2009)

Twenty loci were identified from the cross-trait meta-analysis of HDL and AD. Among them, the most significant gene was *APOE*, a well-established risk factor for late-onset AD (Coon et al. 2007; Genin et al. 2011; Green et al. 2009; Schuff et al. 2009). Notably, in the single trait GWAS analysis, *APOE* also achieved genome-wide significance with HDL level ($P=1.92\times10^{-8}$) (Supplementary Table 6) (Surakka et al. 2015), indicating a potential important pleotropic effect. Recent studies suggest that *APOE* is the major cholesterol carrier in the central nervous system, and that *APOE*-containing HDL contributes to the redistribution of cholesterol for cellular remodeling and repair in the brain (Rasmussen 2016; Takahashi et al. 2016).

In local genetic correlation analysis, we also found the *APOE* region to have a strong genetic correlation with both AD and T2D. The presence of *APOE* in T2D cases with AD is associated with increased neurofibrillary tangles, amyloid plaques, and cerebral amyloid angiopathy (Jayaraman and Pike 2014; Peila et al. 2002).

In addition, we also tested SNPs that were identified from our cross-trait meta-analysis in 3 AD related endophenotypes: hippocampal volume, Alzheimer's disease progression score and cortical amyloid beta load (Scelsi et al. 2018), to see if these SNPs are also nominally significant in these additional 3 GWAS results (Supplementary Table 15). We found rs2279590 was significant in cortical amyloid beta load (P=0.0197) and rs157595 was significant in hippocampal volume (P=0.0265), which may provide additional insight of these shared loci in terms of endophenotypes of AD.

The post-GWAS functional analyses provided biological insights into the shared genes between AD and 3 metabolic traits. The GTEx tissue enrichment analysis identified shared genes enriched in several tissues, such as pancreas, liver and spleen, which are known to play important roles in regulating the hormone and enzyme function. These hormones and enzymes can further impact the glucose and lipid level in the blood or brain (Sridhar et al. 2015). Blood, as a transporting carrier for nutrients, hormones and enzymes, was also found the be enriched in all 3 trait pairs. From TWAS analysis, we identified 14 significant unique gene-tissue pairs associated with AD, 21 with fasting glucose, and 5 with fasting insulin. Of these, MADD was the only gene significantly associated with AD and fasting glucose, exclusively in pituitary tissue; it is also the only shared gene found in both cross-trait metaanalysis and TWAS. MADD is known to improve insulin sensitivity, especially proinsulinto-insulin conversion, for the variant with higher fasting glucose (Wagner et al. 2011). The pituitary plays a central role the endocrine axis because its hormones regulate the function of other endocrine glands. The relationship between diabetes and pituitary function is well known (Arrais and Dib 2006; Chan et al. 2003; Yi et al. 2010), but research has also noted an association between pituitary function and AD (Mrak and Griffin 2005; Pomara et al. 2003). Our results thus supported the hypothesis that the pituitary may link fasting glucose and AD. Even though MADD was only found to be significantly associated with AD in pituitary tissue, we found this gene expressed in 4 other tissues in fasting glucose trait, including the tibial artery, the aorta, and the muscularis and mucosa of the esophagus, which showed the importance of vascular and epithelium system in AD and neurodegeneration (Karlsson et al. 2017; Vemuri et al. 2017).

The genetic correlation between AD and metabolic traits may be due to both pleiotropy and causality(Chung et al. 2019). Our MR analysis showed no causal relationship between fasting glucose or HDL and AD after adjusting pleiotropy (Supplementary Table 16). These results further supported our findings that the shared genetic effects between metabolic traits and AD are more likely to be pleiotropic effects, rather than causal etiology or mechanism.

In addition to the genetic contribution to AD and metabolic traits, environmental and behavioral factors also play important role in their comorbidity. The combination of diet and exercise, and some drugs that modulate metabolism, are a few interventions that have been shown to improve cognition in AD, and currently represent the most hopeful approach to its prevention and treatment (Cheng et al. 2012; Marengoni et al. 2017).

We also acknowledge the limitations of our work. First, our study power is also limited by the sample size of the AD IGAP consortium. A larger sample size AD or its related endophenotypes, such as infarcts, amyloid, tau accumulation and vascular dementia, are needed to identify more novel shared loci between AD and metabolic traits. With the understanding that the power of individual GWAS traits are limited, we seek evidences based on multiple analyses from the genome-wide level, to locus, gene and genetic variant level, where we can take advantage of the benefit of each methods. For example, LDSC can be used to determine the genome-wide genetic correlation, which takes the sum of local genetic covariance but diminishes the power of each individual locus, where ρ -HESS can help to unveil. The TWAS and cross-trait meta-analysis can further investigate genetic overlap on gene and genetic variant level, which provide higher functional significance.

There were 2 reasons we did not apply Bonferroni correction for 10 traits in this study. Our primary focus is based on glucose-related traits, given the high correlation between T2D, fasting glucose and fasting insulin; the Bonferroni correction would seem too conservative. Nevertheless, it is still significant after accounting for 2 traits: T2D and FG-FINS analysis (p<0.025). In addition, our study is based on publicly available GWAS summary statistics. Even though we have tried to standardize the data using ImpG summary statistic imputation to the 1000 Genome reference panel, the fasting glucose and fasting insulin summary statistics did not yield good quality imputed data, with only ~1.5 million SNPs' imputation quality having a r2pred >0.6. Thus, we kept original fasting glucose and fasting insulin summary statistics data for downstream analysis, which is based on HapMap 2 imputation. However, the HapMap 2 platform can also provide powerful and accurate results for the entire genome (International HapMap et al. 2007).

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, our novel genome-wide cross-trait analysis reinforced the idea that AD and disorders of metabolism are connected. Evaluation of the genetic overlap between AD and metabolic traits can be beneficial to understand the shared biological mechanisms underlying this comorbidity. We highlighted the key roles of *APOE* and *MADD* genes played for shared etiology between AD and metabolic traits. More work is needed to fully characterize the heritable component of the metabolic origins of AD.

Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

Acknowledgment

We thank to IGAP consortium, GIANT consortium, DIAGRAM consortium, MAGIC Consortium and ENGAGE Consortium for providing GWAS summary statistic data. We also thank to Huwenbo Shi for statistical advice. This study was supported by grants National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences (NIEHS) P30ES000002 (Zhu), A Merit Review Award Clinical Science R&D I01CX000934-01A1 (Driver) and Dr. Liang is collaborator funded by this award.

REFERENCES

Alzheimers.net (2016) 2016 Alzheimer's Statistics.

- Arrais RF, Dib SA (2006) The hypothalamus-pituitary-ovary axis and type 1 diabetes mellitus: a mini review. Hum Reprod 21: 327–37. doi: 10.1093/humrep/dei353 [PubMed: 16239312]
- Atzmon G, Gabriely I, Greiner W, Davidson D, Schechter C, Barzilai N (2002) Plasma HDL levels highly correlate with cognitive function in exceptional longevity. J Gerontol A Biol Sci Med Sci 57: M712–5. [PubMed: 12403798]
- Brookmeyer R, Johnson E, Ziegler-Graham K, Arrighi HM (2007) Forecasting the global burden of Alzheimer's disease. Alzheimers Dement 3: 186–91. doi: 10.1016/j.jalz.2007.04.381 [PubMed: 19595937]
- Bulik-Sullivan B, Finucane HK, Anttila V, Gusev A, Day FR, Loh PR, ReproGen C, Psychiatric Genomics C, Genetic Consortium for Anorexia Nervosa of the Wellcome Trust Case Control C, Duncan L, Perry JR, Patterson N, Robinson EB, Daly MJ, Price AL, Neale BM (2015a) An atlas of genetic correlations across human diseases and traits. Nat Genet 47: 1236–41. doi: 10.1038/ng.3406 [PubMed: 26414676]

- Bulik-Sullivan BK, Loh PR, Finucane HK, Ripke S, Yang J, Schizophrenia Working Group of the Psychiatric Genomics C, Patterson N, Daly MJ, Price AL, Neale BM (2015b) LD Score regression distinguishes confounding from polygenicity in genome-wide association studies. Nat Genet 47: 291–5. doi: 10.1038/ng.3211 [PubMed: 25642630]
- Carantoni M, Zuliani G, Munari MR, D'Elia K, Palmieri E, Fellin R (2000) Alzheimer disease and vascular dementia: relationships with fasting glucose and insulin levels. Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord 11: 176–80. doi: 10.1159/000017232 [PubMed: 10765049]
- Chan O, Inouye K, Riddell MC, Vranic M, Matthews SG (2003) Diabetes and the hypothalamopituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis. Minerva Endocrinol 28: 87–102. [PubMed: 12717340]
- Cheng G, Huang C, Deng H, Wang H (2012) Diabetes as a risk factor for dementia and mild cognitive impairment: a meta-analysis of longitudinal studies. Internal medicine journal 42: 484–491. [PubMed: 22372522]
- Chung W, Chen J, Turman C, Lindstrom S, Zhu Z, Loh PR, Kraft P, Liang L (2019) Efficient crosstrait penalized regression increases prediction accuracy in large cohorts using secondary phenotypes. Nat Commun 10: 569. doi: 10.1038/s41467-019-08535-0 [PubMed: 30718517]
- Consortium GT, Laboratory DA, Coordinating Center -Analysis Working G, Statistical Methods groups-Analysis Working G, Enhancing Gg, Fund NIHC, Nih/Nci, Nih/Nhgri, Nih/Nimh, Nih/Nida, Biospecimen Collection Source Site N, Biospecimen Collection Source Site R, Biospecimen Core Resource V, Brain Bank Repository-University of Miami Brain Endowment B, Leidos Biomedical-Project M, Study E, Genome Browser Data I, Visualization EBI, Genome Browser Data I, Visualization-Ucsc Genomics Institute UoCSC, Lead a, Laboratory DA, Coordinating C, management NIHp, Biospecimen c, Pathology, e QTLmwg, Battle A, Brown CD, Engelhardt BE, Montgomery SB (2017) Genetic effects on gene expression across human tissues. Nature 550: 204–213. doi: 10.1038/nature24277 [PubMed: 29022597]
- Coon KD, Myers AJ, Craig DW, Webster JA, Pearson JV, Lince DH, Zismann VL, Beach TG, Leung D, Bryden L (2007) A high-density whole-genome association study reveals that APOE is the major susceptibility gene for sporadic late-onset Alzheimer's disease. The Journal of clinical psychiatry 68: 613–618. [PubMed: 17474819]
- Cornes BK, Brody JA, Nikpoor N, Morrison AC, Dang HCP, Ahn BS, Wang S, Dauriz M, Barzilay JI, Dupuis J (2014) Association of levels of fasting glucose and insulin with rare variants at the chromosome 11p11. 2-MADD locus: Cohorts for Heart and Aging Research in Genomic Epidemiology (CHARGE) Consortium Targeted Sequencing Study. Circulation: Genomic and Precision Medicine 7: 374–382.
- Craft S (2009) The role of metabolic disorders in Alzheimer disease and vascular dementia: two roads converged. Archives of neurology 66: 300–305. [PubMed: 19273747]
- Craft S, Asthana S, Newcomer JW, Wilkinson CW, Matos IT, Baker LD, Cherrier M, Lofgreen C, Latendresse S, Petrova A (1999) Enhancement of memory in Alzheimer disease with insulin and somatostatin, but not glucose. Archives of general psychiatry 56: 1135–1140. [PubMed: 10591291]
- Crane PK, Walker R, Hubbard RA, Li G, Nathan DM, Zheng H, Haneuse S, Craft S, Montine TJ, Kahn SE, McCormick W, McCurry SM, Bowen JD, Larson EB (2013) Glucose levels and risk of dementia. N Engl J Med 369: 540–8. doi: 10.1056/NEJMoa1215740 [PubMed: 23924004]
- Demetrius LA, Driver J (2013) Alzheimer's as a metabolic disease. Biogerontology 14: 641–9. doi: 10.1007/s10522-013-9479-7 [PubMed: 24249045]
- Dupuis J, Langenberg C, Prokopenko I, Saxena R, Soranzo N, Jackson AU, Wheeler E, Glazer NL, Bouatia-Naji N, Gloyn AL, Lindgren CM, Magi R, Morris AP, Randall J, Johnson T, Elliott P, Rybin D, Thorleifsson G, Steinthorsdottir V, Henneman P, Grallert H, Dehghan A, Hottenga JJ, Franklin CS, Navarro P, Song K, Goel A, Perry JR, Egan JM, Lajunen T, Grarup N, Sparso T, Doney A, Voight BF, Stringham HM, Li M, Kanoni S, Shrader P, Cavalcanti-Proenca C, Kumari M, Qi L, Timpson NJ, Gieger C, Zabena C, Rocheleau G, Ingelsson E, An P, O'Connell J, Luan J, Elliott A, McCarroll SA, Payne F, Roccasecca RM, Pattou F, Sethupathy P, Ardlie K, Ariyurek Y, Balkau B, Barter P, Beilby JP, Ben-Shlomo Y, Benediktsson R, Bennett AJ, Bergmann S, Bochud M, Boerwinkle E, Bonnefond A, Bonnycastle LL, Borch-Johnsen K, Bottcher Y, Brunner E, Bumpstead SJ, Charpentier G, Chen YD, Chines P, Clarke R, Coin LJ, Cooper MN, Cornelis M, Crawford G, Crisponi L, Day IN, de Geus EJ, Delplanque J, Dina C, Erdos MR, Fedson AC,

Fischer-Rosinsky A, Forouhi NG, Fox CS, Frants R, Franzosi MG, Galan P, Goodarzi MO, Graessler J, Groves CJ, Grundy S, Gwilliam R, Gyllensten U, Hadjadj S, et al. (2010) New genetic loci implicated in fasting glucose homeostasis and their impact on type 2 diabetes risk. Nat Genet 42: 105–16. doi: 10.1038/ng.520 [PubMed: 20081858]

- Fabbri E, Zoli M, Gonzalez-Freire M, Salive ME, Studenski SA, Ferrucci L (2015) Aging and Multimorbidity: New Tasks, Priorities, and Frontiers for Integrated Gerontological and Clinical Research. J Am Med Dir Assoc 16: 640–7. doi: 10.1016/j.jamda.2015.03.013 [PubMed: 25958334]
- Feng YA, Cho K, Lindstrom S, Kraft P, Cormack J, Igap Consortium CTS, Discovery B, Risk of Inherited Variants in Breast C, Elucidating Loci Involved in Prostate Cancer S, Transdisciplinary Research in Cancer of the L, Liang L, Driver JA (2017) Investigating the genetic relationship between Alzheimer's disease and cancer using GWAS summary statistics. Hum Genet 136: 1341– 1351. doi: 10.1007/s00439-017-1831-6 [PubMed: 28780673]
- Finucane HK, Bulik-Sullivan B, Gusev A, Trynka G, Reshef Y, Loh PR, Anttila V, Xu H, Zang C, Farh K, Ripke S, Day FR, ReproGen C, Schizophrenia Working Group of the Psychiatric Genomics C, Consortium R, Purcell S, Stahl E, Lindstrom S, Perry JR, Okada Y, Raychaudhuri S, Daly MJ, Patterson N, Neale BM, Price AL (2015) Partitioning heritability by functional annotation using genome-wide association summary statistics. Nat Genet 47: 1228–35. doi: 10.1038/ng.3404 [PubMed: 26414678]
- Gatz M, Reynolds CA, Fratiglioni L, Johansson B, Mortimer JA, Berg S, Fiske A, Pedersen NL (2006) Role of genes and environments for explaining Alzheimer disease. Arch Gen Psychiatry 63: 168– 74. doi: 10.1001/archpsyc.63.2.168 [PubMed: 16461860]
- Genin E, Hannequin D, Wallon D, Sleegers K, Hiltunen M, Combarros O, Bullido MJ, Engelborghs S, De Deyn P, Berr C, Pasquier F, Dubois B, Tognoni G, Fievet N, Brouwers N, Bettens K, Arosio B, Coto E, Del Zompo M, Mateo I, Epelbaum J, Frank-Garcia A, Helisalmi S, Porcellini E, Pilotto A, Forti P, Ferri R, Scarpini E, Siciliano G, Solfrizzi V, Sorbi S, Spalletta G, Valdivieso F, Vepsalainen S, Alvarez V, Bosco P, Mancuso M, Panza F, Nacmias B, Bossu P, Hanon O, Piccardi P, Annoni G, Seripa D, Galimberti D, Licastro F, Soininen H, Dartigues JF, Kamboh MI, Van Broeckhoven C, Lambert JC, Amouyel P, Campion D (2011) APOE and Alzheimer disease: a major gene with semi-dominant inheritance. Mol Psychiatry 16: 903–7. doi: 10.1038/mp.2011.52 [PubMed: 21556001]
- Gloyn AL, Braun M, Rorsman P (2009) Type 2 diabetes susceptibility gene TCF7L2 and its role in beta-cell function. Diabetes 58: 800–2. doi: 10.2337/db09-0099 [PubMed: 19336690]
- Green RC, Roberts JS, Cupples LA, Relkin NR, Whitehouse PJ, Brown T, Eckert SL, Butson M, Sadovnick AD, Quaid KA, Chen C, Cook-Deegan R, Farrer LA, Group RS (2009) Disclosure of APOE genotype for risk of Alzheimer's disease. N Engl J Med 361: 245–54. doi: 10.1056/ NEJMoa0809578 [PubMed: 19605829]
- Gusev A, Ko A, Shi H, Bhatia G, Chung W, Penninx BW, Jansen R, de Geus EJ, Boomsma DI, Wright FA, Sullivan PF, Nikkola E, Alvarez M, Civelek M, Lusis AJ, Lehtimaki T, Raitoharju E, Kahonen M, Seppala I, Raitakari OT, Kuusisto J, Laakso M, Price AL, Pajukanta P, Pasaniuc B (2016) Integrative approaches for large-scale transcriptome-wide association studies. Nat Genet 48: 245– 52. doi: 10.1038/ng.3506 [PubMed: 26854917]
- Harold D, Abraham R, Hollingworth P, Sims R, Gerrish A, Hamshere ML, Pahwa JS, Moskvina V, Dowzell K, Williams A, Jones N, Thomas C, Stretton A, Morgan AR, Lovestone S, Powell J, Proitsi P, Lupton MK, Brayne C, Rubinsztein DC, Gill M, Lawlor B, Lynch A, Morgan K, Brown KS, Passmore PA, Craig D, McGuinness B, Todd S, Holmes C, Mann D, Smith AD, Love S, Kehoe PG, Hardy J, Mead S, Fox N, Rossor M, Collinge J, Maier W, Jessen F, Schurmann B, Heun R, van den Bussche H, Heuser I, Kornhuber J, Wiltfang J, Dichgans M, Frolich L, Hampel H, Hull M, Rujescu D, Goate AM, Kauwe JS, Cruchaga C, Nowotny P, Morris JC, Mayo K, Sleegers K, Bettens K, Engelborghs S, De Deyn PP, Van Broeckhoven C, Livingston G, Bass NJ, Gurling H, McQuillin A, Gwilliam R, Deloukas P, Al-Chalabi A, Shaw CE, Tsolaki M, Singleton AB, Guerreiro R, Muhleisen TW, Nothen MM, Moebus S, Jockel KH, Klopp N, Wichmann HE, Carrasquillo MM, Pankratz VS, Younkin SG, Holmans PA, O'Donovan M, Owen MJ, Williams J (2009) Genome-wide association study identifies variants at CLU and PICALM associated with Alzheimer's disease. Nat Genet 41: 1088–93. doi: 10.1038/ng.440 [PubMed: 19734902]

- Huyghe JR, Jackson AU, Fogarty MP, Buchkovich ML, Stancakova A, Stringham HM, Sim X, Yang L, Fuchsberger C, Cederberg H, Chines PS, Teslovich TM, Romm JM, Ling H, McMullen I, Ingersoll R, Pugh EW, Doheny KF, Neale BM, Daly MJ, Kuusisto J, Scott LJ, Kang HM, Collins FS, Abecasis GR, Watanabe RM, Boehnke M, Laakso M, Mohlke KL (2013) Exome array analysis identifies new loci and low-frequency variants influencing insulin processing and secretion. Nat Genet 45: 197–201. doi: 10.1038/ng.2507 [PubMed: 23263489]
- International HapMap C, Frazer KA, Ballinger DG, Cox DR, Hinds DA, Stuve LL, Gibbs RA, Belmont JW, Boudreau A, Hardenbol P, Leal SM, Pasternak S, Wheeler DA, Willis TD, Yu F, Yang H, Zeng C, Gao Y, Hu H, Hu W, Li C, Lin W, Liu S, Pan H, Tang X, Wang J, Wang W, Yu J, Zhang B, Zhang Q, Zhao H, Zhao H, Zhou J, Gabriel SB, Barry R, Blumenstiel B, Camargo A, Defelice M, Faggart M, Goyette M, Gupta S, Moore J, Nguyen H, Onofrio RC, Parkin M, Roy J, Stahl E, Winchester E, Ziaugra L, Altshuler D, Shen Y, Yao Z, Huang W, Chu X, He Y, Jin L, Liu Y, Shen Y, Sun W, Wang H, Wang Y, Wang Y, Xiong X, Xu L, Waye MM, Tsui SK, Xue H, Wong JT, Galver LM, Fan JB, Gunderson K, Murray SS, Oliphant AR, Chee MS, Montpetit A, Chagnon F, Ferretti V, Leboeuf M, Olivier JF, Phillips MS, Roumy S, Sallee C, Verner A, Hudson TJ, Kwok PY, Cai D, Koboldt DC, Miller RD, Pawlikowska L, Taillon-Miller P, Xiao M, Tsui LC, Mak W, Song YQ, Tam PK, Nakamura Y, Kawaguchi T, Kitamoto T, Morizono T, Nagashima A, et al. (2007) A second generation human haplotype map of over 3.1 million SNPs. Nature 449: 851–61. doi: 10.1038/nature06258 [PubMed: 17943122]
- Jayaraman A, Pike CJ (2014) Alzheimer's disease and type 2 diabetes: multiple mechanisms contribute to interactions. Curr Diab Rep 14: 476. doi: 10.1007/s11892-014-0476-2 [PubMed: 24526623]
- Karlsson IK, Ploner A, Song C, Gatz M, Pedersen NL, Hagg S (2017) Genetic susceptibility to cardiovascular disease and risk of dementia. Transl Psychiatry 7: e1142. doi: 10.1038/tp.2017.110 [PubMed: 28556832]
- Kim B, Kim S, Lee S, Shin Y, Min B, Bendayan M, Park I (2006) Clusterin induces differentiation of pancreatic duct cells into insulin-secreting cells. Diabetologia 49: 311–320. [PubMed: 16411126]
- Kivipelto M, Mangialasche F, Ngandu T (2018) Lifestyle interventions to prevent cognitive impairment, dementia and Alzheimer disease. Nat Rev Neurol 14: 653–666. doi: 10.1038/ s41582-018-0070-3 [PubMed: 30291317]
- Lambert JC, Ibrahim-Verbaas CA, Harold D, Naj AC, Sims R, Bellenguez C, DeStafano AL, Bis JC, Beecham GW, Grenier-Boley B, Russo G, Thorton-Wells TA, Jones N, Smith AV, Chouraki V, Thomas C, Ikram MA, Zelenika D, Vardarajan BN, Kamatani Y, Lin CF, Gerrish A, Schmidt H, Kunkle B, Dunstan ML, Ruiz A, Bihoreau MT, Choi SH, Reitz C, Pasquier F, Cruchaga C, Craig D, Amin N, Berr C, Lopez OL, De Jager PL, Deramecourt V, Johnston JA, Evans D, Lovestone S, Letenneur L, Moron FJ, Rubinsztein DC, Eiriksdottir G, Sleegers K, Goate AM, Fievet N, Huentelman MW, Gill M, Brown K, Kamboh MI, Keller L, Barberger-Gateau P, McGuiness B, Larson EB, Green R, Myers AJ, Dufouil C, Todd S, Wallon D, Love S, Rogaeva E, Gallacher J, St George-Hyslop P, Clarimon J, Lleo A, Bayer A, Tsuang DW, Yu L, Tsolaki M, Bossu P, Spalletta G, Proitsi P, Collinge J, Sorbi S, Sanchez-Garcia F, Fox NC, Hardy J, Deniz Naranjo MC, Bosco P, Clarke R, Brayne C, Galimberti D, Mancuso M, Matthews F, European Alzheimer's Disease I, Genetic, Environmental Risk in Alzheimer's D, Alzheimer's Disease Genetic C, Cohorts for H, Aging Research in Genomic E, Moebus S, Mecocci P, Del Zompo M, Maier W, Hampel H, Pilotto A, Bullido M, Panza F, Caffarra P, et al. (2013) Meta-analysis of 74,046 individuals identifies 11 new susceptibility loci for Alzheimer's disease. Nat Genet 45: 1452-8. doi: 10.1038/ng.2802 [PubMed: 24162737]
- Lancaster TM, Brindley LM, Tansey KE, Sims RC, Mantripragada K, Owen MJ, Williams J, Linden DE (2015) Alzheimer's disease risk variant in CLU is associated with neural inefficiency in healthy individuals. Alzheimer's & Dementia 11: 1144–1152.
- Lee PH, Anttila V, Won H, Feng Y-CA, Rosenthal J, Zhu Z, Tucker-Drob EM, Nivard MG, Grotzinger AD, Posthuma D, Wang MM-J, Yu D, Stahl E, Walters RK, Anney RJL, Duncan LE, Belangero S, Luykx J, Kranzler H, Keski-Rahkonen A, Cook EH, Kirov G, Coppola G, Kaprio J, Zai CC, Hoekstra PJ, Banaschewski T, Rohde LA, Sullivan PF, Franke B, Daly MJ, Bulik CM, Lewis CM, McIntosh AM, O'Donovan MC, Zheutlin A, Andreassen OA, Borglum AD, Breen G, Edenberg HJ, Fanous AH, Faraone SV, Gelernter J, Mathews CA, Mattheisen M, Mitchell K, Neale MC, Nurnberger JI, Ripke S, Santangelo SL, Scharf JM, Stein MB, Thornton LM, Walters JTR, Wray

NR, Geschwind DH, Neale B, Kendler KS, Smoller JW (2019) Genome wide meta-analysis identifies genomic relationships, novel loci, and pleiotropic mechanisms across eight psychiatric disorders. 528117 doi: 10.1101/528117%JbioRxiv

- Leoni V, Solomon A, Kivipelto M (2010) Links between ApoE, brain cholesterol metabolism, tau and amyloid beta-peptide in patients with cognitive impairment. Biochem Soc Trans 38: 1021–5. doi: 10.1042/BST0381021 [PubMed: 20658997]
- Li LC, Wang Y, Carr R, Haddad CS, Li Z, Qian L, Oberholzer J, Maker AV, Wang Q, Prabhakar BS (2014) IG20/MADD plays a critical role in glucose-induced insulin secretion. Diabetes 63: 1612– 23. doi: 10.2337/db13-0707 [PubMed: 24379354]
- Locke AE, Kahali B, Berndt SI, Justice AE, Pers TH, Day FR, Powell C, Vedantam S, Buchkovich ML, Yang J, Croteau-Chonka DC, Esko T, Fall T, Ferreira T, Gustafsson S, Kutalik Z, Luan J, Magi R, Randall JC, Winkler TW, Wood AR, Workalemahu T, Faul JD, Smith JA, Zhao JH, Zhao W, Chen J, Fehrmann R, Hedman AK, Karjalainen J, Schmidt EM, Absher D, Amin N, Anderson D, Beekman M, Bolton JL, Bragg-Gresham JL, Buyske S, Demirkan A, Deng G, Ehret GB, Feenstra B, Feitosa MF, Fischer K, Goel A, Gong J, Jackson AU, Kanoni S, Kleber ME, Kristiansson K, Lim U, Lotay V, Mangino M, Leach IM, Medina-Gomez C, Medland SE, Nalls MA, Palmer CD, Pasko D, Pechlivanis S, Peters MJ, Prokopenko I, Shungin D, Stancakova A, Strawbridge RJ, Sung YJ, Tanaka T, Teumer A, Trompet S, van der Laan SW, van Setten J, Van Vliet-Ostaptchouk JV, Wang Z, Yengo L, Zhang W, Isaacs A, Albrecht E, Arnlov J, Arscott GM, Attwood AP, Bandinelli S, Barrett A, Bas IN, Bellis C, Bennett AJ, Berne C, Blagieva R, Bluher M, Bohringer S, Bonnycastle LL, Bottcher Y, Boyd HA, Bruinenberg M, Caspersen IH, Chen YI, Clarke R, Daw EW, de Craen AJM, Delgado G, Dimitriou M, et al. (2015) Genetic studies of body mass index yield new insights for obesity biology. Nature 518: 197–206. doi: 10.1038/nature14177 [PubMed: 25673413]
- Marengoni A, Rizzuto D, Fratiglioni L, Antikainen R, Laatikainen T, Lehtisalo J, Peltonen M, Soininen H, Strandberg T, Tuomilehto J, Kivipelto M, Ngandu T (2017) The Effect of a 2-Year Intervention Consisting of Diet, Physical Exercise, Cognitive Training, and Monitoring of Vascular Risk on Chronic Morbidity-the FINGER Randomized Controlled Trial. J Am Med Dir Assoc. doi: 10.1016/j.jamda.2017.09.020
- Merched A, Xia Y, Visvikis S, Serot JM, Siest G (2000) Decreased high-density lipoprotein cholesterol and serum apolipoprotein AI concentrations are highly correlated with the severity of Alzheimer's disease. Neurobiol Aging 21: 27–30. [PubMed: 10794845]
- Milionis HJ, Florentin M, Giannopoulos S (2008) Metabolic syndrome and Alzheimer's disease: a link to a vascular hypothesis? CNS Spectr 13: 606–13. [PubMed: 18622365]
- Mrak RE, Griffin WS (2005) Potential inflammatory biomarkers in Alzheimer's disease. J Alzheimers Dis 8: 369–75. [PubMed: 16556968]
- Østergaard SD, Mukherjee S, Sharp SJ, Proitsi P, Lotta LA, Day F, Perry JRB, Boehme KL, Walter S, Kauwe JS, Gibbons LE, Alzheimer's Disease Genetics C, The GC, Consortium EP-I, Larson EB, Powell JF, Langenberg C, Crane PK, Wareham NJ, Scott RA (2015) Associations between Potentially Modifiable Risk Factors and Alzheimer Disease: A Mendelian Randomization Study. PLOS Medicine 12: e1001841. doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.1001841 [PubMed: 26079503]
- Pasinetti GM, Eberstein JA (2008) Metabolic syndrome and the role of dietary lifestyles in Alzheimer's disease. J Neurochem 106: 1503–14. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-4159.2008.05454.x [PubMed: 18466323]
- Pedersen NL (2010) Reaching the limits of genome-wide significance in alzheimer disease: Back to the environment. JAMA 303: 1864–1865. doi: 10.1001/jama.2010.609 [PubMed: 20460629]
- Peila R, Rodriguez BL, Launer LJ, Honolulu-Asia Aging S (2002) Type 2 diabetes, APOE gene, and the risk for dementia and related pathologies: The Honolulu-Asia Aging Study. Diabetes 51: 1256– 62. [PubMed: 11916953]
- Pomara N, Greenberg WM, Branford MD, Doraiswamy PM (2003) Therapeutic implications of HPA axis abnormalities in Alzheimer's disease: review and update. Psychopharmacol Bull 37: 120–34. [PubMed: 14674372]
- Rasmussen KL (2016) Plasma levels of apolipoprotein E, APOE genotype and risk of dementia and ischemic heart disease: A review. Atherosclerosis 255: 145–155. doi: 10.1016/ j.atherosclerosis.2016.10.037 [PubMed: 28340945]

- Scelsi MA, Khan RR, Lorenzi M, Christopher L, Greicius MD, Schott JM, Ourselin S, Altmann A (2018) Genetic study of multimodal imaging Alzheimer's disease progression score implicates novel loci. Brain 141: 2167–2180. doi: 10.1093/brain/awy141 [PubMed: 29860282]
- Schuff N, Woerner N, Boreta L, Kornfield T, Shaw LM, Trojanowski JQ, Thompson PM, Jack CR Jr., Weiner MW, Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging I (2009) MRI of hippocampal volume loss in early Alzheimer's disease in relation to ApoE genotype and biomarkers. Brain 132: 1067–77. doi: 10.1093/brain/awp007 [PubMed: 19251758]
- Schwarz NF, Nordstrom LK, Pagen LHG, Palombo DJ, Salat DH, Milberg WP, McGlinchey RE, Leritz EC (2018) Differential associations of metabolic risk factors on cortical thickness in metabolic syndrome. Neuroimage Clin 17: 98–108. doi: 10.1016/j.nicl.2017.09.022 [PubMed: 29062686]
- Scott RA, Scott LJ, Magi R, Marullo L, Gaulton KJ, Kaakinen M, Pervjakova N, Pers TH, Johnson AD, Eicher JD, Jackson AU, Ferreira T, Lee Y, Ma C, Steinthorsdottir V, Thorleifsson G, Qi L, Van Zuydam NR, Mahajan A, Chen H, Almgren P, Voight BF, Grallert H, Muller-Nurasyid M, Ried JS, Rayner NW, Robertson N, Karssen LC, van Leeuwen EM, Willems SM, Fuchsberger C, Kwan P, Teslovich TM, Chanda P, Li M, Lu Y, Dina C, Thuillier D, Yengo L, Jiang L, Sparso T, Kestler HA, Chheda H, Eisele L, Gustafsson S, Franberg M, Strawbridge RJ, Benediktsson R, Hreidarsson AB, Kong A, Sigurethsson G, Kerrison ND, Luan J, Liang L, Meitinger T, Roden M, Thorand B, Esko T, Mihailov E, Fox C, Liu CT, Rybin D, Isomaa B, Lyssenko V, Tuomi T, Couper DJ, Pankow JS, Grarup N, Have CT, Jorgensen ME, Jorgensen T, Linneberg A, Cornelis MC, van Dam RM, Hunter DJ, Kraft P, Sun Q, Edkins S, Owen KR, Perry JRB, Wood AR, Zeggini E, Tajes-Fernandes J, Abecasis GR, Bonnycastle LL, Chines PS, Stringham HM, Koistinen HA, Kinnunen L, Sennblad B, Muhleisen TW, Nothen MM, Pechlivanis S, Baldassarre D, Gertow K, Humphries SE, Tremoli E, Klopp N, Meyer J, Steinbach G, et al. (2017) An Expanded Genome-Wide Association Study of Type 2 Diabetes in Europeans. Diabetes 66: 2888–2902. doi: 10.2337/ db16-1253 [PubMed: 28566273]
- Shi H, Mancuso N, Spendlove S, Pasaniuc B (2017) Local Genetic Correlation Gives Insights into the Shared Genetic Architecture of Complex Traits. Am J Hum Genet 101: 737–751. doi: 10.1016/ j.ajhg.2017.09.022 [PubMed: 29100087]
- Shungin D, Winkler TW, Croteau-Chonka DC, Ferreira T, Locke AE, Magi R, Strawbridge RJ, Pers TH, Fischer K, Justice AE, Workalemahu T, Wu JMW, Buchkovich ML, Heard-Costa NL, Roman TS, Drong AW, Song C, Gustafsson S, Day FR, Esko T, Fall T, Kutalik Z, Luan J, Randall JC, Scherag A, Vedantam S, Wood AR, Chen J, Fehrmann R, Karjalainen J, Kahali B, Liu CT, Schmidt EM, Absher D, Amin N, Anderson D, Beekman M, Bragg-Gresham JL, Buyske S, Demirkan A, Ehret GB, Feitosa MF, Goel A, Jackson AU, Johnson T, Kleber ME, Kristiansson K, Mangino M, Leach IM, Medina-Gomez C, Palmer CD, Pasko D, Pechlivanis S, Peters MJ, Prokopenko I, Stancakova A, Sung YJ, Tanaka T, Teumer A, Van Vliet-Ostaptchouk JV, Yengo L, Zhang W, Albrecht E, Arnlov J, Arscott GM, Bandinelli S, Barrett A, Bellis C, Bennett AJ, Berne C, Bluher M, Bohringer S, Bonnet F, Bottcher Y, Bruinenberg M, Carba DB, Caspersen IH, Clarke R, Daw EW, Deelen J, Deelman E, Delgado G, Doney AS, Eklund N, Erdos MR, Estrada K, Eury E, Friedrich N, Garcia ME, Giedraitis V, Gigante B, Go AS, Golay A, Grallert H, Grammer TB, Grassler J, Grewal J, Groves CJ, Haller T, Hallmans G, et al. (2015) New genetic loci link adipose and insulin biology to body fat distribution. Nature 518: 187–196. doi: 10.1038/nature14132 [PubMed: 25673412]
- Sridhar GR, Lakshmi G, Nagamani G (2015) Emerging links between type 2 diabetes and Alzheimer's disease. World Journal of Diabetes 6: 744–751. doi: 10.4239/wjd.v6.i5.744 [PubMed: 26069723]
- Sun BB, Maranville JC, Peters JE, Stacey D, Staley JR, Blackshaw J, Burgess S, Jiang T, Paige E, Surendran P, Oliver-Williams C, Kamat MA, Prins BP, Wilcox SK, Zimmerman ES, Chi A, Bansal N, Spain SL, Wood AM, Morrell NW, Bradley JR, Janjic N, Roberts DJ, Ouwehand WH, Todd JA, Soranzo N, Suhre K, Paul DS, Fox CS, Plenge RM, Danesh J, Runz H, Butterworth AS (2018) Genomic atlas of the human plasma proteome. Nature 558: 73–79. doi: 10.1038/ s41586-018-0175-2 [PubMed: 29875488]
- Surakka I, Horikoshi M, Magi R, Sarin AP, Mahajan A, Lagou V, Marullo L, Ferreira T, Miraglio B, Timonen S, Kettunen J, Pirinen M, Karjalainen J, Thorleifsson G, Hagg S, Hottenga JJ, Isaacs A, Ladenvall C, Beekman M, Esko T, Ried JS, Nelson CP, Willenborg C, Gustafsson S, Westra HJ, Blades M, de Craen AJ, de Geus EJ, Deelen J, Grallert H, Hamsten A, Havulinna AS,

Hengstenberg C, Houwing-Duistermaat JJ, Hypponen E, Karssen LC, Lehtimaki T, Lyssenko V, Magnusson PK, Mihailov E, Muller-Nurasyid M, Mpindi JP, Pedersen NL, Penninx BW, Perola M, Pers TH, Peters A, Rung J, Smit JH, Steinthorsdottir V, Tobin MD, Tsernikova N, van Leeuwen EM, Viikari JS, Willems SM, Willemsen G, Schunkert H, Erdmann J, Samani NJ, Kaprio J, Lind L, Gieger C, Metspalu A, Slagboom PE, Groop L, van Duijn CM, Eriksson JG, Jula A, Salomaa V, Boomsma DI, Power C, Raitakari OT, Ingelsson E, Jarvelin MR, Thorsteinsdottir U, Franke L, Ikonen E, Kallioniemi O, Pietiainen V, Lindgren CM, Stefansson K, Palotie A, McCarthy MI, Morris AP, Prokopenko I, Ripatti S, Consortium E (2015) The impact of low-frequency and rare variants on lipid levels. Nat Genet 47: 589–97. doi: 10.1038/ng.3300 [PubMed: 25961943]

Takahashi Y, Ito Y, Wada N, Nagasaka A, Fujikawa M, Sakurai T, Shrestha R, Hui SP, Chiba H (2016) Development of homogeneous assay for simultaneous measurement of apoE-deficient, apoEcontaining, and total HDL-cholesterol. Clin Chim Acta 454: 135–42. doi: 10.1016/ j.cca.2016.01.013 [PubMed: 26776838]

- van de Bunt M, Manning Fox JE, Dai X, Barrett A, Grey C, Li L, Bennett AJ, Johnson PR, Rajotte RV, Gaulton KJ, Dermitzakis ET, MacDonald PE, McCarthy MI, Gloyn AL (2015) Transcript Expression Data from Human Islets Links Regulatory Signals from Genome-Wide Association Studies for Type 2 Diabetes and Glycemic Traits to Their Downstream Effectors. PLoS Genet 11: e1005694. doi: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1005694 [PubMed: 26624892]
- Vemuri P, Lesnick TG, Przybelski SA, Knopman DS, Lowe VJ, Graff-Radford J, Roberts RO, Mielke MM, Machulda MM, Petersen RC, Jack CR Jr. (2017) Age, vascular health, and Alzheimer disease biomarkers in an elderly sample. Ann Neurol 82: 706–718. doi: 10.1002/ana.25071 [PubMed: 29023983]
- Verbanck M, Chen CY, Neale B, Do R (2018) Detection of widespread horizontal pleiotropy in causal relationships inferred from Mendelian randomization between complex traits and diseases. Nat Genet 50: 693–698. doi: 10.1038/s41588-018-0099-7 [PubMed: 29686387]
- Wagner R, Dudziak K, Herzberg-Schäfer SA, Machicao F, Stefan N, Staiger H, Häring H-U, Fritsche A (2011) Glucose-raising genetic variants in MADD and ADCY5 impair conversion of proinsulin to insulin. PLoS One 6: e23639. [PubMed: 21887289]
- Watanabe K, Taskesen E, van Bochoven A, Posthuma D (2017) Functional mapping and annotation of genetic associations with FUMA. Nat Commun 8: 1826. doi: 10.1038/s41467-017-01261-5 [PubMed: 29184056]
- Willer CJ, Li Y, Abecasis GR (2010) METAL: fast and efficient meta-analysis of genomewide association scans. Bioinformatics 26: 2190–1. doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btq340 [PubMed: 20616382]
- Yi SS, Hwang IK, Shin JH, Choi JH, Lee CH, Kim IY, Kim YN, Won MH, Park IS, Seong JK, Yoon YS (2010) Regulatory mechanism of hypothalamo-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis and neuronal changes after adrenalectomy in type 2 diabetes. J Chem Neuroanat 40: 130–9. doi: 10.1016/ j.jchemneu.2010.05.003 [PubMed: 20472052]
- Zhang B, Kirov S, Snoddy J (2005) WebGestalt: an integrated system for exploring gene sets in various biological contexts. Nucleic Acids Res 33: W741–8. doi: 10.1093/nar/gki475 [PubMed: 15980575]
- Zhang H, Ren Y, Pang D, Liu C (2014) Clinical implications of AGBL2 expression and its inhibitor latexin in breast cancer. World J Surg Oncol 12: 142. doi: 10.1186/1477-7819-12-142 [PubMed: 24884516]
- Zhu X, Feng T, Tayo BO, Liang J, Young JH, Franceschini N, Smith JA, Yanek LR, Sun YV, Edwards TL, Chen W, Nalls M, Fox E, Sale M, Bottinger E, Rotimi C, Consortium CB, Liu Y, McKnight B, Liu K, Arnett DK, Chakravati A, Cooper RS, Redline S (2015) Meta-analysis of correlated traits via summary statistics from GWASs with an application in hypertension. Am J Hum Genet 96: 21–36. doi: 10.1016/j.ajhg.2014.11.011 [PubMed: 25500260]
- Zhu Z, Anttila V, Smoller JW, Lee PH (2018a) Statistical power and utility of meta-analysis methods for cross-phenotype genome-wide association studies. PLoS One 13: e0193256. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0193256 [PubMed: 29494641]
- Zhu Z, Lee PH, Chaffin MD, Chung W, Loh PR, Lu Q, Christiani DC, Liang L (2018b) A genomewide cross-trait analysis from UK Biobank highlights the shared genetic architecture of asthma and allergic diseases. Nat Genet. doi: 10.1038/s41588-018-0121-0



Genetic Correlation between Alzheimer's Disease and Sugar Traits by Functional Category

Figure 1.

Partitioned genetic correlation. a. Genetic correlation between Alzheimer's disease and sugar traits by functional category. b. Genetic correlation between Alzheimer's disease and HDL by functional category category. Vertical axis represents the genetic correlation estimate Rg (standard error), horizontal axis represents 11 functional categories. Asterisk represents significance (P<0.05). DGF: DNaseI Digital Genomic Footprinting; DHS: DNase I hypersensitivity Site; TFBS: Transcription Factor Binding Sites. AD: Alzheimer's disease;

FG: fasting glucose; FINS: fasting insulin; FGFINSmeta: meta-analysis of fasting glucose and fasting insulin.

Zhu et al.



Figure 2.

Local genetic correlation and local SNP-heritability between Alzheimer's disease and T2D (2a), LDL (2b) and HDL (2c) respectively. For each sub-figure, top part represents local genetic correlation, middle part represents local genetic covariance, and significant local genetic correlation and covariance after multiple testing correction are highlighted in blue; bottom part represents local SNP-heritability for individual trait.

Zhu et al.

а

6

4

2

0 b

4

3

2

1

0 С 6

4

2

-log 10 P-value

Significant tissue enrichment Non-significant tissue enrichment AD and fasting glucose AD and fasting insulin AD and HDL Adrenal Gland Bladder Blood Vessel 0 -*Fallopian Earvix Uteri Cervix Uteri Colon Fallopian Tube Heart Kidney* Adipose Tissue Pancreas Pituitary Salivary, Gland Small, Intestine Stomach Thyroid Uterus Vagina Nerve -Liver ⊢^{βun}η M_{uscle} →

GTEx tissue enrichment analysis. a. GTEx tissue enrichment analysis of AD and fasting glucose. b. GTEx tissue enrichment analysis of AD and fasting insulin. c. GTEx tissue enrichment analysis of AD and HDL. Red bar represents significant tissue enrichment after Benjamin-Hochberg correction.

Table 1.

c traits
netaboli
and r
Ą
between /
heritability
based
SNP
and
correlation
Genetic

Phenotype 1	Phenotype 2	\mathbf{Rg}	Rg_SE	P-value	H2	H2_SE
	BMI	0.046	0.050	0.358	0.137	0.007
	WHR	0.012	0.073	0.865	0.094	0.006
	T2D	0.106	0.096	0.268	0.077	0.006
	FG	0.169	0.097	0.081	0.099	0.018
	FINS	-0.196	0.115	0.087	0.069	0.010
IZDEIMET S disease	FG-FINS meta-analysis	0.254	0.106	0.016	0.032	0.007
	LDL	0.104	0.077	0.176	0.103	0.038
	HDL	-0.137	0.068	0.044	0.131	0.027
	TC	-0.076	0.071	0.286	0.133	0.034
	TG	0.021	0.053	0.680	0.184	0.033

able 2.

⁻⁸; single trait P < 0.05)

Fasting	Glucose	CPASSOC B	Genes within clumping region	pQTL
ETA	Р	1		
0×10 ⁻²	7.11×10 ⁻¹³	2.80×10 ⁻¹⁶	ACP2,AGBL2,AMBRA1,AREGAP2,ARHGAP1,ATG13,C1QTNF4,C11orf49,CELF1,CHRM4,CKAP5,CREB3L1,DDB2,DGKZ,F2,FAM180B,FNBP4,HARB11,KBTBD4,LRP4,LRP4, AS1,MADD, MDK, MIR3160-1, MIR3160-2, MIR4688, MIR5582, MIR6745, MTCH2, MYBPC3, NDUFS3, NR1H3,NUP160,PACSIN3,PSMC3,PTPMT1,PTPRJ,RAPSN,SLC39A13,SNORD67,SPI1,ZNF408	NA
0×10^{-2}	9.55×10^{-13}	1.57×10^{-13}	C11orf94,CRV2,MAPK8IP1,PEX16	NA
0×10^{-2}	1.66×10^{-9}	nd.10×10 ⁻¹⁰	Intergenic region, OR4S1*	NA
		n Genet.		Glypican-1, C-type lectin
		Auth		domain family 5
0×10^{-2}	7.50×10^{-10}	u 4.52×10 ⁻⁹	TCF7L2	member A, Gastrin-
		nuscrij		releasing peptide, Interferon
	- *	pt; ava		gamma receptor 1
se; CPA£	SOC: Cross F	e in PMC 2020 May (ciation; pQTL: genotype-protein associations	
)1.		

		;	3		AD	Fasting in:	sulin		Genes within	
AN's	CHR	Z	Position	BETA	Р	BETA	Ь	CPASSOC P	clumping region	pQIL
279590	×	=	chr8:2742274027477509	-0.143	3.75×10 ⁻¹⁷	7.20×10 ⁻³	0.036	1.14×10 ⁻¹⁷	CLU,MIR6843	Pulmonary surfactant-associated protein C, Tenascin, Protein FAM163A, GDP-fucose protein O-fucosyltransferase 2, Prolargin, Scavenger receptor class A member 5, Prote eva-1 homolog C
56401	1	11	chrl:207653395207804141	0.157	7.73×10 ⁻¹⁵	-9.60×10^{-3}	0.018	3.71×10 ⁻¹⁵	CR1,CR2	Polymeric immunoglobulin receptor, Protei S100-A5, Complement decay-accelerating factor
303750	19	7	chr19:4524217345247627	-0.241	9.04×10^{-13}	-1.90×10^{-2}	0.008	6.54×10^{-13}	Intergenic region, BCL3*	Many, see supplement table 6

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Table 3.